

NORTH-WEST UNIVERSITY
(POTCHEFSTROOM CAMPUS)

in association with

Greenwich School of Theology UK

**The resilience of the eighteenth century hymn in
contemporary Church of Ireland (Anglican) worship –
a liturgical study**

by

David Baxter

#22299068

Thesis submitted for the degree Doctor of Philosophy (Liturgics) at the
Potchefstroom Campus of North-West University

Promoter: Prof. Ben de Klerk

Co-Promoter: Revd Prof. Roger Grainger

November 2012

ABSTRACT

The combination of observational, anecdotal and circumstantial evidence suggests that, in the present-day Christian church, older, traditional hymns are slowly but inexorably being replaced by modern, contemporary ones. Whilst it is a truism that hymnody, like every other aspect of civilisation, moves forward with the times, there still remains a large number of people, congregations and clergy for whom the early eighteenth century English hymn is a genre that remains ever-popular.

This research focuses deliberately on the eighteenth century hymn for four main reasons. First, hymns from this period are widely used in most Christian denominations. Second, the eighteenth century was a particularly fertile period for hymnody. Third, this was the era of Watts and Wesley, arguably two of the greatest hymn writers of all time; their burgeoning popularity thrust the eighteenth century into a period of proclivity for hymn writing. Finally, the whole area of hymnody in the Church of Ireland appears to be under-researched. Thus, in seeking to determine why older, more traditional hymns continue to be published in Church of Ireland hymnals this research fills a very obvious gap.

This study establishes that this resilience is real and not merely perceived. Eighteenth century hymns are still widely sung in today's Church, irrespective of size, location, setting, status, leadership or congregation. The study explores the many reasons behind this resilience—reasons that go beyond the more obvious musical and liturgical ones and highlight the impact of hymnody from a variety of angles.

KEY WORDS / TERMS

hymn*, contemporary worship, eighteenth century church, Church of Ireland, Anglican.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Sincere thanks to Professors Ben de Klerk and Roger B. Grainger for their unyielding support and academic advice and to Mrs Eleanor Margaret (Peg) Evans for her advice, support and guidance throughout the completion of this dissertation.

Many thanks also to my family, friends, work colleagues and pupils for their assistance, interest, encouragement and support.

CONTENTS

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Background and problem statement	1
1.1.1	Background	1
1.1.2	Problem Statement	2
1.2	The Aim and objectives	4
1.2.1	The Aim	4
1.2.2	The Objectives	4
1.3	Central theoretical argument	4
1.4	Methodology	4
2	The Anglican context. Hymns and hymnodistic developments in the “mother” Anglican community, the Church of England, from the Reformation to the present day	6
2.1	Research aim for this chapter	6
2.2	Research method for this chapter	7
2.3	Structure of this chapter	8
2.4	Hymnody from its beginnings until 1707	9
2.4.1	The beginnings of hymnody up until the publication of the 1562 Old Version Psalter	9
2.4.2	The first hymnbooks in the Church of England and early hymn writers: 1562 – 1660s	13
2.4.3	Developments in the late seventeenth century, the Restoration, the Savoy Conference and the debate on congregational singing	18
2.5	The publication of Watts’ <i>Hymns and Spiritual Songs</i> in 1707 until <i>A Selection of Psalms and Hymns for Public and Private Use</i> by Thomas Cotterill, 1819	22
2.5.1	Isaac Watts, his imitators and followers (1707 – 1780)	22
2.5.2	John and Charles Wesley, their contemporaries and imitators	30
2.5.2.1	John Wesley	30
2.5.2.2	Charles Wesley	32
2.6	Post-Wesleyan hymnody until <i>A Selection of Psalms and Hymns for Public and</i>	

	<i>Private Use</i> by Thomas Cotterill (1780 – 1819)	39
2.7	1819 until the publication of <i>Hymns Ancient and Modern</i> (1819 – 1886)	43
2.8	<i>Hymns Ancient and Modern</i> until the present day (1886 – Present day)	55
2.9	Addressing the research question	56
3	The historical context of hymnody in the Irish Anglican Church; the periodisation of Irish hymnody according to significant events in relevant Irish Church and civic history and the relevant developments that occurred within these periods	60
3.1	Introduction, context and relevance of this chapter to the overall research questions	60
3.2	Research method for this chapter	61
3.3	Structure of this chapter	61
3.4	The reasons for starting in 1691	62
3.5	1691 – 1801 (Protestant Ascendancy – The Act of Union)	67
3.6	1801 – 1871 (The Act of Union – The Disestablishment of the Anglican Church)	71
	3.6.1 Other internal and external influences from this era	78
3.7	1871 – 1921 (The disestablishment of the Anglican Church – Partition)	79
3.8	1922 - 1966 (Partition – the start of “The Troubles”)	83
	3.8.1 Partition and its influence	83
3.9	1966 – 1998 (The start of “The Troubles” – The Good Friday Agreement)	87
3.10	1998 – present day (The Good Friday Agreement – present day)	92
	3.10.1 Contemporary connections with the Patrician view of Ireland	96
	3.10.2 Creeds and parts of worship in a contemporary context and their resultant influences on hymnody	98
3.11	Addressing the research question	100
4	Musical and hymnodistic influences in the Church of Ireland from its beginnings until the present day	104
4.1	Research aim for this chapter	104
4.2	Research method	104
4.3	Structure of this chapter	105
4.4	Music making in the Church; Introduction	105

4.4.1	Pre-Disestablishment	106
4.4.2	Disestablishment of the Anglican Church – Partition	111
4.4.3	Partition – the start of “The Troubles”	115
4.4.4	The start of “The Troubles” – the present day	118
4.5	Organ and choir development	123
4.6	Influences from other churches	125
4.6.1	The Roman Catholic Church	126
4.6.2	Other Protestant faiths: The Presbyterian Church	130
4.6.3	Other Protestant faiths: The Methodist, Baptist and other Churches’ influences	132
4.6.4	The Eastern Orthodoxies: The emergence of the Eastern Church in Ireland and its influences	133
4.6.4.1	The Greek Orthodox Church	134
4.6.4.2	The Russian Orthodox Church and the Syriac Orthodox Church	139
4.6.4.3	Other Orthodox churches	141
4.7	Other influencing factors	142
4.7.1	Urbanism and Ruralism	142
4.7.2	Clergy, Church growth and “high” Church influences	143
4.7.2.1	High church influences	145
4.7.3	Modern Science	146
4.7.4	Church Buildings and architecture	147
4.8	Addressing the research question	151
5	Establishing an 18th century canon of hymns and evaluating current approaches to hymnody	157
5.1	The research question for this chapter	157
5.2	The research method for this chapter	158
5.3	Structure of this chapter	159
5.4	Definition of the term “eighteenth century”	160
5.5	Criteria for deciding which hymns to include in the canon	160

5.6	The chosen canon	164
5.6.1	Pre-eighteenth century hymns; determining a context for hymns used up until the eighteenth century	168
5.6.2	A graphical representation of the data	170
5.7	How music is performed in today's Church	170
5.7.1	Musical ensembles and methods of accompaniment in today's church	170
5.7.1.1	Organs	170
5.7.1.2	Pipe and non-pipe organs	171
5.7.1.3	Choirs	171
5.7.1.4	"Praise" groups and bands	172
5.7.2	Quantitative online survey to assess musical decisions, ability as well as uses of choirs, organ and praise groups	172
5.7.2.1	Setting up the online survey	173
5.7.2.2	Sample size	173
5.7.2.3	Sampling method	173
5.7.3	The online survey	174
5.7.4	Analysis of the return	178
5.7.4.1	Question 1 responses	178
5.7.4.2	Question 2 responses	179
5.7.4.3	Question 3 responses	180
5.7.4.4	Question 4 responses	181
5.7.4.5	Question 5 responses	182
5.7.5	Summary of the online survey	183
5.8	Addressing the research question	184
6	The survey	188
6.1	Research aim for this chapter	188
6.2	Research method for this chapter	188
6.3	Structure of this chapter	189
6.4	Collecting data from a number of churches over a fixed period of time	190

6.4.1	The year, days and services on which to base the sample	190
6.4.2	A list of the churches being sampled	192
6.4.3	The results of the survey	195
6.4.4	The number and percentage of eighteenth century hymns being sung both by Church and in total	200
6.5	Qualitative interview surveys	200
6.5.1	The sampling unit and size	201
6.5.2	The sample procedure	204
6.5.3	The questions asked in the survey	204
6.6	Snapshot data over a large number of churches on a given Sunday	205
6.6.1	Deciding the sample for the snapshot data	207
6.6.2	The churches chosen for the snapshot data section of the research	208
6.6.3	The results of the snapshot data	210
6.6.3.1	1 st Sunday in Advent	211
6.6.3.2	4 th Sunday after Epiphany	212
6.6.3.3	3 rd Sunday before Lent	213
6.6.3.4	1 st Sunday after Trinity	214
6.6.3.5	All Saints' Day	215
6.6.3.6	Totals	215
6.6	Addressing the research question	216
7	Findings from the research; the reasons why eighteenth century hymns have proved resilient in the contemporary Church of Ireland (Anglican) worship	223
7.1	Introduction and relation to previous chapter	223
7.2	Research method for this chapter	223
7.3	Structure of this chapter	224
7.4	Analysis of the ongoing data from 6.4	225
7.4.1	The validity of the data in an island-wide context	225
7.4.2	An analysis of individual Churches' responses and their approaches to worship	227

7.4.3	An analysis of the selected Sundays, a chronological evaluation	230
7.4.3.1	Advent, Christmas and Epiphany	230
7.4.3.2	Lent, Easter and Pentecost	231
7.4.3.3	Trinity and the Proper Sundays	233
7.4.3.4	Harvest, Remembrance and other festivals	233
7.4.4	The overall reasons and observations why eighteenth century hymns have been resilient as proven by the ongoing data	235
7.5	Why has the eighteenth century hymn proved resilient and why is it still popular today in the Church of Ireland?	236
7.6	Analysis of the qualitative, in-depth questionnaires from 6.5	241
7.5.1	Liturgical reasons for resilience	243
7.5.2	Socio-historical reasons for resilience	245
7.5.3	Literary reasons	247
7.5.4	Musical reasons for resilience	249
7.5.5	Clerical reasons for resilience	261
7.5.6	Congregational reasons for resilience	253
7.5.7	The overall reasons why eighteenth century hymns have proved resilient according to the information provided from the qualitative surveys	255
7.6	Analysis of the snapshot data from 6.6	257
7.6.1	Review of the Sundays selected for snapshot data	257
7.6.1.1	Analysis of the hymns sung on the 1 st Sunday in Advent	258
7.6.1.2	Analysis of the hymns sung on the 4 th Sunday of Epiphany	258
7.6.1.3	Analysis of the hymns sung on the 3 rd Sunday in Lent	259
7.6.1.4	Analysis of the hymns sung on the 1 st Sunday after Trinity	260
7.6.1.5	Analysis of the hymns sung on All Saints' Day	261
7.6.2	Review of the churches chosen	262
7.6.2.1	Clogher Cathedral	263
7.6.2.2	St Patrick's Church, Castle Archdale	263
7.6.2.3	Garvary Parish Church	264

7.6.2.4	St Columb's Cathedral, Londonderry	265
7.6.2.5	St Columba's Parish Church, Omagh	266
7.6.2.6	St Mary's Parish Church, Ardess	267
7.6.2.7	Cleenish Parish Church	268
7.6.2.8	Derryvullen North Parish Church, Irvinestown	269
7.6.2.9	Holy Trinity Parish Church, Lisnaskea	269
7.6.2.10	Maguiresbridge Parish Church	270
7.6.2.11	The Clones Group of Parishes	271
7.6.2.12	Tempo Parish Church	271
7.6.3	A summary of the overall reasons why eighteenth century hymns have been resilient as proven by the data	272
7.7	Addressing the research question	273
8	Conclusion	278
8.1	Introduction	278
8.2	Evaluating the fulfilment of the primary aims of the research	279
8.2.1	To identify the small canon of hymns that have survived to current usage in the Church of Ireland hymnal	279
8.2.2	To determine accurate statistics about the usage of these hymns in contemporary worship	280
8.2.3	To determine the key threats that these hymns have faced and continue to face	281
8.3	Summary of the overall reasons for resilience	282
8.4	Areas for research	283
8.4.1	Irish hymnody	283
8.4.2	Hymn writers	284
8.5	Final conclusions	285
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	286

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND AND PROBLEM STATEMENT

1.1.1 Background

The combination of observational, anecdotal and circumstantial evidence suggests that in the present-day Church, older, traditional hymns are slowly but inexorably being replaced by modern, contemporary ones. Whilst it is a truism that hymnody, like every other aspect of civilisation, moves forward with the times, there still remain significant numbers of people, congregations and clergy for whom the early eighteenth century English hymns by Watts, Cowper, Wesley and others represent a genre that “isn’t broken and thus doesn’t need being fixed” (Frame, 1997:23).

At present, existing research in this field tends to focus only on individual aspects of the various factors that may account for this resilience, as explained below.

First, a large number of studies and histories account for the development and subsequent maturation process of the English hymn from its early period of growth to the present day: Arnold (1995), Ball (1979), Colquhoun (1980) and Northcott (1964) being among some of the more popular critiques. Whilst some of these studies do have elements that touch on the eighteenth century hymns’ resilience, a second problem now arises in that this research is undertaken mostly by “clergy or musicians and (concentrates) on the use of the hymns for worship, on the content of hymns, or on their tunes” (Watson, 1997:vii).

Literature and studies which examine the development of the hymn in the history of the Anglican Church in Ireland (a church that embraces both the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland), are much less fertile, especially those that deal with hymnody and its practical usage. Grindle (1989) deals exclusively with history of a limited range of cathedrals in Ireland, focusing solely on anthems sung and a university dissertation

by McKee (1982) analyses almost exclusively the specific choral traditions of just one cathedral.

The purpose of this thesis is to draw together and evaluate what is special about the hymns produced during this period and to examine why so many of them still speak to people in a special way. To make the analysis comparable to potential global models, the process of examining the treatment of such hymns will be undertaken from an Anglican perspective, since this was the church that, in its earlier days, spoke against “man’s poetry” (Arnold, 1995:3) being used in services, yet eventually moved by the twenty-first century to embrace all kinds of music. Furthermore, with almost 400,000 Anglicans in Ireland (Church of Ireland, 2012) singing between 15 to 50 hymns per week (a figure based on four to five hymns per service with a usual minimum of three services per week to a maximum of ten in cathedrals) clearly there is a need for an academic account of the reasons why so many of these older hymns have withstood the test of time.

1.1.2 Problem Statement

There are four main reasons why this research focuses on the eighteenth century hymn as a means of comparison with present-day approaches to worship.

- The present day hymnals used in many Christian groups include music from before 1700: *Awake my soul*, *My song is love unknown*, and *Now thank we all our God* being three of many examples.
- The eighteenth century was a particularly fertile period for hymnody. Amongst others, Arnold (1995:2), for example, describes it as a period when congregational singing really started to develop and even critics from as far back as Fleming (1933:24) talk about the post-Reformation outpouring of emotions.
- In addition to this, the emergence of Isaac Watts and the Wesleys, amongst others, together with the popularity of their hymns promoted this period of proclivity for hymnody. Not only did Watts himself produce 697 hymns but many other contemporaries and “imitators” also wrote copiously in the period that followed (Arnold, 1995:3).

- Also, from an historical point of view, the period in Irish history following the Protestant ascendancy in 1691 to the Act of Union in 1801 parallels a period of liberalisation within the Anglican Church following the Toleration Act in 1689.

Indeed, the whole area of hymnody in the Church of Ireland appears to be under-researched, there being no holistic study taking into consideration all the factors that contribute to hymn usage in the Church. With this in mind, it would be desirable to determine why older, more traditional hymns continue to be published in Church of Ireland hymnals, and to identify the characteristics that go some way towards explaining their resilience.

Because of this, I believe there is need for further research to examine from the canonical, liturgical, musical and preferential points of view why these hymns continue to be sung to the present day, and also to study the wider political, socio-cultural, historical and doctrinal reasons for this resilience. This research will be achieved by:

- evaluating the situation in Ireland from the 1700s until now;
- establishing different periods of hymnal styles;
- determining the periodisation of Irish hymnody according to significant events in relevant Irish church and civic history and the relevant developments that occurred within these periods;
- establishing an 18th century canon of hymns; by understanding current approaches to hymnody and worship in the Anglican church in Ireland; and finally,
- determining and evaluating 21st century threats.

The overarching research question resulting from this problem statement is:

Why and how have eighteenth century hymns proved to be so resilient and durable in contemporary Church of Ireland worship?

1.2 THE AIM AND OBJECTIVES

1.2.1 The Aim

The aim of this thesis is to discover, by a careful evaluation of both the specific and wider issues of Church of Ireland liturgy and history, why and how older hymns have proved to be so resilient and durable in contemporary Church of Ireland worship.

1.2.2 The Objectives

In order to motivate and interrogate this topic the following will be undertaken:

- to examine why the eighteenth century is considered a golden period of hymn-writing;
- to identify the small canon of hymns that has survived to current usage in the Church of Ireland hymnal;
- to determine accurate statistics about the usage of these hymns in contemporary worship;
- to determine the key threats that these hymns have faced and continue to face; and
- to draw together the reasons how and/or why such hymns continue to be popular and sung today in everyday worship.

1.3 CENTRAL THEORETICAL ARGUMENT

The Central Theoretical Argument of the thesis is that eighteenth century hymns remain resilient in the contemporary Church of Ireland worship.

1.4 METHODOLOGY

This study will use a wide range of research methods since the overarching question is one that is not definable by a single method of analysis. Initially, most of my findings will come as a result of standard library work, reading and evaluating a wide range of criticisms and histories as well as looking at church records. As the research enters its midpoint, it will be necessary to conduct a number of questionnaires and carry out

field research since little accurate and up-to-date data exists. To determine the actual usage of hymns in real terms, as opposed to their listing in a hymnbook, research will focus on usage of hymns on a day-to-day basis.

This research will seek

- to gather on-going data from a selected number of churches over a fixed period of one year, thus allowing one to compare data at different points of time in the Church calendar.
- To gather data by administering quantitative, in-depth questionnaires to music decision-makers in selected churches, be they clerics or laity.
- To gather snapshot data derived from a large number of selected churches on a given Sunday.

When this section of the research is completed, the findings will be interpreted in the light of standard empirical library sources including published studies, academic journals and church records.

CHAPTER TWO: THE ANGLICAN CONTEXT. HYMNS AND HYMNODISTIC DEVELOPMENTS IN THE “MOTHER” ANGLICAN COMMUNITY, THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND, FROM THE REFORMATION TO THE PRESENT DAY

2.1 RESEARCH AIM FOR THIS CHAPTER

Where Chapter 1 outlined the title, scope and structure of the research, this chapter addresses the context of eighteenth century hymns and examines the hymnodistic developments that occurred in the “mother” church, the Church of England, from its inception in the Reformation to the present day.

There are four main aims for this chapter, namely:

- i. to examine hymnody from its beginnings until the eighteenth century;
- ii. to examine the hymns written in the eighteenth century, with special attention given to Isaac Watts and the Wesleys;
- iii. to examine how hymns moved on from the eighteenth century up until the present day.

The purpose of the first aim is to give an understanding of where hymnody lies in history, how hymns began and in what way they emerged from psalms, what their content was, who wrote them and a general discussion on their provenance, especially in relation to the *Church Hymnal* (2000), the official hymn book of the Church of Ireland.

The second aim is to focus on the period at the core of the research and accordingly to include a comprehensive study of the two main hymn writers of the era and their contemporaries, imitators and supporters.

The final aim charts the development of the hymn from Cotterill’s publication of *A Selection of Psalms and Hymns for Public and Private Use* until the present day, divided into three periods for practical purposes.

Having placed the hymn in history and categorised the main styles and themes, the research, by the end of this chapter, will be able to move forward to examine the key events in Church and state history that influenced the reasons why hymns were written. This chapter is sectionalised for ease of evaluating the arguments with relevant historical and ecclesiastical events being used as periodisation points.

2.2 RESEARCH METHOD FOR THIS CHAPTER

This chapter uses desk research from academic texts, articles and online documents accessed from the libraries of Queen's University, Belfast, and the Church of Ireland Theological College, Dublin. The sources drawn on reflect the literature of specialist hymnologists such as Richard Arnold and Nicholas Temperley, underpinned by the hymns and their commentaries in the current fifth edition of *The Church Hymnal*.

This chapter relies heavily on Darling and Davison's *Companion to the Church Hymnal* for three reasons. First, it is the official text that justifies the inclusion of hymns. Second, it acts as a very useful tool for providing a context or provenance of each hymn discussed. Finally, Bishop Darling is the one name who crops up time after time when consultation with experts in the field of Church of Ireland hymnody is sought.

Other texts are relied upon heavily too and the reasons for this are largely to do with the fire in the National Archives in Dublin (Citizens Information, 2011) as well as the fact that church hymnody is such a niche area, there are very few general histories of hymnody. In later chapters, greater, more specific evidence is employed but a relatively small corpus is needed for this chapter's work.

2.3 STRUCTURE OF THIS CHAPTER

In order to evaluate and interrogate the concept of why eighteenth century hymns, specifically within the Church of Ireland, have endured until today, it is necessary to look at the hymns, their writers, historical contexts, meanings and all associated hymnodistic developments and trends in the “mother” Anglican church, the Church of England. This is quite an apposite step to take, not only for the shared provenance due to the Church of Ireland being in the Anglican family, but also for reasons of macro-hymnody. Even today, their current comparable hymn books, the Church of Ireland’s *Church Hymnal* and the Church of England’s *Common Praise* (Anon., 2000) are very similar, sharing many hymns. This is further proof, if necessary, that, given the historical relationship between the two countries, peoples and churches, their musical history is in many ways two sides of the one coin.

This chapter takes the history of hymnody in the English Established Church and breaks it up into manageable periods. These periods are generic to most histories but are by no means absolute. Like any historical periodisation they are open to conjecture and remain in place simply as a means of context and information management.

In simple terms then, this chapter is a brief history of hymnody in relation to both an Anglican and, where specifically appropriate, an Irish perspective. The first section, 2.4, is essentially a platform-building exercise where the contexts of the beginnings of hymn singing, from its origins in metrical psalms, empirical accounts of hymnody, the Calvinistic movement through to post-Reformation hymnody as well as a discussion on the early hymn books of the Church of England, occupy the dissertation. The latter part of this, 2.4.2, deals with the Sternhold and Hopkins’ *Psalter* and starts to trace out and discuss some of the early hymns that are currently in the *Church Hymnal*.

The subsequent sections all take aforementioned definable points in church history and especially, Anglican or Irish church history, as approximate periodisation points for further discussions on hymns that are currently in the *Church Hymnal* and evaluate their relevance to this dissertation.

2.4 HYMNODY FROM ITS BEGINNINGS UNTIL 1707

2.4.1 The beginnings of hymnody up until the publication of the 1562 *Old Version Psalter*

Hymn-singing by a congregation is a relatively new occurrence in church worship compared to the much older practice of chanting metrical psalms by choirs or clergy (Arnold, 1995:1). However, with no empirical evidence found in any major university, public or clerical library, it is difficult to delineate an exact defining point in history when the first congregational hymn was sung (Manwaring, 1991:42), a view shared by major critics such as Arnold, who in *The English Hymn*, for example, reminds readers that “its (earlier) history is punctuated by profound disagreement and a virtual cascade of arguments” (1995:2).

By the middle of the 1500s records do start to filter through and by 1559 a Royal Injunction added to the Act of Uniformity of earlier in the same year, helped to draw a proverbial line in the sand when it set on record the role of singing in the established church. Their citation reads thus:

And that there be a modest distinct song, so used in all parts of the common prayers in the church, that the same may be understood, as if it were read without singing, and yet nevertheless, for the comforting of such that delight in music, it may be permitted that in the beginning, or in the end of common prayers, either at morning or evening, there may be sung an hymn, or such like song, to the praise of Almighty God, in the best sort of melody and music that may be conveniently devised, having respect that the sentence of the hymn may be understood and perceived (Fleming, 1879).

Whilst many argue about the actual definition of a “hymn” and who would sing it, from the perspective of defining a statutory starting point in an academic study of hymnody, the above Arnold quotation is as useful a milestone as any. However, as this study is not essentially concerned with the “birth” of the hymn but more the resilience of early hymns in modern society and worship, the arguments purported by scholars regarding the “whys and wherefores” of what constitutes a “hymn” or even “hymn singing” is of secondary importance to the central thesis. For instance, arguments extolled by Arnold *The English Hymn* (1995:1) develop the semantic possibilities meant by the words “permitted” and “devised”, and Temperley in *The Music of the English Parish*

Church (as quoted in Arnold, 1995:9) talks about which versions of the Book of Common Prayer were used in each part of England.

These and many other debates remain legitimate arguments in the study of hymnody but from the point of view of just establishing music as a congregational activity, it remains valid that the Act of Uniformity formally recognised, for the first time, hymn singing as being part of the Anglican service (Arnold, 1995:4).

The next part of the argument is more difficult to define; that being how many hymns were sung and how did hymns develop past the stage of being metrical psalms. To answer this, an understanding of the way in which the Anglican Church was doctrinally structured helps shed some light. By all accounts, during the years following the Act of Uniformity, the Church of England appeared to adopt a predominantly Calvinistic rather than a Lutheran point of view. This point is clearly evident not only by the quantity of hymns published in the “Old Version” of the Sternhold and Hopkins *Psalter* but also in the statutes of the Church, which state that anything sung should be “the pure word of God only”. Additionally, studies by Arnold (1975:4), Whitley (1993:7) and Temperley (1979:19) argue that Calvin “used his increasing influence to encourage the use of psalms and psalms alone” (Temperley, 1979:20). Given Calvin’s ideology (Arnold, 1975:39) then, it was understandably inevitable that developments beyond the setting of biblical tracts to song would manifestly have been very slow.

The Reformation of course was not solely English. Along with Calvin and Luther stood the important Swiss reformer and theologian, Huldrych Zwingli and the combined influence of all three, along with many countless others to lesser degrees, gave the churches in England the room to manoeuvre their Reformation (Arnold, 1995:3). Another important milestone in cultural and religious history, the Diet of Worms, played its well-known part in shaping history, not only by the way it dealt with Luther challenging the Pope, but also through the theological challenge which purported that

... salvation was by faith alone (sola fide) not through the legal mechanisms of the church or by what people did to earn it. He had also challenged the authority of the Church by maintaining that all doctrines and dogmas of the church should be accountable to the teachings of Scripture (sola scriptura) (Bratcher, 2011).

In 1523, for example, twenty or so years before the publication of the Sternold and Hopkins *Old Version*, Martin Luther asked Johann Walter and Conrad Rupff, both from Wittenberg, to compose music for *Psalms and Hymns* (Arnold, 1995:2). Several other hymnbooks followed such as the *Enchiridion* (Open Library, 2010) and *Gesangbuch* (both of which are now published online by Project Gutenberg) and by the mid-1500s the hymn was established as an integral part of German Protestant worship (Arnold, 1995:3).

The same was true for the rest of Europe. In France, for instance, the French *Metrical Psalter*, or the *Genevan Psalter* as it was more commonly known, was written for the largely Huguenot Protestant churches of France and Geneva and unlike its later English counterpart, it still enjoys uninterrupted use to the present day by Francophone Protestants (Daniell, 2003:39). Small changes have occurred though, such as relatively fresh arrangements written in the seventeenth century by Paschal de l'Estocart and Jan Pieterszoon Sweelinck. Two sources combined to make this Psalter: the poems of Clément Marot and the input of theologian Théodore de Bèze. The actual psalms were set in Gregorian form and featured popular airs and harmonisations that were suitably modified to make them more appealing for congregational singing.

The Dutch, too, produced their own psalter during this era. Compiled by Petrus Datheen in 1566, the work borrowed literal translations from Marot and Beza's French *Genevan Psalter*. Again, like its parent form, this psalter still enjoys usage amongst the Dutch Calvinist Reformed Church, receiving its most recent revision in 1985 (Pettegree, 2005:101). For the record, nowadays a metrical psalmbook is written into the *Liedboek voor de kerken* or *Church Hymnbook*.

The situation in Germany was again largely similar to the examples above. In 1573 Ambrosius Lobwasser translated the *Genevan Psalter* into German with the words being sung to harmonies written by Goudiemel up until the late 1700s (The Genevan Psalter, 1982). Rather interestingly, this very psalter, the *Psalter des königlichen Propheten Davids*, is the one used by the Amish community in North America today. Also, for the record, at the end of the eighteenth century the German pastor Mathias Jorissen popularised a new edition of this psalter in 1798 (Arnold, 1995:5).

Back in England however, the infamous *Psalter* of Sternhold and Hopkins was published in 1562, the product of a seed that started in 1547 when Sternhold published his nineteen *Certayn Psalmes*. The actual *Psalter*, many copies of which were bound with the *Geneva Bible*, was written in common metre with much of the music borrowed from the *Genevan Psalter*. It is fitting that the first hymn to be examined in this study is arguably the oldest and amongst the best known piece to survive from this time. The *Old 100th* is a “hymn” that has enjoyed continuous publication in the *Church Hymnal* to this very day, though the words have changed over the years, especially for use in Scottish churches (Dearmer, 133:37). The title *Old 100th* refers to the fact that the hymn, based on the one hundredth Psalm, was that from the Sternhold and Hopkins’ *Old Version*.

It is not the only psalm to survive though, as a cursory look in the source pages of a lot of hymnals will indicate, and likewise, tunes to accompany these works have also endured to the present day, though usually with more recent words (Fleming, 1937:24). An example of this is the fragment of a hymn published in Day’s *Psalter* in 1562, with more recent words by the nineteenth century Edward Osler. This hymn is now called *O God, unseen, yet ever near* and sung to St Flavian. Another example is part of the melody of *Rejoice in God’s Saints* or *The Old 104th*, which dates from earlier than its more complete form that appeared later in Ravenscroft’s *Psalmes* of 1621 (Darling & Davison, 2000:886).

1562 saw the eventual publication of the famous *Old Version* psalter, an amalgam of various metrical psalms written in ballad metre (Davie, 1993:72). As it transpired, this very psalter, approved by Edward VI, was to be the bedrock of worship for many years to come, indeed until the publication of the ‘New Version’ in 1821 (Arnold, 1995:3).

2.4.2 The first hymnbooks in the Church of England and early hymn writers: 1562 – 1660s

Moving into the 1600s and 1621 specifically, the aforementioned Thomas Ravenscroft published another edition of the *Old Version* by Sternhold and Hopkins. In this publication he added more psalms, many of which had accompanying tunes written by leading composers of the day such as Tallis, Dowland and Morley (Daniell, 2003:14). This is striking for the fact that Ravenscroft was not a theologian, cleric or poet; he was a musician and composer of minor fame.

The idea of writing poems based on biblical texts is not, of course, a wholly post-Sternhold and Hopkins phenomenon. Since the days of the earliest scribes, scholars, philosophers, monks and poets have all found the genre of a biblical poem an attraction (Manwaring, 1990:94). In respect of this, it is therefore necessary to define the works that were texts published with the sole purpose of being used, at least in part, as hymnbooks for congregational singing, as well as to examine writers who wrote biblical poems that were actually used as congregational hymns. If one takes the approximate time span from the publication of the *Old Version* in 1562 until the Restoration in 1660, this era covers around one hundred years. Although such a framework works for an historical perspective, perhaps given the slow pace of development of the seventeenth century, a more accurate period might be closer to one hundred and fifty years, especially if one considers the publication of Watts' first collection of hymns in 1709 as being the beginning of a new epoch in hymnody. As with everything in history, such periodisations are speculative and only help the author and reader comprehend information in manageable portions. The reality is probably much more haphazard with overlaps of what hymnals and Psalters were accepted in individual churches, varying not only from diocese to diocese, but from parish to parish.

As time moved on, there were initially, as Graham argues (2004:153), many attempts to supplant and replace the *Old Version*, and this eventually happened in 1696 when Nicholas Brady and later-to-be Poet Laureate, Nahum Tate published *A New Version of the Psalms of David*, preceded by the publication of *The Bay Psalm Book* of 1640, written and compiled for use by first-generation descendents of the Pilgrim Fathers in

Massachusetts, USA. Indeed, like the *Psalter des königlichen Propheten Davids* referred to in 2.4.1, this hymnal has gone through many editions and is still in use today (Graham, 2004:1).

Until this point, Christians in general, but Puritans especially, were hopeful that a new spirit would emerge from the accession of King James I in 1603, though this did not actually materialise. What did happen though were authorisations of the *Jacobean Prayer Book* in 1604 and a new translation of the Bible, published in 1611 (Chapell, 1968:37). Also during this time, though its use in congregational music is beyond the scope of this study, was the possible influence from what is loosely described as the “golden period” of English choral music. This was, after all, the era of Byrd, Tallis, Gibbons, Tompkins, Weelkes and Tye, all household names in the canon of classical music and all anthem writers for the English Cathedral, with many of them organists in the most influential of sees.

The next significant, relevant development in the post-Sternhold and Hopkins period was the publication of the *Psalms of David* by George Wither (1558 – 1667) which was written in 1632 or, as the script on the book says, “translated into Lyrick-Verse, according to the scope of the Original”. Together with another publication of his, *Hymnes and Songs of the Church* in 1623, both were seen as the first serious challengers to the singing or chanting of psalmody. Wither struggled with this concept and also the requirements of the Protestant tradition against the increasing demands of Reformation theology. Whilst this was clearly an area of conflict in his writing (Watson, 1997:38), he did create “new” texts out of the Psalms and thus must be credited, at least in part, with the creation of “hymns”.

The impact of this publication must have been enormous, as Wither greatly extended the original scope and use of the Sternhold and Hopkins *Psalter*. In his book of 1624, *The Scholars’ Purgatory*, he argued that he needed to develop the principles of metrical psalmody, which meant including other parts of the Bible (Watson, 1997:58). With this in mind his *Hymnes and Songs of the Church* included *Songs of Moses* from Exodus XV, *The Song of Deborah and Barak* from Judges V and *The Song of Hannah* from I Samuel 2. The book (Wither, 1967) also includes ten canticles of *The Song of*

Songs, five *Lamentations* of Jeremiah, all written in what one now would classify as hymnal style, and other hymns less directly referable to actual scriptural texts.

The metaphysical poet John Donne (1572 -1631), dean of St Paul's in the Stuart reign, also contributed to the development of the hymn with *A Hymn to God the Father* and *Holy Sonnet*, both of which start to move towards a more poetic style. Donne, a lover of "God, woman and all humanity ... (and) much obsessed about death" is remembered most for a line from a sermon: "Ask not for whom the bell tolls: it tolls for thee" (Manwaring, 1990:43-4). None of his works are in the *Church Hymnal*.

Similarly at this time, four poems of the Cambridge-educated priest George Herbert (1593 – 1633) became hymns which have survived until the current version of the Church Hymnal. *King of Glory*, *King of Peace*, normally sung to *Gwalchmai*, a Welsh air written by Joseph Jones, shows the direct influence of Hebrews 7:2 (Tuve, 1982:71). It is a hymn which has an unusual provenance, not only in that it was first written by Herbert as a poem, never intended for hymnal use, but because it was continually overlooked as a text, even as late as 1891, when it was not even indexed in Julian's Dictionary (Deamer, 1933:294). Then in 1736 John Wesley converted this poem into common metre and published it in his first hymn book, *Collection of Psalms and Hymns*. Thus he assured its exposure before Robert Bridges somewhat adjusted the stanza settings to its current form and included it in the *Yattendon Hymnal* of 1899 (Darling & Davison, 2005:494) from whence it subsequently was introduced to the *Church Hymnal*.

The second of Herbert's hymns, the famous *Let all the World in every corner sing*, based on Psalm 145, is known the world over (Watson, 1997:72) sung to *Luckington* and has the unusual metre of 10.4.6.6.6.6. Like all his hymns, this was originally published as a poem, but perhaps Herbert had some idea that it would make suitable material for singing, for he gave it the subtitle *Antiphon* (Darling & Davison, 2005:496).

Teach me my God and King, sung to the nineteenth century tune of *Sandys*, the third poem from *The Temple, Sacred Poems and Private Ejaculations*, was titled *Elixir*. The title is metaphorical and implies that if one applies one's life to the words "for thy sake", one's life can be transformed in the way that non-precious metals can be made

precious by the process of applying an “elixir” in the then popular seventeenth century fore-runner to chemistry, alchemy (Watson, 1997:97).

Also by Herbert, *Come my Way*, popularised by Ralph Vaughan Williams in the twentieth century, is arguably less known than the author’s previous three hymns, but does extol a message of commitment, prayer and intercession. The hymn is fundamentally a meditation on the Lord’s words to Thomas in John 14:6. It has enjoyed recent popularity, at least according to Darling and Davison, due to its being set to a popular air by Vaughan Williams (Darling & Davison, 2005:795).

Arguably one of Herbert’s closest supporters was Welsh poet and doctor, Henry Vaughan (1622 – 95). To many he was simply an imitator of Herbert, a point discussed by Calhoun (1981:66) where he argues that “(in) some instances, Vaughan derives observations from Herbert’s language that are distinctly his own. It is as if Vaughan takes proprietorship of some of Herbert’s work, yet makes it completely unique to himself”. Calhoun also points out that Vaughan is different from George Herbert in the way in which he presents his poetry. He writes, “George Herbert in *The Temple*, which is most often the source of comparison between the two writers, lays down explicit instructions on the reading of his work. This contrasts with the attitude of Vaughan, who considered the experience of reading as the best guide to his meanings” (Calhoun, 1981:104). No such works of Vaughan survive in the *Church Hymnal* but his contribution to the pre-Restoration hymn was significant nonetheless.

Only one of John Cosin’s hymns survives until the publication of the 2000 edition of the *Church Hymnal: Come Holy Ghost, our souls inspire*, with an anonymous nineteenth century English air in Mechlin modal form, harmonised by Geoffrey Shaw (Darling & Davison, 2000:551). Darling and Davison argue that the source of the words of this hymn, the *Veni Creator Spiritus*, is probably “the greatest and most widely used hymn in the Western Church” apart from the *Te Deum* (Darling & Davison, 2005:416). *The Collection of Private Devotions*, from which this hymn came, was published in 1627 and was written at the request of King Charles I and the original words of this hymn probably came from Rabanus Magnentius Maurus (776 – 856) the sixth Archbishop of

Mainz, an archdiocese now in Germany but then part of the Holy Roman Empire (Darling & Davison, 2005:416; The Fact Index, 2010).

The significance of this hymn and its place in the *Church Hymnal*, other than its clear historical value, is that it offers “Prayers for the Third House” and, according to Watson, “was placed there because the descent of the Holy Ghost at Pentecost was traditionally thought to have been at the third hour ... This enables him (Cosin) to be allusive, metaphorical, and symbolic” (Watson, 1997:88).

Influenced by the Cambridge Platonists (Pweicke, 1926:62), John Mason was a poet with a “great interest in mystical doctrine and lyrical eloquence” (Watson, 1997:90). His best known hymn, *How shall I sing that majesty*, is in the 2000 edition of the *Church Hymnal* and is set to an air by the twentieth century composer Kenneth Naylor. Again, Watson (1997:90) reminds readers that Mason’s hymn is based on Daniel 7:9-14 and is in Double Common Metre, a form that Mason used almost uniformly, and that it comes from *Spiritual Songs*, a compilation published in 1683, though the 2000 edition of the *Church Hymnal* is its first use in the Church of Ireland. Other hymn writers in this period include John Milton, Jane Austin and Joseph Addison.

Whilst Richard Baxter and Thomas Ken were published in English Anglican hymnals (Brownlie, 1911:122), their works never made it to Irish annals. On the other hand, Milton, Austin and Addison do, with the first of them, the author of *Paradise Lost*, John Milton (1608 – 74), contributing two hymns to the current edition of *The Church Hymnal*. The first one, inspired by a collection of poems published in 1673, *The Lord will come and not be slow*, is a cento of uncertain origin, first appearing as a hymn much later in 1859 with stanzas selected from Milton’s own paraphrases (Dearmer, 1933:348). His second hymn in Irish Anglican usage, *How lovely are thy dwellings fair*, was written in 1648 and is one of the poet’s nineteen paraphrased Psalms. It first appeared in the fourth edition of the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:466).

Oxford-educated Joseph Addison is probably best known for launching *The Spectator* magazine in 1711 (Brownlie, 1911:117-121). Of interest to this thesis is his friendship with Dean Swift (McAuley, as quoted in Fleming, 1937:27) and his contribution of two hymns to the *Hymnal*. The first of these, *The spacious firmament on high*, is based on

Psalm 19:1-6 and was published at the end of an article he himself wrote for *The Spectator* in which he writes about strengthening and confirming faith (Watson, 1997:72). Indeed, Addison's entire collection of five hymns was published in his magazine between 1711 and 1712 (Darling & Davison, 2005:90). The second of his hymns, *When all Thy mercies, O my God*, which is based on Psalm 103, was, like the work of many composers, never intended for public use. It appeared in *The Spectator* at the end of an article on "gratitude" and it was not until John Wesley discovered it and published all thirteen verses of it in his Charleston *Collection of Psalms and Hymns* in 1737 did its use start to become widespread (Watson, 1997:153; Arnold, 1995:75).

By the end of this pre-Restoration period more hymns were written, but as Arnold points out, "the metrical Psalm had a long and virtually absolute reign in England from the 1540s until well into the eighteenth century, even into the nineteenth, officially" (Arnold, 1995:6).

2.4.3 Developments in the late seventeenth century, the Restoration, the Savoy Conference and the debate on congregational singing

In the 1660s several factors converged in English and Anglican history within a narrow time frame. Whilst specific factors concerning the causes and direct effects are beyond the scope of this study, the general outcomes are, and the impact of these events must surely have influenced how poets, clergy, laity, hymn writers and ordinary people must have felt. Within seven years three events occurred that shaped church history in the UK and Ireland. In 1660 the Restoration of the English monarchy followed on from the end of the English Civil War; 1662 saw both the Savoy Conference and the Act of Uniformity; in 1666, the Great Fire of London happened and finally, in 1667, the publication of Playford's *The Whole Book of Psalms* and Milton's publication of *Paradise Lost*, in which he depicts the devils as the first Calvinists, took place in London.

For a great complexity of reasons such as European influences, the development of the form of the hymn, growing awareness of the Puritan point of view and generally the

inevitable march of “civilisation”, the debate about congregational hymn singing started to gather momentum. In 1690, the same year as the Battle of Boyne in Ireland, Robert Steed published his *Essay Concerning Singing in the Public Worship of God*, causing an immediate debate. No sooner had Steed purported that if singing was to be allowed in church, then it should be “mental” singing and done silently like prayer, than Richard Allen counter-argued that “it was the duty for men to praise God in their hearts ... but also with their mouths; and this not by speaking but also by singing his Praise” (Woolsey *et al.*, 1884:51). Both quote biblical texts to support their arguments with Allen’s argument seemingly to have been the more popular line of thought (Arnold, 1995:16).

One year later, in 1691, the Baptist minister Benjamin Keach also took Allen’s line with an essay entitled *A sober reply to Mr Robert Steed’s Epistole concerning Singing in the Public Worship of God*. This was followed by a response by Isaac Marlow who in *Prelimited Forms of Praising God, Vocally Sung by all the Church together, Proved to be no Gospel-Ordinance*, warned that “if such singing should be admitted and imbraced (sic) by the Churches, it would lay such a Foundation for other formal and carnal Worship” (Temperley, 1979:19).

1696 saw the publication of Nahum Tate and Nicholas Brady’s *New Version of the Psalms of David*, a combined effort by laity and clergy. Tate, a poet laureate and librettist and a “man of intemperate and improvident life” (Julian, 1907:920) and Brady, a Doctor of Divinity from Trinity College, Dublin, gained immediate recognition by William III with their publication. This *New Version* was very soon endorsed by the leading clergy of the day and accepted in the major bishoprics of the era but the *Old Version* by Sternhold and Hopkins, according to Temperley, still retained the hegemony for most of the eighteenth century (Temperley, 1979:123).

The arguments over singing in church continued unabated nonetheless, with essay and counter-essay and more and more people being drawn in, including well-known clergy such as Joseph Masters, William Collins, Richard Adams, James Jones, Hercules Collins, Richard Mariot, Abednego Smith, Leonard Harrison, Benjamin Dennis, Joseph Wright, William Groome, Samuel Bagwell, John Christopher and Thomas Winnell (Arnold,

1995:19). Perhaps, to examine the situation summatively, most seem to loosely align themselves in either the Marlow or Keach camp. However, Arnold continues to argue that hymn writing continued unabashed with several works being written that are still in the canon today (1995:19).

Cambridge-educated Samuel Crossman, a victim of the Act of Uniformity when he was expelled for his Puritan views, was re-ordained an Anglican in 1665 and eventually rose to the post of Dean of Bristol Cathedral where he remained until his death in 1683 (Fleming, 1937:27). His hymn *My song is love unknown* is a relatively recent inclusion in the Church Hymnals, only joining the fourth edition of the *Hymnal* following its popularity from its publication in *The Public School Hymnbook* of 1919 (Ferguson & Shaw, eds., 1919:212) and its setting to an air by the famous English composer John Ireland (1879 – 1962) (Darling & Davison:2005:336). According to the historian Barnby, it follows an idea from that period that still exists to the present day of “glorying in the cross as an expression of God’s love” (1995:85) with Watson, however, describing the hymn as being “a narrative with commentary, a story of love on one side and brutality on the other, told with swift compression and given a gloss of indignation, amazement, and even irony” (Watson, 1997:93).

Crossman also authored *The Young Man’s Meditation or Some few Sacred Poems upon Select Subjects and Scriptures* (1664). As Crossman was a Puritan at heart, the tone of the book, according to Watson (Watson, 1997:97), is similar to Baxter’s *Poetical Fragments*, published seventeen years later in 1681.

Thomas Ken (1637 – 1711), one of the famous non-juring bishops at the time of the Declaration of Indulgence, also contributed to the development of the hymn at this period. His morning and evening hymns, *Awake my soul* and *All praise to thee*, were both written in 1674 and remain in the Church Hymnal. Collectively they are known as the “Winchester College hymns” as it was that school he wrote them for. Ken, by virtue of his being a master at Winchester College, a school for boys, had a mix of “high-minded idealism and ... tolerant understanding” (Watson, 1997:94). Darling and Davison point out that it “is important to remember that the hymns were meant for private use and not for singing during public worship”, indeed Ken himself was alleged

to have sung them to himself “every morning before putting his clothes on, accompanying himself on a lute” (Darling & Davison, 2005:108). From a liturgical point of view, *Awake my soul* is viewed as a hymn, which according to Watson, is “universally known and loved for its plain speaking and neat versification: it is able to sum up the daily discipline of the Christian life with a high sense of purpose and yet with humanity” (1997:114).

Also, rather interestingly, the last lines end with a form of the Gloria, “praise God from whom all blessings flow”, an ending that was typical of all Winchester hymns (Darling & Davison, 2005:108). The antithetical hymn *All Praise to thee my God this night* has suffered a lot of changes throughout its history, with stanzas being mixed up and randomly put together from hymnal to hymnal (Watson, 1997:109). The hymn is already successful as, according to Darling and Davison (2005:108), the sentiment is the combination of all the elements that surely comprise a good evening hymn, but also because of its setting to the famous Tallis’ canon (The Hymnary, 2007a).

Contemporaneous with Ken was Benjamin Keach, the author of so many essays already referred to. Keach was also a hymn-writer but none of his works have been used in any versions of the Church Hymnal.

Also during this period, Richard Baxter (1615 – 91) deserves consideration. A Puritan at heart, he suffered professionally after the Act of Uniformity but his influence as a minister and hymn-writer is not to be underestimated (Cook & Harrison, 1977:552). According to Nutall, Baxter was a voluminous writer (Nutall, 1965:115) with his poems showing “a contrast between the soul on earth ... and the glories of heaven” (Watson, 1997:116). One of his best-known, *Ye Holy Angels bright*, was originally written as a poem entitled *A Psalm of Praise to the tune of Psalm 148* and was written in what is called “Peculiar Measure”, allowing it to be sung to whatever pointing for that Psalm was available (Darling & Davison, 2005:519).

He who would valiant Be by John Bunyan is an unusual hymn from this period in that the original, altered from *The Pilgrim’s Progress*, is not entirely different from the more popularly sung version by Percy Dearmer. Both versions are listed separately in the current 2000 *Church Hymnal*, with identical metre, and both are usually sung to the

tune *Monks Gate*, an old English tune adapted by Vaughan Williams (1872 – 1958), a tune that the composer arranged from a folk tune he heard being sung in the village of Horsham, Sussex (Horsham Council, 2010). Bunyan was a Reformed Baptist within the Church of England and the allegorical poem from which *He who would valiant be* was taken was written in two parts in 1678 and 1684. Although not originally meant to be a hymn (Darling & Davison, 2005:588), it is now considered to be one of the finest pieces of Christian writing and has never been out of print since its publication in 1786. Its first inclusion in a hymn book was in *Our Hymnbook* published by E. Paxton Hood in 1873 before Percy Dearmer re-worked it to be included in the first edition of the *English Hymnal* of 1906, of which Dearmer was one of the editors (Darling & Davison, 2005:858).

Although a Baptist Dissenter, Joseph Stennett, 1663-1713, author of many hymns for his own church, but none that survive the various editions of the Church of Ireland Hymnals, was another influential writer of the pre-Watts era (The Hymnary, 2007b). His lasting contribution to that era was the publication of two hymn books in 1697 and 1712, *Hymns in Commemoration of the Sufferings of our Blessed Saviour Jesus Christ, compos'd for the Celebration of His Holy Supper* and *Hymns compos'd for the Holy Ordinance of Baptism* (Watson, 1997:127-8). As the title of his first collection suggests, his mission was to show the relationship between Holy Communion and the sacrifice of Jesus Christ. This he does in the known hymn *From Supper to Gethsemane* in which he presents the action in the poem in the way that a person in real time would follow a Mystery Play (Watson, 1997:129).

2.5 THE PUBLICATION OF WATTS' HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS IN 1707 UNTIL A SELECTION OF PSALMS AND HYMNS FOR PUBLIC AND PRIVATE USE BY THOMAS COTTERILL, 1819

2.5.1 Isaac Watts, his imitators and followers (1707 – 1780)

While the pace of hymn singing remained slow in the seventeenth century and Psalms were being used almost exclusively in the Anglican Church (Fleming, 1937:28), events took a change in the early eighteenth century with the publication of Isaac Watts'

“epoch making” (Fleming, 1937:29) *Hymns and Spiritual Songs* in 1707. The story is old and much told; disgruntled with the current offering of Psalms, the then young man took the advice of his father on the way home from church one Sunday morning, who allegedly told him to “write something better himself than” (Hood, 1875:90). This advice he heeded; the preface of his first volume hints at the type of message he, as a young man studying for the ministry, was trying to achieve: “evangelical, not trammelled by Hebrew models, a response to God, expressing the thoughts and feelings of those who sang” (Fleming, 1937:29). Nonetheless, Watts thought deeply about whether or not to publish this hymn book. He was aware of the “controversie of singing”, as Arnold quotes, for dissenting sects were hesitant about admitting innovative worship-song at the time (1995:36). One of his most encouraging critics was his brother Enoch who was a strong advocate of publication, telling him that “Sternhold and Hopkins are ancient ... there is, therefore, a great need of a pen, vigorous and lively as yours, to quicken and revive the dying devotion of the age” (Arnold, 1995:36).

Isaac Watts (1774 – 1848) was born in Southampton and despite being a scholar at King Edward VI School, was not able to go to Oxbridge because of his non-conformist views (Milner, 2011:177). Of the many hymns of his that are around today, a remarkable sixteen remain in the *Church Hymnal*. They are, in order of appearance in the 2000 edition: *I sing the Almighty power of God; Good is the Lord, our Heavenly King; Sweet is the work, my God and King; Jesus shall reign where'er the sun; Joy to the World; Nature with open volume stands; When I survey the wondrous cross; Come, let us join our cheerful songs; From all that dwell below the skies; Give to our God, immortal praise; I'll praise the Maker while I've breath; Give us the wings of faith to rise; How bright those glorious spirits shine; O God, our help in ages past; Blessed be the everlasting God and There is a land of pure delight.*

First published in *Divine Songs attempted in Easy Language for the Use of Children* in 1715, Watts' *I sing the almighty power of God* is based on the story of Creation as told in Genesis Chapter 1 (Rare Book Room, 2011). The hymn, formerly known as *Praise for Creation and Providence* (Watson, 1997:139), is often set to two airs, *Montrose* and *Solomon*. *Montrose* is an old air revived by Sir Henry Walford Davis for the Coronation

of King George VI in 1937 while *Solomon* is an air based on a piece of music from Handel's oratorio of the same name. The former tune, *Montrose*, appears to be the more popular air, at least according to Darling and Davison (2005:97).

Good is the Lord, our Heavenly King is rarely published in other hymnals than the Church of Ireland one, if at all (Darling & Davison, 2005:97). The original hymn was based on occasional verses of the 65th Psalm and was first published in Watts' *Psalms of David Imitated in the Language of the New Testament* and was at this stage entitled *The Blessings of Spring*. The accompanying tune in the Church Hymnal is *Bishopsthorpe*, a tune alleged to have been written by Jeremiah Clarke, though an error down the ages may mean that it is more likely to have been written by the less famous organist of the church that is now Birmingham Roman Catholic Cathedral, another Jeremiah Clark (Anon., 1987:227).

Sweet is the work, my God and King is also a hymn that has not enjoyed many publications beyond the Church of Ireland hymnals; it made its first appearance in *Psalms of David Imitated in the Language of the New Testament*. It was called *A song for the Lord's Day* by Watts himself and is based on Psalm 92 (Darling & Davison, 2005:139).

Jesus shall reign where'er the sun was written by Watts in his quest to "Christianise" the sacred poems of the Jewish canon and is very tightly based on Psalm 72:5, 8 and 12-19 (Barnby, 1996:11). It was originally written in eight stanzas and called *Christ's Kingdom among the Gentiles*; verses 2, 3 and 7 are omitted in most contemporary versions and like the previous two examples (The Hymnary, 2007b), it was first published in *Psalms of David Imitated in the Language of the New Testament*. Two tunes are popular for this in Irish Anglican music, *Truro* and *Rimmington*, with the former proving the more popular (Darling & Davison, 2005:160-1).

Published in the same book also was *Joy to the World, the Lord is come!* The words are based on verses 4-9 of Psalm 98 and include a verse that is nowadays usually omitted as it is criticised for having a less happy meaning and context than the rest of the hymn (Darling & Davison, 2005:256). The hymn is, according to Manwaring (as quoted in

Darling & Davison, 2005:257), typical of the “Christianised Psalm” which he argues Watts thought would be more palatable for the contemporary church-going public to digest. The tune *Antioch*, to which the piece is sung, is often attributed to Handel but seems to have come from England much later, in about 1834, when first published in the *Voce di Melodia*, edited by Holford (Darling & Davison, 2005:257).

Nature with open volume stands, published in 1707, is very typical of Watts’ personal theology in that the mind can learn from nature. In ways it is similar to *When I survey* but is different in that it focuses on the doctrines behind atonement and not as much on the individual responses to it (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:134).

The popular hymn *When I survey the wondrous cross*, based on Galatians 4:14 (Darling & Davison, 2005:356) was first published in 1710 in Book III of *Hymns and Spiritual Songs* and was included in the Holy Communion section of the volume. The *Church Hymnal* now omits verse 4 for its graphic account of the “crimson robe”. The hymn is undoubtedly popular, indeed in Watson and Dudley-Smith’s view (2003:126) it is “a profound meditation on the sufferings and death of Jesus Christ, discussing its effect on the individual believer. It is a very complex hymn, drawing on traditions of contemplative thought that go back to the Middle Ages and have affinities with Counter-Reformation theology, as found in the Spiritual Exercises of St Ignatius Loyola”.

From the earlier Book I of *Hymns and Spiritual Songs*, the hymn *Come, let us join our cheerful songs* uses ideas from Revelation 5, 11, 12 and 13. In Book II *Give us the wings of faith to rise* uses the examples of saints who have experienced suffering, thus giving comfort to mankind (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:126).

Watts also wrote hymns that were paraphrases of Psalms. *For all that dwell below the skies* restates Psalm 117 and appeared first in 1719 in Watts’ *Psalms of David Imitated in the Language of the New Testament and Applied to the Christian State and Worship*. Indeed this very title shows how Watts takes ideas from the Old Testament and “Christianises” them. Likewise, in the same publication, *Give to our God immortal praise* is a paraphrase of Psalm 136 and *I’ll praise my Maker while I’ve breath* reworks Psalm 146. Revelation 7: 13 – 17 is the source of inspiration for Watts’ *How bright*

those glorious spirits shine, first appearing in his *Hymns and Spiritual Songs* with the sub-heading of *The Business and Blessedness of Glorified Saints* and *Blessed be the everlasting God* is a paraphrase of 1 Peter 1:3 – 5.

O God, our help in ages past first appeared in 1719 entitled *Man as frail and God as eternal* and although not admitted so by Watts himself, it is more than likely that it is based on Psalm 90: 1 – 6. It originally had nine stanzas, two of which are commonly omitted (Darling & Davison, 2005:709) as they, according to Julian, “impede the grandly sustained flow of thought” (Dearmer, 1933:316). The tune to which it is customarily known, *St Anne*, is of unknown origin, having first appeared anonymously in Brady and Tate’s *A Supplement to the New Version of Psalms* in 1708.

It is fitting that the person many call “the father of the hymn” has the last say in the *Church Hymnal*. The hymn *There is a land of pure delight*, according to his biographer Wright, is said to have been inspired by the view that Watts had one day while looking over the Southampton Water (Barnby, 1996:102). The hymn, first published in his *Psalms and Spiritual Songs*, clearly lays out its intentions by its heading above the title: *A prospect of heaven makes Death seem easy*. Darling and Davison state that it is conceivable that there are three sources of inspiration for the hymn. First, the story of the exodus of the Children of Israel passing through wilderness before reaching the Promised Land of Canaan, as told in Deuteronomy 34. Second, the description of the land of Beulah as told in Bunyan’s *Pilgrim’s Progress* and also quoted in Isaiah 62: 4 as being the land where the exiles had returned, and finally, the aforementioned view of the Southampton Water (2005:881).

There is a theme in Watts’ hymns; his hymnody is based “on a system of belief (drawn) from his study of natural philosophy and theology: it celebrates the glory of God in the created world, but does not stop there, because it insists on the importance of revealed religion and on the saving grace of Jesus Christ” (Watson, 1997:136). Perhaps it is this honesty and love of the Saviour what makes him so enduring until the present day. Watts seems to thrill in the glory of the created world of mankind and the Divine order, the Crucifixion and the Resurrection. Understandably, then, there are many literary interpretations of Watts’ hymns. Davie, in *The Eighteenth Century Hymn*,

argues that the meanings in his hymns are axiomatic (1993:27, 48) and while such discussions are interesting they are irrelevant in defining the canon of hymns used in the various *Church Hymnals*. On balance though, Watts' hymns were immensely popular; they were sung widely, but modern literary analysis of them does not really address why they have been around for so long.

So how did Watts help bridge the gap between those who wanted to solely use Psalms for worship and those who wanted to incorporate spiritual songs? The answer seems to be in his preface where he placates those who are uncertain about the legitimacy of human words being used in the House of God. He writes that "(church singing is) that Part of Worship which of all others is the nearest akin to Heaven; and it is a pity that this, of all others, should be performed the worst upon Earth" (Watts, 1707).

Hymns and Spiritual Songs sold phenomenally well upon its publication, being reprinted eighteen times before his death. Needless to say, a school of Wattsonian writers followed in the wake of this publication, not least Simon Browne who not only borrowed the title *Hymns and Spiritual Songs* but saw his 1720 publication as being a supplement to Watts' work. *Come gracious Spirit, Heavenly Dove*, still survives as his sole offering in the 2000 *Church Hymnal* and Browne remains as, arguably, an imitator of Watts (Arnold, 1995:254).

A member of the dissenting ministry, Philip Doddridge (1702 – 1751), was a prolific author who wrote over four hundred hymns (Brownlie, 1911:170), five of which are in the *Hymnal*. He was a contemporary of Isaac Watts but, unlike him, he wrote his hymns on a weekly basis, to be sung by his Congregationalist Church after the sermon (Darling & Davison, 2005:199). Because of this, the manuscripts are dated precisely and the first of his works in the Hymnal, *Hark the glad sound! The saviour comes*, is dated 28 December, 1735 and is inscribed with the subtitle, "Christ's message from Luke 4: 18-19" (Darling & Davison, 2005:199). This hymn, which is now four stanzas, has been slowly reduced over the years from its original seven and is a tale of the poor being enriched (Manwaring, 1991:71). In the Church of Ireland it is historically sung to the tune *Nottingham* though in the rest of the Anglican community it is better known

to the tune *Bristol*, the tune that was associated with it in Thomas Ravenscroft's *The Whole Book of Psalmes* (Darling & Davison, 2005:199).

Doddridge was a well-known admirer of Watts. He has been quoted as having said, when he was 29 years old, "We sang one of your (Watts') hymns ... and in that part of the worship I had the satisfaction to observe tears in the eyes of several of the people; and after the service was over some of them told me they were not able to sing, so deeply were their minds affected" (Abbey & Overton, 1878:256).

Born into a clerical family, his father being a non-conformist minister following the Act of Uniformity, Doddridge too, at least superficially, subscribed to similar values as Watts but on a deeper level. His views on theology are similar to a contemporary of his, the Calvinist John Gill, who agreed "the scope of the atonement as being limited savingly to the elect and that Christ's death nevertheless provides, indirectly, some non-saving, universal benefits" (Ella, 1998).

Posthumously published by Job Orton some twenty years later in 1755 in *Hymns founded on Various Texts*, Doddridge's hymn *Ye servants of the Lord* is based on the parable of the wise and foolish virgins. In keeping with Doddridge's style the hymn enjoyed a previous more direct title, namely *The active Christian, Luke 12:35-38* (Manwaring, 1991:71). Also in this volume by Orton was the communion hymn, *My God your table here is spread*, previously entitled *God's name profaned, when his Table is Treated with Contempt, Malachi 1:2*. Rather interestingly this hymn was included in the current *Church Hymnal* thanks in no small part to the number of requests from members of the Church of Ireland (Darling & Davison, 2005:199).

Also included in the same volume on account of its popularity amongst Church members, *O happy day that fixed my choice*, originally entitled *Rejoicing in our Covenant Engagements to God: 2 Chronicles 15:15*, was the final hymn in the Church Hymnal to come from Orton's posthumous tribute to Doddridge (Darling & Davison, 2005:776).

The final one of Doddridge's five hymns in the Hymnal, *O God of Bethel*, is a hymn that has enjoyed a history of its own, with its title originally *Jacob's vow*, and the number of

stanzas included varying from hymn book to hymn book from its first publication in 1745 (Barnby, 1996:58) until its current inclusion in the Church of Ireland *Hymnal* in 2000.

Anne Steele, one of very few contemporary female hymn writers, contributes to the *Church Hymnal* one hymn from the many she wrote. *To our Redeemer's glorious name* is in common metre and is usually sang to *Jackson*, an air by Thomas Jackson, an eighteenth century composer. Steele was a strict Calvinist and in the 1814 edition of *A selection of hymns for public worship* she has twenty-seven poems. Although she was very similar to Doddridge, both being followers of Watts, her style is to begin with an "experience" or emotion, whereas Doddridge worked more by versifying the narrative (Watson, 1997:195).

Two other hymn writers who enjoyed success during this period were Benjamin Beddome (1717 – 95) and Samuel Stennett (1727 – 95), though none of their works were published in any of the *Church Hymnals* (Darling & Davison, 2005:ix). Beddome, a Baptist, is now largely forgotten, though he did write quite a large volume of hymns (Beddome Blogspot, 2007). Stennett, a third generation hymn writer, is, according to Watson, representative of the "decline of the Baptist tradition into the unexciting". Of his actual output he is equally scathing, saying that his hymns "are difficult to sing because they are somehow inert, metrical arrangements of religious experiences without the energy and excitement of the metrical psalmists or the early Baptists" (Watson, 1997:204).

Whilst Watts and his followers remained popular in the early part of the seventeenth century, the growth of Methodism and the sheer volume of very popular hymns from the pen of Charles Wesley left this era with a rich cultural legacy (Fleming, 1937:31).

2.5.2 John and Charles Wesley, their contemporaries and imitators

The Wesley brothers, John (1703 – 1791) and Charles (1707 – 1788), anchors of the roots of Methodism, were the fifteenth and seventeenth sons of their clergyman father, Samuel Wesley. Both went to Oxford University and both had a life dedicated to the promotion of their evangelical style of preaching and worship. Their popular hymns, many of which are in all editions of the Church Hymnal, are aptly summed up by Manwaring as having “directness and simplicity (as characteristics of their) hymns ... (being) alive with metaphor and alliteration ... (and) making use of the idioms of popular songs of the day “ (Manwaring, 1991:68).

2.5.2.1 John Wesley

The elder of the two brothers, John Wesley, was said to be first attracted by the idea of hymn singing in church from a trip to Georgia, USA, in 1735-36. On that trip he met Moravians and joined in their singing and subsequently the hymnbook they sang from, *Das Gesangbuch der Gemeine in Hernhut*, was translated by him into English. Indeed, he would later go on to translate many more hymns, especially Moravian ones. *Hymns and Sacred Poems* of 1739 was amongst his most popular at the time. Watson, like many commentators, argues that his less than perfect knowledge of German meant that the translated liturgy was “awkward ... he tried hard to accurately translate word-for-word” (Watson, 1997:207).

As a hymn writer John Wesley was not as prolific as his younger brother Charles. Although it is not clear exactly how many hymns he actually wrote, his case is not helped by the fact that a lot of his works often share the inscription “J and C Wesley”. This opens a further debate, with critics such as Bett, in *The Hymns of Methodism* (Bett, 1945:57), contending that hymns attributed to Charles were actually by John, whilst Hildebrand and Beckerlegge, in *A Collection of Hymns*, take the contrary position, arguing that this is not the case and that they were, in fact, his own work (Hildebrandt & Beckerlegge, 1983:35-8).

1780 saw the publication of *A Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People called Methodists* divided into five parts, and containing 525 hymns. Of those, seven were by Isaac Watts, two by Henry More and one each by George Herbert, Samuel Wesley, Rev. Samuel Wesley; nineteen were translations from German hymns, one from Spanish and at least one from French. The number of original hymns contributed by John Wesley is still under debate, though Bett, using contemporary source material from *The Hymns of Methodism*, ascribed a total of sixteen to be his. The rest were most likely by Charles Wesley. Various anthologies followed, with fewer hymns, pocket hymnals, hymns with tunes printed alongside and suchlike, though essentially the hymnbook remained *A little body of experimental and practical divinity* (Little, 1876).

Only two of Charles Wesley's hymns grace the Church Hymnal, both of them translations. *Commit your ways to Jesus* is sung to the tune ICH HALTE TREULICH STILL by J.S. Bach and was originally written by the poet Paul Gerhardt (1703 – 91), often considered in German church music as second in popularity only to Martin Luther (Darling & Davison, 2005:473). His second hymn, *Jesus, thy blood and righteousness* is a translation of Zinzendorf's *Christi Blut und Gerechtigkeit* and set to the tune WARRINGTON, written by his slightly younger contemporary, Ralph Harrison (1748 – 1810) (Darling & Davison, 2000:626).

2.5.2.2 Charles Wesley

The youngest of the Wesleys, Charles (1707 – 1788), relied upon the Anglican tradition of Trinitarian belief as discussed in Watson’s “In defence of Unitarianism” (1997:228). Many of his hymns, such as *Father in Whom we live*, contain ideas from Greek Orthodoxy of double epiclesis, in that the faithful communicants share in the Body of Christ. Despite, or perhaps because of, this subtle use of traditional rites, the Wesleys were more aware than any, that the best way to teach people the Bible and basic faith was to let them sing hymns (Chappell, 1968:80). Of course, the unified Bible of 1611 was now widely available by the time of the Wesleys’ writings, and was in common usage, thus giving the brothers consistent doctrinal pickings. Charles used many techniques to do this, taking biblical texts and reading them as metaphors, altering the Psalms to make King David “Christian” and writing hymns that reflected public and social occasions, such as those included in his 1745 hymnal *Hymns for Times of Trouble* as well as in *Hymns for Public Thanksgiving (after Culloden)* and *Hymns occasioned by the earthquake (Lisbon)* in 1746 and 1750 respectively (Watson, 1997:232). However, as all the editions of the *Church Hymnal* contain a large number of Wesleyan hymns, they are discussed below in the numerical order of the current 2000 edition.

Charles Wesley’s first work in the *Church Hymnal* then, is the controversial morning hymn *Christ, whose glory fills the skies*. It is controversial because it is asserted by some academics not to be his own work (Dearmer in Darling & Davison, 2005:110). In any case, the scriptural source for this hymn is probably Ephesians 4:10 and John 1:9, both of which talk of Christ ascending “up far above all heavens” and Christ being “the true, the only light”.

Originally twenty-two stanzas long and first published in 1749 in *Hymns and Sacred Poems*, the hymn *Jesus, the name high over all*, is typically littered with biblical allusions, with echoes of Philippians 2:9-10, James 2:19, Ephesians 2:7 and John 1:29 all being referred to at various points in the text (Darling & Davison, 2005:168).

O for a thousand tongues to sing, set in the *Church Hymnal* to the tune *Gladness* by George William Torrance, was written in 1739 to celebrate the first anniversary of the author’s conversion (Manwaring, 1991:67). The hymn may arguably be more popularly

known when sung to its Methodist airs, either *Richmond* by Thomas Haweis (1734 – 1820) or *Lydia* by Thomas Phillips (1735 – 1807). There are several theories about the source of its reference to “one thousand tongues” singing and these include Wesley’s possible inspiration from a similarly entitled hymn by the German Johann Mentzer (1658 – 1734) or perhaps even from Isaac Watts’ *Begin, my tongue, some heavenly theme*, both of which would have been known to the author (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:168).

First published in *Hymns for the nativity of our Lord* in 1744, *Come, thou long-expected Jesus* is now more commonly sung as an advent hymn (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:186). It focuses on two issues, the Kingship of Jesus and His birth as the long-expected Messiah (Darling & Davison, 2005:192).

Lo! He comes with clouds descending is an unusual offering by Wesley in that it is very similar to a hymn by the Moravian John Cennick. In the *Church Hymnal* the hymn is given joint authorship status, with Wesley’s alteration being the more dominant. The hymn is based on Revelation 1:7 and is sung to the tune *Helmsley*, the name given to the air by Wesley’s friend, Rev. Dr Richard Conyers, who was a rector in the eponymous Yorkshire village.

Although Julian, in *The Dictionary of Hymnody*, describes *Hark! The herald angels sing* as being one of the four best hymns in the English Language (Dearmer, 1933:49) it is interesting that neither of the Wesleys thought it to be one of the finest to come out of their stable, a point illustrated by the fact that it was not included in either the 1745 publication of eighteen *Hymns for the nativity of our Lord*, nor indeed the 1780 *Collection*. For the record, the version sung today is not exactly as Wesley penned it, with lines 1, 2, 7 and 8 of the first stanza having been altered by fellow founder of Methodism, George Whitefield (1714 – 1770) (Darling & Davison, 2005:247). It is customarily sung to the tune *Mendelssohn*, also known as *Christmas, Berlin* or *Bethlehem*, the last of which is a version of one of the motifs in the second movement of Mendelssohn’s *Festgesang* (Darling & Davison, 2005:248).

Written in the “conversion” years of Wesley, *And can it be, that I should gain is*, according to Darling and Davison, “a great favourite amongst Methodists who

sometimes regard it with the same respect given to a national anthem". The hymn quotes Acts 16: 23 – 32 and was first published in 1739 under the title *Free Grace*, though it first appeared only as recently as 1990 in Church of Ireland publications (Darling & Davison, 2005:321). It is commonly sung to the tune *Sagina*.

It was Augustus Toplady who was primarily responsible for the popularity of *O love divine, what hast Thou done*, first published in *Hymns and Sacred Poems* in 1742, as he included it in his *Psalms and Hymns* of 1776, thus introducing it to a wider Anglican audience (Darling & Davison, 2005:321). The hymn is an Easter hymn, focusing on the Crucifixion of Christ and questions raised in the Lamentations of Jeremiah. Also published in the same volume of John and Charles Wesley's *Hymns and Sacred Poems* was *Hail the day that sees Him rise*, an Ascension Day hymn which has seen alterations and revisions, primarily by Thomas Cotterill. To fit in with the thematic material of the hymn, the current edition of the *Church Hymnal* sees a return to the inclusion of Wesley's own final stanza that had been missing in previous Church of Ireland publications.

Only five of the original twenty-two stanzas of the little-sung *Love's redeeming work is done* remain (Dearmer, 1993:103). This hymn has been included in all five editions of the *Church Hymnal*. As with many of Wesley's works, it first appeared in *Hymns and Sacred Poems*.

Rejoice, the Lord is King! was published in 1744 in *Moral and Sacred Poems* and also in Charles Wesley's own *Hymns for our Lord's Resurrection* of 1746 (Julian, 1907:1251). It is a poem rich in biblical references, all leading to the triumph of Jesus as Saviour and Judge as outlined in the Apostles' Creed (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:193). According to Colquhoun, the refrain comes from two sources, ancient liturgy and Holy Scripture. The first reference of "Lift up your hearts" has its origin in the *Sursum corda* of the Eucharist and "lift up your voice", more obviously, from Isaiah 40:9. The second part of the refrain is easily traceable to Philippians 4:4; the next stanza quotes Matthew 1:21 and Hebrews 1:3; stanza three, focusing on kingship, alludes to Revelation 11:5 and then to 1:17 – 18 and stanza four draws inspiration from 1

Corinthians 15:24 – 25. The tune *Gopsal* to which it is commonly sung was written especially by Handel for the hymn (Colquhoun, 1980:117-21).

The adaptation of Ephesians 6:10-18 in *Soldiers of Christ, arise* is now just a fragment of the original Wesleyan hymn, published as a broadsheet in 1742 and later included in *Hymns and Sacred Songs* (Barnby, 1996:110). The hymn refers to the “armour of God” (Wolffe, 1994:227) but the stanza structure is entirely different from what Wesley initially published. The first five verses are the actual first two stanzas of Wesley’s original and the second half of stanza two is actually the first half of the original stanza seven (Barnby, 1996:110).

Ye servants of God, your Master proclaim, was first published in *Hymns for times of Trouble and Persecution* in 1744, a collection published in response to the Jacobite Risings of 1744 (Szechi, 1994:53). Part of the hymn is based on the metaphor of the floods lifting up the soul in Psalm 93 but the hymn also includes the Incarnate Word and the principles of Revelation 4:9 – 11 and 5:11 – 14, as cited in the *Hymnal* (2000:925).

Again, according to Darling and Davison in the *Companion to the Church Hymnal*, *Peace be to this congregation* is a difficult hymn on which to determine exact provenance (2005:671). Its first appearance was in *Hymns and Sacred Poems* but was called *Peace be to this habitation* and had six, eight line stanzas compared to the present day version of three, four line stanzas. Between these times several people altered the text; two of whom were Thomas Cotterill in 1819 and Joseph Shaw in 1838. It is clearly not an entirely popular hymn, with only one other major English-speaking hymnal using it, the Evangelical Movement of Wales’ 1977 edition of *Christian Hymns* (Darling & Davison, 2005:672).

Help us to help each other, Lord first appeared in the 1780 publication of the *Collection of Hymns for the use of the People called Methodists* and is a cento from *Try us, O God, and search the ground* and *Jesus, united by Thy grace* (Dearmer, 1933:273). The history of the tune normally associated with it, *Dunfermline*, is equally interesting in that it was classified as one of the famous twelve “common tunes” of 1615 used in Scottish worship (Woods, 2001).

In *Jesu, lover of my soul*, Wesley, according to Barnby, shows the authority of wisdom from Psalm 11:25 and 51:1 and includes “good scriptural authority” using Acts 3:14, John 1:14 and Psalm 85:2 (Barnby, 1996:62). Watson, too, comments on Wesley’s use of scripture where he observes the “haven” coming from Psalm 107, the “shadow of thy wing” from Psalm 91 and the “fountain” from Psalm 36 (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:175). Given its current popularity, it is interesting that John Wesley did not include it in *A Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People called Methodists* in 1780 as he was purported to have thought it was too sentimental (Barnby, 1996:62). Two tunes are used by Irish Anglicans, *Aberystwyth* and *Hollingside*, the latter of which is viewed as being the more popular in that it is listed in the current *Church Hymnal* as the first preference.

Forth in Thy name, O Lord, I go was included in *Hymns and Sacred Poems* under the section of *Hymns for Believers*. It was entitled *Before Work* and is one of the few Wesleyan hymns to deal with the “daily work and labour as the vocation of the believing Christian” (Darling & Davison, 2005:748). Wesley believed that Christians should approach work with cheerfulness and purposefulness, not narrowness, and this is borne out by the sentiment in the hymn (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:202). The accompanying air *Angels’ Song* or *Song 34* was written by Orlando Gibbons for George Withers’ *Hymns and Songs of the Church* (Naxos, 2010), published in 1623, but John Wesley included it as the setting for *Forth in Thy name, O Lord* in 1761, and it has been used ever since for that hymn (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:203).

Although most of the hymns in *Hymns on the Great Festivals and Other Occasions* of 1746 were republications of previously released material, *O love divine, how sweet thou art* was there for the first time (National Library of Australia, 2009). The hymn later reappears in *Hymns and Sacred Poems* under the section “Desiring to Love”. The last three stanzas of the original are omitted from the *Church Hymnal*, the argument being that they represent personal identification between Wesley and three characters in the gospels who enjoyed a special relationship with Jesus, namely Mary, the apostle Peter and the disciple John (Darling & Davison, 2005:804).

The very popular wedding hymn, *Love divine, all loves excelling*, voted in the top ten of the BBC's "Nation's Favourite Hymn" in 2005, was first published in *Hymns for those that seek and those that have Redemption in the Blood of Christ* in 1747 (Dearmer, 1980:304). In the 1780 publication of the *Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People called Methodists*, the last stanza is omitted, possibly, as Watson and Dudley-Smith argue, because this verse deals with the possibility of continuing to sin (2003:105). The two tunes that are ascribed to this hymn in the *Church Hymnal* are the Welsh air *Blaenwern* by William P. Rowlands (1860 – 1937) or *Love Divine* by Sir John Stainer (1840 – 1901).

O for a heart to praise my God has been widely published in the major Wesley publications, with the customary minor editing by older brother John, when published by him. It is based primarily on two passages, Psalm 51:10 and Ezekiel 36:26 (Darling & Davison, 2000:1197) and the tune to which it is sung, *Stockton*, was written by Thomas Wright, (1763 – 1829), the inventor of the pocket metronome (Fritz Manufacturing Company, 1997).

The final hymn by Charles Wesley in the *Church Hymnal*, *O Thou who camest from above*, has all the hallmarks of being a family hymn in the most literal sense. It was written by Charles, sometime before its initial publication in 1762 in *Hymns on Selected Passages of Scripture*, and amended by elder brother John Wesley for its inclusion in the *Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People called Methodists*. The tune *Hereford* to which it is sung was written by Samuel Sebastian Wesley, (1810 – 76), the composer's grandson (Darling & Davison, 2005:826). According to Watson and Dudley-Smith (2003:106), Wesley's lines "contain many passing allusions to biblical texts, especially to the descent of the Holy Ghost at Pentecost (Acts 2: 3) and to the image of fire in Luke 12:49. The hymn thus invests the original text from Leviticus with a New Testament application: in verse 4, for example, 'perfect will' is taken from Romans 12:2 and the 'acts of faith and love' are from 1 Thessalonians 1:3".

A rather interesting observation about this piece is the key of the music in which it is written. In previous Hymnals, for example *Church Hymnal IV*, (Darling & Davison,

2000:v) it was in F major but in the current edition it has been transposed down to Eb Major, presumably to make it more accessible for congregations to sing.

With the Wesleys contributing most of the momentum for hymnal development in this period, other poets, clergy and writers also made their mark, with many of their works also used in the *Church Hymnal*. One such person was William Williams (1717 – 1791), a Welshman who was denied full Established Church orders because of his associations with the Countess of Huntingdon and other Methodists (Brownlie, 1911:160). His sole offering in the Hymnal is *Guide me, O thou great Jehovah*, originally published in Welsh with the translated title of *A Prayer for strength to go through the Wilderness of the World*, in 1762. The hymn is essentially based on the story of Israel's adventures in the wilderness, with Exodus 17:1 – 7 relating to the first verse, 13:20 – 22 to the second verse and Joshua Chapter 3 to the last verse (Barnby, 1996:61). However, it is the tune to which it is sung, *Cwm Rhondda*, that is equally significant. Written by John Hughes (1783 – 1932) in 1905 for a Baptist singing festival in Wales, this tune was first published in the *Methodist Hymn Book* of 1933 and has become very famous in recent times, in part due to it being sung at the state funerals of both Diana, Princess of Wales (BBC, 2011a) and the Queen Mother (BBC, 2011b).

According to Brownlie, John Cennick (1718 – 1755) “came under the spell of John Wesley ... (becoming) a Methodist and lay preacher” (Brownlie, 1911:179). In later years, though, for doctrinal reasons, he became a Moravian and authored many hymns, including *Lo! He comes with clouds descending*, which was the inspiration for the adaptation of the same hymn by Charles Wesley.

Other contemporary Wesleyan hymn writers include John Bakewell (1721 – 1819), author of *Hail, thou once-despised Jesus!*; Thomas Olivers (1725 – 1799), who became part of John Wesley's army of preachers and the writer of *The God of Abraham praise*; and John Fawcett (1740 – 1817) whose hymn *Lord dismiss us with thy blessing* is the only work of his to survive to the *Church Hymnal's* current edition. Of these writers, Fawcett's story is especially interesting and casts light on the sense of devotion and duty that Anglican clergy faced in those days, when up against the pull of evangelicalism. It seems that he was due to leave his flock and go to work in London in

a more Methodist-style parish but after saying goodbye to his congregation and having packed his removal wagons, it turns out he had a change of heart and came back to them. This is alleged to have been the inspiration behind *Lord dismiss us with thy blessing* (Brownlie, 1911:177).

2.6 POST-WESLEYAN HYMNODY UNTIL A SELECTION OF PSALMS AND HYMNS FOR PUBLIC AND PRIVATE USE, BY THOMAS COTTERILL (1780 – 1819)

Inevitably, there remains a “hen and egg” situation in post-Wesleyan hymnal history. Did the Wesleys create the rise in interest in hymn singing and advance the popularity of Methodism or did they merely respond to an inexorable change in societal religious commitment? Whilst this potentially huge question is beyond the scope and interest of this study, one thing is factually clear; during the time of the Wesleys and the period following their deaths, hymn-singing enjoyed a huge wave of rising popularity. Parallel with this was the interest in Methodism, indeed growing to such an extent that it was viewed by some as a threat to the established church, even though the Wesleys continued to publicly show allegiance to the Church of England. With this background then, so too continued the arguments for psalm-singing versus “obscene” hymn-singing (Arnold, 1995:66-7).

Anne Steele, writer of *To our Redeemer’s glorious name* and previously discussed in 2.5.1, was amongst those to get caught up in the maelstrom of the Methodist argument. Watson argues that hymn reviewers of this time, mindful of the contentious situation in which they found themselves around the late 1700s, tended to ignore rather than highlight hymnal publications, acting to play safe rather than get embroiled in the discussion.

Equally, William Cowper’s publication of *Olney Hymns* in 1779 was greeted with a wall of reviewer silences, despite the main critic, the poet Christopher Smart, being a well-known hymn writer of the same generation (Arnold, 1995:79). Whilst Smart’s hymns

are not part of the Church of Ireland canon, Cowper contributes the following four hymns to the current *Church Hymnal*.

God moves in mysterious ways is a hymn with an interesting provenance. Some critics have suggested that the hymn, written in 1773, just after Cowper suffered a nervous breakdown, is a cry for help and an outpouring of despair (Darling & Davison, 2005:36). Watson and Dudley-Smith totally refute this, arguing that “nothing could be further from the truth (as) the clouds (that critics argue are metaphors of the poet’s mental state) are clouds which are full of mercy and blessing” (2003:221). The tune to which it is sung, *London New*, is taken from Edward Miller’s *The Psalmes of David*, published in 1635 (National Library of Australia, 2009).

The hymn *Jesus where’er Thy people meet* was a hymn inspired by John Newton (1725 – 1807), the priest who encouraged Cowper to join his congregation and to write hymns with him. Every Tuesday, Newton used to unveil a new hymn at his weekly prayer meeting and in 1796, in honour of a change of venue, Cowper penned this hymn (Dearmer, 1933:293). The hymn is a reassuring one for any member of the flock who was unsure of the move of meeting house and Cowper exploits this to use the sense of place on a higher metaphorical level. Indeed, as a result of this relationship, the *Olney Hymns* were published, “an important event in the latter part of the eighteenth century” (Brownlie, 1911:138).

In the *Olney Hymns*, *Hark, my soul, it is the Lord* is listed in Book 1 with a direct reference to John 21:16, a verse which, according to Watson, was a favourite with contemporary evangelicals. It was written while Cowper was convalescing at the home of Rev. Morley Unwin of Huntington and first appeared before the *Olney Hymns* in an appendix published in 1768 to Thomas Maxfield’s *Collection of Psalms and Hymns* (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:224). Also, during this period, Unwin’s wife Mary became seriously ill, an issue which deeply affected the vulnerable Cowper. *Oh for a closer walk with God* was written in response to this event, initially included in a letter he sent to his aunt (Darling & Davison, 2005:282). The hymn was published many times in Cowper’s lifetime, for example, the *Collection of Psalms and Hymns* of 1776, the *Olney Hymns* of 1779 and Toplady’s *Gospel Magazine* of the same year remain

amongst the more popular hymn books and journals to receive his work (Darling & Davison, 2005:825).

How sweet the name of Jesus sounds is numerically the first of Newton's hymns to be included in the *Church Hymnal* and is based on an idea from Song of Songs 1:3. It is divided into three equal sections of two stanzas each. In the hymn Newton suggests the name of Jesus to soothe, heal, calm, give courage, feed and give rest. In this respect the hymn is very "general purpose" though in the *Olney Hymns* it was placed in Book 1, "On Selected Passages of Scripture" (The *Olney Hymns*, 2005).

Again from *Olney Hymns*, *Glorious things of thee are spoken* draws on the idea of the Church as "Sion, City of our God", with the first ideas emanating from Psalm 87:3. After this, the hymn takes ideas from Isaiah 33:20 – 22 and its chief message is one of insistence on the visible nature of the Church. The hymn is often printed in "three verse form", as is the case in all five editions of the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:834). Both *Abbot's Leigh* and *Austria* are popular hymn tunes, the first being written in 1941 by Cyril Taylor, a Church of England cleric, and the latter by Franz Josef Haydn. This air, *Austria*, is of course, the same tune as the German National Anthem. Other hymns by Newton in the *Church Hymnal* are *May the Grace of Christ our Saviour; Approach, my soul, the mercy-seat; Great Shepherd of your people; and Amazing Grace*.

Against this tide of Methodism were writers like Augustus Toplady (1740 – 1778) who, despite liberal upbringings and education, was at odds with the likes of the Wesleys on account of their more Calvinistic approach (Burrage *et al.*, 1888:345). Arguably his most famous hymn and the only one in the *Church Hymnal* is *Rock of ages* which was written in or around 1775, appearing in convoluted form in the October edition of *The Gospel* in that year, a magazine of which Toplady himself was editor. It would be several months, though, until its readership got the full version of the hymn that is known today, as that did not appear until the March 1776 edition (Universal Library, 2010). The hymn is based on two texts from the Bible, one from Exodus 33:22 and the second from 1 Corinthians 10:4, and is sung in the *Church Hymnal* to the tune *Petra*,

written by Richard Redhead and first published in *Church Hymn Tunes, Ancient and Modern* in 1853 (Darling & Davison, 2005:736).

Although the French Revolution of 1789 represented a turning point in the history of thought in England (Watson, 1997:206), it was something more fundamental that changed the hymnodistic development of the Anglican faith. By the early 1800s Church of England hymnody was starting to make some advances but it was the superficially innocent publication of Thomas Cotterill's *Psalms and Hymns for Public and Private Use* of 1810, written primarily for his own church, St Paul's of Sheffield, that proved to be a seed change in the history of Anglican worship. At this time the singing of hymns was technically against canon law, or as Arnold argues, was not so much illegal but simply not "admitted as proper procedure" (Arnold, 1995:95) with the establishment worried that the "reason for such vociferous and plentiful reaction against hymnody ... was due in part to the identifying of hymn singing with Methodism" (Arnold, 1995:81). With this in mind, such a routine procedure as the publication of a hymnbook of a minister's favourite hymns for use in his own church eventually ended up in the Consistory Court of the Archdiocese of York where two parishioners challenged the public singing of hymns. The case, *Holy and Ward v. Cotterill*, was heard by Archbishop Harcourt and investigated by Chancellor G.V. Vernon in 1820 and his summation was something of a compromise in that he authorised the hymnal for use before and after the actual service, and in that a new volume of hymns be submitted for approval. Thus, a *Selection of Hymns* was unofficially but legally tolerable up until the 1860s when *Hymns Ancient and Modern* took over in popularity (Arnold, 1995:80). It was the final volume by Cotterill, having rumbled on through various guises and publications since its inception as a church-printed pamphlet in 1810 entitled *Hymns and Carols of Christmas*.

Other writers of hymns in this period of continuance from the Wesleys include John Morrison (1750 – 1798), John Rippon (1751 – 1836), John Cawood (1775 – 1852), Richard Mant (1776 – 1848), John Marriott (1780 – 1825) and Reginald Heber (1783 – 1826).

Dr John Morrison of the Church of Scotland has two hymns in the *Church Hymnal: The sinless One to Jordan came* and *Come, let us to the Lord our God*. The first of these is based on Isaiah 9:2 – 7 and is thus used not only during Epiphany but also on Christmas Day. The latter, based on Hosea 6:1 – 4, is used as a call to worship. In the *Church Hymnal* both are sung to Scottish airs, *Dundee* and *Kilmarnock* respectively.

All hail the power of Jesu's name has an unusual history. Being written originally by Edward Perronet (1726 – 1792), a Methodist convert who managed to offend everybody with whom he worshipped, it was altered substantially by Baptist minister Dr John Rippon (1751 – 1836), who based it on Song of Solomon 3:11 (Darling & Davison, 2005:360). Rippon also added sub-titles over each of the verses, namely “Angels”, “Martyrs”, “Converted Jews”, “Believing Gentiles”, “Sinners of Every Nation” and “Ourselves”.

Based on the Parable of the Sower, *Almighty God, your word is cast* was written by John Cawood (1775 – 1852) in 1815 and is significant as it was included in Cotterill's famous *A Selection of Psalms and Hymns for Public and Private Use* in 1819.

Clearly based on Genesis 1:1 – 3, *God, whose almighty word* by John Marriott (1780 – 1825) was written in the year of his death. The entire collection of hymns by Reginald Heber (1783 – 1826) just falls beyond the interest of this thesis, with the exception of *Brightest and best of the sons of the morning* which was written in 1811. His remaining hymns were all written well into the nineteenth century and those that are in the *Church Hymnal* that fall into this period of time are *God, who made the earth and heaven; Virgin-born, we bow before thee; Holy, holy, holy! Lord God almighty* and *Bread of the world, in mercy broken*.

Brightest and best of the sons of the morning was first published in the *Christian Observer* in 1811 and later in Heber's own *Hymns written and adapted to the Weekly Church Service* in 1827 (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:239). This Epiphany hymn shows the Christ-child figure in the manger to whom the wise men are led.

2.7 1819 UNTIL THE PUBLICATION OF *HYMNS ANCIENT AND MODERN* (1819 – 1886)

Now fully into the nineteenth century, this section of the history of hymnody is of limited interest to this study, though there are some justifiable reasons why it is necessary to look beyond the strict deadline of 1799 as a demarcation line of the eighteenth century, not least for the purposes of this study, as the term “eighteenth century” goes a little beyond the clearly defined deadline ending at the calendrical turn of a century.

With this in mind, the publication of Watts’ hymnal in 1707, in many ways, arguably heralds the beginning of the eighteenth century and either the death of the Wesleys in 1788 and 1791 or the Cotterill case in 1819 make a more practical or useful frame for signalling the end of the eighteenth century hymn. However, such was the influence of the Wesleys and the reaction against them by the Oxford Movement, that an examination of hymns a little into the nineteenth century is necessary in order to help determine a canon of eighteenth century hymns for later discussion. Also, the style of writing of some writers, being clearly imitative of the Wesleys, understandably took some years to peter out.

This, however, was secondary to the kind of “green light” given to the use of hymns, as an explosion of hymnals flooded the market following the Cotterill verdict and up until the publication of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* (Arnold, 1995:239).

With this wave of hymn writing came a major contributor to the *Church Hymnal*, the Scottish son of a pastor and missionary of the Moravian Brethren, James Montgomery (1771 – 1854). In all he contributes eleven hymns to the current edition, written throughout his colourful life, which, besides ministry and pastoral work, included travels round Europe, brief imprisonment, time spent as a journalist and a literary career (Wigley, 2010). Although born in the immediate Post-Wesleyan era, most of his writing was done in his later life (Brownlie, 1911:144) and thus canonically fits into the post-Cotterill period of hymnody. Also, of course, the two knew each other as Montgomery contributed to the eighth edition of *Psalms and Hymns for Public and*

Private Use in 1819 (Dearmer, 1933:46). Ten of his hymns grace the *Church Hymnal*, including *Hail to the Lord's anointed*, a paraphrase in free style of Psalm 72 and written in 1821, probably to be used at Christmas in a Moravian church near his ministry college in Fulbeck, near Leeds. It was published widely at the time. Some critics, including Watson, see similarities between this hymn and the poem *Prometheus Unbound*, written by his close friend Shelly. One of the tunes used for this, *Crüger (Herrnhut)*, is appropriately of Moravian extraction with the bracketed sub-title "Herrnhut" being the name given to a Moravian settlement in Germany (Arnold, 1995:250). A second of Montgomery's hymns, the Christmas carol *Angels, from the realms of glory*, was actually included in Cotterill's famous *Selection* of 1819 and his remaining nine hymns in the *Church Hymnal* include *Lord God the Holy Ghost; Lord, teach us how to pray aright* and *Prayer is the soul's sincere desire*.

However, as the 1800s progressed, the Oxford Movement, or what might best be described as the Catholic Revival within the Church of England, emerged from a body of students led by John Keble at Oriel College, Oxford, in the 1830s. Being disenchanted with the Anglican Church, they threatened the *status quo* of the Established Church with questions of doctrine and church organisation (Pusey House, 2006). Furthermore, the Catholic Emancipation Act of 1839 and the Reform Act of 1832 (Suffolk Churches, 2010) had given them hope; spurred on by internal university politics, they exerted considerable influence on the subsequent doctrine, spirituality and liturgy of the Church of England (Anon., 2010). Needless to say, this impacted on hymnody and what was ultimately included in the Anglican canon of hymns and thus, by association, Church of Ireland hymnals.

Some of the hymns mentioned here are discussed more fully in Chapter 4 of this study, where the relationship between the Catholic Church and the Church of Ireland is explored, but suffice to say Newman's *Firmly I believe* and *Praise to the Holiest in the height* are typical of the Tractarian style hymn which resulted as an immediate consequence of the Oxford Movement; but there were others that followed in Newman's wake. Two other such Tractarians are Frederick William Faber and Edward Caswall. Oxford-educated Faber was a prolific writer with over one hundred and fifty titles to his credit (Brownlie, 1911:194), contributing three hymns to the current 2000

edition of the *Church Hymnal: My God, how wonderful Thou art; There's a wideness in God's mercy* and *Hark, Hark my Soul*, the last being published in 1854 in his *Oration Hymns*, entitled *The Pilgrims of the Night*. Indeed, this second title gives a good indication of the hymn's intention, especially when viewed in its entirety with the now omitted verses included, as it is a work that deals with the darkness of human landscape (Watson & Dudley-Smith, 2003:298).

Edward Caswall converted to Catholicism in 1850, becoming a priest two years later (Watson, 1997:368). Like Faber he was a "Newmanite" and contributed a prolific ten hymns to the *Church Hymnal*, though many of these are translations or attributions and include *Jesus, the very thought of Thee; O Jesus, King most wonderful; See, amid the winter's snow; Earth has many a noble city* and *When morning gilds the skies*.

Also worth of note is the actual co-leader of the Oxford Movement, John Keble, the Tractarian who along with Newman tried to steer the Anglican church towards Catholicism. Keble contributes four hymns to the current Church of Ireland 2000 edition though he is thought to have been an artist rather than a hymn-writing poet; Brownlie argues that "style and finish characterise Keble. We seldom come across a thought that acts as an inspiration" (Brownlie, 1911:191). The four hymns are: *Now every morning is the love; Sun of my Soul, my Saviour dear; Blessed are the pure in heart* and *Hail, gladdening light, of His pure glory poured*, the last being a translation from the third century, or earlier, Greek canticle "Phos Hilaron" (Darling & Davison, 2000:1310).

During the same era, former Bishop of Lincoln, Christopher Wordsworth (1807 – 1885) was a nephew of the celebrated poet, William Wordsworth and author of five current Church of Ireland hymns. He was an academic of the highest order and amongst his works he was responsible for translating the Bible into Greek (Grace Music, 2009). His hymns in *The Church Hymnal* are: *Songs of thankfulness and praise; Alleluia! Alleluia!; Gracious Spirit, Holy Ghost; O Lord of heaven and earth and sea* and *Lord, be thy word my rule*. Of these, *Gracious Spirit, Holy Ghost* is of particular interest to this study as it is a hymn which has enjoyed a new lease of life in recent years thanks to its being set to a new melody by Geoffrey Beaumont (1903 – 1970) eponymously entitled

Beaumont. It is based on 1 Corinthians 13 and for that reason is sung at Quinquagesima, as that is the Epistle for that day in the church calendar.

Also, Matthew Bridges (1800 – 94), was an Anglican who, when influenced by the Oxford Movement, followed Newman into the Catholic Church. His sole offering in the *Church Hymnal*, *Crown Him with many crowns*, was first published in 1851 in *Hymns of the Heart* but the version that is sung today was altered much later by Godfrey Thring (1823 – 1903) in or around 1874. The now composite hymn is one of “praise that triumphantly proclaims the Lordship of Jesus Christ through His love, suffering, death and resurrection” (Darling & Davison, 2005:378).

John Wreford (1800 – 81) was a Unitarian minister who contributed two hymns to the current *Hymnal*. *When my love for Christ grows weak* was partially re-written by Samuel Longfellow, brother of the poet H.W. Longfellow, for inclusion in an anthology first published in 1848 and used by Irish Anglicans for the first time some seventy years later when it was selected for inclusion in the 1915 *Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:359). His second hymn used by the Church of Ireland today, *Lord, while all the world we pray*, merits its inclusion in the current *Hymnal* by being a suitable reflection for the aftermath of “The Troubles” in Northern Ireland, at least according to the editors of the *Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:708). Also, his contemporary, John Gurney (1802 – 62), a canon of St Paul’s Cathedral, London, wrote verse 3 of *Ye Holy Angels Bright*, the rest of which was written by Richard Baxter. Other nineteenth century hymn writers who were not part of the Oxford Movement or had Tractarian tendencies, but whose hymns are similar in style, content and idiom to eighteenth century hymns are many and include some of the best-known authors of any era. In regard to being included in the canon of eighteenth century hymns, though, they may just be too late. Whilst there are certain hymnodistic and stylistic features of the eighteenth century, going much beyond Cotterill’s landmark case conflicts with the integrity of the parameters of this thesis, as these hymns arguably fall stylistically beyond the eighteenth century genre as well.

Other hymns that fall into this category are many and include the hymn *Bright the vision that delighted* by Richard Mant (1776 – 1848), which is of interest to this thesis

as it was written by Mant when he was Bishop of Down, Connor and Dromore, effectively making it a genuine Church of Ireland hymn. It is based on Isaiah's vision and was written in 1837 (Darling & Davison, 2005:316). His other hymn in *Edition Five* is *For all thy saints, O Lord* was also written in the same year. Likewise, Tralee Castle baronet, Sir Edward Denny (1796 – 1880), wrote *Light of the lonely pilgrim's heart* and *The Lord is king! Lift up your voice* a few years later in the 1840s.

Spirit divine, attend our prayers is a Congregationalist hymn, one of very few in the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:474). Written in 1829 by Andrew Reed (1787 – 1862), it is his sole hymn in the *Hymnal*. Also, the personal crisis suffered by Charlotte Elliott (1789 – 1871) in 1821 when she was left an invalid for the rest of her life following an illness, resulted in the plaintive *Just as I am, without one plea* (Darling & Davison, 2005:270).

Henry Alford (1810 – 1871), writer of *Come ye thankful people, come* and *Ten thousand times ten thousand*, was Dean of Canterbury Cathedral and known for his academic contributions to the New Testament (Brownlie, 1911:109). The first of these hymns, *Come ye thankful people, come*, is based on two parables, the parable of the wheat and the tares in Matthew 13:24-30 and the parable of someone who sleeps at night and rises at daybreak, in Mark 4:26-29 (Bailey, 1950:391). Alford first published this hymn in 1844 but when it was published in *Hymns Ancient and Modern* in 1861 he was not at all happy with the way in which his original text had been interfered with. In 1865 he had his original restored and it is this version that has been published in the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:37). The second of his hymns to be used in the *Church Hymnal*, *Ten thousand times ten thousand*, was written on inspiration from Daniel 7 and was first published in 1865. It was originally meant to be sung on the twenty-first Sunday after Trinity but nowadays is usually used as a processional for Saints' Days, partly for the fact that there is arguably no direct connection between the readings for that day and the text of the hymn (Darling & Davison, 2005:877).

John E. Bode's (1810 – 74) singular contribution to the *Church Hymnal*, *O Jesus I have promised*, was written as a confirmation hymn for his own children in 1866 (Darling &

Davison, 2005:778) and enjoys many settings to different airs (Bodleian Library, 2003), two of which are in the 2000 *Hymnal*.

John Monsell (1811 – 75) is of particular interest to this study as he was Archdeacon of St Columb's Cathedral; although he is said to have written over three hundred hymns (Brownlie, 1911:207) he is a contributor of just four to the current *Church Hymnal* (Julian, 1907:762). *Father, blessing every seed time* is loosely based on Matthew 13:24-30, the parable of the Wheat and the Tares (Darling & Davison, 2005:93) and although written before the publication of *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, its first major airing was in the third Edition of the *Church Hymnal*. *O worship the Lord in the beauty of Holiness!* was written towards the end of Monsell's life in 1861 as an Ekipany hymn and early editions of it show references to 1 Chronicles 16:29 (Julian, 1907:763). *Christ is risen, alleluia* appeared in Monsell's fourth collection of six hymnals and *Fight the good fight* was written early in his career, on 14 February 1834 to be precise. Based on several epistles from the New Testament, namely, 1 Timothy 6:12, Hebrews 12:1-2, 1 Peter 5:7 and Colossians 3:11, it was designated for use on the nineteenth Sunday after Trinity (Julian, 1907:747).

A contemporary of Monsell, William Pennefather (1816 – 73) wrote *Jesus, stand among us* for use at Easter, as is obvious from the references to the verses used as a point of reference—John 20:19-23.

Charles Kingsley (1819 – 75), author of *The Water Babies* and *Westward Ho!* and Professor of Modern History at Cambridge (Brownlie, 1911:200), contributes one hymn to the Church of Ireland, *From You all skill and science flow*. Originally written for the dedication of a hospital extension, the subject-specific first two verses have long since been removed, making it more generic (Whittmore, 1860:378).

Written close to the publication of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* in 1860, was William Whiting's (1825 – 78) *Eternal Father, strong to save*, written as a poem for a student of his who was about to travel to the United States. One year later John B. Dykes composed the tune *Melita* for this, choosing the title on the basis that it is an archaic term for the island of Malta, the site of a shipwreck involving the Apostle Paul mentioned in the Acts of the Apostles (Hymn Society, 2008). Also, written four years

later was *Jesu, my Lord, my God, my all* by Roman Catholic priest Henry Collins (1827 – 1919), also known as Father Augustine; this is a hymn which has been ever-present in all *Church Hymnals*.

Edwin Hatch (1835 – 89), published *Breathe on me, breath of God* firstly in a pamphlet called *Between Doubt and Prayer* and first used as a hymn in 1886. Based on Job 33:4 the hymn was originally called *Spirit of God*, bearing in mind that the closest word to “spirit” in Latin, Greek and Hebrew in this context is “breath” (Darling & Davison, 2005:412).

Folliott Sandford Pierpoint (1835 – 1917) is another nineteenth century writer who has just one hymn in the *Church Hymnal*. First published in 1864, *For the beauty of the earth* was originally written as a communion hymn (Darling & Davison, 2005:485) and has enjoyed popularity with many different airs, being sung to both *Lucerna Laudoniae* by Welsh composer David Evans and *England’s Lane*, a traditional English melody adapted by Geoffrey Shaw in *Church Hymnal*, edition five.

Faithful Shepherd, feed me, written by Trinity College, Dublin educated Thomas Benson Pollock (1836 – 96) is the only hymn of his in the current *Church Hymnal*. It was first published in 1868 in *The Gospeller* and made its first appearance in the Church of Ireland repertoire in the 1915 *Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:831).

In an era where women hymn writers were few and far between, two that do group together easily are Sarah Adams and Frances Alexander. Of these it could be argued that Sarah Adams is closer to being considered within the eighteenth century genre, writing before 1819, but Frances Alexander falls well into the nineteenth century genre, though her inclusion in this study is relevant as her hymn has been re-worked by many composers and arrangers as a twentieth century piece.

Sarah Adams (1805 – 48) had a distinguished career as a journalist and political activist, indeed ending up in prison at one time because of her views on the Bishop of Llandaff. As an author she enjoyed success with Unitarians but her only hymn to survive to the current *Church Hymnal* is *Nearer, my God, to thee*, which is based on the story of Jacob’s dream at Bethel as told in Genesis 28:10 – 22.

The hymn has become popular through its many other associations, the most famous of which is arguably where it was alleged to have been the last hymn played on the RMS Titanic. The hymn, played to the tune *Bethany*, was used in both the 1943 and 1953 films *Titanic*, whereas the tune *Horbury* was played in Roy Ward Baker's 1958 film. The more recent film *Titanic* reverts to the original *Bethany* (Cameron, 1997).

Whilst three of the four major films of the sinking of the Titanic prefer the air *Bethany*, the bandmaster of the ship, Wallace Hartley, was a Methodist and consequently one who would have been more familiar with the tune *Horbury*. Also, his father, a Methodist choirmaster, used another tune, *Propior Deo*, at church for over thirty years, so there is a possibility that this version may also have been used on the Titanic, an argument that is supported by Hartley's own family (Pendle Town, 2004).

Nearer, My God, to Thee was also sung by the crew and passengers of the SS Valencia as it sank off the Canadian coast in 1905 (Bailey, 1906:281) and other composers such as Carl Nielsen (Carl Nielsen, 2010), Charles Ives (Ballantine, 1979:174) and Sigfrid Karg-Elert (Anon., 1973) have used musical quotations from the tune *Bethany* in the context of its association with the hymn, in works of their own.

Written during convalescence from an illness and constructed around words used in the celebration of the laying-on-of-hands, Mary Maude (1819 – 1913) wrote the hymn *Thine for ever! God of love* in 1847 and it was published a year later in a small journal called *Twelve letters of confirmation*.

One of the most prolific women hymn writers of the pre-*Hymns Ancient and Modern* era was Mrs Cecil Frances Alexander (1818 – 1895), a hymnist who holds particular affection with Irish Anglicans thanks in part to her being the wife of Strabane rector, Rev. William Alexander, who later became Bishop of Derry and finally Archbishop of Armagh. He was also the last bishop to sit in the House of Lords before the 1871 Disestablishment of the Church of Ireland (Belfast Cathedral, 2005). Cecil Frances Alexander contributes six hymns to the current hymnal, namely; *All things bright and beautiful*, *Once in Royal David's city*, *There is a green hill far away*, *The golden gates are lifted up*, *Jesus call us o'er the tumult* and a translation of *St Patrick's Breastplate*.

All things bright and beautiful was written by Alexander in an attempt to make the church catechism more interesting to children whom she taught in Sunday school (Darling & Davison, 2005:74). Written in 1848, *Once in Royal David's city* was again a children's hymn, first being published in *Hymns for little children* in the same year. Believed by French Composer Gounod to be one of the best hymns in the English language, *There is a green hill far away* was also published in *Hymns for little children* and despite reservations regarding its being theologically dubious (St Columb's Cathedral, 1970) it has been published in all five *Church Hymnals* (Darling & Davison, 2005:352).

Published in the Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge's *Hymns* in 1852, *The golden gates are lifted up* does not possess the childlike imagery and language of the previously mentioned hymns, instead focusing on the Lord's ascension. The last of her own hymns in the *Church Hymnal*, *Jesus calls us o'er the tumult* was written to be sung on St Andrew's Day and is based on the collect for that day as prescribed in the 1662 *Book of Common Prayer*. It has been in use by Irish Anglicans since the 1873 edition of the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:706).

Scottish poet and Free Church of Scotland member, Elizabeth Clephane (1830 – 69), wrote her only *Church Hymnal* published work, *Beneath the cross of Jesus*, based on Isaiah 32:2 and Galatians 6:4 (Julian, 1907:238) and the hymn has been gradually reduced in length with subsequent publications in the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:740).

By Christ redeemed, in Christ restored, by Congregationalist and solicitor George Rawson of Leeds, first appeared in the Baptist hymn book *Psalms and Hymns* of 1858, a publication that came about following Rawson's earlier success in co-compiling the *Leeds Hymnbook* of 1853. The original hymn is a stanza longer than what is now published with the *Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge* substantially altering not only the length, but some of the wording, when they included it in the 1871 *Church Hymnal*.

Son of an eminent surgeon, William Dix was educated at Bristol Grammar School before becoming a manager of a large insurance company in Glasgow. He was a

devout Anglican, though he had affiliations with the Tractarian Movement, the forerunner to the Oxford Movement. One of the three hymns he contributes to the current *Church Hymnal* is the Christmas carol *As with gladness men of old* which was written when he, at 21 years old, was convalescing from an illness. The hymn was inspired by the gospel of the Epiphany. As such, then, the carol is based on the teachings of Matthew 2:1 -11 and Matthew 7:14 (Darling & Davison, 2005:286).

Although it was not until the publication in 1852 and 1854 of Parts I and II of *The Hymnal Noted* that the tangible evidence of change was seen. Here, Latin hymns were officially translated for use within the Anglican Service by arguably the finest English hymn writer, Charles Wesley. John Mason Neale, a graduate of Trinity College, Cambridge, left a huge legacy in many hymnals; over sixty in *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, for example, far outnumbering any close rival (Watson, 1997:372-3). The 2000 edition of *The Church Hymnal* claims his legacy is a more modest 22 hymns, but in any case it includes some everyday favourites such as *All glory, laud and honour* and *Sing my tongue the glorious battle* as well as the Christmas carols *Good King Wenceslas* and *O come, o come Emmanuel*, to name but some.

Written in these years also was *We sing the praise of Him who died* by the prolific Irish writer Thomas Kelly (1769 – 1855) subtitled *God forbid that I should glory, save in the Cross: Galatians 6:14*. The hymn is not a personal one of the suffering of Christ on the cross but more objective with the significance of what happens to His believers and how they react emotionally (Darling & Davison, 2005:358). It was so well thought of at the time that the Victorian hymnologist, Lord Selborne, doubted “whether Montgomery ever wrote anything quite equal to this” (Dearmer, 1933:86). The other four hymns of his mammoth output of seven hundred and fifty or so that are in the *Church Hymnal*, fifth edition are; *Hark ten thousand voices sounding; Look, ye saints, the sight is glorious; The head that once was crowned with thorns* and *Saviour, send a blessing to us*.

Father, of heaven, whose love profound, from 1805, is another hymn written in the years before the Cotterill case. Written by Edward Cooper (1770 – 1833) it is a hymn based on the first four suffrages of Cranmer’s *Litany* (Wellington, 1971) and thus often

sung on Trinity Sunday. Cooper was a well-respected preacher whose sermons were published in seven volumes, though this hymn is his only offering in the *Church Hymnal* (Barnby, 1996:56).

There is an apocryphal story of Harriet Auber's (1773 – 1862) hymn *Our great Redeemer, as he breathed* being scratched into the glass of her home by her diamond ring, as she did not have pen and paper to hand. This story is denied by her great niece in a 1929 letter to *The Times* (Darling & Davison, 2005:430), but the hymn has remained popular, being translated into Latin, and has appeared in all five editions of the *Church Hymnal*. It is normally sung to the tune *St Cuthbert* by John Bacchus Dykes (1823 – 1876) and so named because he was at the time Precentor of Durham Cathedral, which, of course, houses the tomb of St Cuthbert (Sadie, 1980:794-5).

Many other hymn writers from this period of the eighteenth century whose works are not in the canon of Church of Ireland hymnody include the following:

John Armstrong, Arthur Stanley, Samuel Hole, William Walsham, James Small, William Maclagan, Isaac Smith, Francis Knollis, Henry Downton, James Hamilton, Greville Phillimore, Samuel Clarke, Lawrence Tuttiett, Abel Blunt, Henry Martin, Richard Littledale, Richard Hayes, William Bourne, George Jaque, William Bruce, Norman MacLeod, John James Burns, Archibald Chateris, Theodore Monod, Horatius Bonar, Thomas Taylor, David Thomas, Eustace Conder, Frederick Goadby, Margaret Mackay, Julie Anne Elliott, Elizabeth Browning, Jane Crewdson, Emma Toke, Mary Peters, Mary Hasloch, Eliza Alderson, Anne Bronte, Eliza Morris, Anne Ross Cousin, Mary Jane Walker, Mary Shekleton, Elizabeth Codner, Charitie de Chenez, Hester Hawkins, Sarah Doudney, Annie Coghill, Eliza Heath, Mrs C.E. May, Fanny Freer, Henrietta De Lisle Dobree, Claudia Hernman, Isabella Stephenson, Henry Bateman, James Deck, George Watson, Thomas Gill, John Shairp, George Robinson, Edward Ellis, Robert Walmsley and Henry Jenner, Alfred Tennyson.

Equally, some of the more significant hymns that fall outside the eighteenth century canon include; *Ride on, ride on in majesty* by Henry Milman (1791 -1868); *Lead us, heavenly Father, lead us* by James Edmeston (1791 – 1867); *Abide with me, fast falls*

the eventide and *Praise my soul the King of heaven* by Henry Francis Lyte (1793 – 1847).

2.8 HYMNS ANCIENT AND MODERN UNTIL THE PRESENT DAY (1886 – PRESENT DAY)

As this study is primarily concerned with the resilience of eighteenth century hymns in current Church of Ireland worship, a study of hymnody in the “mother” Anglican Church, the Church of England, since the publication of its first generally accepted hymnal *Hymns Ancient and Modern* has limited use.

Once established in 1886, *Hymns Ancient and Modern* underwent a passage of development similar to that of the *Church Hymnal*. Following nine successful years and various supplements, the first revision to the *Hymns Ancient and Modern* was in 1875 and edited by William Henry Monk. The second edition was published in 1889 and in 1904 a new and revised edition was published, but following its unpopularity, the previous 1889 edition was republished, sub-titled *The Old Complete Edition*. In 1916 this was republished again with an additional supplement and this was followed in 1922 by *The Standard Edition*. 1950 saw a revised edition, followed in 1983 by the *New Standard Edition* and finally in the year 2000, by a new hymnal, *Common Praise* (SCM, 2009). For the record, *Common Praise* has 628 hymns, all divided into sections representing the Christian year.

2.9 ADDRESSING THE RESEARCH QUESTION

The purpose of this chapter was to give both an understanding of hymnody and its context from the viewpoint of the Anglican tradition.

With so many studies of hymns, for their own sake, there was a deliberate decision to immediately contextualise such an understanding in its setting against the “mother” Anglican Church in England. The reasons for this were straightforward: the Anglican Church in Ireland at this stage was still completely politically, economically and ecclesiastically reliant on its English neighbour.

In order to achieve this goal, it was necessary to start off with an overview of the beginnings of the hymn from its earliest days as sung psalms, as the research found, from the middle of the 1500s. Section 2.4.1 discussed the beginnings of singing hymns, definitions of what hymns were and in what cases they were sung. At this stage, it became necessary to examine the impact of the Reformation and in particular the impact of some of the European thinkers and theologians. This was necessary as the Reformation was not, of course, solely an English phenomenon, as the publication and popularity of the Genevan Psalter proved, when Sternhold and Hopkins “borrowed” music from it to include in their own publication. This section of this chapter reached a natural conclusion at the publication of the *Old Version* psalter.

With the beginnings of singing hymns and the earliest publications now discussed, an evaluation of the first hymn books in the Church of England and early hymn writers was necessary in order to start forming both a context for the early hymns that Church of Ireland worshippers sing today but also to provide a background and context for the period in question in this research, the eighteenth century. Section 2.4.2 drew a lot of interesting conclusions such as the various arguments to replace the *Old Version* psalter as well as taking the whole concept of singing psalms in churches a little bit further away from strict *verbatim* biblical texts. This section also usefully examined some of the earlier hymns that are currently in the *Church Hymnal*.

The final section that examined the pre-Wattsian hymns was a discussion on the impact of the developments in the period leading up to the eighteenth century. This was especially useful as it allowed the historical context of the Restoration and the impact of the Savoy Conference to be examined, in particular, how it inspired and influenced hymnody. Perhaps one of the most interesting and ultimately directly relevant issues to emerge from this was the growth of congregational singing.

By the end of the three sub-sections of 2.4, then, a clear picture was emerging about the initial development of hymns, the slow move away from changed psalms to congregational singing and the impact of various historical events, all against the overarching background of Anglicanism.

Section 2.5 examined the hymns that emerged from 1707 until 1819, divided into two opposite sub-sections. Such a division evolved when it became clear that the output and the influence of the Wesleys deserved specialised treatment. A deliberate attempt was made not to simply have this as a “listing” exercise, but to actually examine the hymns written during this period that were significant to the *Church Hymnals* of the Church of Ireland, and also to the research question in general. In section 2.5.1 Isaac Watts and the hymns of his that are in the current edition of the *Church Hymnal* were discussed. From this it emerged that it was very much Watts’ own personal theology was at the core of his works, underpinned by strong narrative reflections upon actual biblical texts. This sub-section also took account of the works of his contemporary Philip Doddridge and other lesser-known writers familiar to Church of Ireland congregations.

Equally, the importance of the Wesleys was accounted for in 2.5.2 where the impact of their writing was shown to be linked to the growth of Methodism. Emerging from this section was an understanding of the strong evangelical nature of the Wesleys and the close spiritual nature of their hymn texts. It was important to evaluate this as Wesley’s hymns are a key feature of contemporary Church of Ireland worship.

The influence and aftermath of the Wesleys was discussed in 2.6, where it was necessary to examine some hymns used in the Church of Ireland from the period following their composition. With the popularity of congregational hymn-singing now

established, the works of Anne Steele and William Cowper were discovered to have deep personal significances. This section was still concerned, in part, with eighteenth century hymnody so care was taken to include an understanding behind the writing of hymns from this period that would be the subject of later scrutiny regarding their popularity and usage.

Whilst the main period of hymns relevant to the subject of the research was now concluded, namely the eighteenth century, an understanding of what happened after that was also necessary, as this represents the hymns that immediately followed. Also, it was both interesting and apposite to understand the reason behind the writing of the post-eighteenth century hymns, as the reasons for these being sung would become issues in subsequent chapters when field research was being undertaken. Sections 2.7 and, to a much lesser extent, 2.8, do this very task, being divided by the arbitrary periodisation point of the publication of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* in 1886.

In the first of these sections, 2.7, the wide diversity of influences behind hymn-writing was understood and discussed, from Scottish Moravian Brethren to Oxford Movement Tractarians. This proved to be a period of great diversity in hymnody, and the provenance of the hymns for this period that are used in the current edition of *The Church Hymnal* were discussed. This period also started to yield some writing from native Church of Ireland writers such as Mrs Cecil Frances Alexander and John Monsell. Again, care was taken not to make such a discussion too list-like but at the same time, a quick evaluation of these hymns was necessary to explain and understand the wide range of writers, texts and influences.

The final section, the very short but conclusive 2.8, simply justifies why hymns in the twentieth century further slip away from relevance; the section briefly examines the range of hymnals used since the publication of *Hymns Ancient and Modern*.

Overall, this chapter successfully addresses the early part of the research aims and helps the reader have a greater understanding of hymnody from its beginnings to the present day, all within the Anglican context. In addition, it helps to organise and categorise the vast number of hymns in the English tongue originating from the beginnings of hymnody until the present day, as well to explain the provenance and

background to some of the best-known and still much-loved hymns, going some way towards providing the reasons why many of them are still sung today and why the eighteenth century hymn is still resilient in contemporary Anglican worship.

CHAPTER THREE: THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT OF HYMNODY IN THE IRISH ANGLICAN CHURCH; THE PERIODISATION OF IRISH HYMNODY ACCORDING TO SIGNIFICANT EVENTS IN RELEVANT IRISH CHURCH AND CIVIC HISTORY AND THE RELEVANT DEVELOPMENTS THAT OCCURRED WITHIN THESE PERIODS

3.1 INTRODUCTION, CONTEXT AND RELEVANCE OF THIS CHAPTER TO THE OVERALL RESEARCH QUESTIONS

In the previous chapters, the placing of the Anglican hymn was put in its overall hymnodist context. Continuing on from Chapter One, Chapter Two discussed hymns used in the Anglican community, not necessarily as a general history, but more to give further understanding to the general questions raised by the research in relation to the overall question, “Why did the eighteenth century hymn prove so resilient?”

This chapter now takes the historical and hymnodistic background in the mother Anglican Church and the body of hymns associated with it and contextualises it from an “Ireland” viewpoint. This is achieved by defining the significant periods in Irish church history to give some sort of structure to hymn history and also to evaluate the influences and threats from outside the island of Ireland from the perspective of other denominations.

From the point of view of its relevance to the overarching question, that of the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn, this chapter addresses the problem questions, “What is the background context to the problem and what are the factors that determine a canon of hymns that endures?” and “What other church and state events have occurred since the eighteenth century that influence this argument?”

3.2 RESEARCH METHOD FOR THIS CHAPTER

This chapter, like the previous, uses academic texts, articles and online documents accessed from the libraries of Queen's University, Belfast and the Church of Ireland Theological College, Dublin. The sources drawn on reflect the literature of specialist hymnologists such as Richard Arnold and Nicholas Temperley, underpinned by the hymns and their commentaries in the current fifth edition of *The Church Hymnal*.

This chapter relies less on Darling and Davison's *Companion to the Church Hymnal* than the previous chapter but its presence is still useful nonetheless and the entire chapter uses desk research.

3.3 STRUCTURE OF THIS CHAPTER

As this chapter is concerned with providing an historical context for the hymn in the Church of Ireland, its structure is predominantly chronological.

The first sections, as with this research in general, are all concerned with the administration of the thesis, and the first analysis, section 3.4, discusses the criteria for defining different periods in Irish Church history.

The following six sections then take these periods and discuss the various events in church and civic history that affect hymnody, with the last main section, 3.10, examining contemporary connections with the Patrician view of Ireland as well as creeds and other parts of worship in a contemporary context and their resultant influences on hymnody.

The chapter ends, as customary, with the answer to the research question as proposed by this chapter.

3.4 THE REASONS FOR STARTING IN 1691

It must be a truism that there is no instantly recognisable defining starting point when determining a history of anything, and church music is certainly no different. Indeed, throughout the history of academia, scholars have used wars, conflicts, political developments, the births and deaths of influential people and many other issues as suitable and appropriate dates for periodisations of studies. In respect of this, within the context of this thesis, the Protestant Ascendancy in 1691 seems as apposite a starting point as any, with many justifiable and appropriate reasons.

First, the period of pre-music history is now over, tonal harmony is established and the period of plainsong, chant, and choral organum is now over (Dalhaus, 1990:141). This, of course, makes for more recognisable hymnodic structures such as the use of major keys, consequent and antecedent in melodic development and the incorporation of strophic verse and chorus form.

Second, clerical structures are in place, and given the period of time and the changes brought about by the demise of King James II and the prominence of Protestantism in Ireland, a degree of relative stability now ensues. Finally, to end this period just over one hundred years later, the Act of Union with England neatly brings to an end an era, some seventeen years before Thomas Cotterill's landmark publication of *A Selection of Psalms and Hymns for Public and Private Use* in 1819, where the idea of singing of Methodist-style hymns in the English parish church system was put to the test and subsequently formalised (Milne, 2003:45).

Another point, from the Church of Ireland perspective, is that, rightly or wrongly, the Protestant Ascendancy put the Church in the upper echelons of society again (Pooler, 1902:140). Understandably, the Church grew in the following years up until The Act of Union in 1801 which not only joined the parliaments of England and Ireland but closely bound the two established churches even closer together, namely the Church of

England and the Church of Ireland (Milne, 2003:58). Convocation of the Irish clergy in the years closely following the Penal Laws, namely in 1703, 1705, 1709, 1711 and the final one in 1715 saw great debates about the grassroots of Anglican faith and in particular, the use of Irish language in worship. Whilst the Lower House approved the use of the indigenous language, the Upper House of Bishops brushed it aside. Archbishop King, for example, said after the Convocation of 1705 that “Some men are very dexterous at doing nothing. I wish those of that temper would keep out of places that require something to be done.” Despite these apparently harsh words, King’s influence grew in the church and in the early part of the eighteenth century he was seen as central to the development of the Church of Ireland (Pooler, 1902:147). This was doubly significant as at this time it was generally considered that religion was a very low priority on the social radar. Lastly, poverty amongst the church following the Reformation and a constantly changing order left a congregation without a strong, single-minded leadership (Pooler, 1902:154).

Finally, this thesis is concerned with the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn and thus 1691 is appropriately close to the commencement of the century in question. There are a few other starting dates that could have been considered but with the signing of the Treaty of Limerick in 1691 heralding a major turning point in Irish history, namely the ending of the Williamite Wars between the Jacobites and William of Orange, this date is entirely apt.

The background for the commencement for this period of church music is even easier to ascertain, with the bloodless coup that led to the demise of the Irish government in just under two hours beginning at precisely five o’clock on Tuesday, 13 December, 1659 (Connolly, 1992:5). Almost exactly five months later, on 14 May, the newly-crowned King of England, Charles II, became king of Ireland. His coronation was to be followed soon after by a religious settlement of sorts. According to Connolly (1992:10) there was no general consensus regarding what form a national church should take and a “Committee of Religion” appointed by the Convention in March 1660 edged towards two strands: a revival of episcopacy and a version of Presbyterianism.

Connolly also points out, though, that during a period when it was so important to be seen to be on the winning side, it was well-nigh impossible to ascertain where genuine allegiances lay (Connolly, 1992:10).

By the end of 1660 the restoration of the monarchy was complete; Charles II was King of England, Ireland and Scotland, and both reward and retribution was handed out. The Irish Catholics paid heavily for their massacre of tens of thousands of Protestants in the autumn of 1641 by losing all their land, with sales from these confiscations paying for wars from 1641 – 53. Some leeway was given to Catholics who were not involved in the Rebellion, by the Settlement Act of 1662, which increased land ownership from around 8% to 20% but still nowhere near the 60% it had been before the Restoration (Connolly, 1992:14-16).

The Catholic Church has its own chequered history in the 1700s, much of it very colourful but not especially relevant to this study and equally, the dissenting Presbyterians too, were at loggerheads with the post-Restoration establishment. To re-enforce their superiority and as discussed elsewhere in the thesis, the establishment, via the Act of Uniformity in 1662 tried to quash Presbyterians in Ireland as they did with the Puritans in England (Connolly, 1992:26). Charles II's death and the accession to the throne by his brother, Catholic James II, saw the political situation lead into the Williamite wars during which James II was famously defeated at the Battle of the Boyne, thus giving Protestants a period of relatively unopposed stability. During the interim years from James II's enthronement until his demise, many Protestants, among them Church of Ireland families, fled to England. Clergy lost their tithes, churches were seized and Mass celebrated in them, revenues handed over to the titular Roman Catholic bishops and vacant sees were left unfilled (Connolly, 1992:40).

Throughout this time, it remains very difficult to know with any certainty what the populations of any individual faiths were. Connolly in *Religion, law and power* states that in 1670, Oliver Plunket argued that there were twenty Catholics for every one

Protestant. Two years later in 1672, Sir William Petty suggests that there were 300,000 Protestants and 800,000 Catholics in Ireland; Sir Richard Cox in 1706 had Catholics outnumbering Protestants by a ratio of 2:1; Lord Coningsby in 1714 had this figure at 8:1 and Lord Chancellor Freeman said in 1708 Britain and Ireland ratio of ten Catholics to every Protestant. (Connolly, 1992:144).

A census of sorts was in place by 1723 in the form of the hearth-tax returns which show a return of 73% Catholics in the country, but Connolly (1992:145) warns that inaccuracies ranging from 14% to 34% were probable. The religious geography is always an interesting tool to use for such an overview and the returns of 1732-3 provide a valuable insight into how the faiths in Ireland were split. This shows that the Roman Catholic population of Ireland was at least 73% and may have been as much as 79%. From a provincial point of view, Protestants in Ulster accounted for 62% of the population; 21% in Leinster; 11% in Munster and a mere 9% in Connaught (Yates, 2006:19). Equally significantly from the point of view of this study is the lack of popularity of the Church of Ireland, not being the major faith in any of the dioceses. Its only strength, if it can be called that, was in Ulster and The Pale where it languished between having a quarter and a tenth of the share of the population as followers (Yates, 2006:20). Despite this numerical imbalance with other faiths, the Church, according to Yates, enjoyed a level of support and influence not commensurate with its share of the population; indeed, by all accounts it seems to have been as spiritually healthy as its English counterpart (Yates, 2006:22).

Nevertheless, the Church's position and hold on society grew even stronger during this era; a new form of evangelicalism led by John Wesley started to take a grip on the Church of Ireland. Indeed, evangelicalism was becoming widespread in Europe at the time (Arnold, 1995:3) not only on account of Wesley but also on account of the reaction of Calvin and his predecessor Zwingli, who fervently believed that "music, vestments, incense, ritual gestures and images – all were of no avail to man precisely because his faith, the only reality, has nothing to do with the sense" (Garside, 1966:178).

Whilst a study of the demography of Catholics and Protestants is interesting, its relevance beyond this is not of especial interest for a study of hymnody other than to illustrate congregation sizes, an issue which by implication reflects on the hymns sung. These reasons are discussed more fully in the following section, but suffice to say the reasons are as simple as the fact that bigger churches had, by and large, more income, could pay better musicians and thus were not at the mercy of poorly trained organists who had a limited repertoire. Equally, larger churches could enjoy better choirs for the same reasons, thus pushing up the standard as well as improving the variety of performed hymnody.

Politics aside then, one of the first notable events in Church history in the early 1700s was the Convocation in 1704 of both upper and lower houses, during which important and relevant events from a hymnodist point of view were discussed. In no particular order, they decreed that greater observance should be placed on the Lord's Day, and that there should be fines for absentee bishops; they decried unnecessary travelling on Sundays, and irreverence at Christ Church and St Patrick's Cathedrals in Dublin; and they banned non-religious plays in churches. The Lower House of Convocation also asked for reforms, especially concerning the dangers of teaching children philosophy, the ordination of unqualified persons and generally the cleaning up of clerical life (Mant, 1933: 178-79). These topics are just the tip of the proverbial iceberg as reforms in all aspects of church life were called for.

As has already been discussed at length in Chapter Two, this was a period when no published hymn-books were in existence, with the only accounts of hymns used being found in individual diocesan and parish records.

3.5 1691 – 1801 (PROTESTANT ASCENDANCY – THE ACT OF UNION)

In order to understand the context and indeed the complexities of the Church of Ireland by the time the eighteenth century hymn-writers were starting to emerge, this research will briefly examine the beginnings of the Church of Ireland, or as it was then, the Church *in* Ireland. This story has of course been told exhaustively in other histories and documents but an examination on the facts where they influence hymnody or have an impact on what hymns were sung will clearly be useful.

A great deal of myth and legend surrounds the birth, life and work of Patrick (Pooler, 1902:5) but clearly he is still a source of inspiration, so that an understanding of what he did and his subsequent legacy is as good a starting point as any for a study of the Irish church. Arriving in Wicklow in AD 432, the country's patron saint can take almost all of the credit for converting the natives, but he was not the first. That honour fell to a certain Palladius, an emissary of Pope Coelestine, who arrived just one year before Patrick in 431 but fled the country within a year after having formed only three churches and baptised just a few converts (Pooler, 1902:9). Twenty-nine years after the death of Patrick, in 521, another now famous saint stepped onto the island's shore. Born in Donegal but having grown up in Argyll in southern Scotland, Columba became almost as important a saint as Patrick. In 546 he founded Derry, 553 Durrow and in 563 went to exile to Scotland to Iona, the island for which his monastery is now so important. He returned to Ireland on at least two occasions and left a legacy of an even more Christianised country upon his death in 597 (Pooler, 1902:27).

By now the Irish church had grown to an extent that it needed a certain amount of organisation and this fledgling administration was based in Armagh (Milne, 2003:11), the city that to this day holds the Archdiocese of both the Roman Catholic and Anglican traditions in Ireland. It was also at this time that the early monastic practice of dividing the country into manageable areas (what are today termed dioceses and parishes) occurred.

Probably because of its geographical location, Ireland escaped the mainland European wars of the fourth and fifth centuries, but when the Vikings came much later in the ninth century, things were different and many important ecclesiastical centres were destroyed including those at Bangor and Ferns. By the time of the Battle of Clontarf in 1014, most Danes had become Christian and following their victory at this very battle, their merger into Irish religious life influenced the island's subsequent development (Milne, 2003:11).

The first papal legate in Ireland to be appointed by the pope was Gillebert, who rose to become the first bishop of Limerick. Amongst his many claims to fame was his pivotal role in the subsequent Synod in Rathbreasil in Co. Tipperary in 1111, when, amongst other things, they decided upon a formal division of Ireland into twenty-five dioceses led by the primatial see of Armagh (Milne, 2003:21).

Throughout these middle ages it was the ambition of the crown in England to anglicise the Irish church (Milne, 2003:26) and when the Synod of 1172 in Cashel declared that "all sacred offices (are to be) performed everywhere in Ireland according to the usages of Holy church as observed by the Church of England" (Pooler, 1902:62), a tidal wave of change was on its way. This Synod, with the goal to correct abuses within the clerical arena, had as its objective, according to Pooler, "to bring the Church of Ireland into conformity with that of England" (Pooler, 1902:62). As a result, then, Irish clergy found themselves increasingly marginalised in positions of authority in the forthcoming years as Englishmen, especially bishops, led the hierarchy, and by 1217 King Henry III had declared that only Englishmen should become bishops in Irish cathedrals (Milne, 2003:28).

Corruption continued unabated in this new Irish hierarchy until the inexorable journey of the Reformation hit Ireland; in 1536 the first English bishop since the English Reformation was appointed. Bishop George Browne was a reformer but, as it transpired, one of five from the thirty-two Irish dioceses who shared Henry VIII's vision

(Pooler, 1902:23-8). Needless to say, the Pope took steps to re-assert his authority and a vow of obedience to Catholicism was taken throughout the thirty-two counties. Various uprisings continued from Rome but the death of the Pope's ally in Ireland, Archbishop Cromer, in 1543 gave the Reformers some much needed breathing space (Pooler, 1902:87).

For a variety of reasons, little changed in Ireland after the Reformation and it took Henry VIII's son, Edward VI, to develop a new but short-lived "protestant" character in the country (Milne, 2003:34).

The first publication of the *Book of Common Prayer* in Ireland in 1551 was another milestone in Irish church history. The Irish clergy were required to use this but its application was at best sporadic and at worst ignored. There were many reasons for this but one of the more practical ones was the fact that the local Irish simply did not speak English and by the time a Gaelic translation was introduced it was simply too late. (Milne, 2003:36) A final downturn for the Protestant peoples of Ireland occurred during the Marian persecutions from 1553 – 58, though with the death of the said monarch, the persecution of Anglicans came to a halt and the Reformation continued during the Elizabethan era (Pooler, 1902:92).

At this time, the growth of Protestantism in the last decades of the 1500s and the first decade of the 1600s had been helped by changes in new religious policy in the Dublin government, as outlined by Yates in *The Religious Condition of Ireland* (2006:5-10). The first of these was to secure a better form of education for Irish clergy, a move which led to the formation of Trinity College, Dublin University. The second was the introduction of a policy to use English and Scottish based clergy as leaders in the Church, and the final one was to make the Church of Ireland more "Protestant" at a time when it was argued that England was moving in the opposite direction (Yates, 2006: 5-10).

Beginning after the Flight of the Earls in 1607, the Ulster Plantation brought with it understandable new faiths from what is now the UK mainland. Of these, Scots Presbyterianism was the most dominant (Canny, 1987:123). For a time in the early 1600s the Church of Ireland moved somewhat to meet this newfound Scots faith and even adopted a doctrine promoted by James Usher, Professor of Divinity in Trinity College, Dublin, that proved to be quite Calvinistic in character. Later on in the same century though, they reverted to their more commonly accepted doctrines of what they had accepted in the Thirty-nine Articles in 1634 (Milne, 2003:40).

By the early 1700s the church had fallen on hard times and corruption prevailed at large. With the schism between the old English who had settled since the Plantation and the disenfranchised Irish whose land had been lost overnight, the 1641 Rebellion ensued and the subsequent uprising in Ulster had huge consequences for the Church of Ireland. Cromwell, upon victory over the sedition in Ireland, imposed a new form of Puritanism on the Anglican Church in Ireland and forbade the use of the *Prayer Book*. The Church was driven underground until 1660 when the Stuarts were restored to the English throne and the Church of Ireland received a new lease of life with churches and cathedrals being rebuilt and Anglican worship being promoted (Milne, 2003:43-5).

The succession of James II to the English throne in 1685 saw things take yet another twist with Roman Catholicism gaining the state approval and the Church of Ireland being subjected to some degree of scrutiny. Milne, in *A Short History of the Church of Ireland*, argues that though there were no laws that interfered “with the freedom of Protestants as citizens, or to persecute their clergy or prevent them from worshipping as they chose, there were instances of Church of Ireland ... places of worship taken over for Roman Catholic ceremonies ... and such instances not unnaturally made the Church of Ireland uneasy and insecure” (Milne, 2003:48).

3.6 1801 – 1871 (THE ACT OF UNION – THE DISESTABLISHMENT OF THE ANGLICAN CHURCH)

This section examines the aftermath of the eighteenth century, from the Act of Union in 1801 through until the Disestablishment of the Anglican Church, essentially from an Anglican hymnodic perspective but, where relevant, from a general historical perspective as well.

Looking initially from a Church history point of view, The Act of Union in 1801 left the Church of Ireland with four archbishoprics in Armagh, Dublin, Cashel and Tuam, and given the size and scope of the congregations, surely a figure disproportionate to the amount of income it needed to pay for the clerical upkeep. Several Acts followed that lessened the severe Penal laws, such as the Catholic Emancipation Act of 1829, the Tithe Act of 1838 and various tax acts between those dates (Pooler, 1902:166). Arguably the most important act though, from an Anglican point of view, was the Irish Churches Act of 1869 which disestablished the Church from the State. In real terms, with little time to prepare for this Act, the church found itself in disarray and as Milne again argues in *A Short History of the Church of Ireland*, “(it) was starting from scratch” (2003:68-70). Numerically things are interesting too from this perspective. Two years later, in 1871, the Church’s population was 667,900 out of a population of 5,312,000 or 12.34%. Provincially this meant that in Ulster 21.5% of the population were Church of Ireland, 12.3% of Leinster, 5.3% of Munster and just 4.2% of Connacht’s population were Anglican. For the record in Ulster, Fermanagh had the largest percentage of Episcopalians in Ireland, 37% and Co. Down enjoyed being the county with the highest number, namely 60,000 (McDowell, 1975:3).

Whilst these statistics are interesting and show the geographical split of the church (a more relevant outcome of this Act, at least from a hymnodic point of view) they obviously tell only part of the picture. More telling, perhaps, was the dominance of landed gentry and the ruling class within the Church of Ireland, arguably people who would look beyond the shores to the Church of England and the fashions and trends

the more prestigious cathedrals were offering. By the late 1800s the landed class had become immensely influential and furthermore they controlled local and national government, and education, and helped set the standards of conduct for others (McDowell, 1975:5). These latter points are discussed more fully in Chapter 4 of this study.

The second half of the 1800s saw the role of the Church fall into question, its “numerical weakness couldn’t be ignored” and “its adherents amounted to barely an eighth of the population” (McDowell, 1975:26). The Disestablishment of course was a political move and, largely speaking, beyond the scope of this study, though it does produce a useful datum line for helping periodise the era.

The lack of Church buildings was another related issue from the late 1700s and early 1800s, which saw the Board of First Fruits being set up, resulting in an ongoing programme where 116 glebe houses were built by 1803 (Moody & Vaughan, 1986:531). This Board, which was superseded by the Ecclesiastical Commissioners in 1833 with the Whig Government's *Church Temporalities (Ireland) Act* imposed on the Church of Ireland, was prolific up until its merger and was responsible for improving the life of Church of Ireland worshippers on a day-to-day basis, a factor which may have had some impact on the hymnody chosen. With 474 churches being built in the first three decades of the nineteenth century (Erk, 1830:23), this building programme must clearly have instilled a belief in prayers being answered and confidence in the status of the faith of the Church of Ireland, all issues which arguably impact upon the type of hymns being sung in worship.

As well as its developing history, there are two other main areas that arguably affect the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn during the immediate aftermath of this era. These are the whole areas of doctrine and biblical interpretation as well the internal and external influences on the Church. What is harder to assess is the impact upon hymnody in Ireland at this time. It is reasonable to assume that at such times of trouble one would cling to the foundations of the established canon of Anglican

hymns, the great majestic airs that filled the English cathedrals, but this is hard to prove and remains unempirical because of lost records and a fire in the Dublin Public Records Office in the early 1900s. The records for Christ Church and St Anne's Cathedrals are still intact but they are hardly representative of the Church at a grassroots level and do not speak for everyday hymnody.

The whole issue of biblical interpretation (including discussions regarding Lutherans, Evangelicals and the doctrine of justification) is another area which is of interest to this study. From the 1600s, Lutheran supporters in Ireland held to the theory of justification as written in the Treatise of Justification by the then Bishop of Derry, George Downham, in 1639. In this he argued that the "(relationship) of faith to justification, the nature of justifying faith and the effects of such faith . . . (regenerate) those who have it" (Ball, 1886:284). Also, on the Lutheran side was the counterargument of *Fides Formata* based on Jeremy Taylor's view of "faith working by love", based on James 2:24 "by works a man is justified, and not by faith alone". Whilst this argument is perceived as the "fault line" that divides Protestantism from Catholicism, several arguments on this were revived during the period in question.

Bishop James Thomas O'Brien of Ossory and Alexander Knox, a member of the Church laity, took opposing viewpoints in the 1830s (Ball, 1886:249-251). O'Brien, a Professor of Divinity in University College, Dublin, set out his ideas in *Ten Sermons upon the Nature and Effects of Faith*, preached between 1829 and 1831, but not published until much later in 1877 (The Open Library, 2010). Knox's writings, on the other hand, appeared in the Dublin University Magazine around the same time and according to him, justification was more internalised: "a provision not merely to effect acquittal from legal condemnation, but to deliver from the thralldom of sin, and to purify from moral pollution"(Ball, 1886: 251).

Around this time was of course the Tractarian Movement, a force which has been adequately discussed in Section 2.7. According to Ball in *Reformed Church of Ireland* (1886:253), the Tractarians "found no followers in the Church of Ireland. Their system

was by both the clergy and laity of that Church regarded as a mitigated form of all from which the Reformers dissented, and with which Protestantism was in Ireland contending. It was disapproved by the Bishops.”

How any of these arguments affected hymn choice is difficult, if not impossible to determine. If any local clergy heeded any of these ideas from academic circles, it is hard to imagine how it would have influenced an organist’s or cleric’s choice of which hymns to sing on a Sunday morning. In any case, as the examples of the hymns used in this period shows, hymn choice seems unaffected by these viewpoints.

Also in this period, the first official census of persons who were members of the Established Church in Ireland was taken as part of the Temporalities Act. Later censuses of 1841 and 1851 did not include religious persuasion so it was not until the 1861 census that the next snapshot of Irish religious life was available, although nothing remains of it other than fragments of three Catholic registers, its results being recorded in contemporary journals and books.

In this census there were 4,505,265 Roman Catholics; 693,357 Established Church members and a total population of 5,798,967 persons. This figure is not especially interesting for this study but does provide a context for the study of practical worship and thus for hymn usage (Ball, 1886:259).

At the time of the Union, with the exception of two minor sees, there were the same number of dioceses as there were at the reign of Charles II, the period during the reconstruction after the Commonwealth period had been completed, resulting in thirty-three deaneries and thirty-four archdeaconries (Mant, 1933:290).

In 1801 the Church of Ireland was organised in a manner that is not too dissimilar to its present day status. There were four archbishoprics, namely those of Armagh, Dublin, Cashel and Tuam, the latter two of which have disappeared into Dublin’s Province. These archbishoprics were then subdivided as follows (Pooler, 1902:165):

Armagh: Meath and Clonmacnois, Clogher, Down and Connor,
Lilmore, Dromore, Raphoe and Derry.

Dublin: Kildare, Ossory, Ferns and Leighlin.

Cashel: Limerick, Ardfert and Aghadoe, Waterford and Lismore,
Cork and Ross, Cloyne, Killaloe and Kilfenora.

Tuam: Elphin, Clonfert and Kilmacduagh, Killala and Anchory

By 1833 the situation with the organisation of the dioceses had changed as a result of the Church Temporalities Act, which reduced the four archbishoprics to two and merged ten of the twenty bishoprics into adjacent sees; all of this was done for financial reasons and enforced upon the Church by the then Whig government (Anon., 2011a). In this seventy year period, several, now prominent, organisations were set up (Pooler, 1902: 166). These include The Association for Promoting Christian Knowledge in 1792; The Irish Society and the Protestant Orphan Society in 1818; the Sunday School movement in 1782 and its umbrella organisation, the Sunday School Society in 1809 (National Archives, 2010).

From around the 1840s, the Church of Ireland benefited from the effects of the famine, which took up a lot of political and emotional energy and the British “good-feeling” politics heralded by the then prime minister, Viscount Palmerston. This was to be a short-lived reprieve, though, and the inevitable pace of Disestablishment started to gather momentum from the early 1850s (McDowell, 1975:27).

That said, the history of the Church of Ireland in its role as the Established Church, and leading to its Disestablishment in 1871, is beyond the scope and interest of this study in that does not necessarily affect the choice of hymns sung. It may be legitimately argued that those parishes, clergy or churches with allegiances with London and the Crown may have been more inclined to sing Church of England hymns. This is, however, a possibility that may be very hard to prove, not least because there was no published Church of Ireland hymnal until after this period, so all hymn choices are at best haphazardly recorded and at worst whimsical and conjectural.

One aspect that would have had an influence on the choice of hymns for services is the quality of the actual clergy. Barnard, in an essay in *As by law established* (Barnard, 1995:136) draws attention to this fact by reminding readers that with up to eight hundred clerics in Ireland, it meant that the Church had the largest number of professional people employed in the island, with only lawyers coming anywhere close in number with two hundred and fifty. By the end of the pre-Act of Union period, successive Church leaders tried hard to raise standards amongst their clergy by “eliminating non-residence, pluralism, neglect and ignorance” (Barnard, 1995:138). With such training and less time spent doing non-clerical work such as running farms due to agricultural beneficiaries, (Barnard, 1995:137) surely more time would be spent serving the needs of their churches and by implication, putting greater effort into services and appropriateness of hymns.

This, however, is a large assumption. It does seem true that clergy were involved in a great deal more than ministry and when freed of those encumbrances and combined with greater training, then the standard of everything must rise, including of course, the relevance of hymns in services. Riding on the back of this assumption is the musical ability of organists and choirs, for which there are very few records. It is very difficult to quantify musical standards at the best of times but to historically evaluate even a snapshot of church, parish or diocesan musicians is an area that is strewn with immense imponderables. For instance, places of training in early days were few and far between and the organist who may be academically well decorated, may be thus so because of money paid or bequeathed to the institute in which he trained or because of his social class. At the other end of the scale, a home-taught musician may well have been infinitely more proficient, though this is entirely unproven.

With this in mind, this dissertation, in the specific sense, will not try to examine the musicality of churches sampled but work on the general basis that a large town or important city church would have had the resources to sing any hymnal available to it and would not be constrained by musical reasons to black-list “difficult” hymns. Clerics

too had to have a multi-skilled background because a large majority of them were beneficiaries of agricultural properties and a lot of their time was employed in running farms, especially in rural areas (Barnard, 1995:137).

The first point, that of biblical interpretation, is clearly a major issue in all hymnody, but in the case of the period in question, it is especially relevant as this was the time when both sides of the Lutheran and Evangelical arguments were taken up by Irish clerics. Whilst this happened before 1801, the arguments became more relevant and arguably had a greater causal effect following The Act of Union (Pooler, 1902:89).

Whilst the Church of Ireland, by all accounts, was retaining and developing its repertoire along the lines of the Church of England, this too was the period when non-conforming churches were starting to explore what the musicologist Watkins Shaw describes as “the fugal tunes of the Anglican west gallery” (Temperley, 2009). These were the hymns that depended upon a full, four-part harmony; they were popular in Wales amongst Methodists where whole congregations would sing in harmony. As a result of the interest shown by their Irish counterparts, new evangelical societies flourished and in 1818 the Irish Society was formed followed by the Home Mission Society in 1828. Leading Irish clergy of the time included Joseph Singer, Robert Daly, Benjamin Mathias and Edward Nagle (Neely, 2006:151-2). 1849 saw the formation of the Irish Church Missions, which was at the fore of conversions to Anglicanism, and Akenson in *The Church of Ireland, Ecclesiastical Reform and Revolution* claimed that although “there (was) no precise date on which the Church of Ireland became evangelical ... the movement began in the eighteenth century and gathered force (so that) in the mid-nineteenth century ... the church could be safely described as predominantly evangelical” (Akenson, 1971:132).

In addition to other mainstream ideas being developed in the Anglican Church in this era, features that possibly affect hymnody in the pre-Disestablishment period include the resultant influences of the Oxford, Tractarian and Ecclesiological Movements and the effects of a period of great church-building due to an expanding urban population

and the legislation borne out of the Church Building Commission's recommendations in England and Wales in 1818 (Yates, 2006:307). The various movements and their influences are evaluated more fully in other sections of this research and the period of church building had its counterpart in Ireland, as just discussed.

The First Edition of the *Church Hymnal* in 1864 is arguably the last major event from the point of view of Anglican hymnody history to feature in this period, before it was followed some nine years later by the Second Edition. During the end of the period of Establishment there were no collected volumes of hymns or no Church of Ireland hymnal; instead, churches used random collections, some in very poor condition and most based on Tate and Brady's *Metrical Psalms*, according to Rev. Hercules Dickson, a curate who would eventually become Dean of the Chapel Royal, Dublin. McFarlan quotes Dickson's story: he says that in 1855 Dickson "obtained the sanction and encouragement of Archbishop Whately for the preparation of such a collection (of hymns)" (1990:37). As it turned out, it was that collection that eventually was re-printed and in time became the First Edition. For the record, from this First Edition, 162 tunes remain in the current edition of 719 hymns.

3.6.1 Other internal and external influences from this era

This third issue, the influences of the Church in pre-Disestablishment Ireland, the quality of clergy and their training, the rise of the church organ and the introduction of robed choirs, all are perhaps to some degree corollaries of this range of peripheral yet relevant factors and the examination of these influences will help clarify why hymns written during the nineteenth century did not dampen the Church's, or indeed society's, interest in the eighteenth century hymn. Likewise are arguments related to other faiths and their influences upon the hymnody of the Church. These latter issues are discussed in Chapter 4 of this study as they are sometimes more difficult to periodise and best suit a more general discussion in the context of their overall history.

3.7 1871 – 1921 (THE DISESTABLISHMENT OF THE ANGLICAN CHURCH – PARTITION)

This period, whilst quite short in that it is only a fifty year span, offers a natural period in the Church of Ireland's hymnodic history. Starting at the Disestablishment of the Church of Ireland, the period encompasses several editions of the *Church Hymnal*, the growth of choral singing and the huge political development of the splitting of the country in two, a partition that also split some dioceses.

As argued previously, the actual minutiae of the Disestablishment of the Anglican Church in Ireland are not only superfluous to the needs of this study but it is an area of history which is already more than adequately researched, at least if the sheer volume of university and ecclesiastical research is anything to go by. What is of interest to this study, though, are the results of the Disestablishment that may have led to a seed change, if any, in what hymns were sung and popular.

As so often in history, no single event has immediate effects, especially before digital communications became common place in the last twenty years or so. Equally, the Disestablishment's lack of popularity in the eyes those who lost power and influence is a voice to consider, but, as argued in *The History of the Church of Ireland Vol. III*, the enemies of the Disestablishment made "full use of (shortcomings and unworthiness of the Church) and ... paused to pay their tribute in respect of the clergy.

In every relation of life the Protestant Clergy are not only blameless, but estimable and edifying. They are peaceful with all, and to their neighbours they are kind when they can; and we know that on many occasions they would be more active in beneficence, but that they do not wish to incur the suspicion of tampering with ... Catholics (Mant, 1933:325-6).

Notwithstanding this, however, is the fact that during the early years of the period in question in this section, Ireland endured many major pivotal events in its history while

at the same time Church of Ireland history remained institutionally stable. It was during this period that Ireland withstood “land wars, land purchase ... the Gaelic revival, the literary revival, home rule struggle, the 1916 rebellion, fights for Irish independence, the civil war and the emergence of the Irish Free State and Northern Ireland” (McDowell, 1975:71).

From a purely practical point of view, once the new Reconstruction synod met for the first time, a new code of canons was approved and a revision of the prayer book was organised. The revision committee met during the early 1870s and a new prayer book was approved in 1877. Furthermore, a new hymnal was also approved following the 1864 supplement of the 1856 First Edition (Acheson, 2003:208). Discussions for this hymnal were allegedly heated and the make-up of the committee is interesting as it arguably throws some light on actual hymn choice (McDowell, 1975:62). Indeed the growth and usage of the Hymnal was to be the single most important aspect of hymnody development in this era.

Among those who were involved in the revision were Sir Edward Denny, MP for Tralee and eventual leader of the Plymouth Brethren; Mrs Cecil Frances Alexander, hymn writer and wife of the Bishop of Derry; Archbishop Trench, one of the most prominent names in Irish church history and a strong anti-Disestablishment voice; Humphrey Lloyd, Fellow of the Royal Society and Provost of Trinity College, Dublin; Baron William Plunket, Archbishop and member of the Irish aristocracy yet a strong supporter of the evangelical lobby; and Charles Reichel, professor of Latin, Bishop of Meath and a strong voice for the evangelicals (McDowell, 1975:62).

The committee went to exhaustive lengths to get it right. For example, they met weekly and that was just for the tunes alone. The results of their labour resulted in the Second Edition of the Church Hymnal, published in 1873 with a supplement as an appendix in 1891, totalling 642 hymns, 241 of which were in the First Edition. The preface of this hymnal thanks Sir Robert P. Stewart, Professor of Music at Trinity College, Dublin University, though it does point out that he was not responsible for the

selection of tunes to accompany the hymns (McFarlan, 1990:38). A children's hymnal was produced in 1880, the same year the Sunday School movement celebrated its one hundredth anniversary.

After Disestablishment, the Church seemed to be endued with a sense of positivity in its future. One measure of this was the way in which the richer members of the laity invested in both its Sustenance Fund and building programme. For example, in 1879 a Chapel of Ease was built in Mount Temple in the Diocese of Meath, entirely paid for by a lay member of the church. So too in the same diocese were built a parish hall attached to St Mary's Church, Drogheda, a new church at Turrow and the re-opening of a church in Virginia, all within a two year span from 1879 to 1981, all financed from members of their congregations. The list goes on exhaustively and includes some major projects such as the virtual re-building of Christ Church Cathedral in Dublin, the restoration of Kildare Cathedral and substantial work on Saint Fin Barre's Cathedral in Cork. Again, in all cases, these were financed from outside the Church's own funds. Likewise, church interiors were also improved again, including work on some very high-profile churches such as St Mary's Parish Church, Newry and Waterford Cathedral (McFarlan, 1990:9-11).

Another example of the feeling of positivity was the expansion of the Church of Ireland into geographical areas of Ireland that were traditionally weak for Protestant worship. More specifically, the Church started to expand into the west of the province of Connaught, a move whose seeds were sown long before Disestablishment in 1837 when the Bishop of Tuam founded the *Connaught Endowment Fund*. In the years after its conception, the Church of Ireland had a total of seven churches and thirteen congregations; a measure of its success was that at the time of Disestablishment it had thirty-seven churches and fifty-seven congregations. After 1871 this figure continued to increase with expansion into Achill Island, Aasleigh, Castlekirke and Connemara; the last showed an increase in clergy from one to twelve in approximately the same period of time. It is not clear how such expansion would have affected hymnody, though. On one hand it may be argued that such expansion into rural, Irish-speaking Ireland may

have meant that churches would have used more evangelical material and music less associated with the English landed gentry, but that is mere conjecture. Records in such remote churches are scarce as their preachers' books were almost all destroyed by the Dublin Public Records Office fire in The Four Courts in 1922 (Citizens Information, 2011).

The impact of the Home Rule Bill was the final major historical event to impact upon the Church's history in this period. With the continuous British – Irish question developing, Disestablishment implemented and what was to be the creation of two separate states just around the corner, the four Home Rule Bills of the late 1800s and early twentieth century created their own pressures in Church politics. This, in turn, may arguably have led to a greater clinging to British values and thus to a greater use of hymns at the heart of the English establishment. It is a conjectural point, with little or no empirical evidence, but such was the strength of feeling against a nationalised Roman Catholic state by Irish Protestants, that an examination of an overview of events is meaningful.

The first Home Rule Bill was in 1886 but was not passed and consequently its impact, although sending tremors in the Church community, at least according to Foster, was by way of "boosting an antagonistic Tory vote" (Foster, 1988:367). The second Home Rule Bill of 1893 had a different effect. Within a matter of weeks of its introduction 98% of vestries had signed up to protest (McDowell, 1975:98-9). Nonetheless, support for the union with Britain was tangible, at least until the mid-twentieth century in the South and to the present day in the North. For example, during her Diamond Jubilee celebrations in 1897, Queen Victoria received a message of support and loyalty from the General Synod, which also passed resolutions of "loyal and dutiful greetings" to the King in both 1912 and 1937 (Acheson, 2003:224).

The role of women in the Church was also enhanced during these years with the founding of both the Girls' Friendly Society (GFS) and the Mothers' Union (MU), both copied from English models. The GFS was introduced from Winchester by the

daughter of a Kilkenny rector, Mary Townsend and the MU by Annabelle Hayes, wife of the then rector of Raheny (Acheson, 2003:217). By the time of the third and fourth Bills of 1914 and 1920, which never really got off the ground because of the outbreak of World War I, the 1916 Rising and Partition, the growth of the Gaelic League had turned intellectual opinion within the Church (McDowell, 1975:99).

3.8 1922 - 1966 (PARTITION – THE START OF “THE TROUBLES”)

This particular period, like the others, was relatively easy to frame. Partition in 1922 was probably the most significant event in Irish history; together with the internal impact of two split dioceses it was a major turning point for both Church and state. There were several other points which could have ended this era. This era in many ways is a tale of two Churches of Ireland, with the reality of the unifying force of all-Ireland now gone. In the south the apocalyptic picture painted by special sessions of the General Synod in the years leading up to Partition seemed to have been realised with a loss of 85,000 worshippers over a fifteen year span and a further loss of 20,000 over the next ten years. Much of the first loss was due to the removal of crown forces from employment in the south, whereas the second wave of losses, according to the then Archbishop Gregg, was due to emigration, late marrying and mixed marriages (Acheson, 2003:229).

The end of the Second World War and the publication of the fourth edition of the *Church Hymnal* in 1966 were two apposite but differing options. Ultimately, though, the start of “The Troubles” offers a lot in terms of hymnody and history, with beleaguered Protestants, as a people under siege, holding on to strong beliefs and thus providing research interest from the point of view of worship and thus, hymnody.

3.8.1 Partition and its influence

The most recent twentieth century challenge the Church faced was in 1922 when the Irish Free State was formed and Ulster took up its right to opt out and remain with the United Kingdom (Bardon, 1996:188), though in effect it mattered little (Carroll, 1999:118-122). The history of Partition in Ireland is well-documented and as this study is not especially concerned with re-examining the issues surrounding the social and political events that led to the creation of the new Irish state, certain issues that arose within the Church of Ireland potentially do have hymnodistic implications. With this in mind, one of the biggest threats the church must have faced was when Partition occurred with the formation of the Irish Free State for twenty-six of the thirty-two counties in Ireland, the remaining six retaining British authority.

From a southern Irish perspective, the then new Free State, which lasted until 1937 until its emergence into the Eire and finally into The Republic of Ireland in 1949 when it left the British Commonwealth, had undeniable and inextricable links with the Roman Catholic Church, an influence which had far reaching social effects such as the banning of divorce, contraception, abortion and pornography as well as overt censorship of many books, films and, as time developed, other media. The church also controlled the Free State's governmental infrastructure such as hospitals, schools and many local authorities.

From the Protestant perspective, the outlook was grim. In 1922 their population was just over 7% and, in addition, they suffered a disproportionate amount of emigration for a variety of reasons. These reasons included the general economic decline, their opposition to a *de facto* Roman Catholic government, a desire to be British and fear of physical oppression (Collins, 1993:431). Furthermore, at this time, the Roman Catholic Church also issued the previously released decree *Ne Temere* of 1908 which meant that the offspring of mixed Catholic and Protestant marriages had to be brought up as Catholics. This decree was then nullified later in Vatican II. (Woywod, 1912:6).

Meanwhile in Northern Ireland the 1920 Government of Ireland Bill enabled the reformation of the Northern Ireland counties Londonderry, Tyrone, Fermanagh, Antrim, Down and Armagh (Paseta, 2003:102). From Partition until 1972, Northern Ireland was governed by the Unionist Party, led by James Craig, whose goal, in reaction to what was happening in the then Free State, was to form and preserve Protestant authority. Given that the majority of the population in the province were Presbyterian and Anglican, his job was made relatively easy.

The impact of these years upon the church, and upon contemporary hymnody, must have been immense. Suddenly, the church was effectively divided in two, with two dioceses, Derry and Raphoe-Clogher split in half across the border. However, from these times, the fact remains that since Partition, the Church of Ireland now faced fresh challenges as it was now operating in two countries. Whilst the vast majority of Anglicans now lived in the North, the Representative Church Body, the Theological College and the General Synod all operated out of Dublin. On the other hand, the primacy of the Church remained in Armagh, thus creating two ways of viewing the situation. On one hand the Church was disparate and fragmented between two opposing countries always on the brink of hostilities, yet, as McDowell argues, the Church simply acted as a unifying force (1975:111).

Whichever viewpoint one subscribes to, there were clear practical difficulties to overcome. First, there was the allegiance to the King, as declared in *The Book of Common Prayer*; second, there was the issue of divorce, and finally the question of birth control. All three presented serious challenges and different views between state and Church, though there is little evidence that the last two impacted in any empirical way upon hymnody. The former question, that of prayers for the monarchy, arguably may have greater research potential. With allegiance to the crown strong amongst southern members of the Church, it is reasonable that hymns which represented a *status quo* may well have been popular. Such small feelings are in themselves a research topic, as records are at best disparate, and, more importantly, subject to a great deal of conjecture. For the record, change in the crown prayers came in 1949

when the Irish Free State became a fully-fledged republic and the prayers were amended appropriately. In the words of Archbishop Gregg, “(many) will regret the loss of the familiar words but what other way is there? For in our prayers above all, there must be reality” (Acheson, 2003:112). In the end, allegiances in *The Book of Common Prayer* were vowed to the “Rulers” and north of the border, being in the United Kingdom, to “The Queen” (Anon., 2004:96). Overall, though, as Foster argues, “what matters most about the atmosphere and mentality of the twenty-six-county Ireland in the 1920s is that the dominant preoccupation of the regime was self-definition against Britain – cultural and political” (1988:516).

The impact of World War II on the Church of Ireland was another relevant matter, with lives being lost and Belfast being bombed. Indeed, to this day Remembrance Sundays still seem to attract “traditional” hymns for such services, a point borne out by the research discussed in later chapters. Likewise, education was another thorny issue between both countries though it was in Northern Ireland, due to the Education Acts of 1923 and 1947, that made the most changes in the six counties and in turn putting the more loyal pro-British part of the Church at odds with the then ‘Free State’. (McDowell, 1975:116). Again, in both these cases the impact on hymnody is conjectural and open to interpretation, but unlike previous examples before the fire in the Dublin Public Records Office, there is some evidence as most preachers’ books have remained intact as since that the fire, they have been stored in the various venues such as the Church of Ireland’s own vaults and the Public Records Office in Northern Ireland. (Citizens Information, 2011)

The overarching consideration about all this period is that despite clear issues that are relevant to hymnody, there was no edition of the *Church Hymnal* until 1966, besides two pre-war supplements in the 1930s. The reality is that despite the events of the middle fifty-odd years of the twentieth century, there were no officially published new hymns to support worship.

As Ireland moved towards what was to become “The Troubles” a whole new agenda emerged within society. Foster explains:

Half a century of the Protestant supremacist state had come to a bloody and chaotic end. The enormous question of the legitimacy of the government had been raised once more; the conflict of British army, Royal Ulster Constabulary and IRA suggests specious parallels with the 1919-21 turmoil, while the question of majority opinion, in both North and South, was left to one side (Foster, 1988:592).

With this, of course, came a whole new set of challenges for worship and in turn, hymnody. The new *Hymnal* started its life in June 1952 with a proposal to omit 235 hymns. The Joint Hymnal Committee, as it was called, under the Chair of The Bishop of Meath, the Most Rev. J. McCann, met for five years before eventually including 527 hymns from the previous edition and 164 new hymns. In addition two new hymns previously classified as carols were included in the hymn section and one hymn was reclassified as a carol. Furthermore, 17 new carols were added, giving a total of 688 hymns and 31 carols (APCK, eds., 1960:iv-v).

3.9 1966 – 1998 (THE START OF “THE TROUBLES” – THE GOOD FRIDAY AGREEMENT)

The whole area of the demography of Church of Ireland membership is perhaps beyond the scope of examination of this study, other than a cursory snapshot to see potential threats to worship and thus to hymnody. In this light, historically, the north-eastern section of the island of Ireland has fifty per cent of the total Church of Ireland, though this in itself presents new problems, as R.G. Wilson points out in *A Church of Ireland Handbook*, where he argues that there is grave danger of the Church becoming a Northern church with a Southern annex (1970, 226). In some ways this supports Foster’s view quoted earlier in this chapter, where at least in the immediate period after Partition, one of the main foci of the Southern government was to be as much non-British as pro-Irish. These questions perhaps stray more into a sociological study of the problem with a religion serving a divided society in a split country, as such issues are very hard to relate directly and empirically to hymnody.

At the heart of worship, though, were fundamental changes to the pattern of worship in that the sacraments of baptism and the Eucharist became central elements of the service. According to Acheson the emphasis was on freedom and flexibility; the canons adopted in 1974 were devised by a select committee based on what congregations and clergy “may do rather than what they were forbidden to do” (2003:236-7). Also, the Communion Order was another aspect of worship that underwent revision during this period, with a new *Holy Communion 1972* being published which contained new versions of The Lord’s Prayer, the Nicene Creed and various other inclusions by the International Commission on English Texts. This new publication was deemed necessary and largely welcomed as the 1967 edition was really a low-key revision of certain elements of the 1962 edition (Acheson, 2003:238).

Even before “The Troubles”, the divide was there; Stanford as early as 1946 purports the same argument by saying “the Irish Church (Anglican) faces, if not poverty and persecution, at least harder economic conditions and a large measure of unpopularity (in the Republic of Ireland)” (1946:33). By the time “The Troubles” had come, then, religion was at the centre of the argument.

Within a general history of “The Troubles” one aspect that stands out from a worship point of view was the fear felt by the Protestant community. If it is correct that in times of need and unrest one clings to faith, then worship was central to the Protestant population during these dark years. Hancock argues that these fears of the Protestants are deep-seated and possibly stem from the Catholic uprising of 1641 in which several thousand Protestants were killed, an historical fact which was recited regularly during “The Troubles” and compared to the contemporary actions of the IRA (Hancock, 1996). Another threat felt by the Protestant community at large was a real fear of an ethnic cleansing where, should they have fallen to the will of the Roman Catholic majority in the south, they would lose their culture (Rowthorn & Wayne, 1988:17). This was not helped by the fact that until the referendum in 1972 the Roman Catholic Church enjoyed a special status in the Republic’s Constitution. In that

referendum, made law in 1973, the two articles below were passed and became part of the Fifth Amendment of the Irish Constitution.

Deletion of the entirety of Article 44.1.2:

The State recognises the special position of the Holy Catholic Apostolic and Roman Church as the guardian of the Faith professed by the great majority of the citizens.

Deletion of the entirety of Article 44.1.3:

The State also recognises the Church of Ireland, the Presbyterian Church in Ireland, the Methodist Church in Ireland, the Religious Society of Friends in Ireland, as well as the Jewish Congregations and the other religious denominations existing in Ireland at the date of the coming into operation of this Constitution (Anon., 1999).

It may be argued that the possible impact of this upon hymnody is that such a small pool of worshippers may not create a fertile pool of hymn-writers and religious poets. If that were to be the case, then surely there must be a greater pool of hymn-writers in those areas which have greater Anglican populations. Data for this is not available but it is fair to say that there are greater numbers of active church choirs in the areas where there are larger numbers of Church of Ireland worshippers.

The period of “The Troubles” as a whole is of special interest to the Anglican, partly due to the fear Protestants felt, a point made by Landon Hancock in *Northern Ireland: Troubles Brewing* (1996). The fear of extinction is generated out of a perception of threat to cultural identity, with past perceptions being projected onto current events. In the case of the Protestants in Northern Ireland, historical incidents of violence and massacre have been mythologized and used as the template for understanding modern Protestant-Catholic relations.

“The Troubles” have been well documented and researched, both from an academic and populist point of view and it is beyond the scope of this research to focus directly upon them regarding their impact upon hymnody and the enduring quality of the

eighteenth century hymn. As said previously in this section, it may be argued that in times of desperation and despair people cling on to icons of faith and belief, especially during the years of “The Troubles” when Protestants were under the constant threat of terrorist attack. If faith grows in times like these, then so must approaches to hymnody, but whether or not it made people cling on to old hymns as a source of comfort, or whether it made people look at newer ways of approaching faith is another question.

In any case, “The Troubles” did present real challenges to the Church and its people, but so did various World Wars, and before that, other conflicts and hardships. To place inappropriate emphasis to them would arguably be wrong, as it could give an imbalanced view, especially given Ireland’s “bloody” past. Although framed as the era of “The Troubles”, the sixties up until the nineties was also an age of great advancement in industry and invention, so whilst “The Troubles” take the focus as being the main issue in Ireland during these years, there were inevitably great positivities too.

Clearly, “The Troubles” dominated Northern Irish society during this time, but what of the Church as a whole? Even though most of the members of the Church of Ireland live in the “six counties” the Church is an all-Ireland establishment and congregations in places as far away as Cork and south-west Munster were suitably removed from its day-to-day problems. In 1981, the closest census after the start of “The Troubles”, the Church of Ireland population in the Republic of Ireland was 95,000 while the much smaller six counties of Northern Ireland had a Church of Ireland population of just over 280,000 (CAIN, 2011a). For them the issue was one of economics with the Republic being in a very dark place during this period. Bank strikes in the early 1970s impacted heavily on the retail and commercial sector and continued industrial relations disputes, high inflation, emigration, unemployment rising to 18% and associated backlash from “The Troubles” across the border in Northern Ireland led to the Republic being called the “sick man of Europe”. By the 1980s the Republic’s economy was in tatters,

resulting in taxes rising to as high as 60%, clearly a time of great instability for an already minority religion (Hill, 2010:464-5).

This period ends with an upbeat from both counts. The Good Friday Agreement in Northern Ireland (Anon., 1998) heralded the new beginning of a peace process and the much-lauded “Celtic tiger” of the Southern economy started to give untold riches to a nation starved of economic prosperity (Murphy, 2000). From an Anglican point of view, for the first time in its history, it now had an equal footing with every other religion, enshrined in law and matching the Republic of Ireland’s previously referred to Fifth Amendment to the Irish Constitution of 1973, that of the right of any person to worship freely under the Human Rights section of the Good Friday Agreement. This states clearly:

The parties affirm their commitment to the mutual respect, the civil rights and the religious liberties of everyone in the community. Against the background of the recent history of communal conflict, the parties affirm in particular ... the right to freedom and expression of religion (Anon., 1998).

“The Troubles” clearly dominated life in Ulster but other wider, unrelated issues also developed. Of these, the single biggest issue that was to have an impact on clerical and congregational life was the ordination of women priests in 1990; this was quickly followed in 1992 by the General Synod’s Committee on the Ordained Ministry decisions on conditions of service for the wider issues to do with women clergy such as maternity pay, husband and wife ministries and other related minutiae (Acheson, 2003:246).

1996 saw the General Synod regulated the marriage of divorced persons, as the Church’s position on this had been considered inconsistent ever since Disestablishment (Acheson, 2003:246). The result of this was the fruit of labours which had gone on for many years, primarily waylaid by the controversy concerning penitence (The Representative Church Body, 2011). Rather fittingly the last major issue to affect the Church as an organisation during this period was the General Synod

itself; with the sale of Synod House in Dublin, there seemed to be no reason as to why it had to meet in Dublin, so from the mid-nineties onwards it started to rotate around other cities in Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland (Acheson, 2003:247).

3.10 1998 – PRESENT DAY (THE GOOD FRIDAY AGREEMENT – PRESENT DAY)

Arguably the most significant event in Northern Ireland's recent history has been the Good Friday Agreement, an Agreement which was the fruit of many years' labour and brought about the end of "The Troubles" and in turn, peace in the province. This event, plus the impetus of an imminent new millennium, brought about several challenges for the Church, including identity, definition in a post-modern society and how to preserve its unity in the face of deepening divisions in the worldwide Anglican community (Acheson, 2003:268). It is an easy cliché to say it was a time of great change for the Church, but this is indeed the case. Against a 20th century that brought two world wars, Partition, the explosion of the digital era and increasing liberalisation of Christian thought have all taken their toll on the Church of Ireland, indeed as they would have done on any faith (Carroll, 1999:155).

Taking the cessation of terrorist violence and the *de facto* end of "The Troubles" as the critical event during this period, one of the first challenges the Church was confronted with was the whole question of where it stood on its identity in relation to the Roman Catholic Church, terrorism, policing, subscription to Orangeism and its approach to sectarianism. In short, the whole "Northern Ireland" question, not just now, but through the ages, indeed considering the potent mix of Irish politics down the ages, is a metaphorical wolf that has never been too far away from the proverbial door (Barnard, 1995:204). What is problematic from the point of view of this research is that the study of this is clearly a difficult and complex one and largely outside the context of the aims of the research, unless it can be proven that in times or areas of close sectarian division, hymns were chosen to reflect such strife or perhaps to define greater allegiances. Indeed, possible such difficulties are best summed up by Joseph

Liechty in an essay on *The problem of Sectarianism and the Church of Ireland in As by law established*, when he argues that he personally came to “imagine a continuum with personal identity at one end, communal memory in the middle and formal, academic history at the other end”. As he soon found out, “certain issues effectively collapsed the continuum into a single point” (Liechty, 1995:205).

Undeniably, then, such hymn choices are difficult to prove but general factors that may have caused influence are worth considering. In no event however, is there sufficient evidence to lead to any particular direct influences, though they do raise interesting wider issues which, in turn, may affect hymnody.

Whilst the Good Friday Agreement has remained intact, it has been tested to the limit. One such relevant occasion was, and to a degree, still is, the stand-off at Drumcree Parish Church. Beginning in the end of the previous period of time outlined by this research, but impacting more during this current era, is the stand-off involving Orangemen who were not allowed to parade following a service to commemorate the Battle of the Somme in Drumcree Parish Church in the Diocese of Armagh. The parade has been held every year since 1916, but was told in 1997 by the newly-formed Parades Commission that it was no longer allowed to return via its traditional route along the Garvaghy Road. The officers of the Orange Lodge refused to talk to either the Parades Commission or the Residents’ Coalition and instead publicly protested their right to march. From a Church of Ireland point of view it was to say the least, interesting, as it tested the absolute autonomy of a rector and a Church’s select vestry almost to breaking point (CAIN, 2011b). Quite quickly the “Drumcree imbroglio was totemic ... (becoming) a symbol for Northern Ireland at large, with its tensions and seemingly intractable conflicts” (Acheson, 2003:277). The situation also tested Archbishop Eames, who under intense scrutiny became the voice of reason and worked tirelessly to find a solution; in a speech to the House of Lords in 2002, he urged the government of its responsibility to effect a solution (Acheson, 2003:278). In a way Drumcree has petered out; there are still protests but reason has prevailed.

Politics aside, another major emerging issue since the Good Friday Agreement was the rise of small, evangelical groups in Ireland such as the Pentecostals, Free Presbyterians, Baptists and other such groups who gave the Protestant community at large a wider, more evangelical hymnbook base by which to react against the “one true church” doctrine of the Roman Catholic Church (Hempton & Hill, 1992:180). More hymnbooks and, with society moving into the modern era, better communication between disparate parts of the country, meant that Church of Ireland congregations were increasingly aware of other hymns. Indeed, the greater influences of the hymnody of smaller sects will be dealt with more fully in a later chapter. Related in some way to this was a small but important issue that may have reflected upon hymn choice, namely, the work spent in converting Roman Catholics to Protestantism, and thus the new converts arguably bringing with them a greater desire to sing more Tractarian hymns and even accounting for more Roman Catholic hymns being included in published hymn books of the time. The evidence of this attitude of conversion has a strong provenance and indeed as early as the early 1700s, David Hayton’s work with charity schools in Dublin tells of attempts to convert the Roman Catholic children as “running like a thread through the texture of charity-school sermons” (Miller, 1976:73). Despite these efforts, exact statistics simply do not exist for conversions, and therefore such influences regrettably remain conjectural on account of the absence of empirical evidence.

Significant changes to patterns of worship were also significant at this time. This includes a greater sense of intimacy of worship which in real terms means fellowship in small groups and in non-church venues such as halls, people’s homes and other public buildings. Similarly, some churches are removing formal pews and replacing them with chairs to give not only greater comfort, but greater flexibility (Acheson, 2003:249). Magheraculmoney Parish in the Diocese of Clogher is one such Church which regularly holds prayer meetings at various venues ranging from local church halls to a disused village courthouse. Situated in a rural setting, outside a small village, it boasts a new parish centre with a state-of-the-art kitchen and employs several community workers. One look at its website immediately shows how a personal relationship with both God

and humanity is at the forefront of its central mission and indeed it is typical of many churches in Northern Ireland in recent times (St Mary's Church, 2009).

The growth of the youth wing of the Church of Ireland is also an issue of interest, not only since "The Troubles" ended, but in the immediate period before this. Starting in the 1990s, the Church of Ireland Youth Council started to hold summer camps, first in Castle Archdale in the Diocese of Clogher and the following year in Gosford in the Diocese of Down. Entitled 'Summer Madness', it is now in its twelfth year and is phenomenally successful. In 2012 there are plans to have 4000 young people under canvas in the Diocese of Connor (Summer Madness, 2010). Indeed, the explosion of interest in the youth market is not confined to a single summer camp; it is part of a systemic change within the Church where many parishes have one, if not several, full-time youth workers. Indeed, even the smallest of Churches, such as Magherculmone cited above, run painting classes, guitar lessons, keep fit activities, men's and women's breakfast clubs and other recreational events all held in a Christian environment (St Mary's Church, 2009).

This spirit of evangelism has, according to Acheson, arrested the decline of members of the Church. He points out that it is similar in nature to the Evangelical Revival of the late 18th Century, and it is hard not to disagree. As he argues:

Evangelicals in the Church of Ireland generally did not confuse church order with biblical essentials, as did many in England and Australia, and eschewed also the rigid, systematic theology revived in other reformed traditions in Ireland. Again, they did not organise on party lines, for their primary loyalty was to the Church of Ireland. Their younger clergy were apolitical and mostly not identified with the Orange institutions, and in some cases gave a firm lead against Masonic influence in the Church (2003:256).

Throughout the nineties and especially as the decade wore on and into the millennium, the Church of Ireland continued to broaden its interest in tackling social issues. In his presidential address to the General Synod in 1994, Archbishop Eames called for the Church's greater involvement in the alleviation of unemployment, the

provision of skills training, care of the elderly, provision of housing, Church action on alcohol and drug abuse, homelessness and the care of single parents. Support for such projects and initiatives came from not only the Church but from also, especially in the Republic of Ireland, the Roman Catholic Church and other state quangos (Acheson, 2003:251).

Indeed, this spirit of ecumenism was something that became formally acknowledged at this time in two documents: *One Bread One Body* produced by the Catholic Bishops' Conference in 1998, followed two years later by *Dominus Iesus*, though as Acheson again points out, ecumenism was at its most authentic, not when engrossed centrally with formulae, but where it was expressed locally in the desire of Christian people, citing the example of PAKT, *Parents and Kids Together*, a joint initiative of the neighbouring Roman Catholic and Church of Ireland parishes in Lurgan, Co Armagh (Acheson, 2003:273). Also, from a musical perspective, initiatives such as the Two Cathedrals Festival in Londonderry grew from close relationships between the organists of both St Columb's and St Eugene's Cathedrals (St Columb's Cathedral, 2011b), ironically similar but intrinsically opposite to the inter-church choral festivals held by Church of Ireland parishes exactly one hundred years earlier.

3.10.1 Contemporary connections with the Patrician view of Ireland

The relationship between the modern Church and the ancient one founded by St Patrick is an area of potential significance for a study such as this. For many people, the Church's direct origins lie with the patron saint, as there has been no break in clerical succession (Moore, 1937:9). St Patrick's link with current, and indeed historic, worship is clearly evident.

First, in his *Confession*, St Patrick says, "my father was Calpornius, a deacon, one of the sons of Potitus, a presbyter" (Patrick, 1998:41). This fact, together with the knowledge that St Patrick himself said that he was raised to the rank of bishop (Patrick, 1998:32) clearly indicates several issues. First, that even in the early days there were several

orders of clergy, namely bishops, priests and deacons. Second, it shows that the clergy were married men as was St Peter as indicated in Matthew 8:14; “And when Jesus was come into Peter's house, he saw his wife's mother laid, and sick of a fever”.

Also, by referring to St Patrick's teaching, one can also see the first witness for the text of the Bible being used and the first kind of Latin the English-speaking church used (Wilson, 1970:108). Wilson also goes on to purport the Patrician scholar, R.P.C. Hanson's view that St Patrick's interest in the Bible was beyond what would be expected from an untrained theologian, quoting suitable and apt arguments that support this view (Wilson, 1970:109).

A further issue in regard to the relevance of St Patrick's teachings is the present ordinances he handed down. In the *Confession*, he says: “I am a debtor exceedingly to God, who granted me such grace that many people through me should be regenerated to God and afterwards confirmed, and that clergy should everywhere be ordained for them” (Patrick, 1998:38). Also, “wherever I journeyed for Your sake, through many perils, even to the outlying regions beyond which no man dwelt, and where never had anyone come to baptise, or ordain clergy, or confirm people, I have, by the bounty of the Lord initiated everything, carefully and very gladly, for Your salvation” (Patrick, 1998:51).

Such references clearly show the link to the present-day ordinances of Holy Baptism, Confirmation and Ordination and although he makes no direct reference to Holy Communion, his other pastoral and clerical works do, together with suggestions of women being at an altar; all these, according to Wilson, imply that they were part of his general ministry (Wilson, 1970:111). Other Patrician attitudes and issues relating to modern day Anglican worship include no references to the Virgin Mary, no references to Purgatory or place of intercession for sinners and no references to him being sent to Ireland by the Pope Celestine (Wilson, 1970:111-12).

Whilst all this in itself is interesting, its relevance of course is twofold. First, it helps explain the deep-seated attitude of continuance in the Church of Ireland. The words “Ancient and Apostolic Church” are used liberally in literature associated with the Church and perhaps an understanding of its first links helps explain this. Perhaps this helps explain an “if it ain’t broke, don’t fix it” approach one gets from contemporary church goers. This was the over-riding feeling of some of the interviewees (see 7.5 and sub-sections). In any case, it helps address a general area of the strength of the provenance of the Church of Ireland, a provenance that arguably is hymnody-related by definition.

Second, such insights into St Patrick’s teachings and life yield a long-standing ecclesiastical foundation for the beliefs and practices that are referred to in hymns, especially the older hymns under scrutiny in this study—hymns that directly refer to rigid aspects of worship. It is certainly very true that St Patrick’s life and history are everywhere in the Church of Ireland, with churches and cathedrals named after him, to prayers, writings and other general references. In this respect, there must be arguably a tangible link between this and the modern day approach to worship and thus, by implication, to hymnody.

3.10.2 Creeds and parts of worship in a contemporary context and their resultant influences on hymnody

The aspects of worship that are commonplace in the contemporary Church of Ireland are clear vehicles of inspiration for hymn-writers. An understanding and placement of the traditions, creeds and relevant tracts is academically of interest to this study.

Without wishing to re-write an already exhaustive history of the beginnings of Christianity, establishing some kind of background is necessary. The Bible states in Luke 1:1-4 and Acts 1:1 that the early Christian church gained 3000 converts on the Day of Pentecost. It is also known that St Paul’s Epistles to the Thessalonians are

among the first books of the New Testament that were written (Brown, 1997:455) and this occurred after his second missionary journey to the area (Acts 15:3; 17:1; Thess 1:5-6). Furthermore, the belief is that his first missionary journey did not happen until after the Death of King Herod (Acts 12: 1-23; 13) and that his death occurred probably in AD 44 (Richardson, 1999:15). Considering the fact that he spent time in Antioch on his return (Acts 14:28) and then went to the Council of Jerusalem (Acts 15:2, 22), the academic assumption is that the earliest books of the New Testament were not written until twenty years or so after the Resurrection, a date normally agreed to be around 49 – 51 (Wilson, 1970:137).

The creeds, tracts, canticles and scriptures all have their origins from this time, when apostles' letters were read in the churches to which they were sent (Col 4:16) and systematically they became part of church use. Clearly, the old Jewish ways inevitably became intertwined with the new Christian values, but as Wilson argues, when they (the apostles) became disciples of Jesus they had no reason to think less of these Jewish Scriptures ... He declared that He came not to destroy but to fulfil and on many occasions quoted them with obvious approval of their teaching. He approved also many of the observances of the Jewish Law (Wilson, 1970:138).

The Christian church, then, in its early days, is intertwined with the development of the Bible's New Testament and the creeds and canticles that are today part of the Church of Ireland, though it previously argued a continued connection with Jesus Christ. In keeping with most Reformed churches, Scripture must be the basis for all doctrines and on that fundamental premise, together with the Church's provenance with the early days of the evolution of the New Testament, the liturgy of hymns has emerged. In the words of W.G. Wilson again, "creeds developed side by side with the New Testament canon of Scripture, under the guidance of the Holy Spirit in the Church, from elementary "forms" of belief which we can trace in the New Testament"(Wilson, 1970:145).

From a hymnody point of view, what does this mean? In simple terms it means that there may be a case for seeing that the reason the eighteenth century hymn endured

was because of this simple idea of faith and its doctrinal origins. On a psychological level perhaps there are reasons as to why people cling to such hymns, again based on the idea that the link with the early church is there and change isn't necessary. Against this are those who believe that new societies need and require new ways to worship; a more general idea of fundamentalism in Christianity and a seeking of the "Truth" is more desirable and appropriate.

3.11 ADDRESSING THE RESEARCH QUESTION

The purpose of this chapter was to provide structure and clarity to the research and, by doing so, to help contextualise and refine the influencing features of hymnody upon practical worship.

Where the previous chapter dealt with understanding the hymns used in Anglican worship and their diverse influences and provenance, this chapter examined the historical context of hymnody in the Anglican Church as well as periodising this according to significant events in Church and state.

With so many hymns and influences, as well as key historical events in both state and Church, as well as the whole question of Anglo-Irish politics, the argument could easily have become nebulous. For this reason Section 3.4 begins with explaining the reasons for starting in 1691 and explains why it is as good a date as any for anchoring the beginnings. First, there are good practical reasons for starting in 1691; second, the politics and especially the Church politics were very prolific at the time; and finally, it was a period of immense change within the Church of Ireland. This period transpired to be the era of the Wesleys, the rise of evangelicalism and overall, an era of great discontentment regarding the unusual demographics of Ireland which saw a minority of the population being the ruling class.

The period of the Protestant Ascendancy proved to be an apposite choice for the commencement of the next section, 3.5, dealing with seventeenth century hymnody. From giving a brief overview of the history of the Church of Ireland from the birth of St Patrick, a useful wider historical context was provided for the rest of the chapter. This section then, by outlining the key facts related to both the Church *in* Ireland and then the Church *of* Ireland, charts the growth of its beginnings through the early synods, through the Middle Ages to the Reformation; the publication of the *Book of Common Prayer*; the “Flight of the Earls”; the Plantation and the growth of Protestantism in Ireland up until the Act of Union in 1801, where Section 3.6 begins.

3.6 yielded several interesting facts, helping both to understand the aftermath of the Act of Union on a macro level and also to come to terms with the psyche of the Irish Anglican. It was learned from this section, for example, the effects of the domination of the gentry class in Ireland, the vast majority of whom were Anglican and as such, no doubt, clung to their Anglicised forms of worship as the norm. This too was the period of the Board of First Fruits when the Church underwent an expansion, an expansion which also resulted in more hymns.

Finally, from the point of view of liturgy and doctrine, this chapter helped to address the various influences of biblical interpretation from other sources as well as to explain the influence of the Tractarian Movement and the events leading up to and including the publication of the First Edition of the *Church Hymnal* in 1864. 3.6 was undoubtedly a comprehensive section but a necessary one because of the wide range of events that took place in that period, all of which influenced the hymnody of the time. Other relevant internal and external influences of the same period were also briefly explored in 3.6.1 and are fully dealt with in Chapter Four.

In Section 3.7, the Disestablishment of the Church up until Partition was discussed in full, this being an era where the Anglican Church lost its superior “established church” status, an effect which had a great impact upon worship and thus hymnody. It was important to note the growth of choral singing and the sense of rising up against this

adversity by rank-and-file Anglicans and members of the congregation. Section 3.7 showed specifically how this fight-back occurred, with specific examples from the Dioceses of Meath, Dublin and Cork. It also highlighted the Connaught Endowment Fund and other similar schemes such as the birth of the Girls' Friendly Society and the Mothers' Union. Drawing attention to these examples was important to this research as they helped illustrate on a local and parish level the way in which ordinary Church members felt, a feeling that translates into how people worship and thus, what they want to sing.

Section 3.8 was easy to time-frame, it being the Partition until the start of "The Troubles" in Northern Ireland, two events that are arguably the most significant in modern Irish history. As in other sections and indeed chapters in this study, there was a deliberate attempt not to simply reiterate the history, which would have been easy to do, as events in the country were essentially based on religion, the issue behind this research topic. That said, the chronology of events on what was now both sides of the border has a direct role affecting worship.

Section 3.8.1, which discussed Partition and its influence, proved to be equally significant and relevant for two reasons. First, events now enter living history, and second, the Church of Ireland becomes split between two countries. From the point of view of the overarching question of the research, that of why eighteenth century hymns proved to be resilient, it was interesting to discover that during this period there was no new hymnal in the Church of Ireland until 1966, the 1933 *Church Hymnal* merely being a supplement.

In Section 3.9, the duration of "The Troubles" is an era that in modern parlance "picks itself". The twenty-two years of violence had a profound effect on the lives of everyday citizens of the Province, which, of course, included Anglican worshippers. In this respect the research evaluated the effects of this upon its people and found that Protestants under threat may have chosen hymns different from those they would normally sing.

During this section the research also discussed other wider events such as the General Synod's regulating its position on divorce, the rising number of women clergy, and the sale of Synod House in Dublin, as well as evaluating the effects of the new sweep of charismaticism and evangelicalism that were affecting many parishes and their chosen hymnody.

Once the Good Friday Agreement took place in 1998, events changed considerably in the Province, as noted and discussed in 3.10. Again, as during "The Troubles", the research discovered that in times of discontent, certain Anglicans may adopt a more "siege-like" mentality regarding their worship. The siege in question, though, was not a return to violence but the evocative and potentially de-stabilising Drumcree Stand-off. This aside, 3.10 also reached conclusions regarding the new *Church Hymnal* and finally, inter-church relations, especially with Roman Catholic neighbours.

A final summative section 3.10.1 became necessary as the research evolved. This sub-section in a way links back to the start of the chapter in that it addresses the link back to the old Church, during the time of St Patrick, a time which a lot of Anglicans in Ireland relate to. In the sense that this research is concerned with evaluating the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn, an understanding of the Church's own "pedigree" goes some way towards explaining why the Church can actually look over its shoulder at a place in history when they believe life was better.

The similar but slightly tangential sub-section 3.10.2 concludes this chapter by discussing the placement of the various parts of worship which are relevant to this study and helps explain why the Church may hearken back to the eighteenth century for terms of personal faith related to the content of what hymns from that era represent.

Overall this chapter has given many interesting and relevant points and has provided the rest of the research with a much tighter and controlled framework within which to

operate. Its successful analysis of the historical context of hymnody and its periodisation according to the relevant events in Church and state have proven to be a necessary and germane study.

CHAPTER FOUR: MUSICAL AND HYMNODISTIC INFLUENCES IN THE CHURCH OF IRELAND FROM ITS BEGINNINGS UNTIL THE PRESENT DAY

4.1 RESEARCH AIM FOR THIS CHAPTER

Whereas Chapter 3 examined the historical factors that impacted upon hymnody, both from a Church and state perspective, this chapter aims to evaluate and discuss the following:

- i. To examine how music was made in the Church, investigating specific issues that affect hymn usage and selection from the pre-eighteenth century era until the present day.
- ii. To examine the external influences of hymns from other faiths such as Orthodoxy, the Roman Catholic Church and other mainstream Protestant religions.

In the previous chapter it was relatively easy to periodise such issues, on the basis of events which had occurred in history. In this instance, however, an episodic account is not always possible which is why sections 4.5 to 4.8 are discussed separately.

In terms of addressing the overall research questions, this chapter further examines the Irish Anglican background as well as evaluating the main threats that eighteenth century hymns face in worship today.

4.2 RESEARCH METHOD

This chapter uses exclusively academic texts, articles and online documents accessed from the libraries of Queen's University, Belfast, and the Church of Ireland Theological College, Dublin. In section 4.5 Darling and Davison's *Companion to the Church Hymnal* (2000) is used extensively, as are other hymnal reference books and histories.

4.3 STRUCTURE OF THIS CHAPTER

As the general analyses of hymns, their influences and their histories draw to a close in this research, this chapter focuses on the musical issues and other external influences upon hymn choice.

The opening sections from 4.4 to 4.4.4 evaluate music making in the Church following a loose chronology. 4.4.5 looks at organ development and, although it may superficially appear out of place in this section, it is relevant to the overall sectional aims of music making despite not fitting a chronological discussion.

Section 4.5 deals with influences from other faiths, taking as its yardstick hymns that have originated from these cultures and have been included in the *Church Hymnal*, as well as looking at the general influences such faiths have had upon hymnody.

The final sections 4.6, 4.7 and 4.8 address disparate topics, before the ensuing chapter dealing with the establishment of the canon of eighteenth century hymns, while 4.9 draws the chapter to a conclusion.

4.4 MUSIC MAKING IN THE CHURCH: INTRODUCTION

At the core of hymnody is the physical process of playing and singing the hymns and other church music. In this respect, an examination of the situation regarding musicianship and the personnel involved in church music is worth investigating, not least as it helps explain the practicalities behind the reasons why hymns were chosen to be sung in services up and down the country, on a church-by-church basis.

4.4.1 Pre-Disestablishment

It is not surprising that in this very early period of the Church's life, even up to the Disestablishment, most of the church musicians, including singers, organists and composers, were mainly English and strongly Anglicised (Gillen & Johnstone, 2001:13). Whilst the natural flow of historical events in Ireland would account for this anyhow, this feature of church music goes back to medieval times when a law was passed in the infamous "Statutes of Kilkenny" by an infant Irish Parliament citing that "no Irish of the nations of the Irish be admitted into any cathedral or collegiate church by provision, collation or presentation of any person whatsoever, or to any benefice of holy church amongst the English of that land" (Cosgrove, 1987:389). As a result, some of the earliest names in Irish church music such as John Farmer, John Fido and Benjamin Rogers were all English (Gillen & Johnstone, 2001:14) and it was not until the 1700s that the first naturalised Irishman provided church music, either as an organist, singer, choir-leader or composer. These first native Irish persons to serve included a man named John Stevenage of Christ Church Cathedral, who arrived in the church in 1771, though this date is disputed by several academics including Gillen and Johnstone, who suggest that the distinction probably lies with somebody before this time (Gillen & Johnstone, 2001:19).

By the end of the eighteenth century, Christ Church Cathedral in Dublin had built up a library of church music, though most of its repertoire was written on hand-written part-books and scores. In the mid-1700s the Cathedral asked the chanter's vicar to examine and collect old choir parts and start cataloguing them, a task that seems to have initiated the first real attempt at archiving the music (Milne, 1999:311). If this was the case at Christ Church then presumably most other cathedrals and high churches were using hand-written parts as well, though this is an assumption that is difficult to prove because of lost, destroyed or incomplete records.

Also during this time probably the first Irish-born composer whose music was used in church was Richard Broadway (d. 1760), possibly the son of St Fin Barre's Cathedral organist Edward Broadway (Gillen & Johnstone, 2001:19) but little is known of these

times on account of poor and unavailable records. Of the main Irish cathedrals, namely Christ Church and St Patrick's of Dublin, St Anne's in Belfast, St Finbarre's in Cork and St Patrick's Armagh, records remain scant, not least in part because of a fire in the Dublin Public Records Office in 1922 (Citizens Information, 2011), as they housed all Church documents until the formation of the Representative Church Body of the Church of Ireland (the RCB) in 1931. By the next period of Irish history, according to the periodisation employed in this research, choral pieces that emanated from the Dublin cathedrals were much more plentiful and the works of George Walsh (d.1765), Edward Higgins (d.1769), Robert Shenton (1730 – 98) and Samuel Murphy (d.1780) are still performed today (Gillen & Johnstone, 2001:20).

Early hymns still sung in the current *Church Hymnal* are few in number and amount to just 15 pre-eighteenth century ones. Of those, four are by George Herbert and three by John Milton. Herbert's contributions are *King of Glory*, *King of Peace*, *Let all the world in every corner sing*, *Teach me, my God and King* and *Come, my Way, my Truth, my Life*, with Milton's hymns being *Let us with a gladsome mind*, *The Lord will come and not be slow* and *How lovely are Thy dwellings fair!*

Milton's and Herbert's hymns are discussed already in Chapter 2.4.2 but other hymns that survive to this day include Whittingham's *The Lord's my shepherd* and Fletcher's *Drop, drop, slow tears*, all interesting for many different reasons. The first of these, William Whittingham's *The Lord's my shepherd*, is arguably one of the most sung hymns in the Christian world, used as well in Judaism, the world over and in many languages including Hebrew (McMillan, 1988:78). The hymn originated in Scotland and although it is attributed to Whittingham, it was, according to Darling and Davison, "the work of a committee that produced an amalgam drawn from at least seven different sources" (2005:69). Its popularity was no doubt enhanced when the hymn was sung at the wedding of the current Queen Elizabeth II of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Ireland and it is set to two airs in the *Church Hymnal*, *Crimond*, by W. Baird Ross and *Brother James' Air* by James Leith McBeth Baine. *Drop, Drop, slow tears* is a short lament, ideal for Easter and written for private use, as well as being a hymn suitable

for personal reflection. It was written by Phineas Fletcher who, despite being a vicar, was not noted for hymn writing and indeed just wrote this as a poem. It is based on Luke 7:27-8 and is set to Orlando Gibbons' *Song 46*, written contemporaneously. Written by Edward Perronet, *All hail the power of Jesus' name*, sung to the tune *Diadem* or *Miles Lane*, has an interesting provenance in that it started its life in the era of the Wesleys but underwent various revisions, additions of verses before "being appropriated by Dr John Rippon", a Baptist, in 1787 (Darling & Davison, 2005:360).

The first published music in Ireland was in 1771 with works by Dublin-born Richard Woodward Jr (1743-1777), son of one of the Lay Vicars Choral of Christ Church and St. Patrick's Cathedrals who presumably brought him up in the Choir School and Choir of Christ Church Cathedral. On the death of the organist, George Walsh, in 1765, Woodward was appointed organist of Christ Church and made a Lay Vicar Choral there at the same time. He was also made Master of the Choristers at both Cathedrals. His Op. 3, "Cathedral Music", is considered by his current publishers his most important work "(containing) much fine music, including anthems and a Service in B flat" (Melrose Music, 2001).

The nineteenth century seemed to bring with it a great deal of change from the cathedral music perspective and if a cathedral's role as a leader and inspirator to parishes the length and breadth of the country are anything to go by, its effect are at best, haphazard, a point best illustrated by the example of the situation in Irish cathedrals.

With the Act of Union in 1800 having a detrimental effect on commercial life in the country, the leading Irish cathedral, Christ Church, suffered a decline in three areas: status, funding and physical state, the last point being addressed by major repair work undertaken between 1871 and 1878. In St Patrick's Cathedral the situation was not much better. By the start of the nineteenth century it was in partial ruin and it took until 1861 when the brewing magnate, Sir Benjamin Lee Guinness, undertook the repair work at his own expense (Grindle, 1989:55-7).

During the actual services in this time, things were symptomatic of a cathedral in decline. Discipline was at a low ebb and, as Stanford noted, “after the anthem (in Christ Church) there was a general stampede out of the church, leaving the preacher to deliver his gratuitous sermon to the few who remained” (1914:37).

In Armagh the situation was a little more rosy: in the middle part of the century the cathedral enjoyed relative financial security, and with that came a strong musical tradition. Limerick Cathedral was more stable than its Dublin counterparts, even reinstigating daily choral evensongs in 1852. Cloyne Cathedral enjoyed a new cathedral built in the early part of the 1800s and St Finbarre’s Cathedral in Cork expanded its number of choirboys. Elsewhere the situation was patchy. St Canice’s in Kilkenny had an “organ but no choir” (Clontarf Parish Church, 2011), St Columb’s in Londonderry was operating as a parish church and in Waterford Cathedral the choir was disbanded in the 1840s and did not reappear until the 1870s (Grindle, 1989:80-84).

This period includes the Romantic Movement, so the hymns that arose out of this era arguably show more characteristics of the style of this period than they do of any other influences. The works of James Montgomery, as discussed in section 2.7 of this research, are good examples of this; they share his own view of the structure of Romantic poetry in that they must have “a beginning, a middle and an end” (Montgomery, 1825:xiv). As Watson argues in *The English Hymn*, his hymns show the mature style of a professional writer and a competent and technically gifted poet, true to his own ideologies and beliefs (1997:305-7).

Equally, the Victorian hymn as well as the influences of the Tractarians, again previously discussed, all played their part in the development of hymnody in this period. Minor schools such as the “Rivulet” hymns also played their part. It was during this part of the nineteenth century that several styles of hymn were introduced into society. Thomas Toke Lynch, a Congregationalist, published his *Hymns for Heart and Voice*, in a canon that was to become known as the “Rivulet” hymns, and which

touched many raw nerves in Christian intellectual thought (Watson, 1997:498) but as none of his hymns are in the *Church Hymnal*, further analysis is not necessary. Also during this time, American Gospel hymns started to become available and these are dealt with more fully later in this chapter.

Influences from women writers, too, left their mark, this being the era of the famous women novelists including the Brontes, Elizabeth Gaskell and George Eliott. The women hymn writers and Christian poets known to Church of Ireland congregations include Christina Rossetti, Sarah Flower Adams, Dora Greenwell, Frances Ridley Havergal, Charlotte Elliott and Cecil Frances Alexander, to name but some, all of whom are discussed fully in section 2.7.

It is difficult to assess the impact of robed choirs on hymnody and thus on the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn, though as an indicator of the gradual change in status of music in the church, it is nonetheless relevant. Nowadays, Church of Ireland congregations the length and breadth of Ireland are used to seeing robed choirs, even in the smallest and most rural of parishes, irrespective of standard, but this was not always the case. It took the decline of the influence of the Tractarians in the Church of England to start to see this change when a “hybrid form of (a) parochial choir” arose, “whose adoption was to eclipse the original Tractarian model” (Rainbow, 1970:265). This, of course, seems to have its roots in social class and order more than anything else. During the middle to late 1800s, the middle classes broadly speaking made up the large part of church attendances; this was due in part to the perception of church attendance as being linked to a rise in social status (Reader, 1964:137). As such, passionate and fervent congregational singing was considered rather taboo and was perceived as an activity associated with the working classes (Rainbow, 1970:266). Add to this the fact that the Tractarians, whose authority in the Anglican Church was starting to decline, had always advocated proper training for congregations in the singing of hymns, and as their influence started to wane, so too did attitudes about congregational singing (Curwen, 2009:196).

From the 1860s, many new choirs were set up throughout the Anglican community (Rainbow, 1970:269) the parallel popularity of the “Scudamore” organ in village churches (Skidmore Genealogy, 2011) meant a movement away from *a capella* singing to accompaniment by a hand-cranked barrel organ (Rainbow, 1970:269) resulting in a change in musical texture to the ears of the listener, and, crucially, to the way in which the church goer perceived hymnody. This difference in musical texture, and the scope provided by more organs and choirs, inevitably led to new styles of music and new church compositions.

4.4.2 Disestablishment of the Anglican Church – Partition

One of the less-publicised facts to emerge from Disestablishment, but intrinsically relevant to hymnody, was that Church musicians could continue their employment as long as they continued to discharge their duties. Equally interesting was the new legislation surrounding cathedrals and churches, with those cathedrals having a dual function of being a parish church giving rise to controversy as to what forms of service to use (Grindle, 1989:85-7).

As in most churches, however, the reality of fighting against Disestablishment and then sorting out the effects of it meant that music development was well down the list of priorities. Immediate dwindling morale, buildings falling apart and in the case of both Dublin cathedrals, many unsuccessful attempts to attain even regular choir practices, meant that standards at the top level were slipping (Calhoun, 1981:91).

Music sung in services during this time was organised in a disparate fashion, with no cathedrals or churches being the same. Whilst parish churches appeared to remain largely unaffected, it was the cathedrals that saw the most change, fundamentally related to a change in income. In Armagh Cathedral, for example, the choir school closed as a result of Disestablishment, with the boys being sent to the local public school, Armagh Royal School, yet within one year it had re-opened because of public

and church demand (St Patrick's Cathedral, Armagh, 2009). In Cloyne Cathedral, the music was "sung with almost certain less ambition" (Grindle, 1989:107), St Canice's Cathedral in Kilkenny fell under the auspices of being both a cathedral and a parish church and therefore had its own set of problems, and in the case of St Mary's Cathedral, Limerick, all records following Disestablishment have been lost (Grindle, 1989:112).

Beyond the internalised world of cathedrals, another factor affecting hymnody during the years following Disestablishment was the publication of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* in 1889 by the Church of England. Whilst this publication has already been explored in section 2.7, in this context it is interesting to note that whilst it was clearly the most dominant hymnal in the Anglican world, it was not adopted as its official hymn book and faced many challenges from within the Church of England itself. The *Yattendon Hymnal* was one such challenge, produced by Robert Bridges and H.E. Wooldridge. It was printed by Oxford University Press and painstaking detail was taken over the presentation of it, using colour, new type-faces and (what was then very uncommon) words printed between the staves of music. It was essentially a singers' book and as such was limited to 100 hymns so the singer would not have to develop a huge repertoire; indeed it contains many hymns which are now in the current edition of the *Church Hymnal*. Its use and indeed any subsequent English hymnals' usage in Irish Anglican circles is not known, but anecdotal evidence suggests publications from Britain were part and parcel of Irish worship (Watson, 1997:512).

Following its success, *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, 1904 edition, was revised, re-branded and included some fresh hymns including five gospel ones from *Sacred Songs and Solos* as well as two burgeoning American hymns, *Dear Lord and Father of Mankind* and the carol, *O Little Town of Bethlehem*. Nevertheless, it was a commercial failure and hardly a parish in the Church of England ordered a copy (Phillips, 1943:213). *The English Hymnal* of 1906 was much more popular and tried to stay clear of the more Victorian hymns associated with *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, which strove hard to be at the forefront of hymnody (Watson, 1997:516-522).

A less obvious source of hymnody, but one which is still important, was the rise in status given to the output and hymnody of the English public school system. Three editions of the *Public School Hymn Book* in 1903, 1919 and post-Partition in 1949, were all used widely in the school system, even well beyond their intended audience, as well as in schools in Ireland, especially those clinging to the English public school model of governance (Routledge, 1964:47). Also, several eminent hymn writers who were Directors of Music at public schools contributed offerings of their own to these hymnals, many of which have found their way into various editions of the Church Hymnal. Craig Seller Lang of Christ's Hospital School wrote the descants of *Immortal, Invisible, God only wise* as well as *Praise to the Lord, the Almighty, the King of creation!* (Darling & Davison, 2000). Sir George Dyson of Malvern College wrote the tune *Winton* as a setting of *The Lord is here – He finds us as we seek* and the Shaws, Martin and Edward, contributed twelve tunes between them. Martin Shaw's works are *Epworth*, set to *Can we by Searching find out God* by Elizabeth Consett; *Royal Oak*, the air to the well-known *All things bright and beautiful*; *Little Cornard*, the tune to *Hills of the north, rejoice*; the *Old 124th* sung to *Whitmore's Father, again in Jesus' name we meet*; the second tune to Isaac Watts' *How bright those glorious spirits shine!*, *Crediton*; *Camber*, set to *Jesus went to worship*; *Westridge*, made popular by *Jesus, friend of little children* by Walter J. Mathams and Ingeman's song of pilgrimage, *Through the night of doubt and sorrow* sung to *Marching*.

Geoffrey Shaw's output was almost as prolific, composing Wesley's *Christ whose glory fills the skies* set to his air *England's Lane*; *Birling*, which is sung to *Come, gracious spirit, heavenly Dove*; Newton's well-known hymn *Approach, my soul, the mercy-seat* for which he harmonised *Stracathro*; and his adaptation of *Hail, gladdening light* for which the tune is eponymously known.

From the point of view of hymn writers, this was not an especially prolific period, but works from this period include *And now this holy day*, *One day when heaven was filled with His praises*, *Praise the Lord, rise up rejoicing*, *The old rugged cross*, *O Dearest Lord*,

Thou sacred head, and The seed is Christ's and His the sheaf. Amongst those, two that are especially interesting include the Reverend Edward Harland's *And now this holy day*; it was first included in an 1876 second supplement to his 1855 *Church Psalter and Hymnal* and is viewed as being the most famous of his 584 published hymns (Darling & Davison, 2005:125). The hymn was first included in the third edition of the *Church Hymnal* where it has remained since, albeit in a shortened form and is sung to the tune *Quam Dilecta* by Hener Jenner, at the time a Minor Canon of Canterbury Cathedral.

Also, the hymn written by American Presbyterian John Wilbur Chapman, *One day when heaven was filled with His praises*, is an interesting addition to the *Church Hymnal* not only for the provenance of the writer, but because its inclusion in the current edition of the *Church Hymnal* is its first usage in the Church of Ireland, having been popular in other hymnals since its first use in 1908. The air to which it is sung, *Living, He Loved Me* by Charles Howard Marsh, was a bespoke composition, Chapman having personally given the hymn to Marsh for him to compose.

A final interesting development in the time of the period following Disestablishment was the emergence and growth of the choral festival, with organisations being formed up and down the length of the country, such as the Omagh Parochial Choirs Association, Kilkenny Church Choral Union and East Meath Choral Association. The seeds were sown just a few years earlier, though, as the Omagh example illustrates. Here, in 1868, ten choirs met in St Columba's Parish Church making a total of 140 voices; interestingly the hymns chosen came from *Hymns Ancient and Modern* rather than from the recently published First Edition of the *Church Hymnal*. Within fifteen years, Kilmore Diocese and Ballymena had their own fairly major choral events similar to the one in Omagh and the Diocese of Armagh had instigated its own three choirs festival, held in different counties on a rotation basis, namely Armagh, Tyrone and Louth (McFarlan, 1990:30-35). Also similar festivals were held in St Patrick's Cathedral, Dublin, the dioceses of Carlow and Ferns and Belfast, where, Sir John Prescott Stewart's "Belfast Vocal Union" was popular.

Finally, with Disestablishment of the Church came the ending of the lucrative lifetime endowments for a vicar choral, thus reducing the significance of symbols of Anglican colonialism and the end of an era of music in Ireland (Gillen & Johnstone VI, 2001:26).

4.4.3 Partition – the start of “The Troubles”

In this war-interrupted window of post-Partition Ireland, several events of relevant significance occurred in the Church. From an organisational and internal point of view, professional or stipendiary cathedral choirs started to fall in number, as did the number of choir schools. This in turn impacted upon the role of the cathedrals in music and arguably showed a falling standard to the rest of the Church. At present the only cathedral choir school in Ireland is that at St Patrick’s, which was founded in 1432 by Archbishop Talbot, the sole survivor of a decline which lasted most of the 20th Century (St Patrick’s Cathedral, Dublin, 2011). Whilst there is no empirical evidence to conclude that the decline in cathedral choir schools resulted in lower standards, it certainly would have resulted in different standards.

Regarding purely musical influences, this was the era that saw the move away from tonal harmony, the style of harmonic balance that had been in existence since the late Baroque Period (Dolmetsch, 2005). Across Europe, for example, new composers were experimenting with sacred styles resulting in works such as Kodaly’s *Psalmus Hungaricus*, *Te Deum* and *Missa Brevis*; Villa Lobos’ *Mass of Saint Sebastian*; Poulenc’s *Gloria* and *Mass in G*; Lennox Berkley’s *Stabat Mater*, Stravinsky’s *Symphony of Psalms* and Messiaen’s *Livre d’Orgue*, in which the fifth section of the piece contains Hindu rhythms, three other independent rhythmic personalities over a full organ score (Routley, 1964:130). This list is virtually endless, the twentieth century being a period of great musical experimentation.

The big issue in this period, however, is not the way in which remnants of a Church of England-influenced hierarchy cling on to an Anglo-central Anglican idyll, but more so the increasing influences of gospel and other music. Other musical developments in

this period include an explosion of new hymnals, refining technology in organ building including the use of digital organs and the introduction of two new *Church Hymnals*, editions four and five. These and other related topics will be fully explored in Chapter 5 of this study, which fully examines how music-making in the Church happens in today's world, taking its beginnings from the start of "The Troubles" in 1969 for several reasons. First, it will be consistent with the periodisation methodology explained in earlier chapters, second, it is within living memory of some clergy and musicians, and finally, it is an era when the rapid development in technology and media has started to have significant impacts upon society.

In the earlier part of this pre-WWII period, several notable hymns were either written, first discovered or published for the first time. These include family favourites such as *Morning has broken*; the Christmas carol, *Ding dong! Merrily on high*; *Come, risen Lord, and deign to be our guest*; *Spirit of the living God*; *Now the green blade rises from the buried grain*; *God of Grace and God of Glory* and *Rise up and Serve the Lord!*

Commissioned by Percy Dearmer when he was writing the second edition of *Songs of Praise* for its publication in 1931, *Morning has broken*, by Eleanor Farjeon is significant in its inclusion for three reasons. Firstly, the tune *Bunessan* must be one of the more recognisable tunes in the entire English-speaking canon of church music, from any faith, aided and abetted by its being used by the singer Cat Stevens for his chart-topping *Morning has broken* song in 1972. The air is courtesy of Alexander Fraser who heard the tune sung by an old Scottish highlander, indeed the name of the tune, *Bunessan*, is the name of a small village on the south of the Isle of Mull, on the west coast of Scotland (Darling & Davison, 2005:99). Second, this tune is used for five hymns in the fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal*, a unique achievement, and underlies its popularity. Finally, its writer Eleanor Farjeon has herself had a very colourful religious and spiritual background, dabbling in mysticism and the fringes of Christianity before becoming a committed Roman Catholic on her seventieth birthday (Darling & Davison, 2005:117).

Ding dong! Merrily on high, written by G.R. Woodward and first published in 1924, shows another interesting provenance and influence in the *Church Hymnal*. Anecdotal evidence would seem to suggest that most people think it is much older than its twentieth century origins but this is probably due to its incredible popularity and feeling of longevity, arguably accentuated by the style of its air, *Branle de l'Official* on which the main interest lies in respect of this study. The tune in question comes from a dance from the late 1500s, *Orchésographie* by “Thoin Arbeau” an anagram of the real composer, Jehan Tabourot. The actual dance is a *branle*, a duple time movement, popular in the 16th century (Darling & Davison, 2005:242).

The period following the war has considerably more hymns in its canon, this being the era of some of the more prolific contributors to the *Church Hymnal*, William Briggs, Brian Wren and the earlier hymns of Frederick Khan and Timothy Dudley-Smith. Of the 32 or so hymns in the *Church Hymnal* that come from this post-war period up until the start of “The Troubles”, almost all are modern in nature and although their settings are not in post-tonal harmony, they have several factors in common. First, most have a strong sense of unison in their melodic shape, with little or no four-part harmony options. Examples of this include No. 499, *When I needed a neighbour, were you there?* This simple, chant-like melody reinforces a simple message, with the repetition of the message, “were you there?” Written and first published in the early 1960s, the hymn is based on the simple message of Matthew 25:31-46 and is also representative of a growing number of hymns both written and composed by the same person, in this case Sydney Carter. It is one of his three contributions to the *Church Hymnal*, Fifth Edition.

Second, as touched upon in the last point, there is ample evidence of a lot of repetition of key lines. *Make me a channel of Your peace*, as well as the previous hymn, also typifies this trait. In this case, the constant repetition of the central idea, “make me a channel of your peace” is repeated at the start of each line. In addition lines two and three begin with the words “where there’s...”, with the last line “and where there’s ...”. Finally, the hymn is chorused with identical stanzas and together with the repetitive

phrase-like structure of the melody, the over-riding effect is one of repetition. The hymn is based on a prayer of St Francis of Assisi.

Another factor that all these post-war hymns share is their narrow melodic compass. *Lord Jesus Christ, You have come to us* is typical of one such hymn, only once stretching the melody to an octave above the tonic note of D, lying most of the time around a fifth. This hymn shows many other traits of twentieth century writing. Written by the Rev. Patrick Appleford, the piece was inspired by the song "Living Doll" by Cliff Richard. Appleford believed that if the public could get excited about a "living doll" then Christians could share that emotion with a "Living Lord". In typical twentieth century fashion, the harmonised version was published much later, the hymn originally being scored for piano and other "pop" instruments such as drums and guitars (Darling & Davison, 2005:581).

Other similar traits shared by these post-war hymns include a simplistic chordal structure, predictable cadential points, few opportunities for harmony singing, bespoke piano accompaniment rather than being written for organ, and the inclusion of guitar chords for alternative accompaniment.

4.4.4 The start of "The Troubles" – the present day

There are at least 135 hymns from this short 32 year period in the fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal*, representing 19% of the total hymns. Indeed, if one adds the few hymns included in the hymnal written after the Good Friday Agreement, approximately one fifth of the hymns have been written since 1966. This is especially interesting as findings in later chapters will reveal that clergy and organists say that approximately one third of hymns they use come from the eighteenth century. If that is representative across the entire Church then either the hymn book is out of step with its people, or the reverse. As one reads and studies the hymns and their settings, it becomes apparent that there is no single definable point that charts a change in style

or a movement away from the norm. That said, the hymns written in the late 1900s do have several stylistic features in common, their influences coming from the global community and the encroaching digital era. Begbie, in *Resounding Truth*, talks about the connection between music and theology and examines how different societies and cultures respond to music and what it is that creates the emotion (2000:85).

Although the Taizé community started in the previously documented era, in the early 1950s, it was in the late 1960s that its influence started to take effect more globally when Catholics were free to join the community, followed by its move into producing its own music from the 1970s onwards. Founded in Taizé, Saône-et-Loire, Burgundy in France, its music emphasises simple phrases, lines of Psalms, pieces of scripture and chants, all from different languages and from Protestant, Catholic and Orthodox religions. Its music tends to be in simple keys and its power lies in this simplicity, indeed all Taizé's songs are on its website including scores, sound files and the four voice parts of soprano, alto, tenor and bass (Routley, 1979:187).

There are eight Taizé hymns in the current *Church Hymnal*, *Bless the Lord my soul, and bless His holy name; Give thanks to the Lord for He is good; We adore You, Lord Jesus Christ; Praise the Lord, all ye nations; Ubi caritas et amor; Jesus, remember me; All you heavens, bless the Lord* and *Kyrie Eleison*. The first of these, *Bless the Lord my soul*, has the distinction of being the first hymn in the book; it is based on Psalm 103 and features a "sprung rhythm" in which the number of syllables varies from line to line but only three are stressed (Darling & Davison, 2005:39). Interestingly enough, the last Taizé hymn in the book, the *Kyrie Eleison*, is just two hymns away from being the last one in the *Church Hymnal*, though whether this is significant or not is not disclosed by the authors.

The Taizé movement occurred at the same time as the "hymn explosion", a movement coined by James Syndor or "New English Renaissance" by Erik Routley. Routley believed that the hymnal supplement phenomenon began in the early 1960s in Scotland with a series of ecumenical workshops whose purpose was "to explore new

music for the church" (Routley, 1979:189). As a result, musical supplements to hymn books began to proliferate and in 1969, for example, supplements to *The Methodist Hymnbook*, *Hymns Ancient and Modern* and *The Lutheran Hymnbook* were all published (Smith Creek, 2011). Resulting from this "explosion" came the following hymn writers, all liberally represented in *The Church Hymnal*: Fred Kaan, Fred Pratt Green, Brian Wren and Timothy Dudley-Smith, though there were of course many other lesser-known writers (Music, 2001:28).

Of Timothy Dudley-Smith's 19 hymns several remain popular in the Church of Ireland canon, including *Lord for the Years*, written in response to a request that he write a hymn that could be sung at the centenary of the Scripture Union in St Paul's Cathedral, London. Originally it was meant to be sung to the tune *Finlandia*, but a fellow member of the Church Pastoral Aid, of which Dudley-Smith was a member, Rev. Michael Baughen, wrote the tune *Lord for the Years*. It was first published in their own joint publication of *Youth Praise*, has been widely translated and was sung at the enthronement of the previous Archbishop of Canterbury, George Carey, in 1991 (Darling & Davison, 2005:144-5).

Another famous hymn of Timothy Dudley-Smith has proven to be immensely popular, being ranked first in the Church Times' list of favourite new hymns (Darling & Davison, 2005:915). The hymn's status is best summed up by the Chancellor of Durham University, who, when conferring the honorary degree of Doctor of Divinity said this of him and the hymn:

The translators had begun the Magnificat, the song of Mary in St Luke's Gospel, with 'Tell out, my soul, the greatness of the Lord'. To Dudley-Smith's ear this line fell into a rhythm that he instinctively felt: he saw it as the opening line of some verses that he continued, he says, almost 'just for fun'. The result was a hymn that rang round the world, and has continued to do so for almost fifty years. During that half-century, he has become, almost certainly, the best known hymn writer in the English-speaking world (Watson, 2009).

Of Fred Kaan's six hymns in the Church Hymnal, four are from this era of "The Troubles" in Northern Ireland, the remaining two *Now let us from this table rise* and *For the healing of the nations* being from the previous period of Partition to the

commencement of “The Troubles”. Written in 1968 and first published a year later, *God whose love is all around* is Kaan’s first hymn, chronologically, in the *Church Hymnal*. Dutchman Kaan has an interesting background. Born in the Netherlands, Kaan was educated at Utrecht and Bristol before becoming a Congregationalist, Plymouth Brethren and finally Provincial Moderator of the United Reformed Church (Darling & Davison, 2005:565). *God! As with silent hearts we bring to mind* is an especially interesting hymn from a Northern Ireland conflict perspective as it was commissioned for the ITV (Independent Television Network) broadcast on Remembrance Sunday on 1989 to replace the traditional *O Valiant Hearts*. Whilst the tune is sung to the same tune as the hymn it was replacing, *Supreme Sacrifice*, this was never Kaan’s intention and only occurred because at the last minute the organisers of Remembrance Sunday thought that losing both the familiar words and air at the one time was too much. That said, the tune *Holburn* by Eric Thiman is also in the *Church Hymnal* as the Church of Ireland Music Sub-committee felt that they did not want to be known as substituting a tune for *O Valiant Hearts* (Darling & Davison, 2005:668-9).

Fred Pratt Green has a total of 14 hymns in the *Church Hymnal* and like Kaan as well as Dudley-Smith and Wren, some of these come from both the previous era and from this. His and the other “hymn explosion” writers are examined here, though, as this is the period in which they all came to prominence. These works include: *For the fruits of His creation; Christ is the world’s light; He and none other; When Jesus came to Jordan; To mock Your reign, O dearest Lord, they made a crown of thorns; Rejoice in God’s saints, today and all days* and *O Christ, the Healer, we have come*.

The last of the four, Brian Wren, has six hymns in the *Church Hymnal* including *Christ upon the mountain peak*, which was written in response to a shortage of hymns dealing with the Lord’s Transfiguration. As such, it has enjoyed additional status by being in the Lectionary, as there are so few hymns that deal with this issue.

With only thirteen years since the Good Friday Agreement and only two hymns in the current edition of the *Church Hymnal* being from this period, an evaluation of this era

is somewhat limited. That said, this was the period when the fifth edition was actually published and an era when the music sub-committee of the Church of Ireland met to decide its hymnodistic direction. According to the *Companion to Church Hymnal*, this direction included retaining the best of the old, whilst drawing extensively on the vast range of new hymns to produce a hymnbook that could be used to complement the new patterns of worship including hymns that reflected the new spirit of ecumenism and co-operation (Darling & Davison, 2005:31). Also, some of the influences of the times then had to be taken into account, such as the question of gender-inclusiveness, language and hymns from a range of denominations (Darling & Davison, 2005:33-4).

In any case, the two hymns included that have been written since 1998 are the most recent of Michael Foster's eight hymns, *People of God, arise* and Stuart Townend's *How Deep the Father's love for us*.

It is fitting that Michael Foster's *People of God, arise* is the most recently-written hymn in the *Church Hymnal* as Foster is an Irish hymn writer and well known in Church of Ireland circles for his output. The hymn was a commission, written to be sung at the launch of the fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal* in St Patrick's Cathedral, Dublin, and aired on UK-wide television on the "Songs of Praise" programme. It is set to *Rangoon*, an old air written by a former organist of Armagh Cathedral, Charles Wood, later to become Professor of Music at Cambridge University and teacher of Vaughan Williams, Herbert Howells, Michael Tippett and Thomas Beecham, as well as Professor C.H. Kitson, who was, coincidentally, editor of the third edition of the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:649).

The second of the two hymns, *How Deep the Father's love for us*, is very typically twentieth century in that both the words and music were written by Townend. Brought up in an Anglican household where his father was a Church of England vicar, Stuart Townend, who is a Royal College of Music trained pianist, became committed to Christianity, where he leads evangelical worship. Currently he is best-known as the leader of the international Stoneleigh Bible Week, an event in the English midlands

that attracts over 20,000 visitors per annum (Darling & Davison, 2005:328-9). The hymn is used in Passiontide and Holy Week and focuses on the message of John 3:16, “For God so loved the world that he gave his only son, so that everyone who believes in him may not perish but have everlasting life”.

4.5 ORGAN AND CHOIR DEVELOPMENT

The role of the accompanying instrument to hymns, namely the church organ, is another issue that undoubtedly is part of a wider contextual background to the development of the hymn. Where it is difficult to find discernible and empirical evidence surrounding the qualifications and abilities of organists in churches outside the cathedral circuit, information on the instruments they played is a little more plentiful.

The history and development of this instrument is of no particular interest to this study but an understanding of the basic complexities and the difficulties purchasing, maintaining and using such an instrument must surely have coloured the decision-making regarding what hymns were sung. On a simple level, hymns perceived to be “difficult” may have been avoided by averagely competent musicians and “easier” ones chosen instead. Likewise, hymns which rely on a strong accompaniment element such as *St Patrick’s Breastplate* or *Christ is made the sure foundation* may well have been favourites for inclusion in large, well-staffed churches or cathedrals precisely for this reason.

With this in mind, several key points in the history of the organ are of interest. During the Reformation pipe organs that existed already were mostly destroyed. This happened more in England than Ireland, but it was the aftermath of this period that the arrival of continental organ builders, such as “Father” Bernard Smith, brought ideas and innovations that changed the placement of organs in the British and Irish Isles. In this period English-style organs with simpler reed structures and comprising of

one or two manual units were replaced with more elaborate European instruments with a greater number of manuals and more advanced voicings (Randel, 1986).

By contrast, Phillips argues that it appears that those that weren't destroyed showed little improvement from the time of the Restoration period through to the eighteenth century (1969:179). Providing contrast of tone and texture was the main characteristic from an early age, a point made in Purcell's compositions where in an anthem the right hand would play a trumpet opening whilst the left hand would play a figured bass accompaniment on the Choir manual, and it was not until the inauguration of the first mechanised coupler in 1762 in St Mary's, Redcliffe, Bristol, that organists could use effects provided by longer pipes doubling with 8-foot ones (Cagle, 2002).

It was just after the Act of Union that pedal boards in organs became a feature, having been introduced in Germany four hundred years before this (Phillips, 1969:179). For example, Benjamin Cooke's *Service in G* was allegedly written to show the new pedal board in Westminster Abbey (Matthews, 1985:50) but there are no records of pedal boards being specifically introduced in Irish cathedrals. The earliest ones were just one octave, but within fifty years in 1834, the newly-installed pedal board at Yorkminster had increased its compass to two octaves (Phillips, 1969:180).

Throughout the period leading up to Disestablishment, increasing demands in wind pressure due to extra coupling meant that organists were unable to maintain a light touch or play either loud or fast simultaneously. Developments such as the Barker pneumatic lever in 1832 and piston operations in 1851 improved organists' lots considerably, so by the time S.S. Wesley's death in 1876, organists could play whatever their desired artistic effect was (Phillips 1969:1980). By the end of the nineteenth century, the development of pneumatic, electric, and electro-pneumatic key actions made it technically feasible to locate the console independently of the pipes (Purll, 2007). This was certainly the case of the organ in St Anne's Cathedral in Belfast, built in 1907 (St Anne's Cathedral, Belfast, 2006) even though in the twentieth century, some organ builders tried to return to some of the features of the organs built in the 1600s

and 1700s. In those days the organs had mechanical action, making it difficult to play fast passages (Thistlethwaite, 1999:36).

In more modern times, electronically-managed actions meant a more sophisticated form of instrument, and the last thirty years or so has seen the introduction of the Allen digital organ, which is a pipeless organ. These organs have many advantages over traditional instruments, not least the ability to use MIDI files as backing tracks that can be incorporated as all or part of the parts needed for an accompaniment.

Conversations with organists, as per those in later chapters during the field research section of this study, seem to indicate that there is a combination of the old and the new, with traditional pipes being used for the main register of the organ with digital stops for the lowest pedal ranks, thus saving on fabrication costs for the necessary long piping, as well as the maintenance and, of course, space. One of the highest profile examples of this side-by-side effect can be found in Trinity Church in Copley Square, Boston, which has acoustic and digital 32-foot stops side-by-side, thus demonstrating the arguable psychoacoustical inadequacies of the digital 32-foot stop (Purll, 2007).

To measure how the type of instrument being played influences hymn choice and style is conjectural at best. On a *prima facie* basis, it seems more likely that factors such as clerical, congregational or organists' preferences may have greater influence in hymnody, though available accompanying instruments must surely have some say.

4.6 INFLUENCES FROM OTHER CHURCHES

Minor influences from other Western Christian faiths have also had their influence, as the provenance of many of the hymns indicates, if two of the eighteenth century's greatest composers are anything to go on. William Cowper, whose works have already been discussed in Chapter Two, was converted to Evangelicalism in 1763 (Academy of

American Poets, 1997) and Phillip Doddridge was a non-conformist (The Church Society, 2010).

As well as 31 German/Lutheran hymns and eight Greek/Syrian works, already discussed elsewhere in this study, the fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal* has two Danish hymns, *All who believe and are baptized* and *Through the night of doubt and sorrow*; three Italian, *Come down, O love divine*; *All creatures of our God and King* and *Glory be to Jesus*; one Polish and Zulu/Xhosa, *Infant Holy* and *Siyahamb' ekekanyen' kwenkos*. There are also two Welsh hymns, *Guide me, O thou great Jehovah* and *Here is love, vast as the ocean*, though there are many hymn writers whose works are in the *Church Hymnal* who have been born, lived or worked in Wales or indeed who have strong Welsh ancestry.

There are, understandably, many Irish hymns in the *Church Hymnal*, but for the purposes of this study, such works have been included in the organic discussions of this research as they are intrinsically part of it. Latin hymns are discounted from this field of influence on account of the fact that they are obviously not tied to a national identity and consequently their influence is absorbed into the general periodic divisions.

Finally, there is one Hebrew hymn, *The God of Abraham praise* and one Irish/Latin hymn, *O my God, in my help draw near*.

4.6.1 The Roman Catholic Church

The question of pre-Reformation hymnody has already been discussed in section 2.4 of this study and in any case there are no representations of Catholic hymn writers in the chosen eighteenth century canon, with most hymns from this faith coming from the Oxford Movement's followers in the nineteenth century.

By the time the nineteenth century doctrines and theologies started to develop, including those of the Tractarian Movement, the influence of Roman Catholic hymns in the Church of Ireland hymnody started to take effect. The Tractarian Movement and its wider influences have already been discussed more thoroughly in section 2.7 of this research but some of the hymns written at this time, even outside the canon of eighteenth century hymns, are worth further examination.

My God, how wonderful thou art by Yorkshire-born Tractarian Frederick William Faber was first published in 1849 in *Catholic Hymns for Singing and Reading*. It had nine stanzas but nowadays it is usually printed with six or seven. It is usually sung to the tune *Westminster*, which was composed by James Turle, a well-known composer of Anglican chants. Rather interestingly, pre-1900 hymnals list the tune as *Birmingham*, but it is the same melody, having undergone a name change to reflect Turle's position and accomplishments as organist of Westminster Abbey in the late 1800s (Darling & Davison, 2005:47).

There's a wideness in God's mercy was the product of Faber's commitment to write hymns for the Roman Catholic service and was first published in *The Oratory Hymns* of 1854. Despite the more obvious metaphor of the limitless nature of God's humanity, Darling and Davison also argue that there is an oblique reference to Faber's Puritan upbringing in stanza five (2005:49). The hymn is set to two tunes, *Cross of Jesus* by Sir John Stainer and the more recent *Amplitudo*, written for this publication by the editor of the fifth edition, Donald Davison. The more familiar Stainer tune was ironically first brought to prominence through its publication in the 1903 *Methodist Hymnbook* (Darling & Davison, 2005:49).

The third and final hymn of Faber's, *Hark, hark my soul, angelic songs are swelling*, was again published in *The Oratory Hymns* and under its original title of *The Pilgrims of the night* improved its popularity following its publication in *Hymns Ancient and Modern*. Against this is the view that it was sometimes considered to portray too much overt Victorian sentimentality and therefore was not included in the more fashionable

hymnals of the day. In Church of Ireland worship, though, it has remained in constant publication since the second edition of the *Church Hymnal* and is sung to a bespoke tune *Pilgrims*, written by the contemporary London organist of St Pancras, Henry Smart (Darling & Davison, 2005:626). Faber's final contribution to the Hymnal is a translation of the St Francis of Assisi hymn, *All creatures of our God and King*.

Cardinal Newman, then John Henry Newman, contributes three hymns to the Hymnal, *Praise to the Holiest in the height*, *Firmly I believe* and *Lead, kindly light*. The first of these, *Praise to the Holiest in the height*, has been immortalised for two reasons. First, by Elgar's use of the symbolic old man in the hymn, Gerontius in his oratorio of the same name, *The Dream of Gerontius*, and by British Prime Minister Gladstone's comfort gained through the hymn on his deathbed. The hymn, based on 1 Corinthians 15:20-47, has in its fourth stanza a possible veiled reference to transubstantiation in that the words read "a second Adam", suggesting a greater gift than Grace. Indeed this stanza is sometimes omitted in Presbyterian hymnals, especially early ones. The hymn enjoys four possible tunes; *Gerontius* by J.B. Dykes; *Chorus Angelorum* by Somervell, written especially for use at the Roman Catholic cathedral in Arundel, West Sussex; *Billings* by Sir Richard Terry and *Richmond* by Cornish doctor turned cleric, Thomas Haweis (Darling & Davison, 2005:180). *Firmly I believe* is the earlier of the two extracts from Newman's poem about Gerontius and was written long before he became a Roman Catholic priest. In this respect, the hymn has caused some problems in that it raises questions about Newman implying his belief in the infallible Church (Darling & Davison, 2005:446). Nonetheless, the hymn is popular at confirmations and ordinations and is sung to both *Shipston* and *Halton Holgate*; the first one was written by Vaughan Williams from a traditional English melody collected by Lucy Broadwood and the second is based on a William Boyce air written by S.S. Wesley.

By far the most prolific of the main Anglo-Catholics of this era was Edward Caswall, whose ten hymns included *Jesus, the very thought of Thee*; *O Jesus, King most wonderful*; *See, amid the winter's snow*; *Earth has many a noble city* and *When morning gilds the skies*. Like Newman and Faber, Caswall started off as an Anglican but

became a Catholic in 1847 (Catholic Encyclopaedia, 2009). *Jesus, the very thought of Thee* has a complex and interesting provenance. The carol *See, amid the winter's snow*, first published in 1851, is not published in the three main hymnals used in the Church of England, *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, *The English Hymnal* and *Songs of Praise*, though it has appeared continuously in the *Church Hymnal* since the 1919 third edition. It is the problematic last verse that the *Church Hymnal* has simply omitted:

Virgin Mother, Mary blest,
By the joys that fill thy breast,
Pray for us that we may prove,
Worthy of the Saviour's love (Darling & Davison, 2005:273).

The hymn usually sung to the tune *Humility*, which was written by Anglican organist Sir John Goss, a pupil of Thomas Atwood, who in turn had been a pupil of Mozart (Darling & Davison, 2005:274).

1962 saw the meeting of the Second Vatican Council, led by Pope John XXIII, during which was issued the Decree on Ecumenism, which in the eyes of some scholars, such as Samuel McCrea Cavert and W.G. Wilson (Wilson, 1954:4), does not go far enough in reconciling its ecumenical outlook with its assumption that the Roman Catholic Church is the one true church. This, together with the Decree on Religious Freedom, arguably weakens the past idea of the Church being infallible. The former Decree states:

The Council further declares that the right to religious freedom has its foundation in the very dignity of the human person, as this dignity is known through the revealed Word of God and by reason itself. This right of the human person to religious freedom is to be recognized in the constitutional law whereby society is governed; thus it is to become a civil right (The Holy See, 2011).

If this is the case, then there is an argument that such softening of a position, if any, may slightly contribute towards a more open attitude in hymn selection. An example of this may be in a mixed marriage, where Roman Catholic partners, when getting betrothed to a Church of Ireland communicant, may feel more comfortable using a

hymn in the service from his or her community, safe in the knowledge that there is a new post-Vatican II spirit of openness. Another example may occur in the case where clergy from both sides of the religious divide in Ireland may meet with each other for a shared purpose, thus transferring ideas. Whilst these Decrees mitigate a possible opening in the infallibility of the Roman Catholic Church, it is important to note that they do not speak for wholesale changes, nor indeed were they universally popular or adhered to (Wilson, 1954:10).

4.6.2 Other Protestant faiths: The Presbyterian Church

The roots of Presbyterianism in Ireland stem from when the Scottish planters brought over their faith, post-Reformation. In the *Church Hymnal* their influence is small and in the era in question in this research, eighteenth century hymnody, three of the hymns from the canon representing this period were Presbyterian in origin. This was a century when Church membership was weakened because of emigration to colonial America and oversubscription to the Westminster formularies, a system which encouraged Scottish Covenanters to form congregations in Ulster.

The three hymns in question are Dr John Morison's *The people that in darkness walked* and *Come, let us to the Lord our God* as well as *Where high the heavenly temple stands* by Michael Bruce.

Originally written as a Scottish Paraphrase by Church of Scotland minister, Dr Morison, *The people that in darkness walked* has remained in the last four editions of the *Church Hymnal* though with the word "walked" in the title having replaced the word "sat", as is common with most hymnals. It is normally sung to the tune *Dundee* and is in typical metrical style of that genre (Darling & Davison, 2005:300). *Come, let us to the Lord our God* is another paraphrase, based on Hosea 6: 1-4 and sung to the tune *Kilmarnock* by Neil Dougall, a ship's apprentice turned musician when he lost his eyesight and right arm during the firing of a salute on board a ship (Darling & Davison, 2005:308). The

final of the three Presbyterian-influenced hymns in this period, Michael Bruce's *Where high the heavenly temple stands* has an interesting provenance in that the original script of the hymn is a paraphrase of Hebrews 4: 14-16. It first appeared in the second edition of the *Church Hymnal* and, barring a few minor changes to the sixth and final stanza, it has remained in all subsequent editions where it is sung to *Melcombe* by Samuel Webbe the Elder.

In the nineteenth century, the subsequent restoration of subscription in 1835 led to union with the breakaway Covenanters to form the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Ireland, leading to greater numbers starting to call themselves "Presbyterians" (McHugh, 2011). Following sustained growth, the start of the next century saw the year of the Edinburgh Missionary Conference, an event generally perceived to be the start of the Ecumenical Movement. There were moves afoot several years before this time in Ireland when the seeds of inter-church movements were sown but it took the Conference in 1910 to formalise ideas (Barkley, 1970:66). In these early days, common ground for future developments were left untouched but importantly, friendships were being formed and trust was grown, leading to the situation in 1912 where the General Assembly progressed the idea of taking advantage "of their friendly interviews with the representatives of the former Established Church to arrange, if possible, for the mutual recognition of: 1) the status of communicants passing over on marriage to the other Church; 2) of discipline; and 3) of the ecclesiastical status of members of either Church, especially on a change of ministry" (Lisburn, 2010). Despite this olive branch, the Church of Ireland did not move on all issues and it was not until 1923 that the landmark talks on church unity took place under the auspices of the United Council of Christian Churches and Religious Communion in Ireland, an organisation that is now called the Irish Council of Churches. Unfortunately, because of the Easter Rising and Partition, as well as the pending World Conference on Faith and Order, any prospective outcomes petered out (Barkley, 1970:71).

In 1931 the General Synod made another attempt to move along some form of shared commonality but such was the malaise beforehand that any attempts for it to have influenced the choice of hymns in the 1935 Appendix of the *Church Hymnal* would not have been fruitful. In the minutes concerning the publication of the Appendix there are no records of ecumenism being considered. Indeed, throughout the 1930s various attempts from both the General Assembly and the General Synod to open dialogue seems to have failed (Minutes of the General Assembly).

The years surrounding World War II marked a period which saw the births of the British Council of Churches in 1942 and The World Council of Churches in 1948 but official talks between the Presbyterians and the Church of Ireland re-opened in 1964 where dialogue has remained since.

Again, as in the case of the 1935 Appendix, there is no evidence that the Fourth or Fifth Editions of the *Church Hymnal* are influenced by such interaction between the churches, though some hymns by both Presbyterian clergy and Church of Scotland ministers are included and are part of everyday worship, as one would expect from a hymnal that has a wide Christian outlook.

4.6.3 Other Protestant faiths: The Methodist, Baptist and other Churches' influences

Although the first Methodists established themselves in Ireland in 1727, the Disestablishment of the Church of Ireland is also the starting date of the Methodist Church in Ireland as it is known today. Prior to that it was two separate bodies, the Primitive Wesleyan Methodists and the Irish Methodists. The first group, the "Primitives", as they were sometimes known, were a society within the Established Church and enjoyed all the normal sacraments as well as the marriage and funeral arrangements conducted by Anglican clergy. They numbered just over 8,000 compared to the 20,000 Irish Methodists, the main body of Methodism from which the "Primitives" split in 1816 (Weber, 2011a).

Since then the faiths developed as two separate entities, and despite friendly relations and sometimes exchanges of liberal viewpoints on a parish level, there was no immediate official recognition of the validity of Methodist ordination and no exchange of pulpits (Jeffrey, in Hurley, 1970:84). From the 1930s onwards there were many initiatives from both sides to further unity and partial unity and whilst this has not been completely successful, good relationships have been fostered and maintained, both on a parishioner and pulpit level to the present day.

It is with great interest that this research views the relationship between the Methodist “Connexion” (Jeffrey, in Hurley, 1970:79) and the Church of Ireland as due to the single influence of one person, John Wesley, one of the most prolific contributors to all church hymnals and, of course, the founder of Methodism (Weber, 2011a). Wesley’s hymns are extensively discussed in Section 2.5.2 of this study.

With the Baptist roots firmly in the “17th century (and) largely in reaction against the state churches in England and the Netherlands” it is no surprise that its hymnodistic influences stretch into all editions of the *Church Hymnals* (Patheos, 2010). The individual history of the Baptist Church is not necessarily relevant to this study and an understanding of how it faced persecution from other faiths in the history of the Established Church in England is no different from other non-mainstream churches. Three Confessions of Faith in 1644, 1677 and 1689 led to increasing acceptance and a greater resilience amongst Baptists, leading to expansionist ideologies and world growth (Weber, 2011b).

Baptist hymns are well represented across all sections and periodisations of the *Church Hymnal* and several of their hymns have already been discussed in section 2.6 of this study.

4.6.4 The Eastern Orthodoxies: The emergence of the Eastern Church in Ireland and its influences

The influence from the eastern Christian church into western Christian hymnody is, in itself, a major area of research and, as such, may be difficult to reduce to its essential elements for the purposes of this study. Quite simply, it is so fragmented and disparate and has so many possible sub-sets of possible influence that only *prima facie* reasons are included and those that are directly relevant to the aims and objectives of this chapter.

The main Eastern sect in Ireland, the Greek Orthodox, had its first bespoke temple in either Britain or Ireland in London in 1877 and since then, it has developed and expanded throughout both islands. Furthermore, other Eastern Churches have also grown in the English speaking world and on a simple level, these Orthodoxies fall into three sub-groups, all of which are represented in Ireland.

These three sub-groups are the Orthodox Churches of the four ancient Patriarchies of Constantinople, Alexandria, Antioch and Jerusalem. The second group are the Uniate Churches, who owe their existence to Catholic missionary work, and the final group are the heretical movements such as the Nestorian Church, the Armenian Church and the Coptic Church (Wilson-Dickson. 1992:160).

The remainder of this section of the chapter will examine these churches in respect of their influences and presence in Ireland. Together with research completed with clergy in the next chapter, and what records exist, will identify the small body of hymns that stem from these cultures and are currently sung by Anglicans, and will draw some conclusions regarding the influence of eastern Christian churches in Church of Ireland hymnody.

4.6.4.1 The Greek Orthodox Church

By far the largest body is the Greek Orthodox Church, but the Russian, Syriac, Antiochian and Romanian churches all have a presence on the island of Ireland. With only a small presence of worshippers in Ireland, Northern and Southern, the archbishopric of Thyatira and Great Britain, which includes the island's only two churches, the influences both historically and currently are limited. Nonetheless, it has a relationship with the Anglican Church. There are a number of Greek Orthodox hymns in previous as well as the current *Church Hymnal*, and these influences and relationships need examination.

Whilst Greek people have been coming to the UK and Ireland since early times, the first in modern times arrived in 1670 to escape persecution from the Ottoman Empire (BBC, 2011c). The numbers grew steadily since then and nowadays, aided by a swell in numbers coming in the 1950s and 1960s for economic reasons, the number of Greeks (including Greek Cypriots) in the UK stands at around 400,000 (Duff, 2008), some 6.7% of the current UK population of 61.8 million (US Census Bureau, 2011).

The first bespoke Greek Orthodox Church in the UK and Ireland, St Sophia's Church of the Divine Wisdom, was built in Bayswater, London in 1877 (Greek Orthodox Church, 1998) and that is the reason why this study places this examination in this section of the study. Although the religion can be traced back to the beginnings of the New Testament and indeed the Church's official language is biblical Greek (Anon., 2011b), the building of such a landmark church seems as convenient a point as any of examining the influence of the Greek Orthodox Church in Church of Ireland hymnody.

Some nine hymns of Greek origin grace the current *Church Hymnal*. The first of these, *Come ye faithful, raise the strain* or *Αἰσωμεν, πάντεζ λαοί* is by St John of Damascus and translated by John M. Neale (Darling & Davison, 2000:375). It is the first ode for the canon after Easter and dates back to the middle of the 8th century, charting the *Song of Moses* in Exodus 15 (Hymnary, 2007a). All Greek hymns, or odes, are part of a

larger canon and all speak of Old Testament prophecies that come true, in this case metaphorically, but the translations obviously have to take account of differences in language, the original metrical form and semantics. Because of this, Neale's translation uses only the first half of the ode and in the current *Church Hymnal* stanza four is omitted, which, according to Darling and Davison, is a shame as it is the one which most accurately resembles the St John Damascene's original (Darling & Davison, 2000:376). Of the two tunes used for this, *St John Damascene* was actually written specifically for this hymn by the nineteenth century composer and Oxford Movement supporter, Arthur Henry Brown (1830 – 1926) (Hymnary, 2007d).

The second and final hymn in the *Hymnal* written by St John Damascene is *The Day of Resurrection* or *Αναστάσεως ἡμέρα*, sung to the popular tune *Ellacombe*, a re-worked traditional German melody from the *Württemberg Gesangbuch* of 1784. Again, it is a translation by Neale from the first Ode from the Canon for Easter Day, or the Golden Canon and metaphorically interprets Moses' crossing of the Red Sea in Exodus 15:1-19 (Darling & Davison, 2000:401).

In the Greek Church the Golden Canon is sung during the ante-communion at midnight as Easter morning begins. During the ceremony candles are lighted by the congregation, cannons are fired, trumpets are sounded and the officiating priests and people raise a 'spontaneous shout of indescribable joy and triumph' that 'Christ is risen' (Darling & Davison, 2000:401).

Father, we thank Thee who has planted is one of two hymns from the *Didache*, or the teaching of the apostles, a document which has its origins in the Church of Antioch, Syria, from as early as AD 110 (Ramsey, 1896:112). The hymn is a translation of passages from Chapters 9 and 10 of the *Didache* (Hymnary, 2007e). The scriptural references cover quite a few Books, namely John 6:58, 2 Cor. 4:6, Eph. 5:25-27; 6:6-7, 2 Tim. 1:10 and 1 John 5:20 and it is a hymn of thanksgiving and praise.

A great and mighty wonder or *Μέγα καί παράδοξον Θαῦμα* is driven by the theological revelation expressed in John 1:14 and was originally written by St Germanus of Constantinople in the eighth century and translated, again, by Neale. St Germanus, the son of a leading senator, was emasculated and sent to a monastery where he

eventually rose to become Patriarch of Constantinople. Amongst his writings are many hymns, mostly in praise of saints and feast days, and arguably his most famous opus, the *Meditation on Church Matters or Commentary on the Liturgy* (Orthodox Church in America, 1996). In *Church Hymnal 5* the editors remind readers that Neale's translation has been "altered considerably down through the years" (Darling & Davison, 2000:230-1) though it remains a popular Christmas carol, sung to either the traditional German *Es ist ein' Ros' entsprungen* or *Ave Maria Klare*. *Es ist ein' Ros' entsprungen* first appeared in the *Alte Catholische Geistliche Kirchengesänge* in Köln in 1599 and was subsequently arranged by Michael Praetorius in 1609 in *Musæ Sioniae*. *Ave Maria Klare* also has a contemporary Germanic background, having first appeared in Johann Leisentritt's *Catholicum Hymnologium Germanicum*, again in Köln, but twelve years earlier in 1587. Since then it has systematically been rearranged to accommodate congregations and choirs alike, its free rhythm perceived through the years as being difficult to interpret (Darling & Davison, 2005:231).

The very interesting *Lord Jesus, think on me* or *Μνῶεο Χριτέ*, dates from the early 400s and was written by Synesius who hailed from the district of Cyrene which is now part of Libya. As a philosopher, Synesius subscribed to Neoplatonism, an ideology that had a threefold belief in the eminence of the One from which all knowledge came, intelligence as the realm from which intuitive knowledge was derived and the soul as being the vehicle for discursive thought and action (Livius, 2011). Following his appointment as Bishop of Ptolemais in 409, his writings took on a greater Christian significance, especially his famous *Ten Odes*, of which *Lord Jesus, think on me*, was the final and summative one (Hymnary, 2007f). The hymn was translated by the nineteenth century Allen William Chatfield (1806 – 96), who indeed translated all ten Odes and published them in *Songs and Hymns of the Earliest Greek Christian Poets* in 1876 (Darling & Davison, 2000:731). Two tunes are sung to this by Church of Ireland worshippers, *Southwell* and *St Bride*. The former has a somewhat apocryphal origin, being either written or composed by William Damon, but in any case was published by his friend John Bull in 1579 (Darling & Davison, 2005:732). The second tune, *St Bride*, dates from 1762 and was written by Chapel Royal tenor Samuel Howard, who was also

organist at St Bride's Church, Fleet Street, London, from which the tune took its name (Darling & Davison, 2005:733).

Chronologically the next hymn of Greek origin, *Hail, gladdening Light, of his pure glory poured*, is not actually Greek in origin, having being written by the Tractarian John Keble. As such, its inclusion in this section, which examines Greek hymns used in the Church of Ireland, would be misleading and as such, is omitted. Likewise, so are *Light of the world, in grace and beauty* and *O gladsome light, O grace*, for similar reasons of provenance.

The final Greek hymn in the fifth edition is *Let all mortal flesh keep silence* or *Σιγησάτω παρὰ σὰρξ βροτεία* and is one of the earliest liturgies of the Christian Church that is still used today; it has an equally intriguing provenance, having close links with Orthodoxy from around the 4th century (Darling & Davison, 2000:578). The original text is traditionally believed to have come from James, the brother of Jesus and is recited on 23rd October, the commemorative day of the death of St James in Eastern Orthodox religions. St James the Less, the First Bishop of Jerusalem, as he is known, was a Syrian and is mentioned in the Bible only three times, first in connection with his mother Mary in Mark 15:40 and also in Mark 16:1 and Matthew 27:56. The actual hymn expresses awe and wonderment at the coming of Christ. The first verse deals with the mystery of our perception of Christ in the body and blood; in the following two verses there are vivid images from Isaiah 6 and Revelation 5, where the glory of Christ is portrayed and his victory over sin is dealt with (Hymnary, 2007f).

Understandably, with a piece so old, there are many translations, the first notable one being completed, in prose form, by Thomas Rattray, the Scottish Bishop of Dunkeld and first published in 1724 in *The Ancient Liturgy of the Church at Jerusalem* (Darling & Davison, 2000:578). The current metrical version has a more stable history, with the one published in 1864 by Gerard Moultrie being still used today, although it is based on the Rattray translation rather than the original Greek. Moultrie had a high-profile academic and clerical life, being educated at Rugby School and Oxford University

before being a vicar where amongst other offices, he held the posts of Chaplain to the Dowager Marchioness of Londonderry and Warden of St James' College (Center for Church Music, 2009). The tune to which it is sung, *Picardy*, is an old French carol from the 1600s, often sung as a folk song before being published in 1860 and then arranged by Vaughan Williams, whose arrangement is universally known, though in *Church Hymnal 5* it is newly arranged by the editor, Davison (Darling & Davison: 579).

Greek hymns, then, seem to fall into two categories, those of Greek origin, such as the previous one, that are in some cases still used by the Greek Orthodox Church, and some, such as *Hail Gladdening Light* which were written in Greek by English speaking poets and hymn writers. Realistically, the Greek Orthodox Church's influence from a hymnody point of view is limited but both they and Anglicans do share hymns and thus have a link in this dimension, however tenuous.

4.6.4.2 The Russian Orthodox Church and The Syriac Orthodox Church

Following the Russian Revolution in 1917, a number of Russian refugees arrived in the British and Irish isles. Their Divine Liturgy was held in various parts of Dublin by visiting clerics from England. By the 1960s, following the economic collapse post-World War II, Nicholas Couris became the first ordained Russian Orthodox priest, not only in Ireland but outside Russia itself (Russian Orthodox Church, 2011).

In Ireland now, the Russian Orthodox parish of Sts Peter and Paul is housed in a disused Church of Ireland church in Harold's Cross, Dublin, and is comprised of many eastern European émigrés from the former USSR states, Poland, Slovakia, Romania, Serbia and Greece. Also, there are some native Irish converts. By 2010 the faith had grown in numbers to such a level that two more churches have opened, one in Stradbally, Co Laois, and one in Drogheda, north of Dublin (Russian Orthodox Church, 2011). There are no hymns past or present in the Church Hymnals that are of Russian Orthodox religion and from a hymnodist point of view, influence is minimal if any.

The Syriac Orthodox Church community is growing in Ireland with St Mary's Syrian Orthodox Church in Waterford being one of the main Syrian Orthodox Churches in Ireland. The Syriacs claim a privileged place in Christianity, certainly if their grandiose statement from their website is anything to go by.

According to ecclesiastical tradition, the Church of Antioch is the second established church in Christendom after Jerusalem, and the prominence of its Apostolic See is well documented. In his Chronicon (I, 2), the church historian Eusebius of Caesarea tells us that Apostle St. Peter established a bishopric in Antioch and became its first bishop. He also tells us that St. Peter was succeeded by Evodius. In another historical work, Historia Ecclesiastica, Eusebius tells us that Ignatius the Illuminator, "a name of note to most men, [was] the second after Peter to the bishopric of Antioch" (St Mary's Syrian Orthodox Church, 2009).

There is one hymn in the *Church Hymnal* which is of Syriac origin. *Strengthen for service, Lord, the hands* was first introduced to the Church of Ireland hymnals in the fourth edition in 1960. The original script is believed to have been written by St Ephræm of Syrus (c.306 – 373), the scholar who wrote extensively on the Book of Genesis as well as composing many hymns. The hymn is post-communion and based on the Liturgy of Malabar and the Nestorian rite, urging believers to pray for God to strengthen every aspect of life, hands, ears, tongues, eyes, feet and bodies (Darling & Davison. 2000:600). The usage of the Liturgy of the Malabar was one of the reasons behind the excommunication of Nestorius, Patriarch of Constantinople and thus the coining of the term "Nestorian rite", which is the basis for this hymn (Darling & Davison, 2005:601).

The hymn was translated by Neale and was included in the *English Hymnal* of 1906 and re-pointed to accommodate the melody *Ach Gott und Herr*, a piece with a complicated provenance, starting as a minor mode melody in *As Hymnodus sacer*, published by Christian Gall in Leipzig in 1625 and ending up being harmonised and re-worked by many including the version that is sung today, that by J.S. Bach (Darling & Davison, 2005:602). The other tune used is *Jacob's Well*, composed by the contemporary musician Barry Rose OBE (1934 -), former organist of St Paul's Cathedral and Guildford Cathedral.

4.6.4.3 Other Orthodox churches

The arrival and growth of the other Orthodox churches in Ireland happened in the mid to late twentieth century but their inclusion in this chapter is simply to chart the remaining Orthodoxy in Ireland and its consequent influences, all together.

i. The Romanian Orthodox Church: The Romanian Church in Ireland started to exist in October 2000 and several months later in January 2001 Sunday worship took place in Belvedere College chapel in the centre of Dublin. The Romanian community now has 1500 Orthodox worshippers throughout Ireland and has grown steadily with the immigrants arriving during the economic boom of the early part of the 21st Century (Irish Council of Churches, 2011). Again, there are no Romanian Orthodox hymns in the current *Church Hymnal* though through the already referred to links, there are connections between Anglicanism and Orthodoxy in the general sense.

ii. The Uniate Churches: Very few of the eastern Christian churches have more than a local presence in the island of Ireland and even the two main Uniate faiths have just a handful of followers. The Ukrainian Greek Catholic Church uses St Kevin's Oratory in the Roman Catholic Pro-Cathedral in Dublin as a base for its services (Byzantine Catholic Church, 1996).

iii. The Coptic Church: With just one parish, which is in Dublin, the Coptic Church caters for mainly Egyptian families though there are some Irish native members of the congregation as well (Irish Council of Churches, 2011). The smaller Armenian Church, as of June 2011, is starting to hold regular services in Taney Parish Centre, Dublin. Indications from their press release and UK based website imply their faith's membership is at a family and community level (Armenian Church in Great Britain, 2011).

iv. The Antioch Orthodox Church: With its home in Ireland in Belfast and parishes in Dublin and Cork, the largely Romanian speaking Antiochian Church has had no significant input into the influences of hymnody in the Church of Ireland because of its numerically small size. It is undoubtedly an old church, its website claiming that, “The ancient Church of Antioch was founded by Saint Peter the Apostle in A.D. 34. It is one of the five great churches of early Christianity, along with Jerusalem, Rome, Constantinople, and Alexandria. It was at Antioch that followers of Jesus were first called Christians” (Acts 11:26) (Anon., 2011c).

4.7 OTHER INFLUENCING FACTORS

4.7.1 Urbanism and Ruralism

The issue of urbanism and ruralism in the Church of Ireland is a small but interesting factor of worship on a practical level and consequently, may or may not affect hymn choice.

In 1891, 35% of the urban population in Ireland and 70% of the entire population were Protestant. In Dublin itself there was also the issue of social class to consider. The working-class, representing a sizeable 44% of all Protestant males in Ireland, was noted for its uncompromising Protestantism and its ability to use religion as a badge of political allegiance (Maguire 1995:196). In this respect, it is possible to argue that such a community would be more at home singing traditional hymns popular in the Church of England canon, especially given Maguire’s point in *As by law established* that religious worship was practiced in a “rather indifferent manner” and that the clergy usually followed the wishes of its flock (Maguire, 1995:195).

These factors were pre-empted with the formation of the DPOA, the “Dublin Protestant Operatives Society” in 1841 by an evangelical Anglican, Rev. Tresham Gregg, with the aim of reversing “the decline of the Protestant cause, reverse the

concessions to Popery and to defend the Union between Ireland and Britain” (Dorney, 2011). It ultimately proved to be a short-lived organisation, eventually ending up merging with the Orange Order in 1848, but nonetheless, its existence shows the strength of feeling of working-class urban Anglicans towards their Protestant roots. The example of the DPOA is not alone, though. During this era, a plethora of organisations formed to reach out to the disaffected urban Anglicans on not only a parochial level, but a diocesan and national one as well, dispelling the public image that the “parish structure of the Church of Ireland was based on a notional timeless community living in a stable, hierarchical and rural society” (Maguire 1995:196).

Sadly, again on account of the RCB fire (Citizens Information, 2011) and the resultant destruction of parish records, especially in the Dublin area, such reflections are merely that, as there is no definitive way to prove otherwise.

4.7.2 Clergy, Church growth and “high” Church influences

As the period following the Disestablishment began to take hold, a number of internal church issues arose which may or may not affect hymnody. These range from type and quantity of clergy, growth of certain parishes, architectural changes and the intellectual focus of the divinity school.

The first of these issues, the appointments, type and longevity of Church clergy, may be a small but nonetheless significant area of influence in the choice and development of hymnody in Irish Anglican history. Although there is no tangible, empirical evidence to suggest that there is a link between older bishops being less open-minded about newer hymns and ideas, such was the alleged conservatism of the Irish clerical structure (McDowell, 1975: 71) that it is difficult to imagine innovative hymnody being developed and expounded.

At the time of Disestablishment there were two archbishops and ten bishops, rising to eleven bishops in 1886 when the diocese of Clogher was separated from Armagh.

During this period, ten of the bench had been ordained before Disestablishment with Bishop Alexander not retiring until 1911 (History Home, 2011). Of the new bishops appointed post-Disestablishment, McDowell in *The Church of Ireland 1869 – 1969* points out that they were of a very intellectual persuasion, again, tending towards conservatism (1975:72). Such bishops included Henley Henson (Meath), George Chadwick (Derry and Raphoe), William Reeves and then Charles d’Arcy (Down and Connor) and Thomas Berry (Killaloe).

Outspoken Henley Henson ultimately was to move on to become Bishop of Hereford and then to the highly prestigious See of Durham (Henson, 1944:259). George Alexander Chadwick was an eminent author as well as cleric, his output including *Christ bearing Witness to Himself* in 1879; *As He that Serveth*, 1880; *My Devotional Life*, 1882; *Exodus and St Mark*, 1899; *Poems, Chiefly Sacred*, 1900 and in 1905, *The Intellect and the Heart* (British Library, 2010).

Cork-born William Reeves was an antiquarian and the Bishop of Down, Connor and Dromore from 1886 until his death. He was the last private keeper of the Book of Armagh and held the office of The President of the Royal Irish Academy (Thompson, 1996). Charles d’Arcy was Bishop of Clogher, which after the diocesan boundary realignment in 1907 became the Diocese of Ossory, Ferns and Leighlin. He then became Bishop of Down, Connor and Dromore, briefly Archbishop of Dublin, and finally the Primate of the Church of Ireland and Archbishop of Armagh. Clearly he was an eminent academic, holding not only his earned PhD from Trinity College, Dublin University, but also honorary doctorates in divinity from the Universities of Oxford, Queen’s and Glasgow and an honorary DLitt from his *alma mater*, Trinity College, Dublin (St Anne’s Cathedral, Belfast, 2009). Finally, Thomas Berry was a man of considerable distinction, being a scholar of Trinity College, Dublin University. He served in two large city parishes in Dublin before becoming the 9th Bishop of Killaloe, Kilfenora, Clonfert and Kilmacduagh in 1913 (Anon., 1996: 101).

During the same period, on a more parochial level, the number of clergy started to fall. By 1880 there were 350 clergy and by 1914 and 1925 this fell to 290 to 200 respectively with *pro rata* regional variations where Church membership was weak or strong (McDowell, 1975:76). One factor that is worth noting was the rise in population and prosperity in Belfast, a fact that contributed to relatively sudden problems for the Church of Ireland. In 1881 Anglicans accounted for one quarter of the city's population, rising to one third by 1911, a fact that contributed to a demand for new churches for Belfast's 120,000 Episcopalians (McDowell, 1975:76). How this contributed towards any change in approaches to hymnody is debatable and would necessitate a "before and after" analysis of the eleven new parishes created during this period, an exercise which is beyond the scope of this study. Nonetheless, McDowell argues in *The Church of Ireland 1869 – 1969* that because the new churches being built were largely of a Victorian neo-Gothic style, such "architectural change was bound to have some influence on the conduct of public worship". He continues to argue that a "gothicised church imperceptibly calls for heightened ceremonial (sic) ... But during the next few decades ... Irish churches had a distinctly high church bias" (81).

4.7.2.1 High church influences

Within the Church of Ireland there has always been a degree of fear of ritualism, with those in the "low" church always afraid that it could be an issue that could grow and fester in the church and apocryphal stories of a guild of high churchmen being formed abound as well as tales of how fashionable Ritualism was becoming, all heightening the tension of rank and file Anglicans (McDowell, 1975:87). McDowell in *The Church of Ireland, 1869 – 1969* also talks of seeds of discord regarding worship in two Dublin churches and points to quite heated debate in the general synod as well as police intervention in a brawl in St John's in Sandymount (McDowell, 1975:88). Most significantly, from a hymnodistic point of view, uprisings in Belfast churches against Ritualism creeping in and the then Unionist government's alleged dismissive attitude towards it, resulted in some churches objecting to the use of *Hymns Ancient and Modern*. It is not clear whether congregations may have ended up singing hymns

which were in that book but from a different hymnal, or if they refused to sing any hymns associated with *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, but in any case, it goes to show the depth of feeling at the time, which in turn, impacts on hymns sung (McDowell, 1975:88).

4.7.3 Modern Science

The whole question of science in religion is understandably huge and predominantly outside the scope or interest of this study. One small issue with it does exist though and is especially relevant since the evolution of modern medicine where advancements are such that when a person is cured by clinical means, where does Christian society stop believing in God and start believing in science or are the two mutually exclusive? Once that argument has been interrogated, then at what point does this affect modern hymn-writing? Whilst this study is primarily interested in the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn, the results of such an academic study serve merely as a point of comparison, so were it the case that older hymns did prove to be more durable, then this may, in one dimension at least, illustrate that modern hymns of hope and assurance for the sick may not tick all the contemporary Christians' proverbial boxes. Equally, as society moves forward the advancement of science in areas such as cloning and genetically-modified food presents huge challenges for the hymn-writer, especially in an all-embracing church.

A starting point for such an argument might be the upholding of the view that since God is the Creator and one "in whom we live, and move, and have our being" (Acts 17:28) then His authority is assured. This problem is not in isolation though, the same could be argued for many aspects of modern life such as engineering, transport and all aspects of current living.

4.7.4 Church Buildings and Architecture

An as yet un-researched area of church music is its interrelationship with the design and architecture of a church. On a simple level, the singing of an old anthem or hymn in a brand new church building may not seem inappropriate but conversely, a modern church, singing a modern hymn with guitar and folk music accompaniment, for example, may seem entirely appropriate. In this respect at least, some analysis of the issue of the reflection of the visual elements within a church and how this relates to the hymns sung, must deserve attention, at least to some degree.

The study of church architecture is in itself a huge area but a summary of the main tenets of it contribute to a greater understanding of the context for church music. Of course its history does not run in a linear fashion, for buildings put up for one use may have been reused for other, different artistic and legislative practices. As well, uses of local materials and building techniques are relevant considerations.

As far as is recorded in the Bible, places have been set aside for worship. Genesis 22:2 and Exodus 24:15, for example, speak of an area of the mountain that was designated for worship, and in the next chapter of the latter book, there is a reminder to “make this tabernacle and all its furnishings exactly like the pattern I will show you” (Exodus 25:9). Also, the meeting point could be privately owned houses of followers, as illustrated by the fact that the churches of the first four centuries met in privately owned houses (Romans 16:5, 1 Corinthians 16:19, Colossians 4:15 and Philemon 2).

Over the following centuries various styles of architecture were accepted or rejected as the early Christian church grew, especially with influences from classical Greek and Rome. Early Christian architecture then included the basilical church, developed from the Roman secular basilica and modified for liturgical requirements. Congregations and clergy were then segregated in nave and aisles, compared to Roman transepts and apse (Essential Humanities, 2008).

Whilst eastern Christianity had its own style of artistic and architectural movement, the western church moved largely along similar lines, with subtle variations (Essential Humanities, 2008). On a fundamental level of doctrine, churches were then divided in two halves, symbolically divisible to reflect the organisation of Christian society, with the word “church” or “ecclesia” literally meaning to be “set apart from the rest of the world for special purposes” (Wilson, 1970:214).

The concept of a cross shape, especially around the altar, is symbolically easy to follow and the nave is, according to Wilson, so designed to represent the shape of a ship, representing the storm of life and struggle with acceptance and maintaining of faith (Wilson, 1970:215).

By the 1200s Irish churches start to follow their own line of design, especially in the early Church. Here, they were built with square-ended chancels, distinguishing them from the more common European style of the polygonal or semi-circular design. Whenever more space was needed, then the nave was widened, adding transepts and isles. When such extensions were carried out, they were usually built to the east side and extended beyond the outer wall to preserve a now re-configured cruciform shape (Bishop, 1886:14). This early pattern of design continued with minor modifications such as the moving of the choir from the nave nearest the chancel further down the church, the only noticeable change from the point of view of this study (Wilson, 1970:216).

St Brendan’s church in Clonfert claims to be the oldest church in Ireland, though nothing of what was built then now stands. The Cathedral itself stands in the grounds of the monastery founded by St. Brendan in the 6th century. It flourished for many centuries, even through times of great invasions by the Danes who frequently sailed up the River Shannon from Limerick and attacked it. It was burnt down in 1016, 1164, and again in 1179. The monastery and most of the church were destroyed in 1541, and the monastery was not rebuilt after this final assault on it. Perhaps its status is best judged

by the fact that at one time there were over 3,000 monks in this place at one time (St Brendan's Cathedral, 2011).

Of greater interest is the group of oldest church buildings within the Church of Ireland's realm as this provides the scholar, cleric or member of the laity a direct context with the provenance of the past. In this group is St Multose's Church in Kinsale, West Cork, the oldest part of which dates from 1190. Indeed St Multose's claims to be the oldest church in Ireland in continuous usage (St Multose's Church, 2011). At this stage churches started to resemble the common concepts of architectural practice in that stone was used as indeed were conventions of space and shape, though during this period across Europe the "two room" church was the norm. Here, one room was the nave, for congregational use, and the second room a sanctuary for clerical use. The facts that the rooms had a screen between them and that most services were said in Latin meant that congregations were pretty much not involved in the proceedings (Swann, 1982:211).

All this represents a prescribed order, a function that the church has and thus what music has. The continuance of design and architecture, both from an external and internal point of view, surely shows a link with the past, an unbroken line that is difficult to tamper with. In this respect it is reasonable to see that new music styles, new directions and approaches to worship would be difficult. Music can be highly emotive and in times of stress and anxiety, people do cling on to things which have a representation of the past, the continuing of a social order.

Within these highly thought-out design elements lie items of an internal architectural function. If a system has been in place for a long time then it is difficult to confront this with new and challenging music, so in this respect there must be links between the architecture of a church and its music, in terms of the congregation, its hymnody and its anthems. Every piece of church architecture has significance; the communion table, the fontlet, the vessels at "The Table", the lecterns and everything else used in the service. In this respect, a new design of these items may have a relationship with

newer music being sung inasmuch as they represent newer ideas about worship, of which hymnody is only one, but important, aspect.

Again, with contemporary design and the period of Modernism, came the “Liturgical Movement” which, although Roman Catholic in origin, influenced design across the Anglican faith spectrum as well (Klauser, 1979:35). Starting in Europe, with the building of Le Raincy in Paris and Corpus Christi in Aachen, the movement inspired reinforced concrete, large internal spaces, solid white walls and little or no decoration. The altar, in stark contrast to earlier times, was surrounded entirely by the congregation (Klauser, 1975:41). Indeed, such design was backed by a change in liturgy by the Vatican Council II, which encouraged “*participatio actuosa*” and that new churches should be built with this in mind (Klauser, 1975:53).

The link between this and standard parish church design is a bit less tangible and more difficult to chart. No decrees from the Church of Ireland or any of the arguably subtle changes to the *Book of Common Prayer* mitigated any change in design but it must be a truism that when Christian communities saw contemporary churches for one faith, surely it influenced others.

In summary, modern churches evolved by a process of historical steps and with these churches followed new music, for reasons explained above. The question relevant to this study, which becomes more apparent later on in this work when surveys are analysed, is: how do such architectural and design changes speak for the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn?

4.8 ADDRESSING THE RESEARCH QUESTION

The purpose of this chapter was to evaluate and discuss all the influences upon hymnody in the Church of Ireland from its Patrician beginnings to the present day. In terms of the overall research, it was a pivotal chapter, the research preceding this having contextualised both hymns and the events surrounding them into some kind of periodised order.

Following the introductory paragraphs the first main section, 4.4, was a general overview of music-making in the church over the four previously determined main periods. Starting at 4.4.1, discussions around the early pre-Disestablishment period proved that the main input into Irish ecclesiastical music was from England and, although not surprising, vindicated the previous findings of very few records of Irishmen involved in music in their own Church. It was also interesting, and again predictable, that throughout the 1800s most of the music and records seemed to be centred predominantly on the main cathedrals in the Church, and for this section, Gillen and Johnstone's *Historical Anthology of Irish Church Music* proved invaluable, with the added reassurance of the knowledge that Professor Gerard Gillen is an eminent church musician himself. Also, during this section it was learnt that fifteen of the hymns in the current *Church Hymnal* come from this period and interestingly, around half of them from just two writers, George Herbert and John Milton. As this was the period preceding the era at the centre of the research, the discussion around the provenance of these hymns gave a useful contextual background, something that will undoubtedly assist later on in the research, in helping to understand why they are still sung.

As the chapter moved towards discussing the nineteenth century, it was useful to discover the general trends in Church worship and singing. For example, it was interesting to learn of the development of the Victorian hymn's place in singing and match it against the fast-changing developments in Irish hymnody as parish church choirs in the Church of Ireland moved into being robed, the growth of choral

competitions and festivals for parish choirs and, as was learnt from Bernard Rainbow's *The Choral Revival in the Anglican Church*, new choirs being instigated, despite what was to be the inevitable onslaught of the Disestablishment.

In 4.4.2 it was interesting to learn of the status of musicians involved in the Church of Ireland, in that following Disestablishment they were able to continue their employment as long as they maintained their previous duties. This small fact is especially pertinent, as it means there was a degree of continuity in Irish Anglican hymnody, something that kept the older hymns alive during these troubled days for the Church. Had this not occurred, then a break in the usage of older music may have resulted in a very different *Hymnal* today.

To add to this sense of uncertainty, 4.4.2 yielded other interesting facts that affect the over-arching question of the research as a whole. These include the impact of the publication of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* in 1889, the changes and closures of many of the country's choir schools, the competition of many hymnals in the Church of England such as the *Yattendon Hymnal*, *The Public School Hymn Book* and ultimately, *The English Hymnal*. It was also learnt that this was a fertile period of great hymn writing, a fact that is again relevant to the question of the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn as it proved to provide tangible alternatives to the early words of Wesley and Watts *et al*, so loved by congregations up until this point.

The main issues to arise out of 4.4.3 were based on the change to actual music in worship; this proving to be a period of advancement beyond tonal harmony and a rise in the change of the nature of music in churches. It was again interesting to examine the provenance of some of the hymns of this period, especially post-World War II works, which showed a significant move towards a gospel style; this proved to be useful as it gave a background to the contemporary period against which the eighteenth century hymn usage can now be compared. The style of hymns now proved to be increasingly different from those even fifty years earlier, examples of which are hymns such as *When I needed a neighbour were you there*, with its simple,

repetitive flowing nature compared to *One day when heaven was filled with His praises*, which was written at the start of the century, with more standard phrasing and tonality.

Section 4.4.4 became especially interesting as it dealt with issues which are part of recent living memory, the period of “The Troubles” until the present day. Where the likes of Watts and Cowper wrote verse and airs were added later, this section discussed contemporary trends in hymnody, such as the almost “professional” nature of contemporary hymn writers, with people like Townend, who has two hymns in the current *Church Hymnal*.

One section which proved to stand alone and not fit into a chronology was the whole question of organ development. Whilst the history of its development is certainly not at the core of the research, it is an aspect that cannot be ignored, given that it is still the main accompanying vehicle for hymns. What emerged from Section 4.4.5 was the way in which technology has influenced what hymns can be played and how today’s organs can substitute voices for what may be missing, such as digital bass parts and the like.

As the research developed it became necessary to treat influences from other churches as a separate section for a number of reasons. Some faiths had little influence in the Church’s hymnody; some had greater influences than others, and finally, a method of seeing one religion’s holistic influence together might be logically easier to follow. The first section of 4.6, the introductory passage, briefly outlined the problem as well as dealing with the two hymns of Hebrew and Irish/Latin sources, namely *The God of Abraham praise* and *O my God, in my help draw near*.

There was no specific order in this 4.6 but a general flow of western Christian faiths followed by Eastern and other ones. Within that, approximate sequences were determined by the quantity of hymns from that religion in the *Church Hymnal*. There was no specific reason for this only to allow a natural order to follow. The first sub-

section, 4.6.1 then dealt with Roman Catholic influences where the hymns of the many Catholic writers were discussed, such as Frederick William Faber, Cardinal Newman and Edward Caswell. It was interesting and relevant to the over-arching question to consider the relationship between the Catholic hymn-writer's psyche and how the hymns became relevant to Protestants, such as Newman's *Firmly I believe*, which raised questions about its references to the infallible Catholic Church. This section also briefly but significantly evaluated the impact of the Second Vatican Council, when a fresh spirit of ecumenism was decreed.

In 4.6.2 the impact of Presbyterian hymn writers revealed a particular Scottish theme with not only Dr Morison's hymns being used in the *Church Hymnal*, but also the impact of the Edinburgh Missionary Conference upon Church of Ireland worship. In this section, the attempts by the General Synod to engage with the Presbyterians towards some shared areas was noted, but the research concluded that no formal commonalities have been agreed, despite dialogue being open for some time.

With the impact of the Wesleys already discussed in detail in 2.5, the main thrust of the impact of the Methodist Church has been dealt with, as were Baptist hymns in 2.6.

Section 4.6.4 became a very interesting segment of the chapter as it transpired that some influences upon the *Church Hymnal* and thus hymns currently sung in worship were of Orthodox origin. This section ultimately became divided into sub-sections with the most quantitative examples coming from the Greek Orthodox Church, numbering nine hymns in total; this against a backdrop of the faith having only a small number of worshippers in the island of Ireland.

What was also discovered in 4.6.4.1 was that some of the hymns written in Greek do not necessarily reflect a historical Orthodox provenance; they are simply written in Greek for whatever reason.

With no hymns in the *Church Hymnal* of the Russian Orthodox Church, 4.6.4.2 simply accounts for the faith's influence in current worship and the same is largely true for its close neighbour, the Syriac Orthodox Church, though the single hymn from its stable, *Strengthen for service, Lord, the hands*, was found to have an interesting provenance since its first introduction to Church of Ireland worshippers in the fourth edition of the *Church Hymnal*.

The final section in this area of research, 4.6.4.3, simply accounts for the remaining Orthodox faiths, a brief but essential part of the chapter as it takes stock of the whole group of Orthodox religions.

The remaining section, 4.7, discusses the remaining disparate areas that are related to anything which may influence what hymns are sung today, divided into four sections. There was no agenda for what these issues may be; they simply arose from the research and as such are an organic part of the over-arching question of the resilience of eighteenth century hymns today.

Starting with urbanism and ruralism, this short discussion looked at the split before the fire in RCB public records of churches. The next sub-section, 4.7.2, examined the whole aspect of potential clerical input into how hymns were used by examining training, influence and the number of clergy actually practising. Following a brief but useful account of influences from the High Church, during which McDowell's *The Church of Ireland* provided relevant information on the debate about Church order, 4.7.3 and 4.7.4 discussed how Christian approaches to science may affect the thinking behind hymn choice in the modern Church, and finally, how even the architecture of Church buildings may influence hymnody. In this latter point it was useful to discover that the thinking behind the building of a modern church may go hand-in-hand with a modern approach to worship, drawing a parallel example with the *participatio actuosa* of Vatican II.

Throughout this chapter, all aspects of any issue that could relate to hymn choice were successfully and comprehensively discussed and evaluated. This was important not only to the research question as a whole but also to the general progression of the thesis, where the previous chapter looked at actual events in Church and civic history related to hymnody and the next chapter sets about defining the actual eighteenth century canon.

CHAPTER FIVE: ESTABLISHING AN 18TH CENTURY CANON OF HYMNS AND EVALUATING CURRENT APPROACHES TO HYMNODY

5.1 THE RESEARCH QUESTION FOR THIS CHAPTER

Having now comprehensively examined the historical, social and musical context for hymns that are used in the Church of Ireland from its earliest beginnings until the present day, the research aims of this chapter are threefold.

- i. To define what is an eighteenth century hymn and what criteria need to be set to decide which hymns are included in the canon.
- ii. To produce the list of actual hymns in the (current) fifth edition of *The Church Hymnal* that this research has defined as “eighteenth century”. This is known as the chosen canon. Also in this section, using the definitions applied in (i) above, the canon of pre-eighteenth century hymns will also be determined. This will then give the research the total amount of pre- and post-eighteenth century hymns.
- iii. To evaluate, in practical terms, how music is currently approached in today’s Churches; for example, are hymns sung by a choir or praise group, do they use an organ accompaniment, what is the general level of ability of the organist and/or choir and who actually chooses the hymns?

The first target, to define what an eighteenth century hymn is, is not as straightforward as one might assume, as there are several factors and wider issues that need to be accounted for. First, the period of a calendar century is purely arbitrary and merely provides a neat chronology. We may find that some writers on the cusp of century boundaries may stylistically fit in with a previous or later period. Second, there are vast grey areas around dates of hymns being written, first published, first performed and translated; likewise, all this needs a strict set of criteria.

Deciding the list of hymns for the next goal means having to research the *Hymnal* and any related publications for clues of dates. Thankfully, Darling and Davison's *Companion to the Church Hymnal* has thorough details of all hymns in the *Hymnal* but there are other useful texts too.

The final goal of this Chapter will be achieved by means of a simple quantitative survey of a sample size that fits academic research criteria. This will determine simple, physical and practical data about how music is approached in terms of accompaniment, choir support and choice.

When this is completed, the research will naturally follow on to the next chapter which will be anchored on the main qualitative research where actual hymns sung today will be addressed.

5.2 THE RESEARCH METHOD FOR THIS CHAPTER

This chapter draws mainly from the actual fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal* as already cited throughout this entire study. The criteria for usage of hymns uses research gained from this study as well as desk research from the Church of Ireland Theological College library.

Section 5.6 makes extensive use of both *The Church Hymnal* (Darling and Davison, eds., 2000) and *The Companion to the Church Hymnal* (Darling and Davison, 2005). Section 5.7 uses traditional library resources from both Queen's University, Belfast, and the Church of Ireland Theological College, Dublin, as well as field research carried out both in person and by email.

5.3 STRUCTURE OF THIS CHAPTER

This chapter concentrates on determining the actual canon of hymns that are considered to be eighteenth century; its structure therefore reflects this practical and scientific approach. The chapter is divided into seven main sections which cover the three objectives referred to in 5.1.

With sections 5.1, 5.2, 5.3 and 5.12 concerned with the organisation and administration of the chapter, the first research aim, is addressed in sections 5.4 and 5.5. Section 5.4 sets about determining a definition for what is meant by the eighteenth century, at least for the purposes of hymnody in Ireland. The important section 5.5 discusses suitable criteria for what will be in the canon, while the subsequent section 5.6 simply lists the hymns.

The main canon of hymns is selected in section 5.6, and its sub-section 5.6.1 selects a canon of pre-eighteenth century hymns. This is simply in order to give a context of hymnody from the beginning. 5.6.2 is merely a graphical presentation of the data collected in 5.6.

There is a change of mood in section 5.7. Here the focus is on two related issues: evaluating the background of the main musical vehicles used in church, namely organs, choirs and praise groups. The corollary of this section, 5.7.2, is hinged on a quantitative survey of musical decisions and ability as well as uses of choirs, organs and praise groups. As in 5.7.1, 5.7.2 is further divided into relevant sub-sections.

The research aims of this chapter are then evaluated in section 5.8

5.4 DEFINITION OF THE TERM “EIGHTEENTH CENTURY”

At face value, to define the eighteenth century may appear puerile, given the fact that the term actual one hundred year period is merely a convenient fixed calendar point. The reality is of course much different as inevitably there is some variation on the actual eighteenth century “style”. With this in mind, especially from the point of view of Irish hymnody, the Protestant Ascendancy in 1691 seems as good a point as any to start. The Williamite victories obviously secured a new proverbial “line in the sand” in Irish history and following the work done with the Anglican Church in the restoration of Charles II in 1660, the subsequent religious settlement of 1661 was also now in place. Also during these pre-Ascendancy years, action was taken to re-establish the Church of Ireland and to fill dioceses that had become vacant because of deaths during the interregnum, though it is interesting to note that such vacancies were filled not by normal promotions, as was the case in England and Wales, but by giving leading “high” churchmen senior sees, this despite a strong Irish Presbyterian lobby (Yates, 2006:13). To this extent, this study will include hymns that were written or published from around 1690-91 as the start date for the beginning of the era in question.

Ending the eighteenth century is perhaps a little more straightforward. The Act of Union, forming the new country of The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Ireland, receiving Royal Assent on 1 August, 1800 and coming into being on 1 January, 1801, gives an absolute ending to the eighteenth century not only from a historical point of view, but from a human and emotional one too.

5.5 CRITERIA FOR DECIDING WHICH HYMNS TO INCLUDE IN THE CANON

Hand-in-hand with the above point is the second area that needs clarity, which hymns to include. As in 5.4, at face value, this may seem obvious: simply to include those hymns which were written after 1690 and before 1801. However, there are many other less obvious factors to consider, such as translation dates of foreign hymns,

dates of introduction into the English language, additions of verses by other writers, hymns of uncertain “anon” origin, and attributions to other writers.

Also there are stylistic features to consider. For example, some writers who were born on the cusp of one century may chronologically not be from the period in question but may write in the 18th century style, in which case, a decision on a case-by-case issue needs to be considered. For all these reasons, a set of parameters needs to be drawn up.

Hymns that are written in another language and not popularised until after the eighteenth century are difficult to assess regarding their inclusion. On one hand, they are certainly eighteenth century, but against this, being written for a foreign congregation with different religious contexts, liturgies and approaches to faith, means that arguably they are not written in the *spirit* of the eighteenth century hymn. For the sake of liturgical continuity, rather than for reasons of pedantry, such hymns are not included.

These hymns include no. 88, *Fairest Lord Jesus*, which was a very popular hymn in Germany, where it originated in a 17th century hymnal. Although it flourished in the eighteenth century, it did not enjoy any popularity in the English-speaking world and its translation was not completed until 1850. Likewise, *On Jordan's banks*, no. 136, although written in the eighteenth century, was only sung in France, in Latin. Much later, in the nineteenth century, John Chandler discovered and translated it into English. Similarly, *We plough the fields and scatter* made a journey from the eighteenth century where it started its life as a seventeen stanza hymn in Germany, later becoming much shorter and eventually, in 1861, being translated into English by Jane Montgomery Campbell. The ever-popular *Praise my soul the King of heaven* was already published in Bremen in 1680 by Joachim Neander before being translated in the nineteenth century, as was *Praise to the Lord, the Almighty, the King of creation!* by the same author. So too were *Now thank we all our God, Who are these like stars appearing, Jesus lives: thy terror now, Baptized into Your name most holy* and finally *O*

Jesu so meek, O Jesu so mild; these are all not included for similar reasons. *Who are these like stars appearing* was written in 1719 in Frankfurt but it was not sung in England until its translation by Frances E. Cox in 1841; nos 272 and 475. *Jesus lives: thy terror now* and *Who are these like stars appearing were*, were again both published and popular in eighteenth century Germany but were not published in English until the mid-1800s by Frances E. Cox. *Baptized into Your name most holy* suffered the same fate. Published in 1734, it waited another century before Catherine Winkworth's translation and subsequent publication in 1858 and finally, no. 173 *O Jesu so meek, O Jesu so mild* was also written in the era in question, but again, not translated until the nineteenth century, thus leaving it ineligible for inclusion (Darling & Davison, 2000: 102,154,217,264-5, 389,498,503 & 534).

Like the hymns above, which all had German publication before being translated in a later era, no. 666, based on Psalm 46:10, *Be still my soul*, is Germanic in origin. It was written in 1752 by Katharina von Schlegel in response to the Pietistic revival in Germany, a movement not dissimilar to the Puritan and Wesleyan movements, but its more recent popularisation is due to its twentieth century association with the tune *Finlandia* by Sibelius. In any case, it suffers the same plight regarding its inclusion, as once again it was not translated until the nineteenth century (Christian Music, 1982).

All the above examples have a Germanic origin, but one hymn, no. 649, *Happy are they, they that love God*, has a complicated provenance, though its underlying origin means it is not included in the canon, as initially it was only sung as a Latin hymn in France on Tuesday Vespers, prior to its English translation in 1837 by John Chandler. For these reasons it does not liturgically fit the model of the eighteenth century English / Irish hymn and as such, it is not included in this canon.

This means that there are eleven hymns, originally written in the eighteenth century, that do not fit this model of study on account of their translations to English and thus their first occurrences to English-speaking congregations. This equates to just 1.5% of the 719 hymns in the current fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal*.

Finally, there are several hymns that are included but the reasons why may need some clarification as, at face value, their inclusion may be open to conjecture. These hymns are:

Father of Mercies, God of love

Alice Flowerdew's hymn of 1803 took a few years to build up popularity but falls close enough to the eighteenth century to be included. Furthermore, she was a well-established hymn writer by this stage and as such, is liturgically seated in the era in question (Darling & Davison, 2000:95).

Awake, my soul, and with the sun and All praise to Thee, my God, this night

Both of Thomas Ken's hymns were written in the 1670s but their inclusion in publications outside Winchester College, where he taught, was not until the turn of the century when they entered mainstream popularity. As such, they are included in the canon.

Alleluia! Raise the anthem

This was first published in 1805 and performed in its own right as a longer hymn than the one John Mason Neale shortened, revised and published in 1861.

Father, of heaven, whose love profound

This hymn fits into this era by the slimmest of margins, having first appeared in the iconic *A Selection of Psalms and Hymns for Public and Private Use* in 1805. It was written by Edward Cooper, a prolific writer and rector from London. The hymn is Trinitarian in structure, allowing it flexibility for penitential Sundays as well as the more obvious Trinity Sunday (Darling & Davison, 2000:445).

As pants the hart for cooling streams

This is included as it was written in 1691, very close to the commencement of the eighteenth century and in the same year as the start of the Protestant Ascendancy. As its publication was in a book that supplanted the original Sternhold and Hopkins

Psalter of 1562 (see section 2.4.2 of this study), the hymn was written for a new era, thus being more in line with eighteenth century thinking.

Many hymn writers also fall just outside this canon, Henry Francis Lyte and Mrs Cecil Frances Alexander being two that resonate with this study, as the author taught in the school that was the residence of Mrs Alexander at the time she wrote some of her most famous hymns, including *All things bright and beautiful* and *There is a green hill far away*. This study was also written in the same town where Lyte went to school, in Enniskillen, Co Fermanagh, Northern Ireland.

5.6 THE CHOSEN CANON

With the definitions and criteria now decided, the next task is to decide the actual canon; this is research objective 5.1(b). There follows, then, the canon of eighteenth century hymns which are currently used and part of the *Church Hymnal*, grouped according to the divisions in the *Church Hymnal*, fifth edition. This compilation takes into account the parameters set in 5.4 and 5.5.

No.	Hymn	Author
1. The love of God: God the Father, Creator		
13	God moves in a mysterious way	Cowper
28	I sing the almighty power of God	Watts
35	The spacious firmament on high	Addison
40	Father of mercies, God of love	Flowerdew
42	Good is the Lord, our heavenly King	Watts
51	Awake, my soul, and with the sun	Ken
52	Christ, whose glory fills the skies	Wesley, C
59	Now every morning is the love	Keble

63	All praise to Thee, my God, this night	Ken
67	God, who made the earth, the heaven	Heber & Whately
75	Lord, dismiss us with Your blessing	Fawcett
76	Sweet is the work, my God and King	Watts
<i>Total hymns in this section: 83 Total 18th century: 12 Total non-18th century: 71</i>		
2. The love of God: God the Son, Redeemer		
84	Alleluia! Raise the anthem	Hupton & Neale
92	How sweet the name of Jesus sounds	Newton
97	Jesus shall reign where'er the sun	Watts
99	Jesus, the name high over all	Wesley, C
104	O for a thousand tongues to sing	Wesley, C
116	To our Redeemer's glorious name	Steele
119	Come, thou long-expected Jesus	Wesley, C
124	Hark the glad sound! The saviour comes	Doddridge
132	Lo! He comes with clouds descending	Cennick & Wesley, C
145	You servants of the Lord	Doddridge
160	Hark! The herald Angels sing	Wesley, C
166	Joy to the world	Watts
180	Quem pastores laudavere	trad. trans. Caird
188	While Shepherds watched	Nate
190	Brightest and best of the suns of the morning	Heber
199	The people that in darkness walked	Morison
206	Come, let us to the Lord our God	Morison
218	And can it be that I should gain	Wesley, C
221	Hark! The voice of love and mercy	Evans
232	Nature with open volume stands	Watts
234	O Love divine, what hast thou done	Wesley, C
240	Sweet the moments, rich in blessing	Shirley
247	When I survey the wondrous cross	Watts

248	We sing the praise of Him who died	Kelly
250	All hail the power of Jesu's name	Perronet & Ripon
266	Hail the day that sees Him rise, alleluia!	Wesley
268	Hail, thou once-despised Jesus!	Bakewell
269	Hark ten thousand voices sounding	Kelly
270	I know that my Redeemer lives	Medley
271	Jesus Christ is risen today	anon. Davidica
275	Look, ye saints, the sight is glorious	Kelly
277	Love's redeeming work is done	Wesley, C
281	Rejoice, the Lord is King!	Wesley, C
285	The head that once was crowned with thorns	Kelly
291	Where high the heavenly temple stands	Bruce
<i>Total hymns in this section: 241 Total 18th century: 35 Total non-18th century: 206</i>		
3. The love of God: God the Holy Spirit, Life Giver		
295	Come, gracious Spirit, heavenly Dove	Browne
<i>Total hymns in this section: 23 Total 18th century: 1 Total non-18th century: 22</i>		
4. The love of God: God the Holy Trinity, Three-in-one		
319	Father, of heaven, whose love profound	Cooper
323	The God of Abraham praise	Olivers
<i>Total hymns in this section: 9 Total 18th century: 2 Total non-18th century: 7</i>		
5. The Life of Faith: The Church's Worship		
331	God reveals His presence	Tersteegan trans. Foster & Mercer
332	Come, let us join our cheerful songs	Watts
336	Jesus, where'er Thy people meet	Cowper
339	Saviour, send a blessing to us	Kelly
351	From all that dwell	Watts

353	Give to our God, immortal praise	Watts
357	I'll praise my maker while I've breath	Watts
372	Through all the changing scenes of life	Tate & Brady
374	While all Thy mercies, O my God	attrib. Addison
390	Baptized into Your name most holy	Rambach, trans Winkworth
433	My God, your table here is spread	Doddridge
463	Give us the wings of faith to rise	Watts
467	How bright those glorious spirits shine!	Watts
<i>Total hymns in this section: 153 Total 18th century: 13 Total non-18th century: 140</i>		
6. The Life of Faith: The Church's Witness and Mission		
487	Soldiers of Christ, arise	Wesley, C
492	Ye servants of God, Your Master proclaim	Wesley, C
505	Peace be to this congregation	Wesley, C
523	Help us to help each other, Lord	Wesley, C
524	May the grace of Christ our Saviour	Newton
534	God save our gracious Queen	anon
537	O God, our help in ages past	Watts
<i>Total hymns in this section: 68 Total 18th century: 7 Total non-18th century: 61</i>		
7. The Life of Faith: Faith and Discipleship		
547	Approach, my soul, the mercy-seat	Newton
553	Jesu, lover of my soul	Wesley, C
557	Rock of ages, cleft for me	Toplady
563	Commit your ways to God	Gerhardt, trans. Wesley, J
567	Forth, in thy name, O Lord I go	Wesley, C
569	Hark, my soul, it is the Lord	Cowper
591	O happy day that fixed my choice	Doddridge
607	As pants the hart for cooling streams	Tate & Brady
614	Great Shepherd of your people, hear	Newton

621	O Love divine, how sweet thou art!	Wesley, C
634	Love divine, all loves excelling	Wesley, C
637	O for a closer walk with God	Cowper
638	O for a heart to praise my God	Wesley, C
639	O Thou who camest from above	Wesley, C
642	Amazing Grace	Newton
646	Glorious things of Thee are spoken	Newton
647	Guide me, O thou great Jehovah	Williams
657	O God of Bethel, by whose hand	Doddridge
664	To Zion's hills I lift my eyes	Tate & Brady
<i>Total hymns in this section: 136 Total 18th century: 19 Total non-18th century: 117</i>		
8. The Life of Faith: The Christian Hope		
667	Blessed be the everlasting God	Watts
671	Jesus, Thy blood and righteousness	Wesley, J
681	There is a land of pure delight	Watts
<i>Total hymns in this section: Total 18th century: 12 Total non-18th century:</i>		
9. Liturgical Material: Hymns Relating to the Liturgies		
709	Praise the Lord! You heavens adore Him	anon
<i>Total hymns in this section: 38 Total 18th century: 1 Total non-18th century: 37</i>		

The total number of eighteenth century hymns in the current Church Hymnal then, according to the terms and conditions applied as described earlier in this chapter, comes to one hundred and three. This means that almost 15% of the hymns available today are from the period stretching from the Protestant Ascendancy in 1691 until the Act of Union in 1801.

5.6.1 Pre-eighteenth century hymns; determining a context for hymns used up until the eighteenth century

In order to put the current canon of hymns in context, the following table lists hymns written before the eighteenth century, as defined by 5.4 and 5.5. To this extent, hymns will be arithmetically calculated by adding the pre-18th century hymns, with the 103 from the period in question, to derive the number of hymns that are post-18th century.

Again, for the purposes of continuity, hymns written in a language other than English are dated according to their translation.

21	The Lord's my shepherd, I'll not want	Whittingham
30	Let us with a gladsome mind	Milton
140	The Lord will come and not be slow	Milton
176	On Christmas night all Christians sing	anon. after Wadding
231	My song is love unknown	Crossman
296	Come, Holy Ghost, our souls inspire	Cosin, attrib. Maurus
333	How lovely are thy dwellings fair!	Milton
358	King of glory; King of peace	Herbert
360	Let all the world in every corner sing	Herbert
468	How shall I sing that majesty	Mason
506	Pray that Jerusalem may have	anon.
548	Drop, drop, slow tears	Fletcher
560	Alone with none but thee, my God	attrib. Columba
601	Teach me, my God and King	Herbert
610	Come, my Way, my Truth, my Life	Herbert
668	God is our fortress and our rock	Perry after Luther
683	All people that on earth do dwell	Kethe
<i>Total number of pre-18th century hymns: 15 As a %age of the hymn book: 2%</i>		

This means that almost 16.5% of the hymns in the current Hymnal are pre nineteenth century, or close to one sixth.

5.7 HOW MUSIC IS PERFORMED IN TODAY'S CHURCH

This section, which addresses objective 5.1(c) of this chapter's research aims, is divided into two sub-sections.

5.7.1 is concerned with the background and understanding of the main vehicles for accompanying hymns.

5.7.2 examines the approach to music in today's Church in simple, practical terms of the skill level of the musical director or organist who picks the hymns and the choirs' involvement and application.

5.7.1 Musical ensembles and methods of accompaniment in today's church

5.7.1.1 Organs

Although this research is not necessarily concerned with the nature of what type of organ is used as an accompanying instrument to hymnody, it is useful to examine the different instruments on a basic level at least, in case they influence hymn choice or have any bearing on the style or approaches to hymnody. This, of course has already been discussed in a different context in section 4.5, but in simple terms, the church organ does not need much introduction. As symbolic of a church as any icon or piece of architecture, the organ has been around since the 3rd century BC when Ctesibius of Alexandria is credited with having invented the primitive "hydraulis" or water organ (Pettigrew, 2002).

5.7.1.2 Pipe and non-piped organs

Speaking summatively then, the various styles of organs used in Irish churches then, fall into two categories, pipe organs and non-piped organs. In organs that use wind movement through pipes, which are divided into ranks and controlled by hand-stops or combination pistons, the keyboard is not as expressive as a piano, for example, but there is some flexibility here with the use of a “swell box” which controls shutters in front of the pipes, thus allowing the sound to be released more for louder dynamics and closed off more for lesser markings.

Advances in modern technology means that nowadays hybrid organs are starting to appear, these are instruments that include a mix of digital and traditional “piped” sounds. Non-piped organs include the entire electric, electronic and digital range as well as the reed organ or harmonium.

5.7.1.3 Choirs

Field research conducted for this study shows that choirs range from paid SATB choirs (that is, Soprano, Alto, Tenor and Bass) such as that in St Patrick’s Cathedral, Dublin, through to half-a-dozen unison female singers such as Colaghty Parish Church, Co Fermanagh. Despite this, many ministers interviewed spoke of the great Church of Ireland choral tradition, a tradition not necessarily evident either on a parish level or even in large market towns. St Macartan’s Cathedral in Enniskillen, for example, can just about sustain SATB parts on a regular basis and many churches face great difficulties when they have to do a special service with the bishop or other clerical or civil dignitaries (Reagan, 2011). At the time of writing (2012), the current talking point in hymnody circles in Ireland was the fact that the Chapter of St Anne’s Cathedral in Belfast, the second largest city in the Church of Ireland’s aegis, was going to substantially downgrade the choir in the Cathedral by axing the post of Musical Director and reducing the choir’s commitment (Poole, 2010).

5.7.1.4 “Praise” groups and bands

Findings from the research associated with this study suggest that “praise” groups, as they are informally called, are made up of whatever available musicians there are. Rossory Parish Church in Clogher Diocese, for example, uses a group made up of two flutes, a clarinet, tenor saxophone and guitar. On the other hand, Mountjoy Church in the Diocese of Derry and Raphoe uses two guitars, a bass guitar and two violins and so the list goes on. One thing is clear: these groups are only used for occasional accompaniment or for solo items and are not seen as a general replacement for the organ.

5.7.2 Quantitative online survey to assess musical decisions, ability as well as uses of choirs, organ and praise groups

Before beginning to determine the approach to music in the modern Church, a brief survey was needed to underpin the academic research. This is necessary for several reasons:

- i. Academic research may not take into account what is happening at the proverbial “coal face” of music in churches.
- ii. The little research that has been done is now somewhat out of date, the most recent research being just a few references in Alan Acheson’s *History of the Church of Ireland* (2003).
- iii. Finally, though in many ways possibly an extension to the point (ii) above, there is actually very little research available. In a way this is not so surprising given the specialised nature of the study and also the relatively small number of Anglicans in Northern Ireland and Eire, compared to the number of worshippers on mainland UK.

5.7.2.1 Setting up the survey

As this survey needed to yield a basic picture of the overall approaches to hymnody and church music, a large sample was needed and thus, in keeping with the research guidelines as laid down in Chapter 6, where the main surveys are discussed, the questionnaire was limited to five questions, a feature that would assist in the questions being easy to ask by telephone or internet.

5.7.2.2 Sample size

There are 459 parishes in the Church of Ireland which includes 31 cathedrals. This figure is open to a little conjecture as there are some parish unions which effectively have the same minister and sometimes organist. Also, there are some other divisions which are counted as being parishes but may be unions or groups by the Church of Ireland. Some of these dioceses have as few as two or three parishes, such as Clonfert and Waterford, whereas some have many more, such as Conor, with 76 parishes. Therefore, this sample will include a pro rata mix of cathedrals which serve small, medium and large dioceses and likewise, matching parishes in terms of scale. On the model using guidelines provided by the Organizational Systems Research Association, a sample size of 200 would be deemed adequate (Bartlett et al., 2001).

5.7.2.3 Sampling method

The survey will be carried out by the following method:

- i. incorporating the questions into the longer interviews being held in relation to Chapter 6.
- ii. by telephone

iii. by the internet using “survey monkey”, a free online resource.

5.7.3 The online survey

The research at this stage required just simple answers that would give an overall picture, so with this in mind, the first piece of information needed was to find the ability and professionalism of the musician. Understanding this helps interpret the subsequent findings. The first question was then worded accordingly: *“Which term below best describes the organist/musical director in your church?”* The kinds of responses to this have to fit the conventional models of field quantitative research, so all possible answers were categorised into four types: Is your organist a professional one who is paid the RSCM fee and leads a competent SATB choir or equivalent? Is your organist a music graduate or pianist/organist of Grade 8 or above who is a stipendiary contracted? Is your organist an amateur, “leisure” or self-taught organist who is contracted voluntarily? Finally, do you not have an organist and if so, does the church use either a rota or taped hymns?

The next issue that needed addressed was to find some way of defining a choir. This question, with a limited range of answers, gives a more detailed context for the survey but also helps answer the analysis as well. For instance, a choir which sings mainly modern church music may not have at its disposal all four voice parts. Question two then asks, *“Which description best describes your choir?”* The following range of answers is possible and is condensed down to four response options. The choir is professionally run with all voice parts able to competently sing any material; practices are held at least weekly but usually more often; the choir sings a different anthem every service. The choir is a competent SATB one that rehearses weekly and sings regular anthems. The choir is limited in its ability to hold all four voice parts but does occasionally, sometimes with outside help; the choir will sing anthems occasionally. Finally, the choir is mainly unison though one or two may sing harmony when the occasion suits; the choir will practice from time-to-time, usually to prepare for key Church events.

The third issue needs to address directly the question of the church's approach to music, and following the outcomes of the research so far, there are only three possible answers; mainly older music, music which is considered modern and a mix of the two. Therefore, question three asks *"Which term best describes the kind of music you do in your church?"*

There is also a box for the respondent to comment in the form of a Likert scale about the percentage of modern to old. It may seem very vague in a study such as this to identify music which is "old" or "modern" but in layman's terms, in the congregations up and down the country, such descriptions are clearly understood. The only caveat is that old hymns are sometimes done with a modern twist, by using guitars when the piece is scored for organ, for example. As this study is concerned primarily with the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn, this is of relevance to the research and its findings. If an eighteenth century hymn is given a modern setting and is accompanied by a "praise group", it is still an eighteenth century hymn.

Following in a logical order, the issue of how music is accompanied is the next aspect needed. A simple but straightforward question such as, *"How is your music accompanied in your church?"* seems appropriate, with the three available options all listed, namely, mostly organ, mainly organ but also other instruments such as guitars and "praise" groups, and finally, the organ is seldom used in favour of guitars or "praise" groups.

The final question asks a related but critical question, *"Who is it that chooses the hymns and decides musical direction?"* Essentially there are five possible answers to this query: exclusively or mostly the minister, exclusively or mostly the organist, mainly or usually the minister, mainly or usually the organist, or another party such as a senior member of the church or choral deacon.

To avoid the situation emerging where all the answers did not fit a maverick or one-off sample, then the "comment box" will enable respondents to put in other points.

There are many other questions that could have been asked, but keeping the survey manageable and able to be sent to the respondents quickly and efficiently, was more

important. Other questions that could have been asked concern how rigidly the church followed the lectionary, how much of a say the congregation had in hymnody and whether or not the church was using a particular style of hymn because it suited the circumstances and method of accompaniment available. However, with careful reading, the questions that have been asked, in some way do help address these issues whilst still enabling the research to ascertain the over-arching research question, are eighteenth century hymns more or less resilient now and if so, why.

Below is a summary of the questions and possible answers:

1. Which term below best describes the organist in your church?

- i. Professional organist who is paid the RSCM fee and leads a competent SATB choir or equivalent.
- ii. A music graduate or pianist/organist of Grade 8 or above who is a stipendiary contracted.
- iii. An amateur, "leisure" or self-taught organist who is contracted voluntarily.
- iv. No organist. The church uses either a rota or uses taped hymns.

2. Which description best describes your choir?

- i. A professionally run choir with all voice parts able to competently sing any material. Practices are held at least weekly but usually more often. The choir sings a different anthem every service.
- ii. A competent SATB choir that rehearses weekly and sings regular anthems.
- iii. A choir which is limited in its ability to hold all four voice parts but does occasionally, sometimes with outside help. The choir will sing anthems occasionally.
- iv. A mainly unison choir though one or two may sing harmony when the occasion suits. The choir will practice from time-to-time, usually to prepare for key Church events.

3. Which term best describes the kind of music you do you in your church?

- i. We follow "older" or "traditional" hymns the overwhelming majority of times.
- ii. We have a mix of old and new hymns
- iii. We use mainly newer, twentieth century hymns

Question 3 also gave a definition of a “new” hymn as being one which was twentieth century, had a modern-style setting, had guitar chords provided, whose words often featured repeated phrases and whose harmonic structure may have been quite simple. Although this definition may seem on the outset, lacking empirical structure, a “modern” or “new” hymn is a term used regularly in the Church and has a clear implied meaning.

4. How is music accompanied in your church?

- i. Mostly organ
- ii. Mainly organ, but we use other instruments too such as guitars and “praise” groups.
- iii. Seldom use the organ, usually guitars or “praise” groups.

5. Who decides the music used in your Church or determines the musical direction?

- i. Mostly or exclusively the organist/musical director.
- ii. Mostly or exclusively the minister.
- iii. Mainly the organist but with permission or consultation with the minister.
- iv. Mainly the minister but with permission or consultation with the organist/musical director.
- v. Other members of vestry, assistant organists, retired clergy or significant laity.

5.7.4 Analysis of the return

5.7.4.1 Question 1 responses

The first question, that of which term best describes the organist in your church, gave the following answers.

	Question	No	%age
(i)	Professional organist who is paid the RSCM fee and leads a competent SATB choir or equivalent: 5	11	5.5%
(ii)	A music graduate or pianist/organist of Grade 8 or above who is a stipendiary contracted:	62	31%
(iii)	An amateur, "leisure" or self-taught organist who is contracted voluntarily.	118	59%
(iv)	No organist. The church uses either a rota or uses taped hymns.	9	4.5%

By far the most common outcome was that almost three fifths of all churches have as their music staff, an organist who is simply a leisure player without any professional training. Adding the additional 4.5% who responded with answer "d", means that amount of churches who have averagely competent organists or directors of music inches closer to almost two thirds. With this in mind, many of the hymns in the *Church Hymnal* may simply not be available to the congregation, as they may be deemed either too technically difficult or because the organists or directors of music are untrained, or may not fully understand the musical or liturgical appropriateness of hymns for services.

Conversely, it was interesting to find that over two thirds of organists or directors of music were of a competent standard where hymn choice is not an issue, nor is setting their choirs challenging music.

5.7.4.2 Question 2 responses

The second question, that of which term best describes the choir in your church, gave the following answers.

	Question	No	%age
(i)	A professionally run choir with all voice parts able to competently sing any material. Practices are held at least weekly but usually more often. The choir sings a different anthem every service.	8	4%
(ii)	A competent SATB choir that rehearses weekly and sings regular anthems.	23	11.5%
(iii)	A choir which is limited in its ability to hold all four voice parts but does occasionally, sometimes with outside help. The choir will sing anthems occasionally.	41	20.5%
(iv)	A mainly unison choir though one or two may sing harmony when the occasion suits. The choir will practice from time-to-time, usually to prepare for key Church events.	128	64%

It was interesting to see that almost two-thirds of church choirs in the representative sample are perceived by their minister or organist / musical director as being mainly unison, in other words, a glorified extension of the congregation. At the other end of the scale, only 14.5% of churches can competently sing hymns in adequate four-part harmony, leaving a very musically shallow pool of hymns which sound at their best. Interestingly enough, with the canon of hymns from the 20th Century representing such a large proportion of the *Church Hymnal*, fifth edition, most churches may arguably derive greater musical satisfaction from performing unison modern music, specifically written to be performed in that style. Yet, as the following question's response illustrates, the vast majority of churches are singing older hymns which, by their nature, tend to have bespoke four-part harmonies. Indeed it is ironically these harmonies, when the hymns are sung at their best by cathedral choirs, that perhaps are part of the allure of the hymns in the first place.

5.7.4.3 Question 3 responses

The third question, that of which term best describes the kind of music you do in your church, gave the following answers.

	Question	No	%age
(i)	We follow “older” or “traditional” hymns the overwhelming majority of times.	172	86%
(ii)	We have a mix of old and new hymns	27	13.5%
(iii)	We use mainly newer, twentieth century hymns	1	0.5%

Question 3 responses showed an overwhelming number of churches who used “older” or more “traditional” hymns the vast majority of the time. This in itself is quite a revealing statistic, depending on one’s interpretation of “older” hymns. If one takes the figure as being pre-nineteenth century, then with only about 15% of hymns this would suggest that a large number of the hymns in the *Church Hymnal* are being ignored and/or not used. Even adding the pre-twentieth century hymns, the percentage of “older” hymns are disproportionate to the quantity of those that are being sung. It is also very telling that only one church uses almost entirely modern music and further research into this shows that the organist is not a music-reader and plays “by ear”, therefore there is the question of the music being chosen to suit the musician (Elizabeth Seale, 2011).

5.7.4.4 Question 4 responses

The fourth question, that of how music is accompanied in your church, resulted in the following responses.

	Question	No	%age
(i)	Mostly organ	192	96%
(ii)	Mainly organ, but we use other instruments too such as guitars and “praise” groups.	7	3.5%
(iii)	We seldom use the organ, usually guitars or “praise” groups.	1	0.5%

Whilst “praise groups” and informal instruments may or may not be used for occasional services such as youth meetings, special events or sacred concerts, the overwhelming response from churches is that the organ is by far the most popular instrument for musical accompaniment. This research, of course, is not necessarily concerned with what type of organ is being used, as such a question would overlap with Question 1, the skills of the organist. This is because a more skilled organist will be attracted to a higher quality instrument or one with greater tonal scope such as a three manual with full foot pedals and will not be necessarily attracted to a glorified portable “keyboard” such as the lower-priced Yamaha models which are in some churches. To this extent a four manual pipe organ such as that in St Columb’s Cathedral, Derry; a three manual organ such as that in St Columba’s Parish Church, Omagh; a two manual such as that in St Macartan’s Cathedral, Enniskillen, and a two manual harmonium such as that found in Ballyshannon Parish Church are all counted simply as “organs”.

5.7.4.5 Question 5 responses

The fifth question, that of who decides the music used in your Church or determines the musical direction, gave the following answers.

	Question	No	%age
(i)	Mostly or exclusively the organist/musical director.	46	23%
(ii)	Mostly or exclusively the minister.	36	18%
(iii)	Mainly the organist but with permission or consultation with the minister.	65	32.5%
(iv)	Mainly the minister but with permission or consultation with the organist/musical director.	49	24.5%
(v)	Somebody else (please specify the title or role the person has, not their name).	4	2%

This final question was the most easily split question, with the exception of the last point, which was simply there as a valve to allow a response not covered by the clear-cut options available for questions i to iv. Although the strongest response is iii, that where organist decides the hymns but with the permission or consultation with the minister, there is still a degree of conjecture amongst this due to obvious semantic and interpretive bias. To one minister “consultation” may be simply saying “we are doing hymn 63 to open the service, is this ok?” (St Macartan’s Cathedral, Clogher) and in another case may be at the opposite end of the scale. Equally, the example of St Patrick’s Church in Castle Archdale is also worth bearing in mind (Information gained from personal interview). Here, two organists share the post, one a retired ex-cathedral organist, the other a locally-trained housewife, who never had lessons other than by a private teacher in her own home. Whilst the obvious deduction from this scenario is that the ex-cathedral organist would decide the hymns and the local organist would be told what to play, the reverse is actually the case. This is because the ex-cathedral organist has a strong personality and is just playing the organ as a job,

whereas the locally-trained organist is a key member of the church's community and as such, the minister entrusts her with choosing the hymns.

The lectionary too, plays its part in this answer. With a number of hymns to choose from, should the church follow the lectionary, then an organist will not be able to put in too many personal favourites which may accidentally clash with the central message of the point in the church calendar.

Despite the numerous paradoxes which must be within these figures, it still is interesting to note that there appears, at least in the very general sense, to be some degree of substantial input by organists into the choosing of hymns.

5.7.5 Summary to the survey

Whilst there were no continuous corollaries or pre-condition questioning in the survey, the summary is that the vast majority of churches play hymns which are pre-twentieth century, by organists who are amateur or of limited ability, on a traditional church organ. Hymns are usually chosen by the organist in consultation with the minister but many churches use the reverse and close variations on that. Only a small handful of churches use mainly modern hymns but these too are played on organs. Most choirs sing in unison with a little or limited harmony while some choirs are able to sing most or all voice parts for special occasions, which they achieve by calling in non-choir members, guest singers or by having extra choir practices for that event. Only a small number of choirs are able to sing full harmony the vast majority of the time and again, only a small number of organists are professionally or semi-professionally trained.

Of the random cross-sample drawn for this survey, the overwhelming majority of churches use a traditional organist accompaniment, with or without a choir. In the main, folk groups and other accompanying ensembles seem to be restricted to churches that are large, in towns or cities, and have a wide range of musical resources.

There is a definite urban / rural split here; folk groups and other accompanying ensembles increase in popularity the closer one gets to the three main population centres in the island of Ireland, Dublin, Belfast and Cork.

A large number of churches seem to have pianos as well as organs and as in the case of accompanying ensembles, some kind of area set aside with room for a drum kit and guitarists.

Accompanying ensembles primarily seem to be comprised of popular instruments and those that are simply available. Guitars, bass guitars, drums and keyboard are the most popular with flute, clarinet, trumpet, saxophone and trombone also popular. Orchestral string instruments are not very popular.

5.8 ADDRESSING THE RESEARCH QUESTION

There were three main foci for this chapter, namely, setting criteria for what hymns should be included in the canon of eighteenth century works, the physical listing of these hymns and the evaluation in practical terms of how churches approach hymn-singing in the current era.

With the administrative sections of 5.1, 5.2 and 5.3 concluded, 5.4 dealt with defining the term “eighteenth century”, at least from an Anglican hymnodist point of view. As it transpired, this proved to be relatively straightforward thanks to the Protestant Ascendancy of 1691, which was to all accounts one of the most defining points in Irish history. Equally, the Act of Union in 1801 concluded the era without any other major events or turning points in history providing any worthwhile opposition.

With section 5.4 having decided the period boundaries for the eighteenth century, the next section, 5.5, discussed the criteria for deciding which hymns could be included. This was necessary because of the sometimes disparate ways in which hymns were

performed and published. For some hymns, the research discovered that the date of authorship, first use locally, first recorded use and publication could all differ. Furthermore, there were the added complications of translations, added verses and re-writes. Therefore, the fairest thing to do seemed to consider all the hymns which had issues of complexity to them on a case-by-case basis, applying the 1691 – 1801 dates as equitably as possible.

This analysis actually drew some quite interesting results, for example, *Praise my soul the King of heaven* was used in the Church of England for the first time only in the nineteenth century, even though it was written and published in Germany in 1680 by Joachim Neander. *Be still my soul* by Katharina von Schlegel and *Happy are they, they that love God* were two other similar hymns. Such instances occur other times, that of being written in one language in or around the time of the eighteenth century but not translated until much later.

On the other hand, both of Thomas Ken's *Winchester Hymns* are included because although they were written a little earlier than 1691, they were not publicly used until the start of the 1700s and as such, qualify for inclusion. The same is true for *Father of heaven, whose love profound* by Edward Cooper, but at the upper end of the century boundary, many hymn writers do not enjoy inclusion for the opposite reason: their hymns were just written too late into the nineteenth century. These include the works of Henry Francis Lyte, the author of *Abide with Me* and Mrs Cecil Frances Alexander, writer of *All things bright and beautiful* and *There is a green hill far away* among other offerings.

5.6 sees the chosen canon being physically listed. As there were so few hymns in the *Church Hymnal* that were written before the eighteenth century, it seemed prudent to include these in the research as well, as they would give a pre-nineteenth century and post-eighteenth century total. These hymns are in 5.6.1 and section 5.6 is concluded with a graphical presentation of the data for this part of the research.

There is a slight change of focus in 5.7, which addresses the final aim of the research goals for this chapter, that of establishing how hymns are sung on a practical basis, week-in, week-out. With all the research prior to this, both desk and field research, focusing on academic models, it was felt that as the thesis was now reaching the stage of seeing how often eighteenth century hymns were sung and trying to find some sort of reason why they were or were not being used, some kind of knowledge about practical hymn-singing in the Church was essential. In this respect, 5.7 was divided into two sub-sections; 5.7.1 was concerned with how hymns are actually accompanied in the Church and 5.7.2 discussed the personnel involved in hymnody in the Church. From this, 5.7.1 was further sub-divided into four more sections where the different aspects of hymn singing were introduced, namely the organ, pipe and non-piped organs, the church choir and other methods of accompanying such as praise bands or folk groups.

5.7.2 saw an examination into the practical accompaniment and use of hymns in services in today's Church. This was addressed by the form of a simple survey using an online method, applying the principles as outlined in van Rensburg's *Research Methodology* on quantitative research (van Rensburg, 2007).

Section 5.7.2.3 provided the details behind the sample size and method, and the survey itself was thoroughly discussed in section 5.7.2.2, again based on criteria found in van Rensburg's empirical paper on *Research Methodology*. Here, in the analysis of the survey in 5.7.2.3, it was found that the amateur organist and unison choir was by far the most popular kind of support the hymn enjoyed, accompanied by an organ and chosen mainly by the organist but also quite a lot by the minister, or a combination of both. The type of hymn sung was also interesting given the high volume of modern hymns in the *Church Hymnal*, namely, 86% of the hymns chosen in the sample were "older" or more "traditional".

This was an unusual chapter in that it dealt with three apparently disparate aims, though when analysed, had a logical thread linking them. The first target, that of defining what is an eighteenth century hymn, was successfully discussed and refined

into a working model in the earlier sections. The second goal, to produce a list of hymns from the eighteenth century, did then follow on quite naturally, and finally, the argument naturally and organically developed into a treatise on how hymns are actually chosen, sung and accompanied in today's church. This, in turn, leaves the research ready to evaluate the main survey, that of actually seeing which eighteenth century hymns are sung now and how they have proved to be resilient.

CHAPTER SIX: THE SURVEY

6.1 RESEARCH AIM FOR THIS CHAPTER

This chapter is solely concerned with the three surveys which determine the number of eighteenth century hymns being currently used in contemporary worship and the thoughts and feelings of decision makers in Church music.

With the canon of hymns now selected and following guidance from van Rensburg (2007), this will be done by three methods, namely:

- I. Gathering ongoing data from a number of churches over a fixed period of time.
- II. Quantitative and in-depth questionnaires carried out with music decision-makers in churches, both clerical and laity.
- III. Collecting Snapshot data from a large number of churches on a selected Sunday.

From the point of view of the over-arching problem statement, this chapter will discuss the *modus operandi* for evaluating the main threats that eighteenth century hymns face in worship today.

6.2 RESEARCH METHOD FOR THIS CHAPTER

The first method of research will involve the collection of data from a number of churches over a one-year cycle. During this one year, of course, all the churches' seasons and festivals will have occurred and it will afford the study accurate data which, given the period of time involved, will allow for any localised variables to be aggregated.

A key element in selecting a church will be to confirm who the minister is and his or her views on hymnody. To this purpose, the research will note briefly the specific church's approach, all to help eliminate bias.

Again, to reduce the likelihood of subjectivity, the study will involve the data from ten churches and, although this is a small sample size, it will represent the singing of at least 6,000 hymns, assuming an average parish church singing 600 hymns per annum, when all services in the church calendar are accounted for. These churches were selected for the following reasons:

- i. Combined, they represent as wide a range of experiences as possible.
- ii. They are a mix of cathedrals, parish churches and component churches in groups of parishes.
- iii. They represent a mix of fully trained and regular choirs and organists.
- iv. They represent a mix of rural churches which have occasional choirs and volunteer organists, through to cathedrals which have the highest standards attainable within the confines of their available resources.
- v. They represent a balance where hymn choice comes from clergy of all ranks.
- vi. Finally, the churches come from a wide geographical area and will include urban as well as rural parishes and from as wide a social mix as possible.

6.3 STRUCTURE OF THIS CHAPTER

Essentially this chapter is about the survey:

- who and what are surveyed;
- the sampling methods to be used and why;
- the surveys themselves and their results.

Once the administrative sections of 6.1, 6.2 and 6.3 are completed, 6.4, 6.5 and 6.6 will focus on the three main surveys. Section 6.4 is concerned with the collection of ongoing data from a number of churches over a fixed period of time; section 6.5 comprises the in-depth, quantitative-based questionnaires held with music decision-makers in churches, involving both clerics and laity. Finally, snapshot data collected from a large number of churches on a given Sunday in the church year is the subject of section 6.6.

The data from these surveys will be available as annexures at the end of the study and the findings from these underpin the academic research undertaken thus far.

6.4 COLLECTING DATA FROM A NUMBER OF CHURCHES OVER A FIXED PERIOD OF TIME

Based on Van Rensburg's paper on quantitative data, this will be a simple arithmetical exercise, calculating the percentage of eighteenth century hymns sung, compared to more modern hymns. Pre-eighteenth century hymns are eliminated from the sample as the aim of the research is to analyse why eighteenth century hymns have proved so resilient. In addition, to provide a context for the samples, the following information will accompany each set of data: details of

- each church, its minister, other clergy and key laity;
- organists and other musical staff both voluntary and paid; and
- each church's actual approach to hymnody.

As justified in 6.2, the sample size is set at 6 churches, giving a return of about 5,500 hymns, which is a large enough hymn sample within which to work. This figure is based on the same calculation model used in 1.2.1. In addition, the six churches are a mix of cathedrals and parish churches in both urban and rural environments, using both stipendiary and voluntary organists and choirs. For reasons of consistency, these six churches will form the first half of the twelve churches used in 6.6 and will involve personnel used in 6.5.

6.4.1 The year, days and services on which to base the sample

The fixed period will be one year, which will allow a cycle of all the festivals, dates and peculiarities of the Anglican calendar. To allow records to pass from a local to a central point and to allow collation of data, the year chosen is 2010. This is sufficiently recent

to accommodate current trends yet historic enough to allow reflection. For the record, it is Year A in the common lectionary.

The next decision to make relates to the days and services on which to base the sample and, with a wide range of services in any year, it soon became clear that it would be very difficult to compare like with like. As such, only the services common to all churches were sampled. With not all the churches having evening prayers or evensong, sampling just the morning prayers and morning communion services seemed the most prudent. This criterion also ruled out some obvious key points in the church calendar, with the Easter services being the biggest casualty. Whilst all of the churches had Easter week services, only half of them had an organist or sang hymns, thus ruling out Maundy Thursday and Good Friday. Also affected was Christmas with some Churches not having a Christmas Eve service.

Other festivals not included are the churches' carol services or Harvest Thanksgiving services, for differing reasons. Carol services vary so much in size and scope that any like for like comparisons are unfair; for example, some churches such as Ardess and Castle Archdale have numerous carols sung with St Columba's, using much fewer carols and more soloists. Similarly, Harvest Thanksgivings are also in the evening and in some cases, the afternoon, and for reasons of consistency only morning services are included in this comparison.

In summative tabular form, the dates and services sampled are as follows:

2010 Lectionary Year A

29 November	The first Sunday of Advent
6 December	The second Sunday of Advent
13 December	The third Sunday of Advent
20 December	The fourth Sunday of Advent
25 December	Christmas Day
27 December	The second Sunday of Christmas
3 January	The Epiphany of our Lord
10 January	The first Sunday after the Epiphany
17 January	The second Sunday after the Epiphany
24 January	The third Sunday after the Epiphany
31 January	The fourth Sunday after the Epiphany
7 February	The fifth Sunday after the Epiphany
14 February	The last after the Epiphany

21 February	The first Sunday in Lent
28 February	The second Sunday in Lent
7 March	The third Sunday in Lent
14 March	The fourth Sunday in Lent
21 March	The fifth Sunday in Lent
28 March	The Sixth Sunday in Lent
4 April	Easter Day
11 April	Second Sunday of Easter
18 April	The third Sunday of Easter
25 April	The fourth Sunday of Easter
2 May	The fifth Sunday of Easter
9 May	The sixth Sunday of Easter
16 May	The seventh Sunday of Easter
23 May	Pentecost
30 May	Trinity Sunday
6 June	Second Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 5
13 June	The third Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 6
20 June	The fourth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 7
27 June	The fifth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 8
4 July	The sixth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 9
11 July	The seventh Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 10
18 July	The eighth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 11
25 July	The ninth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 12
1 August	The tenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 13
8 August	The eleventh Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 14
15 August	The twelfth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 15
22 August	The thirteenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 16
29 August	The fourteenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 17
5 September	The fifteenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 18
12 September	The sixteenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 19
19 September	The seventeenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 20
26 September	The eighteenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 21
3 September	The nineteenth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 22
10 September	The twentieth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 23
17 September	The twenty-first Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 24
24 September	The twenty-second Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 25
31 September	The twenty-third Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 26
7 November	All Saints Day / Proper 27
14 November	The twenty-fifth Sunday after Pentecost / Proper 28
21 November	Last Sunday of Pentecost

6.4.2 A List of the churches being sampled

The churches chosen are as follows, with a brief explanation as to why their use in the sample is deemed appropriate.

1. Clogher Cathedral, Co Tyrone

Clogher Cathedral is unique in that it has two diocesan cathedrals, yet one dean and chapter. It is in a rural location and is typical of many village centre churches in rural Ireland.

2. St Patrick's Parish Church, Castle Archdale

This church was selected as it is close to the ancient monastic site of the 12th Century Devenish Round Tower where a strong Christian presence has been maintained in the region since (Anon., 2008). Its relevance to this survey is that the organist is one of the people sampled in the survey; the church has a strong community focus in its locality; and the choir is regularly rehearsed and sings at all main church festivals.

3. Garvary Parish Church

Garvary Parish is in a rural location but draws its congregation from both the surrounding hinterland as well as the suburbs of the nearest busy market town. The church struggles to find a competent, regular organist and suffers from having an aging congregation. That said, the choir is musically ambitious and its leaders and current musicians take the task in hand earnestly and with conviction (W. Downey, interview). There is a rota of voluntary organists.

4. St Columb's Cathedral, Londonderry, Co Londonderry

This city-centre cathedral, built in 1633, has a prominent historical significance in Ireland, both north and south. Interestingly, it was the first cathedral to be built after the Reformation and was the home of hymn writer Mrs Cecil Frances Alexander when her husband, Bishop William Alexander, was made bishop of the diocese in 1867. It has a record of having a choir of men and boys since at least the late 1800s and, most obviously, bears the name of the sixth century Saint Columba (St Columb's Cathedral, 2010). Furthermore, as this cathedral has a regular choir and professional organist, there are no technical restrictions upon the music played. Musically, the cathedral has a good semi-professional Soprano, Alto, Tenor and Bass (SATB) choir, which follows the standards of larger English cathedral choirs. The organist is also semi-professional, and the cathedral publishes music lists for the services (St Columb's Cathedral, 2011c).

The cathedral is in a strongly Roman Catholic area and, therefore, from the standpoint of hymnody it may reflect hymns chosen by those who feel they are marginalised and live under threat, though this aspect is beyond the scope of this research.

5. St Columba's Parish Church, Omagh, Co Tyrone

St Columba's is a parish church in the same diocese as its diocesan cathedral, St Columba's in Londonderry and therefore provides a like-with-like comparison between urban and market town, cathedral and parish church, professional and amateur organist against the backdrop of having the same bishop and therefore overall clerical direction. In addition, its parishioners represent a broad cross-section of society, the church has a strong full-voice, robed choir that is affiliated to the Royal School of Church Music (RSCM) and the church's organist is one of the sampled interviewees, thus providing continuity in that context.

6. St Mary's Church, Ardess, Co Fermanagh

The rural parish church is interesting in that it is at the heartland of a very stable, affluent, rural community. It has a competent organist, a regular choir and the church is led by a well-respected canon. Its choir meets weekly for practices and sings at morning prayers on Sunday. It has a regular, stipendiary organist.

6.4.2 Tabular overview of sampled churches

Church	Clergy	location	organ	organist	choir
Clogher	Dean	historic cathedral in village	2 manual	voluntary	regular unison
St Patrick's Castlearchdale	Rector is a canon	village	2 manual electric	voluntary	regular unison
Garvary Parish Church	Rector is a canon	rural	1 manual digital	voluntary rota	regular unison
St Columb's Londonderry	Dean	small city	4 manual pipe	semi-professional	semi-professional SATB
St Columba's Omagh	Rector is a canon	market town	3 manual pipe	stipendiary	regular SATB
St Mary's Ardess	Rector is a canon	rural affluent village	2 manual pipe	stipendiary	regular unison

6.4.3 The results of the survey

Below is the table of hymns sung on the days identified in 6.4.1. NCH refers to non-*Church Hymnal* hymns. The last church, Ardess Parish Church, submitted hymns as a total list, which probably includes services additional to the 53 weekly ones selected for this sample. However, it does not include a Carol Service or any evening prayers. For the purposes of hymns sung from the eighteenth century canon, the information is still valid, though for other comparative purposes it is not.

Clogher Cathedral

Castle Archdale Parish Church

29	Nov	501	636	136	145	40			119	130	136	137	145	
6	Dec	124	137	421	145	188			501	636	136	145	180	
13		119	388	136	501	383			119	388	136	501	383	
20		160	180	188	164	182			160	180	188	164	182	
25	Xmas Day	172	159	170	166				160	151	182	177	170	
27		119	388	136	501	383			194	189	198	98	160	
3	Jan	194	189	198	98				52	199	204	385	195	485
10		199	391	367	97	597	509		479	334	491	518	383	
17		501	600	695	373	645			349	532	565	578	524	
24		349	374	642	634	658			206	642	421	485	634	
31		370	569	607	578	383			493	607	418	522	321	
7	Feb	358	623	421	660				370	483	495	606	517	525
14		352	551	219	112	575	382		346	334	384	454	75	
21		207	551	630	321				336	567	641	647	524	
28		624	547	607	553				207	551	630	639	655	
7	March	652	557	638	639				624	547	607	547	250	
14		101	523	554	634				652	557	638	32	652	
21		542	543	606	541	361			554	101	627	553	645	
28		108	92	112	373	115			335	543	421	635	207	
4	April	287	283	271	288				271	260	283	288	642	
11		275	270	58	292	269			287	393	270	518	277	
18		277	260	286	567	75			260	385	614	642	383	
25		255	77	584	618	516			252	636	382	96	575	525
2	May	370	522	636	375	524			336	349	385	563	613	
9		96	682	39	350	565	525		52	38	29	80	41	
16		267	284	285	269				268	275	285	292	712	
23		313	293	299	306	568			306	310	295	299	341	386
30		532	276	518	636	454	525		321	77	319	324	316	
6	June	330	597	421	324				6	384	493	565	568	
13		341	607	358	324	383			330	485	532	509	639	
20		318	607	423	664				370	606	642	385	500	525
27		96	687	650	636	517	386		566	388	523	592	524	
4	July	709	584	382	454	485			570	367	658	586	488	
11		336	334	56	492	383			346	614	636	603	522	
18		627	4	80	56	568			335	382	421	518	634	
25		493	624	414	645				584	606	495	639	517	113
1	Aug	570	78	349	495	597	613		493	334	385	573	524	
8		6	596	667	454	383			6	596	644	454	645	
15		29	644	522	373	339			532	384	435	383	642	
22		336	370	451	645				618	682	341	19	575	613
29		658	19	518	483	594	525		29	650	101	373	339	
5	Sep	372	607	566	642	485			365	311	370	523	645	
12		567	614	634	573	524			372	566	607	361	485	
19		52	339	97	643	509			333	614	634	525	104	
26		346	418	349	647				658	391	550	483	597	524
3	Oct	350	393	58	4	652	568		346	636	542	493	485	
10		658	482	565	680	568			492	532	596	454	524	
17		343	388	112	656	115			335	551	451	568	712	
24		370	517	421	383				604	495	522	385	500	509
31		370	381	461	358	349			330	461	425	660	553	
7	Nov	336	382	500	533	509			346	382	213	349	596	645
14		339	334	372	627	375	522		34	281	20	250	485	
21		113	565	658	680	525			52	536	650	550	509	

Garvary Parish Church St Columb's Cathedral

29	Nov	52	509	124	501	145	419	124
6	Dec	537	124	104	124	168	137	175
13		136	384	349	52	166	151	163
20		123	124	435	188	166	149	170
25	Xmas Day	491	457	136	146	175	172	170
27		372	388	189	198	84	188	177
3	Jan	482	52	349	172	151	188	184
10		97	387	382	658	152	194	201
17		285	431	528	491	195	597	6
24		482	400	583	712	352	596	104
31		58	400	606	316	515	52	636
7	Feb	482	207	488	652	293	581	34
14		325	34	418	8	490	325	431
21		547	414	586	207	701	596	595
28		25	542	543	145	518	20	557
7	March	217	238	244	687	616	676	358
14		166	652	195	30	328	932	562
21		217	226	645	81	356	586	517
28		238	217	237	244	630	237	240
4	April	97	226	247	652	364	592	80
11		160	108	271	37	4	47	42
18		271	557	321	332	651	631	565
25		482	657	361	81	482	636	581
2	May	330	321	318	657	525	425	366
9		537	583	596	295	315	695	581
16		488	489	492	281	276	515	627
23		348	562	586	491	597	581	288
30		58	318	583	490	305	634	0
6	June	537	596	606	414	384	431	581
13		330	601	623	81	482	636	581
20		55	318	376	321	4	497	32
27		268	360	431	652	310	219	593
4	July	365	547	596	330	419	517	646
11		100	349	596	712	500	624	562
18		365	435	583	614	596	268	395
25		482	657	361	339	616	215	83
1	Aug	55	376	606	81	325	92	517
8		537	583	596	614	525	636	595
15		348	562	586	321	219	624	557
22		651	318	547	712	651	293	597
29		482	346	398	34	431	567	639
5	Sep	100	349	361	6	658	305	20
12		365	435	583	81	719	624	228
19		365	547	596	635	451	86	642
26		330	601	623	76	616	432	34
3	Oct	537	596	606	639	596	373	316
10		58	318	583	37	4	47	42
17		330	683	657	NCH	597	224	596
24		55	576	606	294	356	592	20
31		482	346	398	481	712	293	22
7	Nov	585	398	349	6	328	396	567
14		651	349	547	651	643	533	112
21		651	318	547	119	325	276	34

St Columba's Parish Church

29	Nov	491	690	276	83	604
6	Dec	136	141	419	164	
13		180	149	162	164	
20		177	182	174	160	
25	Xmas Day	152	149	188	172	
27		160	172	182	177	
3	Jan	491	644	81	189	
10		330	134	305	353	96
17		652	651	712	595	80
24		492	598	529	431	
31		92	518	293	484	190
7	Feb	491	36	503	581	647
14		294	651	592	597	376
21		330	500	515	517	218
28		30	4	596	34	365
7	March	195	398	398	281	
14		207	596	635	562	108
21		657	586	305	709	103
28		491	597	581	288	
4	April	81	518	305	373	108
11		271	276	96	288	
18		655	92	104	557	
25		332	655	104	639	365
2	May	652	592	293	80	567
9		263	525	92	642	346
16		6	655	614	581	643
23		92	655	492	NCH	
30		491	366	601	77	509
6	June	398	518	695	268	
13		294	386	305	96	346
20		6	490	558	517	492
27		81	606	398	643	
4	July	352	92	418	80	
11		294	710	384	581	373
18		336	328	712	597	288
25		652	616	195	42	643
1	Aug	294	710	384	373	581
8		372	518	396	647	
15		491	695	129	96	
22		330	624	525	636	376
29		321	712	614	216	34
5	Sep	6	701	630	595	108
12		492	515	431	346	639
19		657	325	503	80	647
26		81	658	614	636	372
3	Oct	65	606	228	593	431
10		76	616	432	34	642
17		491	712	293	22	326
24		8	719	224	80	281
31		657	651	494	643	376
7	Nov	634	25	636	20	288
14		491	596	635	435	557
21		10	391	598	218	487

Ardess Parish Church

6	132	247	373	518	586
18	134	259	386	518	593
20	134	259	386	518	596
20	134	259	386	522	596
20	135	259	386	522	597
20	149	263	386	523	597
20	149	263	386	523	603
21	151	263	386	525	603
21	151	263	386	525	603
21	152	263	388	525	603
21	152	263	388	525	627
25	152	268	391	525	627
25	152	268	403	527	627
25	152	268	403	528	634
25	152	268	403	528	634
25	160	270	403	528	636
36	162	271	423	528	640
37	163	271	423	528	642
37	164	293	431	528	642
37	164	293	431	528	642
37	164	294	431	529	642
38	172	294	435	534	642
44	172	303	435	536	642
47	172	303	443	536	642
47	172	303	443	536	642
80	174	303	455	549	642
80	174	308	461	553	642
80	174	308	479	553	643
80	177	310	479	553	643
80	177	310	479	553	643
80	177	313	479	557	643
80	177	313	479	557	643
80	179	313	488	557	643
80	182	313	488	557	644
81	182	318	488	558	644
91	195	321	488	558	646
91	195	321	488	559	647
92	195	321	488	559	647
92	195	321	489	559	647
92	195	321	489	562	651
92	195	325	489	562	652
92	196	325	491	562	655
92	198	325	492	562	658
92	201	325	493	562	659
94	201	325	493	566	659
94	201	325	503	566	671
94	213	325	503	566	671
96	218	325	503	566	680
96	218	325	515	566	693
96	218	325	515	566	693
100	218	336	515	566	693
100	219	346	515	566	693
100	219	338	515	578	693
100	228	361	515	580	712
104	231	361	515	582	712
104	236	365	515	582	712
112	244	365	515	582	
112	244	366	515	583	
112	247	366	518	583	
112	247	366	518	583	
112	247	370	518	583	

6.4.4 The number and percentage of eighteenth century hymns being sung both by Church and in total

Clogher Cathedral sung 259 hymns on the selected Sundays, of which 54 are from the eighteenth century, or 20.8%.

Castle Archdale sung 275 hymns on the selected Sundays, of which 60 are from the eighteenth century, or 21.8%.

Garvary Parish Church sang 159 hymns on the selected Sundays, of which 32 are from the eighteenth century, or 20.1%.

St Columb's Cathedral sang 212 on the selected Sundays, of which 15 are from the eighteenth century, or 7%.

St Columba's Parish Church sang 248 hymns on the selected Sundays, of which 43 are from the eighteenth century, or 17.3%.

Ardess Parish Church sang 362 hymns on the selected Sundays, of which 55 are from the eighteenth century, or 15.2%.

All the churches combined sang 1515 hymns on the selected Sundays, of which 259 are from the eighteenth century, or 17.1%

Discounting the last church, Ardess Parish Church, as its data was slightly different from the other parishes, the figure was 1153 hymns sung on the selected Sundays, of which 204 are from the eighteenth century, or 17.7%.

6.5 Qualitative interview surveys

This section discusses the construction, sample type and sample size of the qualitative, in-depth questionnaires held with music decision-makers in churches.

According to Kotler and Armstrong (1990:92), a survey-based research is the best method for gathering descriptive information and is the only method used in research study. Furthermore, they state that despite its benefits, "the main drawbacks of personal interviewing are costs and sampling problems". However,

since cost is not an issue in this exercise and consequently, there are no real restrictions on sampling size, other than physical practicalities, both negativities are *de facto* eliminated.

In order to carry out this survey, the first priority is the sampling plan, the number of people who will adequately represent the views of as wide a range of people as possible who are either involved in or have a knowledge of hymnody from a Church of Ireland perspective. Kotler and Armstrong (1990:95) call this process “the design of the sampling unit”, comprising:

- Who will be surveyed?
- What will be the sample size?
- Which sampling procedure will be used?

6.5.1 The sampling unit and size

The type of people surveyed needs to include clergy as well as laity, musicians as well as non-musicians and congregation as well as service participants. For reasons of balance then, the following categories are represented.

- Clergy of all ranks: lay, curate, canon, archdeacon and bishop;
- Laity from all aspects of the church life, namely vestry members, volunteers and congregational members of the Church;
- Musicians: professional, stipendiary and amateur.

These samples are drawn from local churches, parish churches and cathedrals to reflect differing foci of worship.

In addition, all samples are drawn from within the context of:

- urban churches serving a city congregation;
- market town churches serving a mix of town and rural churchgoers;
- countryside and village churches serving a mainly rural community; as well as
- farming and agri-economy workers and their families.

➤ An income mix which includes all social classes.

Taking the above criteria into account, the following individuals have been identified as a suitable sample unit.

Elizabeth Seale

Profile: Elizabeth is organist in a large market town parish church. She is a life-time Anglican and Head of Music in a nearby school. She runs a regular full four-part choir and is married to the Church's rector.

John McDowell

Profile: The current Bishop of Clogher.

Glenn Moore

Profile: Glenn is a stipendiary organist in a strong, affluent, rural parish church which has a strong evangelical rather than traditional approach to worship. He is also the full-time diocesan secretary.

Margaret Elliott

Profile: Margaret is a recently retired medical doctor who has been a church organist in her small town parish church for over 30 years. As well as being a busy lay minister, she is a keen scholar of church music and is known as someone who puts a great deal of thought into her choice of hymns.

John Irvine

Profile: This candidate is lay preacher and a key member of his local parish church. He takes a strong interest in the hymns sung in his church and is a member of the choir.

Harry Allen

Profile: Retired professional medic (an ear specialist in large regional hospital) and committed Anglican, this respondent is an amateur organist and musician who has

spent a life-time in Church of Ireland music. He has a profound knowledge of hymns and canticles, the latter of which he is especially interested in. An example of his commitment to church music is that he owns a small professional practice pipe organ in his own home.

Alan Capper

Profile: The Revd Capper is the rector of a busy, small market town in a rural location. As a youth he was a chorister both at Armagh Cathedral and at St Mark's Parish Church, also in the city. Chosen for the fact that his father was a prominent church organist in the Diocese of Derry and Raphoe, Alan grew up steeped in church music and hymnody.

Jim Kerr

Profile: This interviewee is a churchwarden in a cathedral, a diocesan historian and retired headmaster.

Glenn West

Profile: This interviewee is a Canon of St Patrick's Cathedral, Dublin as well being rector of a rural parish. He is the Church of Ireland's leading representative on inter-faith matters and is known locally as a forward-thinking minister.

Summary table for interview sample

	Church location			Church type		Musician-ship level (if applicable)		Clergy (if applicable)			Laity (if applicable)
	urban	market town	rural / village	cathedral	parish church	organist	Chorister	Bishop / Dean	Curate / Rector	Lay Reader	Congregation member
Mrs Elizabeth Seale		✓			✓	✓					
Bishop John McDowell	✓			✓				✓			
Mr Glenn Moore			✓		✓	✓					
Dr Margaret Elliott			✓		✓	✓					
Mr John Irvine			✓		✓		✓				✓
Mr Harry Allen	✓				✓		✓				✓
Rev Alan Capper		✓			✓				✓		
Mr Jim Kerr		✓		✓						✓	
Canon Glenn West			✓		✓				✓		
Mrs Wendy Downey			✓		✓	✓					

6.5.2 The sample procedure

Where possible, interviews were conducted in person, forming the basis of a discussion. When this was not possible, for whatever reason, the interview will take place by telephone. During the discussion the key points were recorded on paper and interviewees were asked to accept the interview being recorded for ease of understanding afterwards.

6.5.3 The questions asked in the survey

The details of the thesis were outlined to the interviewee, providing them with the title and the objectives of the thesis. This information was derived directly from Chapter 1.

Next, the candidates were provided with the list of the one hundred and three hymns identified as being from the eighteenth century.

Question 1: In your view, how often are these hymns sung in services led by you or in services or which you have had a decision-making input?

Question 2: Why do you think eighteenth century hymns have been resilient? For this particular question, it was important to initiate a discussion on hymnody in general as this will reveal other related facts.

6.6 SNAPSHOT DATA OVER A LARGE NUMBER OF CHURCHES ON A GIVEN SUNDAY

The Sundays from which samples are derived, are as follows:

1st Sunday in Advent

4th Sunday of Epiphany

3rd Sunday before Lent

1st Sunday after Trinity

All Saints' Day

These dates were chosen on the following grounds:

- i. Taking the Anglican calendar, the 1st Sunday in Advent is used, as it is the start of the liturgical year. As it is the fourth Sunday before Christmas, it is a time when few churches use carols, so for the purpose of gaining an overall picture of the church at this time of the year it is interesting.
- ii. The fourth Sunday of Epiphany is suitably placed after Christmas and before Easter and thus, not much influenced by seasonal hymns.
- iii. Also, the third Sunday before Lent is a suitable time before Easter when most choirs are in full rehearsal period and the specialist Easter hymns are not fully integrated into the services.
- iv. The first Sunday after Trinity is usually around the time of year when church choirs reduce the number of regular practices. Choirs and churches that use students also see their young people leave for summer examinations, so any time chosen after this period may produce a bias towards hymns chosen for their level of difficulty rather than for their appropriateness.
- v. All Saints' Day is chosen as it is the first day, usually after Harvest Thanksgiving, that churches may use as a point of focus between then and Advent or Christmas.

6.6.1 Deciding the sample for the snapshot data

The criteria for deciding which churches to focus on for the snapshot data are largely similar to the relevant criteria from 6.5.1, aimed to give a balanced mix, namely:

- Urban churches serving a city congregation;
- market town churches serving a mix of town and rural churchgoers;
- countryside and village churches serving mainly rural communities as well as farming and agri-economy workers and their families.

Deciding exactly which churches/parishes on which to base this sample is more difficult, though. Whilst the temptation would be to select an urban parish, a rural parish and a semi-urban/rural parish, one has to bear in mind that such a selection will be based on which parishes have the best records. A fire in the early 1900s destroyed most centrally held records and consequently, subsequent records are held in a more disparate manner. Other factors, too, play a part, such as the ability to compare like with like.

The period of one year will be based on sampling the church calendar of 2009/10 with a reserve year sampled, where possible on 2008/09. The reason for this two-year span is to allow a back-up record to be used from the corresponding service a year previous, if a church's 2009/10 records were incomplete. For example, if it turned out that a month or so was missing from one church for one year, it would allow the research to take the previous or following year's data for the same period. Whilst this is not ideal it is a practical contingency plan which would save having to go back and re-do all the churches again for a different given period and is a recognised sampling procedure (Kotler and Armstrong, 1990, 152).

6.6.2 The churches chosen for the snapshot data section of the research

1. Clogher Cathedral
2. St Patrick's Parish Church, Castle Archdale
3. Holy Trinity Church, Garvary
4. St Columb's Cathedral, Londonderry
5. St Columba's Parish Church, Omagh
6. Ardess Parish Church.

For all the above churches, see 6.4.1 for further details.

7. Cleenish Parish Church

This church is in a suburban location, four miles from a large market town. Its congregation is a mix of rural and increasingly white-collar families who live in one of the village's housing developments. It has a voluntary organist playing on a simple electronic single manual instrument and uses an occasional unison choir who sing at most services. The choir prepares for at least the three main points in the Church calendar, namely Harvest, Christmas and Easter.

The rector of the church is a canon and the parish serves a small rural church as well.

8. Derryvullen North Parish Church, Irvinestown

In many ways, Derryvullen North should be similar to Cleenish in that it is a similar distance from the same town centre, but in a different direction. However, it is entirely dissimilar in that its congregation is almost entirely rural as the church is set in open countryside. That said, they are fortunate in that they have an organists' rota shared between a retired cathedral organist and a music graduate whose first study is piano. In this respect, accompaniment of any hymn, whatever its perceived level of difficulty, is not an issue. Its choir is typical of many rural churches, with a large ladies' unison section and a handful of male unison singers, with no harmony singing whatsoever. The choir prepares anthems for all main church services and all canticles are sung.

9. Holy Trinity Church, Lisnaskea

Lisnaskea Parish Church serves a small market town with a population of fewer than 3,000 people (NISRA, 2010). The nearest parish churches are around five miles away on the south-western and north-western sides.

Despite its size and the number of parishioners, the musical output from this church is quite modest: an occasional unison choir, a simple organ and a voluntary organist. In this respect it provides an interesting subject for a sample as it satisfies the criterion of being a “rank and file” rural church with no certain musical ambitions. The present minister’s father was a well-respected organist in St Mark’s Church, Armagh and St Columba’s church, Omagh and the minister himself was brought up as a RSCM-trained choirboy and chorister. As such, the hymns chosen, should he have any input, would at least reflect a musically and hymnodistically-aware judgement.

10. Maguiresbridge Parish Church

The small village of Maguiresbridge, named after the Maguire family, was founded around 1760 (NISRA, 2010) and as such is representative of places with historical significance. It has a small but sustainable congregation comprising a mix of farmers and white and blue collar workers. It lies eight miles from a major market town and is four miles on either side of the main road that passes through it and from its neighbouring parish churches. Despite its small size and modest facilities, the church does a lot to promote music, though its main choir is a unison one. The rector of the Church is the Diocesan officer for lay readers and therefore enjoys a special relationship with the laity.

11. Clones Group of Parish Churches

This parish church is selected for a number of reasons. First, it is a parish which contains four churches, all rural or semi-rural and some with fewer than 100 members. Second, it is on the border of Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland, which in effect brings its own sense of history and tradition, and finally,

relatively rarely in the Church of Ireland, it is led by a woman rector, the Revd Canon Helene Steed, who is Swedish and thus gives the research another dimension to its responses. Here, the component churches work on a rota basis with a group service should a 5th week lie in the month. Although groups of churches like this are difficult to draw data from, they are important as there are quite a few churches in this situation (Moore, 2011).

12. Tempo Parish Church

The last church to be sampled, Tempo Parish Church, is in a small village with a population of just 533 and an equipopulous hinterland (NISRA, 2010). It is a village equally split between Protestants and Roman Catholics with the former being divided into a number of denominations, the Presbyterian and Methodist churches being situated within a few hundred metres of the parish church. This church is selected because of its modest means; it survives, but only just, because of the small congregation pulling together and achieving. The unison choir is small and irregular in attendance, and the voluntary organist plays a simple single-manual electric instrument. The parish includes a smaller church in a nearby hamlet location.

6.6.3 The results of the snapshot data

There are several points of note in relation to the data given below.

- All percentages are rounded up to one decimal point.
- Where Cleenish and Clones groups of parishes are concerned, the data was collected from whichever church within the group had the service that day. Although that might not seem to be comparing like-with-like, the reality is that this happens regularly and increasingly, so it needs to be reflected. With the same minister, though, such bias is minimised.
- Finally, the number of hymns sung at services varied at some times in the year. There is no specific reason for this other than the fact that morning prayer services, rather than communion services, may account for more hymns being sung.

6.6.3.1 The 1st Sunday in Advent

Church	Hymns sung on the first Sunday in Advent, 2010				
Clogher Cathedral	501	636	136	145	
Castle Archdale PC	119	130	136	137	145
Garvary PC	52	509	124		
St Columb's Cathedral	501	145	419	124	321
St Columba's PC	491	690	276	83	604
Ardess PC	112	134	132	553	
Cleenish Parishes ¹	606	20	10		
Derryvullen North PC	509	137	604	637	
Lisnaskea PC	651	25	376	528	
Maguiresbridge PC	269	123	118	365	
Clones Parishes ²	250	124	263		
Tempo PC	136	318	419	40	

The snapshot data from this reveals that 53.6% of the hymns sung are from the canon of eighteenth century hymns.

¹ Cleenish Group of Parishes is a group of four churches who have services on a rota basis

² Clones Group of Parishes is a group of four churches who have services on a rota basis

6.6.3.2 4th Sunday after the Epiphany

Church	Hymns sung on the 4 th Sunday after the Epiphany, 2010				
Clogher Cathedral	624	547	607	553	
Castle Archdale PC	207	551	630	639	
Garvary PC	25	542	543		
St Columb's Cathedral	145	518	20	557	
St Columba's PC	30	4	596	34	365
Ardess PC	529	644	634		
Cleenish Parishes	207	630	384		
Derryvullen North PC	100	52	528		
Lisnaskea PC	528	581	124	529	
Maguiresbridge PC	634	97	373	634	
Clones Parishes	607	58	52		
Tempo Parish	316	515	98	636	

The snapshot data from this reveals that 33.3% of the hymns sung are from the canon of eighteenth century hymns.

6.6.3.3 3rd Sunday before Lent

Church	Hymns sung on the 3 rd Sunday before Lent, 2010				
Clogher Cath	199	391	367	97	
Castle Archdale	479	334	491	518	
Garvary Parish	97	387	382		
St Columb's	658	152	194	201	528
St Columba's	330	134	305	353	597
Ardess Parish	112	634	528		
Cleenish Group	374	569	607		
Derryvullen N	352	8	492		
Lisnaskea	581	644	384	123	
Maguiresbridge	97	695	523	583	
Clones Group	557	383	587	123	
Tempo Parish	219	660	607	374	

The snapshot data from this reveals that 32.6% of the hymns sung are from the canon of eighteenth century hymns.

6.6.3.4 1st Sunday after Trinity

Church	Hymns sung on the 1 st Sunday after Trinity, 2010				
Clogher Cath	341	607	358	324	
Castle Archdale	330	485	532	509	
Garvary Parish	330	601	623		
St Columb's	81	482	636	581	
St Columba's	294	386	305	96	346
Ardess Parish	492	647	92	80	
Cleenish Group	414	276	305		
Derryvullen N	528	581	583		
Lisnaskea	361	712	419	219	
Maguiresbridge	29	596	349		
Clones Group	644	667	528		
Tempo Parish	372	522	454	597	

The snapshot data from this reveals that 13.5% of the hymns sung are from the canon of eighteenth century hymns.

6.6.3.5 All Saints' Day

Church	Hymns sung on All Saint's Day, 2010				
Clogher Cathedral	336	382	500	533	
Castle Archdale PC	346	382	213	349	596
Garvary PC	585	398	349		
St Columb's Cathedral	6	328	396	567	500
St Columba's PC	634	25	636	20	288
Ardess PC	370	461	336	346	671
Cleenish Parishes	294	596	382		
Derryvullen North PC	113	553	10	218	
Lisnaskea PC	658	550	119		
Maguiresbridge PC	637	712	553	112	
Clones Parishes	218	492	58		
Tempo PC	8	25	218	81	

The snapshot data from this reveals that 27.1% of the hymns sung are from the canon of eighteenth century hymns.

6.5.3.6 Totals

Event	percentage	18 th Century hymns	All hymns
1 st Sunday in Advent	53.6%	15	28
4 th Sunday after the Epiphany	33.3%	9	27
3 rd Sunday before Lent	32.6%	15	46
1 st Sunday in Trinity	13.5%	5	37
All Saints' Day	27.1%	13	48
Total	30.6%	57	186

6.6 ADDRESSING THE RESEARCH QUESTION

The primary focus of this chapter is to provide details of the three surveys:

- an ongoing survey from a number of churches over a fixed period of time;
- in-depth quantitative surveys from church members; and
- snapshot data derived from a large number of churches on selected Sundays.

With the administrative tasks detailed descriptively in 6.1, 6.2 and 6.3, each of the three surveys was allocated a full subsection, with the first one, 6.4, accounting for the collection of data from a number of churches over a fixed period of time.

This was an interesting task to complete as it required an industry standard of quantitative research models in order to make the survey accountable. As it transpired, Van Rensburg's paper on data handling provided this and the sample size was fixed at six churches. Also, the sample included a cross section of churches ranging from the tiny and rural to the urban and large. A by-product of this was that such churches were led by a wide range of clergy of all ranks and were served by an equally diverse range of choirs and organists. 6.4.1 formalised the criteria to a greater level, examining the apposite days on which to base the sampling procedure, noting in particular that days like Christmas Day and Harvest Thanksgiving were probably not suitable festivals for they would provide an imbalance in the results due to many subjective and localised reasons.

The lectionary year on which to base the survey required another decision to be reached in this chapter and the year of 2010 was selected. The reason for this choice was not that it was "Year A" of the Lectionary, but that it was the year that worked out best from a practical standpoint.

Initially, the aim was to sample three consecutive Years A, B and C from the Common Lectionary but it soon transpired that records were very difficult to obtain and that recent years would be more suitable, even though they broke the Lectionary cycle.

The reasons for records being difficult to find were as follows:

- Not all churches recorded hymns in their “preacher’s book”.
- In most cases, there was no obligation for churches to maintain records of hymns sung. It was done on a personal basis for reasons of private interest.
- Only the organists seemed to have the records and not all did.
- Some records were haphazardly organised; at best they were recorded neatly in a folder (such as Irvinestown PC) and at worst in the back of a hymn book (Garvary PC).
- Sometimes hymns were only recorded by name, making the data collection not only arduous but also practically very difficult, depending on the organist’s handwriting and how many note-making shortcuts they took. For example, *Come down O love divine* and *Love divine* was one such record that was difficult to decipher.
- The further back in time, the more difficult it was to obtain records.

As some of the research for 6.5 had started at this stage, it became clear that churches only paid cursory attention to the hymn lectionary published in *The Companion to the Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005:937-948): indeed, not all organists had the text. This proved to be a great consolation, as finding three consecutive years in the lectionary cycle was proving to be a great obstacle. On this basis and underpinned by the principles referred to by Kotler and Van Rensburg on quantitative sampling, a single year’s sample was deemed adequate. Consequently, all church contacts were requested to furnish details for three years, 2009, 2010 and 2011, the feeling being that if some dates were incomplete, then a date from the previous or following year could be substituted so at least some degree of continuity was assured.

The selected days on which to set the survey proved to be an issue for great contemplation and in the end the Sundays chosen gave a balance of the key events. For these reasons Christmas, Harvest and Holy Week services are omitted, as well as other occasional services. 6.4.1 also deals with the reasons why morning services

are chosen to be sampled, as well as dealing with other minutiae regarding sample selection.

6.4.2 provides reasons why certain churches are sampled, with some interesting reasons emerging that validate the cross-section of examples chosen. In the Church of Ireland, only one cathedral, St Patrick's Cathedral, has anything approaching the standards of the English Cathedral system in terms of having a full-time choir, organist and choir school. Though the aspiration is to have representations from this sector, these simply are not available and would not reflect today's Church. Even the large city cathedrals of Belfast and Cork have choirs that are similar to their Church of England counterparts in name only, even modest towns on the UK mainland having a stronger choral tradition, with Hexham Abbey as a prime example. In contrast, despite the wording on the website giving the impression it is of international standing, the facts are as follows:

Hexham Abbey

- Town population according to the 2001 census: 11,008. It is 25 miles from the major city of Newcastle-upon-Tyne.

Services involving the choir

- | | | |
|-------------|---------|-----------------------------|
| ➤ Sunday | 10.00am | Sunday morning service |
| ➤ Sunday | 6.30pm | Choral Evensong (term time) |
| ➤ Wednesday | 6.30pm | Choral Evensong (term time) |
| ➤ Thursday | 6.30pm | Choral Evensong (term time) |

Choirs

- Boys' and men's choir (amateur)
- Girls' choir
- Chamber Choir
- Choir for older teenagers

Resources

- Bell-ringing

- Almost weekly concerts and a regular programme of lunchtime concerts

Personnel

- Full-time Director of Music
- Part-time Assistant Organist
- Two part-time professional choirmasters

St Anne's Cathedral, Belfast

Town population: 286,323, though Belfast and its immediate hinterland accounts for two thirds of Northern Ireland's population of 1,600,000 (Belfast City Council's 2008 estimate based on the 2001 census).

Services involving the choir

- Sunday 11.00am Sunday choral Eucharist service
- Sunday 3.30pm Choral Evensong (term time)

Choirs

- Boys' and men's choir (amateur)

Resources

- Very few concerts

Personnel

- Part-time Director of Music
- Part-time Assistant Organist

Thus Londonderry's St Columb's Cathedral was an apposite example. They appear to have slightly stronger resources than a parish church but their choir is still voluntary and they only sing one service per week; in this aspect they represent the best of regional praise in terms of music being performed.

6.4.2 is simply a tabular presentation of the relevant features of the sampled churches and 6.4.3 discusses the hymns sung on the chosen days with the exception being Ardess Parish Church who submitted their hymns as a total list. As such, it was

not possible to express like-for-like data for this Church. Finally, in 6.4.3 there is a summary of the results, which are discussed fully in 7.6.4.

The qualitative interviews were discussed in 6.5, where the rationale and background to the sampling models were initiated. The research used models agreed by industry standards according to Kotler and Armstrong and in 6.5.1 the rationale behind who was interviewed and for what reasons was evaluated. Whilst the processes clarified in this section show the final list of interviewees, this is not the whole story. As in 6.4, the practicalities of finding people who could speak with authority on hymnody were strewn with difficulty. Because I had anticipated this to some degree, interviewees were furnished with guidance notes in which the outline summary of the research was explained as well as the list of eighteenth century notes. This was sent in advance by email or post. Despite this, the following problems occurred when carrying out the interviews:

- It was difficult to get respondents only to answer the question and not be subjective. Bishop McDowell and Glenn Moore were outstanding in this respect.
- People obviously had their pet hates and likes, sometimes wishing to speak more on these topics than anything else.
- Some people contradicted themselves, and this called their responses into question. For this reason, one individual minister's responses have limited use when moving beyond obtaining basic information.
- Despite showing the interviewees the list of eighteenth century hymns, the terms "old/older hymn", "traditional hymn" and "eighteenth century hymn" became almost interchangeable for most of the respondents.
- Sometimes a modern hymn such as those by Timothy Dudley-Smith, for example, which are written in a pre-nineteen hundreds style, were confused with older hymns and in the case of one minister, eighteenth century hymns.

The actual questions asked in the interview are recorded in 6.5.3, which follows the brief but important criteria for setting the sampling criteria. This being quantitative research and based entirely on the quality of the conversation, the questions were

deliberately open-ended. Almost all the interviews were held in person, with just two by telephone. In the two cases where telephone interviews resulted, both were due to extenuating circumstances and also both respondents talked freely and openly, without restriction. The results of these responses are discussed in 7.5.

The final section of the body of this chapter, 6.6, accounts for the snapshot data, the third element of the research. There was quite a lot to consider in this area, the first being which Sundays to choose. Ultimately, the services selected seemed appropriate enough, a point shared when Bishop McDowell's counsel was sought on this matter and he agreed that the days chosen were apposite and would give a good overview. With the dates decided, the mix of sample churches was considered, with the findings discussed in 6.6.1. On face value, this seems a relatively easy exercise, but gaining access to some of the churches' records proved difficult, for the same reasons as identified earlier in this section. That said, the final list achieves a good and practical balance ranging from cathedral to small, rural parishes, led by a similar diverse range of ministers of all ranks, age groups and gender.

One thing that did cause concern in this area was the varying number of hymns sung in different churches, with some churches using three hymns per service and others up to five. However, that reflects the practicality of every-day life in the Church of Ireland and, as such, it is a realistic snapshot.

In 6.6.2 the churches selected are listed, with the new churches added on from 6.4 being described in order to provide justification for their inclusion. The results are overviewed in 6.6.3 and are fully discussed in 7.6, though already it is interesting to see how many hymns from the eighteenth century are actually still sung, with the Advent Sunday service seeing almost half the hymns sung being from that era.

Overall, this chapter presents the considerable practical difficulties faced in determining the following:

- Who will be surveyed?
- What will be the sample size?
- Which sampling procedure will be used?

These challenges are all overcome so that collation of the results of the surveys produces some interesting results. The aim of the chapter, to research the number of hymns being sung in today's church using three sampling methods, was achieved.

CHAPTER SEVEN: FINDINGS FROM THE RESEARCH; THE REASONS WHY EIGHTEENTH CENTURY HYMNS HAVE PROVED RESILIENT IN CONTEMPORARY ANGLICAN (CHURCH OF IRELAND) WORSHIP

7.1 INTRODUCTION AND RELATION TO PREVIOUS CHAPTER

This chapter takes the data and responses from the interviewees identified in the previous chapter and discusses them in terms of the various reasons for the resilience of eighteenth century hymns in contemporary Anglican worship.

While the previous chapter deals largely with setting up the surveys, deciding who was being interviewed, what data was being collected and identifying the processes to use, this chapter deals with the interpretation of the responses and offers some conclusions as to why the over-arching question remains valid.

7.2 RESEARCH METHOD FOR THIS CHAPTER

This chapter draws on all the data collected in 6.4, 6.5 and 6.6, the on-going data collected from a number of churches over a fixed period of time, the questionnaires and the snapshot data.

One problem identified in this research was the term “eighteenth century hymn”, a label which some interviewees struggled with, confusing it with any hymn that was not modern or contemporary, one minister especially. Care was taken as to when to explain the differences in terminology to all respondents. Also, when interviewees did say “older hymns” in their responses, clarification was sought to ascertain exactly what they meant from the point of view of periodisation.

7.3 STRUCTURE OF THIS CHAPTER

This chapter is divided into three main sub-chapters. The first, 7.4, addresses the general reasons why the questionnaire gave the results it did. These are reasons that were not easily assigned to other categories and therefore reflect more general trends.

The second section, 7.5, addresses the main areas for resilience, as found by the qualitative research, under the headings: liturgical, socio-historic, literary, musical, clerical and congregational reasons. These labels were determined after examining all possible responses and grouping them accordingly.

- **Liturgical reasons** include the nature of the text of the hymn and how this fits in not only with the Church as a body, but also any relationship the hymn may have with the lectionary year.
- **Socio-historic reasons** include more ephemeral considerations, such as a hymn's history, not only as a stand-alone form of worship, but also within the wider contexts of meaning, provenance and setting in overall praise.
- **Literary reasons** for the resilience of certain hymns take into account their form as pieces of poetry or open prose, which many were written as. This also includes meaning, syntax, language and literary style. Arguably, a more obvious reason for a hymn's resilience is its musical attributes. Clerical and congregational input play their part - two sides of the pulpit providing the force and influence required to keep a hymn alive for so many years.

The final section, 7.6, accounts for the interpretation of 6.4 and 6.6, namely, the findings from the on-going and snapshot data and how these help explain why 18th century hymns have proved resilient. It is divided into two sections:

- 7.6.1 discusses the selected Sundays and the hymns sung on those days.
- 7.6.2 evaluates the twelve churches selected and analyses the data from this perspective.

7.4 ANALYSIS OF THE ONGOING DATA FROM 6.4

Though the number of eighteenth century hymns sung in the sampled churches is expressed in 6.4.3.2 as being 17.7%, a deeper analysis highlights a more interesting picture. Furthermore, with 15% being the number of eighteenth century hymns in the *Church Hymnal*, 17.7% becomes significant, especially when compared to the large number of post-eighteenth century hymns available to choose from.

There are many issues or aspects to consider when discussing these results: the first being an individual church-by-church analysis in order to understand the way each approaches worship; to determine if this is typical or atypical; and finally, to ascertain whether the statistics provide any overall patterns.

7.4.1 The validity of the data in an island-wide context

Chapter 6.4.2 describes how each individual church is assessed for its suitability as a sample parish. With the data complete, it is interesting to see how a deeper study suggests more composite reasons why eighteenth century hymns have proved to be resilient.

On a *prima facie* basis, the three large coastal cities of Dublin, Belfast and Cork dominate the island of Ireland and these conurbations speak for a large percentage of the population of both countries. For example, according to the 2001 Northern Ireland census, almost 1 million of Northern Ireland's 1.7 million inhabitants live in either Belfast or the neighbouring local government districts (NISRA, 2010) and in the Republic of Ireland the population distribution is similar, with 1.2 million of the country's 4.2 million living in the Dublin area and 450,000 in the Cork area (Central Statistics Office, 2012, 2006 census figures).

Beyond these settlements, both Northern Ireland and The Republic of Ireland are rural environments with large market towns and small cities dotted almost

equidistantly from each other as “capital” county towns or places where settlements grew organically in locations such as sea estuaries, river crossings or “narrowings”, and natural points of fortification. There is little variation in these towns and cities from a population point of view with the larger ones such as Limerick, Londonderry and Galway not significantly more populous than the smaller regional centres.

Against these facts the Church of Ireland’s small population means that musically it can at best, only aspire to emulating the standards reached by the most modest English Cathedral, Abbey or large Collegiate Church. In the Republic of Ireland, for example, the Church of Ireland population is just 125,000 (Central Statistics Office, 2012) and in Northern Ireland 260,000 (NISRA, 2010), a point which is also discussed in a different context in 6.6. The total number of Church of Ireland worshippers is just under 385,000. There are no figures available for migrant English Anglicans working or studying in either Northern or Southern Ireland, but in any case it would be difficult to imagine that there are any more than 400,000 Anglicans in the island of Ireland at any time (see Chapter 1.1.1).

With this in mind, as indeed the research indicates, the Church of Ireland’s choral tradition is at best, aspirational. Even the largest churches struggle to find quality organists and choristers, a fact not helped by the fact that most good singers and organists view modern hymns with suspicion at best and at worst with derision. From their perspective though, this is perhaps a valid standpoint as some contemporary hymns afford only limited opportunities for harmony singing.

Largely because of the demography of the Church of Ireland, it is easy to classify many of the parishes into three approximate categories. This process derives from the research carried out in Chapter 5.2 as well as from the more specific surveys described in Chapter 6.4 – 6.6.

- i. **Cathedrals and large parish churches** - Based mainly in town centres, this category also includes some churches that are in the suburbs of the three main cities. The four surveys (5.2, 6.4, 6.5 and 6.6) produced statistics that were consistent across churches, enabling like-with-like comparisons to be made.

These showed that in the case of large churches and urban cathedrals, music is led either by a full-time or by a stipendiary organist, with a four-part SATB choir meeting at least weekly and an organist deciding which hymns are played, sometimes with the help, guidance or even intervention from clergy (Moore, 2011).

- ii. **Small town parish churches or rural churches** - These have a stable, medium-sized congregation, usually a regular but often untrained organist and a strong choir, which is usually unison or else augmented for special services.
- iii. **Rural churches and those in an area where there is no minister and / or a small congregation** - These churches seem to live hand-to-mouth, aspiring to have better quality music but surviving on available resources, which effectively means a mainly unison choir, a voluntary organist and the minister having a bigger say in the choosing of hymns.

7.4.2 An analysis of individual Churches' responses and their approaches to worship

In many ways it was possible to group some of the churches together, at least in terms of size, location, the type of congregation and the approach to worship. In this respect, Clogher Cathedral, Castle Archdale Parish Church and Garvary Parish Church are three such parishes. As well as the aforementioned similarities, all three have clergy who are of at least canon status, all have part-time voluntary organists and all struggle desperately to sustain a choir. Of course, there are subtle differences.

- In the case of Clogher Cathedral, the organist is a volunteer who is devoted to the post and has the ability to play any of the hymns.
- Castle Archdale has a rota of two organists, a lady who is limited in her ability to play difficult hymns and the other a retired cathedral organist. The former organist works closely with the minister and vestry to promote the Church and is an active member of the congregation while the retired cathedral organist simply plays whatever hymns are selected for him. In this respect, the Church has a problem; the cathedral organist has immense ability but is not really part of the

Church community so his input into the choir and other hymnodist developments is limited while the other organist is very keen to promote hymn singing but is of limited ability.

- Garvary Parish Church – This church is the least endowed of these three churches in terms of musical scope; indeed sometimes it so hard for them to get an organist that the minister himself has to play during the service. Consequently, their hymn choice is very limited and restricted. This is the *real* Church of Ireland, revealed in practical terms and from the discussions that emerged from the research described in 6.5. Darling and Davison’s inclusion of an index of hymns in *The Church Hymnal*, which have been recorded on CD for use during a service, confirm that this is clearly an everyday problem for many small parishes with insufficient resources.

The number of eighteenth century hymns sung in each of these three churches shows similar high interest in older hymns, with 20.8% of Clogher Cathedral’s hymns, 21.8% of Castle Archdale’s hymns and 20.1% of Garvary’s hymns all being from the canon chosen for this research. This is significantly higher than the number of hymns in the *Church Hymnal* from this period.

As representatives of the main parish churches in their respective towns, St Columb’s Cathedral and St Columba’s Parish Church in Omagh represent two ends of the musical scale. St Columb’s Cathedral employs a part-time organist but on quite a few weekly hours and St Columba’s Parish Church has a music graduate stipendiary organist. The choir of St Columb’s has a choir of men and boys and sings two services on a Sunday, while St Columba’s is a mixed SATB choir singing at one service on Sunday with a reduced choir for evensong. It is difficult and arguably inappropriate to use the word “better” or “worse” in a study such as this, but on the balance of work achieved beyond their respective churches, St Columb’s has made recordings, broadcasts and sung at some very high profile services, whereas St Columba’s remains simply a church choir to lead the service, so in this respect St Columb’s could be perceived as more successful.

The choices of hymns from these churches are to some degree comparable but their approach to music is very different. St Columb's is a very formal church and aspires in its services towards the English cathedral model, whereas St Columba's is much more interactive; an example of this is the strong pastoral role taken by the clergy. Also, modern technology is used in the service to the extent where the hymns, words and prayers are all put on a Microsoft PowerPoint display throughout the service.

St Columba's Parish Church uses almost as many eighteenth century hymns as the three smaller rural churches, 17.3%, but St Columb's Cathedral is the only church sampled to sing fewer eighteenth century hymns than the comparable percentage in the hymnbook, 7%. Such figures do not suggest that the Cathedral uses modern hymns, it does not necessarily; it just uses fewer eighteenth century hymns. In some ways this is not entirely surprising, for the evangelical hymns such as those by the Wesleys would not necessarily suit the high rite of the cathedral and a cursory examination of the hymns as listed in 6.4.3.1 reveals that Victorian hymns feature very highly in the Cathedral's own canon.

Ardess Parish Church is more difficult to categorise. Although it is a rural church outside a remote village, it is more akin to a suburban church in that it has a very affluent, white-collar congregation, underpinned by a wealthy farmer class (Moore, 2011). As such, it enjoys a degree of sophistication, with the church having an elaborate support network of full-time parish workers, a youth office, and a busy parish centre and office (Ardess, 2009).

The Church's approach to worship is contemporary and interactive, using Microsoft PowerPoint to display the hymns and words, regularly using praise groups and always trying to be innovative (Moore, 2011). Despite this apparent uniqueness it is quintessentially Anglican, as the data indicates: the congregation enjoys singing many eighteenth century hymns. In addition, the Church organist, whose opinions are fully discussed in 7.5, speaks of the "singability" of these hymns (meaning strong melodic line, well-worked harmonies and suitable cadences and modulations as to inspire and uplift the singers) and enjoys their usage in all services.

7.4.3 An analysis of the selected Sundays: a chronological evaluation

The reasons for the selection of certain Sundays are explained in 6.4.1. However, with the research now complete, further issues merit discussion and evaluation.

7.4.3.1 Advent, Christmas and Epiphany

Beginning at the start of the church calendar, in the Advent weeks leading up to Christmas and including Christmas itself, there would have been a temptation to include all the extra services that are traditional at this time of year. After all, such services are very much part of Christmas and equally, it is part of the Church's heritage to celebrate this time of the year in that fashion. The reasons for not including them, as was vindicated by the comments made in the surveys described in 6.5, included the fact that on account of so much individual subjectivity surrounding such services, any data would have the potential to grossly imbalance the conclusions that were to be drawn. Indeed, the evidence of such disparity is striking: first, Clogher Cathedral only has occasional services during the Christmas period and not all of them have the regular organist playing. Second, Ardess Parish Church uses a multiplicity of soloists and praise groups. It tends to use the Christmas and Advent services not only as a way of getting young people actively involved in the Church, but also using these services as "dry runs" for the Carol Service. Furthermore, St Columba's Church is very active around Christmas, but the material derives from repeated "orders of service" from the main Christmas services of Christmas Day and the Second Sunday of Christmas. Equally, Garvary Parish Church changes their repertoire once the Second Sunday of Christmas has passed and retains no or few Epiphany carols, while Castle Archdale Parish Church repeats material used in its sister church in Irvinestown and seems seldom to use soloists or any special items apposite to Christmas. Finally, only St Columba's Cathedral follows the hymn lectionary closely at this time of year and, if its returns of data are anything

to go by for other years, it seems to give a fair and balanced weighting of Advent, Christmas and Epiphany material.

On this last point, the other five churches seem to freely interchange the hymns from these periods and either intersperse them with hymns across the *Hymnal* that suit the organists' or ministers' whims, or they are chosen to suit congregational knowledge or for other reasons. In the churches sampled for this section, most popular hymns in Advent were *On Jordan's Bank, Hark the glad sound the saviour comes* and *Christ is the world's true light*, which were sung seven, six and five times respectively between Advent Sunday and the Sunday before Christmas. Of these, Philip Doddridge's *Hark the glad sound the Saviour comes* is from the canon of eighteenth century hymns. The most interesting fact to emerge from the data collected from these churches was that on six Sundays during Epiphany, no single hymn was performed more than three times; this during a period when 144 hymns were sung in total. Also, by comparison with the high number of hymns sung during selected services and discussed in 7.6, only seventeen of these hymns were from the eighteenth century, or 11%. This figure is very similar to the ratio of eighteenth century hymns in the actual fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal*, which is 15%.

7.3.2 Lent, Easter and Pentecost

The Sundays around Easter also presented similar challenges, though the main variations in the Holy Week services were that rural churches simply did not sing hymns at them all and of those that did, there was a lot of duplication of material. Both these factors would have given an imbalance to the data returns. As explained in 6.4.1, Easter Monday was not included as there are very few services on that day, at least in the churches sampled across all the research. Taking into account the Sundays from the start of Lent until Easter, the most sung hymn from the exactly one hundred used was Symttan and Pott's nineteenth century *Forty days and forty nights*, set to the air *Heinlein*, which was originally published in the *Nürnbergisches Gesangbuch* as an air before being arranged for choir by Martin Herbst in the

seventeenth century. Interestingly, this hymn, which was sung four times in the selected churches, is neither a Lenten nor Easter hymn, being classified instead as part of the “His life and ministry” section of the *Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2000:399). Three other hymns that were sung three times each were the more appropriate *All glory, laud, and honour*, set to *St Theodulph* and based on a poem by Theodulf of Orleans before being translated and versified by John Mason Neale; John Newton’s *Approach, my soul, the mercy-seat* set to *Stracathro* and *Just as I am, thine own to be* by the nineteenth century hymn writer and poet, Marianne Farningham. In this period a total of 21 hymns sung were from the eighteenth century, or 21%, a figure above the number of hymns from that period actually in the *Church Hymnal*.

The period following Easter, the eight Sundays from the Sunday after Easter until and including Pentecost, was a period when a total of 173 hymns were sung, of which a large 26% were from the eighteenth century, over a quarter of the total hymns used. From the point of view of hymns being sung, it is perhaps no surprise that Davidica’s *Jesus Christ is risen today, alleluai!* was the most used with five renditions of it appearing in the selected churches. Based on an anonymous 14th century text, it is sung in the *Church Hymnal* to a melody originating from the eighteenth century’s *The Compleat Psalmist*. Three other hymns are used four times, the evocative *Thine be the glory*, set to Handel’s eponymous famous air from his oratorio *Judas Maccabeus*; the contemporary *Here I am, Lord* by Shutte, and Leeson’s hymn of pilgrimage, *Loving Shepherd of your sheep*.

It is worthwhile noting that this is when the attendance figures for choirs are at their lowest. The practical issues of spring evenings, meaning longer hours for what one of the respondents in Chapter 6.5 referred to as “the three Gs”, namely “golf, gardening and grinds”, are reflected in poor attendances at choir practices and services. Because of this, these weeks tend to be when organists choose hymns that are “safe” (a word used by two respondents), both from a congregational point of view and from the security of them being sung well with either limited or no choir practice time at all. Whilst the above reason may appear churlish, it is real and all choirmasters spoke of dwindling attendances when the daylight hours increase

following the long, dark, northern hemisphere winter. The “grinds” is a colloquial term used for period of intense exam preparation that school and university students undertake, thus affecting young persons’ attendances at choir and church as well.

7.4.3.3 Trinity and the Proper Sundays

From Trinity Sunday until the end of the summer and indeed onwards until the end of the church calendar, there is arguably more scope for organists to choose their own favourite hymns from throughout *The Church Hymnal*, but again, this is a period which is fraught with holiday season practicalities. All the church choirs sampled close for the summer and there is no reason to suspect that it is any different in any other part of the country, as explained by Moore (2011) and McDowell (2011) in the qualitative interviews in 6.4. The problem is thus: during the actual school holidays, most churches survive on the slenderest of resources, especially in rural communities where ministers cover each other’s churches in rotation. In this respect, most churches effectively close for a month or operate on the basis either of visiting clergy and organists or of parish readers. Again, from the information gained during the qualitative research, the hymns sung during these times are chosen for reasons of familiarity: everyone in the congregation knows them.

During these long months, which total 47% of the church year, the church is at its lowest in terms of musical productivity, with few or no services involving choirs, with deputy and relief organists being used extensively and with regular small congregations.

7.4.3.4 Harvest, Remembrance and other festivals

A dilemma for this research was whether to include Harvest Thanksgiving as part of the list of selected Sundays. Eventually, this was overcome when it transpired that the service was invariably in the evening and largely, on a non-Sunday evening. The

reasons for this are rooted in practicalities and based on two reasons. First, a great number of parishes use guest musicians and clergy to enhance their service and second, churches try not to clash with neighbouring ones, even those of different Protestant faith. The thinking behind the first reason is perhaps largely obvious; in a small, isolated church, the opportunity to give the congregation a treat by hearing a soloist or a specially enhanced choir is understandable. With regard to the second point, it is intriguing that so many people especially in rural communities like going to neighbouring churches' harvest festivals as well as their own. An example of this occurred in 2010 when Ardess Parish Church's Harvest Service, like every other, was held on the 2nd Sunday evening in September. To accommodate this, the nearby tiny Muckross Parish Church held its Harvest Thanksgiving service on the nearest Friday to that and a third church, a Methodist church in the next village three miles away, held it on the day before, the Thursday before the 2nd Sunday in September. This practice appears to be general all over the island of Ireland (Moore, 2010, interview).

Another point in the church calendar is also not included, Remembrance Sunday. This is because some churches have their services not as a variation of Morning Prayers or Matins, but as an afternoon service. Also, other Saints' Days and festivals are incorporated into the selected Sundays though acknowledgement of them appears to be in name only, rather than following any specific hymn lectionary for the occasion, the one exception being the family services in some churches, and on these occasions, "singable" hymns for children are included more frequently.

Finally, as referred to more fully in 7.5.4, individual organists have their favourite hymns, which sometimes override the appropriateness of hymns for certain Sundays.

7.4.4 The overall reasons and observations why eighteenth century hymns have been resilient as proven by the ongoing data

From carrying out the snapshot data, the findings have concluded that the eighteenth century hymn has proved to be resilient for the following reasons:

- i. There is a deep-rooted love of older, “traditional” hymns across all sectors of worship and all types of churches.
- ii. The quantity of data across a wide variety of churches in all circumstances shows that there is a pattern of hymns chosen from this period.
- iii. Certain hymns remain favourites because of external factors. These factors are wide ranging and more fully discussed in 7.5.
- iv. Hymns that are well known through constant usage are more likely to be played on a regular basis.
- v. Modern churches that use contemporary approaches to worship such as Microsoft PowerPoint displays and praise groups still choose a high level of hymns from the eighteenth century.
- vi. There are few differences between the status, size and location of a church; all equally enjoy singing hymns from the eighteenth century.
- vii. At certain times of the year such as Christmas, Easter and other key dates, there is a congregational demand for hymns that are in their view, established. Invariably these include a large number from the eighteenth century.
- viii. Congregations seem to enjoy the liturgy of older hymns.
- ix. Strong community links with other churches have made hymns sung in all major Protestant faiths popular. Such hymns typically include many by the Wesleys.
- x. The pool of Anglicans in Ireland is relatively small, so traditional patterns are maintained, meaning that changes occur slowly, this being true for the introduction of new hymns: older hymns remain popular.
- xi. There is a strong sense of family in the Church, both on a micro and macro level. This means that hymns sung by a congregation’s fathers and forefathers will have increased significance.

- xii. Within the general Protestant family, each congregation supports the other's services, ensuring hymns familiar to such denominations have increased use due to reasons of familiarity.

7.5 WHY HAS THE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY HYMN PROVED RESILIENT AND WHY IS IT STILL POPULAR TODAY IN THE CHURCH OF IRELAND?

The final analysis of this data revealed the following reasons. These are grouped in no particular order and do not imply a hierarchy.

- **The overall perceptions of the popularity of eighteenth century hymns.**
 - i. The overall perception of those interviewed was that the perceived number of eighteenth century hymns sung is grossly higher than what data proves. This could be interpreted on many levels but on an evidential basis, it does suggest that at the very least, the eighteenth century looms larger in their minds than in reality.

- **The provenance of hymns accounts for their continued use.**
 - i. The provenance of the eighteenth century hymns is a robust and genuine reason for the hymns being used. Throughout the interviews people spoke warmly of such hymns and even of the hymn writers, especially John Wesley, whom some of the respondents talked about as though they personally knew him.
 - ii. What was also evident was the strong sense of family in the church, which means in real terms that hymns sung at previous generations' weddings, funerals, baptisms and the like hold significant emotions for those concerned. This in turn creates a fondness and sense of homeliness for the hymn. Equally, many people interviewed thought that older hymns have a greater connection with the past and offer a more enriching experience through their provenance.

iii. Finally on this area, there was a shared belief that eighteenth century hymns have stood the test of time; in short, “the Bible doesn’t need to be retold in modern English to suit whimsical fashions of today” (Irvine, 2011).

➤ **There are strong literary reasons why they are resilient.**

- i. Another reason for the resilience of the said hymns is that older hymns, especially eighteenth century ones, have a stronger sense of narrative and house a greater story-telling role.
- ii. Likewise, the language of hymns offers a sense of deference to God and older congregations, especially those who find comfort in the Anglican rite, like this and find comfort in such hymns.
- iii. Furthermore, because many eighteenth century hymns started out as sacred poems, they have a use not only as a piece of prose but also as an extension of the Bible. This too, accounts for their continued use.

➤ **Eighteenth century hymns are resilient because they are well-known and are universally loved**

- i. Hymns which are well-known through constant usage are more likely to be played on a regular basis.
- ii. Churches are more likely to sing older, more traditional hymns for weddings, baptisms and funerals as well as at Christmas, Easter and other key points during the church calendar, and this increases usage throughout the year because of familiarity.
- iii. What emerged time and time again was the fact that older hymns are sung because they are more familiar than more modern, contemporary ones. In addition, there is an innate love of these hymns across all sectors of worship and indeed all types of churches. What this means is that members of the congregation who come into the Church through marriage or other reasons have a point of familiarity with these more traditional hymns. Of course there is universality to modern hymns as well, but it is worth noting that a good many of

those used by the Church of Ireland were written either for, or used exclusively in, the *Church Hymnal*.

- iv. Also related to this is the whole area of localised familiarity between the main and secondary Protestant faiths. The emergence of the fact that local churches have their Harvest Thanksgiving festivals on days that suit churches from other Protestant faiths was illuminating and shows the strength of such ties.
- v. Finally, any area that has strong links with Methodism tends to use a lot of Wesleyan hymns for the same reason as above (Downey, 2011).

➤ **There are many quantifiable musical reasons behind the hymns' resilience**

- i. There is a significant lack of musical resources in today's Church. This, by a step-by-step process, means that eighteenth century hymns are more likely to be sung. Quite simply churches have not had the time to train congregations in learning and singing new hymns and when relief organists are in during the summer, or when there are rota organists, it is easier to play hymns which have been known for generations.
- ii. Organists like the rousing choruses, the metre and chord progressions of many of the eighteenth century hymns and as it is they who usually choose the hymns, such works become used frequently. They have their own favourites because of this and these tend to be "hymns that work" (Moore, 2011) and will generate uplifting singing.
- iii. There is a direct link between organists' ability and hymns chosen. Generally speaking, older organists are less likely to try out new, modern hymns.
- iv. Straightforward four-part harmony is easier to play than a syncopated, modern rhythm.
- v. Organs are predominantly used for accompaniment and this suits the older style of hymn.
- vi. Most choirs hate modern hymns as they offer little in the way of four-part harmony singing.

➤ **Parish and domestic reasons account for hymns' resilience**

There are some interesting reasons which are grouped under this area, that accounts for the continued use of so many eighteenth century hymns.

- i. First, on a practical level, it is the older members of the congregation who are paying the wages, keeping the churches full and on the vestries and committees, therefore their needs are addressed as a higher priority. This usually happens in smaller churches rather than busy urban ones, though.
- ii. From the point of view of training, some churches try to promote and educate their parishes and congregations into learning new hymns but time and resources prevent them from doing this to any useful degree. This in turn means that older hymns receive more usage.
- iii. It was disappointing to find that a few clergy appear to be untrained in the appropriateness of choosing hymns, as was obvious when they spoke in the interviews. This must surely have an impact upon hymnody in that church.
- iv. There is no evidence to support the fact that smaller, rural and more family-oriented churches choose more "traditional" hymns, all churches including cathedrals are as likely to select hymns from the eighteenth century as their lesser counterparts.
- v. The pool of Anglicans in Ireland is relatively small so patterns of traditions are maintained, thus meaning that change happens slowly and this is true for the introduction of new hymns. As such, older hymns remain popular.

➤ **There are sentimental and emotional reasons for resilience**

At certain times of the year such as Christmas, Easter and other key dates, there is a congregational demand for hymns which are in their view, established. Invariably these include a large number of eighteenth century ones.

- i. Overlapping with 8.5.4, but with a different outcome, is the fact that times of great emotional pull, such as services like Remembrance Sunday and various Saints' Days or other festivals, there is a greater likelihood of eighteenth century

hymns being sung as these hymns are perceived to have a greater sense of occasion or history.

- ii. The small selection of hymns in the *Church Hymnal* which are specific to times of the year affects the hymn choice.
- iii. People seem to love the emotion behind singing something which is familiar. This is supported by West (2011) who added that, as a minister, he has yet to see a funeral service where at least one traditional, older hymn wasn't used.

➤ **Liturgical reasons for resilience**

- i. There is a fundamental feeling, consistent throughout all the interviewees, that congregations seem to enjoy the liturgy of older hymns. They seem to offer something more.
- ii. Equally, the hymns of the eighteenth century are perceived to have more biblical references.
- iii. As modern hymns are viewed as being simply too generic and not having an affinity with the Sunday they are used, older hymns are the reverse of this. This absence of specificity means that older hymns have not as yet had enough competition so eighteenth century hymns are still resilient.
- vii. The liturgical content of modern hymns is questionable, meaning older hymns are more likely to be sung.
- viii. Some people are not comfortable with the close, personal relationship with God that some modern hymns offer; instead preferring the more reverential distance that eighteenth century hymns offer.

➤ **Generational and temporal reasons**

The use of older hymns is as cyclic as the constant evolution of modern hymns and some of those surveyed believe that the day will come when they will be out of fashion.

7.6 ANALYSIS OF THE QUALITATIVE, IN-DEPTH QUESTIONNAIRES FROM 6.5

This section will evaluate the findings from the in-depth interviews held with key church members, as outlined in Chapter 6.4, and summarizes the key reasons why eighteenth century hymns have proved resilient, as argued by those surveyed.

A general question asked informally at the start of the interview and formulated as an introduction to the topic and to prepare the interviewees, resulted in some intriguing results. This question was: “Without referring to any records, what is your general feeling about what percentage of hymns your church sings which are from the eighteenth century?” This question was asked to gain an overall view of what interviewees thought was sung rather than actually mathematically collated and was as much to put the interviewees at ease as anything else. Nonetheless, the results were somewhat intriguing, as most made a wildly exaggerated guess. Of course what did become clear as the interviews progressed was that some clergy and laity alike struggled with the concept of “eighteenth century”, instead speaking of older hymns *en masse*. Bishop McDowell’s response is not included in this table as he does not have a parish church.

Table showing the perceived percentage of eighteenth century hymns sung in respondents’ churches.

Interviewee	Perceived percentage of eighteenth century hymns sung
West	90%
Capper	85%
Kerr	85%
Downey	85%
Elliott	85%
Irvine	75%
Allen	70%
Seale	66%
Moore	50%

From the point of view of the interviewees themselves, the concept of their being representative of a wide range of viewpoints certainly was valid. Seale spoke intelligently about the hymns and the reasons for their resilience, having researched hymnody for her BMus degree at Queen's University, Belfast, as an undergraduate. She is a lifetime Anglican and puts much thought into her hymn choice. The general feelings she had for the resilience of 18th century hymns was that it was the youth of the church that pushes and drives modern and contemporary hymnody and, in turn, the youth-praise element within churches which fosters a more personal, intimate relationship with God. This point indeed is echoed by Moore who himself is a traditionalist and thinks that the ceremony and occasion that goes with the Anglican rite is part of the Church and one of its strengths.

Elliott spoke generally about hymn familiarity and added that she only chooses modern hymns when they are well known, such as Kendrick's *Shine, Jesus Shine*, and Irvine, whilst making a similar point, went on to discuss the purpose of hymn familiarity. He claims that when a hymn is familiar and one does not have to work hard at singing it, then one can get on with the process of worship. He adds that hymns are there for the purposes of worship, not as aids for musical egos or other ephemeral issues.

Although he personally prefers modern music, one minister, like others, spoke of the need for familiarity and said that his church uses up to 90% of old hymns. Allen and Kerr liked the general longevity of hymns and appreciated their individual provenance, with Allen pointing out the importance of chanting and canticles and their role in preserving the Anglican tradition. Downey believes that most members of the congregation prefer older hymns for a myriad of reasons and it is difficult to separate which came first. She points out that if an organist plays a hymn regularly for so many years, then it will become an "old familiar" hymn within a short span. In this way, hymns develop their own sense of provenance and a globally or nationally favourite hymn is one where this has happened over a wider scale yet the reason for this can be totally conjectural.

Finally, West focuses on the rhythm of life and of the cycle of hymnody and that everything had its season. In his manner, the use of older hymns is as cyclic as the constant evolution of modern hymns.

7.5.1 Liturgical reasons for resilience

The single message that ran throughout all interviews was that older hymns had a greater sense of being biblically based and newer hymns were less specific and more generic. Irvine (2011) spoke at length of the liturgy of the Church being scripturally based and that older hymns are manifestations of this. He describes newer hymns as being “puffs of smoke” that are relevant for a short period and will ultimately mean nothing in years to come. Allen (2011) also had a similar sentiment but added that older hymns can sometimes be over-sentimentalised, but he likes the older material as it follows both the prayer book and Bible thought. His only caveat is that sometimes the melodies and harmonies used can contribute to their being over-sentimentalised. On the same debate, Seale (2011) feels that the liturgical content in newer hymns is questionable, a point also made by West (2011) who argues that older hymns have much more biblical substance. West also feels that the depth of character in these older hymns forms the basis of the Anglican faith, especially for older people, as they have grown up with this liturgy. He also purports that not all clergy can see the depth in these hymns. Inevitably, some of the deeper meanings will not be explained to congregations by those ministers who do not understand such hymns. West concludes his points on this area of resilience by adding that in almost every case he can think of, an older hymn will almost certainly be at least one of the hymns sung at a funeral.

The use of the prayer and psalm lectionary was also an issue with the liturgical reasons for hymns being used. Some clergy and churches followed the lectionary closely (Seale, Irvine, Moore and Elliott, for example), whilst others use it sparingly or in context (West, Downey and Allen, for example). In any case, the lectionary seemed to act as at the very least, some sort of guide. Few used the hymnal

lectionary as provided as an appendix in the *Companion to the Church Hymnal* (Darling & Davison, 2005). Some of those who did not use the lectionary in this way include Elliott and West, with the former not even owning a copy.

The mood of the liturgy was a point made by McDowell (2011) who argues that in the 18th and 19th centuries, the hymns fit perfectly the mood of the general sentiment of the era and this does not often happen in modern and contemporary hymns. He gave the example of the modern hymn *In Christ alone*, which in his view makes every Sunday sound like Easter. This point was echoed by Moore (2011) who spoke of the liturgy of the older hymns being more typical of the period of expansion and acceptability of the era in which they were written. He spoke of the Church's position in society and the solemnity of the relationship between humans and God being different from the almost personal way in which modern Christians address God, and this is reflected in the hymnody of the period.

Elliott (2011) too, followed the trend, feeling that older hymns were more biblically based and believing that the reasons behind writing them are closely regarded in every hymn, with the liturgy of the Church, which is scripturally based, being reflected in the texts and thus in the liturgies of the older hymns. Like Irvine and Downey (2011), she also believes that the older hymns have longevity of their own and are not just items of ecclesiastical fashion that are relevant for a short period and will mean nothing in years to come. Indeed Downey also adds that modern hymns can be a bit vacuous and do not offer the congregation anything substantial from a liturgical point of view. She did add that there are some modern hymns that do not fall into this category and are very apposite, a point also held by West and Elliott, amongst others. Of these, she refers to *Amazing Grace* and the many hymns by Timothy Dudley-Smith that appear to be simplistic but have greater depth and meaning. In relation to his overall comments in the interview, one minister's main concern in the liturgy of the hymns was that older hymns, which from the examples he implies are pre-World War II, retain the gender of Jesus and God. He deplored the fact that modern hymns lose the "maleness" (*sic*) of God and spoke of his

congregation also not liking this. The example he cites is of an unremembered hymn, which between the third and fourth editions of the *Church Hymnal* changed “your son” to “your heir”. This same minister, somewhat contradictorily, refers to modern hymns as a smokescreen, but did say he preferred them to older hymns.

Finally, Kerr also concurred with the main thread of feeling regarding the liturgical reasons for the resilience of 18th century hymns in Church of Ireland usage. Like many others, he spoke of the biblical basis of older hymns and of the relevant passages and quotations from the Bible that occurred in such hymns.

7.5.2 Socio-historic reasons for resilience

Many interviewees spoke of a sense of history in older hymns and, in turn, their relationship with the links of the past. In many cases they spoke in a nostalgic tone where older hymns seemed to represent an era of better values in society, where the Church stood for different things, which in their eyes was a better world in which to live. Seale (2011) and Downey (2011) both spoke of the hymns having a socio-historic aspect or hymns having their own sense of history. West spoke of the hymns’ historical connections but focused on the fact that every time a hymn is performed, it adds its own history to that which it already has, as well as its associations with the reasons behind its usage the first time. McDowell also concurred with this and, like others, added individual reasons and examples. He spoke of many hymns that have become overused, as well as noting that hymns used for really significant, high-profile services gain their own sense of gravitas. *Abide with Me*, although not an eighteenth century hymn, is one such example that he gave and despite this inappropriateness, it does illustrate the point in question. Sung at the wedding of King George VI, it was then used for the wedding of his daughter, the now Queen Elizabeth; its usage in Anglican churches has increased, as though it has gained approval from the top. Elliott agreed with McDowell on this very point as well, believing that families have sung certain hymns for generations and find great solace from this. In the case of her church, she sees this in the way that there is little

movement in and out of the parish. Both Allen and West pointed out the sense of provenance of the Church from Celtic times. Allen spoke at length about the connections with the old Patrician view of Irish religion and of how he feels the connection between the old and the contemporary is valid and alive, adding how he feels hymns play a part in this. West is also a believer in the way in which the old Celtic church has links and relevancies to the modern. He pointed out that he feels this responsibility through his own parish whose church is called St Patrick's and is close to several ancient monastic sites, one of which is the 12th century Devenish Round Tower.

Moore raised an interesting point when he spoke of older hymns standing for the pre-disestablishment mind-set of Church of Ireland Anglicans. Although out of context, he illustrated his point by talking of the Victorian period of the Board of First Fruits when the Church of Ireland was typified by a period of prolific hymn-writing.

Irvine and Kerr both made interesting points about the cultural attachment associated with certain older hymns, especially the Wesleyan hymns, as well as some later than that. Kerr referred to some of these hymns being "steeped in tradition and having stood the test of time" and Irvine talks of hymns "in the old times" as being part of a never-changing narrative and that is why they have this attachment and have stood the test of time. He referred specifically to Christmas hymns, which are typical of this, citing that no matter what era you live in, "the nativity is still the nativity" and doesn't either need or withstand any new interpretations.

The only interviewee who disagreed with hymns having any historical significance was an individual minister who claimed that hymns are only used simply because people know them and he believes that clergy don't pick them on their sense of history. In discussing a later point, however, this person contradicted himself by saying that clergy never pick hymns.

7.5.3 Literary reasons

The idea of there being literary reasons for the resilience of hymns is a small but nonetheless integral part of the family of overall reasons for the longevity. This is especially true of the canon of hymns chosen for this study, as many of them started life not as sung hymns, but as sacred poems written for study and devotion as much as for being sung aloud.

McDowell spoke of hymns being poems where words engage with the melody because, in most cases, in those times melodies came after and were written idiomatically for the words. He quoted a Wesley hymn to illustrate the point, where *Hark! The herald angels sing* inspired one of the greatest composers of all time, Felix Mendelssohn, to write the tune that now accompanies the words. Seale too shared this sentiment, arguing that of many of the older hymns were very fine poems to start with, quoting Cowper's *God moves in a mysterious way* and the anonymously attributed Davidica's *Jesus Christ is risen today!* as two such examples.

Moore spoke of these points too but adds that the poetry from these times is easily remembered, most likely because of the strong narrative nature, a view shared by Elliott, who also talks of hymns as literary works with a strong layout and structure.

Indeed the strong narrative structure of the hymns in the eighteenth century is a point shared by most of the interviewees, especially Downey and West, who both draw attention to the literary value of the poems from the point of view of style and language. Downey spoke of the hymns of Cowper and Watts being frequently studied as poetry in university English Literature courses. She considers them good literary examples of the time, quoting Tate and Brady's *Through all the changing scenes of life* and Wesley's *Jesu lover of my soul* as being two examples that touch her in this way. Likewise, West pointed out that he feels that sometimes the language of hymns is often ignored or taken for granted. He argues that the language used in older hymns helps give a sense of deference to the sanctity of those works and creates a respectful distance between humans and God. He feels modern hymns are different from this and also endemic and representative of the

fact that people have become so used to the culture of today that they do not respect the fact that when they are entering a service, it is a sacred place. Older hymns help remind churchgoers and set a standard for this reverential approach to worship. Hymns that help do this are those such as *Jesus where'er thy people meet* by Cowper, *From all that dwell* by Watts and Wesley's *Jesus shall reign where'er the sun*.

Kerr likes the way in which older hymns enjoy a greater sense of permanence because of the stories they tell, pointing out the arguments made by other interviewees that good hymns are good stand-alone poems. He refers specifically to works such as *O God our help in ages past* and *When I survey the wondrous cross*, both by Isaac Watts, as being strong examples of this. As well as agreeing with the general sentiment of what others had said, Allen makes an interesting observation about children's hymns in this genre. He feels that although they may have simple verses and melody, the message can be like the poetry of William Blake in that they convey a much deeper sentiment and meaning. *Jesus, good above all others* (traditional, translated by Caird) and *There is a land of pure delight* by Watts are hymns that are often used as children's hymns yet both have profound deeper meanings beyond the simplistic child-centred message of the rewards of salvation.

Irvine takes a similar but tangential approach to the like-minded responses by others in that he believes that the ideas in older hymns are not as whimsical as in modern hymns, pointing to hymns such as *While Shepherds watched their flocks by night* and *Ye servants of God* by Nate and Doddridge respectively. He believes that these are truer to the word of the Bible than modern hymns like *Shine, Jesus Shine* by Kendrick.

Finally, one minister thinks that eighteenth century hymns have a better story-telling quality, but quoted as examples hymns by Dudley-Smith, which are of course twentieth century.

7.5.4 Musical reasons for resilience

Once interviewees moved beyond the common theme of older hymn tunes being resilient because of familiarity following usage over a long period of time, many other interesting reasons emerged.

Seale thought some of the reasons for hymns' resilience were their use of homophonic chords, especially in root position, together with a slow march-like style rhythm or pulse. *And can it be* by Wesley and Cowper's *Hark, my soul, it is the Lord* are examples of these hymns, which she quoted as having such textures and features. Seale also is quick to commend modern hymns as being good at what they are and what they stand for. She quotes *Father, of heaven, whose love profound* by Cooper as having nice chords and feels its harmonisations are strong with rising tenor voice and interesting chromatic movement. By contrast, *Soldiers of Christ, arise* by Wesley is a hymn which she feels has good arpeggiated rising-figures, as does another of Wesley's, *Ye servants of God, your master proclaim*, whose well-balanced structure and good use of consequent and antecedent stand out for her. Finally, she quotes *Rock of ages* by Toplady as being a hymn that not only is typical of the period in that it is musically good with strong chromatic harmony, but also is liturgically sturdy.

McDowell not only agrees with the general sentiment of older hymns being more musically interesting but points to the fact that because of their very nature as SATB arrangements, they help preserve the choral tradition of the Anglican faith. This is also a point taken up by Moore, who, like Downey, feels the whole tradition of choral singing in the Church of Ireland is being undermined by modern unison hymns which have not only a very narrow vocal compass but also, by their nature, are more suitable for guitar and / or praise group accompaniment. Moore feels that such a homophonic texture works well with organ accompaniment and full SATB choirs. In this respect, he believes they have a security of style that mirrors the steadfast nature of the Anglican rite. Indeed, such is the stylistic similarity of these hymns that he sees, as an organist, that it is possible to develop a technique of being able to sight-read these hymns relatively easily. Both Downey and Moore feel the older

hymns are more folk-like in their tunes, and the melodies go in a predictable manner, thus adding to the same reverential sanctity spoken of in relation to the liturgical reasons for the resilience of eighteenth century hymns.

Downey also speaks of the relationship between words and music being very important, citing Isaac Watts' *When I survey the wondrous cross* as being a strong example of this. Not only does she feel the melody suits the words but she also points to the way in which the tenor part soars at mournful intervals of a 6th above the tune, adding to the pathos. She also notices how much the congregation enjoys singing this hymn and feels it is almost as perfect a hymn as there could be. From the point of view of an organist, she also adds that she does not object to new hymns whatsoever and sometimes tires of "the same old hymns", though these are what the congregation feels secure with. She also feels a musical reason for eighteenth century hymns' resilience is that modern hymns, though sometimes more rhythmic and colourful in parts, work best with other instruments such as guitars and drums, while older hymns have a stylistic familiarity, and the organ and standard church choir is the best vehicle for these.

Elliott concurred with the general feelings of the interviewees, adding that arguably newer hymns suit younger people, so implicitly, the only reasons why older hymns were resilient was because the church had problems attracting young people to church. Elliott also spoke in consort with Moore, Downey and others in saying that there was a certain musical predictability in the melodies of older hymns. One person who took this idea a little further was Irvine, who spoke at length about the stability of the older hymn, comparing it to what was happening in the world of bagpipe music, of which he is an *aficionado*. In older church music as in piping music, when music was in 4/4, 6/8 or whatever, it stayed in that key, whereas in modern church and piping music there could suddenly be a randomly placed 5/8 bar and this rhythmic irregularity "threw" people. He said that congregations like stability and thrive on familiarity and that was one of the mainstays behind the resilience of eighteenth century hymnody.

Allen shared exactly the same opinion as Irvine, though without the piping analogy, adding that older hymns, like canticles, do not have unusual metre. He believes that this is one of the characteristics of the Church of Ireland and indeed the Anglican Church in general.

One minister added a practical note, saying that in his experience organists pick the hymns and as a result, if they were not able to play a hymn, it would not be used. He implied that this might be why older hymns are used more, but this feeling is at variance with the accepted, though anecdotal view, that most modern music is substantially easier to play, primarily because it is chord-based and one can take more musical liberties because of its structure.

The feeling that older hymns are more widely appealing was a view held by Kerr, as was the idea that the tunes of older hymns seem easier to remember, even unfamiliar ones. Kerr, by his own admission, is not a musician, and this feeling may be similar to the point made by some of the organist interviewees, who all spoke to some degree about the predictability of the airs of older hymns. Kerr used the hymns *Lo, He comes with clouds descending* by Wesley, *Joy to the world* by Watts and *All hail the power of Jesu's name* by Perronet and Ripon as examples of this melodic and harmonic predictability.

Finally, West's views are similar to those expressed above except to add that the main reason why modern hymns are used in his church is to appeal to young people or for a children's service.

7.5.5 Clerical reasons for resilience

With the general consensus from all the interviews being that the clergy have, at best, a limited influence in the music being sung in churches, this chapter's findings only offer a small, but nonetheless significant insight into the resilience of eighteenth century hymns.

All of the interviewees who were organists, namely Seale, Moore, Downey and Elliott, said that it was they personally who chose the hymns and did so usually with complete freedom. Sometimes they used the lectionary for guidance but more often than not, hymns were chosen out of personal preference. Moore added that there were several hymns he would usually include in most services and they were based on how well his church sang them; these hymns were older hymns with only one twentieth century hymn. They are *Guide me O, thou great Jehovah*, *Praise my soul the king of heaven*, *Nearer my God to thee*, *Love Divine*, *Thine be the Glory* and *Christ is made the sure foundation*.

Seale, uniquely, is married to the rector of her church, but is confident that decisions she makes are reached independently in line with her status as a church organist. She feels the weight of responsibility for both maintaining a choral tradition and developing new hymns and music. She slightly resents the fact that she felt obliged or even on some occasions, forced, to use hymns from *Irish Church Praise*, a volume that preceded the fifth edition of the *Church Hymnal* and was in use in some parishes. That said, she does not go looking for older hymns to educate her congregation with, she just discovers them by accident, perhaps because they are on a facing page of a hymn she is playing or because she has heard it elsewhere.

McDowell's case is interesting in that he is a bishop. He is aware that he has no control over hymnody and of the fact that when he visits a parish, the church is often putting its "best foot forward" because the bishop is there. In that context, hymns tend to be safe and well known so the congregation will give a rousing rendition.

The lay clergy interviewed, namely Irvine, Kerr and Elliott, all believe that the minister has no say in the choice of hymns as the lectionary has freed the minister of the responsibility of hymn choice and they simply do not want to get involved. All three regularly take services on their own, primarily on account of the lack of available clergy in rural areas. They do not interfere in hymn choice, though on a personal level none particularly enjoys modern hymns. In addition, Kerr was keen to point out that many clergy are not as "stuck in a rut" as one would imagine and that

most, like Seale, given time and resources, would like to educate their congregations and get them used to modern hymns.

West, too, raised an interesting point in that he believed sometimes the appropriate hymn before a sermon will more often than not spark a link-line between that hymn and the service; he did not give specific examples, but he was quite clear in this and drew attention to it several times.

Finally, one individual minister provided some contradictory information when he said that the organist did not necessarily determine the continued use of older hymns: it was more a case of the personal choice of the individual musician and that is the way it always has been. He then went on to say that he enjoyed more modern music himself and that he did try to steer the hymn choice, yet he said earlier in the interview that he felt older hymns were better and had much more substance.

Overall, it is difficult to see how many clerical influences were exerted in the past but the picture from today's church is that at best they steer direction and at least they just wait and see which hymns will be sung.

7.5.6 Congregational reasons for resilience

This final aspect, the congregational reasons for hymns' resilience, centres on one main point, that of congregations liking and desiring familiarity. However, beyond that, several interviewees raised some interesting points. Fundamental to this is the fact that on a practical basis, the congregation really has very little input into steering hymnody other than making suggestions to the minister when they may have family hymn services on a "fifth Sunday". The Fifth Sunday is the term used to describe the times during the year when there are five Sundays in a calendar month. As it interrupts the natural flow of the cycle of services, it is sometimes used for family services. Such an instance occurred in Derryvullen North Parish Church, Artigarvan Parish Church and Trory Parish Churches, though in all cases there was no formal process whereby congregations could steer or advise on any hymn choice.

There seems no evidence either of a congregation having any influence generally into hymnody other than through their vestry representatives or by way of anecdotal conversations with decision makers. That said, it is interesting that McDowell argued that congregations drive hymn choice for certain services or times of the year. The example he gave was the opening hymn of a carol service, *Once in Royal David's city*. "It is hard to get beyond the chicken and egg situation with this music", he suggested, when talking of the carol's provenance as the opening carol of the televised festival of nine lessons and carols from King's College, Cambridge. He felt that even if an organist decided against it, he imagined there would be sufficient anger in the congregation for the hymn to be reinstated for the following year's carol service. He maintained that the same was true for other hymns throughout the church calendar.

Seale feels that congregations have little formal say in how they maintain hymnodistic traditions; in her view it is a purely random result as most organists do not like interference from congregations or from clergy. She added that she feels young worshippers get caught up in the hypnotic effect of the beat and instrumentation of modern praise music. This was a view held by Downey as well, who wondered if any of the older hymns would be around in another 50 years, such is the insatiable appetite for modern music in the Church of Ireland.

Moore feels that the reason why older hymns have endured for so long is that, in his experience as an organist, there is nothing congregations like more than a good "pub sing" and in his view, older hymns satisfy this. In this respect congregations do drive forward hymnody in the way they respond to hymns by, as Moore put it, "either singing or not singing".

Elliott, Irvine and Kerr, as lay preachers, focused on the fact that congregations like familiarity. Elliott feels that once a congregation knows a piece, whether it is new or old, they are happy enough to sing it. Irvine argues that churches are in a "catch 22" situation whereby it is middle-aged parishioners who like the "comfort zone" of older hymns, yet without younger people the church and its music will die. He adds that it is they who are the main attendees, the primary focus of income and the

loudest voices on vestries and committees. Kerr, like Elliott thinks that congregations are happy enough to sing hymns once they know them and feels they are open-minded enough. Although not a lay minister, Allen too, is in accordance with this point.

West and Downey both agree with the sentiment expressed above but feel there is a need to educate congregations further and Downey especially feels that older people in the congregations need to have the provenance of newer hymns explained rather than being just exposed to them.

Capper agreed that congregations liked familiarity and that primarily, hymns were chosen on the basis of the organist's ability, congregational ability to sing them and personal preference.

7.5.7 The overall reasons why eighteenth century hymns have proved resilient according to the information provided from the qualitative surveys

This section discusses the overall reasons why eighteenth century hymns have been resilient as proven by the qualitative, in-depth questionnaire surveys. These points have no particular bias and may have questionable validity, but they are the reasons that emerged from the surveys.

- i. The frequency of singing eighteenth century hymns is perceived as grossly higher than the data proves, indicating that it seems to have a greater significance for those being interviewed.
- ii. Older hymns are preserved because the newer ones are promoted predominately by the youth element of churches.
- iii. Older hymns are sung because contemporary hymns are simply not as familiar. In this respect there is an argument that eighteenth century hymns are resilient because of the lack of a viable alternative.
- iv. Eighteenth century hymns have a stronger provenance.

- v. Older hymns have a global appeal and are performed simply because they are so well-known.
- vi. The use of older hymns is as cyclic as the constant evolution of modern hymns; the day will come when they will be out of fashion.
- vii. The hymns of the eighteenth century have a greater biblical connection.
- viii. Modern hymns are simply too generic and do not seem to fit into any occasion, and lack affinity with the Sunday on which they are used. This absence of specificity means that older hymns have not as yet had enough competition.
- ix. Older hymns, especially eighteenth century ones, have a stronger sense of narrative.
- x. The liturgical content of modern hymns is questionable, meaning older hymns are more likely to be sung.
- xi. When needing a hymn for a specific service, an older hymn is more likely to address the sentiment of the moment.
- xii. Old hymns are not broken and therefore do not need fixing.
- xiii. Some people are not comfortable with the close, personal relationship with God that some modern hymns offer; instead, preferring the more reverential distance that eighteenth century hymns offer.
- xiv. Modern hymns try to non-gender God and this is not liked by some congregations.
- xv. Eighteenth century hymns have stood the test of time. The Bible does not need to be retold in modern English to suit the whimsical fashions of today.
- xvi. Because many eighteenth century hymns started as sacred poems, they can be used as devotional texts and have greater flexibility. This, in turn, has increased their popularity and consequently their likelihood of being used.
- xvii. The language of hymns offers a sense of deference to God and older congregations like this and find comfort in such hymns.
- xviii. Organists like the rousing choruses, metre and chord progressions of many of the eighteenth century hymns. As it is they who usually choose the hymns older hymns are used more frequently.

- xix. Modern hymns were forced upon organists and clergy and so people have turned against them.
- xx. There is a feeling that the current *Church Hymnal* has a disproportionate number of contemporary hymns, many of which are unusable because they are either too general or they do not work musically when played on the organ.
- xxi. The offerings of older members of the congregation pay the wages, keep the churches full and serve on the vestries and committees, therefore their needs and favourites are addressed first.
- xxii. It is lack of musical resources that makes eighteenth century hymns more resilient. Quite simply churches have not had time to train congregations in singing and learning new hymns.

7.6 ANALYSIS OF THE SNAPSHOT DATA FROM 6.6

The data collected from this aspect of the research in sections 6.4 and 6.6, supports the idea that very few comparatively new hymns are being sung currently during Church of Ireland worship and for the various reasons already summarised in 7.5.7 and 7.4.4, all older hymns, including the canon of eighteenth century hymns, are still being used in large numbers consistently across the church calendar. Consequently, the results of the ongoing data from the following churches are discussed in detail in the following sections.

7.6.1 Review of the Sundays selected for snapshot data

The first issue under review concerns the reasons why the Sundays selected were the most appropriate and suitable for this research. Although this was discussed to some degree in 6.6.1, a review of what was learnt from choosing these services is both interesting and relevant now this research is completed. Subsequently, the following subsections 7.6.1.1 to 7.6.1.5 evaluate the five selected points in the calendar in greater detail.

7.6.1.1 Analysis of the hymns sung on The First Sunday in Advent

The first Sunday chosen was the first Sunday in Advent by reason of its position at the start of the church year. As it transpired, it proved a good choice for the following reasons:

- i. Whilst the liturgical year has its own calendar, on a day-to-day basis, the church year appears to mirror the academic year. Church choirs re-commence after the summer season in early September and that is the time when churches recruit most. On an amateur level, it is the time when people looking for new hobbies or commitments start their lives afresh.
- ii. Advent comes after the Harvest Thanksgiving festival and in Northern Irish churches, the Remembrance Service, and as such, it is the time when fresh music comes into the cycle of usage.
- iii. From a practical point of view, school pupils will have just had a mid-term break and the return for many families sees the Halloween celebrations finished and the anticipation of Christmas beginning.
- iv. Finally, before Advent, during the “Proper” weeks, churches have the most liturgical and lectionary freedom; it is a time to learn and revisit seasonal music, which is welcomed.

During this period, almost 54% of the hymns were from the eighteenth century, including Doddridge’s *Hark the glad sound! The Saviour comes*, which was sung three times on the same day by different churches.

7.6.1.2 Analysis of the hymns sung on the Fourth Sunday of Epiphany

The second Sunday chosen, the Fourth Sunday of Epiphany, was selected as it is suitably placed in between Christmas and Easter and seems an apposite choice for the following reasons:

- i. During this time, the repertoire has time and space to move on from Christmas music and yet still use material that is quintessentially Epiphany.
- ii. The *Church Hymnal* has just fifteen hymns in its Epiphany section which forces churches to use material from related sections or indeed the more general sections of the hymn book. As such, there is a good balance of hymns from different periods in the data responses.
- iii. Since choirs are not rehearsing at this time for any specific event, it is a good “rank-and-file” time to listen to a choir, as it is the mid-point of the year for them.
- iv. From a human point of view, the last vestiges of the darkness of winter are over, evenings are starting to draw out a little and people are able to come home from work and school in dusk rather than darkness. Whilst this may appear largely ephemeral and difficult to quantify, it is real; all clergy speak of new life in earth’s natural forces being mirrored by a feeling of hope in society.

A large number of eighteenth century hymns were sung in this period, namely 33%, including Tate and Brady’s *As pants the hart for cooling streams* and Wesley’s *Love divine, all loves excelling*, each of which were sung twice by two separate churches on the same Sunday.

7.6.1.3 Analysis of the hymns sung on The Third Sunday in Lent

The Third Sunday before Lent was chosen primarily for two reasons, again as outlined in 6.6.1. First, it is a time when choirs are still rehearsing and second, the full impact of Easter hymns has not been felt in the pews. In real terms, any Lenten service could have been chosen but being three weeks before Easter, a full palate of more generalised hymns remains, from which the organist may choose. The analysis of data and the discussions with clergy and organists arising from the collection of data from this period reveals the following further details:

- i. With only nine hymns from the Lenten section of the *Church Hymnal*, churches have to look elsewhere for hymns to sing.
- ii. This appears to be a time when services are well attended, perhaps because of the onset of Spring or other factors beyond the scope of this research. In any case, during this period churches seem to enjoy choosing hymns that congregations will enjoy singing.
- iii. As some churches have no choirs available during the actual Easter weekend these are the last weeks when choirs are active and at full strength, especially in rural parishes. As such, this is a time when the final choir “solo” anthems are sung.

Of the hymns sung in Advent, as discussed in 6.6.3.1, almost one third of them are from the eighteenth century, including Doddridge’s *You Servants of the Lord* and *Hark the glad sound! The Saviour comes* as well as Wesley’s *Come Thou long expected Jesus*.

7.6.1.4 Analysis of the hymns sung on The First Sunday after Trinity

The Church in many ways, at least evidentially on a local basis, faces a problem in that for almost half of the year they are operating on reduced resources. By May, most, if not all choirs, have ceased regular practices and the few young people who are around, are all focusing on school and university exams. Thus for almost six months of the year music is in virtual hibernation and the First Sunday after Trinity is virtually the last chance for any creative musical output. Because of this, it is the last chance to measure hymns before more haphazard choices are employed. When carrying out the research into this Sunday, the following issues were also apparent:

- i. In the interviews discussed in 7.5, Seale argued that organists have greater freedom in Trinity and this was certainly reflected in the hymns chosen by the churches on that day. For example, Lisnaskea Parish Church used four hymns, all very different in their spiritual focus, namely: *Jesus, friend of little children*, which is a hymn of pilgrimage; *All things bright and beautiful*, written to testify God’s

creation; a hymn of general praise, *Ye holy Angels bright* and finally the controversially Catholic hymn (Darling & Davison, 2005:518), *The Church's one foundation*, essentially a hymn of unity and fellowship. Two other issues of note regarding this example are that no Trinity hymn was sung during the service and the service included two children's hymns.

- ii. Other disparate examples are evident in considering the other churches' chosen hymns.
- iii. Of the twelve churches sampled on Trinity Sunday, four (Castle Archdale, Derryvullen North, Maguiresbridge and Garvary parishes) commented on the lack of musical resources on that day. Two were using relief organists, one a retired organist, and in the fourth case, the minister had to play the hymns. A further three comments were made about lack of choir members and in one case the activities of the choir had been completely abandoned since Easter.

Of the hymns sung in the selected parishes on Trinity Sunday, 27% were from the eighteenth century, including Tate and Brady's *Through all the changing scenes of life, As pants the hart for cooling streams* as well as Wesley's *Blessed be the everlasting God*. Two hymns were sung twice on that day but *O Breath of Life come sweeping through us* by Elizabeth Head and *God is here! As we His people* by Pratt Green are both twentieth century hymns.

7.6.1.5 Analysis of the hymns sung on All Saints' Day

The last day chosen, All Saints' Day, is some 23 weeks away from the last selected day, Trinity Sunday, and the reasons for this are explained above in 7.6.1.4; they are primarily based on the fact that music in the church becomes too dependent on other factors to make measurement of data meaningful. On the other hand, All Saints' Day, being in early November, is at a time when choirs and musicians are in the peak of their season and furthermore, buoyed up by the family services of Harvest Thanksgiving and the prospect of Christmas, churches are at their fullest (McDowell, interview). In this respect it proved to be a good time to sample, with the data returns showing an interesting range of hymns chosen in the respective

churches. Other features to emerge from the data collection for this service include the following:

- i. None of the churches used any hymns from the *Church Hymnal's* dedicated section on hymns for Saints' Days which includes well-known works such as How's archetypal *For all the saints, who from their labours rest*, sung to *Sine Nomine* and composed by Vaughan Williams.
- ii. There was a great diversity in the hymns sung, as much as in the Trinity season. For example, Lisnaskea Parish Church sang the Wesleyan Advent hymn *Come, thou long-expected Jesus*; Castle Archdale Parish Church, Margaret Cropper's Lenten hymn, *Jesus' hands were kind hands, doing good to all* and three churches, Clones, Tempo and Lisnaskea Parish Churches, used the Passiontide hymn *And can it be that I should gain*, again by Wesley and sung to Thomas Campbell's *Sagina*.

From the hymns sung on that day in the chosen churches, over a quarter were from the eighteenth century, namely 27%. As well as the Wesleyan hymns above, other works used from this period include others of his: *Jesus, lover of my soul*, which was sung by two different churches on the same day, as was Cowper's *Jesus, where'er Thy people meet*.

7.6.2 Review of the churches chosen

In both 6.4.1 and 6.6.3, summaries are given of the reasons why the chosen churches were selected and on what criteria. With the research now completed, as in 7.6.1, it is interesting to consider the other factors that emerged from the data collection and why these may impact upon the over-arching research question posed generally by the thesis and specifically by this chapter.

7.6.2.1 Clogher Cathedral

Clogher Cathedral is a cathedral in name only, its primary function being that of a parish church for a small, single street village in a rural location. Historically, it is a very interesting Church, with its roots going back to the late thirteenth century; the present building was constructed in 1744 and worship has continued since (TEENA, 2011).

The Church itself is small and its congregation seldom stretches beyond 100 persons for a popular service, fewer for routine Sunday services. The samples were collected with relative ease, having been collated from the organist, who keeps her own records, the sole record of hymns sung in the church. Being some miles from the nearest market town of any size, resources are thin but a choir is maintained throughout the main church season, although it is mainly unison, with two ladies singing occasional alto. All anthems are sung in unison with seldom, if ever, any simple harmony. On balance, its rural nature and mix of rural and village congregation members means that its hymn choice is no different from any other small rural parish church in the island of Ireland and therefore, its sample is representative of similar churches.

For the services selected for sampling, Clogher Cathedral sang a total of twenty hymns, of which seven were from the eighteenth century, or 40%. These were Cowper's *Jesus, where'er Thy people meet*, Morison's *The people that in darkness walked*, Watt's *Jesus shall reign where'er the sun*, Wesley's *Jesu, lover of My soul* and *You servants of the Lord*, as well as two instances of Tate and Brady's *As pants the hart for cooling streams*.

7.6.2.2 St Patrick's Church, Castle Archdale

Rather confusingly, this Church is known by four names, all of which are equi-popular; St Patrick's, Castle Archdale, Derryvullen and Lisnarick. The first three are all accurate to a degree, reflecting derivations of either the church or parish name,

but the latter label applied is simply the name of the nearest village to the rural church. From a geographical point of view, the church is situated on the edge of Castle Archdale Estate and is at the entrance to the country park of the same name. Consequently, it enjoys a mix of both local parishioners and holiday-makers from the nearby campsite and caravan park, especially in the summer. In this respect it does not suffer the virtual hibernation that other rural parishes seem to.

The organ is a two-manual pipe organ with single octave pedal board and two facing double rows of *cantoris and decani* seating for the choir, in the upper nave.

The hymns are collated by the organist and lay reader, who is the sole record keeper of such matters, as the hymns are not recorded in the “preacher’s book”. All the hymns are displayed on the hymn board at the start of the service though the church does use printed order of service sheets for quite a few occasions and when this happens, the words of the hymns are printed as well. The minister stresses that he likes this as it suits the many visitors to the church and provides those not familiar with the Anglican service with the order as a single document. Finally, whilst the church then enjoys a healthy attendance on a year-round basis, it still is typical of many small rural churches in its musical resources and, as such, there is no bias in the sample.

Only three of Castle Archdale Parish Church’s hymns are from the eighteenth century and they are all by Charles Wesley, namely; *Come, thou long expected Jesus, O Thou who camest from above* and *You servants of the Lord*. This means that almost 14% of their repertoire from these Sundays was from that period.

7.6.2.3 Garvary Parish Church

The samples from Garvary Parish Church were provided by one of the organists who records all the hymns the Church uses, whether she is playing or not. As in previous examples, she is the sole record-keeper as they are not formally added to the “preacher’s book”.

The organist was reluctant to release the details of the hymns, fearing that it would show up what she assumed was the church's parochialism, and needed assurance that her church was no different to many others in similar geographical locations with matching demographics and history. Despite her reservations, the church did sing a wider variety of hymns than she assumed, and like all churches, it had its favourites, irrespective of the point in the Church calendar.

The church has a two-manual Yamaha digital piano and the hymns are played using the "organ" voicings on the instrument. There is also a pedal board attached but only one of the duty organists uses it. There is room for two *cantoris and decani* rows of singers in the upper nave, but these are rarely filled and when this is so, by unison singers.

The church's inclusion into the sampling procedure for this thesis was valid on a number of levels: primarily for its location several miles out of a busy but small market town, its size and its scope. For the five services sampled in the year, the Church sang fifteen hymns and of these, three, or 20%, were eighteenth century, namely; Watts' *Jesus shall reign where'er the sun*, Wesley's *Christ whose glory fills the skies* and Doddridge's *Hark the glad sound! The saviour comes*.

7.6.2.4 St Columb's Cathedral, Londonderry

A cursory glance at the orders of service of English Cathedrals' morning prayers will show that at most, three hymns are sung, usually fewer. With this in mind, it was unusual to find that St Columb's Cathedral, which clearly models itself on this approach to worship, sings up to five hymns per service, addressing its need more fully as a parish church, which effectively, it is. This seems at odds with its website, which gives the impression of a church in much grander soundings and with greater resources than it has in reality. First, the church building is no larger than any modest town parish church; second, its choir of men and boys sings only one service per week and finally, there are very few recordings or other indicators of the aspired professionalism that the Cathedral's music seems to reach (St Columb's Cathedral,

2010 d). That said, the organ is a well-maintained Wells-Kennedy instrument and it is laudable that in such a small, predominantly Roman Catholic city (see 7.4.2) they can maintain a choir of men and boys.

In terms of its suitability and relevance as a sample, the Cathedral is very typical of an Anglican presence in a large town or small city in Ireland, primarily for the following reasons:

- i. As cited in 7.4.2 it is typical of a large town or small city in Ireland with a demographic which is not in the Anglican's population's favour.
- ii. With limited resources in terms of available congregation members, it uses hymns in a focused and intelligent manner, trying to balance the needs of the congregation who like hymns which are familiar with giving the choir material that is musically complex enough to provide interest for them.
- iii. Like so many Anglican churches in similar sized towns, its population is very much in the minority and Roman Catholic music is a much stronger presence. As such, St Columb's own hymn choices are interesting and apposite.

During the five chosen Sundays, St Columb's sang a total of twenty-three hymns of which five were from the eighteenth century, or 22%. These are *Wesley's Forth, in Thy name, O Lord I go*; *Toplady's Rock of ages, cleft for me*; *Doddridge's Hark the glad sound! The Saviour comes*; and two renditions of *You servants of the Lord*, also by Doddridge.

7.6.2.5 St Columba's Parish Church, Omagh

There are many similarities between St Columba's Parish Church and the Cathedral Church of St Columb's in Londonderry. At least in its approach to worship, St Columba's appears to be a very modern church, providing its samples on Microsoft PowerPoint presentations, as they use that method in every service. Not only are the hymns and their words on PowerPoint, but also the entire worship, including the

words of the canticles, prayers, interesting quotations and even accompanying appropriate visual material, such as scenes and landscapes to reflect the content of the service. With this in mind, it was surprising to find that so many of the hymns they used were from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

The robed SATB choir which sits in stalls that rather unusually fill the entire north transept, in raised rankings lies perpendicular to the congregation in the middle of the church, in front of the choir. In this fashion, the choir parts take a row each, or as close to this as possible. Despite this unusual arrangement and indeed of the geography of the church in general, its role in being a sample for this research was justified on the basis that it is representative of churches in many market towns of similar size and Protestant demography in terms of its available resources and approach to worship.

Of the twenty-four hymns sung in the five week sample selection, only two were from the eighteenth century, though a good deal more were pre-twentieth century. The two from the relevant canon for this thesis were Watts' *Give to our God, immortal praise* and Wesley's *Love divine, all loves excelling*,

7.6.2.6 St Mary's Parish Church, Ardess

St Mary's Parish Church's approach to worship, as indicated by its music, appears modern with a forward-thinking outlook. Despite this, the hymns it chooses do not stray too far away from the older, more traditional hymns of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, though of all the churches sampled, it did move beyond the *Church Hymnal* more than others. The organ is a two-manual, Wells-Kennedy pipe instrument with double octave pedal board and its organist is a very competent musician who leads a mainly, but not exclusively, unison choir. The choir stalls are the same as the churches cited so far, being two opposing rows of *cantoris and decani* pews and there is ample room at the chancel for praise groups, when they perform. Finally, its rural location in an affluent and populous area of Anglicans

provides a contrast to the Clones group of parishes, for example, and in this respect its inclusion as a sample is valid.

In total, the Church sang nine of its twenty hymns on the five Sundays sampled, from the eighteenth century canon, or 45%. These hymns were *Love divine, all loves excelling* by Wesley, which was sung on two separate occasions as well as several others of his, namely: *Lo! He comes with clouds descending*; *Jesu, lover of my soul*; and *Ye servants of God, your Master proclaim*. Also sung were John Wesley's *Jesus, Thy blood and righteousness*; Newton's *How sweet the name of Jesus sounds*; Cowper's *Jesus, where'er Thy people meet* and Williams' *Guide me O, Thou great Jehovah*,

7.6.2.7 Cleenish Parish Church

The hinterland around Cleenish Parish Church and its rural location makes it balance Garvary Parish Church in many respects. Its congregation is drawn from both the suburbs of a nearby market town with a mix of the local agricultural economy; its congregation is relatively prosperous and weekly attendance and physical church size, very similar. In this respect it provides another stream of data similar to Garvary Parish Church's and allows like-for-like comparisons.

The Church uses traditional methods for its approach to service such as hymn boards to display the hymns, a small but regular unison choir for leading the worship and very few, if any, praise groups or "modern" instruments. Of the three hymns it uses at each service, its complement of eighteenth century hymns is very small though the remainder are predominantly nineteenth or early twentieth century. From the canon of hymns selected for this thesis, Addison's *While all Thy mercies, O my God*; Doddridge's *Hark, my soul, it is the Lord*; and *As pants the hart for cooling streams* by Tate and Brady are the only three sung on the five Sundays selected, which coincidentally were all sung on the same day, the Third Sunday before Lent, which is in turn 20% of their output on the Sundays sampled as being eighteenth century.

7.6.2.8 Derryvullen North Parish Church, Irvinestown

For a Church in a rural village location, with a small, aging congregation, one would expect to find quite an introspective approach to hymnody, but the reverse is the case. As such, its inclusion as a sample is well justified for it provides an example of similar sized churches which are trying to be positive and to innovate with few resources. From a technical point of view the Church has two rows of *cantoris* and *decani* pews, a small two manual pipe organ and a unison choir. Despite this, they try to educate the congregation by holding such things as family services where requested hymns are played and follow a process of introducing new hymns on a planned basis. It is also interesting that these new hymns are not always contemporary, maybe simply unfamiliar. Finally, the church uses the services of a guitarist from time to time to balance their programme.

Of the 17 hymns used in the sample window, four are from the eighteenth century, these being: *Wesley's Christ whose glory fills the skies*; *Ye servants of God, your Master proclaim*; and *Jesu lover of my soul*, as well as *Cowper's O for a closer walk with God*.

7.6.2.9 Holy Trinity Parish Church, Lisnaskea

The relevancy of Holy Trinity Parish Church in Lisnaskea to the overall research aims is justified in section 6.3.3.9. Having collected the data it was interesting to examine the factors behind the choice of hymns, as the underlying reasons for their selection deserves further clarification.

On face value the church is as described in section 6.3.3.9. There is a competent organist, a regular, albeit unison, choir and according to its minister, the Church enjoys good attendances at its Sunday services. Despite this, there are some contradictory messages and these emanate from the fact that the minister of the church was one of the interviewees used in Chapter 6.4. During discussions with

him, he said that he was happy to let the organist choose all the hymns, yet later on in the conversation he alluded to the fact that he chose them. Again, in the same conversation he spoke of his congregation's love of older hymns and ones familiar from generations handed down. He spoke of his willingness to meet their needs yet he emphasised his fondness for including new hymns in the service. Against all this, the hymns on the selected Sundays speak of a more usual pattern, consistent with the previous samples, with the majority of the hymns being either eighteenth or nineteenth century and around 15% at most being post World War II.

In fact, just two of the twenty hymns are actually eighteenth century, or 10%. These are Doddridge's *Hark the glad sound! The Saviour comes* and Wesley's *Come thou long expected Jesus*.

7.6.2.10 Maguiresbridge Parish Church

Maguiresbridge Parish Church was chosen as a sample because of its typicality of approach to worship, its size and the available resources. The unison choir sing in two *cantoris* and *decani* pews and the organ is a digital two manual, with a single octave pedal board, which is seldom used.

Like Garvary Parish Church, hymns appear to be selected on the basis of both familiarity and ease and the spread of hymns across the *Church Hymnal* appears to reflect this policy; hymns are appropriate for the church season, where possible.

In total the Church used 19 hymns on the Sundays selected and of these, six are from the eighteenth century, 32% or just under one third. These hymns are Isaac Watts' *Jesus shall reign where'er the sun*, which was sung on both the Fourth Sunday after Epiphany and the Third Sunday before Lent services; Kelly's *Hark ten thousand voices sounding*; Wesley's *Jesu, lover of my soul* and *Love divine, all loves excelling*; as well as Cowper's evocative *O for a closer walk with Thee*.

7.6.2.11 The Clones Group of Parishes

Of all the churches chosen, the Clones group of parishes is especially interesting, not only for the reasons outlined in 6.6.3.11 but for the fact that each of the churches within the group has different musical resources available, ranging from a choir of around ten unison singers and a single manual digital piano, to a two manual organ and a choir of almost twenty. In respect of this research it was entirely appropriate to include such a sample as there are many such groups of parishes operating in the Church of Ireland. Also, the parish straddles the border with the Irish Republic so it provides an insight into the musical and hymnody aspirations of congregations in this situation.

The Swedish rector is the source of the drive and commitment in this parish and it is he who rotates the services on a weekly basis between the four churches. In this respect there is continuity, but the hymn choices are left to the individual churches, with consultation in case two churches have the same hymns on consecutive Sundays.

Of the sixteen hymns sung on the five selected Sundays, eight were from the eighteenth century, representing the largest percentage of all the samples, 50%. These hymns include three of Charles Wesley's: *Christ whose glory fills the skies; And can it be;* and *Ye servants of God;* as well as Doddridge's *Hark the glad sound! The Saviour comes;* Péronnet and Ripon's *All hail the power of Jesu's name;* Toplady's *Rock of ages, cleft for me;* Tate and Brady's *As pants the hart for cooling streams;* and Watts' *Blessed be the everlasting God.*

7.6.2.12 Tempo Parish Church

The last church in the sample is the only church to draw its entire congregation from a small rural village without over-spilling into the rural hinterland to the same degree as other churches. It is also in an area of strong Presbyterianism and Methodism and for this reason it is interesting to examine its hymnody.

Musically, the church has very typical resources, compared to like-sized parishes in similar villages. Its organ is a two-manual digital instrument and the organist is a local volunteer. The choir meets weekly. It is a unison choir with just a few alto harmony singers; they sit in two rows of *cantoris* and *decani* pews. Of the church's twenty hymns sung during the five-Sunday sample, five are from the eighteenth century, or 25%. These hymns are *Father of mercies, God of love* by Flowerdew; Wesley's *And can it be that I should gain*; Tate and Brady's *Through all the changing scenes of life and As pants the hart for cooling streams*; Addison's (attributed) *While all Thy mercies, O my God*.

7.6.3 A summary of the overall reasons why eighteenth century hymns have been resilient as proven by the data

- iv. There are certain times of the year that influence what people sing, which of course has an impact on eighteenth century hymn selection.
- v. At times of great emotional pull, such as services like Remembrance Sunday and various Saints' Days or other festivals, there is a greater likelihood of eighteenth century hymns being sung, as these hymns are perceived to have a greater provenance.
- vi. The small selection of hymns in the *Church Hymnal* that are specific to times of the year affects the hymn choice.
- vii. During Christmas, Easter and other key services, hymns historically associated with these times are usually played. This includes a number of eighteenth century ones.
- viii. During the recess months, organists choose hymns which are easily known, sung and universally known.
- ix. There is no evidence to support the fact that smaller, rural and more family-oriented churches choose more hymns that are "traditional". All churches, including cathedrals, are as likely to select hymns from the eighteenth century.
- x. There is a direct link between organists' ability and the hymns chosen. Again, this impacts on the use of eighteenth century hymnody and popularity.

- xi. There is no formal method of keeping the names of hymns chosen at parish, diocesan or even provincial level.
- xii. The organ is predominantly the instrument used for accompaniment and this suits the older style of hymn.
- xiii. Some churches try to promote and educate their parishes and congregations into learning new hymns, but time and resources prevent them from doing this as fully as they would like.
- xiv. Some clergy seem untrained in the history and appropriateness of hymnody and when they provide input into hymn choice, they appear to just muddle the situation.
- xv. Groups or parishes are especially vulnerable musically, so they tend to play safe by choosing only the universally known hymns; again, these issues impact upon the number of eighteenth century hymns used.
- xvi. Strong links between churches of different Protestant sects in a local area result in greater use of commonly known hymns. As a result, Wesleyan hymns feature strongly as Methodism is strong in Ireland.

7.7 ADDRESSING THE RESEARCH QUESTION

This chapter focuses essentially on interpreting the three types of data before the final chapter, which offers overall conclusions to the research question. The context for the research is in section 7.4.1 which provides an overview of the state of the Church of Ireland in terms of the number of worshippers and the percentages of these who are Anglican. From this point of view, it was interesting to observe how few Church of Ireland worshippers there are in the two countries, namely just under 400,000. If one considers the status that the Church enjoys, such as local ministers automatically being made chairs of various school and community boards, it is really quite interesting.

This section of the research also tries in some way to categorise the different types of churches according to their size and scope. Ultimately, this proved useful as

generally speaking, the larger and more affluent the church, the more musical resources it had. In turn, the more resources there were at churches' disposal, the more inventive and creative the musical output. As it transpires, most churches are just surviving, with musical resources being very much a lower priority.

Section 7.4.2 gives an overview of the data, where it was revealed that most churches use a much higher percentage of eighteenth century hymns than the 15% found in the *Church Hymnal*; subsequent sections broke down this data according to the time of the year. Even at this stage, it was interesting to see that there were no real differences in the output of the types of churches, or indeed locations.

The first part of the calendar discussed is Advent, Christmas and Epiphany. As there has to be some way of making the data more specific than for the whole year, these weeks were combined initially. As it transpires, some churches freely interchange the hymns specifically from this time, so allowing some like-for-like comparisons. The research also provides an evaluation of the circumstances in each church, how it approaches this time of year, and this was useful as it provides some insight into the way hymns are chosen and thus explains more fully why eighteenth century hymns have proved resilient. At this stage, it is interesting to see how few churches use the lectionary and also how a few hymns are recycled around a few churches, with *On Jordan's Bank*; *Hark the glad sound the saviour comes*; and *Christ is the world's true light*, being sung eighteen times over 13 weeks in five churches, or more specifically 9.5%.

From the discussion on the Lenten hymns sung, as discussed in section 7.4.3.2, a very high 26% of the hymns used were from the eighteenth century canon; this was especially interesting as this is the time when choirs begin to wind down for the season. In addition, it is evident from this that Easter seems to be a time when people are at their most traditional, a time when they seem to dislike change the most. As such, it points to evidence that churches sing older familiar hymns when they are at their most vulnerable, a point made all the more valid when in section 7.4.3 it is pointed out that during Trinity, almost half the hymns are from the eighteenth century. This section concluded with a short evaluation of other

Sundays and the criteria used in the research to consider the hymns sung on those days.

In Section 7.5, the results of the qualitative in-depth surveys are discussed. It is an interesting section, and throws light on why the eighteenth century hymns are resilient. In many ways it underpins the feelings emerging from the quantitative data used in 7.4 and 7.6. It is also interesting to hear the human side of the argument, where all the people interviewed speak with real passion and feeling about the state of the Church and specifically about the musical aspect.

Some of the respondents are upbeat and positive; McDowell, Moore and Downey are three who are especially representative of that group. They see music as evolving and realise that though not all hymns are to everyone's taste, it is a question of balance. On the other hand, some interviewees are a little despondent, feeling that they are caught in a vicious circle of having not enough young people in the church and not enough music to suit their tastes. It was interesting to hear Allen speak of the need to develop chanting and the singing of responses, which was something he felt passionately about and that he felt needed to be developed or it could die out. In any case, all the responses are discussed in the component sections in 7.5 and this was something that worked well, allowing like-for-like comparisons on similar topics within hymnody.

In 7.5.1, the liturgical reasons for eighteenth century hymns' resilience drew enthusiastic responses from the interviewees, probably the most of all the sections. A diverse range of opinions was offered but the key points to emerge from this area are that older hymns are more biblically based and offer a more relevant liturgy. In addition, hymns from this period offer a great deal more specificity in terms of their use at certain services.

In some ways, many of the respondents featured in section 7.5.2 were initially slightly confused by what was meant by the term "socio-historic" and this took some explaining, but the underlying message from this was the historic ties of older hymns and their sense of provenance. McDowell especially offered valuable observations

when talking on this topic and his point that hymns themselves have their own cultural attachment was interesting and is a possible area for further research in hymnody.

Literary reasons for the resilience of hymns proved to be the topic most respondents found difficult to talk about at length. All agreed that hymns are also good poems, but it was a little disappointing to find that many did not have more developed feelings on this. Kerr, however, did talk about the narrative development in the poem and Irvine, as well, liked the stories the hymns told.

The majority of the argument in section 7.5.4, that is, the musical reasons for resilience, centred on the dilemma of whether a hymn is unpopular because it does not have a familiar tune and, in turn, if it was better known, whether it would be used more often. Only history will tell, but there were many other useful points also to consider in this area. McDowell, for example, spoke of the need for the usage of older hymns in order to maintain the Church of Ireland's choral tradition and Moore also respected the need for choirs to sing good quality SATB music.

Section 7.5.5 attracted fewer responses, with some conclusions offered about the input of clergy either in promoting or in suppressing the canon of eighteenth century hymns. Finally, the section focussed on the input of congregations into the resilience of eighteenth century hymns, the last to be discussed. The argument here centred on the need for greater feedback from the pews, as well as more education and awareness.

7.6, the final major section, was the macro level research to balance 7.4. Again it was quantitative but focused on five specifically chosen services throughout the year. The first of these, the First Sunday in Advent, returned 54% of the hymns on this day being from the eighteenth century, which clearly asks some impertinent questions about what modern hymns fail to offer.

In 7.6.1.2 and 7.6.1.3, the Epiphany and Lenten sections, a much smaller 33% of hymns were from the thesis' canon but again, this is still more than double what is in the *Hymnal*, and Trinity and All Saints' Days quota of 27% is just fractionally smaller.

Here, the number of hymns repeated proves of interest. It perhaps says much about the lack of viable alternatives, for whatever reason, when certain hymns are used over and over in the Church.

In section 7.6.1 background information to the churches not discussed in section 6.4.2 is provided to conclude the chapter, before the main reasons listed for resilience are summarised in section 7.6.3 in the same way as in sections 7.4.4 and 7.5.7.

With the data now completed and evaluated, the academic findings accounted for and the objectives for this chapter concluded, the research is now in a position to offer accurate, considered and appropriate reasons why the eighteenth century hymn has proved to be resilient in contemporary Church of Ireland worship.

CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION

8.1 INTRODUCTION

This final chapter, the conclusion, draws together the arguments and viewpoints discussed in the thesis and offers deductions and solutions to the problem statement offered at the commencement of the research.

The primary aim of this research was to discuss, evaluate and resolve why eighteenth century hymns proved to be so resilient and durable in contemporary Church of Ireland worship. This was to be motivated and interrogated from the following angles;

- i. To examine why the eighteenth century is considered a golden period of hymn-writing.
- ii. To identify the small canon of hymns that has survived to current usage in the Church of Ireland hymnal.
- iii. To determine accurate statistics about the usage of these hymns in contemporary worship.
- iv. To determine the key threats that these hymns have faced and continue to face.

This concluding chapter will discuss the research's success in addressing these aims as well as offering suggestions and opinions regarding the over-arching question, suggesting possible areas for further research as well as discussing gaps in the literature market that became clear as the thesis evolved.

8.2 EVALUATING THE FULFILMENT OF THE PRIMARY AIMS OF THE RESEARCH

8.2.1 To identify the small canon of hymns that have survived to current usage in the Church of Ireland hymnal

Having now established the fact that the eighteenth century was a period well-worth investigating, the next stage of the process was to determine the canon of hymns from the eighteenth century that are used in the Church of Ireland. This involved a two stage process; first, to understand and evaluate the history of hymnody in the Church of Ireland and secondly, to actually determine the canon of hymns itself.

The first part of the process involved a step-by-step process and this was necessary for two reasons. Firstly, there are very few academic texts that evaluate hymnody in Ireland from any faith's perspective, let alone the Church of Ireland and secondly, there were equally few texts that gave a history of how civic and religious affairs reflect upon hymnody. Finally, a contextual understanding of the Church's history in terms of its music and equally, its musical resources, would help draw conclusions about the validity of the overall research question. All of these three areas were addressed in Chapter 3 by discussing the various events in church and civic history that affect hymnody.

The next part of this "step-by-step" process then was to examine the musical and hymnodistic influences directly relating to the Church of Ireland. Chapter 2 gave the Anglican Church in England's context, which was necessary as it was in all respects the body governing, leading and influencing the Church in Ireland; Chapter 3 gave the historical background of the Irish Church relevant to its hymnody and this final part of understanding the use of eighteenth century hymns and the threats and opportunities that followed, was also dealt with in this chapter. Here, two issues were explored:

- i. How music was made in the Church, investigating specific issues that affect hymn usage and selection from pre-eighteenth century until the present day.

- ii. The external influences from hymns from other faiths such as Orthodoxy, the Roman Catholic Church and other main-stream Protestant religions, for example.

In this section, texts by Milne, Pooler, Connolly, Phillips, Rainbow, Grindle, Routley, Watson and McDowell were the most useful but again, there was a lack of adequate resources from which to draw. Likewise, searches of articles and theses bore either marginally relevant or no results, though anything that was valuable was discussed in 3.11 and 4.8.

The last stage of this process was the actual selection of the canon of eighteenth century hymns and this was done in Chapter 5. This was an exhaustive account, taking in both the strict criteria for hymn selection, the physical compilation of the hymns and an evaluation of how hymns are sung and finally, who chooses them. This latter point was especially important as it allowed adequate preparation for the third aim, that of determining accurate statistics about the usage of these hymns in contemporary worship.

8.2.2 To determine accurate statistics about the usage of these hymns in contemporary worship

At the centre of this research lay the statistics about the usage of hymns in today's Church. The data for this was not available centrally and this must be one area for the Church of Ireland to examine, otherwise they cannot plan for the next edition of the *Church Hymnal* if they do not have an accurate picture of which hymns are not being used. Indeed, this very point was put to the planning committee for the next supplement to the current *Hymnal*, but they declined to comment.

The three methods used for collecting data from the Churches about their hymn usage has already been adequately explained in 6.1 – 6.3, but in relation to the research as a whole, it was interesting to view these statistics alongside the perceptions one gets from reading the underpinning academic texts.

8.2.3 To determine the key threats that these hymns have faced and continue to face

Whilst the main focus of the research was on the resilience of the eighteenth century hymn, the other side of the argument of course was the competition and threats it faced and obviously the lack of viable alternatives remained one of the major threats. As the research proved, it is interesting to note that, even in modern churches that use contemporary approaches to worship such as Microsoft Power Point displays and praise groups, there are still a large number of hymns used from the eighteenth century.

The other issue that the research summarised from this section was the fact that there are few differences between the status, size and location of a church; all equally enjoy singing hymns from the eighteenth century. In conclusion, the main threats were:

- i. Older hymns are preserved because the newer ones are promoted predominately by the youth element of churches. This youth element, according to those interviewed, is quite strong and are always keen to promote modern gospel music.
- ii. The fact that there is the feeling that “old hymns are not broken and therefore do not need fixing” acts as a metaphor for the Church being staid and set in its ways. As such, there seems to be a perception amongst rank-and-file clergy and laity that the hierarchy keep wanting to add newer, more modern hymns “just for the sake of it” (Downey, 2011).
- iii. There is a feeling that the current *Church Hymnal* has a disproportionate amount of contemporary hymns and because of this, older hymns will become fewer and fewer as each edition of the Church Hymnal is published.

8.3 SUMMARY OF THE OVERALL REASONS FOR RESILIENCE

It was interesting and sobering to discover the fondness in which the eighteenth century hymn was held, across all sectors of the Church, and whilst there were very few, if any, that didn't at the very least respect the music from that canon, there was frequent derision and even hatred for many modern hymns. In this respect the Church seems to have a real problem moving forward from the point of view of hymnody. On one hand, very few like the contemporary hymn but on the other hand, they do not have the resources to preserve that form of music in terms of training organists, finding and recruiting singers and choir leaders and generally maintaining their choral tradition; a choral tradition which, on the basis of this research, is in tatters.

The provenance of hymns as a reason for eighteenth century hymns' resilience was not a great surprise, especially as the research evolved. The fondness that people spoke of for the hymns of Wesley *et al.* was almost humbling and indicated a sense of nostalgia in both their own and their Church's life. Smiles would break out, wayward glances towards the sky and gentle nods to the head would add to that sense of approval; this being the case across all age ranges.

The whole area of the hymn as a piece of narrative or prose was an area which yielded some reasons for the older hymns' resilience, but only from a few respondents, and this was the same for reasons of those hymns offering a stronger liturgy. Nonetheless, there was the strong underlying message that older hymns offered a much richer experience in worship, usually contrasted with what modern hymns offer.

What became clearer as the research evolved was that the Church really does face a hymnody crisis. Older people and traditionalists loathe modern "happy clappy" music (Downey, 2011) and see it as a piecemeal attempt to bring younger people in or to pay tokenism to be modern (Irvine 2011). The Church of Ireland seems to have a great fear of not being perceived as modern and likes to view itself as being contemporary (Seale, 2011) and this may be arguably one way in which it is trying to

achieve this. Whilst this may or may not be a valid viewpoint, the story is not all doom and gloom for modern music, with several interviewees stating that it was for reasons of familiarity more than anything else that older hymns were sung (Elliott, 2011). With this in mind, the Church arguably needs to invest in supporting new hymns and new hymn writers, as recent material is not known about and the vast majority of churches sometimes use modern music just by accident as it may be on the facing page of a hymn already used or for some other whimsical reason (Seale, 2011).

Perhaps one key to moving forward would be for the Church to take heed of the findings of this thesis. I spoke to a lot of clergy, congregation members, lay workers and church musicians, but none had been consulted on the new *Church Hymnal* supplement and many did not even know it was happening. As such, it seems at best bizarre that the Church of Ireland is moving towards amending its current Hymnal when it does not even appear to know what is being sung at present.

8.4 AREAS FOR RESEARCH

For reasons of consistency, the following possible areas for further research are grouped according in categories. These categories emerged from the literature searches and other ideas that arose from completing the thesis and are in no particular order.

8.4.1 Irish Hymnody

There is a niche not only for literature or studies on Irish hymn writers in general but also for other sub-groups. These include Irish women hymn writers, Irish clerics who were published hymn writers, Irish organists and choristers who were published hymn writers and Irish hymn writers who practiced in England. Of course there are other approaches too, such as regionalised studies of Irish hymn writers. In short, all searches found no collective studies or articles on Irish hymn writers.

8.4.2 Hymn Writers

There is a lot of research on established hymn writers, but lesser-known ones and those related to specific events, times or circumstances are either general commercial “histories” or non-academic pamphlets. One angle of interest to this research might be the evaluation of the Irish hymn writers, especially clerics, who moved to England and wrote their hymns in a Church of England context.

➤ Historical studies in church music

At present, historical studies in church music appear to be based on individual sects, with few inter-faith comparative studies. Thus there may be scope in the following niche areas:

i. Hymnal longevity and “shelf-life” – will modern hymns have the same longevity? Although history can only be the judge of that, there are few, if any, studies similar to this and one idea might be a counter-balance examination of the Roman Catholic faith’s music in Ireland.

ii. Political, socio-historical and other reasons why hymns are used.

The research in this area seems to centre on short chapters or discussions and commentaries on individual hymns. There is little in the way of generic works on a holistic approach such as “a response to hymn-writing arising from the First World War”, for example.

➤ Repertoire studies

Repertoire studies in hymnody are usually marketed at the casual clerical or organists market, with little in the way of any substance. Consequently, there is a need for more specialised, in-depth analysis of hymns from either liturgical, provenancial or musical perspectives.

➤ Musical resources in the Church of Ireland

There is no central resource for recording the names of all the hymns that every parish sings on a service-by-service basis. This is absurd, as the Church is already

planning a supplement to a new hymn book; how can they do this if they do not know what is already being sung?

Equally, there is no central point for recording what resources each church has in terms of choirs, organs, available instruments and the like.

➤ **Chanting and canticles**

There is a need for a study similar to this to be completed on canticles, though without the question of resilience and more focus on usage. Allen (2011) strongly believes that chanting could die and he may well be right as there is no common approach, training or even simple guide books or text books available to the Church.

➤ **The cultural attachment of hymns**

Hymns have a strong cultural attachment and there are limitless theses that could be initiated on this topic alone.

8.5 FINAL CONCLUSIONS

As the research has shown, there is no single reason why eighteenth century hymns have proved resilient but there is no doubting that the central premise posed at the start of this journey, that they are still sung in great numbers, by churches of all sizes, histories and contexts, by congregations that represent the broadest spectrum of the Church of Ireland.

As is of course to be understood, the research opens many other doors and asks questions on many levels, but what is factual and successfully proven is that, for the many reasons explained throughout the thesis, the eighteenth century hymn in the Church of Ireland (Anglican) is in a very healthy state, in spite of, rather than because of, the Church.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ABBEY, C. J. & OVERTON, J. H. 1878. *The English Church in the Eighteenth Century*. London: Dodo Press. 276 p.
- ACADEMY OF AMERICAN POETS. 1997. William Cowper. <http://www.poets.org/poet.php/prmPID/608> Date of access: 18 Apr. 2010.
- ACHESON, A. 2003. *A History of the Church of Ireland, 1691 – 2001*. Dublin: Columba Press. 320p.
- AKENSON, D.H. 1971. *The Church of Ireland, Ecclesiastical Reform and Revolution, 1800 – 1885*. New Haven: Yale University Press. 428 p.
- ALLEN, H. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- APCK. 1960. *The Church Hymnal*. 4th ed. Dublin: APCK. 987p
- ANON. 1973. Sigfrid Karg-Elert. *The Musical Times*. 33-34, Jan. & 489, May.
- ANON. 1987. English Hymnody. *Journal of the Hymn Society*. XI.171
- ANON. 1996. English Officers of State (*In* FRYDE, E. B., GREENWAY, D. E., PORTER, S. & ROY, I. 1996. *A Handbook of British Chronology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 605p)
- ANON. 1998. The Good Friday Agreement. <http://www.nio.gov.uk/agreement.pdf> Date of access: 18 May 2010.
- ANON. 1999. The Constitution of Ireland. <http://www.constitution.ie/reports/ConstitutionofIreland.pdf> Date of access: 14 May 2010.
- ANON. 2000. *Common Praise*. Canterbury: Canterbury Press. 1400 p.
- ANON. 2008. Ancient Island Sites on Lough Erne. <http://www.culturenorthernireland.org/article/746/ancient-island-sites-on-lough-erne> Date of access: 15 Sep. 2011.
- ANON. 2010. The Oxford Movement. http://www.encyclopedia.com/topic/Oxford_movement.aspx Date of access: 10 Apr. 2010.

- ANON. 2011a. Encyclopaedia Britannica Online.
<http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/614673/Act-of-Union> Date of access:
 2 Jul. 2011.
- ANON. 2011b. Archdiocese of Thyateira and Great Britain. www.thyateira.org.uk
 Date of access: 21 Jun. 2011.
- ANON. 2011c. Antiochian Orthodox Church of Saint Ignatius, Belfast.
www.belfast.antiochireland.org Date of access: 23 Jun. 2011.
- ANSWERS. 2010. First Fruits. <http://www.answers.com/topic/first-fruits#ixzz1cN6Utd4G> Date of access: 2 Jun. 2010
- ARCHAEOLOGY CHANNEL. 2011. The Hydraulis.
<http://www.archaeologychannel.org/content/video/hydraulis.html> Date of access:
 4 Apr. 2011.
- ARMENIAN CHURCH, THE. 2011. Diocese of Great Britain.
www.armenianchurch.co.uk Date of access: 22 Jun. 2011.
- ARNOLD, R. 1995. *The English hymn: studies in a genre*. New York: Peter Lang. 254 p.
- BAILEY, A. E. 1950. *The Gospel in Hymns*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons. 600 p.
- BAILEY, C. H. 1906. The Wreck of the Valencia. *Pacific Monthly*. 281, Mar.
- BALLANTINE, CHRISTOPHER. 1974. Charles Ives and the Meaning of Quotation in Music. *The Musical Quarterly*, 65(2): 167-184 (April).
- BALL, MICHAEL. 1979. *Singing to the Lord. The Psalms as Hymns*. London: Bible Press. 78 p.
- BAPTIST CHURCH. 2011. History of the Baptist Church.
<http://www.baptist.org.uk/baptist-history.html> Date of access: 14 Apr. 2011.
- BARNARD, T. 2003. 'That's no good religion that disturbs the government': the Church of Ireland and the non-conformist challenge, 1660-88 - Richard L Greaves; Improving clergymen, 1660-1760. (In FORD, A., MAGUIRE, J. & MILNE, K. eds. 1995. *As by law Established: Church of Ireland since the Reformation*. London: Lilliput Press. 288 p.)
- BARTLETT, J. E., KOTRLIK, J. W. AND HIGGINS, C. C. 2001. Organizational Research: Determining Appropriate Sample Size. *Survey Research. Information Technology, Learning and Performance Journal*. 19(1) Spring.

- BBC. 2011a. Order of Service for the funeral of Diana, Princess of Wales.
<http://www.bbc.co.uk/politics97/diana/order.html> Date of access: 4 Jan. 2011.
- BBC. 2011b. Order of Service for the funeral of The Queen Mother.
<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/uk/1919541.stm> Date of access: 4 Jan. 2011.
- BBC. 2011c. The Greek Orthodox Church.
http://www.bbc.co.uk/london/content/articles/2005/05/27/greek_london_feature.shtm Date of access: 14 Jun. 2011.
- BEDOME BLOGSPOT. 2007. About Benjamin Bedome.
<http://benbeddome.blogspot.com/> Date of access: 14 Dec. 2010.
- BEGBIE, JEREMY S. 2000. *Theology, Music and Time*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 317 p.
- BERTRAM, B. 1996. *In Concert Sing*. Norwich: The Canterbury Press. 234 p.
- BETT, H. 1945. *The Hymns of Methodism*. London: Epworth. 172 p.
- BISHOP, H H. 1886. *Architecture: Especially in Relation to Our Parish Churches*. Dublin: SPCK. 214 p.
- BODLEIAN LIBRARY, THE. 2003.
<http://www.bodley.ox.ac.uk/dept/scwmss/wmss/online/1500-1900/gordon/gordon.html> Date of access: 9 Jun. 2010.
- BRATCHER, D. *ed.* 2011. *The Edict of Worms*.
<http://www.cresourcei.org/creededictworms.html> Date of access 2 Feb. 2011.
- BRITISH LIBRARY, THE. 2010. *Hymnody in the Library*.
<http://direct.bl.uk/bld/Home.do;jsessionid=8607EC08F2AEA8AB6B1275A5DCEBCB16> Date of access: 4th Sep. 2010.
- BROWN, R. E. 1997. *An Introduction to the New Testament*, New Nave: Yale University Press. 928 p.
- BROWN, S. J. 2001. *The national churches of England, Ireland, and Scotland, 1801-1846*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 459 p.
- BROWNLIE, J. 2007. *The hymns and hymn writers of The Church Hymnary*. London & New York: H. Frowde. 380 p
- BURRAGE, H S. 1888. *Baptist Hymn Writers and Their Hymns by Henry Sweetser Burrage*, Portland: Brown Thurston & company. 682 p.

BYZANTINE CATHOLIC CHURCH IN AMERICA. 1996. History of the Byzantine Catholic Church in America. <http://www.byzcath.org/index.php/about-us-mainmenu-60/about-byzantines-mainmenu-62> Date of access: 23 Jun. 2011.

CAGLE, C. W. 2002. The Pipe Organ in Early Modern England. Blacksburg: Virginia Tech University, USA. (PhD Dissertation).

CAIN. 2011a. Conflict Archive on the Internet, University of Ulster. Background information on Northern Ireland Society – Religion. <http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/ni/religion.htm> Date of access: 4 May 2011.

CAIN. 2011b. Conflict Archive on the Internet, University of Ulster. 2011. Parades and marches – Developments at Drumcree, 1995 – 2000. <http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/issues/parade/develop.htm> Date of access: 20 Nov 2011.

CALHOUN, T. O. 1981. Henry Vaughan: The Achievement of the Silex Scintillans. New Jersey: Associated University Presses. 265 p.

CAMERON, J. producer. 1997. Titanic. Released by Twentieth Century Fox, Beverley Hills, Calif.: Twentieth Century Fox. [DVD]

CANNY, N. 1987. From Reformation to Restoration: Ireland 1543 – 1660. Dublin: Edco Ireland. 238 p.

CAPPER, A. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)

CARROLL, D. *ed.* 1999. Religion in Ireland: past, present and future. Blackrock, Co. Dublin: Columba Press. 176 p.

CENTER FOR CHURCH MUSIC, THE. 2009. American Hymnody. www.songsandhymns.org Date of access: 23 May, 2011

CHAPPELL, P. 1968. Music and Worship in the Anglican Church. London: The Faith Press. 143 p.

CHRISTIAN MUSIC. 1982. Katharina von Schlegel. <http://www.suite101.com/content/be-still-my-soul-k-von-schlegel-a34346#ixzz1RhNZVBaT> Date of access: 1 Jun. 2011.

CHURCH OF IRELAND, THE. 1996. Regulations for the remarriage of divorced persons. <http://www.ireland.anglican.org/information/42> Date of access: 12 Aug. 2011.

CHURCH OF IRELAND. 2012. About us. <http://www.ireland.anglican.org/about>. Date of access: 14 April 2012.

- CHURCH SOCIETY, THE. 2010. Philip Doddridge.
http://www.churchsociety.org/churchman/documents/Cman_065_1_SydneyCarter.pdf.
 Date of access: 12 Nov. 2010
- CITY POPULATION. 2010. North East England populations.
<http://www.citypopulation.de/php/uk-england-northeastengland.php?cityid=b70300> Date of access: 1 Dec. 2011.
- CLONTARF PARISH CHURCH. 2011. A second report of HM commissioners on ecclesiastical revenue and patronage, Ireland, 1847 in Clontarf Parish Church.
http://www.archive.org/stream/armaghclergypari00lesl/armaghclergypari00lesl_djvu.txt Date of access: 30 Sep. 2011.
- COLLINS M. 1993. Ireland 1868-1966. BELFAST: EDCO. 280 p.
- COLQUHOUN, F. 1980. Hymns that live: Their meaning and message. London: Hodder and Stoughton. 320 p.
- COOK, P. E. G. & HARRISON, G. 1977. Christian Hymns. Bridgend: Evangelical Press of Wales. 1056 p.
- DALHAUS, C. 1990. Studies in the Origin of Harmonic Tonality. Princeton: Princeton University Press. 408 p.
- DANIEL, D. 2003. The Bible in English: Its History and Influence. New York: Yale University Press. 899 p.
- DARLING, E. & DAVISON, D. eds. 2000. Church Hymnal. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- DAVIE, D. 1993. The eighteenth-century hymn in England. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 167 p.
- DEACON, M. 1980. Philip Doddridge of Northampton. Northampton: Northamptonshire Libraries. 212 p.
- DEARMER, P. 1933. Songs of Praise Discussed. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 560 p.
- DEARNLEY, C. 1970. English Church Music, 1650 – 1750. London: Barrie and Jenkins. 308 p.
- DOLMETSCH. 2005. Principles of Harmony. <http://www.dolmetsch.com/harm.pdf>
 Date of access: 1 Jun. 2011.

- DORNEY, J. 2011. Loyal Dublin – The Dublin Protestant Operative Association. <http://www.theirishstory.com/2011/01/20/loyal-dublin-the-dublin-protestant-operative-association/#.T2SarsUaPpk> Date of access: 4 Apr. 2011.
- DUFF, G. 2008. Pandora: It's all Greek to Boris. *The Independent*: 19, 3 April. <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/people/pandora/pandora-its-all-greek-to-boris-803996.html>
- CITIZENS INFORMATION. 2010. Sources of women's history. http://www.nationalarchives.ie/topics/womens_history/women.html Date of access: 2 Jul. 2010.
- CITIZENS INFORMATION. 2011. National Archives of Ireland. http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/travel_and_recreation/recreational_activities_in_ireland/cultural_institutions/national_archives_of_ireland.html Date of access: 1 Aug. 2011.
- COOK, P. E. G. & HARRISON, G. eds. 1977. *Christian Hymns*. London: Evangelical Press. 1056 p.
- CRESOURCEI. 2006. The edict of Worms <http://www.cresourcei.org/crededictworms.html> Date of access: 3 Nov. 2010.
- CULTURE NORTHERN IRELAND. 2008. Ancient Islands Sites on Lough. http://www.culturenorthernireland.org/article.aspx?art_id=746. Date of access: 9 Sep. 2011.
- DOWNEY, W. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- ELLA, G. 1998. Philip Doddridge. <http://www.puritansermons.com/banner/ella2.htm> Date of access: 16 Oct. 2010.
- ELLIOTT, M. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- ERK, J. C. 1830. *An account of the Ecclesiastical Establishment subsisting in Ireland*. London: Milliken Press. 369 p.
- ESSENTIAL HUMANITIES. 2008. Roman Architecture. <http://www.essential-humanities.net/western-art/western-architecture/roman-architecture/> Date of access: 14 May. 2011.
- FACT INDEX, THE. 2010. The Archbishop of Mainz. http://www.fact-index.com/a/ar/archbishop_of_mainz.html Date of access: 4 Aug. 2010.

- FERGUSON, W. H. & SHAW, G. *eds.* 1919. *The Public School Hymn Book*. 2nd ed. London: Novello. 642 p.
- FLEMING, I. P. 1879. *The Illegality of the "Agnus Dei" after the Prayer of Consecration in the Communion Office and the Lawfulness of the Customary Hymns in Divine Service*. http://anglicanhistory.org/england/misc/plant_agnus1879.html Date of access: 5 Mar. 2010.
- FLEMING, R. J. 1937. *The highway of praise: an introduction to Christian hymnody*. London & New York: Oxford University Press. 143 p.
- FOSTER, R. 1988. *Modern Ireland, 1600 – 1972*. London: Penguin. 688 p.
- FRAME, J. M. 1997. *Contemporary worship music: a biblical defense*. Phillipsburg, USA: P&R Publishing. 232 p.
- FRANZ MANUFACTURING. 1997. *A Brief History of the Metronome*. <http://www.franzmfg.com/history.htm> Date of access: 15 Feb. 2011.
- GENERAL THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY. 2011. *The Heritage of the General Theological Seminary*. http://www.gts.edu/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=725&Itemid=52. Date of access: 3 Jun. 2011.
- GENEVAN PSALTER, THE. 1982. *The Geneva Psalter text*. http://genevanpsalter.redeemer.ca/psalm_texts.html#psalm24 Date of access: 20 Aug. 2010
- GILLEN, G. *ed.* 2001. *Irish Musical Studies VI: A Historical Anthology of Irish Church Music* Dublin: Four Courts Press. 240 p.
- GRACE MUSIC. 2009. *Christopher Wordsworth*. http://www.igracemusic.com/hymnbook/authors/christopher_wordsworth.html Date of access: 11 May 2010.
- GRAHAM, F. K. 2004. *With One Heart and One Voice: A Core Repertory of Hymn Tunes Published for Use in the Methodist Episcopal Church in the United States, 1808-1878*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press. 167 p
- GREEK ORTHODOX CHURCH IN BRITAIN, THE. 1998. *About the Greek Orthodox Church*. <http://www.nostos.com/church> Date of access: 21 Jun. 2011.
- GRINDLE, W. H. 1989. *Irish cathedral music: a history of music at the cathedrals of the Church of Ireland*. Belfast: Institute of Irish Studies, Queen's University of Belfast. 261 p.

- HANDCOCK, L. 1996. Northern Ireland: Troubles Brewing.
<http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/othelem/landon.htm#fear> Date of access: 11 Jun. 2010.
- HEADMASTERS CONFERENCE. 1919. The Headmasters' Conference. The Public School Hymnbook, Online edition
<http://www.canamus.org/Enchiridion/Xtrs/pshb1919.htm> Date of access: Feb. 2010.
- HEMPTON, D. & HILL, M. 1992. Evangelical Protestantism in Ulster Society, 1740 - 1890. London: Routledge. 288
- HENSON, H. 1944. Retrospect of an unimportant life. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 432 p.
- HEXHAM ABBEY. 2011. Music in Hexham Abbey.
<http://www.hexhamabbey.org.uk/worship-music/> Date of access Jan 2nd 2012
- HILDEBRANDT F. & BECKERLEGGE, A. *eds.* 1983: A Collection of Hymns for the use of the People called Methodists. The Works of John Wesley, vol. 7. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 786 p.
- HILL, J. R. *ed.* 2010. A New history of Ireland, Volume VII. Oxford: OUP. 1190 p.
- HISTORY HOME. 2011. Religion and politics in England and Ireland 1820 – 1841.
<http://www.historyhome.co.uk/peel/religion/relandpol.htm> Date of access: 23 July 2011.
- HOLY SEE, THE. 2011. Vatican City State, Pope Benedict XVI.
http://www.vatican.va/phome_en.htm Date of access: 15 Jun. 2011.
- HOOD, E. P. 1875. Isaac Watts: His Life and Writings, His Homes and Friends. London: Adamant Publishing. 369 p.
- HORSHAM COUNCIL. 2010. Churches in Horsham.
<http://www.horsham.gov.uk/news/2008/9141.aspx> Date of access: 4 October 2010.
- HYLSON-SMITH, K. 1989. Evangelicals in the Church of England 1734-1984. Edinburgh: T and T.Clark. 411 p
- HYMNARY. 2007a. <http://www.hymnary.org/?qu=tallis%27+canon> Date of access: 21 June, 2011.
- HYMNARY. 2007b. http://www.hymnary.org/person/Stennett_J1 Date of access, 15 Oct. 2010.

- HYMNARY. 2007c. http://www.hymnary.org/text/jesus_shall_reign_whereer_the_sun Date of access: 3 Dec. 2010.
- HYMNARY. 2007d. Arthur Henry Brown. http://www.hymnary.org/person/Brown_AH Date of access: 23 Jun. 2011.
- HYMNARY. 2007e. Didache. <http://www.hymnary.org/person/Didache1> Date of access: 23 Jun. 2011.
- HYMNARY. 2007f. Let all mortal flesh keep silent. http://www.hymnary.org/text/let_all_mortal_flesh_keep_silence Date of access: 25 Jun. 2011.
- HYMN SOCIETY, THE. 2008. The Secretary's Newsletter in Hymn Society of Great Britain and Ireland's Journal. <http://www.hymnsocietygbi.org.uk/Images/Hymn%20Society%20News%20Letter7-08.pdf>. Date of access: 3 Jun. 2010.
- IRISH COUNCIL OF CHURCHES, THE. 2011. Orthodoxy in Ireland. www.irishchurches.org/files/OrthodoxyinIreland06.pdf Date of access: 22 Jun. 2011.
- IRISH INTER-COLLEGIATE CHRISTIAN UNION. 1913. Ireland's hope: A call to service. London: IICCU Press. 232 p.
- IRISH STATUTE BOOKS. 1972. The Fifth Amendment of the Constitution Act. <http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/1972/en/act/cam/0005/index.html> Date of access: May 2010.
- IRVINE, J. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- IRWIN, J. *ed.* 1983. Sacred sound: music in religious thought. Chico, USA: Scholars Press. 172 p.
- JEFFREY, F. 1965. Anglican-Methodist Relations. (*In* HURLEY, M. 1970. Irish Anglicanism, 1869 – 1969). Dublin: Allen Figgis. 236 p.
- JULIAN, J. 1907. 1839-1913, A dictionary of hymnology: setting forth the origin and history of Christianity. London: J. Murray. 1768 p.
- JUSTUS. 2010. The Society of Archbishops. www.justus.anglican.org Date of access: 12 March, 2011.

- KERR, J. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- KLAUSER, T. 1979. A short history of the western liturgy; an account and some reflections. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 240 p
- KOTLER, P. & ARMSTRONG, G. 1990. Marketing: An Introduction. Eaglewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall. 592 p
- LIECHTY, J. 2001. The problem of sectarianism and the Church of Ireland. (*In* FORD, A., MAGUIRE, J. & MILNE, K. eds. 1995. As by law Established: Church of Ireland since the Reformation. London: Lilliput Press. 288 p.)
- LISBURN. 2010. The history of the Presbyterian Church in Northern Ireland. <http://www.lisburn.com/books/history-presbyterian/history-presbyterian-3.html>
Date of access: 3 Sep. 2011.
- LITTLE, W. 2010. A Brief Background to the 1876 Hymn-book. <http://www.ccel.org/ccel/wesley/hymn/jwg3000.html> Date of access: 14 Dec. 2010.
- LIVIUS. 2011. Ancient History. www.livius.org Date of access: 22 Jun. 2011.
- LUTHER, M. 1884. The Hymns of Martin Luther set to their original Melodies (English version). Translated from German by Leonard Woolsey Bacon and Nathan H. Allen. London: Hodder and Stoughton. 107 p.
- McCAULEY, L. 1886. The Life and Writings of Addison. London: Hurd and Houghton. 120p.
- McDOWELL, J. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- McHUGH, B. 1980. Music in St Patrick's Cathedral, Dublin, 1865 – 1915. Dublin: University College Dublin. 222 p.
- McHUGH, J. 2011. Presbyterianism (*In* The Catholic Encyclopaedia, Volume 12) [CD].
- McKEE, J. 1982. The Choral foundation of Armagh Cathedral: 1600 – 1870. Belfast: Queens University of Belfast. (Dissertation – M.A.) 86 p.
- MACMILLAN, J. D. 1988. The Lord our Shepherd. Bryntirion, Wales: Evangelical Press of Wales. 78 p.
- MAGUIRE, M. 1990. The Church of Ireland and the problem of the Protestant working-class of Dublin, 1870s-1930s. (*In* FORD, A., MAGUIRE, J. & MILNE, K. eds.

1995. *As by law Established: Church of Ireland since the Reformation*. London: Lilliput Press. 288 p.)
- MANT, R. 1933. *Church of Ireland in the reign of King Charles II until Michael Boyle, Archbishop of Armagh*. (In Philips, W. A. ed. 1934. *History of the Church of Ireland*. Vol. 1. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 820 p.
- MANWARING, R. A. 1991. *A Study of Hymn-writing and Hymn-singing in the Christian Church*. New York: Edwin Mellen Press. 188 p.
- MATTHEWS, B. 1985. *Members of the Royal Society of Musicians 1734-1984*. London: The Royal Society of Musicians. 151 p.
- MELROSE MUSIC. 2001. <http://www.melrosemusic.ie/Aboutmel.htm> Date of access: 17 April, 2011
- MILLER, D. W. 1978. Presbyterianism and modernisation Ulster. *Past and Present*, 80(8):66-90, August.
- MILNER, THOMAS. 2011. *The Life, Times and Correspondence of the Rev Isaac Watts, DD*. London: Lightening Sources. 744 p.
- MOODY, T.W. & VAUGHAN, W. E. ed. 1986. *A New History of Ireland, IV: Eighteenth Century Ireland 1691 – 1800*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 604 p.
- MOORE, G. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- MOORE, H. 1937. *Ireland and her Church*. Dundalk, Ireland: Dundalgen Press. 50 p.
- MOUGHTY, DONNA. 2011. *Church of Ireland Records*. http://www.moughty.com/Site/Blog/Entries/2011/4/11_Church_of_Ireland_Records.html Date of access: 2 Jul. 2011.
- MURPHY, ANTION. 2000. *The Celtic Tiger, an analysis of Ireland's economic growth performance*. (In the Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies EU Working Papers, RSC No 2000/16.) www.eui.eu/RSCAS/WP-Texts/00_16.pdf Date of access: 14 Aug. 2011.
- MUSIC, D. W. 1996. *Hymnology: a collection of source readings*. London: The Scarecrow Press. 235pp.
- MUSIC, DAVID, 2001. *Christian Hymnody in Twentieth-Century Britain and America*. London: Greenwood Publishing. 2001p

NATIONAL LIBRARY OF AUSTRALIA ARCHIVE. 2009. The Psalms of David.
<http://catalogue.nla.gov.au/Record/3250684> Date of access: 25 Mar. 2010.

NAXOS MUSIC. 2010. George Wither.
http://www.naxos.com/person/George_Wither/40137.htm Date of access: 18 Mar. 2010.

NIELSEN, CARL. 2010. Carol Nielsen.
<http://carlnielsen.dk/pages/vaerkoversigt/orkestermusik.php> Date of access: 1 Oct. 2010.

NISRA. 2010. The Northern Ireland Statistics and Research Agency.
<http://www.nisra.gov.uk/Census/2001%20Census%20Results/PopulationReport.htm>
 | Date of access: 20 Dec. 2011.

NORTHCOTT, CECIL. 1964. Hymns in Christian Worship. London: Lutterworth Press. 100 p.

NORTHERN IRELAND GOVERNMENT <http://www.nio.gov.uk/agreement.pdf>

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY, USA. 1970.
http://search.library.northwestern.edu/primo_library Date of access: 3 Jun. 2011.

NUTTALL, G F. 1965. Richard Baxter. London: Nelson. 217 p.

OPEN LIBRARY, THE. 2010. Enchiridion
<http://openlibrary.org/books/OL24781239M/Enchiridion> Date of access, 4 October, 2010.

OLNEY HYMNS ONLINE, THE. 2005. The Olney Hymns.
<http://www.ccel.org/ccel/newton/olneyhymns.toc.html> Date of access: 15 Mar. 2010.

ORTHODOX CHRISTIANITY. 2002. About Orthodoxy. www.orthodoxchristianity.net
 Date of access: 16 Jun. 2011.

ORTHODOX CHURCH IN AMERICA, THE. 1996. Orthodoxy in America.
<http://ocafs.oca.org> Date of access: 22 Jun. 2011.

PASETA, SENIA. 2003. Modern Ireland: A Very Short Introduction. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 184 p.

PATHEOS. 2010. Baptist Influences.
<http://www.patheos.com/Library/Baptist/Origins/Influences.html> Date of access: 4 Jun. 2011.

- PATRICK, Saint. 1998. *Confessions of St. Patrick and Letter to Coroticus*. Translated from Latin by J Skinner. London: Bantam. 112 p.
- PENDLE.NET 2004. Wallace Hartley. <http://www.pendle.net/WallaceHartley/> Date of access: 3 Jun. 2010.
- PETTEGREE, A. 2005. *Reformation and Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 252 p.
- PETTIGREW, R. 2002. *The Ancient Hydraulis*. <http://www.archaeologychannel.org/hydraulisint.html> Date of access: 5 Sep. 2011.
- PHILLIPS, C. H. 1969. *The singing church : an outline history of the music sung by choir and people*. London: Faber and Faber. 288 p.
- POOLE, A. 2010. Churchmen face calls to resign over St Anne's church music row. *The Belfast Telegraph*: 9, 19 Aug.
- POOLER, L. A. 1902. *A Short History of the Church of Ireland*. Dublin: APCK. 176 p.
- PURLL, A. 2007. *The history of the organ*. <http://www.purlla.com/teacher/organ/history-of-the-pipe-organ.html> Date of access. Oct. 2011.
- PUSEY HOUSE. 2006. *The Oxford Movement*. <http://www.puseyhouse.org.uk/house/history/oxfordmovement> Date of access: 15 Mar. 2006
- PWEICKE, F. J. 1926. *The Cambridge Patonists*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 376 p.
- RAINBOW, B. 1970. *The Choral Revival in the Anglican Church (1839–1872)*. London: Boydell Press. 390 p.
- RAMSAY M. W. 1896. *St. Paul the Traveler and the Roman Citizen*. London: Putney. 396pp.
- RANDEL, D. M. *ed.* 1986. *The New Harvard Dictionary of Music*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. 968 p.
- RARE BOOK ROOM. 2011. *Isaac Watts' Divine Songs*. <http://www.rarebookroom.org/pdfDescriptions/watdiv.pdf> Date of access: 4 Jun. 2011.
- RATTENBURY, J. E. 1948. *The Eucharistic Hymns of John and Charles Wesley*. London: The Epworth Press. 249 p.

- READER, W. J. 1964. *Life in Victorian England*. London: Putnam Publishing. 176 p.
- REAGAN, N. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- REPRESENTATIVE CHURCH BODY, THE. 2011. *About the Church of Ireland*. <http://ireland.anglican.org/index.php?do=about&id=103> Date of access: 3 Feb, 2011
- RICHARDSON, P. 1999. *Herod: King of the Jews and friend of the Romans*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group. 453 p.
- ROUTLEY, E. 1964. *Twentieth century church music*. London: Herbert Jenkins. 244p
- ROUTLEY, E. 1979. *A Panorama of Christian Hymnody*. Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press. 708 p.
- ROWTHORN, B. & WAYNE, N. 1988. *The political economy of conflict*. Cambridge: Polity Press. 230 p.
- RUSSIAN ORTHODOX CHURCH, THE. 2011. *The Russian Orthodox Church outside Russia*. www.rocor.org.uk Date of access: 15 Jun. 2011.
- SADIE, S. *ed.* 1980. *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, Vol. 5. London: Macmillan Publishers Limited. 802 p.
- ST ANNE'S CATHEDRAL. 2005. <http://www.belfastcathedral.org/visitors/virtual-tour/item/63/corbel-william-alexander/> Date of access: 20 May 2010.
- ST ANNE'S CATHEDRAL, BELFAST. 2006. *Music in St Anne's Cathedral*. <http://www.belfastcathedral.org/music> Date of access: 11 Nov. 2011.
- ST ANNE'S CATHEDRAL, BELFAST. 2009. *Charles Frederick d'Arcy* <http://www.belfastcathedral.org/heritage/deans-of-belfast-since-1904/darcy/> Date of access: 15 Oct. 2011.
- ST BRENDAN'S CATHEDRAL, CLONFERT. 2011. www.moytura.com/clonfert.htm Date of access: 4 April, 2011
- ST COLUMB'S CATHEDRAL, LONDONDERRY. 1970. *A Green Hill Far Away: A Life of Mrs C.F. Alexander E.W. Lovell, 1970*, Friends of Derry Cathedral. Date of access: 15 Jun. 2010.
- ST COLUMB'S CATHEDRAL, LONDONDERRY. 2011a. *About St Columb's Cathedral*. www.stcolumbscathedral.org Date of access: 9 Sep. 2011.

ST COLUMB'S CATHEDRAL, LONDONDERRY. 2011b. A brief history of St Columb's Cathedral. <http://www.stcolumbscathedral.org/page5.html> Date of access: 19 Nov. 2011.

ST COLUMB'S CATHEDRAL, LONDONDERRY. 2011c. St Columb's Cathedral Choir. <http://www.stcolumbscathedralchoir.com/staff.htm> Date of access: 8 Dec. 2011.

ST MARY'S PARISH CHURCH, MAGHERCULMONEY, ARDESS. 2009. About the Parish. http://clogher.anglican.org/index_files/Page2530.htm Date of access: 3 Feb. 2011.

ST MARY'S SYRIAN ORTHODOX CHURCH. 2009. St Mary's Syrian Church. www.stmaryswaterford.com Date of access: 22 June, 2011

ST MULTOSE'S CHURCH, KINSALE. 2011. The history of St Multose's Church. <http://kinsale.ie/st-multose-church> Date of access: 4 May, 2011

ST PATRICK'S CATHEDRAL, ARMAGH. 2009. The History of the choir. <http://www.stpatricks-cathedral.org/worship-music/history-of-the-choir/> Date of access: 14 Sep. 2011.

ST PATRICK'S CATHEDRAL, DUBLIN. 2011. The Choir of St Patrick's Cathedral. http://www.stpatrickscathedral.ie/the_cathedral_choir.aspx Date of access: 15 Jun. 2011.

SCM. 2009. A history of *Hymns, Ancient and Modern*. <http://www.scm-canterburypress.co.uk/CorpHistory.asp> Date of access: 14 May 2010.

SEALE, E. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)

SKIDMORE GENEALOGY. 2011. The Skudamore organ. http://www.skidmoregenealogy.com/images/OccPap_no_26_20071027.pdf Date of access: 25 Jun. 2011.

SMITH CREEK MUSIC. 2011. The New English Renaissance. <http://smithcreekmusic.com/Hymnology/NewEnglishRenaissance/hymnexplosion.html> Date of access: 1 Sep. 2011.

STANFORD, C. V. 1914. Pages from an unwritten diary. London: Arnold. 328 p.

STANFORD, W. B. 1946. Faith and Faction in Ireland Now. Dublin: APCK. 39 p.

SUFFOLK CHURCHES. 2009. The Oxford Movement. <http://www.suffolkchurches.co.uk/zoxfordmovement.htm> Date of access: 16 Apr. 2010.

- SUMMER MADNESS. 2010. Summer Madness Christian Camp.
http://www.summermadness.co.uk/2012/?page_id=73 Date of access: 4 Apr. 2010.
- SWANN, W. 1982. *The Gothic Cathedral*. London: Random House. 328pp
- SZECHI, D. 1994. *The Jacobites*. Manchester, England: Manchester University Press. 172 p.
- TEENA. 2011. Clogher and St Macartin's Cathedral.
<http://freepages.genealogy.rootsweb.ancestry.com/~cotyroneireland/churchrecord/Clogher-StMaCartans.html> Date of access: 11 Oct. 2011.
- TEMPERLEY, N. 1979. *The music of the English parish church, Volume One*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 447p
- TEMPERLEY, N. 2009. *Studies in English Church Music, 1550 – 1900*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 368 p.
- THISTLETHWAITE, N. 1999. *Origins and development of the organ. The Cambridge Companion to the Organ*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 354 p.
- THOMPSON, J. 1996. William Reeves and the medieval texts and manuscripts at Armagh. *Peritia* 10:363-380. (Journal of the Medieval Academy of Ireland.)
- TUVE, R. 1952. *A Reading of George Herbert*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 216 p
- UNITED STATES CENSUS BUREAU. 2011. US Census Data. www.census.gov Date of access: 23 Jun. 2011.
- UNIVERSAL LIBRARY. 2010.
<http://www.archive.org/details/historyandusehym007965mbp> Date of access: 15 Mar. 2010.
- VAN RENSBURG, J. J. 2007. *Seminar on Research Methodology*. North-West University, South Africa.
- WARREN, K. 2009. Edward Caswell. (*In The Catholic Encyclopaedia, Volume 3*). [CD].
- WATSON, E. W. 1914. *The Church of England*. London: Thornton Butterworth. 246 p.
- WATSON, J. R. 1997. *The English hymn: a critical and historical study*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 552 p.

- WATSON, J. 2009. Citation for Timothy Dudley-Smith's Doctor of Letters HC.
http://www.dur.ac.uk/resources/ceremonies/congregation/dudley_smith_timothy.pdf
 Date of access: 15 Jul. 2011.
- WATSON, J. & DUDLEY-SMITH, T. 2003. An Annotated Anthology of Hymns. Oxford: OUP. 472 p.
- WATTS, I. 1707. Hymns and Spiritual Songs.
<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/13341> Date of access: 12 May 2010.
- WEBER N. 2011a. Methodism (*In The Catholic Encyclopaedia, Volume 10*). [CD].
- WEBER N. 2011b. Baptists (*In The Catholic Encyclopaedia, Volume 2*). [CD].
- WELLINGTON, J.E. 1971. The Litany in Cranmer and Donne.
<http://www.jstor.org/pss/4173718> Date of access: 14 Apr. 2010.
- WESLEY, J. 1737. A Collection of Psalms and hymns. London: Woolmer. 156 p.
- WEST, G. 2011. Verbal communication with the author. (Original transcripts of interview in possession of the author.)
- WHITLEY, W. T. 1933. Congregational Hymn Singing. London: Dent. 242 pp.
- WHITTEMORE, T. 1860. The Modern History of Universalism: Extending from the Epoch of the Reformation to the Present Time. Boston: Tomkins. 418 p.
- WIGLEY, J. 2010. James Montgomery and the 'Sheffield Iris', 1792-1825: A Study in the weakness of Provincial Radicalism, The Hunter Archaeological Society, Vol 10.
<http://www.sheffieldhistory.co.uk/forums/index.php?showtopic=9215> Date of access: 15 Aug. 2010.
- WILSON, W.G. 1970. Church Teaching. A Church of Ireland Handbook. Dublin: APCK. 311 p.
- WILSON-DICKSON, A. 1992. The Story of Christian Music. Oxford: Lion Publishing. 256 p.
- WITHER, G. 1967. Hymnes and Songs of the Church. New York: Burt Franklin. 230 p.
- WOLFFE, J. 1994. God and Greater Britain: Religion and national life in Britain and Ireland, 1843-1945. London: Routledge. 336 p.

WOODS, H. J. T. 2001. The Scottish Psalmody.

http://www.reformationireland.com/articles/scottish%20psalmod_y.htm Date of access: 15 Jul. 2010.

WOYWOD, O. F. M. 1912. A brief explanation of the decree Ne temere.

Philiadelphia: Dolphin Press. 54 p.

YATES, N. 2006. The Religious Condition of Ireland, 1770 – 1850. Oxford: OUP. 401 p.