

A study of the current South African housing environment with specific reference to possible alternative approaches to improve living conditions.

L.G. Lategan

21441480

Dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree M.Art et Scien (Urban Planning) at the Potchefstroom Campus of the North-West University

The financial assistance of the National Research Foundation (NRF) towards this research is hereby acknowledged. Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at, are those of the author and are not necessarily to be attributed to the NRF.

Supervisor:

Dr E.J. Cilliers

November 2012

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Special note must be made of the persons who aided in and informed the research conducted, without whom many of the conclusions drawn and recommendations made would have been impossible.

Special acknowledgement is warranted for supervisor, Dr E.J. Cilliers of the North-West University for her patience, consideration and guidance in the evaluation of the research conducted.

It is also important to thank the planning professionals who were available for interviews and queries. Without these individuals and companies the research conducted would have lacked an accurate real world perspective. These persons include Mr D. Larsen and Mr R. Thomas of NuPlan Africa, Durbanville, Mrs I. Swanevelder of the ProPlanning Academy, Mr G. Juthe and Ms S. Bruce of the Oudtshoorn Municipality as well as the staff of Bigen Africa and Basil Read Developers for their contributions.

A study of the current South African housing environment with specific reference to possible alternative approaches to improve living conditions.

ABSTRACT

In South Africa issues regarding the dissatisfactory delivery of low-cost housing developments are well known. Low-cost housing has generally been delivered in a manner which attempts to address housing backlogs, instead of focussing on establishing quality environments and sustainable communities.

In order to address the current deficient approaches to low-cost residential development, a literature and empirical investigation was conducted with the purpose of exploring the South African status quo. Issues for improvement were researched within the existing knowledge base.

The literature reviewed for this study encompassed government literature, policies and legislation as well as work from both national and international authors from a variety of fields, given the diverse nature and multiple impacts related to housing development. These literary works provided evidence to the conclusions drawn and informed the recommendations made accordingly.

The empirical research conducted included several structured interviews, the distribution of questionnaires and the evaluation of various South African case studies. Empirical results added a quantitative measure to the evidence provided by the literature study and thus offered further conclusions and recommendations.

The recommendations made were categorised according to their contribution to planning, management and design. It is believed that the adoption of these preliminary recommendations may greatly improve the housing delivery process and quality of life experienced by low-income beneficiaries.

The issues covered in this study include research, conclusions and recommendations on:

- Investigating the South African status quo with regard to housing policies and legislature.
- Identifying the merits of historical theoretical models and their value in modern day housing development.
- Discussing the importance of a locally focussed development approach with regard to the role of local municipalities versus provincial authorities in low-cost residential development.
- Identifying the value of low-cost housing in local economic development and sustainable socio-economic growth.
- Discussing the role of community participation in delivering sustainable neighbourhoods and communities.
- Investigating the need for higher density development with specific reference to the integration of various housing typologies.
- Exploring the relevance and benefits of alternative construction materials in low-cost residential development.
- Exploring the informal backyard rental sector.
- Exploring the approaches followed in South African case studies of varying successes in various provinces.

It should be noted that the research conducted for this study, the conclusions drawn and the recommendations made provide substantial value, but are all mainly provided as preliminary concepts to be elaborated in a future PhD study.

Key words:

- Low-cost housing development
- Sustainable low-cost housing
- Housing in the South African context
- Housing planning, management and design

‘n Studie van die huidige Suid-Afrikaanse behuisingsomgewing met spesifieke verwysing na moontlike alternatiewe benaderings om lewenskwaliteit te verbeter.

UITTREKSEL

Probleme met die lewering van lae-koste behuising in Suid-Afrika is welbekend. Lae-koste behuising is tot dusver grootliks gelewer volgens 'n benadering wat op die behuisingsagterstand fokus, in plaas van die vestiging van kwaliteit omgewings en volhoubare gemeenskappe.

Ten einde die gebreke in die huidige benadering tot lae-koste behuisingslewering aan te spreek is 'n literatuur studie en empiriese ondersoek onderneem met die doel om die huidige Suid-Afrikaanse situasie te ontleed. Kwessies vir verbetering is binne die bestaande kennisbasis nagevors.

Die literatuur wat vir hierdie studie gebruik is omvat owerheidskrywes, beleide en wetgewing asook werke van beide internasionale en plaaslike outeurs vanuit 'n wye spektrum spesialiteitsvelde. Hierdie literatuur het as getuienis gedien vir die gevolgtrekkings en aanbevelings wat gemaak is.

Die empiriese navorsing wat voltooi is, het verskeie gestruktureerde onderhoude, die verspreiding van vraagbriewe en die evaluering van menigte Suid-Afrikaanse gevallestudies ingesluit. Empiriese resultate het 'n kwantitatiewe dimensie aan die bewyse van die literatuurstudie gelewer en het aanleiding gegee tot verdere gevolgtrekkings en aanbevelings.

Die aanbevelings wat gemaak is gekategoriseer volgens spesifieke bydraes tot beplanning, bestuur en ontwerp. Die implementering van die voorlopige aanbevelings wat deur dié studie verskaf word kan behuisingsleweringprosesse en die lewenskwaliteit van lae-inkomste begunstigdes verbeter.

Die kwessies wat deur diè studie gedek word sluit navorsing, gevolgtrekkings en aanbevelings aangaande die volgende in:

- 'n Ondersoek van die Suid-Afrikaanse realiteit met betrekking tot behuisingsbeleide en wetgewing.
- Die identifisering van die meriete van historiese teoretiese modelle en hul waarde in hedendaagse behuisingsontwikkeling.
- 'n Bespreking van die belang van 'n plaaslik gefokusde ontwikkelingsbenadering met betrekking tot die rol van die plaaslike munisipaliteit teenoor provinsiale owerhede in lae-koste residensiële ontwikkeling.
- Die identifisering van die waarde van lae-koste behuising in plaaslike ekonomiese ontwikkeling en volhoubare sosio-ekonomiese groei.
- 'n Bespreking van die rol van gemeenskapsdeelname in die lewering van volhoubare woonbuurte en gemeenskappe.
- Die identifisering van die behoefte aan hoër digtheidsontwikkeling met betrekking tot die integrasie van verskeie behuisingtipologieë.
- Die ontleding van die voordele verbonde aan die gebruik van alternatiewe boumateriaal in lae-koste residensiële ontwikkeling.
- 'n Bespreking van die informele agterplaasbewingsektor.
- Die ontleding van die benaderings wat in verskeie Suid-Afrikaanse gevallestudies van wisselende sukses in verskeie provinsies gevolg is.

Dit moet daarop gelet word dat die navorsing vir hierdie studie, die gevolgtrekkings en aanbevelings van aansienlike waarde mag wees, maar ook dat hierdie studie slegs voorlopige konsepte vir verdere uitbreiding in 'n toekomstige PhD studie verskaf.

Sleutelterme:

- Lae koste behuisingsontwikkeling
- Volhoubare lae koste behuising
- Behuising in die Suid-Afrikaanse konteks
- Behuising-, beplanning, bestuur en ontwerp

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements.....	i
Abstract.....	ii
Uittreksel.....	iv
Table of Contents.....	vii
List of Tables.....	xv
List of Figures.....	xvi
List of Abbreviations and acronyms.....	xx
Chapter One: Introduction.....	1
1.1 Problem Statement and motivation.....	1
1.2 Research goals and objectives.....	3
1.2.1 Primary research objectives.....	3
1.2.2 Secondary research objectives.....	3
1.3 Research methodology.....	5
1.3.1 Literary study.....	5
1.3.2 Empirical investigation.....	6
1.4 Research hypothesis.....	8
1.4.1 Assumptions.....	8
1.5 Limitations to research.....	9

Section A: Literature Study.....	11
Chapter Two: Policy and legislative overview of the South African housing context.....	12
2.1 Background and introduction on the South African low-cost housing context.....	13
2.2 The White Paper on a New Housing Policy and Strategy for South Africa of 1994.....	18
2.3 The Breaking New Ground Initiative of 2004.....	20
2.4 The National Housing Code of 2009.....	24
2.5 Conclusion to a policy and legislative overview of the South African housing context.....	30
Chapter Three: A theoretical background on alternative layout proposals.....	32
3.1 Clarence Perry: The Neighbourhood Unit.....	33
3.2 Clarence Stein's Radburn Plan.....	38
3.3 Conclusion to a theoretical background on alternative layout proposals...43	
Chapter Four: The role of the local municipality in housing delivery.....	44
4.1 Background and introduction on governmental structure and housing delivery.....	45
4.2 Emerging contractors.....	51
4.3 Risks arise when responsibilities are blurred.....	52
4.4 Allegations of corruption.....	56
4.5 Conclusion to the role of the local municipality in housing delivery.....	58

Chapter Five: The relevance of low-cost housing delivery in local economic development (LED).....	59
5.1 Background and introduction to LED.....	60
5.2 LED strategies.....	60
5.3 LED and local conditions.....	64
5.4 LED and sustained growth.....	64
5.5 Conclusions with regard to LED and the theme of research.....	72
Chapter Six: The informal backyard rental sector in South Africa.....	73
6.1 Introduction to the backyard sector.....	74
6.2 Constraints in the backyard sector.....	76
6.3 Infrastructure considerations with regard to backyard structures	78
6.4 Backyard politics and policies.....	79
6.5 Tenants and landlords.....	81
6.6 Possible approaches to address the sector	83
6.7 Conclusion to the backyard rental sector.....	89
Chapter Seven: Increased densities.....	90
7.1 Introduction to increased densities.....	91
7.2 Single residential units.....	94
7.3 Semi-detached homes.....	96
7.4 Row houses.....	98
7.5 Walk-ups and apartments.....	100
7.6 Conclusion to the need for increased density development.....	101

Chapter Eight: Alternative housing design and construction proposals.....	102
8.1 An introduction into alternative construction materials.....	103
8.2 Mud brick construction.....	110
8.3 Alternative materials and urban planning.....	114
8.4 Conclusions with regard to alternative building materials and construction techniques in in the South African context.....	116
Chapter Nine: The importance of community participation.....	117
9.1 Background and introduction to community participation.....	118
9.2 Constraints to participatory processes.....	121
9.3 Community participation and alternative approaches.....	122
9.4 The consequences of participatory processes.....	124
9.5 Conclusions on the importance of community participation.....	128
Section B: Empirical investigation	129
Chapter Ten: Structured interviews.....	130
10.1 NuPlan Africa.....	131
10.1.1 Conclusion to the NuPlan Africa interviews.....	141
10.2 Proplanning Academy.....	143
10.2.1 Conclusions with regard to the ProPlanning Academy (Ilette Swanevelder) interview.....	148
Chapter Eleven: Case studies.....	150
11.1 Cosmo City.....	152
11.1.1 Conclusion to the Cosmo City case study.....	161
11.2 Olievenhoutbosch.....	163
11.2.1 Conclusion to the Olievenhoutbosch case study.....	167
11.3 The N2 Gateway Project.....	169

11.3.1 Conclusion to the N2 Gateway Project.....	174
11.4 The Ethekwini Municipal Study.....	176
11.4.1 The opportunity to extend structures.....	176
11.4.2 Adaptable and varied design.....	178
11.4.3 Housing on the street.....	179
11.4.4 The importance of aesthetic urban design.....	182
11.4.5 Conclusion to the Ethekwini Municipal Study.....	183
Chapter 12: Rose Valley.....	185
12.1 Conclusion to the Rose Valley case study.....	196
Section C: Conclusions and Recommendations.....	199
Chapter Thirteen: Conclusions.....	200
13.1 Policy and legislative overview of the South African housing context...201	
13.2 A theoretical background on alternative layout proposals (Clarence Perry and Clarence Stein).....	202
13.3 The role of the local municipality in housing delivery.....	202
13.4 Local Economic Development (LED).....	204
13.5 The backyard rental sector	206
13.6 Increased Densities	207
13.7 Alternative housing design and construction proposals.....	208
13.8 The Importance of community participation.....	209
13.9 Interviews.....	210
13.9.1 NuPlan Africa.....	210
13.9.2 Ilette Swanevelder.....	211
13.10 Case Studies.....	212
13.10.1 Cosmo City.....	212

13.10.2 Olievenhoutbosch.....	213
13.10.3 The N2 Gateway Project.....	214
13.10.4 Ethekwini Municipal Study.....	215
13.11 Rose Valley.....	216
Chapter Fourteen: Recommendations.....	222
14.1 Planning.....	223
14.1.1 Planning: Adequate and timely planning.....	224
14.1.2 Planning: A focus on both quality and quantity.....	225
14.1.3 Planning: Addressing the backyard rental sector.....	225
14.1.4 Planning: Community participation.....	230
14.1.5 Planning: Maximising the role of low-cost housing in local economic development (LED).....	231
14.2 Management.....	233
14.2.1 Management: Public private partnerships.....	234
14.2.2 Management: Governmental Structures.....	235
14.2.2.1 Management: The central role of the local authority.....	236
14.2.3 Management: The professionalization of the planning field and effective management.....	236
14.3 Design.....	238
14.3.1 Design: Alternative layouts.....	238
14.3.1.1 Design: Socio-economic Integration.....	239
14.3.1.2 Design: Aesthetic urban design Initiatives.....	241
14.3.2 Design: Increased densities.....	242
14.3.3 Design: Expansion.....	244
14.3.4 Design: Pedestrian movement.....	246
14.3.5 Design: Building placement on stand.....	247
14.3.6 Design: Alternative construction materials.....	247

14.4 Recommendations for the Rose Valley Extension.....	249
14.4.1 Rose Valley: Planning.....	249
14.4.1.1 Rose Valley: Adequate and timely planning.....	249
14.4.1.2 Rose Valley: Planning Local Economic Development.....	250
14.4.1.3 Rose Valley: Planning the backyard rental sector.....	251
14.4.1.4 Rose Valley: Planning Community participation.....	252
14.4.2 Rose Valley: Management.....	253
14.4.2.1 Rose Valley: Management Public private partnerships.....	253
14.4.2.2 Rose Valley: Management Enhanced governmental structures.....	253
14.4.2.3 Rose Valley: Management Professionalization of the planning sector.....	253
14.4.3 Rose Valley: Design.....	254
14.4.3.1 Rose Valley: Design Alternative layout.....	254
14.4.3.2 Rose Valley: Design Socio-economic integration.....	254
14.4.3.3 Rose Valley: Design Institutional uses as central.....	255
14.4.3.4 Rose Valley: Design Increased density.....	255
14.4.3.5 Rose Valley: Design Pedestrian movement.....	256
14.4.3.6 Rose Valley: Design Expansion.....	256
14.4.3.7 Rose Valley: Design Building placement on stand.....	256
14.4.3.8 Rose Valley: Design Alternative construction materials.....	257
14.4.3.9 Rose Valley: Design Aesthetic urban design.....	258
14.5 Conclusion to recommendations.....	264
Chapter Fifteen: Final conclusion.....	265
15.1 Areas of further study.....	265

Annexure.....	
ANNEXURE A: Rose Valley Questionnaire.....	267
ANNEXURE B: Most applicable Rose Valley Questionnaire Results.....	271
List of Sources.....	279

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: The most important inhibiting factors to South African housing delivery.....	19
Table 2: BNG Solutions to address the South African housing dilemma.....	21
Table 3: Other supporting housing programmes.....	25
Table 4: Applicability of Perry’s guidelines to SA low-cost housing.....	37
Table 5: Applicability of Stein’s guidelines to SA low-cost housing.....	42
Table 6: Housing development should be broken up into four broad categories.....	46
Table 7: Planning risks due to the distortion of responsibilities between provincial and local authorities.....	53
Table 8: Good practice principles in constructing LED strategies.....	63
Table 9: Best practice principles from the PELIP project, Nelson Mandela Bay, the Far East Bank project in Alexandra, Johannesburg and Lufhereng, Mogale City.....	88
Table 10: Difficulties with the use of alternative construction materials in SA.....	104
Table 11: The benefits of earthen building and its value in the South African context.....	113
Table 12: An overview of different’ views on participation.....	127
Table 13: Main findings derived from the NuPlan Africa interviews.....	142
Table 14: Main findings derived from Ilette Swanevelder interview.....	149
Table 15: A SWOT analysis of Cosmo City.....	162
Table 16: A SWOT analysis of the Olievenhoutbosch development.....	168
Table 17: A SWOT analysis of the N2 Gateway Project.....	175
Table 18: A SWOT analysis of the Ethekwini Municipal Study.....	184
Table 19: Summary of case study findings.....	197
Table 20: Summary of best practice conclusions.....	218
Table 21: Summary of recommended guidelines for future delivery.....	259

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Case study locations within SA.....	7
Figure 2: Document structure.....	10
Figure 3: Summary of Chapter 2: Policy and legislative overview of the South African housing context.....	12
Figure 4: Summary of Chapter 3: A Theoretical background on alternative layout proposals.....	32
Figure 5: A Graphic representation of Clarence Perry’s Neighbourhood Unit.....	35
Figure 6: Stein’s Radburn Plan.....	40
Figure 7: Summary of Chapter 4: The role of the local municipality in housing delivery.....	44
Figure 8: Municipal corruption figures vs. national and provincial corruption figures.....	57
Figure 9: Summary of Chapter 5: The relevance of low-cost housing delivery in local economic development.....	59
Figure 10: Housing development leads to sustainable economic growth.....	67
Figure 11: The relationship between economic development through low-cost housing development in terms of agglomeration benefits, labour and suppliers.....	69
Figure 12: Agglomeration benefits will be optimised where deciding factors such as labour, capital and resources are best located.....	70
Figure 13: Low-cost housing development’s influence on employment.....	71
Figure 14: Summary of Chapter 6: The informal backyard rental sector in South Africa.....	73
Figure 15: An introduction to backyard rentals.....	75
Figure 16: Various constraints prohibit the supply of informal rental options in the South African context.....	77
Figure 17: Summary of Chapter 7: Increased densities.....	91
Figure 18: Illustration of single residential units.....	95
Figure 19: Illustration of semi-detached units.....	96

Figure 20: Illustration of row housing.....	99
Figure 21: Summary Chapter 8: Alternative housing design and construction proposals.....	103
Figure 22: Mud Brick Construction.....	110
Figure 23: A completed mud brick unit.....	110
Figure 24: Summary of Chapter 9: The importance of community participation.....	117
Figure 25: Role-players in the community participation process.....	120
Figure 26: Constraints to community participation.....	125
Figure 27 Summary of Chapter 10: NuPlan Africa Interview.....	132
Figure 28: Concept for residential cell with institutional linkages.....	134
Figure 29: Concept for pedestrian friendly layout.....	135
Figure 30: A simplified and adjusted model of the NuPlan Africa concept.....	137
Figure 31: Artist's impression of community spine.....	139
Figure 32: Aerial representation of communal spine.....	139
Figure 33: Problems with sand in Cape Town.....	141
Figure 34: Sandy areas remedied by building placement.....	141
Figure 35: Summary of Chapter Ten (10.2): Proplaning Academy, Ilette Swanevelder Interview.....	143
Figure 36: Summary of Chapter 10: Case Studies.....	151
Figure 37: Cosmo City location.....	152
Figure 38: High density units in Cosmo City.....	154
Figure 39: Newer subsidised units in Cosmo City.....	154
Figure 40: Typical bonded home in Cosmo City.....	154
Figure 41: A typical subsidised unit in Cosmo City.....	155
Figure 42: An expensive bonded home in Cosmo City.....	155
Figure: 43: A typical park in Cosmo City.....	160
Figure 44: Olievenhoutbosch location.....	163
Figure 45: A double storey semi-detached unit in Olievenhoutbosch.....	165

Figure 46: Single residential units in Olievenhoutbosch.....	165
Figure 47: Single storey semi-detached units in Olievenhoutbosch.....	166
Figure 48: A larger bonded unit being constructed next to a smaller bonded unit...166	
Figure 49: The N2 Gateway Project location.....	169
Figure 50: A typical image of units delivered in the N2 Gateway Project.....	171
Figure 51: Double storey units are very common.....	171
Figure 52: An example of wasted space next to main access corridor due to budget cuts.....	173
Figure 53: Newer single storey units.....	173
Figure 54: An initial building structure as received by tenants and the manner in which units can be extended by filling the space between starter units.....	177
Figure 55: Proposed extension of single residential units.....	177
Figure 56: Possible variations in layout.....	179
Figure 57: Fragmentation and top structure placement.....	180
Figure 58: Private space and top structure placement.....	180
Figure 59: Simple examples of variations in building facades to create interest in a cost effective manner.....	182
Figure 60: Summary of Rose Valley findings.....	185
Figure 61: Rose Valley location in Oudtshoorn.....	186
Figure 62: An aerial photograph of the Rose Valley Settlement in April 2011.....	187
Figure 63: The Rose Valley Settlement in July 2012.....	187
Figure 64: A streetscape which illustrates the formal nature of the current spatial format	187
Figure 65: A typical South African scene, children playing soccer on a dirt sports field.....	187
Figure 66: Reasons settlers moved to Rose Valley.....	188
Figure 67: Origin of the Rose Valley Settlers.....	189
Figure 68: Would Rose Valley settlers consider walk-up/apartment living?.....	191
Figure 69: An example of Rose Valley's undulating landscape.....	192

Figure 70: Would Rose Valley settlers consider constructing backyard structures after they have taken up residence?.....195

Figure 71: Summary of Chapter 14: Recommendations.....222

Figure 72: Concrete walls and backyard structures.....228

Figure 73: Integration for sustainability.....239

Figure 74: A concept for a model which promotes socio-economic integration and access to facilities through pedestrian movement.....241

Figure 75: Proposed unit placement.....244

Figure 76: Suggestion for the layout of approved extensions to promote freedom of choice, variety and safe and aesthetically pleasing additions.....245

Figure 77: The Role of the Urban Planner in implementing alternatives.....248

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

BNG.....	Breaking New Ground
CBD.....	Central Business District
CRU.....	Community Residential Units Programme
CSIR.....	Council for Scientific and Industrial Research
DORA.....	Division of Revenue Act
EEDBS.....	Enhanced Extended Discount Benefit Scheme
EPHP.....	Enhanced People's Housing Process
HDA.....	Housing Development Agency
IDP.....	Integrated Development Plan
IRDP.....	Integrated Residential Development Programme
LED.....	Local Economic Development
OPS/CAP.....	Operational Capital Budget
PHP.....	People's Housing Process
RDP.....	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SACPLAN.....	South African Council of Planners
SAPI.....	South African Planning Institute
SDF.....	Spatial Development Framework
SMME's.....	Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises
UDF.....	Urban Development Framework
UN.....	United Nations
USDG.....	Urban Settlements Development Grant