

**Critical analysis of sustainable community planning  
and development principles as applied within the  
Tlokwe Municipality**

**BB VAN SCHALKWYK**

**20665350**

Dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree  
*M.Art et Scien* at the Potchefstroom campus of the North-West University

**Supervisor: Prof CB Schoeman**

**November 2012**

# ABSTRACT

## **Critical analysis of sustainable community planning and development principles as applied within the Tlokwe Municipality**

Due to the current high levels of urbanisation and the lingering effects of Apartheid, South African municipalities have experienced difficulties in planning for sustainability and more specifically sustainable community development. Sustainable community development is needed in order to achieve more integrated and sustainable towns and cities with an improved urban environment and a higher quality of life. Due to this sustainable community development is of particular relevance to South Africa. Although policies and legislation exist at international, national and local level, there is a lack of suitable planning instruments to guide sustainable community development.

Tlokwe Local Municipality is researched as study area to test and develop planning instruments for sustainable community development. An assessment matrix of sustainability indicators is linked to Multi-criteria analysis (MCA) and applied to identify the themes and sub-themes applicable to sustainability in which intervention is required to improve the sustainability rating of the municipality. A Goal Assessment Matrix (GAM) approach is used to score and prioritise municipal projects, plans and strategies according to sustainable community development fundamentals. The top scoring projects are indicative of the achievement of sustainable community development goals and objectives. The result of the sustainability assessment is that the Tlokwe Local Municipality is considered to be relatively sustainable, performing overall better than the three spheres of government against which it was measured. Subsequent to the GAM assessment a lack of alignment between the sectoral plans was identified as well as the duplication of projects. The projects, plans and strategies of the municipality are found to not have been formulated with sustainable community development framework as a guiding goal.

It is recommended that municipalities use the assessment matrix methods to determine its level of sustainability when developing respective sectoral plans (SDFs, ITPs, EMFs and IDPs). Areas in which there is a lack of sustainability are highlighted and can consequently be addressed through intervention strategies. Prioritising municipal projects, plans and strategies through the use of GAM identifies crucial projects that need special attention to ensure their successful implementation as this will largely aid sustainable community

development. Both the assessment matrix method and the GAM approach are valuable planning instruments with which to achieve sustainable community development.

**KEYWORDS:**

Sustainability, Sustainable development, Sustainable community development, Multi-criteria analysis, Goal achievement matrix.

# OPSOMMING

## **Kritiese analise van volhoubare gemeenskapsbeplanning and –ontwikkelings beginsels soos toegepas binne die Tlokwe Munisipaliteit.**

Weens die huidige hoë vlakke van verstedeliking en die oorblywende effekte van Apartheid ondervind Suid-Afrikaanse munisipaliteite dit moeilik om te beplan vir volhoubaarheid en volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling. Volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling is van uiterse belang ten einde meer geïntegreerde en volhoubare dorpe en stede met 'n beter stedelike omgewing en hoër kwaliteit van lewe te verseker. Volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling is daarom van spesifieke belang vir Suid-Afrika. Al bestaan daar beleide en wetgewing op internasionale-, nasionale- en plaaslike vlak, is daar 'n tekort aan toepaslike beplanningsinstrumente om volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling te rig.

Tlokwe plaaslike munisipaliteit is gebruik as studie-area om beplanningsinstrumente vir volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling te toets en te ontwikkel. 'n Asseseringsmatriks van volhoubaarheidsindikatore is met multi-kriteria analyses gekoppel. Dit word gebruik om die temas en sub-temas van volhoubaarheid te identifiseer waarin intervensie nodig is om die munisipaliteit se volhoubaarheidsvlak te verbeter. 'n Doelwit bereikings matriks benadering is gebruik om die munisipaliteit se projekte, planne en strategieë te beoordeel en te prioritiseer volgens volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkelings prinsiepe. Die projekte met die hoogste puntetoekenning word gesien as noodsaaklik vir die bereiking van volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling. Die resultaat van die volhoubaarheidsassesering is dat die Tlokwe plaaslike munisipaliteit gesien kan word as redelik volhoubaar aangesien dit beter gevaar het as die drie sferes van die regering waarteen dit gemeet is. Na die toepassing van die doelwit bereikings matriks is 'n tekort aan oriëntasie tussen die sektorale planne so wel as 'n duplisering van projekte geïdentifiseer. Daar is bevind dat die projekte, planne en strategieë van die munisipaliteit sonder 'n volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkelingsraamwerk as 'n leidende maatstaf opgestel is.

Daar word aanbeveel dat munisipaliteite die asseseringsmatriks metode vir die bepaling van volhoubaarheid gebruik wanneer hulle hul sektorale planne opstel. Areas waarin daar 'n tekort aan volhoubaarheid is word uitgewys en kan gevolglik deur ingrypende strategieë aangespreek word. Die prioritisering van munisipale projekte, planne en strategieë deur die gebruik van die doelwit bereikings matriks identifiseer kritieke projekte waaraan spesiale

aandag gegee moet word om hul suksesvolle implementering te verseker. Dit sal grootliks bydra tot die realisering van volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling. Beide die asseserings matriks metode en die doelwit bereikingsmatriks is waardevolle beplanningsinstrumente waarmee volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling behaal kan word.

**SLEUTELWOORDE:**

Volhoubaarheid, Volhoubareontwikkeling, Volhoubare gemeenskapsontwikkeling, Multi-kriteria analise, Doelwit bereikingsmatriks

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is my name that appears on the front of this dissertation, but behind every chapter has been a group of people who've contributed unstintingly of their time and talents, support and friendship. Each of these people have, in one way or another, enriched this dissertation, and enriched my life.

I am deeply indebted towards my supervisor, Prof. Calie Schoeman, who provided encouragement, insight, guidance, support and challenges throughout the years. Anybody that knows his opinions will immediately recognize his influence on my writings. Years of study under him could not be anything else than fruitful.

I am immensely grateful to all my friends and especially my family who encouraged and supported me during my studies and provided me with enthusiasm when it was most needed. To my nearest and dearest I say heartfelt thanks.

A special thank you to Sakkie and Anna who volunteered their time and knowledge to act as guides in Primosa, Mohadin and Ikageng, without which I would quite literally be lost. Your warm hospitality still leaves me with a fond smile. Ke a leboga.

A special note of gratitude to Me. Erica Roodt of the Ferdinand Postma Library, North-West University, who gave me answers when I couldn't find them anywhere.

Sincerest love and thanks to "The Meesters Musketeers", Karin, Leatitia and Louis, for all the frantic midnights you worked beside me; the pep talks when I needed it most and your ability to comprehend the fact that a dissertation has a life of its own. We did it, guys!

To Roland Szafraniec, thank you for never losing your patience or your humor; and for never losing track of me!

Last but not least I would like to thank my Lord and Saviour for keeping true to His promise: The will of God never leads you where the grace of God can't keep you.

# TABLE OF CONTENT

<b>ABSTRACT</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>OPSOMMING</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENT</b>	<b>vi</b>
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	<b>xii</b>
<b>LIST OF IMAGES</b>	<b>xiv</b>
<b>LIST OF MAPS</b>	<b>xiv</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>	<b>xvii</b>
<b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Literature overview and background to the study	1
1.2 Problem statement and motivation	3
1.3 Research objectives	4
1.4 Delineation of the study area	5
1.5 Research hypothesis	7
1.6 Methodology and research structure	7
1.6.1 Literature analysis	7
1.6.2 Empirical research	7
1.6.3 Structure of research concept	8
<b>Chapter 2: A background on sustainability and sustainable development</b>	<b>11</b>
2.1 The concept and definition of sustainability	11
2.2 Dimensions of sustainability	13

## TABLE OF CONTENT (Continued)

2.2.1 Social sustainability	14
2.2.2 Economic sustainability	15
2.2.3 Environmental sustainability	17
2.2.4 Spatial sustainability	17
2.3 Sustainable development	18
2.4 Millennium Development Goals and sustainable development	21
2.4.1 Background on the Millennium Development Goals	21
2.4.2 The correlation between the Millennium Development Goals and sustainable development.	23
2.5 Sustainability and sustainable development in South African context	26
2.5.1 South Africa's progress towards the Millennium Development Goals	29
2.6 Conclusion	37
<b>Chapter 3: Sustainability and spatial planning principles</b>	<b>39</b>
3.1 The sustainability and integration imperatives	40
3.2 Integration	40
3.2.1 Functional integration	41
3.2.2 Social integration	43
3.2.3 Economic integration	44
3.2.4 Spatial Integration	45
3.3 Sustainability and integration translated into planning principles	46
3.4 Planning principles of sustainable community planning	48
3.5 Conclusion	54

# TABLE OF CONTENT (Continued)

<b>Chapter 4: Strategic spatial planning for sustainability</b>	<b>56</b>
4.1 Functional elements	56
4.1.1 Human settlement development	57
4.1.2 Employment	63
4.1.3 Services	67
4.1.4 Transport	72
4.1.5 Community	75
4.1.6 Character and Identity	76
4.2 Planning process for sustainable development.	81
4.3 Smart Growth for sustainable development	84
4.4 Conclusion	85
<b>Chapter 5: Sustainable community development</b>	<b>86</b>
5.1 Definition of sustainable community development	87
5.2 Challenges in realizing sustainable community development	89
5.2.1 Integration	90
5.2.2 Scale	90
5.2.3 Governance	91
5.2.4 Inclusion of the community	92
5.2.5 Western concepts and methodologies of development	92
5.3 Urban planning structures for sustainable development	93
5.4 A history of community development in South Africa	95
5.5 Sustainable community planning in South Africa and the World	96

## TABLE OF CONTENT (Continued)

5.5.1 Canada	98
5.5.2 England	101
5.5.3 Nelson Mandela Bay – South Africa	107
5.5.4 Specific case study: Motherwell – Port Elizabeth – South Africa	109
5.6 Conclusion	112
<b>Chapter 6: An assessment of sustainable community planning and development</b>	<b>114</b>
6.1 National policy guidelines for sustainable community planning and development	115
6.1.1 The national Framework for Sustainable Development	115
6.1.2 A comprehensive plan for the development of integrated and sustainable human settlements	118
6.1.3 The National Development Plan	120
6.1.4 The Upgrading of Informal Settlements Programme	122
6.1.4.1 The National Upgrading Support Programme	123
6.1.5 Other policies and legislation for sustainable community planning and development	123
6.2 Sustainability indicators	123
6.3 Multi-criteria analysis application	127
6.4 The Goal Achievement Matrix approach	129
6.5 An assessment matrix of sustainability indicators to assess the sustainability of community development projects and planning	130
6.5.1 Methodology of indicator selection	130

## TABLE OF CONTENT (Continued)

6.5.2 Assessment matrix compilation	133
6.5.3 Empirical application to case study	138
6.6 Applying Multi-criteria analysis as an evaluation tool	140
6.7 Applying the Goal Achievement Matrix as an evaluation tool	141
6.8 Conclusion	143
<b>Chapter 7: Application of the principles of sustainability within the Tlokwe Local Municipality</b>	<b>145</b>
7.1 Background on the Tlokwe Local Municipality	145
7.2 Local and provincial policy guidelines for sustainable development within the Tlokwe Local Municipality	150
7.2.1 North West Land Use Management Bill	150
7.2.2 Provincial Growth and Development Strategy	151
7.2.3 Integrated Development Plan	152
7.2.4 Spatial Development Framework	154
7.2.4.1 Provincial Spatial Development Framework	154
7.2.4.2 Local Spatial Development Framework	158
7.3 Applying the sustainability assessment matrix to the Tlokwe Local Municipality	161
7.4 Interpretation of the results from the assessment matrix	164
7.4.1 Tlokwe Local Municipality measured against the national sphere of government	164
7.4.2 Tlokwe Local Municipality measured against the provincial sphere of government	166

## TABLE OF CONTENT (Continued)

7.4.3 Tlokwe Local Municipality measured against the district sphere of government	167
7.4.4 Conclusion	168
7.5 Prioritising project for sustainable community development for the Tlokwe Local Municipality	170
7.6 Conclusion	184
<b>Chapter 8: Conclusions</b>	<b>187</b>
8.1 Sustainability on the African continent	188
8.2 The Integrated Development Plan as an instrument of sustainable development and sustainable community development	188
8.3 Data limitations	189
8.4 Prioritizing projects and strategies	189
8.5 No perfect strategy for sustainability	190
8.6 Research hypothesis	190
<b>Chapter 9: Planning recommendations</b>	<b>191</b>
9.1 Achieving sustainability on the African continent	191
9.2 Adjusting the decision making framework	191
9.3 Overcoming data limitations	192
9.4 Prioritizing projects and strategies for sustainable community development	192
9.5 Best practice guidelines for sustainable community development	193
<b>ANNEXURE</b>	<b>194</b>
<b>LIST OF REFERENCES</b>	<b>218</b>

# LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: A concept map of Chapter 1	1
Figure 1.2: Structure of the research document	9
Figure 2.1: A concept map of Chapter 2	11
Figure 2.2: The aspects of sustainability	12
Figure 2.3: Dimensions of sustainability	14
Figure 2.4: Dimensions of social sustainability	15
Figure 2.5: Three pillars of sustainable development	16
Figure 2.6: The Millennium Development Goals and Targets	22
Figure 2.7: The Correlation between the Millennium Development Goals and sustainable development	23
Figure 2.8: Progress made toward eradicating extreme poverty and hunger	30
Figure 2.9: Progress made toward achieving universal primary education	31
Figure 2.10: Progress made toward promoting gender equality and empowerment of women	32
Figure 2.11: Progress made toward reducing child mortality	33
Figure 2.12: Progress made toward maternal health	34
Figure 2.13: Progress made toward combating HIV/Aids, Malaria and other diseases	35
Figure 2.14: Progress made toward ensuring environmental sustainability	36
Figure 2.15: Progress made toward a global partnership for development	37
Figure 3.1: A concept map of Chapter 3	39
Figure 3.2: The components of integration	40
Figure 3.3: Functional integration	42
Figure 3.4: Planning principles of integration and sustainability and the implementation thereof	47

Figure 3.5: Simplification of application instruments relating to planning principles	54
Figure 4.1: A concept map of Chapter 4	56
Figure 4.2: Manifesting integration in human settlement development	57
Figure 4.3: A small housing cluster	59
Figure 4.4: Economic activities that make up work opportunities	64
Figure 4.5: Essential services	67
Figure 4.6: Service distances from home	72
Figure 4.7: Phases of an IDP	82
Figure 4.8: Application of the planning framework for sustainability	83
Figure 4.9: Phases of the planning and implementation process	84
Figure 5.1: A concept map of Chapter 5	87
Figure 5.2: The seven key areas of sustainable cities	89
Figure 5.3: Human settlement levels	91
Figure 5.4: Stakeholders in community development in South Africa through its History	95
Figure 5.5: Spheres of a sustainable community	97
Figure 5.6: Integrated Community Sustainability Plan process outline	99
Figure 5.7: Levels of decision making and participation within the Motherwell Pilot Project	110
Figure 6.1: A concept map of Chapter 6	114
Figure 6.2: Five strategic focus areas for sustainable development	116
Figure 6.3: Challenges to achieve development in South Africa	121
Figure 6.4: Sections of the National Development Plan that directly and indirectly effect sustainable community development	122
Figure 6.5: Steps for implementing multi-criteria analysis	141

Figure 6.6: Assessment matrix compilation process	143
Figure 7.1: A concept map of Chapter 7	145
Figure 7.2: Abbreviated history of Potchefstroom	146
Figure 7.3: Population pyramid for Tlokwe Local Municipality	147
Figure 7.4: Potchefstroom's profile	148
Figure 7.5: Pillars of the Provincial Growth and Development Strategy	151
Figure 7.6: Tlokwe Local Municipality's sustainability performance when measured against the three spheres of government within which it falls	164
Figure 7.7: Sustainability performance profile for the Tlokwe Local Municipality	185
Figure 8.1: A concept map of the research document	187
Figure 9.1: Decision making frameworks	191

## **LIST OF IMAGES**

Image 1: Row housing in Johannesburg, South Africa	61
Image 2: Urban agriculture in Cape Town	66
Image 3: Urban agriculture in Cape Town	66
Image 4: Solar geyser in Ikageng, Potchefstroom	69

## **LIST OF MAPS**

Map 1.1: Location of the Tlokwe Local Municipality within the bigger scope of the North West Province	5
Map 1.2: The demarcation of the Tlokwe Local Municipality and the delamination of the Wards therein.	6
Map 5.1: Ward demarcation of the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality	107
Map 5.2: Position of Motherwell within the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality	109

Map 7.1: Main municipal land uses within the Tlokwe Local Municipality	149
Map 7.2: Main urban land use within the Tlokwe Local Municipality	150
Map 7.3: North West Provincial Spatial Development Framework	156
Map 7.4: Spatial Development Framework for Dr Kenneth Kuanda District Municipality	157
Map 7.5: Proposed spatial framework for Tlokwe	159
Map 7.6: Spatial Development Framework of Tlokwe Local Municipality	160

## **LIST OF TABLES**

Table 2.1: International, national and local perspectives on sustainable Development	20
Table 2.2: Correlation between cities and the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals	24
Table 2.3: A summary of the problems influencing the application of sustainable development in South Africa	27
Table 2.4: Alignment of strategic priorities of the MTSF and the MDGs	29
Table 3.1: Planning principles of sustainable communities	49
Table 4.1: Quantitative guidelines for public service facilities	71
Table 4.2: Requirements for recreational and sport facilities	73
Table 4.3: Sustainability considerations in transport planning for communities	74
Table 4.4: Correlation between the planning principles and functional elements of sustainable communities	78
Table 5.1: Five dimensions of sustainable community development	88
Table 5.2: Structural elements of sustainable community	93
Table 5.3: Steps for guiding the development of an ICSP	100
Table 5.4: Focus components of sustainable communities according to the Communities Plan	102

Table 5.5: Summary of the 2003 Communities Plan	104
Table 5.6: Projects and project cost within the Motherwell Case study	111
Table 5.7: Obstacles, solutions and lessons learnt for each case study	113
Table 6.1: Proposed interventions and actions for creating sustainable human Settlements	117
Table 6.2: Plans to aid housing delivery	119
Table 6.3: Advised action to the challenges faced in development by South Africa	121
Table 6.4: CSD's sustainable indicators framework	125
Table 6.5: Multi-criteria analysis evaluation matrix	128
Table 6.6: Indicator selection matrix	132
Table 6.7: Indicators and inter-thematic linkages	134
Table 6.8: Methodology and application sheet	137
Table 6.9: Ideal assessment matrix	139
Table 6.10: Goal Achievement Matrix for IDP and sectoral plan evaluation	142
Table 7.1: Refined assessment matrix	162
Table 7.2: Performance matrix of the refined assessment matrix	163
Table 7.3: Spatial Development Framework projects	172
Table 7.4: Environmental Management Framework projects	173
Table 7.5: Integrated Transport Plan projects	175
Table 7.6: Integrated Development Plan projects	177
Table 7.7: Integrated priority project list for the promotion of sustainable community development	182
Table 7.8: Intervention areas within the Tlokwe Local Municipality and the corresponding sectoral plans' projects	186

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS – Acquired immune deficiency syndrome

BEE – Black economic empowerment

BNG – Breaking New Ground

CBO – Community Based Organisations

CSD – Commission of Sustainable Development

CSIR – Council of Scientific and Industrial Research

DBSA – Development Bank of South Africa

DKKDM – Dr Kenneth Kuanda District Municipality

EIA – Environmental Impact Assessment

EMF – Environmental Management Framework

EPWP – Extended Public Works Programme

FCM – Federation of Canadian Municipalities

GAM – Goal Achievement Matrix

GDP – Gross Domestic Product

GNP – Gross National Product

HIV – Human immunodeficiency virus

ICSP – Integrated Community Sustainability Plan

IDC – Industrial Development Corporation

IDP – Integrated Development Plan

ISC – Institute for Sustainable Communities

ITP – Integrated Transport Planning

LED – Local Economic Development

LUMB – Land Use Management Bill

MCA – Multi-criteria analysis

MDG – Millennium Development Goals

MIG – Municipal Infrastructure Grant

MOSS – Municipal Open Space System

MSA – Municipal Systems Act

MTSF – Medium term Strategic Framework

NATMAP – National Transport Master Plan

NDH – National Department of Housing

NDOT – National Department of Transport

NEMA – National Environmental Management Act

NFSD – National Framework for Sustainable Development

NGO – Non government organisation

NMBM – Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality

NUSP – National Upgrading Support Programme

NWDARD – North West Department of Agriculture and Rural Development

NWDEDT – North West Department of Economic Development and Tourism

NWDHS – North West Department of Human Settlements

NWDL – North West Department of Labour

NWDPW – North West Department of Public Works

NWP – North West Province

NWU – North West University

ODA – Official development assistance

PGDS – Provincial Growth and Development Strategy

PPP – Public Private Partnerships

PSDF – Provincial Spatial Development Framework

PTIF – Public Treasurers Investment Fund

RSA – Republic of South Africa

SANRAL – South African National Roads Agency

SCDF – Sustainable Community Development Fundamentals

SCU – Sustainable Community Unit

SDF – Spatial Development Framework

SEA – Social Economic Analysis

SIDA – Swedish government grant agency

SMME – Small medium and micro enterprises

SSETA – Services Sector Education and Training Authority

TB – Tuberculosis

TLM – Tlokwe Local Municipality

UISP – Upgrading of Informal Settlements Programme

UN – United Nations

UNECE – United Nations Economic Commission for Europe

UN-HABITAT – United Nations Human Settlement Programme