



Measuring student perceptions about the use of a computer programme as a teaching aid in Auditing

Nestene Botha

21090734

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

Magister Commerci in Accountancy

at the

Potchefstroom Campus of the North West University

Supervisor: **Prof JP Fouché**

Co-supervisor: **Prof A Nel**

January 2014

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the following people and organisations, without which this dissertation would not have been possible:

- My Heavenly Father, for giving me the ability, creativity, strength, courage and human resources to complete this dissertation
- My fiancé, Johan, for his patience, continued assistance and support during the time of this study
- My brother, Ockert-Johan, who provided valuable pre-programming assistance and recommendations, assisted with the animation process, programmed and re-programmed the educational game until all technical clichés were eliminated and provided technical assistance during the experiential group experiment
- My best friend, Elsabe Roux, who developed the animated content for the educational game and provided technical assistance and moral support on the day of the experiment.
- Chante Ollewagen, who assisted with developing the animated content for the educational game.
- My parents, Christoff and Doret, who provided technical and moral support on the day of the experiment and assisted (also academically) me throughout the process of developing and completing both the educational game and dissertation
- My supervisors, Prof. Jaco Fouche and Andre Nel, for their wealth of knowledge, insight, continued support and professional guidance throughout this project
- All the research participants, for offering their valued time to play the educational game, complete the case study and complete the questionnaires
- All my colleagues at the North West University's School of Accounting Science, for their interest and support and for participating in the pre-test of the educational game and providing valuable feedback
- All my colleagues at CAP Chartered Accountants, for their interest and support.

- Ms Laetitia Bedeker, for the professional manner in which she conducted the language and reference editing
- Mrs Susan van Biljon, for the professional manner in which she conducted the technical and typographical editing
- Mrs Suria Ellis of the Statistic Consultation Service of North-West University, for her professional statistical guidance and support

OPSOMMING

Sleutelwoorde: eksperimentele leer; inligtingstegnologie; rekeningkundige onderwys; opvoedkundige speletjie; ouditkunde onderwys

Oudit, as 'n sub-vak van die rekeningkunde-dissipline, is inherent 'n moeilike vak om te leer en te onderrig. Die tradisionele onderrig van oudit en rekeningkunde is die bron van talle uitdagings, probleme en kritiek. Oudit dosente het dus 'n verantwoordelikheid om metodes of hulpmiddele te ondersoek wat dosente kan help om hierdie uitdagings, probleme en kritiek die hoof te bied ten einde toekomstige ouditeurs op te lei wat die nodige kennis, begrip en vaardighede het om doeltreffend in die werkplek te funksioneer. Die primêre doelstelling van hierdie studie was dus om te evalueer of die leer- en onderrigprobleme wat ervaar word doeltreffend aangepak kan word deur die gebruik van 'n opvoedkundige inligtingstegnologiegebaseerde speletjie, wat met verloop van en op grond van hierdie studie ontwikkel is. Die persepsies van derdejaar oudit studente aan Noordwes-Universiteit rakende die gebruik van hierdie speletjie as 'n opvoedkundige hulpmiddel in die onderrig van oudit is aan die hand van 'n vraelys getoets, wat ook as deel van hierdie studie ontwikkel is. Die deelnemers is in 'n eksperimentele en 'n kontrolegroep verdeel. Die eksperimentele groep het die opvoedkundige rekenaarspeletjie gespeel, terwyl die kontrolegroep die gevallestudievraag voltooi het op grond waarvan die opvoedkundige speletjie ontwikkel is. Die studente het daarna dieselfde vraelys voltooi. Die vernaamste bevindinge van die studie was dat die opvoedkundige rekenaarspeletjie van gelyke opvoedkundige waarde as die gevallestudiemetode was, terwyl faktore soos genot, betrokkenheid en motivering hoër aangeslaan is met betrekking tot die rekenaarspeletjie as die gevallestudiemetode.

ABSTRACT

Keywords: accounting education; auditing education; educational game; experiential learning; information technology

Auditing, as a subset of the accounting discipline, is an inherently difficult subject to learn and teach. There have been various challenges, problems and criticisms regarding traditional auditing and accounting education. Auditing lecturers therefore have a responsibility to investigate methods or aids that can assist lecturers in addressing these challenges, problems and criticisms in order to educate future auditors who have the knowledge, understanding and skills to function effectively in the workplace. The primary objective of this study was therefore to evaluate whether the learning and lecturing difficulties experienced may be addressed effectively through the use of an educational auditing information technology-based game, which was developed during the course and as a result of this study. The perceptions of third-year auditing students at North-West University regarding the use of this game as an educational aid in auditing education were tested through a questionnaire that was also developed as part of this study. The study involved dividing the participants into an experimental and control group. The experimental group played the educational computer game, while the control group completed the case question from which the educational game was developed. The students then completed the same questionnaire. The main findings of the study were that the educational computer game was equal in educational value to the case method, while factors such as joy, engagement and motivation were rated higher for the computer game than for the case method.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
OPSOMMING	iv
ABSTRACT	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	vi
LIST OF TABLES	xii
LIST OF FIGURES.....	xvii
<u>CHAPTER 1</u> THE CHALLENGES FACING AUDITING EDUCATION.....	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 AUDITING IN PRACTICE	2
1.2.1 What is auditing?	2
1.3 AUDITING EDUCATION.....	7
1.3.1 Audit knowledge and skills	8
1.3.2 Qualification process for chartered accountants in South Africa.....	9
1.3.3 Auditing as a theoretical subject.....	11
1.3.4 Inherent reasons why students struggle with Auditing as a theoretical subject	11
1.3.5 Criticism of traditional auditing education	13
1.4 PROBLEM STATEMENT	16
1.5 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES	16
1.5.1 General objective	16
1.5.2 Specific objectives.....	16

1.6	FIELD OF INVESTIGATION	17
1.7	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	18
1.7.1	Phase 1: Literate review	18
1.7.2	Phase 2: Development of the prototype game	18
1.7.3	Phase 3: Empirical study	19
1.8	CHAPTER OVERVIEW	20
1.9	SUMMARY	21
<u>CHAPTER 2</u>	EXPERIENTIAL TEACHING METHODOLOGIES: A POSSIBLE WAY OF ADDRESSING THE CHALLENGES FACING AUDITING EDUCATION	23
2.1	INTRODUCTION	23
2.2	EXPERIENTIAL TEACHING METHODOLOGY	24
2.3	DIFFERENT EXPERIENCE-BASED METHODS	26
2.3.1	Annual projects	26
2.3.2	Case studies	27
2.3.3	Problem-based learning	29
2.3.4	Interactive learning	30
2.3.5	Simulations	31
2.3.6	Role play	32
2.3.7	Educational games	33
2.3.8	The use of guest lecturers	34
2.3.9	Field experience	36
2.3.10	Information technology integration	37
2.4	CONCLUSION	40

<u>CHAPTER 3</u>	EXPERIENTIAL TEACHING METHODOLOGIES: CONSIDERATIONS REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION	41
3.1	INTRODUCTION	41
3.2	RESEARCH CONDUCTED IN TERTIARY EDUCATION IN GENERAL.....	42
3.2.1	Medical education	42
3.2.2	Civil engineering	42
3.3	RESEARCH CONDUCTED IN ACCOUNTING AND AUDITING EDUCATION.....	43
3.3.1	Case studies	43
3.3.2	Simulations	45
3.3.3	Educational games.....	47
3.3.4	Annual report project.....	49
3.3.5	Problem-based learning	50
3.4	CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE DESIGN OF AN EXPERIENTIAL TEACHING AID	51
3.5	MOTIVATION FOR THE DESIGN OF AN EDUCATIONAL COMPUTER GAME	57
3.6	CONCLUSION	59
<u>CHAPTER 4</u>	DESIGN NOTES ON THE USE OF A COMPUTER GAME AS A TEACHING TOOL.....	60
4.1	INTRODUCTION	60
4.2	DESIGN PRINCIPLES.....	60
4.2.1	Pedagogy.....	61
4.2.2	Gameplay	69

4.2.3	SUMMARY	75
4.3	GOALS OF THE EDUCATIONAL COMPUTER GAME	78
4.4	ADDRESSING SPECIFIC DESIGN CONSIDERATIONS	82
4.5	CONCLUSION	86
<u>CHAPTER 5</u>	DEVELOPING THE EDUCATIONAL GAME.....	87
5.1	INTRODUCTION	87
5.2	DETERMINING THE EDUCATIONAL CONTENT	88
5.2.1	Learning outcomes	89
5.2.2	The teaching plan	90
5.2.3	Question paper and memorandum	93
5.3	WRITING THE STORYBOARD	93
5.4	ANIMATING AND RECORDING THE CONTENT	94
5.5	PROGRAMMING THE GAME	94
5.6	TESTING AND EVALUATING THE GAME.....	94
5.7	RE-ANIMATION AND RE-PROGRAMMING	95
5.8	SUMMARY	95
<u>CHAPTER 6</u>	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND RESULTS	97
6.1	INTRODUCTION	97
6.2	SOCIAL EXPERIENTIAL RESEARCH DESIGN.....	97
6.2.1	Ethical considerations.....	98
6.2.2	Validity.....	98
6.2.3	Reliability	101
6.2.4	Independent and dependent variables.....	101

6.2.5	Sampling.....	101
6.2.6	Experiential and control group.....	102
6.2.7	Questionnaire.....	103
6.3	REPORTING AND INTERPRETING THE RESULTS.....	105
6.3.1	Descriptive statistics: Answers to Section A of the questionnaire – Background information	106
6.3.2	Descriptive statistics: Answers to Section B of the questionnaire – Perceptions regarding auditing education	117
6.3.3	Descriptive statistics and frequency analysis: Answers to Section C of the questionnaire – Perceptions regarding the case study and educational game as an educational tool.....	122
6.3.4	Descriptive statistics: Answers to Section D of the questionnaire – Self-assessment with regard to learning outcomes achievement.....	143
6.3.5	Descriptive statistics: Answers to Section E of the questionnaire – Perceptions regarding the computer game design	148
6.4	SUMMARY	162
<u>CHAPTER 7</u>	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	166
7.1	INTRODUCTION	166
7.2	GENERAL RESEARCH OBJECTIVE.....	166
7.3	SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES	166
7.3.1	Specific objective 1	167
7.3.2	Specific objective 2	168
7.3.3	Specific objective 3	169
7.3.4	Specific objective 4	170
7.3.5	Specific objective 5	173

7.3.6	Specific objective 6.....	179
7.3.7	Specific objective 7.....	180
7.3.8	Limitations of the study.....	186
7.3.9	Areas for further research.....	186
7.3.10	Conclusion.....	187
REFERENCE LIST		189
APPENDIX A	Case question and memorandum	210
APPENDIX B	Story Board : Audit recall it	216
APPENDIX C	Student perceptions regarding the use of an educational computer game in auditing education	238
APPENDIX D	Student perceptions regarding the use of an educational computer game in auditing education	250
APPENDIX E	Proof of editing	265

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 6	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND RESULTS.....	97
Table A.1:	Gender.....	106
Table A.2:	Age	106
Table A.3:	Historical year of study	107
Table A.4:	Qualification	108
Table A.5:	Module	108
Table A.6:	Home language.....	109
Table A.7:	Occupation.....	110
Table A.8:	Marks.....	110
Table A.9:	Vacation work experience	111
Table A.10:	Full-time work experience	111
Table A.11:	Perceived effect of work experience on studies.....	112
Table A.12:	Reason for chosen Profession	114
Table B.1:	Understanding the role of the auditor in public practice	117
Table B.2:	Understanding of the work environment.....	118
Table B.3:	Understanding of the auditing process	118
Table B.4:	Assessment of the difficulty of the subject.....	119
Table B.5:	Interest in the subject	119
Table B.6:	Assessment of the workload of the course	119
Table B.7:	Learning approach preference	120
Table B.8:	Perception of lectures	120

Table C.1:	Interest in the game/case study	122
Table C.2:	Game/case study as an aid to understanding the role of the auditor in the audit firm	122
Table C.3:	Game/case study as an aid to develop problem-solving skills ...	123
Table C.4:	Game/case study as an aid to developing judgement skills	123
Table C.5:	Game/case study as an aid to understanding the audit process.....	124
Table C.6:	Game/case study as an aid to visualising the audit process	124
Table C.7:	How the game/case study addresses the challenge of limited time	124
Table C.8:	The link between theory and the game/case study	125
Table C.9:	The Level Of Difficulty Of The Game/Case Study	125
Table C.10:	The game/case study as an aid when studying alone.....	126
Table C.11:	Joy factor.....	126
Table C.12:	Level of competition.....	127
Table C.13:	Competition as a motivating factor.....	127
Table C.14:	Perceived value of the game/case study	127
Table C.15:	Effectiveness of the guidance provided with the game/case study	128
Table C.16:	Successfulness of the guidance provided with the game/case study	128
Table C.17:	The game/case study as an aid in achieving better marks.....	128
Table C.18:	Feedback regarding the learning process in the game/case study	129
Table C.19:	Success of the game/case study in changing the learning approach of the students	129

Table C.20:	Success of the game/case study in increasing the motivation of the student	130
Table C.21:	Ability of the game/case study to substitute work experience	130
Table C.22:	Ability of the game/case study to be used repeatedly to enable the student to achieve higher marks	130
Table C.23:	Level of difficulty of the game/case study	131
Table C.24:	Level of intrigue of the game/case study	132
Table C.25:	Transferral of application skills in a test scenario	132
Table C.26:	Transferral of application skills in a work environment.....	132
Table C.27:	Motivational aspect: emotional involvement	133
Table C.28:	Critical thinking skills utilised to complete the game/case study	133
Table C.29:	Success of story in relating to student.....	134
Table C.30:	Success of game/case study in utilising thinking skills	134
Table 6.1:	Important statistical values	135
Table 6.2:	Pattern matrix	136
Table 6.3:	Factors with a chronbach's alpha higer than 0.7	138
Table 6.4:	Factors with a chronbach's alpha between 0.5 and 0.7	138
Table 6.5:	Factors with a chronbach's alpha lower than 0.5.....	138
Table C.31:	Factor: Educational value.....	139
Table C.32:	Factor: Examination preparation	139
Table C.33:	Factor: Level of discomfort	139
Table C.34:	Factor: engagement and joy.....	140
Table C.35:	Fascination	140

Table C.36:	Skills and workplace application	141
Table D.1:	Learning outcomes: understand how inventory should be audited	143
Table D.2:	Learning outcomes: Understand the audit process.....	143
Table D.3:	Learning outcomes: Able to identify risks at assertion level for the inventory balance	144
Table D.4:	Learning outcomes: understand assertions relating OT Inventory.....	144
Table D.5:	Learning outcomes: able to link risks to assertions.....	145
Table D.6:	Learning outcomes: understand the principles of audit planning.....	145
Table D.7:	Learning outcomes: understand the role of professional judgement in audit planning.....	146
Table D.8:	Learning outcomes: understand the concepts of nature, timing and extent of audit procedures	146
Table D.9:	Learning outcomes: understand the concepts of risk versus effectiveness as it applies to audit planning.....	147
Table D.10:	Learning outcomes: understand the concept of how and why audit procedures are performed.....	147
Table D.11:	Learning outcomes: understand the examination technique of formulating an audit procedure	148

Table E:	Answers to Section E of the questionnaire: Perceptions regarding the computer game design.....	149
Table E.1:	Computer literacy.....	149
Table E.2:	Like/dislike of recreational gaming	149
Table E.3:	Visual appeal	150
Table E.4:	Links with theoretical knowledge.....	150
Table E.5:	The gradebook feature is helpful.....	151
Table E.6:	Progress properly planned	151
Table E.7:	Desire to use the game as a study aid when studying out of class	152
Table E.8:	Usability	153
Table E.9:	Aptitude for interaction with others	154
Table E.10:	Success of information technology integration	155
Table E.11:	Clarity of communication.....	155
Table E.12:	Authenticity	156
Table E.13	Interest in the story	156
Table E.14:	Joy factor introduced through animations.....	157
Table E.15:	Educational value of tutorials	157
Table E.16:	Joy factor introduced through fantasy	158
Table E.17:	Motivational factor: challenge.....	158
Table E.18:	Tempo	159

LIST OF FIGURES

CHAPTER 1	THE CHALLENGES FACING AUDITING EDUCATION	1
Figure 1.1:	Summary of the audit process	7
CHAPTER 5	DEVELOPING THE EDUCATIONAL GAME.....	87
Figure 5.1:	Components to be included in the educational game	88
CHAPTER 7	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	166
Figure 7.1:	Components of the educational game	174
Figure 7.2:	Key pedagogical elements of an experiential teaching tool in general	175
Figure 7.3:	Elements of gaming.....	177

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AECC	Accounting Education Change Commission
ATO	Approved Training Office
CA(SA)	Chartered Accountant South Africa
IFAC	International Federation of Accountants
IRBA	Independent Regulatory Board for Auditors
ISA	International Standard on Auditing
iViSiCE	Interactive Visualisations in Civil Engineering
LAN	Local Area Network
NWU	North West University
PAAB	Public Accountants' and Auditors' Board
PBL	Problem-based learning
PWC	PriceWaterhouseCoopers
RTO	Registered Training Office
SAICA	South African Institute of Chartered Accountants
UK	United Kingdom
USA	United States of America
VAT	Value Added Tax
WWTB	Who Wants to Be a Millionaire
WWW	World Wide Web