

**Exploring emotive listening experiences through continuous
measurement of self-report and listening profiles**

M.L. Schutte

(née Steinberg)

12776718

Dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

MAGISTER MUSICAE

at the North-West University, Potchefstroom campus

Supervisor:

Dr. D.J. Taljaard

November 2011

SUMMARY

Exploring emotive listening experiences through continuous measurement of self-report and listening profiles

Training can enable performers to express music in a personal and emotional way while communicating aesthetic impressions to an audience. Little research has been done on the emotive experiences of performing musicians listening to their *own* performances. The main goal of this study was to develop a reliable way to investigate emotive content of such experiences through a combination of listening profiles and continuous measurement.

This empirical, methodological study used a mixed-method design. Responses from formally and informally trained musicians were tested. The methodology consists of two parts: listening profiles (Part I), and the continuous measurement of self-reported emotional response to music (Part II), supported by interviews. Part I consists of a demographic questionnaire, a listening test and a personality test. Part II consists of a computerised questionnaire with four questions: 1) word sorting, 2) word, colours, and facial expressions checklists, which participants use to indicate their emotional responses *while the music plays*, 3) free description, and 4) rating scales. Data was obtained during three test periods.

Part I results revealed that personality, illness, preferences, and psychological factors influence the emotive content of listening experiences. Participants' response time and manner of word sorting was also supportive of their profiles. Part II results revealed that listeners pay attention to both structural and performance elements as well as emotive content in both prescribed and personal musical tracks. Only a few participants were able to identify the predetermined emotion of the prescribed musical tracks. Participants' experiences seemed to be influenced by training and personal preferences.

Listening to their own recorded performances, informally trained participants were able to focus progressively less on performance elements and more on emotive content, while

formally trained participants seemed to focus progressively more on performance elements, and less on emotive content.

Keywords: emotive content, listening experiences, continuous measurement, listening profiles, self-report response, prescribed music, personal music, formally trained, informally trained

OPSOMMING

Verkenning van die emotiewe inhoud van luisterervaringe deur middel van kontinue meting deur self-gerapporteerde reaksie en luisteraarsprofiel

Musiekopvoeding kan uitvoerders in staat stel om musiek uit te voer op 'n persoonlike, emosionele wyse, terwyl estetiese indrukke aan 'n gehoor gekommunikeer word. Min navorsing bestaan oor die emotiewe inhoud van luisterervaringe van musikante wat na hul *eie* uitvoerings luister. Die hoofdoel van hierdie studie was om 'n betroubare metode te ontwikkel wat juis hierdie ervarings ondersoek deur 'n kombinasie van luisteraarsprofiel en kontinue meting.

Hierdie empiriese, metodologiese studie is gebaseer op verskeie metodes. Ervarings van formeel- en informeel-opgeleide musikante is ondersoek. Die metodologie bestaan uit twee dele: luisteraarsprofiel (Deel I) en die kontinue meting van self-gerapporteerde emosionele reaksies op musiek (Deel II), wat ondersteun word deur onderhoude. Deel I bestaan uit 'n demografiese vraelys, 'n luistertoets en 'n persoonlikheidstoets. Deel II bestaan uit 'n gerekenariseerde vraelys met vier vrae: 1) sortering van emosie woorde, 2) kontrolelyste van woorde, kleure en gesigsuitdrukings, wat die deelnemers gebruik om emotiewe reaksies aan te dui *terwyl* die musiek speel, 3) vrye beskrywings, en 4) merieteskale. Data is versamel tydens drie toetsperiodes.

Deel I se resultate het aangedui dat persoonlikheid, siekte, voorkeure en psigologiese faktore 'n invloed het op die emotiewe inhoud van luisterervaringe. Deelnemers se reaksietyd en reaksiestyl tydens die sortering van emosie woorde het ook hul profiel ondersteun. Deel II se resultate het aangedui dat luisteraars aandag skenk aan beide elemente in die struktuur en hul uitvoerings, sowel as emotiewe inhoud van beide voorgeskrewe en persoonlike musiekstukke. Slegs enkele deelnemers kon die voorgestelde emosie van die voorgeskrewe musiekstukke identifiseer. Die ervarings van deelnemers is skynbaar deur opleiding en persoonlike voorkeure beïnvloed.

In terme van die beluistering van hulle eie uitvoerings, het die informeel-opgeleide musikante progressief minder gefokus op hul uitvoerings en meer op emotiewe inhoud, terwyl die formeel-opgeleide musikante progressief meer op hul uitvoerings gefokus het, en minder op emotiewe inhoud.

Sleutelwoorde: emotiewe inhoud, luisterervaringe, kontinue meting, luisteraarsprofiel, self-gerapporteerde reaksie, voorgeskrewe musiek, persoonlike musiek, formeel opgelei, informeel opgelei

Note to the reader

Four musical tracks were added to the playlist editor of this demonstration version of Ponto Vista for testing purposes. They are: 1) a sample from a recording of ‘Gnossienne’ by Erik Satie, where you can use all three response formats, and 2) the three Hindustani samples that were used in this study, where you can use one response format per sample, like the participants did. If you wish to change the musical tracks in the playlist editor, follow the instructions provided in Chapter 4 and the Addendum.

Please keep the following in mind:

1. Copy the entire folder to your computer first.
2. All the provided files must be in the same folder in order for Ponto Vista to work.
3. You must install the provided Java application before opening Ponto Vista.
4. Username: Demo Reader. Once you have logged into the program, you cannot close it again. The program was designed to prevent users from closing it before all the tracks have played and all the questions have been answered. Only then will you be able to close the program.
5. Ponto Vista was designed to play only Ogg Vorbis files; therefore it is recommended that you should have a program able to save files in (or convert to) this format. The researcher used Audacity, which is available for free on the internet.
6. The data report generated at the end of the Ponto Vista session is an html-document. The researcher used Firefox to open it, but any contemporary web browser will suffice.

CONTENTS

Summary	i
Opsomming	iii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Problem statement and motivation	1
1.3 Objectives	6
1.4 Central theoretical argument	6
1.5 Method of investigation	6
1.6 Main concepts	9
1.7 Overview of research report	10
CHAPTER 2: MAPPING EMPIRICAL RESEARCH STUDIES ON MUSIC AND EMOTION	11
2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 Mapping of existing and potential research	11
2.3 Map and studies used in the current research project	28
2.3.1 Previous study: Steinberg 2006.....	32
2.3.2 Ponto Vista Questions 1 and 2: Shaver <i>et al.</i> , 1987.....	36
2.3.3 Ponto Vista Question 2, Colours checklist: existing research.....	40
2.3.4 Ponto Vista Question 2, facial expressions checklist: Vanger <i>et al.</i> , 1998	43
2.3.5 Ponto Vista Question 4, rating scales: Balkwill & Thompson, 1999 and Shaver <i>et al.</i> , 1987.....	48

2.3.6 Semi-structured interviews: Green 2002	50
2.4 Measuring instruments used in the current research project.....	50
2.4.1 Listening profiles: Demographic questionnaire.....	51
2.4.2 Listening profiles: Tomatis listening test	52
2.4.3 Listening profiles: NEO PI-R	58
2.4.4 Ponto Vista	65
2.5 Other ‘paths’ related to the current study	67
2.5.1 Overall design: mixed method	68
2.5.2 Ponto Vista: three Test Periods vs. one Test Period	68
2.5.3 Ponto Vista: continuous measurement	69
2.5.4 Ponto Vista: self-report	71
2.5.5 Ponto Vista: verbal and non-verbal response formats	71
2.5.6 Musical stimuli: prescribed music	72
2.5.7 Musical stimuli: listener is also performer	73
2.6 Summary	75
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY AND RESEARCH DESIGN	76
3.1 Introduction	76
3.2 Research design	76
3.3 Basic outline of methodology and measuring instruments	76
3.4 Participants	80
3.5 Recordings	82
3.6 Procedure	82

3.6.1 Part I: Listening profiles	83
3.6.2 Part II: Continuous measurement of self-reported emotional response to music.....	85
3.6.3 Semi-structured interview	97
3.7 Data capturing and editing	99
3.7.1 Part I	99
3.7.2 Part II	99
3.7.3 Interviews	110
3.8 Summary	110
CHAPTER 4: THE COMPUTERISED QUESTIONNAIRE – A DESCRIPTION OF THE PONTO VISTA PROGRAM	111
4.1 Introduction	111
4.2 Purpose	111
4.3 Description	112
4.3.1 Main window	112
4.3.2 Introduction window	114
4.3.3 Question 1 - Word sorting	114
4.3.4 Total progress window and loading window	117
4.3.5 Question 2 – Multi interface checklists	118
4.3.6 Question 3 – Free description	119
4.3.7 Question 4 – Rating scales	120
4.3.8 The report	122

4.3.9 General	127
4.4 Time line and development stages	128
4.5 Summary	131
CHAPTER 5: RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	132
5.1 Introduction	132
5.2 Part I: Listening profiles	132
5.2.1 Demographic questionnaire	132
5.2.2 Tomatis listening test	136
5.2.3 NEO PI-R personality test	137
5.2.4 Combining the results of the NEO PI-R and Tomatis listening test	142
5.2.5 Ponto Vista Question 1	142
5.2.6 Interviews: relevant information	182
5.2.7 Listening profiles: an example	185
5.3 Part II: Continuous measurement of self-reported emotional response to music	189
5.3.1 Prescribed musical tracks	189
5.3.1.1 Example	190
5.3.1.2 Raga Kirwani and samples results: group	226
5.3.2 Personal musical tracks	244
5.3.2.1 Example	245
5.3.2.2 Personal musical tracks results: group	255
5.4 Part I and Part II: tendencies	270
5.4.1 Tendencies according to Part I (Demographic questionnaire) and Part II	270

5.4.2 Tendencies according to Part I (Tomatis listening test) and Part II	275
5.4.3 Tendencies according to Part I (NEO PI-R) and Part II	276
5.5 Comparison between formally trained and informally trained participants	279
5.5.1 Part I: Listening profiles	279
5.5.2 Part II: Continuous measurement of self-reported emotional response to music	283
5.5.3 Part I and Part II: tendencies	285
5.5.4 Conclusion	286
CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	287
6.1 Introduction	287
6.2 The relationships between the main concepts	287
6.3 Summary of the results of the study	292
6.4 Methodological advantages and limitations	297
6.5 Recommendations	299
6.6 Personal reflections on the research process	301
6.7 Conclusions	302
6.7.1 Significance in the research field of music and emotion	302
6.7.2 Significance for the training of performing musicians	303
References	305
Addenda	313
Addendum A: Demographic questionnaire	313

Addendum B: NEO PI-R	316
Addendum C: Specifications	324
Addendum D: Informed consent	327
Acknowledgements	329

FIGURES

CHAPTER 2

Figure 2.1 Profiling methods: summary	12
Figure 2.2 Profiling methods 1/3	13
Figure 2.3 Profiling methods 2/3	13
Figure 2.4 Profiling methods 3/3	14
Figure 2.5 Methods to measure emotional response: summary	14
Figure 2.6 Methods to measure emotional response 1/3	15
Figure 2.7 Methods to measure emotional response 2/3	15
Figure 2.8 Methods to measure emotional response 3/3	16
Figure 2.9 Musical stimuli: summary	17
Figure 2.10 Map of the current study – profiling	29
Figure 2.11 Map of the current study – measurement of emotional response.....	29
Figure 2.12 Map of the current study – musical stimuli	30
Figure 2.13 Results of the Shaver study	39
Figure 2.14 Processing stages	45
Figure 2.15 Prototypes	46
Figure 2.16 Combination of upper and lower facial expressions	47

CHAPTER 3

Figure 3.1 List of emotion words	88
Figure 3.2 Colours checklist	92
Figure 3.3 Facial expressions	93
Figure 3.4 An example of a Word Sorting sheet	101
Figure 3.5 An example of a Word Sorting Summary sheet	102
Figure 3.6 Creating and deleting categories	102
Figure 3.7 An example of a Word Categories sheet	103
Figure 3.8 Comparing a participant's categories to Shaver's categories	106
Figure 3.9 An example of a participant's word checklist results	107
Figure 3.10 An example of a participant's colours checklist results	107
Figure 3.11 An example of a participant's facial expressions checklist results	108
Figure 3.12 An example of a summary	109
Figure 3.13 An example of free descriptions results	109
Figure 3.14 An example of rating scales results	110

CHAPTER 4

Figure 4.1a Log in screen	112
Figure 4.1b Enter username	112
Figure 4.1c Playlist editor	113
Figure 4.2a Introduction window	114
Figure 4.2b Overview of the questions	114
Figure 4.3a-b Question 1 – word sorting	115-116

Figure 4.4a-c Warning	117
Figure 4.4d Return or continue	117
Figure 4.5a Total progress window	117
Figure 4.5b Loading window	117
Figure 4.6a Example of multi interface checklists	118
Figure 4.6b Panel at bottom of window	118
Figure 4.6c Timer	118
Figure 4.7 Question 3 – free description	119
Figure 4.8 Question 3 – help screen	119
Figure 4.9a Rating scales	120
Figure 4.9b-c Warning	121
Figure 4.10 Total progress window	121
Figure 4.11 Farewell window	122
Figure 4.12a-d Report	123
Figure 4.13 Report: word sorting	124
Figure 4.14 Report: checklist selections	126
Figure 4.15 Report: free descriptions	126
Figure 4.16 Report: rating scales	127
Figure 4.17 Development stages	129

CHAPTER 5

Figure 5.1 Tomatis listening test – JP	186
Figure 5.2 Matching JP’s selections with the raga score	193

Figure 5.3 Matching JP's selections with the score – Track 5, 6 and 7	218
Figure 5.4 Matching JP's selections with the score - Reinecke Sonata.....	247

TABLES

CHAPTER 2

Table 2.1 Acronyms	16
Table 2.2 Existing studies	17
Table 2.3 Summary of studies used in the current study	30
Table 2.4 Summary of measuring instruments used in the current study	51
Table 2.5 Summary of methodology – related decisions	67

CHAPTER 3

Table 3.1 Methodology	77
Table 3.2 Participants	81
Table 3.3 Musical tracks	90
Table 3.4 Shaver categories	104

CHAPTER 5

Table 5.1 Illness	133
Table 5.2 Illness during Ponto Vista sessions	133
Table 5.3 Personal information of participants	134
Table 5.4 Tomatis test results	136

Table 5.5 -5.9 Domain results	137
Table 5.10 Misunderstood/misarranged emotion words.....	143
Table 5.11 Unknown emotion words	143
Table 5.12 Not emotion	143
Table 5.13 Remaining emotion words	144
Table 5.14 Number of categories	144
Table 5.15 Strategies	146
Table 5.16 Constructing positive, negative and mixed categories	146
Table 5.17 Cause and effect strategy	148
Table 5.18 Emotions related to situation or person strategy	151
Table 5.19 Shaver categories	154
Table 5.20 Comparing participants' categories with Shaver's categories	156
Table 5.21 Response time and manner	180
Table 5.22 Relevant interview information	182
Table 5.23 Specific interview questions	184
Table 5.24 Demographic questionnaire – JP	185
Table 5.25 NEO PI-R evaluation report – JP	187
Table 5.26 Word checklist	190
Table 5.27 Colours checklist	191
Table 5.28 Facial expressions checklist	192
Table 5.29 Summary	214
Table 5.30 Free description	214
Table 5.31 Relevant paraphrased interview extracts	215

Table 5.32 Rating scales	216
Table 5.33 Track 5 word checklist	217
Table 5.34 Track 6 Colours checklist	217
Table 5.35 Track 7 Facial expressions checklist	218
Table 5.36 Summary	224
Table 5.37 Free descriptions	225
Table 5.38 Relevant paraphrased interview extracts	225
Table 5.39 Rating scales	226
Table 5.40 Response formats participants used most	227
Table 5.41 – 5.50 Word checklists	228
Table 5.51 Colour selections	232
Table 5.52 Facial expressions selections	235
Table 5.53 Topical descriptions of free descriptions	238
Table 5.54 Rating scales	240
Table 5.55 Appropriateness scale	241
Table 5.56 Interview topics	242
Table 5.57 Word checklist	245
Table 5.58 Colours checklist	245
Table 5.59 Facial expressions checklist	246
Table 5.60 Summary	253
Table 5.61 Free descriptions	253
Table 5.62 Relevant paraphrased interview extracts	253
Table 5.63 Rating scales	254

Table 5.64 Participants' personal musical tracks	255
Table 5.65 Use of formats	256
Table 5.66 – 5.75 Word checklists	257
Table 5.76 – 5.77 Colours checklists	261
Table 5.78 – 5.79 Facial expressions checklists	263
Table 5.80 Free descriptions	267
Table 5.81 – 5.82 Rating scales results	268
Table 5.83 – 5.84 Appropriateness scale results	269
Table 5.85 Interview topics	270
Table 5.86 Example	272
Table 5.87 Illness during a Test Period	274
Table 5.88 – 5.92 NEO PI-R domains	276
Table 5.93 Comparison of group's NEO PI-R results	281