

CHAPTER 5

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter summarises the study. The main outcomes of the literature study and empirical investigation, including the findings on the research objectives, are presented in this chapter. These findings, together with the literature study, form the basis on which the recommendations are made.

5.2. SUMMARY OF THE STUDY

In chapter one of the mini-dissertation the orientation, problem statement, research objectives and research methodology of the study were addressed. The method of investigation, work procedure and objectives of the study were also presented in this chapter. It also covered the reason for the study, dealt with the background to this public housing problem in South Africa and mentioned how the people voted for a democratically elected government in 1994.

The key questions of the research were theoretically explored in chapter 2 of the mini-dissertation. It focused on the public housing dilemma from a South African perspective as well as from a Cape Town municipal perspective. The chapter dealt with the annual influx of people, from the Eastern Cape Province particularly, in search of economic opportunities. This is contributing to the public housing dilemma in Cape Town. The City of Cape Town Municipality has embarked on an informal settlement upgrade programme and employed a four-phased approach. The Municipality's Integrated Development Plan (IDP) as well as its Integrated Housing Plan (IHP) were analysed and presented in this chapter.

The statutory and regulatory framework which governs public housing delivery in South Africa was analysed and presented in Chapter 3. The South African government repealed many apartheid laws and promulgated a new Constitution which contains a Bill of Rights. From the Constitution, the supreme law of the country, many other laws were promulgated to give effect to the government's housing strategy. The study analysed the provisions contained in the Housing Act, the Social Housing Act, the National Housing Code and the Prevention of Illegal Eviction from and Unlawful Occupation of land Act. The City of Cape Town

Municipality's IDP, IHP and Housing Allocation Policy were also discussed in greater detail in Chapter 3 of the study.

Chapters 2 and 3 concentrated on the first two objectives of the study, namely to:

- Evaluate the City of Cape Town Municipality's strategic housing plan to deliver housing to the approximately 350 000 people living in the more than 200 informal settlements in and around Cape Town; and
- Analyse the policies, strategies and legal requirements of the City of Cape Town Municipality in its quest to provide public housing infrastructure to the poor.

Chapter 4 investigated the perceived problems of slow housing delivery and services experienced by residents of the 223 Informal settlements situated in and around Cape Town. The perceptions, attitudes and behaviours of Municipality housing officials towards housing delivery in Cape Town were also investigated by the researcher. The researcher made use of semi-structured questionnaires to conduct personal interviews with identified key-role players of the City of Cape Town Municipality's housing directorate, as well as residents of a few informal settlements and backyard dwellers. The semi-structured questionnaire was developed and divided into three main sections namely Section A: Biographical information; Section B: Semi-structured questions about public housing; Section C: measured the attitudes and perceptions of respondents regarding public housing delivery. The questionnaire was therefore used as the basic research mechanism. During the discussion of the empirical findings, attention was paid to the following:

- Challenges regarding housing service delivery as experienced by the City of Cape Town Municipality (objective three of the study); and
- Possible reasons for the perceived slow delivery of housing within the City of Cape Town Municipality's area of responsibility (objective four of the study).

The findings confirmed the research questions and the literature review. The Municipality cannot provide sufficient public housing opportunities to the numbers of people mentioned. Because of the limited financial resources available to the City of Cape Town Municipality, it has embarked on a four phased plan to

upgrade and improve the living conditions of the informal settlement dwellers in Cape Town. The rudimentary services and improvements delivered by the City of Cape Town Municipality to many of these informal settlements have bettered the lives of these people while they wait patiently for formal housing to be delivered to them.

Chapter 5 summarises the study and discusses the results of the empirical study. By interpretation of the results, conclusions can be reached as to whether the objectives of the study were achieved. These findings, collected through the literature study and the interviewer-administered questionnaire, are summarised in the next section.

5.3. FINDINGS WITH REGARD TO RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

In conclusion, it will be indicated whether the objectives of this study were achieved. This will be done by analysing each of the research objectives, in order to determine whether the study was successful.

The primary objective of this study was to analyse the level of involvement and/or commitment of the City of Cape Town Municipality in delivering formal housing to the approximately 350 000 people living in informal settlements in and around Cape Town.

Objective one was therefore to find answers regarding the following question: *What is the City of Cape Town Municipality's role in delivering houses to those living in the 222 informal settlements in the demarcated jurisdictional area of the City of Cape Town Municipality?*

This objective was achieved through an analysis of the public housing dilemma in SA with specific reference to the said Municipality (chapter 2). The history of SA housing problems was analysed in chapter 2.

Objective two was to discover answers regarding the following question: *What are the policies, strategies and legal requirements for municipal service delivery with reference to public housing service delivery?*

This objective was achieved by the discussion of relevant statutory and regulatory legislation in chapter three, which focused on housing service delivery within SA.

Objective three was to find answers regarding the following question: *What are the challenges faced by the City of Cape Town Municipality in rendering public housing infrastructure to the 222 informal settlements?*

This objective was achieved by using the semi-structured questionnaires as part of the empirical study (chapter 4), and conducting personal interviews with respondents from informal settlements, backyard dwellers and housing officials from the Municipality. During these interviews, all respondents listed the many challenges they experience as residents on the one hand and as Municipality housing officials on the other, wanting to deliver on the needs of the people.

Objective four was to find answers regarding the following question: *What are the possible reasons for the perceived slow delivery of housing in the local government's pilot housing project, namely the Joe Slovo, N2 Gateway Housing Project?*

This objective was not met in its totality. Through a political decision by the national DOH the City of Cape Town Municipality is no longer involved with this pilot housing project in Cape Town. Fifty percent of the respondents from the City of Cape Town Municipality's department were reluctant to confirm the literature study which was undertaken by the researcher. Fifty percent of respondents only confirmed that the project is now a national project and that they were not operationally involved with the housing delivery of the N2 Gateway housing project any longer. This housing project could form part of an independent study to achieve this study objective.

The results of the questionnaire indicate a positive response, which is an indication that the City of Cape Town Municipality is unable to provide formal housing to the people mentioned. All of the City of Cape Town Municipality housing officials agreed with the findings.

5.4. RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are made, based on the findings of the empirical study:

Every citizen of SA, and in particular Cape Town residents, has the right to public housing delivery, provided they meet the requirements as set down in the

relevant housing policies and regulatory framework promulgated by the national Government of South Africa.

The study also confirms that public housing opportunities are a very costly exercise which cannot be achieved by the SA Government alone. Due to the constant in- migration of people into the City, mainly from the Eastern and Northern Cape provinces, the housing backlog in Cape Town annually grows unabated.

Attempting to stop people from migrating to the CBDs may be seen as infringing on their Constitutional rights to employment and shelter. Nevertheless the Municipality cannot utilise its total financial budget to build millions of houses each year to address the housing dilemma. The recommendation of this study is that the City of Cape Town Municipality should request more funds to purchase sufficient land and create enough housing opportunities each year to meet its developmental targets of approximately 10 000 units. Public housing delivery is a very complex matter and there are no easy solutions to this problem.

The challenges of unemployment, poverty, public ground and limited financial resources will remain part of the Municipality's quest to provide for the needs of the people in Cape Town as stipulated by the Constitution. Countries like China applied the densification principle by building high rise buildings to resolve their public housing needs. This study confirmed that the 2014 deadline for eradication of informal settlements as set by the national department of housing is unattainable and unrealistic.

The City of Cape Town Municipality should continue with its four phased plan of upgrading the living conditions of informal settlements dwellers as planned in their IDP and IHP. The Municipality should investigate the possibility of legalising these informal structures in order to add value and create wealth for the informal dweller. The property should be demarcated and valued and the informal structures legalised. This is a similar strategy to that of dealing with the informal backyard structures in Cape Town.

The issue of public land should be addressed with national government and the long processes in acquiring land for housing should be revised. There should be a closer working relationship between the three tiers of Government, namely

national, provincial and local, especially when it comes to issues of land for public housing delivery.

There should be a greater focus on job creation and rural development at a municipal sphere, in order to address the needs of people. This study confirmed that people migrate from neighbouring provinces in search of economic opportunities to support their families. Foreign investment into South Africa should be encouraged at every possible opportunity presented to the three tiers of Government. With an adequate and stable income, more people will be able to enter the formal housing market and become less dependent on the Government to provide them with public housing opportunities. The possibility of Government incentives for foreign investment should be pursued at the highest levels of Government.

Integrated public housing should form part of existing suburbs and communities around the City of Cape Town. This will eradicate past spatial planning and present a truly cosmopolitan community and landscape in Cape Town. The Municipality is exploring the Chinese housing development model of building two or three storey public housing complexes due to a lack of suitable ground for public housing development in and around the city. This model has never been tested in Cape Town before, and more research should be undertaken into the feasibility of this type of housing development.

The City of Cape Town Municipality has a constitutional mandate to assist people in need of formal housing opportunities. It acknowledges that on its own it cannot provide sufficient housing opportunities. The research confirmed that the Municipality has entered into a cooperative working relationship with three major banks in Cape Town, to develop certain areas of vacant land in the city with public housing opportunities for people earning between R3501 to R10 000 per month who do not qualify for a state housing subsidy. They also do not earn enough to enter the formal housing market. It is recommended that this type of private public partnership be extended to other areas of the City where the public housing need is greatest. This seems to be a very successful strategy in dealing with public housing opportunities.

Private businesses and large corporations in Cape Town should be encouraged to follow the example of the Monaco resident, Lord Irvine Laidlaw, who donated

approximately R9.0 million to build brick houses for residents of Masiphumelele Informal Settlement near Noordhoek in Cape Town.

The residents of many affluent communities in and around Cape Town are resistant to having low cost housing integrated into their communities, as they fear that their property values will be devalued in the process. The Municipality should re-examine its property valuation policies, in order to value these so-called low-cost public housing units according to the valuation strategies in place for so-called up market areas. The public housing opportunities should be valued according to the community where they are situated without affecting the property valuations of the existing community. This will make it more acceptable for the affluent community dwellers to accept public housing opportunities to be developed on state land situated within their community. There is a need for a further and more in-depth study into this proposal. This will enhance the integration of low-cost housing in and around Cape Town. This model could be replicated in the major CBDs in and around South Africa.

The national department of housing's BNG pilot project, the Joe Slovo N2 Gateway housing project, should be managed in a more efficient and effective manner and without the political interferences which it has experienced to date. The Municipality was removed from the management of this project by a political decision. This project has been delayed and only a few thousand of the expected 22 000 housing opportunities have been built to date. The estimated cost overruns of this pilot housing project are estimated to run into billions of rand, from public funds. The delays in public housing delivery to informal settlement dwellers have caused occurrences of public violence in Gugulethu and on the N2 Highway near Cape Town during 2008 and in 2009. The 22 000 intended housing opportunities should be completed as soon as possible to prevent future public violence being committed by shack dwellers and to assist in eradicating the informal settlements in Cape Town in the foreseeable future. We need greater co-operation between the three spheres of Government to address the public housing need in Cape Town.

The national Government of South Africa should focus on a more effective and efficient rural development strategy to enhance the development of infrastructure and economic opportunities for the people. Job opportunities should be created closer to the people in rural towns, which may prevent them from migrating to the

CBDs in search of economic opportunities. The fact that they move to the bigger cities around SA does not guarantee them a job opportunity. It is hoped that this study will have laid the groundwork for an effective solution to the challenge of providing suitable housing for those who do move to the City of Cape Town.

5.5. FINAL CONCLUSION

This study focussed on the public housing opportunity and service delivery by the City of Cape Town Municipality. The City of Cape Town Municipality has delivered a total of 9576 housing opportunities during the 2008/9 financial year. Even with such a delivery rate, it cannot begin to eradicate the ever growing housing backlog in Cape Town. Much still needs to be done by the national government to alleviate the plight of approximately 2.4 million people living in almost 7000 informal settlements in South Africa. Two hundred and twenty three informal settlements were identified in Cape Town where close to 400 000 people are in need of housing assistance. The regulatory and statutory framework is in place to try and deal with the public housing dilemma in SA and in Cape Town. Sufficient public land for housing remains a big challenge to the Municipality.

It is hoped that there will be a greater working relationship between the three tiers of Government (National, Provincial and Local), which will improve housing delivery in the N2 Gateway housing project and the public private partnership with the SA banking fraternity. The delivery of formal public houses has the benefit of improving the living conditions of citizens. Public housing will also create wealth in terms of property ownership and thereby reducing poverty amongst South Africans.