Exploring local histories in the use and appreciation of heritage and history in history curricula

Prof Elize S van Eeden
North-West University
Vanderbijlpark
Elize.vaneeden@nwu.ac.za

Abstract

With the Internet so easily available nowadays, I decided (just for the fun of it but also out of curiosity) to do a Google search to see how many entries I could find for “heritage and history”. In a split second no fewer than 840 000 results appeared. I felt exhausted even before I even started surveying the results. This gives a sense of how history educators must sometimes feel when they have to teach content or facilitate, but still have to find the time on a daily or weekly basis to engage with meaningful ideas and activities as part of the History curriculum. This is especially true for heritage assignments that from 2012 will, among others, be the focus in the Grade 10 History curriculum.

In September 2010 the South African Society for History Teaching held its second conference since its founding on the theme of heritage and its inevitable associations with history. As I do not wish to repeat here the theories and practical suggestions which other educators of history with expertise in heritage have recently developed, my focus is more practical. It is practical in the sense that it will motivate educators to use existing content in local histories and local heritage within history curricula frameworks (in all educational phases) to serve as examples of broader trends – apart from this, heritage is also to be appreciated for its own sake as well as acting as a micro anchor and milestone from which broader historical developments evolve. In this regard my focus therefore was more on identifying historical content in past debates and research deliberations with the intention to support educators

with content that they can explore inside and outside the formal classroom set-up. Therefore the discussion merely:

- Gives glimpses of local history and heritage in the writing of historians and others;
- Deals with one local heritage example in the classroom (to connect with the SASHT 2010 conference theme: The “how to of yours, mine and ours in a still divided community; environment”), namely the 2010 Shaka statue debacle;
- Gives some concluding suggestions on heritage, history and the History curriculum.

Introduction

Although heritage topics – with their always highly debateable associations with history and memory – are not part of my daily professional focus and concern, I also from time to time stumble on their inevitable presence in the recording of local and regional history. When doing so, and also with preservation of the local environment at the back of my mind, I am more often than not aware that history educators from all the provinces, and from particular regions and localities, can do so much more to support awareness of local history and local heritage as a form of identity. Through practical means (for example learner assignments that can also be linked to most History curriculum themes, and are thus not “wasted”) this activity could contribute to preserving local history (as a non-negotiable foundation to support the understanding and appreciation of local heritage). These inputs could eventually expand the archived memories of their own area that responsible institutions of local areas preserve or that are archived elsewhere.

The point I am also making is that local history and local heritage preservation cannot be the task only of local or national government or a limited number of local historians/heritage-preservation organisations in our country. Therefore heritage education will (and should) have a place in History curricula once History educators are willing to provide space to previously neglected or marginalised narratives as a living (intangible) or visible (tangible) heritage.

2 In the context of this discussion local or regional history is recognised as the unity of all historical branches related to history. In regional history the past is studied from a local angle from above and below. Its methodology therefore also features an interest in smaller communities/individuals, their activities, experiences or/and contributions in their own environment, of which some local events also may lead to broader outcomes. Compare “Editorial”: Contree: Journal for South African urban and regional history, 1 (January 1977), p. 3.

3 In the context of this discussion heritage is basically defined as an individual or collective memory/oral conceptions of the past as expressed in the present. There is no exact relationship of the past in the present. It can also appear as being both a point of identity and difference. See N Sheperd & S Robins (Eds.), New South African keywords, (Jacana, Johannesburg, 2008), p.117; C Kros, Heritage vs. history: the end of a noble tradition? Historia, 48(1), May 2003, pp. 326-336.

Heritage is not only to be explored occasionally or mostly ignored, but must be passionately and constructively engaged with inside and outside classrooms and lecture halls (as so many educators pointed out during the SASHT 2010 conference). As heritage will always have the appearance of being in motion (and is not fixed) its “acknowledgement” in formal history education could and should rather be used as human experiences that support the making of any history, or as a tool contributing to the understanding of expressions of the broader past.

The professional engagement which I, and other historians, have is then to record local histories (this could be approached from various angles such as economic, religious, educational, environmental, etc.) so that History educators and others can also use these contents as fundamental historical contexts, for example in heritage assignments.

Another personal engagement (at least in this writing) is to make History educators aware of the fact that the broader History curricula of the General Education and Training (GET) and Further Education and Training (FET) phases do not “ignore” local history and local heritage. Their “useability” and “practicality” in the teaching of History curriculum themes lie in the way the History educator methodologically structures his or her theme content so that learners, for example, can understand international events through local examples, and vice versa. The rest of the discussion will be devoted to this “second” engagement, with the point of departure being some form of conceptual understanding, and then exposing history educators to some practicalities and local South African sources that they can use to enrich their local history research and heritage activities for History learners.

Views on the teaching of History by deliberating on past research into local history and local heritage by historians and others

It is generally known that perhaps no national history and memory can be representative and/or complete without considering some milestones in local historical events that sometimes contribute, or have contributed, to mind-shifting decision making at all levels of authority and in the community. Although these events may be associated only with one particular group, community, race, gender or even age group, contributions (historically recorded, or through oral/anecdotal memories or visual expressions as

heritage), they remain part of the local and also the broader national history.

To my mind local history and local heritage in the 21st century should not be ignored or “de-balkanised” (a term used by a speaker during the SASHT 2010 conference) to support notions such as “rainbow nationalism”. Exploring local histories in the knowing, using and appreciating of heritage and history in general (but certainly for History educators exploring a history theme in a History curriculum in an all-inclusive way) may spontaneously pave the way for “nation building”. Thus it is a form of open-minded approach that may perhaps contribute to another second form of identity among all, which features traces of “rainbow or liberal nationalism”, and which could serve as a form of identity bonding of the South African nation, but does not ignore or disrespect the differences and identities of the various communities.

An appreciation of the history and heritage of all is reflected in the Preamble to the National Heritage Resources Act (Act 25 of 1999). The role of heritage (and per se also local heritage) is expressed in a refined and well-articulated way (I have underlined certain of the words to accentuate their importance):

Our heritage is unique and precious and it cannot be renewed. It helps us to define our cultural identity and therefore lies at the heart of our spiritual well-being and has the power to build our nation …

So indirectly the developers of the Act have acknowledged the reality that “our heritage” can “help us” … and “has the power” to … NOT: “it defines a specific heritage” but simply a more moderate “it helps us to define”, and NOT: it “builds our nation”, BUT it “has the power to build our nation” (which means that this definition can only be applied if all the “our heritage” legacies (which also mostly have local roots) are acknowledged, are historically

---


8 This argument does not contradict the view that any country should explore ways of creating a national identity.

9 These are conceptual expressions that academia have tossed around recently. See S Marschall, “Making money with memories: The fusion of heritage, tourism and identity formation in South Africa”, Historia, 50(1), May 2005, p. 118.

well recorded, respected and used or imaged through various mediums of heritage expressions (past and present).\textsuperscript{11}

Because all communities and individuals have a heritage, just as they all have a past, Heritage Day in South Africa is for the “all”\textsuperscript{12} and the “us” in the country. I would like to think, without wanting to provoke an enormous conceptual debate, that history should serve as a cornerstone of representative and reliable information from which heritage activities in South African education are developed and facilitated. Heritage outcomes could then serve the purpose of leading to inventive actions and/or creativity in many forms. In the process it could even allow opportunities to assemble unique information to be unlocked (by interested experts) and preserved for future generations.

Heritage can be packaged in many forms and with many features, such as in:

- Religion
- Material/spiritual culture
- A physical space which a group(s) occupy/ies
- National values
- Wildlife
- Landscape
- Oral testimonies
- Individual contributions/outstanding leaders
- Street and place names
- Artistic expressions in all their variety.

To be able then to “serve” the theme of “heritage”, at least in the recently accepted South African History curriculum for schools (CAPS document), History educators will probably rely heavily on the guidance of learner and teacher textbooks. As these books can only provide direction on one theme to a limited extent, the independent-thinking History educator should explore his or her local environment and region more intensively to use the local/regional historical legacy as efficiently as possible in an educational environment.

As a start, to acquaint oneself and learners on a local topic so as to reach the heritage part, in my view searching for available information on a specific local community (close by or even elsewhere) would be one of the first obligations of the educator. Because some information on local histories is

\textsuperscript{11} Also compare DoE, CD compilation titled, “Celebrating our heritage.” Constitutional values highlighted in the manifesto on values, education and democracy. Race and values in education, Pretoria, ca 1996.

not readily accessible to some History educators, I have listed several related local history articles on a variety of places in South Africa (see below). They are mostly written by historians or researchers in other disciplines known to be experts in a particular field or area of research. These articles are mostly based on extensive research (and thinking), and could serve as valuable points of departure to unlock a specific local past, or to present debates on the past.

Some articles can also be used in various History curriculum themes (in a national and even international context) to provide the educator (and learners) with additional knowledge to be able to come to a more informed understanding of a theme under discussion. Once History educators have identified a few articles in the selection below that would serve their purpose, the way to obtain them would be to ask a local library to trace them through an interlibrary service or to investigate their availability through various search engines on the Internet. History societies or/and institutions that publish journals could also be approached. As a last resort the SASHT could also serve as an intermediate source to provide history educators with specific history articles or other historical information. The website www.sashtw.org.za (for subscribers) can be used for such enquiries. It is hoped that after making the effort to find sources of information on local history and local heritage in the form of articles in the four historical journals (there are more) cited here, educators will continue their research in other publications and books and use the information for its educational and historical value.

**Locating local history and local heritage articles in history journals**

Selections of history articles are given below which appear in four well-received journals on South African history (although they are by no means “complete sets” of local history and local heritage history). They are valuable sources of information on local history and local heritage history. The hope is that History educators will consider using those articles that they find informative for explaining the context of a particular theme, or will consider using the content in practical local history or heritage excursions as views or perspectives.

Also note that although some place names that appear in the articles may have changed after 1994, the early history of an area, monument, building,
etc. remains very much intact, so most of the content is still important for exploring relics of a town’s, region’s or country’s heritage. In the lists of selected articles below there is something worthwhile to browse through on just about every province and its regions. The journals explored are the South African Historical Journal (SAHJ); Historia; the New Contreé (previously known as Contreé, mainly focused on local history); and the South African Journal for Cultural History (abbreviated in this discussion as the SACJ). They are listed in random order.14

Eastern Cape

- H Giliomee, Democracy and the frontier. A comparative study of Bacon’s rebellion (1676) and the Graaff-Reinet rebellion (1795–1796), SAHJ, 6(1), 1974, pp. 30-51.
  - KS Hunt, When the railway came to Grahamstown, Contreé, 6, 1979, pp. 24-28.
  - OJO Ferreira, Onder-Kouga: Oorsig van ‘n kontrole, Contreé, 14, 1983, pp. 5-16.
  - EJ Iongs, Mfengu beach labour and Port Elizabeth harbor development, 1835-1870, Contreé, 21, 1987, pp. 5-12.
  - JC Visagie, Pieter Jacobus de Wet (1790-1843) and the voorgeskiedenis van Alwal-Noord, SAJC, 19(2), November 2005, pp. 111-126.
  - JR Heaton, The dismissal of John Milford Bowker, resident agent amongst the Gqunnukwebe and Mfengu at Fort Peddie, 1836-1839, Historia, 23(2), 1978, pp. 112-121.

14 The articles listed in each of the provinces are not given in any specific order.
Free State

- W van der Merwe, Die Berlyse sendelinge van Bethanie (Oranje-Vrystaat) en die Kora, 1834–1856. SAHJ, 17(1), 1985, pp. 49-63.
- CJP le Roux, Sandkif - sanddiplikerke in die Oranje-Vrystaat. SAJC, 7(3), Junie 1993, pp. 47-55.
- SM Botes, L Mauritshuis invloed op die interieur-inrigting van twee van Bloemfontein se bekendste wonings, 1880-1900. SAJC, 17(1), Junie 2003, pp. 115-140.

Gauteng

- C Dugmore, From the ‘Devil’s drop’ to ‘Fair drop’: The transformation of Krugersdorp from a transient mining boomsrhp into a stable settler town, 1887 to 1903. SAHJ, 63(2), 2010, pp. 338-357.
KwaZulu-Natal

- SM Ndlovu, “He did what any other person in his position would have done to fight the forces of invasion and disruption”, Africans, the land and contending images of King Dingane (‘the Patriot’) in the Twentieth Century, 1916–1950, SAHJ, 38(1), 1998, pp. 99-143.
- P Ferreira, Duddington Court, Durban, Centene, 1, 1977, p. 28.

Exploring local histories

- P Müller, They also served: Ordinary South African women in an extra-ordinary struggle: The case of Erna de Villiers (Bubbe), New Context, 59, 2010, pp. 1-25. [A personality of the Vanderbijlpark-Vereeniging area]
- R van der Merwe, Changing profile: The public face of the University of Pretoria over a century, 1908-2008, New Context, 60, 2010, pp. 84-112.
- JS Bergh, “Die aanvangsjaare van die Belyme Sehindingstasie Wallmannshul SAJC,10 (1), Mei 1996, pp. 74-86.
- A Douwes, Begruiden, an 1847 Suikerboerdryk farm name change, SAJC, 13(1), May 1999, pp. 1-15.
- KA Bakker et al., The “Mamelodi Rondavels” as place in the formative period of Bantu Education and in Vlakfontein (Mamelodi West), SAJC, 17(2), November 2003, pp. 1-22.
Limpopo


Mpumalanga

Exploring local histories

Northern Cape

- JJ Marais, Carnarvon: Oorsig van die geskiedenis van die dorpe en distrik, Contrace, 1(1), 1977, pp. 16-20.
- JCS van der Merwe, Vanwykskeur: ‘n Streekshistoriese skets, Contrace, 6, 1979, pp. 12-17.
- PHR Snyman, Die rol van sendelinge, die owerheid en ekonomiese faktore in die ontstaan van Karoo, 1886-1913, Contrace, 22, 1987, pp. 5-14.
- A Mabin, Visiting our urban past: the Kimberley mine and Pilgrim's Rest Museums, Contrace, 36, 1994, pp. 31-41.

North West

- GN van den Bergh, Machaviesat 1839-1889: Pocheferrooom se eerste swart woonbuurt, Contrace, 34 1993, pp. 1-10.
- GN van den Bergh, Die watermeeuws van Pocheferrooom, 1874-1888, SAJC, 7(1), September 1993, pp. 87-99.
It is noticeable that a very limited number of articles have been written on the local history and heritage of some of the provinces. To find out why this is so would require time and space, and would be part of another whole debate on the need for more local history research.

Perhaps an argument could be made that some of the articles suggested above may be very outdated and only serve to discuss a particular group. However, there is not sufficient reason to ignore them, as they are valuable for understanding and explaining local histories and aspects of heritage. History should thrive on multiple perspectives to help readers to come to an informed understanding of events. Avoiding some perspectives in some articles can just lead to another way of becoming one-sided or ignorant.
Creative educators may wish to explore other sources that contextualize heritage and the heritage history of some groups in South Africa in a national or wider context. In this regard a few articles have been identified from the aforementioned journals that may be of value.

**General/National**

- A Netleton, *Arts and Africa: Hierarchies of material culture, SAHJ*, 29(1), 1993, pp. 61-75.
- S Marschall, *“Painting to the dead: Victims, martyrs and public memory in South Africa”, SAHJ*, 60(1), 2008, pp. 103-123.
- A van Vollenhoven & JW van den Bos, *‘Eerste fase onderzoek na die Britse blokhuiskartel van die Anglo-Boereoorlog (1899-1902) in die Transvaal (Zuid-Afrikaansse Republiek), SAJC*, 15(2), November 2000, pp. 94-112.
- H Raath, *Ontspanning van die term hartstocenehuis, SAJC*, 17(2), November 2003, pp. 78-94.
Occasionally history journals that mostly focus on South African history also publish research on other areas in southern Africa because of the interconnectedness of the histories of neighbouring countries. A few research articles have been found in the four history journals, but more could probably be identified in other journals covering Africa and specifically southern Africa.

Southern Africa

- EA Maré, Batalla as ‘n heileige plek (Batalla as a sacred place), SAJC, 3(2), April 1989, pp. 93-108.

A few links are given below regarding some other local and national sources that accommodate history and heritage:

http://www.southafrica.info/about/history/

http://www.southafrica.info/about/history/worldheritagesites.htm
Information from heritage organisations can also be used for assignments on local history and heritage:


Museums, Monuments and Galleries in South Africa:


Lastly, here are some sources on heritage in South Africa retrieved from the Scirus.com search engine:


- *The Yesterday & Today*, from 1981 as “Gister en Vandag/Yesterday and Today,” also hosts a number of heritage related articles.
Dealing with a local heritage example in the classroom (to connect with the SASHT 2010 conference theme: The “how to of yours, mine and ours in a still divided community; environment”):

In the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) plan of the South African Department of Education, released as a draft in late 2010, the Intermediate Phase learner (Grades 4 to 6) is exposed to local history and some familiar examples of local history, but they are represented as contributions on a national level. The Mapungubwe and Zulu Kingdoms (the latter after 1860) serve as examples. Only in the FET phase (Grade 10) are learners introduced to groups in various local regions of South Africa as part of the topics:

- Transformations in southern Africa after 1750 (the example of Shaka later in this discussion was developed from this topic).
- Colonial expansion after 1750.

The topic outlines for Grades 11 and 12, as far as South African history is concerned, build on a selection of the history topics to which learners in the lower grades were broadly introduced. In all topics it is possible to use local and local heritage histories in comparative ways to gain a better understanding of a particular national/international topic. Perhaps workshops on how to understand and teach local history and local heritage history should be invested by the DoE in conjunction with historians and the SASHT in future. To explain in a simple way what I mean when I say that the value of local history and local heritage in all curriculum topics should not be underestimated, I brainstormed some of the Grade 10 topics on a few possibilities of linking the current international topics ONLY with some of South Africa’s local histories so as to progress towards a local understanding of a national and/or internationally related topic (obviously a topic can also be approached by starting from the local and proceeding to the national):
Exploring local histories

Table 1: The publication edited by G Cuthbertson, A Grundlingh and M-L Suttie, titled Writing a wider war. Rethinking gender, race and identity in the South African War, 1899-1902 (David Phillip, Cape Town 2002) should not be ignored in providing additional background to a well recorded period in South Africa’s history.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO.</th>
<th>TOPIC</th>
<th>FET TOPICS</th>
<th>GRADE 10</th>
<th>Examples of some local history and local heritage history connections of FET topics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The world around 1600</td>
<td>1. Compare the kingdom features and motives for growth of the Songhai with those of the Ndawandwe or Zulu Kingdoms. Comparison of specific leadership or events concerning the obtaining and/or holding on to power also accentuates the local history and local heritage histories.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Expansion and conquest in the 15th – 18th centuries</td>
<td>2. The example of the Cape in this curriculum topic is already suggested. It can simply be expanded to other regions or be made very local specific to serve as example.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The French Revolution</td>
<td>3. To be able to understand why oppression and dissatisfaction can lead to uncontrollable communities, the case study does not necessarily have to be on Haiti or Toussaint L’Ouverture (the leader of the Haitian revolution). Many local areas of mid-20th century South Africa are closer and will enable learners to associate more easily with a lack of e.g. liberty, equality and fraternity. Think about examples such as the incidents in Sharpeville and Soweto. In a more focused study, learners may also be exposed to very specific examples of local leadership and ordinary people who contributed towards change.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Transformations in southern Africa after 1750</td>
<td>4. Shaka as a specific local and South African leader, who contributed towards local and national history, a heritage image, and left a legacy, will be dealt with further on.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Colonial expansion after 1750</td>
<td>5. Trace any town’s/region’s local history that evolved as a result from example Boers trekking into the interior of historical footprints of former kingdoms/chieftains’ groups in your hometown area. They can serve as examples to explain some trends as mentioned in the topic.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The South African War and Union</td>
<td>6. The impact of the South African War features all over South Africa and has definite associations with responses and actions from abroad. Any hometown or region does have memories and a history on their region’s contributions and the role of individuals.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**The 2010 Shaka statue debacle**

The Grade 10 curriculum deals with aspects of how the AmaZulu leader Shaka has been remembered. Learners are challenged and invited to discuss the question in Topic 4: Transformations in southern Africa after 1750. This is done by asking questions such as:

- How has Shaka been portrayed – past and present (or representations of Shaka)?
- What sources/evidence are there for our histories of Shaka?
- Why was Shaka portrayed in this way?

These questions have been raised because in the last thirty years or so the statue of Shaka still sparks interest among South Africans, the Zulu people in particular, and many others worldwide who have an interest in the AmaZulu kingdom and its history. By 2010 the perception was that Shaka’s image is still well recognised, as he has for years been idolised in a popular film and through a wide variety of other media.\(^{16}\) His image as a person has also been honoured by naming places and buildings after him. Among others there are the uShaka Marine World – an aquatic theme park that opened in 2004 in Durban – and the King Shaka International Airport at Durban which opened in May 2010. In the new CAPS History curriculum for Grade 10, which deals specifically with this local and regional history, including its interconnectedness with South Africa and southern Africa’s history, educators are challenged to consider past and recent interpretations of the history of Shaka’s leadership of the AmaZulu. Also to be valued is Shaka’s image as it relates to heritage and legacy histories, such as his image in individualistic thinking and/or various artistic expressions, which may or may not complement the most recent historical research, but which still rely on selective or perhaps skewed past memory. One example that could provoke an interesting debate, considering recent historical research, combined with perceptions of Shaka’s image created by observers, past writers and oral tradition, is the dismantling of the sculpture of Shaka just weeks after its unveiling in May 2010 at King Shaka airport in Durban. To my mind this outcome also requires extensive debate by practitioners of history and institutions and groups concerned with preserving the country’s heritage. It was mentioned earlier that heritage mostly appears to be in motion and is not fixed (this implies that it can be a heritage built on informed/uninformed or skewed/transformed images or expressions.

Exploring local histories

of a specific past). I would like to repeat that the “acknowledgement” of heritage in formal history education could and should rather be used as human experiences (we may even add perceptions) that support the making of any history, or as a tool contributing to the understanding of expressions of the broader past that feature tangible and intangible heritage. Acknowledgement of the variety of expressions we categorise as heritage also leads to other debates on human rights, such as the right of expression and to what extent any form of political ideology can interfere or intervene.

For the purposes of our example, the focus will be on the dismantled sculpture which is a tangible heritage expression of King Shaka, respected as a leader of the AmaZulu in present-day KwaZulu-Natal. A few newspaper reports are provided below as sources of expressions of the representativeness of the 2010 Shaka sculpture on Shaka as a leader. Excerpts from recent research by historians are also provided (and should be further explored) to support a more informed and deliberated point of view.

Snippet about the Shaka sculpture:

A very interesting recent portrayal was the unveiling of a sculpture of Shaka on 8 May 2010 at the new King Shaka International Airport in Durban (35 kilometres north of the Durban city centre at the request and with the funding of the Dube Trade Port close to the airport. The sculpture was created by Andries Botha. The bronze sculpture of King Shaka without a spear is accompanied by sculptures of Nguni cattle, which therefore differs from past images of Shaka as an intrepid, merciless warrior. Botha thus dropped the previous lionised image of Shaka as a warrior.
Perhaps also important to note is that Botha’s sculpture was created in honour of Shaka at the King Shaka International Airport. Although the statue was unveiled in May 2010 as part of the FIFA World Cup activities, the statue was dismantled on 13 June 2010 because some members of the Zulu royal house raised concerns about its true reflection of Shaka.

If I were the educator of a group of Grade 10 learners, I would have developed a history assignment as well as a heritage assignment from the section on Shaka in Topic 4 of the curriculum.

History assignment

In the history assignment (based on recent historical research and discussions) the following two criteria would have been included to inform the learners of Shaka’s legacy:

• Theoretical
  
Read the following excerpts (and explore the discussions on Shaka in more recent history sources) to compile your 21st century image of Shaka:

SOURCE A

Of all the books written on Shaka and the Zulu, E. A. Ritter’s “Shaka Zulu” (1955) is almost certainly the most widely read. It remains the only substantial so-called ‘biography’ of Shaka … Historians who doubt Ritter’s veracity, and quibble about his fictionalising, or who no longer wish to cite him as a source at all, unquestioningly incorporate assertions or episodes found nowhere outside “Shaka Zulu”… Ritter’s use of written sources is … extremely limited and selective, even disingenuous, and his evocation of oral traditions so dubious as to be practically useless to the historian… Ritter, while clearly working within a ‘great man’ paradigm of history, paradoxically attempts to decentre Shaka as cause of a sub-continental wave of violence (the ‘mfecane’, a term Ritter himself does not use), while lionising his nation-building personality. The defence is based partly on chronology, partly on Ritter’s overriding concern to present a more sympathetic protagonist: ‘by no conceivable stretch of the imagination can Shaka be blamed for the devastations’ of the early 1800s; these were largely Zwide’s and other ‘desperadoes’” doing, while the empire builder Shaka ’destroyed only in order to rebuild’.

SOURCE B
John Wright’s [understanding] of the Zulu kingdom under Shaka as a defensive, reactive state – as opposed to an aggressive, predatory state [has not been] challenged … the Zulu state was just one of a number of states that were consolidating themselves in response to external pressures. It was not the barbaric war-machine stereotyped in the colonial literature. Nor was it the product of dynamic, heroic nation-building, as Zulu nationalists would have us believe …


SOURCE C
A popularization of the mfecane as concept followed the publication of John Omer-Cooper’s “The Zulu Aftermath” in 1966 … he interpreted the violence and migrations on the subcontinent between the 1810s and 1830s as African state-building – completely independent of European influence – driven by the explosion of Shaka’s Zulu state … Throughout the nineteenth century, the notion of Shaka as the motor of subcontinental violence had been increasingly entrenched in settler writing and culture …


SOURCE D
An important aspect of [historian] Julian Cobbing’s radical critique of the ‘mfecane as the pivotal concept of the history of southern Africa in the nineteenth century is the claim that the image of Shaka-as-monster’ was an alibi invented by Europeans in the 1820s to mask their slaving activities. Reconsideration of this claim reveals that it is based on the misuse of evidence and inadequate periodisation of the earliest representations of Shaka. [An] Examination of the image of Shaka promoted by the Port Natal traders in the 1820s reveals that, with two highly specific exceptions which were not influential at the time, the traders’ presentation of Shaka was that of a benign [kind] patron. It was only in 1829, after the Zulu king’s death that European representations began to include a range of atrocity stories regarding Shaka. These were not invented by whites but drew on images of Shaka already in place amongst the African communities of Southern Africa…

SOURCE E
Shaka for long [was regarded as] the Attila of Africa in popular historical writings … A wider movement [developed] for the rehabilitation of the image of the Zulu monarch … By the early 1980s, the Inkatha leader, Gatsha Buthelezi, was describing Shaka as ‘a walking, living, human miracle, a spiritual colossus who passed on great ideals to the Zulu nation’ and a ‘legend of human endurance, tenacity and singleness of purpose’. He [Buthelezi] called on university history departments to correct the ‘grossly distorted image of King Shaka as a bestial, insane tyrant’, and blamed this picture on the writings of the earliest white visitors to the Zulu kingdom … Shaka emerged as an astute leader … somewhat lacking in human warmth … When Buthelezi, in a speech containing over thirty invocations of history … he is investing autonomy and power in ‘history’ itself, and not in the producers of historical accounts …


• Visual
Compare the image of Shaka (see image A below) and the recent one by Andries Botha (image B) and try to find all the differences and similarities.

Image A:

Source: http://asterling.typepad.com/.a/6a00d8341ed39853ef011570ae8d2970b-800wi
Image B from two angles:

Source: The Natal Mercury, 23 May 2010 (Photograph by Fiona Kirkwood)

Source: http://durbandiva.blat.co.za/files/king-shaka.jpg; http://asterling.typepad.com/.a/6a00d8341e d39853ef011570aeb8d2970b-800wi

**Heritage assignment**

In the heritage assignment (based on the newspaper sources on the 2010 Shaka sculpture which are provided below, and more responses traced by learners on the Internet) the questions that follow could be debated to provide learners with the present-day views of people and to give them the opportunity and freedom to express their own views on events such as the example under discussion (after having considered the recent historical research):

**SOURCE A**

... So His Majesty [King Goodwill Zwelithini] thinks the founder of the [Zulu] nation looks like a sissy boy and not a ferocious warrior ... How can matters in a democracy be settled purely on a whim? ... Now we are lumped
with a 20-ton, R1.5 m problem on the side of the highway, where it will remain, badly hidden beneath shade cloth, until a few comrades are appeased. The thing is … art and history [are] subjective. Their interpretation will always be contested …

Source: G Arde, “We could quickly fill parks with monuments to stupidity”, Sunday Tribune, 6 June 2010.

**SOURCE B**

Andries Botha’s sculpture of King Shaka is a thought-provoking, stirring and inspirational rendition that raises Shaka above the clichéd, colonial stereotype as the ‘noble savage’ and places this leader squarely in the vernacular of the 21st century: a Renaissance man who was a warrior in the pursuit of his dreams, yet a courageous visionary who understood that the dream is about laying down one’s weapons – and was that not also the genius of Nelson Mandela? Removing this sculpture was an outrageous and tragic act of vandalism that desecrated all the cultural values in our constitution and that we upheld with suffering and sacrifice during the time of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission.


**SOURCE C**

[Sculptor Andries Botha] … said it was a pity the issue [his interpretation of the Shaka statue] had become racialised. ‘Mine is not a white Afrikaner interpretation’, it’s a South African interpretation, although I am rooted in a poor white, working-class tradition and I’m proud of that. ‘I am an independent thinker and I have the ability to reason and to shift my beliefs in consultation with others.’ The image of Shaka is a very complex one that comes from a rich cultural tradition … It is a pastoral image many South Africans can identify with. A herd boy can become a leader, we all know that. A simple carpenter can be God. ‘The role of the artist is consultative, but also interpretative and independent. It’s not reflective of a collective or dominant world view … the fact that artists can have autonomy is a reflection of a healthy democracy … With regard to Shaka, I had a conversation with a competent historian from UKZN who is far more qualified than I am to interpret Shaka. I spent hours talking to the poet laureate Mazisi Kunene on his epic Emperor Shaka the Great, so I fully acknowledged my limitations and moved accordingly.’ Botha said Dube Trade Port had endorsed his version of Shaka, pointing to his shield and spear. ‘This affirms his military prowess and the fact that he forged a unified nation. His herd, apart from the significance of cattle in Zulu culture, was meant to symbolise trade and the fact that Shaka was a ‘global visionary.’ Botha said there were no pictures of Shaka to consult, so his work obviously relied on interpretation. But he had purposely steered
away from representing Shaka negatively as a ferocious military dictator. ‘This image is a stereotype that fails to register the complexity of the African culture and spiritual world view’ … ‘I deeply respect the King’s [Goodwill Zwelithini] commitment to the cultural significance of Shaka’s image and his guardianship of that image, but I don’t know what that image is. I will respect his interpretation, but don’t believe it should dominate’…


**SOURCE D**

An expression by a group, or perhaps an individual, at the spot where the Shaka statue was unveiled before it was dismantled. The note next to the flower reads: *In memory of the Shaka sculpture that was removed from this place*

Source: Sunday Tribune 28 June 2010

**Question 1**

Give a one-sentence overview of the author’s/creator’s sentiment raised or expressed in each of the sources.

**Question 2**

List the arguments in sources A to C that you: 2.1) can associate with, and/or: 2.2) dissociate from, giving a proper motivation based on what you have learned so far in History about Shaka (1 page max.).
Question 3

In source B the author also responded by stating that: “Removing this sculpture was an outrageous and tragic act of vandalism …” Why is the author of such an opinion and how will this “act” (which reflects disrespect towards the interpretation of the artist on an aspect of South Africa’s heritage) and thinking be considered by, for example, the following groups of people in future?:

3.1) Historians/writers of history
3.2) Heritage artists
3.3) Politicians
3.4) Members of the community.

Lastly, mention that this heritage assignment can even include a visit to places associated with Shaka’s childhood, his activities as a warrior and places commemorating his legacy. If travel and funding are problems, explore an example of an outstanding or disputed leadership closer to your locality, and deal with the content discussion in a similar way as was done with King Shaka.

Heritage, History and the history curriculum: some concluding suggestions

The key purpose of the discussion in this article was to remind history educators of, and introduce them to, the exciting opportunities and challenges of local histories in the knowledge, use and appreciation of heritage and history in History curricula. Several examples of local history sources, reflecting the nine provinces of South Africa, were listed to explore their content value in History curricula, and also to consider their historical value when assignments on heritage are the focus. From the possibilities offered as examples of assignments (including the questions), the hope is that History educators will sufficiently emphasise the value of extensive historical research to complement and acknowledge South Africa’s heritage legacies and expressions in their tangible and intangible forms.