



GIDEON ELS

Gideon Els studeer aan die Randse Afrikaanse Universiteit (RAU) en die Universiteit van Johannesburg (UJ) en behaal doktorsgrade in Ekonomie en Ouditkunde. Hy is sedert 2005 'n dosent en mede-professor in Rekeningkunde by die UJ. Sy navorsing fokus op Besigheidsgeskiedenis, Finansiële Bestuur, Finansiële Verslagdoening en Navorsingsmetodologie. Hy is die outeur van vele sekondêre en tersiêre handboeke in die velde van Finansiële Rekeningkunde, Koste- en Bestuursrekeningkunde asook Finansiële Bestuur.

Gideon ontvang orrelles by Mnr Adriaan Boot en verdere onderrig by Mej Susan Engelbrecht aan die Nederduitsch Hervormde Kerk van Afrika se Konservatorium vir Kerkmusiek. Hy was onafgebroke vir amper 26 jaar orrelis by NG Farramere / Jubilatê in Benoni en vanaf Januarie 2019 is hy voltyds by NH Benornyn Familierk (in Benoni) as orrelis betrokke.

gideone@uj.ac.za

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0763-7605>

GAWIE CILLIÉ GEDENKLESING / MEMORIAL LECTURE

Liturgical renewal as a catalyst for
worship wars in traditional Afrikaans
Protestant churches

Liturgiese vernuwing as 'n katalisator
vir aanbiddingsoorloë in tradisionele
Afrikaanse Protestantse kerke



Prof. Gideon Els

Aangebied by die 42ste Algemene
Jaarvergadering van die Suider-Afrikaanse
Kerk- en Konsertorrelistevereniging (SAKOV)

Presented at the 42nd Annual General Meeting
of the Southern African Church and Concert
Organists Society (SAKOV)

17 September 2022

ABSTRACT

Afrikaans Protestant churches have a long and deep church music tradition. History has also shown that various individuals have done much over the years to stimulate development in our church music, church music culture, and a reformed singing tradition. Reformers like Luther and Calvin had an enormous impact on the development of our theology of song and music as well as the development of the Psalms and hymns as we know them today. The aim of this paper is firstly to reflect on the liturgical renewal prevalent in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches in South Africa and, secondly, to analyse and recount congregants' experience of liturgical renewal in traditional Afrikaans churches as articulated in popular Afrikaans media publications over the past century using document and discourse analysis. Research has shown that worship wars revolve around the bi-polar idea of 'traditional worship' versus 'contemporary worship'. From the analysis it is noted that congregants are experiencing liturgical renewal in a very negative manner and see it as the diminishing of the traditional church music treasure.

Keywords: liturgical renewal, worship wars, church song, hymns, worship, Afrikaans Protestant churches, discourse analysis

OPSOMMING

Afrikaanse Protestantse kerke het 'n lang en diep kerkmusiektradisie. Die geskiedenis het ook gewys dat verskeie individue deur die jare baie gedoen het om ontwikkeling in ons kerkmusiek, kerkmusiekkultuur en 'n gereformeerde sangtradisie te stimuleer. Hervormers soos Luther en Calvyn het 'n enorme impak gehad op die ontwikkeling van ons teologie van sang en musiek asook die ontwikkeling van die Psalms en Gesange soos ons dit vandag ken. Die doel van hierdie referaat is eerstens om te reflekteer oor die liturgiese vernuwing wat in tradisionele Afrikaanse Protestantse kerke in Suid-Afrika heers en, tweedens, om gemeentelede se ervaring van liturgiese vernuwing in tradisionele Afrikaanse Protestantse kerke, soos verwoord in populêre Afrikaanse mediapublikasies oor die afgelope eeu, te ontleed en weer te gee deur gebruik te maak van dokument- en diskoersanalise. Navorsing het getoon dat aanbiddingsoorloë om die bipolêre idee van 'tradisionele aanbidding' versus 'kontemporêre aanbidding' draai. Uit die ontleding is dit opmerklik dat gemeentelede liturgiese vernuwing op 'n baie negatiewe wyse ervaar en dit as 'n wegkalwing van die tradisionele kerkmusiekskat beskou.

Sleutelwoorde: liturgiese vernuwing, aanbiddingsoorloë, kerklied, gesange, aanbidding, Afrikaanse Protestantse kerke, diskoersanalise

1. INTRODUCTION

For anyone to be asked to present a memorial lecture is a great honour. Being invited by the Southern African Church and Concert Organists Society (SAKOV) to deliver the annual Gawie Cillié memorial lecture at its 42nd Annual General Meeting (AGM) is an even greater honour – thank you!

Looking back at the lecture presented by Prof. Daleen Kruger in 2020 (Kruger, 2020), I was struck by her anecdote that she personally knew Prof. Cillié, having worked with him as part of her commission for the revision of the Psalms in the *Liedboek van die Kerk* (2001). Unfortunately my only ‘acquaintance’ with him stems from what I have read about him.

In a dissertation by Erasmus (2006), one cannot but notice the culture-historical contribution of Cillié in his lifetime. Not only did he contribute to the South African and Afrikaans Reformed church music history, but he also created an awareness to preserve our Protestant hymn heritage (or culture). He promoted Afrikaans church music consciously and added to this oeuvre by way of his numerous compositions (Erasmus, 2006).

Calitz (2011a:183) notes the link between culture and church singing (worship music) when he states that “Every congregation worships [sic] in a certain cultural and cultural-liturgical context.” Cilliers (2011:4) refers to the connection between hymnology and culture by stating that “... the practical-theological component of hymnology transcends a liturgics of hymnody”, and that hymnology “articulates itself as *cultic rite* (Kultus) [and] cannot avoid its negative or positive relationship to *culture* (Kultur) as a whole.”

The cultural milieu in which church music and singing finds itself in today is more complex than ever before, and “the protected walls of the church no longer keep out the secular influences” (Papenfus, 1994:113). Towns (1996:12) refers to church culture as the ‘glue’ that keeps people together in a church environment.

As I have been a part of and actively involved in the Afrikaans Protestant religious establishment¹, its reformed church music tradition or culture sparked my interest. I grew up in a traditional Afrikaans-speaking home and attended the *NG Kerk* (Dutch

¹ When referring to Afrikaans Protestant churches in this article, it includes the *Nederduits Gereformeerde Kerk* (NGK or DRC); the *Nederduitsch Hervormde Kerk van Afrika* (NHK); and/or the *Gereformeerde Kerke in Suid-Afrika* (GKSA).

Reformed Church or DRC) my whole life. Moreover, I have been a church organist for more than 30 years in various Afrikaans Protestant churches and have a great affinity for its musical tradition and culture.

I have also witnessed and experienced changes in and renewal of liturgy, worship, and worship styles over this time. The magnitude of change necessitates the question: *Is this divergence in worship formats and liturgical renewal currently practised and experienced, a catalyst for worship wars in Afrikaans Protestant churches?* What about the culture and tradition within these churches?

For many years, the issue of these 'worship wars' has been at the forefront of both academic and popular international literature (see, for example: Fisackerly, 2012; Justice, 2010; Moore, 2018; Redman, 2004; Ruth, 2017; Schröder, 2021; Towns, 1996; and Watkins, 2004). Although not as pertinent, aspects of 'worship wars' in academia have also been reported on in South Africa (see, for example, Kloppers, 1997; Swanepoel, 2014; and Vermeulen, 2015). What is clear, is that the common denominator in all these battles seems to be in the musical realm.

The aim of this paper is firstly to reflect on the liturgical renewal prevalent in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches in South Africa and, secondly, to analyse and recount congregants' experience of liturgical renewal in these churches as articulated in popular Afrikaans media publications over the century. In the context of this paper it is also important to evaluate the current state of reformed church music culture or tradition, so cherished and propagated by Gawie Cillie, in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches.

In the paper the reader will be introduced to and made aware of the understanding of a reformed singing tradition; what has been happening in terms of liturgical renewal in our Afrikaans Protestant churches with a focus on 'the old' versus 'the new'; a brief explanation of the phenomenon of 'worship wars', and an exploration of what has transpired in terms of 'worship wars' in Afrikaans Protestant churches over the past century.

2. A REFORMED SINGING TRADITION

Calitz (2011a, b) states that congregants sing in church because singing is an essential part of worship. "Singing is not only an existential and cultural phenomenon; it is truly also a Christian phenomenon" (Calitz, 2011a:2). In conclusion to his research, Calitz (2011b:6) notes that liturgical singing "... is more than text and melody. It is

part of the repertoire of symbols and rituals within a congregation, representing and presenting another reality”.

For more than 500 years singing or worshipping formed an integral part of the Reformed church. One must also recognise that Christian worship and liturgy are cherished for their very rich tradition (Campbell & Kruger, 2021) and that church music and hymns have been an integral part of the liturgy in the DRC tradition (Lamprecht, 2013).

Osei-Bonsu (2013:83) notes that worship “... is a principal act in the life of the Christian church, and it is the church’s response to God’s gift of Christ. Therefore, the kind of music used in worship is very important.”

The earliest reference to ‘church singing’ and the Christian song appears in a letter from the pagan governor Pliny² in 112 CE to the emperor Trajan (c. 53-117 CE), in which he reports on the persecution of the first Christians and then remarks that “It was their [the Christians] custom of coming together on a particular day before dawn and singing a song to Christ as God” (Gerdener, 1944:4).

Before one can speak about a ‘reformed church singing tradition’, one has to dwell for a moment on the music in the Roman Catholic Church shortly before the Reformation. The Roman Catholic Church had a highly developed musical practice and was the largest centre for music development in the world. The irony is, however, that the ordinary Roman Catholic member’s share in church music was minimal or totally absent (Fourie, 2000). The first forms of church ‘singing’ seem to have developed from the recitation of poetic texts that were chanted by priests (Papenfus, 1994) and were later defined as plainsong or *cantus planus*.

The church reformation of the 16th century gave a new interpretation of the revelation of God to man (Fourie, 2000). The church reformers saw congregational singing as a powerful tool in building the Protestant church, as congregational singing in the Roman Catholic Church did not exist (Papenfus, 1994). History has, however, shown that different reformers had different views on worship and music (Osei-Bonsu, 2013). Even though Calvin, Luther and Zwingli all noted the close relationship between words and music as a characteristic of the worship service (Kloppers, 2005), their approach to the congregational worship service and music differed (Fourie, 2000).

² Pliny the Younger was the governor of Bithynia and Pontus on the Black Sea coast of Anatolia, having arrived there as the representative of Emperor Trajan (Carrington, 2011:429)

The two reformers, Martin Luther (1483-1546) and John Calvin (1509-1564), played a foremost role in the development of a reformed theology - singing in the mother tongue and music as we know it in Reformed churches today (Lamprecht, 2013).

As the 'father of the reformation', Luther had a great influence on religion, culture, and church music in the 16th century (Lamprecht, 2013). From childhood, Luther had a strong musical background. "As a boy he loved to sing, was a *Kurende* (choirboy), and played the lute. He began writing music as he grew older, and as an adult regarded it as crucial to the education of both children and adults" (Peront, 2021:52).

In his preface to the Wittenberg Hymnal (1524), Luther states: "That it is good and pleasing to God to sing hymns is, I think, known to every Christian ..." (Lamprecht, 2013:26). Luther was convinced that music is a gift from God, made to praise God, and that music and singing come to fruition in the service of God. Luther was personally involved in the development of church music in the 16th century, and he wrote numerous hymns and also rhymed *Psalms* for use in the worship service (Cillié, 1982; Van Rooy, 2008).

Calvin and Zwingli, on the other hand, broke entirely with the Roman Catholic Church's worship traditions (Fourie, 2000). The Swiss theologian Ulrich Zwingli (1484-1531) rejected music in worship and removed all artworks from the church (Van Rooy, 2008). He destroyed organs and other musical instruments in the church as, according to him, they promoted self-indulgence (Vermeulen, 2015). Whereas Luther had a much more liberal view of music and its function in the church, Calvin was more rigid in his approach (Ticker, 2015). As early as 1536, Calvin also considered music essential for a reformed worship service, but he was concerned about what the congregation sang, and that the music should not distract the singer from the message of the song (Lamprecht, 2013). Nonetheless, he also spent years developing songs for church use and was strongly impressed by the power of music to speak to the human heart. Calvin's views regarding church music may be summarised as follows (De Visser, 2009; Fourie, 2000). He believed that:

- music is a gift of God, which needs to be used for the praise of God and for the pleasure of man;
- we should distinguish between the role of music in everyday life and the role of music in the worship service (Calvin used the words *poids et majesté* ((weight and majesty)) to describe the character of worship music.);
- singing in church should be seen as a form of prayer and should be done by the

congregation;

- the content of the songs should be biblical and, as much as possible, taken directly from the Bible (which is why he preferred the *Psalms*);
- moderation should be a guiding principle for singing during the worship service, because if the music becomes too rich and beautiful it might start drawing attention to itself and distract the mind from concentrating on the content of the words.

Luther and Calvin had an enormous impact on the development of a reformed theology of song and music as well as the development of the *Psalms* and hymns as they are known today. However, liturgical renewal (perhaps a *modern-day reformation*) seems to be a constant. Calitz (2011a) notes that some of the contemporary changes and challenges experienced in many of the Afrikaans Protestant churches involve: (i) a change in the repertoire of hymns/songs used; (ii) a change in the mode of accompaniment (i.e. organ vs. other instruments); (iii) a change in the musical genres (traditional hymns, praise and worship songs, and contemporary music are all sung in many congregations); (iv) the use of singing and the frequency thereof within liturgy has changed; and (v) the aim and purpose of liturgical singing has changed.

3. LITURGICAL RENEWAL IN TRADITIONAL AFRIKAANS PROTESTANT CHURCHES

Just as change in everyday life is a constant, so too is change in the church – specifically with regard to its [traditional] liturgy and music. Kloppers (1997:184) noted that constant renewal in liturgical music is needed for it to be relevant. The question is how the renewal could and should take place. For some, renewal is nothing more than reverting to the past (i.e. the way it has been done for so many years); for example, for some it means a new harmonisation; for some the same hymn text but with a new melody, and for some it means doing away with the ‘old’ and only using the ‘new’.

As the postmodern congregant now ‘deconstructs’ everything, liturgical renewal now means that liturgy is more than just the order of a service – it includes total congregational activities during a worship service “with provision for different spiritualities” (Swanepoel, 2014:12).

Papenfus (1994) hinted at renewal of the church song with what she called the use of the ‘informal church song’ together with the ‘traditional church song’. Kloppers (2003) indicates that the process of renewing the church song had already begun to take

place with the publication of the *Liedboek van die Kerk* in 2001, as it accommodated various forms and styles.

The renewal of the church song, and in particular the Afrikaans church song, progressed in leaps and bounds with the establishment of VONKK and FLAM. After its publication, congregants indicated that the *Liedboek van die Kerk* did not contain enough contemporary music (i.e. songs and hymns that speak to the youth, for example). As such, the General Synod of the DRC established a project team in 2002 tasked with creating and promoting new Afrikaans contemporary church music on an ongoing basis. This project team later became known as FLAM (Funky liedere vir 'n aan-die-brand-musiekbediening) (FLAM, 2020).

According to the 2007 General Synod of the DRC, VONKK, or rather 'Voortgesette Ontwikkeling van Nuwe Klassieke Kerkmusiek' (Continued Development of New Classical Church Music), aims to create and collect new and also indigenous [classical] church music constantly (VONKK, 2020).

However, the renewal of the church song is not viewed by everyone in a positive light. Viljoen (2006:760) refers to this renewal by stating that 'liturgical music in South Africa is in a crisis.' Otterman (1992:75) even stated it as blatantly as "Church music in South Africa is in confusion".

In his research, Els (2020, 2021) showed that some disputed the survival of the traditional church song, while others strongly criticised the extremely contemporary style of church music. In many traditional Afrikaans Protestant congregations no songs are sung from either VONKK or FLAM.

Kruger (2007) refers to the growth in the number of church songs that are now available as well as the various musical styles that express these church songs. According to Kruger, the modern churchgoer expects the church song to undergo a [constant] renewal. However, this means that their "personal taste and culture ..." should also be taken into account (Kruger, 2007:651). She then adds that this unequivocally means that members may disagree about what is acceptable or not.

Viljoen (2006:760) articulates liturgical music as a "focal point" within the church but is also of the opinion that the influence of the charismatic musical style of the contemporary church song cannot be ignored. Just as Viljoen (2006) pointed out the function of the church song, Kloppers (2003) and Van Rooy (2008; 2013) and Van Rooy (2013) consider the church song as a mode of communication through words

and melody. Papenfus (1994) views singing, making music and a believer's expression of praise as the basic forms of human communication especially if the expressions of praise are done with fellow believers.

It is precisely this form of 'traditional' or 'contemporary' communication that is sometimes problematic for many congregants. Justice (2010) puts it so eloquently when she notes:

Organs versus guitars, hymns versus praise choruses, a choir versus a band ... [i]n deciding upon which of such 'worship elements' define 'us' versus 'them', religious groups discern a combination of sonic, social, and sacred factors ...

4. A CASE OF 'THE OLD' VERSUS 'THE NEW'

Swanepoel (2014:iii) notes that church music, specifically church music in the DRC, is going through a 'paradigm shift' where traditional liturgical music is in a phase of uncertainty and experimentation with greater disagreement about the types of spirituality and the role of church music. Spirituality refers here to the manner in which congregants experience their faith and serve the Lord. Spirituality takes its clearest shape in the worship service and the congregation's organisation and functioning (Janse, 2002). Vermeulen (2012:2) provides a very apt definition of spirituality as "The modern concept of spirituality refers to piety ... the experience side or experiential side of the religion ..." Spirituality thus speaks to one's faith experience and practice. (Also see Janse (2002) and La Grange & Dreyer (2022) for a discussion on the different spirituality typologies.)

These diverging viewpoints regarding church music in South Africa may be described using different terms. The most common descriptors of this debate may be labelled as 'traditional versus charismatic' or '*outyds* (old-fashioned) versus *vernuwend* (renewed)'. In their research, Calitz (2011a) and Long (2001:2) also note other descriptions such as 'traditional worship' versus 'contemporary worship' or 'trend-seekers and the traditional'.

Justice (2010) clarifies these descriptors and notes that:

... 'contemporary' and 'traditional' worship music manifest many visible and audible differences: musical genre, text, instrumentation, dress, and physical space. These immediate contrasts alone - for example, should a congregation sing from sheet music in hymn books or from lyrics projected onto a screen? - often trigger substantive conflict.

She also describes the opposite two poles as 'frozen chosen' versus 'hands-in-the-air praising'!

Olivier (1997:87 in Calitz, 2011a) describes this tension that:

... on the one hand there are the advocates of the 'more devoted, solemn and/or traditional' church song in which there is no place whatsoever for any form of renewal or change. On the other hand, there are those who campaign for the promotion of 'a more contemporary, lively' and/or 'gospel songs' which should preferably be accompanied by instrument groups [i.e. bands].

Similarly, Routley (1978:164) referred to this tension by writing:

We now have the shocking spectacle of churches feeling obliged to run two services on a Sunday morning, one popular or modern, the other traditional, thus effectively dividing their congregations into two parties which find it convenient not to meet.

Armour and Browning (1995:17 in Calitz, 2011a) observed that while the church has always contended with diversity and tension, "... those forces are now at unprecedented levels". Nearly 40 years ago, Van Wyk (1983:65) already articulated this dichotomy as: "Between innovation and tradition - this is how we can describe the field of tension in which the church song lives."

5. A BRIEF EXPLANATION OF THE PHENOMENON OF 'WORSHIP WARS'

What God intended for His glory and for our corporate and personal growth - worship - has been transformed from a soul-deep commitment to an ugly, carnal fight. If there is anything that brings delight to Satan, it is the disruption of the worship of God (Swindoll, 2010:188).

As common as disagreements are in any family, so too one finds disagreement on worship practices in the church. Ever since the Reformation, protestants have been divided over whether worship should be liturgical or not - a conflict that continues to this day and has recently been given the name of 'worship wars' (Aspray, 2021:1). Based on research we now also know that 'music' and the use of instruments seem to have been the biggest sources of conflict in churches since the dawn of time (Wood, 2014). It is important to note that the aversion to church music came from a unified Christian viewpoint that ideas about music had its origin in a "pagan Graeco-Ro-

man environment" and these ideas were at odds with that of Christianity (Wood, 2014:120).

Adding to the debate on whether instruments should be used in church, the next struggle was even more prevalent – the question of whether church music (i.e. singing) should be enjoyable or not. Writing in the fourth century, Athanasius³ (the bishop of Alexandria, c. 296-373 CE) accepts that music is essential to the church but does not believe that it should bring joy to those who are singing (McKinnon, 1987).

This debate continues and is noted in a portion of Augustine's *Confessions*⁴. Augustine (c. 354-430 CE) also wrote that he was torn between whether he should allow the emotional power of music to overtake him, leaving his mind disengaged or, in retrospect, consider and accept how sinful it had been. Contrary to these beliefs, Saint Ambrose⁵ (c. 339-397 CE), the fourth-century archbishop of Milan, unashamedly proclaimed how pleasant it is to sing psalms (Wood, 2014).

Up to the 14th century, other examples of conflicts in church music history pertained to whether women are to sing in church, and whether one should sing church music in a triple or duple metre (Wood, 2014).

Lamm (2011a) argues that worship wars have been raging at least since around 700 CE and highlights some of these 'controversial issues' disagreed upon:

- When the Gregorian Chant⁶ became the official music of the church, it was characterised by a single, monophonic unaccompanied melody sung only by men. Later, young boys with unchanged voices started singing with the men, but their voices were displaced by an octave and many objected. Later harmony was added to the music [...] and many were against it.

³ Athanasius I of Alexandria was a Greek church father and the twentieth pope of Alexandria (as Athanasius II). He was a Christian theologian and the chief defender of Trinitarianism against Arianism.

⁴ *Confessions* (*Confessiones*) is an autobiographical work by Saint Augustine of Hippo, consisting of 13 books written in Latin between 397 CE and 400 CE. The work outlines Saint Augustine's sinful youth and his conversion to Christianity.

⁵ Ambrose of Milan was a theologian and statesman who served as Bishop of Milan from c. 374 to 397 CE. He fiercely promoted the Latin Church against Arianism and paganism.

⁶ Gregorian chant is the central tradition of Western plainchant, a form of monophonic, unaccompanied sacred song in Latin (and occasionally Greek) of the Roman Catholic Church. Gregorian chant developed mainly in western and central Europe during the ninth and tenth centuries, with later additions and redactions.

- Near 1750, the Wesley brothers⁷ wrote hymns that taught theology and doctrine. It again caused great struggle among church leaders.
- The music of the 1880's *Sunday School Era* (1780-1880) was looked down on by many because the hymns and testimony songs being written were subjective (personal) and not objective (directed toward God). Congregants thought there was no room for such music in the church.
- Jazz influences of the early 20th century brought out an edict from the Pope that the piano was forbidden in the Catholic church, because of its worldly influences.
- Soon after, one finds the *Jesus Movement*⁸ with drums, bass, guitars, and other instruments. Choruses and praise songs were following close behind and all of it was hotly debated in the church.

Justice (2010) points out that 'worship wars', like most other wars, began "... when some people began to feel threatened". She researched these wars from within various academic models of religious expression: ethnomusicologists, anthropologists, and social scientists in the study of religious music. Calitz (2011a) reiterates this and concludes that in the last couple of years, the word 'war' has become synonymous with the word 'worship', indicating how great the differences grew when talking about church music or singing in church (also see Kloppers, 1997; Vermeulen, 2015).

Janse (2002) contends that 'worship wars' occur because of the diversity of church members. This diversity may be found in congregants' diverse spirituality needs; their different worship requirements or needs; and the diversity in worship styles to accommodate these different spiritualities.

Lamm (2011b) quotes Ed Stetzer⁹ who resolved that "... the reason worship wars exist is because the church thinks it is fighting for something permanent when it is actually

⁷ John Wesley, English clergyman (1703-1791), attempted to revive the spiritual life of the Church of England but instead founded Methodism, a worldwide family of independent churches. His brother Charles (1708-1788) was a prolific hymnwriter and his works include '*And Can It Be*', '*Christ the Lord Is Risen Today*', and the Christmas carol '*Hark! The Herald Angels Sing*'.

⁸ The *Jesus Movement* was an evangelical Christian movement which began on the United States' West Coast in the late 1960s and early 1970s and primarily spread throughout North America, Europe, and Central America, before it subsided in the late 1980s. Members of the movement were called 'Jesus people' or 'Jesus freaks'.

⁹ Prof. Ed Stetzer, PhD, is dean at Wheaton College where he also serves as Executive Director of the Wheaton College Billy Graham Center.

temporary. Musical styles and service preferences are like a jacket that can be taken on or off depending upon the temperature [...] it is used only when needed”.

Empereur (2004) notes a very interesting phenomenon in that worship wars are not always caused by friction or disagreement between groups in a church. “There is a more insidious kind of liturgy [worship] war caused by the disappointment that eats away at the faith of the parishioners ...” (Empereur, 2004:19) and that many worship wars stem from a “...lack of understanding and appreciation of other cultures” (Empereur, 2004:22).

Redman (2004:42) disagrees that these differences should be seen as “bipolar worship wars” but rather as a “worship awakening”, which has produced diversity in the way we express ourselves in worship and think about worship. He also acknowledges that diversity “... is a divine fingerprint”.

6. 'WORSHIP WARS' IN TRADITIONAL AFRIKAANS PROTESTANT CHURCHES – AN EXPLORATION

6.1 Introduction

In the introduction to this paper, I pointed to some of the research that has been conducted on the issue of ‘worship wars’ both in South Africa and abroad. The commonality between all of these is that the viewpoints portrayed in the articles are borne from one or more academic, liturgical and/or theological perspectives. Very little of the data presented in these are based on the perceptions of the average congregant or parishioner facing these discrepancies or differences first hand¹⁰.

6.2 Research methodology

To gather an understanding of how and what congregants in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches have experienced over the years when it comes to liturgical renewal, I conducted a document analysis of newspaper articles, opinion pieces and letters published in various Afrikaans daily and weekly newspapers and magazines in South Africa using discourse analysis.

¹⁰ Patricia Woodard (2008) conducted a study where she analysed more than 1 400 newspaper and wire service stories published in the USA and Canada between 1 January 2000 and 30 June 2007. While her findings are preliminary, the article’s purpose was to present a qualitative study of the contexts in which *hymn stories* are reported, and to provide promoters of hymns and hymn singing with information that may assist them in publicising their own efforts.

In the archival search for these artefacts, I only focussed on primary sources in the public domain that were most likely to be easily found by individuals who were inexperienced with traditional academic research methods.

Bowen (2009) describes document analysis as a systematic revision or evaluation of both printed and electronic documents, and as with other qualitative analytical techniques "... document analysis requires that data be examined and interpreted in order to elicit meaning, gain understanding, and develop empirical knowledge ..." (Bowen, 2009:27). Like all qualitative methodologies, the main emphasis in document analysis is on *discovery* and *description*, including the search for underlying meanings and patterns (Altheide, 2000).

This study adheres to the analytic paradigm of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). CDA has its roots in critical linguistics, which is a branch of discourse analysis that goes beyond the description of discourse to an explanation of *how* and *why* particular discourses are produced (Teo, 2000).

Discourse analysis can make the classical approaches to "content analysis" more explicit (Van Dijk, 1983:20). Henry and Tator (2002:72) consider CDA "a tool for deconstructing the ideologies of the mass media [...] for identifying and defining social, economic, and historical relations".

6.3 Sampling

With the assistance of the librarian at the *Beeld* newspaper, an online archival search was conducted on the databases at Netwerk24¹¹, focusing on their various daily and weekly newspapers and magazines with the following relevant keywords: "kerkmusiek" OR "kerksang" OR "liedboek" OR "kerkorrel" OR "orrel" OR "liturgie".

I included articles, opinion pieces and letters that were (i) published in Afrikaans; (ii) drawn from all Afrikaans brands in the Media24 stable (i.e. *Rapport*, *Beeld*, *Die Burger*, *Volksblad* and *Huisgenoot*); and (iii) published as far back as possible for each of these publications (with the earliest artefact dating from 1932).

After I had received 183 artefacts in electronic format, I excluded duplicates and examples that did not really speak to the research aim and was left with 144 arte-

¹¹ www.Netwerk24.com is an Afrikaans-language, South African online news publication created in October 1998 by the multinational media company, Naspers. It is owned by Media24, South Africa's leading media company with interests in digital media and services, newspapers, magazines, etc. It is part of Naspers, a multinational group of media and e-commerce platforms.

facts for document and discourse analysis purposes. The following information was extracted from each: (i) the title of the artefact; (ii) the source (i.e. *Rapport, Beeld, Die Burger, Volksblad* or *Huisgenoot*); (iii) the publication type (e.g. letters to the editor, articles, opinion pieces, SMS, WA-message); (iv) publication date (year and month); and (v) a basic analysis of the content leading to the extraction of prominent themes.

6.4 Data analysis and interpretation

In reporting on the discourse analysis below, sources are indicated in parenthesis. Information succeeding each source pertains to the author and the month and year of publication. Source quotations have been translated for the purposes of accessibility. Results and interpretation are reproduced according to a thematic analysis done for that era. Only a selected number of quotations are reproduced in the discussion.

6.4.1 The 1930s to 1960s (7 sources)

During this period the themes emanating from letters to the editor, articles and/or opinion pieces published can be grouped according to the following themes:

- **Church music is a cultural treasure**

Below one can find examples of comments by readers.

Our [French-Dutch] church music is a cultural treasure [Huisgenoot, LF van Wageningen, 1 September 1944]

We have a rich legacy of good church music (from Germany) but "... we neglect our rich legacy of church music..." [Die Burger, C.G.S., 12 Augustus 1935]

- The extreme positive or negative **feeling** towards *Halleluja*¹² songs and the *Halleluja*-hymnal

The use of various publications of the *Halleluja*-hymnal seem to have been a major

¹² The *Halleluja*-hymnal (*Halleluja-bundel* or *Halleluja-boek*) was a hymnal ancillary to the standard hymnal (*Gesangboek*) used in the Dutch Reformed Church (DRC) until the 1970s. It contained 'sentimental songs' specifically used in the DRC during Pentecost season (Calitz, 2011a:3).

Three editions of the *Halleluja*-hymnal were published and used in South Africa. The *Halleluja* (1903) with its 411 songs, published by Charles Wesley, contained only one Psalm and seven Hymns (*Gesange*). This publication was followed by other publications in 1931 (*Die Nuwe Halleluja*) and 1951. The 1931 publication contained 75 Psalms and 100 hymns (*Gesange*). Many of the songs in the 1931 and 1951 publications were included in the *Nuwe Gesangeboek* (1978) (Calitz, 2011a:179). Erasmus (2006) notes that the various editions of the *Halleluja*-hymnal appeared in 1949, 1951, 1960 and 1972.

issue if one notes the number of comments. It is noticeable that this topic has been an ongoing issue in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches over many years (also see section 6.4.3).

"If the Hallelujah songs are going to make their way into our churches, it's done with our music" [Die Burger, Anon., 9 April 1932]

"... a bunch of Hallelujah songs, so poor that one feels ashamed to even mention them." [Die Burger, C.G.S., 12 Augustus 1935]

"Although Halleluja-songs are simple, it has won thousands of souls ... it's only reborn Christians ... [who can] appreciate them ..." [Die Burger, Pieter van Malmesbury, 15 Augustus 1935]

- The **quality** of **church music**

"[Our church] music is monotonous ... church music is sad ..." [Die Burger, Anon., 30 Julie 1935]

"We only have a few psalms and hymns (gesange) some of which are 'badly harmonised'..." [Die Burger, C.G.S., 12 Augustus 1935]

- The issue of **rhythmic singing** in church

Initially, congregations sang all the notes of the *Psalms* at the same length because of its irregular rhythm. In an article that appeared in *Huisgenoot* on 1 September 1944, the South African author, LF van Wageningen, explained it by stating:

"... short and long notes arose for the sake of emphasising words ... moreover, the majority of parishioners were illiterate..."

Further to this discussion, the following comments about rhythmic singing were also noted:

"... an improved rhythm is a requirement for new songs ... contrast is also necessary and monotony is deadly..." [Die Burger, Anon., 30 Julie 1935]

"Singing rhythmically is soulful, enthralling, elevating and encouraging ... by singing rhythmically we can help to provide more familiarity to our Psalm melodies ..." [Huisgenoot, LF van Wageningen, 1 September 1944]

- The **quality** of **organists** in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches

"Most organists - to give them a name they do not deserve - do not get beyond a few hackneyed Praeludiums [sic] and Postludiums ... organists are paid more than a starvation wage so that people with talent and better training can do the job..." [Die Burger, C.G.S., 12 Augustus 1935]

- The playing of **marches** in church

"The DRC Synod appeals to organists to play less death marches ..." [Die Burger, Anon. 3 April 1963]

Traditional wedding marches are no longer played in the church in an attempt "... to purge the church of entertainment music..." At the DRC General Synod in 1970 it was requested that wedding marches could be replaced by "other more suitable music..." [Die Burger, Japie Malan, orrelis, Grootte kerk, 27 Maart 1974]

6.4.2 The 1970s (10 sources)

An important aspect of the 1970s was that the DRC introduced their new hymnal (*Nuwe Gesangboek*) in 1978. That was of course an invitation for great debate.

- An idea that there will be a **general improvement** in the **standard of congregational singing** after the commissioning of the *Nuwe Gesangboek* (1978)

"The spirit of the hymns [in the new hymnal] has been enlivened..." [Beeld, Attie van der Colf, 30 Januarie 1976]

"An exciting moment in the history of congregational singing when the new hymnal will be put into use next year ... the music is sparkling and the language up-to-date ... [this volume] combines two traditions - the singing of Psalms - a Calvinist institution and the singing of hymns (Gesange) - a Lutheran institution..." [Beeld, Korrespondente, 29 Augustus 1977]

"The new hymnal deserves great praise ... the choice of 'hymn tunes' [in the new hymnal] is of high quality and have been brought in without breaking the Church tradition ... something that happens a lot in English churches now - too many good and old traditions are disappearing especially from a musical point of view ..." [Die Burger, Ivan Killian, Wynberg, 14 November 1978]

- **Complaints** about the new hymnal (*Nuwe Gesangboek*, 1978)

"The new hymnal is a disaster..." [Beeld, Mev A Slabbert, Fochville, 27 Februarie,

1979]

"I express my regret and disappointment about the new hymnal ... to see how the old hymnal has been perverted and destroyed ... a jewel of the church has been taken away ... I feel like a stranger in my own church..." [Beeld, LE Opperman, Pretoria, 13 Februarie 1979]

This debate around the new hymnal (*Nuwe Gesangboek*) continued into the eighties.

- The (poor) general **quality of church music** and **congregational singing**

"Church music in South Africa maintains a low quality because too few people know what they are doing ... quasi-organists should go fishing on Sundays instead..." [Die Burger, Willempie, 14 Februarie 1978]

"Concerns rightly exist about the state of our church music [...] in general..." [Die Burger, Dr WJB Serfontein, Stellenbosch, 6 Maart 1978]

- **Quality of organists** and **organ playing**

"Do our churches have competent organists or is organ playing just an afterthought?" [Die Burger, Quo Vadis, 16 Januarie 1978]

"We must reflect on the poor quality of church organ playing in our congregations" [Die Burger, Sue van Waart, Oudtshoorn, 23 Januarie 1978]

"Trained church organists in South Africa are thinly spread - perhaps 15 in total along with about twenty more 'professional quacks' who think they can also play the organ; many elderly people; students who play the organ for three years as a second instrument at a conservatory and then the number of quasi-organists and aunties in the countryside..." [Die Burger, Willempie, 16 Februarie 1978]

In response to these statements, the following comments then appeared in various newspapers:

"In terms of poor congregational singing - the fault does not always lie with the organist" [Die Burger, Sue van Waart, Oudtshoorn, 23 Januarie 1978]

"Training centres [sic] for organists have tripled in the last 30 years... in the countryside we must be grateful for the number of pianists who served as organists for years and they were certainly not quacks..." [Die Burger, Dr WJB

Serfontein, Stellenbosch, 6 Maart 1978]

6.4.3 The 1980s (44 sources)

- The establishment of **SAKOV**

The year 1980 is firstly important in our discussion as that was the year SAKOV¹³ was established on 10 May. A letter from Prof Albert Troskie, then the Chairperson of SAKOV, about some regional meetings taking place the following year appeared in *Beeld* on 23 November 1981.

At our SAKOV meeting ... organists and interested parties gathered from the three sister churches and "... the Reformers, Gatjieponders and Doppers talked and sang very well together..."

- The '**banning**' of the *Halleluja*-hymnal

According to the artefacts examined, debates and discussions in the DRC in the eighties mostly seem to have evolved around the issue of the 'banning' of the *Halleluja*-hymnal. In 1972 the DRC Synod of Northern Transvaal issued a statement that the church should only make use of one official hymnal and therefore no longer use the *Halleluja*-hymnal in its services. From the comments, one can deduce how beloved this hymnal was in the DRC.

"I am amazed and disgusted like most NG members that the Halleluja-hymnal has been 'banned'... the new hymnal [Nuwe Gesangboek] has been selected according to the taste of the compilers..." [Beeld, JN Wynkerk, Florida, 14 April 1981]

"The learned musicians ... have little knowledge of the spiritual impact of the Halleluja-hymnal. Why did the Halleluja-hymnal have to be taken away? An irreparable loss..." [Beeld, JN Wynkerk, Florida, 17 Augustus 1984]

"The biggest blunder of the DRC was to phase out the Halleluja-hymnal... synods succumbed to the pressure of classical musicians." [Die Burger, NG Lidmaat, Stellenbosch, 16 Junie 1983] and [Die Burger, HAC van den Berg, Parow, 20

¹³ "The Southern African Church and Concert Organists' Society (SAKOV) endeavours to promote music, as well as liturgical and organ-building practices in Southern Africa by developing and supporting church and concert organists in order to offer functional, relevant and inspired services. The Society facilitates subject-focused liaison between organists and other interested parties, and provides expert information and guidance." <https://sakov.co.za/en/wie-is-ons/>

Julie 1983]

"The winds of change with our new hymn book [Nuwe Gesangboek] as well as the banishment of the Halleluja-hymnal have left a scar on the impact and spiritual power of our church songs..." [Beeld, Somber, Potchefstroom, Julie 1983]

"The hallelujahs are part of our religion ... they are loved ... the simplicity made it easy for children to also understand..." [Die Burger, Mev A Coetzee, Sauer, 14 Julie 1983]

"We have been robbed of [our] cultural heritage..." [Beeld, Vincent van der Westhuizen, Pretoria, 23 Augustus 1983]

"The reason for our bad singing [in churches] seems to be the removal of the Halleluja-hymnal in the Protestant church. Now we have to sing psalms and hymns (gesange) that are unsingable ..." [Beeld, Charl M von Wielligh, 14 Desember 1983]

As a response to these statements, various comments to the contrary were also presented.

"How can ministers reintroduce hallelujahs - the bone of contention of more than a century - into the Church? Let's unite behind the new hymnal and stop debating the hallelujah issue..." [Die Burger, Dr Danie Malan, Somerset-Wes, 21 Junie 1983]

"Congregants are not against the [new] hymnal in the church but against taking away the hallelujahs..." [Die Burger, Kosie Burger, Swellendam, 30 Junie 1983]

- Comments about the **new hymnal** (*Nuwe Gesangboek*, 1978)

With change there will always be criticism and backlash - so is the case with the introduction of the new Afrikaans hymnal in 1978. After congregants now have had more than two years to get used to the book, the comments about its use and contents started to appear again.

"My family and I have eagerly been waiting for the new hymnal for 5 years. However, our experience is that instead of happy songs we get a lot of moaning, lifeless funeral songs. The deadness in our churches is due to the singing... it's a tragedy..." [Beeld, JW Jacobs, Pretoria, 8 Julie 1983]

"I am not happy with the new Afrikaans hymnal. Why change the tunes? It's such a shame that the Halleluja-hymnal is no longer used." [Beeld, ERJ, Innisdale, 3 Augustus 1983]

"That Hymn book [Nuwe Gesangboek] is a failure. Why change our Genevan [Geneefse] Psalm melodies?" [Beeld, CR Weideman, Roodepoort, 8 April 1987]

There were also voices that praised the new hymnal.

"Church songs cannot be unsingable - the reformation made the silent congregants sing again ... our new songbook is a gain with more (singable) songs than there were previously." [Die Burger, Dr Danie Malan, Somerset-Wes, 21 Junie 1983]

"...history has taught that the sublime and eternal message of the Scriptures cannot be accompanied by inferior and transient tunes. The new Afrikaans hymnal is not perfect - we will always have to work on it again..." [Beeld, Ons Politieke Redaksie, 14 Julie 1983]

"How can people write letters about the new hymnal if they have not yet made it their own? Do we really want to return to 'inferior hallelujahs' whose origins are dubious (some originally pub and drinking songs) is unthinkable." [Beeld, Mev M Nortje, Johannesburg, 5 Augustus 1983]

Readers were very taken aback by the comment in the previous letter and responded as follows:

"To think that someone could insult the Halleluja-hymnal like that by saying that the songs were originally pub and drinking songs..." [Beeld, E Senekal, Rietfontein, 6 September 1983]

- The **(planned) revision of the Afrikaans hymnal** and the **re-rhyming (herberyning) of the Psalms**

Following the introduction of the new Afrikaans hymnal in 1978 (*Nuwe Gesangboek*), plans were soon afoot to have the Afrikaans Psalms revised.

The General Synod of the DRC made a decision that a new psalm rhyme and not

just a revision of the Totius¹⁴ text, must be made. This also included the creation of new Psalms (Basson, 2014). As pointed out by Dr Willie Serfontein, Chairman of the Review Commission, this would be a long process that could take up to 10 years to complete. The review involves bringing together the major sciences - language, music and theology, which must form a unit (Wiese, 1983).

This sparked intense debate amongst readers.

"We cannot 'remove' our old treasure of songs [the old Totius Psalms?] by placing them in a new context for 'Christians...'" [Beeld, Henk Bolhuis, Leesfontein, 26 Februarie 1983]

"The decision to re-rhyme the Psalms is irrelevant and unnecessary ... There is nothing wrong with the original Totius rhymes ... Who will consider him [sic] suitable to improve Totius's [sic] wonderful settings?" [Die Burger, NG Lidmaat, Stellenbosch, 16 Junie 1983]

"Afrikaans-speaking churches have come under the influence of 'change' ... just five years after a new hymnal, new rhymes for psalms must now be sought again..." [Beeld, Somber, Potchefstroom, 1 Julie 1983]

There were also voices that agreed with this decision.

"It will be a happy day in the church if the Psalms undergo a new rhyme. We must place the melodies of songs in the singing idiom of the contemporary church public, otherwise the opportunity to become a true singing church will be lost..." [Beeld, JA Swanepoel, Florida, 21 Julie 1983]

"If Totius were still alive today, he would not have left the words [of the current Psalms] just like that." [Beeld, Mev M Nortje, Johannesburg, 5 Augustus 1983]

- The creation of a new collection of songs aimed at the youth (**Jeugsangbundel I**)

For many years different songs and songbooks were used alongside the *Nuwe Gesangboek* (1978) (the Afrikaans hymnal) but without the official approval and sanction of the DRC. Examples of these are the *Halleluja-hymnal(s)*, *Jeugsangbundel*

¹⁴ Jacob Daniël du Toit (1877-1953), better known by his pen name Totius, was an Afrikaans poet. Du Toit was responsible for much of the translation of the Bible into Afrikaans, finishing what his father Stephanus Jacobus du Toit had begun. He also put a significant amount of work into producing poetic versions of the *Psalms* in Afrikaans.

I and *Jeugsangbundel II*, as well as a multitude of informal hymnals and free songs. In many congregations the use of these songs and collections of songs was limited to informal meetings, youth meetings, special occasions, and evening services; in others they were sung within the worship service. Often these songs were labelled as charismatic, of poor musical standard and not fit for use in gatherings.

The *Jeugsangbundel I* appeared in 1984 as a collection of songs that were, according to the foreword, not fit for purpose as part of official worship (Calitz, 2011a:3-4, 180). Immediately one notices the comments about this:

"We are surprised to hear about a new collection planned for young people (of course with guitar accompaniment..." [Die Burger, NG Lidmaat, Stellenbosch, 16 Junie 1983]

A possible reason for making this comment and especially mentioning guitars, is that for many years the guitar was emblematic of 'the contemporary' style of worship (Perez, 2019).

Prof Henk Temmingh noted that adapted church music is 'nonsense'. The Jeugsangbundel I is a 'trivial attempt' to modernise church music ... [Beeld, Ina van der Linde, 1 April 1987]

There were, however, also people that supported the creation of a separate 'hymnal' for the youth.

"Rev Jan de Wet said that church music must be more relevant and contemporary. People cannot be reached by means of 'medieval music' which does not keep pace with renewal and flourishing in the church..." [Beeld, Ina van der Linde, 1 April 1987]

"I do not agree with the views of Prof Temmingh. There must be room for young people to praise the Lord in their own contemporary way." [Beeld, Ds WPJ van Wyk, Potchefstroom, 15 April 1987]

- **Quality of church music and singing** in the DRC

"Why can members in the AFM Church sing so well but I can't in my own church? Why must gloomy and unsingable songs be shoved down my throat?" [Beeld, GRJ van Niekerk, Roodepoort, 9 Januarie 1988]

"Uninspired, mournful singing in the church due to old, unsingable songs is one

reason why churches are empty and spring up like mushrooms [...] it dampens the joy of praising God from the heart..." [Beeld, JA Swanepoel, Florida, 21 Julie 1983]

"I want to praise the Lord in [sic] a tune that speaks to my heart. Even though the new hymnal is filled with wonderful songs [...] there are also quite difficult songs [...] that do not speak to the heart of the ordinary churchgoer. I am not advocating inferior melodies. I plead for melodies that promote the praise of God." [Beeld, Prof AB du Toit, 22 November 1983]

Once again concerns about church organists and the use of the organ were also highlighted.

"... ministers do too little to inspire congregations to learn new songs. Many organists also make no meaningful contribution ..." [Beeld, Daleen de Wet, 2 November 1983]

"Church singing and music is still in crisis [and] the lack of spontaneous church singing may be traced to the weak or no support of the organ and guidance of the organist..." [Beeld, Francois Uys, 20 Februarie 1985]

Prof. Gawie Cillié also made his voice heard when he stated the following at the 34th General Conference of the FAK in Pretoria on 14 July 1983:

"Music with a 'beat' in the church or even a 'foxtrot' rhythm as found in some churches would be a disaster that could destroy the progress of Afrikaans church music over the last forty years..."

- **Gospel groups and the 'birth' of church bands**

Theologians have warned members of the various traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches 'to be careful' when they attend a Gospel Festival on Loftus Versfeld ... [Beeld, Redakteur, 2 Maart 1984]

"What do gospel groups do right that the church can't get right? When young people get together for a gospel concert it is criticised by the older guard." [Beeld, Andre Manuel, 5 Mei 1984]

Some of the general comments also made in the publications during this time are that, even though gospel groups (such as church bands) play an important social role in the community, their clothing is sometimes offensive.

“Are jeans and sneakers good enough for a performance in a church? Some bands look sloppy.” [Beeld, Andre Manuel, 5 Mei 1984]

6.4.4 The 1990s (35 sources)

In the early nineties one notes the fiery debate that raged about hymns and church music in the popular press. What is different to debates from previous years is that theologians and church music academics seem to differ greatly in their viewpoints as to what constitutes good church music. The common theme in all discourse in this era can be summarised by a newspaper heading in *Beeld* on 18 September 1993:

Chaos over church singing continues / Chaos oor kerksang duur voort

What is also noteworthy is that Prof. Cillié then penned an opinion piece that was published in *Die Burger* on 24 December 1991, in which he stated that people's different viewpoints concerning church music are as old as history itself:

It was probably Solomon who said in his wisdom that there is nothing new under the sun. I have often thought of this saying in recent months during the polemic in the letter columns of *Die Burger* about the state of and the trends in our church music today. That people disagree among themselves about the musical arrangement of church songs is almost as old as the Christian church itself [...] our differences about which music is suitable for the worship service and which is not, is, like the poor, something that we will always have with us.

- Congregants support **'new'** (and **'easy'**) church music

Dr Braam Hanekom, pastor of the DRC Student parish in Stellenbosch says that research shows that a significant number of congregants show a need for new songs and hymns. [Die Burger, Kerksake-verslaggewer, 10 Mei 1991]

Are only stately, gloomy hymns and psalms, and often in the minor key, composed in the Middle Ages, suitable as 'church music'? It is easier to praise God with simple songs. [Die Burger, Gloria, Bellville, 16 April 1991]

- The **'unsingability'** of certain hymns

As with criticism from previous years, the issue of the so-called 'unsingability' of hymns (and specifically the *Psalms*) came to the fore again.

“Unsingable tunes are not conducive to praise in church.” [Die Burger, Antoinette

Visagie, Stellenberg, 29 Oktober 1991]

"The 'unsingability' of certain hymns (Psalms) is perhaps a search for sensation, which is why church services have suddenly become 'dull and dead' and members flock to where the 'action' is." [Beeld, ACC Loubser, Elspark, 18 Desember 1991]

A detailed opinion piece decrying and commenting on the issue of 'unsingable church music' by South African composer and musician, Dr Roelof Temmingh, was then published in *Die Burger* on 16 November 1991. This seems to have elicited a raging debate over the next few weeks in the newspapers.

"The argument that the church music problem is about the alleged 'unsingability' of so many psalms and hymns will not survive any scientific test. It is irrefutable that about 75 percent of the psalms and more than 50 percent of the hymns have never been tested as 'singable' or 'unsingable' by the youth of the DRC. When inferior music is used in the church to glorify God, it does not increase this music's value. The end does not justify the means." [Die Burger, Roelof Temmingh, Stellenbosch, 16 November 1991]

- The **standard** and **value** of **church music**

"Should we as members [congregants] strive for a high standard in church music? I find it presumptuous to judge people by accusing them of 'music snobbery' if they do. Thank you for those dedicated organists who strive for the promotion of our church song." [Die Burger, Johan Martinson, Worcester, 14 Januarie 1992]

"It was a great joy for me to learn that I am not alone in my dismay at the decline of the quality of our church music. We should promote the feeling of the age-old accepted church music among the youth in order to bring home and maintain the sacredness and stateliness of the worship service." [Die Burger, HR van Huyssteen, Somerset-Wes, 5 April 1991]

In response to the article by Dr Roelof Temmingh on 16 November 1991, the following letter (one of many) was published:

"I humbly disagree with Dr Roelof Temmingh of Stellenbosch. The learned friend apparently believes that church music is on the wane. It behoves no creature on earth to express an opinion about music that is not dedicated to him or his fellow man ..." [Die Burger, M Burger, Hermanus, 7 Desember 1991]

- The **sacredness of worship**

Worship of God is not meant for man's entertainment or personal goals. In many cases it is one big 'entertainment concert' Sunday after Sunday [in many churches]. This is unacceptable and worrying for many of our small group of believers who are actually the minority these days." [Die Burger, D.S., Durbanville, 6 Februarie 1992]

"The atmosphere and sacredness created by the most beautiful church music cannot be replaced by any songs and music. We must guard against trying to compete with the 'charismatic' churches in this area by creating a kind of 'disco' atmosphere in our DRC just to also sound 'contemporary'" [Die Burger, Danie Gildenhuys, Kaapstad, 29 Oktober 1991]

"Worship should not be a joyous concert." [Die Burger, Desmond Stumpf, Durbanville, 10 Januarie 1995]

- The **differences in viewpoints** regarding church music have **grown in intensity** and **veracity**

"The debate about church music seems to have created an unbridgeable gulf between church musicians and ordinary members. It is so immense that it seems impossible for any ordinary member to venture a verdict on music in the church. We need to make room for each other's viewpoints." [Die Burger, Flippie du Toit, Stellenbosch, 23 November 1991]

6.4.5 The 2000s (25 sources)

The year 2001 was very important in terms of liturgical renewal with the publication of the new Afrikaans hymnal, *Liedboek van die Kerk* (2001). Whereas the publication of the previous hymnal, *Nuwe Gesangboek* (1978) was met with great negativity, discourse during this period shows that congregants accepted it in a much more positive way.

- **Commendations** for the new Afrikaans hymnal (*Liedboek van die Kerk*, 2001)

"The Liedboek van die Kerk [the new Afrikaans hymnal] is a special publication [...] The reformation of the church and its songs, focusing on the gaps, must continue ..." [Beeld, André van Niekerk, 27 Oktober 2001]

"As an Afrikaans cultural treasure with so many new texts, so many new

indigenous melodies and the adoption of so many gems from countries around the world, the 'Liedboek' [new Afrikaans hymnal] is a beacon that will stand for years to come. [Beeld, Redakteur, 29 Oktober 2001]

"How wonderful that we [can sing] in our own contemporary Afrikaans from our new 'Liedboek' [new Afrikaans hymnal]." [Volksblad, Awie Cilliers, Bethlehem, 8 November 2001]

Another measure of how positively this new hymnal was accepted by the church is to note that by the time that the new hymnal was officially inaugurated on 29 October 2001, more than 460 000 copies of it had been sold (Van Niekerk, 2001:12).

- **Complaints** about the new Afrikaans hymnal (*Liedboek van die Kerk, 2001*)

The few complaints that were published in the media mostly criticised the fact that the church now again has a new hymnal, and its cost was pointed out as a concern. Some congregants also had an issue with the way in which Prof TT Cloete re-rhymed (*herberym*) the Psalms taken up in the *Liedboek van die Kerk*.

"At the time, the General Synodal Commission approved the Hymnal in its entirety without checking the hymns one by one. One wonders what they are doing there. TT Cloete's Psalm-rhymes come from the 1983 Bible translation and are not based on the original texts like Totius' [which is not correct]." [Die Burger, C Bothma, Goodwood, 25 Oktober 2001]

- Liturgical **renewal** and *change* are **difficult**

It was also noticeable that two examples focussing on the difficulty with *change* and *liturgical renewal* also appeared in the newspapers.

"It is so that change and innovation do not appeal to everyone. It is also everyone's good right to express their opinion, but then the criticism must at least be based on facts. The Liedboek [the new Afrikaans hymnal] is beautiful, contemporary Afrikaans, understandable and sings beautifully. That way we can praise the Lord with a new song." [Die Burger, Cobus de Klerk, Strand, 29 Oktober 2001]

"Transformation, renewal or reform - call it what you will - catapults you out of your comfort zone. Re-creation, the broadening of one's thinking and radical change are inconvenient. Being forced to sing other songs [new hymns] puts you in a zone where you have to stand either alone, and it may be difficult ..."

[Volksblad, Maretha Maartens, 1 November 2001]

Whereas the discourse concerning liturgy and church music in the previous century was very much pragmatic, a more spiritual approach came about at the start of the new millennium.

- The neglected '**young soul**' of the Church

"The needs of the Youth of today's church are different to those in the past; they are tired of pretension; the youth are looking for spirituality but do not find it in the traditionally institutional churches [...] Music plays a big role in the life of our Youth ... and it's not Psalms and Hymns (Gesange) [...] Young people demand respect and appreciation for diversity..." [Rapport, Carin Fourie, 29 Oktober 2006]

- A (re)-awakening of **spirituality** experienced in **worship**

"Does the simplicity and austerity of our current liturgy take away the mystical and emotional aspects of spirituality?" [Beeld, Gerhard van der Linde, 5 September 2009]

- The **incompatibility** of the **charismatic** versus **classical** way of worship

"Is the charismatic church service now winning the 'battle' against Afrikaans mainstream churches? This battle between the churches is already 50 years old in the USA and it is now a battle that also rages in South Africa ... Unfortunately, the contemporary worship movement rejects innovative traditional churches completely ... their view is that the principle of reformation is 'old' and European and must be replaced by a reformation from American culture..." [Rapport, Prof Hennie Pieterse, Pretoria, 3 Desember 2006]

"We as older members need to be more tolerant. If God is, He is in the silence and in the noise. Young people have little or no background in the age-old traditions of church music. Their living world is the noisy world of the marketplace." [Beeld, Wilhelm Jordaan, 27 Januarie 2010]

- **Blended worship** versus (complete) **integrated worship** (the old and the new)

"In our church we do not have a form of blended worship ... rather complete integration - the organ is used together with other instruments. It is not a piece of traditional and a piece of contemporary." [Rapport, Prof Hennie Pieterse,

Pretoria, 3 Desember 2006]

"The traditional view of modern liturgy is the principle of 'either old or new'. Shouldn't we instead look at an 'old and new' approach?" [Beeld, Wilhelm Jordaan, 27 Januarie 2010]

"[Hymn] quality is important, but an authenticity and a feeling about what one sings gives the final decision." [Beeld, Dr Elsje Buchner, 14 Julie 2008]

- The **'feel good'** emotion that **praise and worship** elicits

"Isn't praise and worship an example of spiritual eroticism? Praise and worship should not be about the 'feel good' emotion but approach the experience of God with the necessary respect and humility." [Beeld, Wilhelm Jordaan, 27 Januarie 2010]

"Praise and worship music has undergone a transformation over the years where it can now be sung in church or at Skouspel¹⁵!" [Beeld, Johan van den Heever, 16 Januarie 2010]

6.4.6 The 2010s to the present (23 sources)

- What is the inherent **purpose of singing** and music in the Church?

"Praise & Worship is fun ..." - the question is whether church singing is about man - his pleasure and satisfaction - or is it about glorifying God? Aren't we, with the movement of liturgical renewal, engaged in the humanisation of the church?" [Rapport, Prof HG van der Westhuizen, 17 Februarie 2011]

- **Praise and worship** services now seem to be done by all

"A big band. Comfortable language from the minister. Previously we had a fixed liturgy - the same every Sunday. Church has to be cool otherwise we lose our target group." [Rapport, Terésa Coetzee, 5 Februarie 2012]

"There is a tension between the tradition of consecration/sacredness (gewydheid) and renewal..." [Volksblad, Wilhelm Jordaan, 25 Julie 2018]

¹⁵ 'Skouspel' or 'Huisgenoot Skouspel' was a popular music concert series presented annually by the weekly Afrikaans magazine *Huisgenoot* where some of South Africa's leading African artists were invited to perform.

- A longing for the more **traditional** ...

"Sacred music awakens joy, homesickness and melancholy in you ... [but] these days I go to church with a heavy heart. Nonsensical 'songs' accompanied by guitars and drums take the sacred atmosphere out of the church. Everything is fast, cheerful and superficial. Our youth is poorer [sic] in good church music." [Die Burger, Betta, Kaapstad, 12 November 2019]

- Poor **church attendance**

"The reason for poor church attendance is the use of the organ ... old music and boring liturgies. Will the pipe organ - once an institution in churches - also die out like the Dodo as musical tastes and worship styles modernise? Recently a congregation got rid of their organ - a 'renewal action' - that will put an end to the 'apartheid thing' where different worship styles are offered separately from one another at one congregation." [Die Burger, LeRoux Schoeman, 14 Junie 2014]

"Young people leave the church and doors must be closed [permanently]..." [Beeld, Alet Louw, 26 Julie 2018]

- Research shows that **young people** want to **return to the traditional**

"Within the USA there is a movement among young people who grew up in contemporary churches and now wish to return to the more traditional form of worship." [Die Burger, LeRoux Schoeman, 14 Junie 2014]

Research conducted amongst more than 1 500 students at the DRC Universiteitsoord in Pretoria has shown that there seems to be a proclivity that the most popular church music among people attending the evening services was organ accompaniment supplemented by classical instruments such as violins, cellos and flutes (Jackson, 2004:2).

- **Trauma** if the **church becomes worldly**

"People experience trauma when the church secularises; when the church puts aside its familiar liturgies, symbols and songs and exchanges them for everyday music and talk." [Christina Landman, Volksblad, 24 Julie 2018]

"Worldwide research has proven that churches that recklessly modernise, traumatise more members than they win. Many members still sit in the church every Sunday ... but they are getting quieter and quieter..." [Christina Landman,

Volksblad, 24 Julie 2018

In section 6.4.3 deep-seated anger was present amongst congregants when the *Halleluja*-hymnal was 'banned' from use in the church. One could interpret that many of these congregants experienced the 'trauma' mentioned above.

- The **sacredness** of a worship service

"We as an older generation grew up with church music with a deep-rooted tradition. This music created a sacred atmosphere in the church. We must ensure that church music does not become 'fast food'." [Beeld, Koos van die Waterberge, 22 Julie 2021]

"Bands, gospel-rock and 'praise & worship' do not contribute to a sacred atmosphere. Just remember - being a church is not about 'you'." [Beeld, Jakkals, Potchefstroom, 23 Julie 2022]

7. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

Liturgy and music in the traditional Afrikaans Protestant church have a deep and very long tradition. Reformers like Luther and Calvin had an enormous impact on the development of our theology of song and music as well as the development of the Psalms and hymns as we know them today. Locally, individuals like FW Jannasch, PK de Villiers, AC van Velden and GG Cillié did much to stimulate development of Afrikaans church music, church music culture, and a reformed singing tradition. Even though church culture is often referred to as the 'glue' that keeps people together in a church environment, the perception amongst congregants in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches is that liturgical renewal has eroded much of this culture.

Where 'worship wars' used to be something experienced in the USA, for example, research has shown that it is permeating into traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches as well. It is also apparent that the biggest bone of contention in 'worship wars' seems to be the music heard, played, and sung in church. These diverging viewpoints always seem to be a case of 'traditional worship' versus 'contemporary worship'.

Liturgical renewal is a constant with many challenges and changes experienced by traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches over the years. To gain an understanding of congregants' experience of liturgical renewal in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches, a discourse analysis was conducted based on an analysis of newspaper articles, opinion pieces and letters published in various Afrikaans daily and weekly

newspapers and magazines in South Africa the past century.

From a holistic analysis of the accounts and experience of liturgical renewal by congregants in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches, as articulated in popular Afrikaans media publications over the past century, the following may be observed:

- **Church music is a cultural treasure in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches**

The average congregant recognises that traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches have a rich legacy and tradition of church music, which is sadly being neglected. There is also a presumption that overall quality of church music, organists and congregational singing in traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches is declining. Poor church attendance has also been blamed on the 'old' way of doing things and their propensity to preserve this cultural treasure.

- **Liturgical renewal - the publication of new hymnals**

The introduction of a new Afrikaans hymnal in 1978 (*Nuwe Gesangboek*) led to many complaints by congregants as it was their perception that nothing really improved for the better compared to the previous edition. It is interesting that the introduction of another new hymnal in 2001 (*Liedboek van die Kerk*) did not elicit a similar number of comments from congregants based on publications in popular media. Introducing specific hymnals focussing on the youth (for example, *Jeugsangbundel I* in 1984) again elicited some pessimistic views.

A huge point of criticism against liturgical renewal was noticed in the seventies and eighties with the removal of the *Halleluja*-hymnal from use in general worship services. The modernisation of church songs with the introduction of VONKK and FLAM in worship services did not have the expected positive outcome/reaction as expected. Some of the songs in FLAM, in particular, are seen by many of the more traditional congregations as a step in the direction of liturgical renewal of worship. Previous research has shown that there are many Afrikaans Protestant congregations that do not make use of these sources at all.

- **Liturgical renewal - contemporary worship services**

The new millennium saw the proliferation of church bands used in many more traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches. This, linked to the view that these churches have to cater to the needs of its youth, made the incompatibility of the charismatic versus classical way of worship even greater. Numerous traditional congregants often

viewed the modern style of worship as a superficialisation of faith (*geloofsvervlakking*) in/from the church.

- **Liturgical renewal – blended worship versus integrated worship**

A major concern for many traditional Afrikaans Protestant congregations is whether their worship model should be 'blended' or a '(fully) integrated'. Although the blended worship style (i.e. separate traditional and contemporary services) seems to be prevalent, many congregations are seeking to find a so-called 'middle ground' by introducing a more integrated approach to worship. An integrated worship service means the integration of contemporary songs and music together with its traditional church music treasure thereby preserving its rich theological and liturgical heritage. In many churches this also extends to the incorporation and use of crosses, candles and liturgical colours of the church year. In some traditional Afrikaans Protestant churches, however, the urgency of liturgical renewal extends so far that they are disposing of their church organs as a practical way of showing their intent for a true 'Praise and Worship' experience.

- **Liturgical renewal – lack of sacredness (*gewyldheid*)**

Numerous traditional congregants challenged the church by questioning the inherent purpose of singing and music in the church, and also raised their concerns about the lack of sacredness in modern-day worship. The traditional liturgy, typical for many years in Afrikaans Protestant churches, has also increasingly been replaced by 'praise and worship' services.

- **Liturgical renewal is difficult**

Change and transformation do not appeal to everyone. It is, however, a fact that liturgical renewal or reform is a given. The question here would be how the church assists its congregants in managing these changes. Research has shown that excessive liturgical renewal may create 'trauma' amongst congregants.

- **A (re)-discovery of spirituality**

At the turn of the century, comments by congregants have also shown that the concept of 'spirituality' is specifically coming to the fore in worship services. This of course is juxtaposed against the 'feel good' emotion that 'praise and worship' services elicit or should elicit.

- **A longing for the more traditional ...**

With all these changes afoot, there also seems to be a case that liturgical renewal has its limitations. Many younger congregants, having experienced the 'new', seem to feel that it may not be the 'better' solution and are returning to a more traditional form of worship.

Acknowledgements:

The author acknowledges the wonderful assistance from Leonie Klootwyk, Librarian at the Beeld newspaper as well as Dr Nico Strydom and Profs. Daleen Kruger, Wim Dreyer, Colin Campbell and Mario Nell for their valuable input and advice.



REFERENCE LIST

- Altheide, D.L. 2000. Tracking discourse and qualitative document analysis. *Poetics*, 27:287-299.
- Aspray, B. 2021. How can phenomenology address classic objections to liturgy? *Religions*, 12(4):236. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel12040236>
- Basson, W.D. 2016. *Die invloed van Sinodebesluite op die Psalm as kerklied in die Gereformeerde Kerke in Suid-Afrika*. Ongepubliseerde PhD-proefskrif, Noordwes-Universiteit.
- Bowen, G.A. 2009. Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2):27-40. <https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027>
- Calitz, C.J. 2011a. *The free song (hymn) as a means of expression of the spirituality of the local congregation with specific focus on the situation of the Dutch Reformed Church in South-Africa*. Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Pretoria.
- Calitz, C. 2011b. Liturgical singing as ritual symbol. *Verbum et Ecclesia* 32(1), Art. #430, 7 pages. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v32i1.430>
- Campbell, C. and Kruger, D. 2021. Gawie Cillié Memorial Lecture: Being Broken: A call to lead worship in God's mission. *Vir die Musiekleier*, 41(48):10-28.
- Carrington, P. 2011. *The Early Christian Church - Volume 1*. Cambridge University Press.
- Cillié, G.G. 1982. *Waar kom ons Afrikaanse Gesange vandaan?* NG Kerk Uitgewers.
- Cilliers, J. 2011. Faith in search of sound: The interaction between religion, culture and hymnology. *Vir die Musiekleier*, 31(2011):3-18.
- De Visser, A. 2009. *Church Music in Calvin's Tradition*. Available: <https://www.christianstudylibrary.org/article/church-music-calvin%E2%80%99s-tradition> [Accessed 15 August 2022]
- Els, G. 2020. Die gebruik van die Delphi-tegniek in die bepaling van ons mees geliefde Kerklied: 'n Metodiese oorsig. *Vir die Musiekleier*, 40(47):50-76. Available: https://repository.nwu.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10394/36646/Die_gebruik_van_die_Delphi-Tegniek_in_die_bepaling_van%20ons_mees_geliefde_kerklied.pdf?sequence=1

[Accessed 15 August 2022]

Els, G. 2021. Die bepaling van ons mees geliefde Afrikaanse kerklied - 'n metodiese ondersoek. *Tydskrif vir Geesteswetenskappe*, 61(4):1350-1378. <https://doi.org/10.17159/2224-7912/2021/v61n4-2a8>

Empereur, J. 2004. Worship Wars in the Roman Catholic Church, *Liturgy*, 19(4):15-24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/04580630490490486>

Erasmus, J. 2006. *Die lewe en werk van Gabriel Gideon Cillie (1910-2000) in kultuurhistoriese perspektief*. Ongepubliseerde MMus-verhandeling. Universiteit van die Vrystaat.

Fisackerly, W.A. 2012. *Worship Wars: Minimizing Conflict and Maximizing Unity Through a Worship Transition*. Unpublished PhD dissertation, Asbury Theological Seminary.

FLAM. 2022. Available: <http://flam.co.za>

Fourie, F.P. 2000. *'n Geskiedenis van die Kerklied in die Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk*. Ongepubliseerde doktorsale proefskrif. Universiteit van Suid-Afrika.

Gerdener, G.B.A. 1944. Ons Psalm- en Gesangboek: sy groot godsdienstige en kulturele betekenis. *Huisgenoot*, 27 Oktober 1944:4.

Henry, F. and Tator, C. 2002. *Discourse of domination: Racial bias in the Canadian English-language press*. University of Toronto Press.

Jackson, N. 2004. Klassieke kerkmusiek gekies. *Beeld*, 1 September 2004:2.

Janse, R. 2002. *Spiritualiteitsdiversiteit as uitdaging Aan die erediens: 'n verkenning van die funksie van lofprysing in die Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk*. Ongepubliseerde PhD-proefskrif, Universiteit Stellenbosch.

Justice, D. 2010. Public, Private; Contemporary, Traditional: Intersecting Dichotomies and Contested Agency in Mainline Protestant Worship Music. *Folklore Forum*, April 2020. Available: <https://folkloreforum.net/2010/04/19/public-private-contemporary-traditional-intersecting-dichotomies-and-contested-agency-in-mainline-protestant-worship-music/> [Accessed 15 August 2022]

Kloppers, E.C. 1997. Liturgical music: Worship or war? *HTS* 53(1&2):172-184.

Kloppers, E.C. 2003. Vernuwung in die Kerklied: Die Liedboek van die Kerk (2001). *Acta Theologica*, 1:71-82.

Kloppers, E.C. 2005. *Kerkliedere vir 'n nuwe generasie - 'n liturgies-himnologiese ontwerp onder voorwaarde van die ekumene*. Ongepubliseerde PhD-proefskrif, Universiteit van Pretoria.

Kruger, D. 2007. "A high degree of understanding and tolerance": Veranderende denke oor die Gereformeerde Kerklied. *Koers*, 72(4):649-669.

Kruger, D. 2020. Gawie Cillié Memorial Lecture: From Far and Wide: Historical Sources of Afrikaans Liturgical Hymns. *Vir die Musiekleier*, 40(47):8-29.

La Grange, A. & Dreyer, Y. 2022. Spirituele voorkeure en die ervaring van erediens in die Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk. *Tydskrif vir Geesteswetenskappe*, 62(1):137-149. <https://doi.org/10.17159/2224-7912/2022/v62n1a7>

Lamm, K. 2011a. *Worship Wars*. Available: <https://www.renewingworshipnc.org/worship-wars/> [Accessed 15 August 2022]

Lamm, K. 2011b. *Worship Wars 3: Ending the worship war without a truce*. Available: <https://www.renewingworshipnc.org/worship-wars-3/> [Accessed 15 August 2022]

Lamprecht, F. 2013. *Die rol van sang en musiek in die liturgie van 'n Nederduitse Gereformeerde kerk*. Ongepubliseerde MDiv-skripsie, Universiteit Stellenbosch.

Liedboek. 2001. *Liedboek van die Kerk vir gebruik by die erediens en ander byeenkomste*. NG Kerk-uitgewers.

Long, T.C. 2001. *Beyond the Worship Wars: Building Vital and Faithful Worship*. The Alban Institute.

McKinnon, J. 1987. *Music in Early Christian Literature*. Cambridge University Press.

Moore, M.G. 2018. Contemporary worship music: Text, theology, and musical meaning. *The Hymn*, 69(1):27-28.

Otterman, R.E. 1992. Kerkmusiek in verwarring. *Ned. Geref. Teologiese Tydskrif*, XXXIV:74-80

Osei-Bonsu, R. 2013. John Calvin's Perspective on Music and Worship, And its Implications for the Seventh-Day Adventist Church. *Ilorin Journal of Religious Studies*,

3(1):83-101.

Papenfus, A.F. 1994. 'n Waardebepaling van die nie-amptelike, informele kerklied soos gesing in die erediens in gemeentes van die Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk in die PWV. Ongepubliseerde MMus-verhandeling, Universiteit van Suid-Afrika.

Perez, A. 2019. Beyond the guitar: The keyboard as a lens into the history of contemporary praise and worship. *The Hymn*, 70(2):18-26.

Peront, S. 2021. Re-forming Music: Martin Luther's Impact on Church Music through the Lutheran Reformation. *Musical Offerings*, 12(2):51-62. <https://doi.org/10.15385/jmo.2021.12.2.2>

Redman, R. 2004. Worship Wars or Worship Awakening? *Liturgy*, 19(4):39-44. <https://doi.org/10.1080/04580630490490512>

Routley, E. 1978. *Church Music and the Christian Faith*. Agape.

Ruth, L. 2017. The Eruption of Worship Wars: The Coming of Conflict. *Liturgy*, 32(1):3-6. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0458063X.2016.1229431>

Schröder, J. 2021. Academic music ministry training from a practical-theological perspective. *Acta Theologica*, 41:209-232.

Swanepoel, I.L. 2014. Die effektiewe benutting van die orrel in die liturgie van die hedendaagse Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk. Ongepubliseerde MMus-skripsie, Noordwes-Universiteit.

Swindoll, C.R. 2010. *The Church Awakening: An Urgent Call for Renewal*. Faith Words.

Teo, P. 2000. Racism in the News: A Critical Discourse Analysis of News Reporting in Two Australian Newspapers. *Discourse & Society*, 11(1):7-49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926500011001002>

Ticker, C.S. 2015. Music during the Reformation: Changing Times and Changing Minds. *Music and Worship Student Presentations 3*. Available: http://digitalcommons.cedarville.edu/music_and_worship_student_presentations/3 [Accessed 15 August 2022]

Towns, E.L. 1996. *Putting an End to Worship Wars*. Broadman & Holman Publishers.

- Van Dijk, T.A. 1983. Discourse Analysis: Its Development and Application to the Structure of News. *Journal of Communication*, 33(2):20-43. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.1983.tb02386.x>
- Van Niekerk, A. 2001. Laat ons sing. *Beeld*, 27 Oktober 2001:12.
- Van Rooy, J.H. 2008. *Die Psalmboek 2003 as kommunikasiemiddel in die liturgie van die erediens in die Gereformeerde Kerke in Suid-Afrika: 'n himnologiese studie*. Ongepubliseerde PhD-proefskrif, Noordwes-Universiteit.
- Van Rooy, J. 2013. Die kerklied en kommunikasie deur woord en melodie. *In die Skriflig*, 47(1), Art. #82, 9 bladsye. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ids.v47i1.82>.
- Van Wyk, D. 1983. Kriteria vir die kerklied. *HTS Teologiese Studies*, 39(1):65-73. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v39i1.4278>
- Vermeulen, O.C. 2012. Estetiese musiekbediening in die Afrikaanse gereformeerde erediens: die rol van spiritualiteit en inligtingsteorie. *Vir die Musiekleier*, 32:2-15.
- Vermeulen, O.C. 2015. In good times and in bad: Die stormagtige verhouding tussen kerk en die orrel – is egskeiding onafwendbaar? *Verbum Et Ecclesia*, 36(1):1-11.
- Viljoen, A.M. 2006. Die waarde en funksie van liturgiese musiek. *Nederduitse Gereformeerde Teologiese Tydskrif*, 47(3 & 4):760-772.
- VONKK (Voortgesette Ontwikkeling van Nuwe Klassieke Kerkmusiek). 2020. Available: <http://vonkk.kerkmusiek.co.za>
- Watkins, K. 2004. The future of protestant worship: Beyond the worship wars. *Encounter*, 65(4):418-419.
- Wiese, T. 1983. Psalms ingrypend hersien. *Die Burger*, 7 Julie 1983:17.
- Wood, M.J. 2014. Ancient Worship Wars: An Investigation of Conflict in Church Music History. *Musical Offerings*, 5(2):119-130. <https://doi.org/10.15385/jmo.2014.5.2.3>
- Woodard, P. 2008. Hymns in North American newspapers 2000-2007. *The Hymn*, 59(3):26-38.