

Anabaptist discipleship: progressive sanctification and the role of community

H Kim

 **orcid.org 0000-0002-0987-6813**

Dissertation accepted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree *Master of Theology* in *Dogmatics* at the North-West University

Supervisor: Dr ST Rochester

Co-promoter: Dr C Seed

Graduation ceremony: December 2021

Student number: 29929334

Anabaptist Discipleship: Progressive Sanctification and the Role of Community

ABSTRACT

This thesis examines whether Christian discipleship, as conceived by Anabaptists, can be understood in connection with a doctrine of sanctification. It also studies how the community, in other words, the church, influences the practice of discipleship and the process of sanctification. The work first discusses the doctrine of sanctification as formulated in various denominational contexts, and then examines, from historical and biblical perspectives, the relationship between the practice of Anabaptist discipleship and the concept of progressive sanctification. A study of sanctification and discipleship in the Old and New Testaments leads, in the final chapter, to an examination of Anabaptist discipleship as progressive sanctification. It concludes that Anabaptist discipleship is a process characterised by community-centred sanctification. Finally, it offers an evaluation of the usefulness of this perspective in the Christian community, and formulates a doctrine of sanctification compatible with Anabaptist principles.

Key words

Anabaptism, Sanctification, Progressive Sanctification, Community Discipleship

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1. Introduction	1
1.1 Background and problem statement.....	1
1.1.1 Background.....	1
1.1.2 Problem statement and questions arising	4
1.2 Aims and objectives.....	6
1.2.1 Aim.....	6
1.2.2 Objectives	6
1.3 Central theoretical argument	7
1.4 Research methodology.....	7
1.5 Ethical statement	9
1.6 Outline of Chapters.....	9
CHAPTER 2. Historical views of sanctification	11
2.1 Luther’s view of sanctification	11
2.2 Reformed view of sanctification according to John Calvin.....	16
2.3 Views of the Puritans: John Owen and John Flavel	20
2.4 Wesley’s view of sanctification	24
2.5 Anabaptists’ understanding of Christian life as sanctification	27
2.6 Historical understanding of the relation between sanctification and the role of community	29
2.7 Conclusion.....	32
CHAPTER 3. Biblical and theological understanding of sanctification and discipleship	34
3.1 Sanctification in the Old Testament	34
3.1.1 $\psi\iota\tau\grave{\alpha}$ [<i>kadosh</i>] as noun/adjective	34
3.1.2 $\psi\tau\grave{\iota}$ [<i>qâdash</i>] as a verb	36
3.1.3 Exegesis of $\psi\tau\grave{\iota}$ [<i>qâdash</i>] in Leviticus.....	39
3.1.4 “Be holy, for I am holy” in Leviticus 11:44 and 45	39
3.1.5 “Be holy, for I am holy” in Leviticus 20:7 and 26	41
3.1.6 Conclusion	44
3.2 Sanctification in the New Testament	45
3.2.1 The nouns $\acute{\alpha}\gamma\iota\alpha\sigma\mu\acute{o}\varsigma$ and $\acute{\alpha}\gamma\iota\omega\sigma\acute{\upsilon}\nu\eta$	45
3.2.2 The verb $\acute{\alpha}\gamma\iota\acute{\alpha}\zeta\omega$: Jesus as the source of sanctification	47

3.2.3 The adjective ἅγιος: the sanctified community	51
3.3 Theological understanding of sanctification	54
3.3.1 Sanctification is a positional status	54
3.3.2 Sanctification is a progressive work	57
3.3.3 Sanctification is a community matter	60
3.3.4 The sanctifying community is redeemed and missional	62
3.4 The biblical concept of discipleship in the Old and the New Testaments	64
3.4.1 Discipleship in the Old Testament	65
3.4.2 Discipleship in the New Testament Gospels.....	69
3.5 Conclusion.....	76
CHAPTER 4. Anabaptist concepts of discipleship and the role of the Christian fellowship as a redeemed and transformative community	77
4.1 A brief history of the Anabaptist movement	77
4.1.1 Martin Luther.....	79
4.1.2 Zwingli and the Anabaptists	81
4.2 The Anabaptist concept of discipleship	84
4.2.1 Discipleship as positional sanctification	86
4.2.2 Discipleship as progressive sanctification.....	87
4.3 The role of the Christian fellowship as a redeemed and transformative community	90
4.3.1 The church as redeemed community.....	91
4.3.2 The church as transforming community.....	93
4.4 Conclusion.....	98
CHAPTER 5. The Relationship between the Reformed doctrine of sanctification and the Anabaptist concept of discipleship	100
5.1 The relationship between discipleship and sanctification in the Bible....	100
5.1.1 Biblical concepts of sanctification	100
5.1.2 Biblical concepts of discipleship.....	106
5.1.3 Conclusion	110
5.2 The relationship between the Reformed doctrine of sanctification and the Anabaptist concept of discipleship.....	111
5.2.1 Luther's justification by faith and the Anabaptists' discipleship	111
5.2.2 Calvin's concept of union in Christ and the Anabaptists' concept of discipleship	113

5.2.3 The Puritan concept of sanctification and the Anabaptist concept of discipleship	114
5.2.4 Wesleyan sanctification and Anabaptist discipleship	115
5.3 Sanctification as discipleship in the community of faith	116
5.3.1 Biblical evidence for the application to the church and life of believers	117
5.3.2 Sanctification through the church and the life of believers	118
5.3.3 Anabaptist practice for application to the church and the life of believers.....	119
5.3.4 How all of this could work out in the current Anabaptist church setting in North America	121
5.4 Towards a doctrine of sanctification in Anabaptist perspective	123
5.5 Conclusion.....	124
CHAPTER 6. Conclusion	126
6.1 Summary of the research	126
6.2 Research objectives	127
6.3 Significance of the research	128
6.4 Conclusion.....	128
6.5 An Anabaptist doctrine of sanctification.....	129
6.6 Areas for further research.....	129
Reference list	131

CHAPTER 1. Introduction

1.1 Background and problem statement

1.1.1 Background

Growing up as a member of the Presbyterian Church in Korea, I learnt much about theological terms, which helped me to understand what a Christian is and how a Christian life should be lived. When I became an Anabaptist pastor in Canada in 2015, I was surprised when I read the book *Beliefs: Mennonite Faith and Practice* by John D. Roth (2005). His theological categories appeared too simple to me. According to this book, the Mennonites have only seven categories with which to understand the church of God and the Christian life. After that, I searched for a book on Anabaptist systematic theology, but I could not find one. While I was reading Roth's book, I realized that his concept of discipleship is quite similar to the concept of sanctification in the theology with which I was familiar, even though he does not use the term "sanctification". Therefore, in order to gain clarification, I would like to attempt to compare the concept of sanctification with the Anabaptist concept of discipleship through this dissertation.

For this subject matter, the analysis and review of previous resources is crucial. Among these, Peter Toon's *Justification and Sanctification* (1983) first takes a biblical approach to these topics, then discusses historical perspectives from Augustine to Wesley, concluding with the views of more contemporary scholars such as Newman and Tillich. This book provides a good introduction to the topic, although it is focused more on justification than on sanctification.

More recently, James Howard's book *Paul, the Community, and Progressive Sanctification* (2006) explores 'community-based transformation' within Pauline theology, considering the biblical meanings of sanctification throughout the whole of the biblical revelation while focusing on 'progressive sanctification' and the 'solidarity' of the Christian community.

For an insightful treatment of 'community' I will refer to Robert Banks' work *Paul's Idea of Community* (1980), examining the social setting of first-century Christians. In this book Banks does not deal with the doctrine of the church under systematic theological terms, but he structures his work around significant words found in all the epistles of Paul.

There are some important keywords for this dissertation. The first is **positional or positioned sanctification**. It is similar to the term justification, in which God declares people to be righteous and separated to God (Hill, 2014:63). Positional sanctification refers to being set apart to God; it is an instantaneous act of God's saving grace which takes place at the moment of conversion (Mery, 2013:1). Therefore, positional sanctification or justification explains how the gospel is effective; it is based on the great themes of the righteousness of God and human faith (Toon, 1983:20).

While positional sanctification refers to an instantaneous act of God, **progressive sanctification** refers to the ongoing progressive work of God in a believer's life. This process makes believers more and more free from sin and enables them to follow Jesus more closely in their Christian life (Grudem, 1994:746). There are several perspectives regarding progressive sanctification

which follow various church traditions. In Wesley's view, according to Howard (2006:12),

... the concept of holiness is as dynamic in nature as it is descriptive. The heart of the New Covenant is that God, through the promised Holy Spirit, will completely restore his love in his children and with this love, the ability to fully love God. The centrality of this theme in both the Old and New Testaments is reflected in Wesleyan theology in that, through the power of the indwelling Spirit, the children of God are enabled to live in righteousness and true holiness throughout their entire Christian lives. Inherent in the command is the capability and promise of its fulfillment (Howard, 2006:12).

In the Reformed view according to Calvin in his *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, progressive sanctification is the process of renewal. While Wesley refers to the indwelling Spirit, Calvin talks about union with Christ. So, its central concept involves the word of God and renewal and transformation in *Institutes* 3.1. "Though people were created in the image of God, sin so completely perverted that image that holiness was lost. In the process of sanctification, that image is being renewed" (Howard, 2006:15). Therefore, I will use the term "progressive sanctification" in this dissertation for the process or progressive work of God making human beings to be in union with Christ and the indwelling Spirit; this process is one of renewal and transformation.

The last keyword is **community sanctification**. This can be defined by references to biblical concepts. Howard uses the word "solidarity" when he considers community sanctification. Solidarity may be defined as "the way in which God has given humanity in general and his people in particular a common life with common concerns and responsibilities, so that the actions of one may deeply affect others for good or ill" (Grogan, 1998:159–160, cited by

Howard, 2006:83). Furthermore, fellowship or communion with God is the fundamental goal of all scriptural communication (Allen and Swain, 2017:94). Both the Old and New Testaments consistently and continually illustrate God as initiating relationship with the community. This pattern of God's initiation of relationship with His creation forms the basis and example in the New Testament for how community members are to act toward one another (Howard, 2006:184). Hence, according to Allen and Swain (2017:97),

... the very aim of the gospel is restored fellowship or communion (*koinonia*) between the one true God and his children, admittedly those who at this point are estranged lovers and prodigal children. The function of the gospel is the sharing of life and the gift of fellowship (Allen and Swain, 2007:97).

Therefore, community sanctification is to participate in Jesus Christ through joining the redeemed community, which facilitates believers' learning to think and live like Christ, and thus growing in Christ-likeness (Howard, 2006:186).

1.1.2 Problem statement and questions arising

Sanctification is a key aspect of theological inquiry. The subject has been approached from various angles by scholars from a range of denominational traditions. The sanctification of a Christian believer can be considered to consist of two elements, sometimes called "positional sanctification", which refers to the ascribed holiness that believers receive when they put their faith in Christ for salvation, and "progressive sanctification", referring to the continuing process by which believers become more Christlike through the nurturing and growth of their faith and their experience of God's working in their lives (Snider, 2010:12).

Anabaptist traditions, which value the perspectives of the sixteenth-century Radical Reformers, have largely avoided the construction of systematic theology, and have preferred to consider the development of a believer's Christian life not as sanctification but as discipleship, partly because "educated Anabaptists were banned from further formal study and most publishing and public speaking" (Finger, 2004:87). Furthermore, the Anabaptist movement was not the product of just one person but arose in at least three local regions: Switzerland, South Germany-Austria and The Netherlands (Finger, 2004:87), so it was difficult to merge their views into a single written theology. In addition, Anabaptist perspectives place a high value on the role of the Christian community in the transformation and development of a believer's life, such that "community sanctification" becomes a significant category. An important research question is, therefore, what role does the community of faith play in promoting faithful discipleship and sanctification?

In Pauline theology, it is impossible to live holy lives without involvement with community (Howard, 2006:186). Therefore, while the dissertation deals with sanctification, it will also examine the concept of the church as the believer's community of faith, and its role in promoting faithful discipleship. The dissertation will attempt to clarify the Anabaptist concept of discipleship through the application of a range of views of sanctification and will try to establish a doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles.

Several questions provide appropriate areas for research on this problem:

1. How has the doctrine of sanctification been formulated in the Lutheran tradition (represented by Martin Luther), the Reformed tradition (according to John Calvin and the Puritans John Owen and John Flavel), and the Wesleyan tradition (John Wesley)?
2. What are the scriptural foundations of the doctrine of sanctification and its elements of positioned and progressive sanctification?
3. What are the Anabaptist perspectives on the role of the Christian fellowship in the processes of Christian discipleship?
4. How should one formulate a doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles?

1.2 Aims and objectives

1.2.1 Aim

The main aim of the dissertation is to examine the relationship between discipleship and sanctification from an Anabaptist perspective.

1.2.2 Objectives

The specific objectives, therefore, include the following:

1. to investigate the doctrine of sanctification as it has been formulated in a range of traditions: Lutheran (by Luther), Reformed (by Calvin), Puritan (by Owen and Flavel), and Wesleyan (by Wesley);
2. to investigate the scriptural foundations of the doctrine of sanctification and its elements of positioned and progressive sanctification;

3. to examine the Anabaptist perspectives on Christian discipleship and the role of the Christian fellowship as a redeemed and transformative community;

4. to develop, from an Anabaptist perspective, an understanding of discipleship that takes full account of the Christian community's role in "community sanctification" and to formulate a doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles.

1.3 Central theoretical argument

The central theoretical argument of this study is that the church, as the believer's community of faith, plays an essential role in promoting faithful discipleship, such that this function can legitimately be viewed as fostering progressive sanctification through the intentional interaction of believers with their community, and that this view is compatible with Anabaptist principles.

1.4 Research methodology

This dissertation deals with Christian dogmatic theology, specifically entailing research into the doctrine of sanctification, and therefore it uses qualitative methods.

Chapter 2 examines the historical theological formulations of this concept through some important theologians. A literature analysis is conducted to determine and evaluate past and present formulations of the doctrine of sanctification. Primary sources include Martin Luther's *Small Catechism*, John

Calvin's *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, especially books 3 and 4, John Owen's *The Holy Spirit, His Gifts and Power* (Owen, 1954) and John Wesley's *Plain Account of Christian Perfection*. Secondary sources will include *Martin Luther on Sanctification* (Towns, 1969), *John Flavel: Puritan Life and Thought in Stuart England* (Cosby, 2014), and *Wesley on the Christian Life: The Heart Renewed in Love* (Sanders, 2013).

Chapter 3 investigates relevant portions of the Old and New Testaments on which these formulations have been based, in order to discover the scriptural foundations of the doctrine of sanctification. The method for exegesis is the historical-grammatical method. My epistemological presupposition is that "the Bible is God's full and final revelation" (Smith, 2016:139). I have been guided in this section by Antony Thiselton's material on hermeneutics and language in his *Two Horizons* (1980) and Kopic's *Sanctification: Explorations in Theology and Practice* (2014).

Chapter 4 presents the results of a literature analysis of Anabaptist views of discipleship and understanding of the church.

In Chapter 5 the collected data is analyzed, critically evaluated, and synthesized with a view to making appropriate connections between discipleship, sanctification, and the Christian community, from an Anabaptist perspective.

This study is done from within the Evangelical Protestant Anabaptist tradition.

1.5 Ethical statement

This thesis is the product of individual theoretical research, and no empirical investigations have been conducted. In my review of the relevant literature I have made every effort to represent each view in an unbiased way, whether I agree with it or not. I am fully aware of the requirement to avoid plagiarism, and I undertake to present original work and to attribute others' ideas and quotations accurately. In regard to my historical-grammatical exegesis, my aim is to be objective and to respect the approach of other scholars. For these reasons, my work is of low ethical risk.

1.6 Outline of Chapters

Chapter 1 introduces the problem and its background issues.

Chapter 2 investigates various formulations of the doctrine of sanctification as it has been viewed in the Lutheran tradition according to Luther, the Reformed tradition according to Calvin, the Puritan tradition according to Owen and Flavel, and the Wesleyan perspective according to Wesley.

Chapter 3 highlights aspects of sanctification as this concept is presented in Scripture, and examines the elements of positioned and progressive sanctification.

Chapter 4 explores the Anabaptist concept of discipleship, and evaluates the role of the Christian fellowship as a redeemed and transformative community;

Chapter 5 identifies connections between Anabaptist views on discipleship and the previously discussed perspectives on sanctification and works toward the formulation of a doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles.

Chapter 6 summarizes the research and offers a brief doctrinal statement on the relationship of sanctification and discipleship in the context of the Anabaptist community.

CHAPTER 2. Historical views of sanctification

There are two doctrines that express the greatness of God's gracious acts of salvation since the Reformation was launched. The first is justification, and the other is sanctification. However, sanctification has been understood in different ways by a variety of scholars and denominations. For example, it has often been understood with a focus on good works done by recipients of justification, even the completion of salvation through good works. Since the main aim of this dissertation is to study and summarize the doctrine of sanctification from an Anabaptist perspective, it is appropriate to deal with the historical views of sanctification expressed by some theologians and scholars who dealt with this subject matter. Writers such as Luther, Calvin, some Puritans like John Owen and John Flavel, as well as John Wesley, have been especially influential in the formation of views on sanctification. This chapter seeks to understand and summarize these contributions, and also deals briefly with some Anabaptist references, even though there is no official Anabaptist doctrine of sanctification.

2.1 Luther's view of sanctification

Luther is well known as a theologian of justification, for he understood the categories of salvation, such as sanctification, renewal, and regeneration, within the meaning of justification. Luther saw that a human has a twofold nature:

Man has a twofold nature, a spiritual and a bodily one. According to the spiritual nature, which men refer to as the soul, he is called a spiritual, inner or new man. According to the bodily nature, which men refer to as flesh, he is called a carnal, outward, or old man, of whom the apostle

writes in 2 Cor. 4:16, "Though our outer nature is wasting away, our inner nature is being renewed every day." (Luther, 2002:4)

For the inner person, Luther says that "no external thing has any influence in producing Christian righteousness or freedom, or in producing unrighteousness or servitude" (Luther, 2002:4). Thus, Christians cannot be justified by their ideas or thoughts, but only by faith in Jesus Christ. Luther (2002:5) says that faith alone and the efficacious use of the Word of God bring salvation, according to Romans 10:9, and that "Christ is the end of the law, that everyone who has faith may be justified" (Romans 10:4). Therefore, for Luther, faith is the key and the foundation for justification and Christian life. He says that "faith alone, without works, justifies, frees, and saves" (Luther, 2002:7). As faith is the saving power for Christians, it "honours Him whom it trusts with the most reverent and highest regard, since it considers Him truthful and trustworthy" (Luther, 2002:9). Luther also talks about another benefit of faith, that "it unites the soul with Christ as a bride is united with her bridegroom" (Luther, 2002:10-11). Luther says:

Christ is God and man in one person. He has neither sinned nor died, and is not condemned, and He cannot sin, die, or be condemned; His righteousness, life, and salvation are unconquerable, eternal, omnipotent... His life stronger than death, His salvation more invincible than hell. Thus the believing soul by means of the pledge of its faith is free in Christ, its bridegroom, free from all sins, secure against death and hell, and is endowed with the eternal righteousness, life, and salvation of Christ, its bridegroom (Luther, 2002:11).

Therefore, Luther understood that justification gives a Christian freedom from all sins through Christ, so that justification is the cause of a believer's salvation, and sanctification is the effect on the Christian's life in Christ lived by faith (Towns, 1969:116). Luther, referring to Romans 5, considers "the fruits and

works of faith, such as peace, joy, love to God and to every man, as well as confidence, assurance, boldness, courage, and hope amid tribulation and suffering.” He continues:

For all this follows, if faith be true, because of the super-abundant goodness that God shows us in Christ, causing Christ to die for us before we could ask it of Him, indeed, while we were still enemies. Thus we have it that faith justifies without any works; and yet it does not follow that men are therefore to do no good works, but rather that the genuine works will not be lacking (Luther, 2002:99).

Therefore, sanctification is initiated by justification and proceeds in the Christian believer because the believer’s condition is, in Luther’s words, *simul justus et peccator*, which means simultaneously justified and a sinner. Thus, Luther believed that our union with the crucified and risen Christ has been accomplished, and the living Christ in us again and again exposes and sweeps away sin. The righteousness of believers consists of two parts: first, the imputed righteousness through Christ, and second, the renewal which has begun in the Christian through the presence of Christ (Vaino, 2008:38). With this renewal, sanctification begins.

Luther’s view of sanctification is well documented in Part 2 of Luther’s *Small Catechism*. It is the third article on the Apostles’ Creed, which deals with the life of the Holy Spirit, the church and the Christian life: “I believe in the Holy Spirit, the holy Christian Church, the communion of saints, the forgiveness of sins, the resurrection of the body, and the life everlasting.” Quoting this, Luther asks, “What does this mean?” Luther answers:

I believe that I cannot by my own reason or strength believe in Jesus Christ, my Lord, or come to Him; but the Holy Spirit has called me by the

Gospel, enlightened me with His gifts, sanctified and kept me in the true faith. In the same way He calls, gathers, enlightens, and sanctifies the whole Christian church on earth, and keeps it with Jesus Christ in the one true faith. In this Christian church He daily and richly forgives all my sins and the sins of all believers. On the Last Day He will raise me and all the dead, and give eternal life to me and all believers in Christ. This is most certainly true (Luther, 1986).

Luther understood that justification and sanctification must be seen as a dynamic unity in the light of God's eschatological acts that bring new life from death. Thus, for Luther, sanctification was seen as union with Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit through justification by faith in Jesus Christ. He saw that justification and sanctification are connected like cause and effect; the cause of sanctification is justification and the result of justification is sanctification. In addition, Luther realized that sanctification should be understood as a daily process rather than a one-time process, and that the process is not effective apart from the church, by the work of the Word and the Holy Spirit (Towns, 1969:119). Luther says that Christian life is the life under the Cross: the life will be patterned after Christ and will be characterized by bearing the cross (Ferguson, 2018). However, Luther understood that "it must not be self-imposed but it is something that is imposed upon a person" (Luther, 2002:321); the way of bearing the cross is "the touch of Christ which sanctifies all the sufferings and sorrows of those who believe in Him" (Luther, 2002:322).

Whoever does not suffer shows that he does not believe that Christ has given him the gift of sharing in His own passion. But if anyone does not wish to bear the Cross which God places upon him, he will not be compelled to do so by anyone—he is always free to deny Christ. But in so doing he must know that he cannot have fellowship with Christ or share in any of His gifts (Luther, 2002:322).

Therefore, Luther says that “One thing, and only one thing, is necessary for Christian life, righteousness, and freedom. That one thing is the most holy Word of God, the gospel of Christ, as Christ says in John 11:25” (Luther, 2002:4).

About the Word, Luther also says that

The Word is the gospel of God concerning His Son, who was made flesh, suffered, rose from the dead, and was glorified through the Spirit who sanctifies. To preach Christ means to feed the soul, make it righteous, set it free, and save it, provided it believes the preaching (Luther, 2002:5).

Luther’s view about good works is that “no good work can rely upon the Word of God or live in the soul, for faith alone and the Word of God rule in the soul” (Luther, 2002:8). For Luther, union with Christ in His death and resurrection and its outworking in daily experience becomes the spectacle lens through which Christians learn to view every experience in life (Ferguson, 2018).

To summarize Luther’s view of sanctification, three points are important. First, he saw that, according to the gospel, sanctification is the work of the Holy Spirit, and of Christ as well, and is not dependent on any human work. Therefore, just like justification, any human merit cannot be included in the process of sanctification because it is accomplished by the atonement of Jesus Christ. Second, Luther saw that the process of sanctification can be accomplished through the word and sacrament in the church, the community of believers. Finally, he understood sanctification as a daily process. It is the process activated by faith, and begins by the indwelling of the Holy Spirit in everyday life. Thus, as he understood justification, he understood God’s omnipotence and great work through sanctification.

2.2 Reformed view of sanctification according to John Calvin

John Calvin is the most important person in Reformed theology. Calvin's *Institutes of the Christian Religion* is his most influential book, which has influenced various denominations such as Reformed, Presbyterian, and Reformed Baptists. Although Calvin did not have any special category for sanctification, he mentioned sanctification several times in his *Institutes*, Book 3, while he was dealing with repentance and the Christian life. Therefore, this section will cover Calvin's view of sanctification, and the next section will discuss Puritan views of sanctification which formed following Calvin's theology. Like Luther, Calvin also acknowledged that the word of God, that is, the Scripture, is the indispensable means of growth in the Christian life. He writes:

The Scripture system of which we speak aims chiefly at two objects. The former is, that the love of righteousness, to which we are by no means naturally inclined, may be instilled and implanted into our minds. The latter is ... to prescribe a rule which will prevent us while in the pursuit of righteousness from going astray (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.6.2, 694).

Calvin understood the grace of Christ (justifying grace and transforming grace) as a whole, so that, for him, the sanctification of the Christian is understood as union with Christ. Calvin writes,

We must now see in what way we become possessed of the blessings which God has bestowed on his only-begotten Son, not for private use, but to enrich the poor and needy. And the first thing to be attended to is, that so long as we are without Christ and separated from him, nothing which he suffered and did for the salvation of the human race is of the least benefit to us (Calvin, *Institutes* 3.1.1, 537).

Also, Calvin understood that Christ is given for righteousness, sanctification, and life.

We do not obtain salvation either because we are prepared to embrace every dictate of the Church as true, or leave to the Church the province of inquiring and determining; but when we recognize God as a propitious Father through the reconciliation made by Christ, and Christ as given to us for righteousness, sanctification, and life (Calvin, *Institutes* 3.2.2, 549).

For Calvin, Christians obtain salvation by the help of the Holy Spirit. He says that “The Holy Spirit is the bond by which Christ effectually binds us to himself” (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.1.2, 538). For Calvin, the work of the Holy Spirit is important for sanctification:

The Spirit is called the Spirit of sanctification, because he quickens and cherishes us, not merely by the general energy which is seen in the human race, as well as other animals, but because he is the seed and root of heavenly life in us (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.1.2, 538)

When Calvin considers salvation, he writes about the twofold benefit of justification and sanctification:

Christ, given to us by God’s generosity, is apprehended and possessed by us in faith, by means of which we obtain in particular a twofold benefit: first, being reconciled by the righteousness of Christ, God becomes, instead of a judge, an indulgent Father; and secondly, being sanctified by his spirit, we aspire to integrity and purity of life (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.1, 738).

Because justification and sanctification are, for Calvin, “inseparably tied”, he further writes that “Christ, therefore, justifies no man without also sanctifying him” (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.16.1, 815). Calvin says, “these blessings are conjoined by a perpetual and inseparable tie. Those whom he enlightens by his wisdom he redeems; whom he redeems he justifies; whom he justifies he sanctifies” (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.16.1, 815). Calvin also understood that

sanctification is inseparable from repentance and regeneration. He defines regeneration as the starting point of renewal for sanctification:

Accordingly, through the blessing of Christ we are renewed by that regeneration into the righteousness of God from which we had fallen through Adam, the Lord being pleased in this manner to restore the integrity of all whom he appoints to the inheritance of life (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.3.9, 605).

Calvin says that the Holy Spirit inspires believers with new thoughts and affections, that they may be regarded as new (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.3.8, 604). For Calvin, therefore, sanctification starts from union with Christ, put into effect by the Holy Spirit and under the guidance of the Holy Spirit. This begins with true repentance, and it consists of two parts: “the mortification of the flesh and the quickening of the spirit” (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.3.8, 604). Therefore, according to Calvin, as justification is done through faith, these works are also done through faith and the Spirit.

For if we have true fellowship in his death, our old man is crucified by his power, and the body of sin becomes dead, so that the corruption of our original nature is never again in full vigor (Rom. 6:5, 6). If we are partakers in his resurrection, we are raised up by means of it to newness of life, which conforms us to the righteousness of God (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.3.9, 605).

Calvin says that Christ is in us, and we are in Christ in a living union. Union with Christ also leads to repentance, which consists of mortification and quickening which cannot be achieved by one’s own work. For Calvin, “in Christ” or “union with Christ” is the central idea for understanding the Christian’s salvation and ongoing life. Calvin sees that there is no innate ability in humans to know God

or receive God's salvation, but it is possible when humans are in Christ Jesus.

He writes,

For although no man will now, in the present ruin of the human race, perceive God to be either a father, or the author of salvation, or propitious in any respect, until Christ interpose to make our peace, still it is one thing to perceive that God our Maker supports us by his power, rules us by his providence, fosters us by his goodness, and visits us with all kinds of blessings, and another thing to embrace the grace of reconciliation offered to us in Christ (Calvin, *Institutes*, 1.2.1, 10).

Calvin understood that union with Christ, or being in Christ, is like the relation between a husband and a wife:

... he declares his constant mercy and kindness to the remote posterity of those who love him and keep his Law. The Lord very frequently addresses us in the character of a husband, the union by which he connects us with himself, when he receives us into the bosom of the Church, having some resemblance to that of holy wedlock, because founded on mutual faith. As he performs all the offices of a true and faithful husband, so he stipulates for love and conjugal chastity from us; that is, that we do not prostitute our souls to Satan, to be defiled with foul carnal lusts (Calvin, *Institutes*, 2.8.18, 373).

Therefore, if a person is not united with Jesus Christ, who is our righteousness, they remain in death, but union with Him will bring everlasting salvation (Calvin, *Institutes*, 2.10.8, 428). Calvin did not treat the doctrine of sanctification separately in his work, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*. However, in Chapter 6, Calvin asserts:

... the object of regeneration is to bring the life of believers into concord and harmony with the righteousness of God, and so confirm the adoption by which they have been received as sons (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.6.1, 693).

Therefore, Calvin says that "there is no sanctification without union with Christ" (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.14.4, 786). Thus, Calvin sees that justification and

sanctification are not separable, as Christ cannot be divided into parts (Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.6, 744). Calvin understood that justification is to be declared as righteous and sanctification is to experience the renewal of life by the Spirit of God. So, the foundation for the Christian's life is living faith, and it is union with Christ which brings blessing. The blessing is reconciliation and renewal because these are conferred by Christ and received by faith (Allen, 2017:149). In summary, Calvin's view on sanctification is founded on union with Christ and its result, which is regeneration and renewal.

2.3 Views of the Puritans: John Owen and John Flavel

The understanding of the Reformed theology of sanctification was more specifically applied through the Puritan theology of sanctification. The Puritans' view of sanctification was premised on Calvin's view of union with Christ, and the Puritans understood sanctification in the following three aspects.

Sanctification is by God's grace

The first is that the sanctification of a Christian is initiated and completed by God's grace, just as justification is done by the grace of God. John Owen writes:

Sanctification, as here described, is the immediate work of God by his Spirit upon our whole nature, proceeding from the peace made for us by Jesus Christ, whereby being changed into his likeness, we are kept entirely in peace with God, and are preserved unblameable, or in a state of gracious acceptance with him to the end (Owen, 1954:221).

Owen (1954:230) understands sanctification as the universal renovation of human nature by the Spirit and transformation into the image of God through Jesus Christ.

Sanctification is an immediate work of the Spirit of God on the souls of believers, purifying their natures from the pollution and uncleanness of sin, renewing in them the image of God, and thereby enabling them, from a spiritual and habitual principle of grace, to yield obedience to God, according to the tenor of the new covenant, by virtue of the life and death of Jesus Christ.

However, this transformation necessarily involves the cooperation of the believer:

The good news of the gospel message, according to Flavel and the Puritans, included the imperative to repent and believe. The gospel, in other words, includes both the indicatives of justification, but also the imperatives of a sanctified life (Cosby, 2014:120).

John Flavel also understands Christ as the author of both redemption and sanctification.

Christ is not only made of God unto them wisdom and righteousness, the one curing our ignorance, the other our guilt; but he is made sanctification also, to relieve us against the dominion and pollutions of our corruptions (Flavel, 1853:15).

Thus, Flavel, like Owen, understands that sanctification is the work of God by the Holy Spirit through Jesus Christ.

Sanctification is a progressive work

The second aspect is that the Puritans understand sanctification as a progressive work. Owen recognizes that Scripture enjoins believers to increase and grow in holiness (Owen, 1954:231).

The work of holiness, in its beginning, is but like the seed cast into the earth being cherished and nourished, it is in its nature to take root, to spring up, and to bring forth fruit. It is thus with the seed of God, the principle of holiness (Owen, 1954:231).

Owen writes that holiness grows “by strengthening and increasing those graces we have received and exercised” (Owen, 1954:231). But this exercise, as the earlier reformers Luther and Calvin saw, is not done without the Spirit of God.

And the Spirit of God excites them, by frequently and seasonably presenting their proper object: particularly in the preaching of the word, and other ordinances of worship. God in Christ, the promises of the covenant, and other proper objects of faith and love being proposed to us, these graces are drawn out into exercise (Owen, 1954:232).

The Puritans understood that the grace of God and growth in Christ are not separated; the daily concerns of believers are based on God’s grace which enables them to live as Christians (Cosby, 2014:113). They see that God makes believers able to die to sin and live for God (Cosby, 2014:113). In answer to the question “Is sanctification perfected at once?” John Flavel says “No, but by degrees; 2 Peter 3:18, ‘But grow in grace, and in the knowledge of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ’” (Flavel, 1853:35). John Flavel poses the question, “What is the inseparable companion of sanctification?” and gives the answer:

Righteousness towards men; Luke 1:74-75. That he would grant unto us, that we, being delivered out of the hands of our enemies, might serve him without fear, in holiness, and righteousness before him all the days of our life. (Flavel, 2016:Q35)

Therefore, as Owen saw that sanctification is a progressive work, Flavel also understood that it is a life-long process that will be completed in heaven.

Sanctification is communion with God

Thirdly, as Calvin saw the Christian’s salvation as union with Christ, Owen understood it as communion with God. Owen saw that, because of the sinful

nature of humanity, no one naturally has communion with God (Owen, 2003:156). Thus, Owen says,

Now, two cannot walk together unless they are agreed; while this distance between God and man exists, they cannot walk together in fellowship or communion (Owen, 2003:156).

But he understood that the distance between God and humanity is removed by Jesus Christ. Owen understood communion with God as twofold: the one is perfect and complete, which we will enjoy in eternity, and the other is initial and incomplete, which we have here and now, in grace (Owen, 2003:202). For Owen, this communion is Trinitarian: there is communion with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. When he explains the communion with the Spirit, he understands that it is a progressive work. He says,

This distinct communion, then, of the saints with the Father, the Son, and the Spirit, is very plain in the Scripture... Their spiritual and holy activities are the means by which the saints enjoy communion with God in Christ. It is found in the exercise of those graces that comprise the moral and instituted worship of God (Owen, 2003:240).

Therefore, Owen understood “distinctly affixing our faith, commitment, and confidence in the Lord Jesus Christ as the Son of God, is frequently pressed” (Owen, 2003:281). Therefore, communion with God for Owen is fellowship with God through Jesus Christ and is the initial step for the Christian’s life.

To sum up, the Puritans saw that sanctification or holiness is rooted in the attributes of God (Beeke, 2012: loc. 20101). They understood that sanctification is a necessity for every believer, that it is a progressive work under God’s guidance, and that it requires communion with God.

2.4 Wesley's view of sanctification

Wesley's view of sanctification has some similarity to Calvin's view in that Wesley also believed that sanctification comes after justification. In his sermon on justification by faith he wrote:

This is "sanctification," which is, indeed, in some degree, the immediate fruit of justification, but, nevertheless, is a distinct gift of God, and of a totally different nature. The one implies what God does for us through his Son; the other, what he works in us by his Spirit (Wesley, 1999).

For Wesley, there is no sanctification without justification because justification always precedes sanctification (Sanders, 2013:134). Wesley's understanding of sanctification is faith working by love. In his book, *A Plain Account of Christian Perfection*, he answered the question 4 "Is love the fulfilling of the law?":

Unquestionably it is. The whole law under which we now are, is fulfilled by love (Rom. 13:9, 10). Faith working or animated by love is all that God now requires of man. He has substituted (not sincerity, but) love, in the room of angelic perfection (Wesley, 2010:59).

He believed that Christianity must show its reality in a faith that works by divine love in everyday life (Dieter, 1996:12). Therefore, the Bible is the fundamental source for the Christian's life because it talks about God, and God is love (Dieter, 1996:14). In Sermon 6 on the righteousness of faith, Wesley says, "Believe and live, and thou shalt be saved; now saved, both from the guilt and power of sin, and, of consequence, from the wages of it" (Wesley, 1999).

Sanders summarises the difference between justification and sanctification: Wesley believes that justification is the great work of God for us, in forgiving our sins, while regeneration or sanctification is the great work of God in us, in renewing our fallen nature (Sanders, 2013:78). Wesley writes:

But what is it to be “justified”? What is “justification”? This was the second thing which I proposed to show. And it is evident, from what has been already observed, that it is not the being made actually just and righteous. This is “sanctification;” which is, indeed, in some degree, the immediate fruit of justification, but, nevertheless, is a distinct gift of God, and of a totally different nature. The one implies what God does for us through his Son; the other, what he works in us by his Spirit. So that, although some rare instances may be found, wherein the term “justified” or “justification” is used in so wide a sense as to include “sanctification” also; yet, in general use, they are sufficiently distinguished from each other, both by St. Paul and the other inspired writers. (Wesley, 2011)

Just as the Puritans understood that sanctification is a progressive work, Wesley had the same understanding that sanctification is an ongoing process during the Christian’s whole life. To understand Wesley’s view of sanctification, it is most important to understand his unique concept of Christian Perfection or Entire Sanctification. He understood Christian perfection as two parts. The first is that Christians cannot be perfect on this earth:

They are not perfect in knowledge. They are not free from ignorance, no, nor from mistake. We are no more to expect any living man to be infallible, than to be omniscient. They are not free from infirmities, such as weakness or slowness of understanding, irregular quickness or heaviness of imagination (Wesley, 2019b:10).

This is the same viewpoint as other reformers such as Luther and Calvin. In Sermon 40 on Christian Perfection, Wesley wrote that “the best of men are liable to mistake, and do mistake day by day with regard to the holy scriptures themselves, as careful as they are to avoid it” (Russie, 2013:400). Christians are not free from errors or temptation, according to Wesley. Thus, when Wesley talked about Christian perfection, he did not imply “an exemption either from ignorance or mistake, or from infirmities or temptations. Indeed, Christian perfection is only another term for holiness” (Russie, 2013:402). Wesley says in his book *A Plain Account of Christian Perfection*:

In one view, it is purity of intention, dedicating all the life to God. It is the giving God all our heart; it is one desire and design ruling all our tempers. It is the devoting, not a part, but all our soul, body, and substance to God. In another view, it is all the mind which was in Christ, enabling us to walk as Christ walked (Wesley, 2010:90).

For Wesley, Christian perfection is “renewal of the heart in the whole image of God” and becoming like Christ (Wesley, 2010:90). By this he meant sanctification. Even though he understood that Christians are not perfect in this earth, he asserted that Christians are indeed perfect because of Jesus Christ.

A Christian is so far perfect, as not to commit sin. This is the glorious privilege of every Christian, yea, though he be but a babe in Christ. But it is only of grown Christians it can be affirmed, they are in such a sense perfect, as, Secondly, to be freed from evil thoughts and evil tempers. First, from evil or sinful thoughts. Indeed, whence should they spring? ‘Out of the heart of man,’ if at all, ‘proceed evil thoughts.’ If, therefore, the heart be no longer evil, then evil thoughts no longer proceed out of it: For ‘a good tree cannot bring forth evil fruit’ (Wesley, 2019b:11).

Here Wesley acknowledges that ‘perfect’ can be understood in at least two senses. According to the first, even baby Christians are perfectly forgiven, since they are declared righteous even though in practice they may not be. In this sense, Wesley’s doctrine of Christian Perfection takes a similar approach as the doctrine of justification by faith. He says that “now the Word of God plainly declares that even those who are justified, who are born again in the lowest sense, do not continue in sin and that they cannot live any longer in it” (Russie, 2013:403).

According to the second sense, however, his view of Christian Perfection addresses the moral aspect: mature Christians can be “freed from evil thoughts and evil tempers”. Quoting John 5:18, he says that “whoever is born of God does not sin; but he who has been born of God keeps himself, and the wicked

one does not touch him". Wesley understood that one who has been born of God does not sin willfully and habitually (Russie, 2013:403).

Therefore, there is a Christian perfection that comes about through justification, and a Christian perfection that can be grown by the Spirit. It follows that he understands the Christian's life as a progressive process of sanctification, as the Puritans believed. For Wesley, thus, sanctification is the work of the Holy Spirit predicated on the work of Christ, as the Puritans believed and taught.

2.5 Anabaptists' understanding of Christian life as sanctification

In Anabaptism there is no special theological category called sanctification, but most Anabaptist writers address the topic with reference to the obedience that issues from Christian faith and life. When they write about this matter, they explain that sanctification finds its basis in Christology.

All Anabaptists are united in emphasizing that the confession of Jesus as Lord must be combined with obedience to his words. If obedience is not there, the faith is, by definition, counterfeit (Klaassen, 1981:27).

Like other Reformers, Anabaptists say that Jesus made atonement and peace. Jesus gave the Holy Word so that Christians can become children through faith. Hubmaier, an Anabaptist theologian (1480–1528), wrote:

He has made peace between you and me, who am a poor sinner, and has won, through his obedience, an inheritance for me. He has now given me strength through the Holy Word which he has sent, so that I may become your child through faith (Hubmaier, 1981a:28).

Likewise, Melchior Hoffman (1495–1543) says,

No flesh can become good through any work except through an innocent death, that is, through a pure flesh without spot that was not from the cursed seed (Hoffman, 1981:31).

Thus, in this point, Anabaptists agree with justification by faith but they go further from this point. Like the Puritans, who understand that sanctification is progressive, Anabaptists believe that salvation is an ongoing process throughout life because Anabaptists agree that the process of salvation begins with God's gracious act in Jesus Christ. Balthasar Hubmaier also says:

Now, we do not wish to be mouth Christians only, to boast and say: O yes, we believe that Jesus Christ suffered agony and death for us. Rather, faith must express itself also in love to God and the neighbour. Thus John teaches us when he says: "Little children, let us not love in word or speech but in deed and truth. By this we shall know that we are of the truth" (1 John 3:18). Faith must be active in love (Hubmaier, 1981b:51).

So, justification by faith bears the fruit of faith which is obedience. In this point, Anabaptists do not agree with Luther's separation of works from faith, or action from confession. Rather, Anabaptists believe that works are a part of faith, and faith is not faith without works (Klaassen, 1981:49). Hans Denck understood that faith is obedience to God and confidence in His promise through Jesus Christ. He wrote,

... whoever submits his will to the will of God, he is free for good and imprisoned for good. Whoever does not so submit his will is free for evil and imprisoned for evil. Whoever is one's master frees one to do in his service whatever he desires. God coerces no one to remain in his service whom love does not coerce. The devil, however, is unable to force anyone to stay in his service, who has once seen the truth (Denck, 1981:55).

This shows that, for Anabaptists, the Christian's life or sanctification consists in following Jesus Christ in the service of obedience. Jacob Kautz said,

Jesus Christ of Nazareth has not suffered for us or made satisfaction for us in any way unless we stand in his footsteps, walk the way he blazed before us, and follow the command of the Father as the Son, everyone in his measure (Kautz, 1981:57).

These Anabaptists agreed that salvation is a daily process through faith in Jesus Christ. As Jacob Hutter said, quoting Galatians 5:16 and Romans 8:12-13,

All those who live and walk in the spirit do not fulfill the lusts of the flesh. For through the spirit they mortify the works of the body and are no longer debtors to the flesh (Hutter, 1981:73).

In summary, as others in the Reformed tradition understood, Anabaptists also agreed on justification by faith and sanctification by faith, which is obedience.

2.6 Historical understanding of the relation between sanctification and the role of community

The role of the Christian community in the sanctification of believers is a crucial question for this dissertation. Martin Luther dealt with the question when addressing the doctrine of the church, which is the community of the saints. The Holy Spirit sanctifies the saints through the community. He wrote:

... the Holy Ghost effects our sanctification by the following parts, namely, by the communion of saints or the Christian Church, the forgiveness of sins, the resurrection of the body, and the life everlasting; that is, He first leads us into His holy congregation, and places us in the bosom of the Church, whereby He preaches to us and brings us to Christ (Luther, 2010:83).

Luther did not understand a believer's sanctification separately from the church. He did not believe that people can be sanctified by themselves. Therefore, he viewed the church as the mother of believers.

For, in the first place, He has a peculiar congregation in the world, which is the mother that begets and bears every Christian through the Word of God, which He reveals and preaches, [and through which] He illumines and kindles hearts, that they understand, accept it, cling to it, and persevere in it (Luther, 2010:84).

This means that, for Luther, outside the church there is no forgiveness and no sanctification (Luther, 2010:86). He understood the church to be the place of Christian sanctification.

Therefore, we believe in Him who through the Word daily brings us into the fellowship of this Christian Church, and through the same Word and the forgiveness of sins bestows, increases, and strengthens faith in order that when He has accomplished it all, and we abide therein, and die to the world and to all evil, He may finally make us perfectly and forever holy; which now we expect in faith through the Word (Luther, 2010:87).

Like Luther, Calvin also dealt with the importance of the church as the ‘mother’ for the believer’s sanctification. He wrote:

I will begin with the Church, into whose bosom God is pleased to collect his children, not only that by her aid and ministry they may be nourished so long as they are babes and children, but may also be guided by her maternal care until they grow up to manhood, and, finally, attain to the perfection of faith (Calvin, *Institutes*, 4.1.1, 1045).

As Luther explained the church as the mother, Calvin used a similar expression, “maternal care”. So, believers, once they are called by God, should be united with other saints in the fellowship of Christ (Calvin, *Institutes*, 4.1.3, 1047).

For if they are truly persuaded that God is the common Father of them all, and Christ their common head, they cannot but be united together in brotherly love, and mutually impart their blessings to each other (Calvin, *Institutes*, 4.1.3, 1047).

The understanding of the New Testament is that believers, who are the “saints” (Greek *hagioi*, holy ones) are members of the church (Greek *ekklēsia*) and are called to congregate. So, Calvin’s understanding of the church is similar to that

of Luther: it is the place, designated by God, where believers are nurtured in faith and developed in Christian sanctification and holiness.

The Puritan understanding of the community of saints is based on communion, which is fellowship with God, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. John Owen mentioned this in his comment on the fellowship of believers:

In 1 John 1:3, the apostle assures those to whom he wrote that the fellowship of believers “is with the Father, and with his Son Jesus Christ.” The expression he uses speaks with such force that we have rendered it, “Truly our fellowship is with the Father, and with his Son Jesus Christ” (Owen, 2003:11).

Owen saw that this fellowship with God and the Son is a unique fellowship accomplished by grace. The saints have communion with God in grace, and they have from him all kinds of grace, and in that they have fellowship with the Son (Owen, 2003:54). The Puritans also believed that family and corporate discipline are necessary for the believer’s sanctification:

The Puritans emphasized worship in private and within families as well as in the greater family of the church. They urged the explanation and application of the Word to families and society, because the Word is effectual in softening hearts. And they urged participation in the sacraments, which make the Word visible (Beeke, 2012: loc. 20239).

John Wesley insisted that sanctification cannot be attained individually, and thus the role of the community is essential; it is done together.

Accordingly, our blessed Lord, when his disciples were in their weakest state, sent them forth, not alone but two by two. When they were strengthened a little, not by solitude but by abiding with him and one another, he commanded them to wait not separate but being assembled together, for the promise of the Father (Wesley, 1739:vi).

He wrote that the Gospel of Christ is social, so that holiness is social holiness (Wesley, 1739:viii). Therefore, Wesley's concept of sanctification depends on the community and is socially based.

Ye are taught of God, "not to forsake the assembling of yourselves together, as the manner of some is", but to instruct, admonish, exhort, reprove, comfort, confirm, and every way build up one another" (Wesley, 1739:ix).

Outler summarizes Wesley's concept of the church (cited by Snyder, 1978:41):

- 1) The unity of the church is based upon the Christian koinonia in the Holy Spirit.
- 2) The holiness of the church is grounded in the discipline of grace which guides and matures the Christian life from its threshold in justifying faith to its plerophory in sanctification.
- 3) The catholicity of the church is defined by the universal outreach of redemption, the essential community of all true believers.
- 4) The apostolicity of the church is gauged by the succession of apostolic doctrine in those who have been faithful to the apostolic witness.

In summary, early reformers understood that sanctification can be achieved not by an individual but by the church as the community of believers, and the calling of believers is to build one another up together for the kingdom of God.

2.7 Conclusion

Even though there is now much controversy among pastors and scholars, the one thing that historical writers were focused on was the Christian life, whether they used the word sanctification or not. Luther understood that people cannot be justified or made righteous by their own effort: it is only done by the work of God. But justification is the beginning of sanctification. John Calvin says in his

Institutes of the Christian Religion that the Holy Spirit is the bond which unites us with Christ, bringing both reconciliation and renewal. Puritans talk about the doctrine of sanctification from the perspective of purity: it is a progressive work through the believer's communion with God. Through John Wesley, the doctrine of sanctification became widespread in the Christian world. The doctrine of sanctification is a way to understand the work of God and the work of the Holy Spirit. Furthermore, all these reformers understood that the church, the community of believers, is the place for Christian sanctification. For all these writers, even though their ways of approaching sanctification are somewhat different, and even though they emphasize different aspects, they agree that the process of sanctification is a continuing process, involving understanding God's work in salvation, responding to God's work, and seeing the fruit of God's work in one's life. In the next chapter, this dissertation will examine the biblical and theological meaning of sanctification in both the Old Testament and the New Testament.

CHAPTER 3. Biblical and theological understanding of sanctification and discipleship

The previous chapter dealt with historical approaches to sanctification through the specific perspectives of Luther, Calvin, the Puritans, and Wesley. The present chapter highlights aspects of sanctification as this concept is presented in Scripture. It examines the elements of positioned and progressive sanctification.

3.1 Sanctification in the Old Testament

In the Old Testament, there is no exact word that denotes sanctification, but there is a certain word group that relates to sanctification. The root שדק [qadash] can form a noun or adjective or verb. Howard (2006:41) says that “the word group שדק is most consistently presented in terms of who God is and who the rest of creation is in relation to God.” When it occurs as a verb, its form is שדק [qâdash] and the form of the noun or adjective is שדק [qâdôsh] (Holladay and Köhler, 1988:313).

3.1.1 שדק [kadosh] as noun/adjective

When it is used as a noun or adjective, its meanings are “holy, holy thing, holiness, holy area, and so on” (Holladay and Köhler, 1988:314). Holiness in the Old Testament is one of God’s attributes. God, through holiness, shows to his

chosen people that God himself is distinct from the world. Thus, the first meaning of holiness in the Old Testament applies to God's distinctive nature. This word shows the otherness or distinctness of God's attributes, words, and activities. Specifically, God's holiness is associated with his sovereignty, awesomeness, and majesty (Peterson, 1995: loc. 205). God's holiness shows his chosen people the unique attributes of God. Therefore, when God says, "For I am the LORD your God. Consecrate yourselves, therefore, and be holy, for I am holy" (Lev. 11:44) he leads his people to understand his own distinctive attribute of holiness. The holiness of God also shows the distance between God and humanity. Howard (2006:43) writes, "All the rituals and acts of consecration were designed to reveal the impossibility of achieving, much less maintaining, holiness." God's holiness also applies to everything related to God. In Exodus 3:4–5, when God reveals himself to Moses, he tells Moses that the land where God stands or exists is a holy place.

When the LORD saw that he turned aside to see, God called to him out of the bush, "Moses, Moses!" And he said, "Here I am." Then he said, "Do not come near; take your sandals off your feet, for the place on which you are standing is holy ground."

Thus, God's distinctive holiness applies not only to God himself, but also to everything related to him, including God's creatures. Therefore, the word "holy" in the Old Testament relates to the holiness of God. Human holiness is transmitted from God to his people, and God is the only source and foundation of this holiness (Peterson, 1995: loc. 318). From this point moral holiness can be applied to humanity. Peterson writes that "an important dimension to God's separateness and distinctness is his moral purity and perfection" (Peterson,

1995: loc. 210). The holiness of God, in fact, is not separated from his moral purity and perfection because the holiness of God shows that God is only good. After God's redeeming work from Egypt, he ordered his people to be a holy nation.

After Sinai, the ritual provisions of the covenant were meant to sustain Israel as a holy nation. Elaborate instructions were given for consecrating Aaron and his sons as priests. Here the emphasis was on separation, purification and initiation into a distinctive role before God, as representatives of the people (Peterson, 1995: loc. 265).

Thus, when the holiness of God is applied to humanity, "God's sanctifying presence would continue to mark them as a holy people and demand holiness of living as a response" (Peterson, 1995: loc. 275). Therefore, the concept of moral holiness is related with God and his holiness. Peterson writes further:

In this framework of thought, the command to 'sanctify yourselves' meant 'live as those who know God's character and will and delight to please him'. By keeping his ritual, moral and social laws, the people of Israel would not profane his holy name before the nations. Rather, they would demonstrate God's virtues and the benefit of being 'a people holy to the LORD ... chosen out of all the peoples on earth to be his people, his treasured possession' (Peterson, 1995: loc. 281).

However, holiness cannot be achieved by any human effort because it is God's unique attribute first. It is imparted from God to humans when they are in a relationship with God.

3.1.2 קָדַשׁ [*qâdash*] as a verb

When it occurs as a verb in the Old Testament, it can refer either to God making his people holy through covenant and redemption or to the people making themselves holy by obedience, consecration and cultic practices.

God making his people holy through covenant and redemption

When it is used as a verb, its meaning first is “to pronounce the thing to be holy, to consecrate, dedicate, and treat as holy and so on” (Holladay and Köhler, 1988:313). God’s command that the Israelites were to consecrate themselves was based on the covenant that he had already made with them, to set them apart as his own holy people. As Peterson (1995: loc. 318) says, holiness is a condition or status which God imparts to people who are chosen by God, and God brings them into special relationship with himself through covenant and redemption. Thus, sanctification as an act of God in making his people holy is a “transition from the realm of the profane to that of direct association with God” (Toon, 1983:37).

The people making themselves holy

By obedience, consecration and cultic practices people could make themselves holy before God and before the nations (Pardosi, 2015:777). To sanctify oneself is to purify or consecrate oneself according to God’s commands. God chose the Israelites as his people for the purpose of blessing the nations, and when they obeyed God’s commands, the nations would know that they were God’s chosen people.

And the LORD has declared today that you are a people for his treasured possession, as he has promised you, and that you are to keep all his commandments, and that he will set you in praise and in fame and in honor high above all nations that he has made, and that you shall be a people holy to the LORD your God, as he promised (Deut. 26:18–19).

This passage shows that Israel is the holy community of God. This community, the people of God, should walk with God in proper obedience to his commandments in order to demonstrate their relationship with God.

The people responded by affirming that the Lord was their God and that they would walk in his ways, keep his statutes, commands, and ordinances and obey him (Lev. 26:17) (Evans, 2019: loc. 403).

God responded to the people through the covenant that he made with them, clearly showing the relationship between God and his people.

God responded with his covenant promise that if his people would keep all his commands, he would elevate them to praise, fame, and glory above all the nations and make them a holy people to himself (Evans, 2019: loc. 403).

That is why God gave his commandments not to a person but to the whole congregation. He said, “Speak to all the congregation of the people of Israel and say to them, You shall be holy, for I the LORD your God am holy” (Lev 19:2).

The subsequent text in this passage, Leviticus 19, shows that the people (the congregation of God) should, by their right posture towards God and their loving conduct, demonstrate God's holiness to their neighbours. As the community belonging to God, they have the communal responsibility to spread God's holiness to the nations. Toon notes that this would be a faithful response to the call of God, “who had liberated them from the slavery of Egypt and was about to renew (in a special form of administration) the covenant of grace he had made with their ancestor, Abraham” (Toon, 1983:37). Therefore, the concept of holiness or sanctification is related to the covenant of God and Israel's perpetual relationship with God. This relationship is not based on individuals, but on God's call to them to be a holy nation.

By his call and covenant the Lord made his people holy; but they expressed this sanctification in terms of making themselves holy in the ways God directed. They thereby showed that they belonged to the holy Lord and were not as other nations (Toon, 1983:37).

When the Israelites joined with God by God's calling, they became the holy nation and they were set apart from the world. And then, by God's choice or election, "his choice of Israel involved their sanctification so they could be God's instrument in reaching the other nations" (Howard, 2006:48).

3.1.3 Exegesis of שָׁדָשׁ [*qâdash*] in Leviticus

In order to deal with the concept of holiness, it is good to investigate the book of Leviticus because it talks about the relationship between holiness and the ethics of living for the Israelites (Lasor, 1982:91). Moreover, it talks about God's attributes and will for Israel in the law which he gave them (Wenham, 1979: loc. 207).

In Leviticus, the words for 'sanctify' and 'holy' (שָׁדָשׁ [*qâdash*], or שִׁדָּשׁ [*qadosh*]) occur in total 78 times among 171 in the five books of Moses (E-sword Bible program, ESV). One of the main ideas of Leviticus is the "call to be holy for I am holy." This appears in Leviticus two times in Chapter 11 and three times in Chapters 19 and 20 (Wenham, 1979: loc. 2374).

3.1.4 "Be holy, for I am holy" in Leviticus 11:44 and 45

When God let Israel know that he is holy, he instituted the laws that deal with things clean and unclean. After the death of Nadab and Abihu, God set out ritual ceremonies for Israel. Leviticus 11 to 15 deals with ritual purity. In Chapter 11, it is about clean and unclean animals, births in Chapter 12, skin diseases

and growths in garments and on walls of a house in Chapters 13 and 14, and bodily emissions in Chapter 15. Hartley (1992:353) writes,

The standard of ritual purity in the Old Testament is built on the view of God's holiness and of human earthly existence being under the curse of death.

Chapter 11 deals with clean and unclean animals. The Israelites could keep and eat only clean animals and birds to keep themselves holy. After that, God let them know that they should be holy because he is holy. Leviticus 11:44~45 says,

For I am the LORD your God. *Consecrate yourselves* (שׁוֹדֵשׁ [qâdash]) therefore, and be *holy* (שׁוֹדֵשׁ [qadosh]), for I am *holy* (שׁוֹדֵשׁ [qadosh]). You shall not defile yourselves with any swarming thing that crawls on the ground. For I am the LORD who brought you up out of the land of Egypt to be your God. You shall therefore be *holy* (שׁוֹדֵשׁ [qadosh]), for I am *holy* (שׁוֹדֵשׁ [qadosh]).

When God called Israel as his chosen people, he gave them these purity laws that they should keep. Moreover, they were called to be and act like God (Wenham, 1979: loc. 2367). These laws showed them that they were set apart from the world to God, as the clean animals were set apart from the unclean animals.

They were perpetual reminders of God's grace to Israel. As the laws distinguished clean from unclean animals, so the people were reminded that God has distinguished them from all the other nations on earth to be his own possession (Wenham, 1979: loc. 2370).

This law of food shows that God is distinct from the world because he is holy, so they should be holy as God is.

These are regulations that God has the right to require since God is the one who saved them and who delivered them from slavery in Egypt. God

acted on their behalf so that as a free people this liberating God would be their God. As a result, since their God is holy, God's people must be holy (Yoder, 2017: loc. 1968).

Because these laws related to food, "ritual purity was a vital dimension of daily life in ancient Israel" (Hartley, 1992:353). They assume that holiness should be practiced in the daily life of the Israelites. This law reminded the Israelites at every meal that they were God's chosen people (Wenham, 1979: loc. 2245).

As they distinguished between clean and unclean foods, they were reminded that holiness was more than a matter of meat and drink but a way of life characterized by purity and integrity (Wenham, 1979: loc. 2245).

Therefore, when God gave this law of the food, it made them realize the relationship with God, and that their God was holy. He was unique, distinct from other gods. So, when they followed the law, it made them holy, which means being consecrated by God.

These laws symbolized God's choice of Israel. They served as constant reminders of God's electing grace. As he had limited his choice among the nations to Israel, so they for their part had to restrict their diet to certain animals. At every turn these laws reminded them of God's grace toward Israel (Wenham, 1979: loc. 2414).

Therefore, the law of food shows God's choice and will for Israel first and then it makes Israel a holy nation just as God is holy.

3.1.5 "Be holy, for I am holy" in Leviticus 20:7 and 26

As the laws of food and the clean and the unclean from Leviticus 11 to 16 show holiness based on daily life, Leviticus 20 deals with social and ethical applications of holiness. Chapter 20 is a repetition and summarization of

Chapters 18 and 19. It starts with punishments for people who offer a child to Molek and for the community that fails to punish them. This chapter also deals with the matter of sexual offenses and the matter of sorcery. In fact, Leviticus from 18 to 27 is dealing with the matter of social ethics. Chapter 18 is about unlawful sexual relations and Chapter 19 deals with loving the neighbours. If these social laws are broken, it is like breaking the society. Therefore, holiness in Leviticus is not just a religious matter but a public concern for the society.

In Leviticus, holiness is not a religious virtue, but a public virtue that shapes our “secular” lives. It is about how we live. For Leviticus, obedience, holiness, and being God’s people are inseparable (Yoder, 2017: loc. 3365).

In Chapter 18, God let Moses and Israel know why they should follow these regulations to be holy.

You shall not do as they do in the land of Egypt, where you lived, and you shall not do as they do in the land of Canaan, to which I am bringing you. You shall not walk in their statutes. You shall follow my rules and keep my statutes and walk in them. I am the LORD your God (Lev. 18:3-4).

Israelites should not follow the cultures of other nations such as Egypt and Canaan because these nations were not holy, according to God’s standards.

Both Egypt and Canaan practiced or tolerated forms of incest, adultery, homosexuality, and bestiality. Not only the biblical texts (Gen 19:5–8; 39; Ezek 16:26; 23:3, 19–20) but also Egyptian myths impute practices to gods and goddesses also known in the society... Practices include, among others, Baal’s copulation with a heifer and El’s explicit sexual involvement with two goddesses referred to as his daughters... Thus the Bible correctly distinguishes Egyptian and Canaanite customs from those of other ancient Near Eastern peoples (Hess, 2017:239).

If the Israelites practiced the cultures of other nations, they could not follow God’s word and they could not keep themselves holy. Therefore the regulations

in Chapter 18 and 19 show the relation between God's commands and their obedience.

These commandments allow the Israelites to actualize their faith and experience the covenant and its blessings (Lev 26:3–13; Dt 28:1–14). It is not that their obedience earns God's favor, but that the favor, already given freely by God, grows and flourishes in the life of obedience (Hess, 2017:239).

Chapter 20 has two parts; the first specifies punishment for child sacrifice and other matters (vv.1–9) and the second deals with punishments for sexual immorality (vv.10–21). In this chapter, God let them know that they should avoid other spiritual powers such as Molech (ESV) and necromancers (ESV) because God is the only legitimate source of power for their life. Then God said to them,

Consecrate yourselves, therefore, and be holy, for I am the LORD your God. Keep my statutes and do them; I am the LORD who sanctifies you (Lev. 20:7-8).

According to these verses, the Israelites could sanctify themselves by keeping and practicing the regulations.

Israelites sanctify themselves by keeping the commands of God because obedience is God's means of making them holy (Yoder, 2017: loc. 3410). Therefore, the Israelites should make the proper obedience to God's commands in the Promised Land which God had given them. That land which they would enter was plentiful and was the gift of God who had set them apart from other people (Yoder, 2017: loc. 3434). Their obedience to God through the regulations could make them realize who God is, and other nations could know the holiness of God.

Israel's holiness requires distinction from the practices of foreign nations and adherence to a separate way, whether in diet, worship, or sexual

practices. By avoiding activities that would tie Israel with the deities of other peoples, they recognize their God alone (Hess, 2017:268).

When God gave these regulations, they included penalties. This means that if they did not live as God's holy chosen people, the message of God could not be spread out to the other nations. So, holiness and being holy was their duty as God's chosen people to let other nations know that God is holy.

In conclusion, Leviticus 18 and 20 emphasize that God's holiness is the basis of individual and community holiness. Leviticus 18 teaches obedience to God's commands while Chapter 20 talks about the matter of sin and its penalty when they do not keep it.

3.1.6 Conclusion

The concept of holiness in the Old Testament represents God's uniqueness and distinctness from this world. It also shows God's majesty being separated from humanity. But then it leads humanity to be distinct and separated from the world, not because of their uniqueness but because of their relationship with God who is holy and unique. Holiness is not a human achievement but the impartation of God when the human is in relationship with God. Moreover, holiness in the Old Testament is not just a matter of individual practices, but also a matter of social ethics, as Leviticus 18 and 20 indicate.

3.2 Sanctification in the New Testament

While *qadosh* [קדוש] is used in the Old Testament, the word group *agía-* is used for sanctification or holiness in the New Testament. As holiness in the Old Testament is shown to be an aspect of God's nature, as well as his purpose for the Israelites as his covenant community, the New Testament shows continuity with this perspective. In the New Testament holiness or sanctification is denoted by the verb *hagiazō* [ἁγιάζω], the noun *hagiasmos* (Rom 6:19) or *hagiasyne* (1 Thess. 3:13), and the adjective *hagios* in several of Paul's letters (Vine, 1952:226). When the New Testament writers used these words, they referred first to the believer's status or position in Jesus Christ, and then to the believer's progressive life in Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit.

3.2.1 The nouns *hagiasmos* and *hagiasyne*

When it is used as a noun (*hagiasmos* or *hagiasyne*), it means to be set apart to God (Vine, 1952:226). When Peter wrote in the greeting of his letter, *en hagiasmō pneumatos* (1 Peter 1:2), he referred to the sanctifying work of the Spirit. The preposition *en* may be used in various ways, with a locative, instrumental, distributional or spherical sense, though its basic meaning is 'in' or 'in the realm of' (Porter, 1994:156). Here, the Spirit is the cause of the believer's sanctification. Peter thought that the new status (in the sanctification of the Spirit) is caused by the work of God.

God's choice has been effected by the sanctifying work of the Holy Spirit. The purpose of this action was to create a people who would obey Jesus Christ and be sprinkled by his blood (Thiessen, 2009:12).

When Paul said “For this is the will of God, your sanctification (ἁγιασμός)” in 1 Thessalonians 4:3, it is the process of making holy, while ἁγιωσύνη in 3:13 indicates being holy (Bruce, 2017:3580). And, when Paul referred to holiness (ἁγιασμῶ) in 1 Thessalonians 4:7, it implies that “sanctification is part of the Christian calling; by calling his people God sanctifies them in the sense of setting them apart for himself” (Bruce, 2017: loc. 3698). Therefore, a believer’s sanctification or holiness is the state which is predetermined by God for believers (Vine, 1952:225) and it requires a process led by the Spirit as Peter indicated, “according to the foreknowledge of God the Father, in the sanctification of the Spirit, for obedience to Jesus Christ and for sprinkling with his blood” (1 Peter 1:2).

The idea that the Spirit sanctifies indicates not simply a positional change when God reached out to them, but a practical change in lifestyle for the better, from a less holy lifestyle to one that is set apart for God (Davids, 2016:33).

As Peter indicated the believer’s state, Paul also showed that believers are in the state of sanctification in the Spirit, and that the Holy Spirit is the agent of this sanctification (Wallace, 2000:168). While ἁγιασμός shows the state or position of believers in God, ἁγιωσύνη in 1 Thessalonians 3:13 shows the quality of the believer’s personal conduct:

... so that he may establish your hearts blameless in holiness (ἁγιωσύνη) before our God and Father, at the coming of our Lord Jesus with all his saints (1 Thess. 3:13).

This shows that God will make the believers blameless in the state of sanctification and it will be accomplished by the power of Jesus Christ, as Paul said in Romans 1:4.

... and was declared to be the Son of God in power according to the Spirit of holiness (ἁγιωσύνη) by his resurrection from the dead, Jesus Christ our Lord (Rom. 1:4).

Paul uses the word ἁγιασμός in Romans 6:22—"the fruit you get leads to sanctification (ἁγιασμός) and its end, eternal life"—and in 1 Thessalonians 4:7—"for God has not called us for impurity, but in holiness (ἁγιασμός)".

Different English versions translate ἁγιασμός as "sanctification", "holiness", or "holy life." Therefore, the words "holiness" and "sanctification" appear to be interchangeable in Paul's letters. These two verses show that sanctification is not a human work but the work of God, especially "his calling to make them set apart to God" (Bruce, 2017: loc. 3698). The use of the noun in the New Testament shows that holiness or sanctification is the believers' status before God and also their quality of conduct in Jesus Christ.

3.2.2 The verb ἁγιάζω: Jesus as the source of sanctification

The word ἁγιάζω is a verb and may be interpreted as "to consecrate, hallow, sanctify, treat as holy, and to set apart" as שָׁדַךְ does (Peterson, 1995: loc. 2338; Vine, 1952:227). When we read the Old Testament in LXX, ἁγιάζω is used to translate שָׁדַךְ and its general meaning of "to consecrate" in the New Testament is not different from the meaning in the Old Testament. In the New Testament, ἁγιάζω expresses a similar concept of holiness as that in the Old Testament.

The meaning of שָׁדַךְ in the Old Testament is to render or acknowledge to be

venerable, to hallow the subject, as it is used in Matthew 6:9, Isaiah 29:23 and Ezekiel 20:41 (StudyLight, 2020).

For when he sees his children, the work of my hands, in his midst, they will *sanctify* my name; they will *sanctify* the Holy One of Jacob and will stand in awe of the God of Israel. (Isa. 29:23)

Pray then like this: “Our Father in heaven, *hallowed* be your name” (Matt. 6:9).

When Jesus taught his disciples how to pray, he used this word in its passive form, ἁγιασθητω: “hallowed be your name” (Matt. 6:9). This expresses a desire not only to honour God but also to glorify his name by obedience to his commands, in preparation for the coming of the kingdom of God (Brown, 1986:227). Matthew 6:9 and Isaiah 29:23 focus on the fact that God’s character is holy and that God is hallowed or sanctified only by his people. Therefore, as שׁוֹמֵר refers first to God, ἁγιάζω also shows God’s character as holy. As holiness is the character of God, so ἁγιάζω means “to separate from things profane and to dedicate to God, to consecrate and so render inviolable” (StudyLight, 2020). So, when Deuteronomy 15:19 talks about the firstborn, it belongs to God and it should be consecrated (ἁγιασεῖς) to God.

All the firstborn males that are born of your herd and flock you shall *dedicate* to the LORD your God. You shall do no work with the firstborn of your herd, nor shear the firstborn of your flock.

Then, as שׁוֹמֵר refers to practical matters and progressive work in the community, ἁγιάζω also refers to purification for the people of Israel, as Leviticus 16:19 and 2 Samuel 11:4 show:

And he shall sprinkle some of the blood on it with his finger seven times, and cleanse it and consecrate (ἁγιασει) it from the uncleannesses of the

people of Israel (Lev. 16:19).

So David sent messengers and took her, and she came to him, and he lay with her. (Now she had been purifying [ἁγιαζομένη] herself from her uncleanness.) Then she returned to her house (2 Sam. 11:4) (StudyLight, 2020).

In the New Testament, the writers of Hebrews 9:13 and 1 Corinthians 6:11 use the verb in the same way (StudyLight, 2020):

For if the blood of goats and bulls, and the sprinkling of defiled persons with the ashes of a heifer, sanctify (ἁγιαζει) for the purification of the flesh (Hebrews 9:11)

And such were some of you. But you were washed, you were sanctified (ἡγιασθητε), you were justified in the name of the Lord Jesus Christ and by the Spirit of our God (1 Cor. 6:11).

Therefore, the usage and meaning of ἁγιαζω in the LXX and in the New Testament is the same as שָׁטַף, that is, to indicate God and his character first, and then the persons and things that are sanctified.

The verb ἁγιάζω occurs in John's Gospel several times. When John uses this word, it indicates "the special consecration of Jesus to do the will and work of the Father" (Brown, 1986:231). In John 17, Jesus prays to God for his disciples that they might be separated from the world. In this passage, the work of sanctification for believers in the truth refers to being separated from the world while being in the world:

And I am no longer in the world, but they are in the world, and I am coming to you. Holy Father, keep them in your name, which you have given me, that they may be one, even as we are one ... I have given them your word, and the world has hated them because they are not of the world, just as I am not of the world ... Sanctify (ἁγιασον) them in the truth; your word is truth (John 17:11, 14, 17).

John 17 shows that believers are sanctified by the truth and that the Father will keep them. Here Jesus did not pray for their purification. Rather, they “are set apart for God’s use” (Kruse, 2017:323).

The disciples were distinguished from the world by their acceptance of God’s word (17:14). Stated negatively, God’s word separated them from the world. Stated positively, it set them apart for God (Kruse, 2017:323).

Peter Ellis (1984:243) says that “the sanctification of the apostles in verse 18 must be referred to the apostles’ being set aside or called for the same mission as Jesus was.” Jesus’ prayer shows that this sanctification “is accomplished by his name (John 17:11), his word (John 17:14) and his truth (John 17:17)” (Howard, 2006:50). When it occurs in Hebrews, ἁγιάζω shows that Jesus is the source of the believer’s sanctification.

For he who sanctifies [Jesus] and those who are sanctified all have one source (2:11, ESV).

And by that will we have been sanctified through the offering of the body of Jesus Christ once for all (10:10).

So Jesus also suffered outside the gate in order to sanctify the people through his own blood (13:12).

Brown (1986:230) notes that all verses which use ἁγιάζω in Hebrews refer to the same source of sanctification: the verb ἁγιάζω “presents a highly specialized aspect of holiness. Christ, as the high priest, is the one who sanctifies his people, and officiates in a sanctuary not made with hands” (Brown, 1986:20).

Guthrie (1983) mentions that the common meaning of ἁγιάζω as “to make holy” cannot apply to Jesus.

In that case to sanctify meant to set aside for a holy purpose, a sense which is certainly more applicable to Jesus Christ. He who sanctifies is here the pioneer of salvation, who has nonetheless first sanctified himself (Guthrie, 1983:68).

Jesus is the sanctifier, so he is leading his people “into an experience through which he himself has passed”, having been set apart by God (Guthrie, 1983:68). Guthrie (1983:161) mentions that “the sanctification process is one which has never been completed except in Christ.”

Since Christ is perfectly sanctified through his perfect obedience to the will of God, it may be said that his sanctification is shared by all who believe (Guthrie, 1983:162).

Here the use of the verb ἁγιάζω shows that the source of sanctification is God himself and its process is through the sanctifier who is Jesus Christ.

3.2.3 The adjective ἅγιος: the sanctified community

When Paul uses the word as an adjective (ἅγιος), it is “functioning as an equivalent for Old Testament declarations about holiness being the essential will of God for his people” (Peterson, 1995: loc. 2378). The New Testament shows that holiness is an attribute of God’s deity. It is predicated of God “as the Holy One, in His purity, majesty and glory” (Vine, 1952:226).

Holiness in the New Testament expresses the uniqueness of God like the Old Testament does.

In the Old Testament, holiness revealed a unique status when compared to the common and unclean and revealed how far humanity was from God. This boundary between the holy and the common remains in view in the New Testament (Elliot, 2000:360, cited by Howard, 2006:49).

Therefore, when Paul addressed the believers in his letters, he wrote, “To all the saints (ἅγιοις) in Christ Jesus” (e.g., Phil. 1:1). When it is used as a plural word, it refers to “holy ones”, that is, the community of believers. However, when it was used commonly in the first century, it indicated the people of Israel because the Bible indicated them as “holy ones” several times, for example, in Psalm 16:3 and Daniel 7:18 (Dunn, 1996:48). Dunn writes of Paul’s use of this word to refer to believers:

The important inference is that Paul understood these Gentiles to have been incorporated into Israel, the people of God, through faith in and baptism in the name of Messiah Jesus—that is, without becoming Jewish proselytes (by being circumcised) (Dunn, 1996:48).

Therefore, it “is used regularly in Paul for believers as a whole” (Dunn, 1988:3621).

It implies (1) a special status, identity, and belonging (as “consecrated”); (2) an alternative character and manner of life (“holiness”); (3) a distinctive vocation and mission (as “devoted”) (Zerbe, 2016:44).

In Romans 1:7, Paul used a special phrase, κλητοῖς ἅγιοις, which means “called to be saints.” By this phrase Paul did not indicate a special person, title or role in the way that the Catholic and Orthodox churches do (e.g., St Peter, St Paul, etc.). When these groups use the word “saint” it means this:

In the strict sense saints are those who distinguish themselves by heroic virtue during life and whom the Church honors as saints either by her ordinary universal teaching authority or by a solemn definition called canonization (Catholic Dictionary, 2020).

Paul used this phrase “called to be saints” in 1 Corinthians 1:2 when he addressed the believers in Corinth. Believers cannot be “saints” by themselves; it is based on God’s calling. When God called them, they were saints, as God chose Israel as His nation, to be ἅγιοι. In the same manner, Frangipane (2011:22) says “personal maturity which is holiness will always be found in dynamic communion with the faith community.”

The holiness of the Christian can find expression only within the love and fellowship of the church. Our individual sanctification is part of God’s overall plan for the church (Frangipane, 2011:23).

When Paul mentions that the church is the body of Christ in Ephesians 1:22-23, this is because the church consists of believers who are called by Jesus Christ.

The Church of our text is made up of all true believers in the Lord Jesus Christ, of all who are really holy and converted people. It comprehends all who have repented of sin, and fled to Christ by faith, and been made new creatures in Him (Ryle, 2017:211).

When Peter also mentions the “holy nation” (ἔθνος ἅγιον) in 1 Peter 2:9, he describes the believers as a race chosen by God, a royal priesthood which is sacred to God, as in the Old Testament, and a holy nation which is set apart to God.

It has a special calling and a special purpose among the nations of the world. The church is unlike any other body of people. That the church is a holy nation suggests it will live by higher values and have different principles than other nations of the world (Thiessen, 2009:36).

This uniqueness implies that people are to be consecrated, separated from the unclean. This requirement is the same for the New Testament believers as it was for the Old Testament people of God.

3.3 Theological understanding of sanctification

As sanctification can be understood from the scriptural basis, but it can be seen also through theological reflection, approached through the categories of positional, progressive, and communal sanctification.

3.3.1 Sanctification is a positional status

Positional sanctification refers to one's status and identity before God. The believer's position is changed once they experience conversion.

Positional sanctification reflects the dominant relational aspect depicted by the Hebrew and Greek terms. It refers to our "position" before God which we enjoy by virtue of our new status in Christ (Grenz, 1994: loc. 6611).

When Paul wrote his letter to the Corinthian church, he addressed his audience like this: "To the church of God in Corinth, to those sanctified in Christ Jesus and called to be holy". Here sanctification can be understood as justification partly because it is the forensic declaration of our status before God (Grenz, 1994: loc. 6611). Humans cannot be righteous by themselves.

Holiness cannot simply be acquired by human effort. It is a status or condition which God imparts to those whom he chooses to bring into a special relationship with himself through covenant and redemption. But it is a status that carries with it particular responsibilities (Peterson, 1995: loc. 323).

The first step to understanding sanctification is to have a right understanding of one's status before God. The early church fathers used the term 'salvation' to refer to "the whole process by which human beings are restored to fellowship with God through the work of Christ and the bestowal of the Holy Spirit" (Rausch, 2000:57). 'Salvation' means to be righteous before God, but salvation can be understood as two parts: justification as positional (being made righteous) and sanctification as progressive (becoming righteous). That is why salvation covers the two terms, justification and sanctification. Thus, the term 'righteousness' is always two-dimensional in the Bible:

On the one hand it designates the righteousness that belongs to God alone; on the other had it refers to something that human beings receive from God and hence possess, and is properly called our righteousness (Rausch, 2000:61).

Positional sanctification is conferred by God to believers by faith as justification is done.

Positional sanctification, therefore, is an objective reality, a standing in righteousness, which is ours solely by virtue of the grace God extended to us in Christ and which the Holy Spirit applies to our lives. We receive this reality solely by faith (Grenz, 1994: loc. 6615).

On the basis of this positional sanctification, believers can go on to the progressive or conditional sanctification. While positional sanctification depicts the believer's status before God, progressive sanctification shows the believer's morality and character (Grenz, 1994: loc. 6619). Progressive sanctification is subjective while positional is objective (Grenz, 1994: loc. 6622). As positional sanctification is done by faith, progressive sanctification is also done by the

working of the Holy Spirit. The Spirit can give power to believers to overcome temptation and trials.

No temptation has overtaken you that is not common to man. God is faithful, and he will not let you be tempted beyond your ability, but with the temptation he will also provide the way of escape, that you may be able to endure it (1 Cor. 10:13).

Once the believer's status is changed by God, they enter the ongoing process of progressive sanctification by the Holy Spirit during their earthly life.

A sanctified life will continue to express what it means to be in an eternal relationship with the Holy one, through the work of his Son and by the gift of his Spirit (Peterson, 1995: loc. 1922).

God requested his people to be holy. Holiness did not mean a one-time process but an ongoing process during the whole of life. When God showed his sanctifying presence in the wilderness, it marked the Israelites as a holy people and demanded holiness of living as a response (Peterson, 1995: loc. 275). In Wayne Grudem's understanding of sanctification, he suggests three stages for its progress. The first is that "sanctification has a definite beginning at regeneration" (Grudem, 1994:747). Regeneration happens when the believer accepts Jesus Christ; this reception leads to a definite moral change.

This initial step, which is the moral change in sanctification, involves a definite break from the ruling power and love of sin, so that the believer is no longer ruled or dominated by sin and no longer loves to sin (Grudem, 1994:747).

The second stage for Grudem is that “sanctification increases throughout life” (Grudem, 1994:748). Numerous passages in the New Testament talk about this. For example,

Paul tells the Colossians that they should not lie to one another, since they have “put on the new nature, which is being renewed in knowledge after the image of its creator” (Col. 3:10), thus showing that sanctification even involves increasing likeness to God in our thoughts as well as our words and deeds (Grudem, 1994:749).

The last stage is that “sanctification is completed at death (for our souls) and when the Lord returns (for our bodies)” (Grudem, 1994:749). So in Grudem’s view, sanctification is a gradual and progressive work during the believer’s whole earthly life. He says that “sanctification is a progressive work of God and man that makes us more and more free from sin and like Christ in our actual lives” (Grudem, 1994:746).

3.3.2 Sanctification is a progressive work

Paul mentions sanctification as the goal of Christian life. In both 2 Corinthians 7:1 and 1 Timothy 2:15 Paul views it as a process:

Since we have these promises, beloved, let us cleanse ourselves from every defilement of body and spirit, bringing holiness to completion in the fear of God (2 Cor. 7:1).

Yet she will be saved through childbearing—if they continue in faith and love and holiness, with self-control (1 Tim. 2:15).

Even though sanctification is the work of God (and especially the work of the Holy Spirit), it requires human accountability. It is the result or consequence of

God's calling, as Paul used the phrase κλητοὶς ἁγίοις (Rom. 1:7, 1 Cor. 1:2).

Believers are accountable to God to fulfil this calling in association with the Holy Spirit, as Brown (1986:229-230) writes:

Christ is their sanctification as well as their righteousness and redemption (1 Cor. 1:30), and thus the one in whom they become holy to the true God.... Sanctification is like the growth of fruit which results in eternal life (Rom. 6:19-22). Spiritual, rational worship is the offering of oneself as a living, holy sacrifice, acceptable to God (Rom. 12:1).

As holiness characterises the chosen people's lifestyle in the Old Testament, sanctification in the New Testament demands a consecrated lifestyle for the believers. Paul writes in 1 Thessalonians 4:3–4,

For this is the will of God, your sanctification: that you abstain from sexual immorality; that each one of you know how to control his own body in holiness and honor, not in the passion of lust like the Gentiles who do not know God.

Then Paul says that "God has not called us for impurity, but in holiness" (4:7).

This indicates that "holiness as a way of life flows from consecration to God in Christ" (Peterson, 1995: loc. 2382). Thus Paul's words show that sanctification necessarily has an ethical quality. The presentation of sanctification in the New Testament implies that holiness is a progressive work and that it is developed through daily life. However, it must issue from Christ and be grown in Christ, as Paul mentions in Ephesians 3:16-17:

... that according to the riches of his glory he may grant you to be strengthened with power through his Spirit in your inner being, so that Christ may dwell in your hearts through faith—that you, being rooted and grounded in love...

Peterson (1995: loc. 168) says, “From the moment of initiation into Christ, growth in holiness has been expected in the context of everyday life and experience.” Paul mentions daily progress in Philippians 2:12:

Therefore, my beloved, as you have always obeyed, so now, not only as in my presence but much more in my absence, work out your own salvation with fear and trembling.

This verse may be seen as problematic. Some think that it implies that salvation is completed by human work—“self-help salvation” (Boice, 1971:162). Others believe that salvation can be started by Jesus and achieved by their own work. However, Paul also mentions the reason why they could work out their own salvation. It is because they are in Jesus Christ: “for it is God who works in you, both to will and to work for his good pleasure” (Phil 2:13). Boice comments on this:

Because you are already saved, because God has already entered your life in the person of the Holy Spirit, because you, therefore, have His power at work within you—because of these things you are now to strive to express this salvation in your conduct (Boice, 1971:162).

Therefore, because God enables people to work out their own salvation, they can do it (Zerb, 2016:157). Although this verse has attracted some controversy regarding faith and works, it shows that salvation (implying sanctification) requires daily work on the part of the believer—specifically, obedience to the Lord, because, as Paul says in 1 Corinthians 6:19, “You are not your own.” That is why he uses the words “work out” not “work for” (Evans, 2019: loc. 2077).

According to the New Testament, as ἐν ἁγιασμῷ πνεύματος declares, and as Hebrews illustrates with the verb ἁγιάζω, God is the source and the worker of

sanctification just as he is the source and the worker of holiness in the Old Testament. When Peter wrote his letter to the churches, he clearly indicated that God's people have been chosen "according to the foreknowledge of God the Father, in the sanctification of the Spirit, for obedience to Jesus Christ and for sprinkling with his blood" (1 Peter 1:2). Peterson (1995: loc. 339) writes,

Just as Israel was maintained as a holy people by God's presence in their midst and his provision of the priesthood and rituals of the Mosaic Covenant, so Christians are sustained in holiness by the ongoing presence of the Holy Spirit and the trust that he gives in the finished work of Christ (Peterson, 1995: loc. 339).

Sanctification in the New Testament is always linked to the work of Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit in believers.

In summary, the New Testament clearly shows that sanctification of believers, the people of God, characterises their way of life through the guidance of the Holy Spirit, as the people of God of the Old Testament had lived according to the Law of God after their redemption from Egypt. There are two elements: one, which is the redeeming work of Jesus, is done once for all; the other, which is the work of the Holy Spirit in the believers, is done continually until the end of the age (Toon, 1983:39).

3.3.3 Sanctification is a community matter

Sanctification in the Old Testament and the New Testament is both an individual and community matter. Paul mentions this several times in his letters, most of which were addressed to his communities. For example, when he talks

about the fruit of the Spirit, it is not only for an individual's life but for sharing the love of God to their neighbours. Galatians 5:13-14 says,

For you were called to freedom, brethren; only do not turn your freedom into an opportunity for the flesh, but through love serve one another, for the whole Law is fulfilled in one word, in the statement, "you shall love your neighbor as yourself."

Here, when Paul talks about love, he mentions that it fulfills the Law of God.

In the Old Testament, love reaches a high point in the context of the covenant that binds God and Israel. Love is covenantal. In that context, love expresses the commitment that sustains the relationship (Brunk, 2015: loc. 4837).

In Galatians 5:16 Paul writes to the Christian community, "Walk by the Spirit..." Howard (2006:142) comments that "the community is necessary to walk by the Spirit". When Jesus prayed to God for his disciples, he prayed for their sanctification. Peterson (1995: loc. 392) writes, "Jesus' first request for his disciples in the prayer of John 17 is expressed in these terms: 'Holy Father, protect them in your name that you have given me, so that they may be one, as we are one' (17:11)." Jesus is here talking about the unity of disciples. It is like the Israelites in the Old Testament.

... so Christians are sustained in holiness by the ongoing presence of the Holy Spirit and the trust that he gives in the finished work of Christ. The essential work of the Spirit is to enable belief in the gospel, so that the blessings it offers may be continually enjoyed by God's people (Peterson, 1995: loc. 339).

The New Testament is clear: sanctification begins when the individual is sanctified by God, and is then driven to the community to be built up together in holiness.

3.3.4 The sanctifying community is redeemed and missional

Even though it is not the central part of this thesis, it is good to deal with the missional implications of sanctification and community briefly in this part because God's holiness is applied to his chosen people first and then to the nations that are near Israel. When God redeemed Israel, he brought them out of Egypt, according to his plan. Part of God's purpose in sanctifying the community of Israel was mission to the other nations and to establish the missional community through Israel for his name's sake. At a later time, Ezekiel clearly expresses that purpose:

Therefore say to the house of Israel, Thus says the Lord GOD: It is not for your sake, O house of Israel, that I am about to act, but for the sake of my holy name, which you have profaned among the nations to which you came. And I will vindicate the holiness of my great name, which has been profaned among the nations, and which you have profaned among them. And the nations will know that I am the LORD, declares the Lord GOD, when through you I vindicate my holiness before their eyes (Ezek 36:22-23).

As the people who had experienced the true identity of God, Israel was to be the witness among the nations to God's acts of self-revelation and redemption (Wright, 2013:91). Although the role of the covenant was to make Israel separate from other nations and to create a holy nation to present God's glory and name (Wenham, 2009: loc. 2195), part of the role of the sanctified community was to participate in the mission of God as the missional community. As sanctification is a community matter, the concept of "solidarity of the redeemed community" (Howard, 2006:83) is valid here. When defines solidarity, it is "how God has given humanity in general and his people in

particular a common life with common concerns and responsibilities” (Howard, 2006:83). So, “Israel’s solidarity was both a gift and responsibility and was to be used to invite pagan nations into a life-changing relationship with God” (Lattey, cited by Howard, 2006:83). The solidarity of Israel in the Old Testament was generated through their relationship to God himself, through the Law, and through the Temple (Howard:2006:88).

God designed the three symbols to unite Israel, to promote the growth of his people because they belonged to a community, and to reach the world around them as a community representing him (Howard, 2006:89).

Jesus redefined these three symbols through his ministry. Jesus taught the disciples that he is the Son of God, the heart of the Law, and the temple of God through his ministry. Jesus had the authority to make a new covenant as God had created the covenant with his people. Just as the Law communicated how Israel was to live in harmony, Jesus affirmed this solidarity, by which all nations should be treated fairly and justly. All people will grow together in a relationship with Jesus (Howard, 2006:97). Gorman (2015) uses the words “anticipation” and “participation” to understand salvation:

Anticipatory participation means that the new creation of Christ-like love, *shalom*, reconciliation with God and one another, and restorative justice will come to expression in the present among those who live in God’s crucified and resurrected Messiah by the power of the Spirit (Gorman, 2015: loc. 345).

Thus love, *shalom*, and reconciliation with God and one another are missional. These encourage the formation of community, which is related to its own life and the life of the world (Gorman, 2015: loc. 350). N.T. Wright views “the church as a microcosmos, little world, as the prototype of what was to come” (cited by

Gorman, 2015: loc. 356). So Paul writes,

Now may our God and Father himself, and our Lord Jesus, direct our way to you, and may the Lord make you increase and abound in love for one another and for all, as we do for you, so that he may establish your hearts blameless in holiness before our God and Father, at the coming of our Lord Jesus with all his saints (1 Thess. 3:11–13)

Here the meaning of holiness is “a kind of participation in God that means participation in the world in a radically new and different way” (Gorman, 2015: loc. 1684). In Philippians 1:27–30 also, Paul is concerned that the believers’ “manner of life be worthy of the gospel of Christ ... with one mind striving side by side for the faith of the gospel.”

Only let your manner of life be worthy of the gospel of Christ, so that whether I come and see you or am absent, I may hear of you that you are standing firm in one spirit, with one mind striving side by side for the faith of the gospel, and not frightened in anything by your opponents. This is a clear sign to them of their destruction, but of your salvation, and that from God. For it has been granted to you that for the sake of Christ you should not only believe in him but also suffer for his sake, engaged in the same conflict that you saw I had and now hear that I still have (Phil. 1:27–30).

In this text, the identity of the church is missional because, for Paul, it embodies the gospel and becomes a witness to others (Gorman, 2015: loc. 362).

Therefore, the church, which is the progressively sanctified community of believers in Christ, is part of God’s mission.

3.4 The biblical concept of discipleship in the Old and the New

Testaments

For the study of the Anabaptist discipleship and the doctrine of sanctification, which is the subject of this thesis, it is important to deal with discipleship in the

Bible, just as this thesis has taken a biblical approach to the theory of sanctification in this chapter. Therefore, in this part, this paper will look at discipleship in the Old and New Testaments.

3.4.1 Discipleship in the Old Testament

Although the Old Testament does not explicitly mention or deal with discipleship, this chapter will look at what discipleship is through God's direct relationship with his people and the way God's people responded to him. The Old Testament also shows how Israel testified of God to the world through the relationship between God and his people, how God's laws were communicated to Israel, and how Israel followed God. The Old Testament tells us that the beginning of the world is God. The world began to exist as God spoke and commanded it.

God as the leader of all

God's providence in creation shows that God created and governs this world, and that all things in this world, including humans, are under God's leadership.

God as creator is obviously a unique and, in many ways, incomparable leader. He lays a foundation on which everything else is built (Rochester, 2020: loc. 203).

As a leader, God rules over the creation he has made, and has a relationship with those who are made in his image. Just as a potter's finger sensitively feels and molds clay, so God's hand gently touches and shapes the focus of his love, a humble man who digs the soil (Rochester, 2020: loc. 9). Genesis 3 shows that

God continues to be with this person in his daily life to provide an experience of sharing divine-human community (Rochester, 2020: loc. 9).

And they heard the sound of the Lord God walking in the garden in the cool of the day, and the man and his wife hid themselves from the presence of the Lord God among the trees of the garden (Gen. 3:8).

Although the man and the woman cannot fully obey God's law and are expelled from the Garden of Eden, God's leadership toward them continues to appear throughout the Old Testament. This shows that God's leadership is immutable and will continue to be manifested through his creation.

The steadfast love of the Lord never ceases; his mercies never come to an end; they are new every morning; great is your faithfulness (Lam. 3:22-23).

This God does not give up on humanity and continues to show his providence through the people he has chosen. Therefore, discipleship in the Old Testament takes the form of acknowledging God as the leader and responding to God's call. God is the eternal leader, and his called ones are portrayed as servants of God.

The people of God as servants of God

Genesis tells many stories of God choosing and calling people and using them. The stories of Noah, Abraham, Isaac, Jacob and Joseph illustrate how God calls them and uses them as his servants. These stories in Genesis have similar patterns and structures. For example, Abraham does not seek God first, but God appears and calls Abraham first. After that, God teaches Abraham what to do, where to go, and what kind of life to live. Moses, who is most

remembered as a servant of God, is no different. The God of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob appears to Moses, who lived an ordinary life as a shepherd. When he is not looking for God, nor praying any religious prayers, God appears to Moses. God's covenant with Abraham becomes a covenant of blessing for all nations, and it continues to flow through the next generation, especially through Moses in Exodus, as a concept of salvation.

Moving along the pathway of the Bible's grand narrative we come to the Exodus. Theologically we move from election to redemption. Missiologically we move from the man for all nations to the people redeemed to be God's priesthood in the midst of the nations (Wright, 2013:190).

In Exodus, we read that God tells Moses what to do as a servant of the Lord.

For example, God's instructions to Moses with regard to Aaron:

You shall speak to him and put the words in his mouth, and I will be with your mouth and with his mouth and will teach you both what to do. He shall speak for you to the people, and he shall be your mouth, and you shall be as God to him. And take in your hand this staff, with which you shall do the signs" (Exod. 4:15-17).

Acknowledging God's covenant, Moses rises up and takes courage to accept God's great plan to save the people of Israel from Egypt and to walk the way of the Lord. Thus, God's people, who have been chosen, redeemed, and called into covenant relationship, must live the life they are supposed to live, a life that is unique, holy, and ethical in the sight of God and in the eyes of the nations (Wright, 2013:190).

The people of God as the kingdom of God

In the Old Testament, the purpose of God's calling and using people is not primarily to give individual redemption, but to give the message of redemption to

the whole Hebrew nation, and eventually to all nations. The Ten Commandments in Exodus contain God's assurance that he will save the nation of Israel from Egypt and make them his own people and cause them to flourish. The Ten Commandments now show us, as Christian readers, how to live as God's holy community.

Israel will display to the rest of the world within its covenant community the kind of relationships, first to God and then to one another and to the physical world, that God intended originally for all of humanity (Gentry and Wellum, 2012:303).

The Ten Commandments begin with what God did to the Israelites:

And God spoke all these words, saying, "I am the Lord your God, who brought you out of the land of Egypt, out of the house of slavery (Exod. 20:1-2).

This shows that God had been protecting them in the wilderness, and that the difficult journey there was also prepared by God, and that he has protected them under his wings, and that he is preparing their future dwelling place (Gentry and Wellum, 2012:311). Moreover, Exodus describes the scene where God calls the people of Israel a kingdom of priests, showing that their identity not only keeps the covenant, but also actively witnesses and manifests the kingdom of God to all nations.

Now therefore, if you will indeed obey my voice and keep my covenant, you shall be my treasured possession among all peoples, for all the earth is mine; and you shall be to me a kingdom of priests and a holy nation. These are the words that you shall speak to the people of Israel (Exod. 19:5-6).

The Hebrew word for "kingdom" can refer to a domain or territory governed, or to the reign and exercise of sovereignty by a king. The word "priest," in terms of

its function, refers to a person who offers sacrifices on behalf of people before the presence of God (Gentry and Wellum, 2012:319). Therefore, Israel can be interpreted as a kingdom of priests who receive God's covenant through calling into a holy relationship with God, and who establish a connection between God and all nations for the fulfillment of that covenant. The term "nation" is a parallel term for kingdom. This is the economic, political and social structure in which the final head of government operates. This is the city of God, the kingdom of God. In fulfillment of the promise made to Abraham, Israel through the Mosaic covenant will provide a model of God's rule over human life under God's direct rule, which is God's purpose for the whole world (Gentry and Wellum, 2012:324).

In summary, although the Old Testament has no direct reference to discipleship, the relationship between God and his people shows that God first is the leader and sovereign of his people, and secondly that God has called the people, as his servants, to walk with God and obey the laws that God has given them. Finally, the concept of the kingdom of God, through the identity of his holy covenant people as a kingdom of priests, serves as a bridge between God and all nations. This shows that discipleship in the Old Testament is clearly the manifestation of God's will in the world through the community of God and his people.

3.4.2 Discipleship in the New Testament Gospels

The concern of this thesis is to study the relationship between sanctification and Anabaptist discipleship. It is thus necessary to look at the biblical definition of discipleship. The Bible, especially the New Testament, speaks of discipleship in

many places. However, in this thesis, it would be appropriate to focus on the four Gospels, in which the works and teachings of Jesus are revealed. When readers first read the Gospels, especially the Gospel of Matthew, they know that it is not about a theological doctrine, but about the story of Jesus and his disciples. Although there may be several themes, the central theme of Matthew's Gospel is the fulfillment of Jesus' commands. This is expressed clearly in Matthew's conclusion (28:18-20):

And Jesus came and said to them, "All authority in heaven and on earth has been given to me. Go therefore and make disciples of all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, teaching them to observe all that I have commanded you. And behold, I am with you always, to the end of the age" (Matt. 28:18-20).

Matthew, as one of the twelve disciples, may have written his Gospel as a way to guide a reader to understand the meaning of discipleship (Donaldson, 1996:30). For Matthew, this could be a fulfillment of Jesus' command to make disciples.

Jesus is the center of discipleship

Matthew used a narrative approach to show his readers what a disciple is and what life should be like as a disciple, and centered the story on Jesus. Thus, Matthew begins the story with the birth of Jesus. Unlike other Gospels, when Matthew talks about the birth of Jesus, he refers to the Old Testament extensively, showing that Jesus is the long-awaited Messiah, and because of him, the kingdom of God will come to Israel, and a shepherd will be given to those who had no shepherd, because Matthew understood what would happen. Thus Matthew's story begins with Israel, the people of God and the people of

Jesus, suffering the consequences of their sins, in need of a shepherd and a savior (Donaldson, 1996:34).

They told him, "In Bethlehem of Judea, for so it is written by the prophet: 'And you, O Bethlehem, in the land of Judah, are by no means least among the rulers of Judah; for from you shall come a ruler who will shepherd my people Israel'" (Matt. 2:5-6).

This is an introduction to what Jesus' ministry to Israel was like as a shepherd because as the story unfolds, Matthew shows Jesus doing the work of proclaiming, teaching, and healing the sick as the Savior, proclaiming the kingdom of God. In particular, the healing ministry of Jesus is linked to the forgiveness of sins, which is proof that Jesus is the Son of God.

The initial impression as readers is that the story of Jesus will have to do with the way God accomplishes salvation for Israel through Jesus, who has been sent by God to deliver his people from their state of sin and exile (Donaldson, 1996:34).

Therefore, for Matthew, the beginning of discipleship can be defined as understanding and accepting Jesus Christ, the Messiah who came, and his work.

The Kingdom of God as the central theme of the teaching of Jesus

When Jesus began his ministry, the first message he proclaimed is that "the kingdom of God is at hand."

Now after John was arrested, Jesus came into Galilee, proclaiming the gospel of God, and saying, "The time is fulfilled, and the kingdom of God is at hand; repent and believe in the gospel" (Mark 1:14-15).

All the synoptic Gospels deal with the message and arrival of the kingdom of

God, and this suggests that this message is central to Jesus' ministry and his mission (Gushee and Stassen, 2016: loc. 366). The reason why the proclamation and arrival of the kingdom of God is so important is because of the hope of salvation held by the Jews at the time of Jesus.

The Kingdom of God is a Jewish idea, through and through, rooted in the embodied drama of Israel and God's relationship with Israel (Gushee and Stassen, 2016: loc. 383).

Thus, Luke explains Jesus' ministry of proclaiming the kingdom of God through the book of Isaiah.

"The Spirit of the Lord is upon me, because he has anointed me to proclaim good news to the poor. He has sent me to proclaim liberty to the captives and recovery of sight to the blind, to set at liberty those who are oppressed, to proclaim the year of the Lord's favor" (Luke 4:18-19).

Remembering the God of the Old Testament, the God who delivered them, restored them, and led them out of Egypt, the people of Israel recognize that they are the kingdom of God. Thus, the coming of God's kingdom is an act in the history of salvation in which God intervenes to save those who are oppressed by unrighteous power (Gushee and Stassen, 2016: loc. 531). Just as God saved the people of Israel from Egypt and made them his people, now Jesus proclaims a new age through the proclamation of the kingdom of God, and by declaring a new kingdom, he is announcing that God's work and divine plan will begin (Gushee and Stassen, 2016: loc. 537). Therefore, the concept of the kingdom of God refers to the arrival of a new age in Jesus, which is a different concept from the existing kingdom. When some of Jesus' disciples came to follow Jesus, they were expelled from the synagogue they belonged to

(John 9:22) and they were no longer able to enjoy the culture and customs they were familiar with.

For now to confess Jesus to be the Messiah not only marked the believer in Jesus as a disciple of Jesus, but also served to excommunicate those that believed from the Jewish synagogue... At times, the world means the world of humanity, so in this sense, the world is almost identical with the Jews (Hillmer, 1996:81).

This fact shows that the identity and position of the disciples had changed: though they were in the world, they were now also in the kingdom of God.

Discipleship as positional change in the Gospels

Among the four Gospels, the Gospel of John expresses the change of position of believers in Jesus' teaching about being born again. In John 3, Jesus talks about what it means to be born again through a conversation with Nicodemus.

Jesus answered him, "Truly, truly, I say to you, unless one is born again he cannot see the kingdom of God." Nicodemus said to him, "How can a man be born when he is old? Can he enter a second time into his mother's womb and be born?" Jesus answered, "Truly, truly, I say to you, unless one is born of water and the Spirit, he cannot enter the kingdom of God (John 3:3-5).

In this conversation, Jesus is telling Nicodemus twice that unless he is born again of the Holy Spirit, he cannot enter the kingdom of God. In other words, the disciples of Jesus, those who believe in Jesus, are those who have been born again by the Holy Spirit. Being born again by the Holy Spirit means that they do not belong to this world, like Jesus; their position as believers is that they have entered the kingdom of God. "The discipleship of those who experience this rebirth is related to the world above, the world of spirit, to which Jesus belongs and from which he has come" (Hillmer, 1996:82). Therefore, disciples are those who have been born again from above, those who are related to the realm of

the Holy Spirit, and those who do not belong to this world (Hillmer, 1996:83).

Furthermore, disciples are those who have a relationship with Jesus and follow Jesus' teachings and footsteps in their daily lives as members of the kingdom of God.

They are called to abide in him, just as the branches remain in the vine. To fail to remain in him is to be unfruitful and to face judgement. To remain in Jesus is to respond in faith to him and his revelation. It is to accept him as the Messiah, the Son of God, the one sent by the Father. It is to be in union with him in a close, personal relationship (Hillmer, 1996:87).

Discipleship as taking up the cross daily

The Gospel of Luke is the longest and contains the most stories among the four Gospels. It shows the two broad parts of Jesus' ministry; the first is the Galilean ministry and the other is the Perea-Judean ministry (Longenecker, 1996:52).

The disciples followed Jesus and saw his ministry with their own eyes.

Thus, the four Gospels show the reader what it is to live as a disciple of Jesus, showing how Jesus' twelve disciples responded to his call, walked with him, and fulfilled his mission. In other words, the four Gospels say that Jesus is the basis and pattern of discipleship (Hurtado, 1996:25). Through the cross, Jesus shows us that discipleship is not to rule over others, but to serve with love, and to save others by sacrificing ourselves.

Christological emphasis falls more on the cross as the disclosure of the meaning of Jesus, which is why an accurate understanding of Jesus is withheld from all human characters... Discipleship means following Jesus, with the story of Jesus serving as the paradigm (Hurtado, 1996:25).

Mark emphasizes that being a disciple means following Jesus with no

distractions, no rivals, and no competition for the allegiance of the disciples (Hurtado, 1996:25). So, to follow the way of Jesus is to follow his word in one's daily life, to proclaim it, and to testify of the good news that Jesus declared. This is in the same vein as Paul's confession that he died and began to live a new life in Jesus:

I have been crucified with Christ. It is no longer I who live, but Christ who lives in me. And the life I now live in the flesh I live by faith in the Son of God, who loved me and gave himself for me (Gal. 2:20).

Therefore, disciples are people who have a new identity in the kingdom of God, follow the help of the Holy Spirit, and live daily lives with a new mindset and attitude.

Being a follower of Jesus requires new attitudes toward wealth, poverty, and the use of riches for the benefit of others and a radical new type of lifestyle that puts following Jesus before every other allegiance—so radical, in fact, that every other allegiance, of whatever nature, can be characterized as “hate” by comparison (Longenecker, 1996:64).

In conclusion, the four Gospels teach that discipleship is based on the salvation accomplished by Jesus, and entails giving up one's personal will, realizing the presence of the Holy Spirit and relying on his help, and spreading the message of the kingdom and the attributes of God to all nations as Jesus did. The Gospels also show that a disciple is a person who daily lives the new life that Jesus taught and demonstrated.

3.5 Conclusion

Sanctification is to be set apart for God. The Old Testament uses the words for 'holy' and 'holiness' as they first applied to God, because it is God's unique character. And then, holiness is applied to his creatures. When it is applied to his creatures, it is first about their status in God and then their work for sanctification, that is, the practices they keep in order to remain holy. This work of sanctification is done in the community which is called and established by God. In the New Testament, sanctification refers to the believer's life while it also shows God's character as the Old Testament does. The New Testament shows two aspects of sanctification: positional and progressive. It shows the believer's definite status in Christ and then it leads a believer to a progressive work during their earthly life. Part of this work is missional, as a witness to those who do not yet believe.

Although there is a difference between the Old and New Testaments, discipleship in the Old Testament beginning with God and God's call, and the New Testament beginning with Jesus and his call, the essence of discipleship is the same. Those who are called to have a relationship with God or Jesus must go forth as holy people, as disciples concerned for the world and their community, rather than being confined to individual salvation.

The next chapter will examine the Anabaptist understanding of discipleship.

CHAPTER 4. Anabaptist concepts of discipleship and the role of the Christian fellowship as a redeemed and transformative community

Since the beginning of the Anabaptist movement in the sixteenth century, it has understood believers as disciples of Jesus. Anabaptists believed that discipleship cannot be separated from salvation. Indeed, Christian believers are deeply engaged in life on this earth. This chapter will explore Anabaptist concepts of discipleship and will evaluate the role of the Christian fellowship as a redeemed and transformative community.

4.1 A brief history of the Anabaptist movement

Anabaptism was a sixteenth-century church reform movement rooted in religious, social, economic and political conditions in Western Europe (Dyck, 1993:33). It was a religious movement that simultaneously took place in several areas and regions. It was not an isolated phenomenon, but it shared historical and political backgrounds with other reform movements. This chapter therefore begins by reviewing the history of the sixteenth-century Reformation.

Historical background of the early sixteenth century

The social, political and religious climate of the world in the early sixteenth century was turbulent for various reasons. Much change had taken place in the late Middle Ages (AD 1200 – 1500). At the beginning of the sixteenth century, Europe no longer considered itself a single empire. There, the only emperor

wielded a secular sword and Rome's religious counterpart wielded a spiritual sword (Gonzalez, 1975:27). This made a new situation in Western Europe, so popes, emperors and lords found it challenging to control what they enjoyed (Gonzalez, 1975:28). Consequently, it led to the declining authority of the church hierarchy. At that time, three events were especially significant: “moving to Avignon, the Great Western Schism, and the capture of the papacy by the spirit of the Italian Renaissance” (Gonzalez, 1975:30). These events brought a heavy financial burden to the church. The church tried to make more funds through taxation, which resulted in more loss of its authority and power. Finally, the sale of indulgences gained new momentum, as funds were needed to complete the magnificent art of St. Peter’s Basilica in Rome (Gonzalez, 1975:31). These things led Martin Luther, amongst others, to protest.

Another issue in the early sixteenth century was humanism. Humanism was the life and spirit of the Renaissance, the fourteenth- and fifteenth-century restoration of ancient cultures in Greece and Rome. Humanism was a this-worldly request that asked people to look from heaven to the earth around them. It rejected many irrational superstitions and customs of the times (Dyck, 1993:28). Whereas mysticism was a “theology of all men” that extended the possibility of intimate union with God to clergy and laity, monarchs and peasants, women and men alike, humanism was a reform movement initiated and dominated by the intellectual elite of Europe (George, 2013:48). Its motto was “*Ad fontes!* – Back to the sources!” and it influenced scholars who opened up new perspectives in history, literature, and theology (George, 2013:49).

The Reformation would not have been possible if there had been no humanist

restoration of biblical scholarship. The sharp pens of the humanists made the church act where the Reformers' actions often triggered a reaction (Dyck, 1993:29). This reform movement, humanism, influenced, directly and indirectly, Luther, Zwingli, Calvin, and Menno Simons.

4.1.1 Martin Luther

Martin Luther is the most significant theologian for the Reformation in the sixteenth century because of his understanding of Scripture. Undoubtedly, he initiated the Reformation. Luther's protest was the first attack on authoritarianism in many areas of social and intellectual life, and a "hammer blow against the kind of religion that 'tells you to think'" (Marshall, 2009:2).

His fresh account of justification by faith and *sola scriptura* influenced other reformers such as Zwingli and Menno Simons. Luther began his study of theology when, through a terrible experience of thunderstorm, he decided to be a monk. While he was studying theology at Erfurt in an atmosphere of humanist learning, he read some books by Plato and Augustine. Actually, Augustine might have pointed him to the great authority which is the Bible (MacCulloch, 2004:228). Luther later became a priest in the Catholic church. In Wittenberg, where he started his teaching and pastoral ministry, the church started selling a new indulgence and Luther at first did not know it. The purpose of this sale of indulgences was to complete St. Peter's Basilica in Rome, which had been temporarily halted because of the lack of funds.

Prince Fredrick, who was the lord of Wittenberg, did not accept the sale of

indulgences in Wittenberg, but Luther's parishioners went out to buy the new indulgences (Gonzalez, 1975:58). Luther believed that "trust in the merits and relics of the saints was in vain" (Gonzalez, 1975:57). Consequently, Luther composed and posted his famous Ninety-five Theses on the wall of Wittenberg Castle Church on October 31, 1517, the night of Halloween. In general, he wrote the theses against the preachers of indulgences (Gonzalez, 1975:58). This event was later seen as the beginning of the Reformation. For the Protestant Reformers, the doctrine of justification by faith alone is the central position; Luther said that it is the "summary of all Christian doctrine," or "the article by which the church stands or falls" (George, 2013:70). While he was struggling with his inner faith and studying in his little tower room, he discovered a new meaning.

In Romans 1:17, he who through faith is righteous shall live. God is not angry with sinners; he loves them, not because of what they do for God, but because of what God does for them in Christ. They are justified by faith in Christ, not by good work (Dyck, 1993:30).

With this understanding, Luther felt freedom in Jesus Christ and this was at the heart of his movement (Dyck, 1993:30). Even though he did not agree with the Anabaptist movement, his approach to the Scripture and his Reformation doctrines of *sola fide*, *sola scriptura*, and *solus Deo gloria* provided a biblical foundation for the Anabaptist movement. The most crucial point of the Reformation is that the Word of God, the Bible, was restored to its rightful place as the rule of Christian life (Marshall, 2009:2).

4.1.2 Zwingli and the Anabaptists

While Martin Luther had launched the Reformation whether he intended or not, Zwingli in Switzerland was also an essential reformer for the Protestant church in the sixteenth century. He grew up under a local church minister, and he studied the new Greek text published by Erasmus. He had already become a thoroughgoing humanist and a great admirer of Erasmus (Estep, 1995:166). Zwingli's early development was formed by two factors that continued to influence his thinking throughout his career: Swiss patriotism and Erasmanian humanism (George, 2015:147). Just as the Bible was important for Luther in Wittenberg, it was the main weapon of the teaching and the purification of the church for Zwingli (Bromiley, 1953:49). Some theological points such as the importance of the Scripture, baptism, and the Lord's Supper were also important for the first Anabaptists. In fact, Zwingli's approach to the Bible influenced them. For example, when Zwingli wrote about tithes, he claimed that "the Scripture describes tithes, which the church has represented as divine obligations, simply as voluntary contributions" (Finger, 2004: loc. 150). Even though Zwingli did not agree with the believers' baptism of the Anabaptists, his first teaching was that "unbaptized children are not damned and that infant baptism lacks biblical foundation" while he praised pacifism and the early Christian community of goods in 1522 (Finger, 2004: loc. 155). Zwingli asserted also that "Christ is the only way to salvation for all who ever were" in section 2 of his 67 articles (Graves, 2021). Following this section, he wrote:

From this follows first that all who dwell in the head [that is, Christ] are members and children of God, and that it is the church or communion of the saints, the bride of Christ, *ecclesia catholica* (Graves, 2021).

His understanding was not much different from the first Anabaptists' understanding of the church and the baptism even though Zwingli did not agree with them. While Zwingli showed a moderate tone, his young followers such as Conrad Grebel and Felix Manz did not agree with him. As the radicals explored a new path (according to Zwingli's previous hints), they became convinced that baptism should only be performed on those who had made decisions of mature faith, not infants (Finger, 2004: loc. 172).

On January 21, 1525, following their faith, George Blaurock asked Grebel to baptize him at Felix Manz's home. Grebel accepted and baptized others. A new church originated (Finger, 2004: loc. 174). Whether Zwingli agreed with Anabaptism or not, both asserted the teaching of the Bible and tried to respond to it. They tried to follow the Bible faithfully. However, they did not anticipate the consequences of their acts. People started calling them Anabaptists, which means those who were rebaptised. They did not agree with infant baptism because infants cannot confess their faith by themselves. This movement spread rapidly throughout Europe, through such men as Hans Hut (1490-1527), Hans Denck (1495-1527), and Pilgram Marpeck (d. 1556) in South Germany and Moravia, together with Melchior Hoffman (1495-1543) and Menno Simons (1496-1561) in the Netherlands (Becker, 2017: loc. 188).

The Anabaptist movement was begun not by just one person or group but by several groups simultaneously. Because of this, they did not all have the same perspective and viewpoint, except for their rejection of infant baptism. However, the Catholics and mainstream Protestants did not accept the view of the Anabaptists. Instead, they regarded it as a dangerous teaching.

When the forerunners of the Mennonites—a group called the Anabaptists—first emerged in the 1520s, Catholics and Protestants alike considered their teachings so dangerous that they regarded the Anabaptists as criminals. Within a few decades of their beginnings, several thousand Anabaptists were executed. They were drowned, burned at the stake, or tortured to death on account of their beliefs, and many more thousands were imprisoned or exiled (Roth, 2005:20).

According to the Anabaptist perspective, Christianity had lost its essence for the church, faith, and even Christian life.

... the mainstream churches—Catholic and Protestant—continued to marginalize Jesus. He was worshipped rather than followed. The Protestant reformers honoured Jesus as the one through whose redeeming work sinful human beings could be justified, but they generally paid scant attention to his life and teaching (Murray, 2015:61).

Because of this perspective, Anabaptists were not welcomed by the mainstream churches. Even though their point of view was radical, their beliefs were not different from the first reformers. When Anabaptists gathered at Schleitheim in Switzerland in 1527, they drafted a confessional document called “Brotherly Union of a Number of Children of God Concerning Seven Articles”, now called the Schleitheim Confession. The first article deals with baptism:

Notice concerning baptism. Baptism shall be given to all those who have been taught repentance and the amendment of life and who believe genuinely that their sins are taken away through Christ, and to all those who desire to walk in the resurrection of Jesus Christ be buried with Him in death so that they might rise with Him; to all those who with such an understanding themselves desire and request it from us (Yoder, 1977:10).

As indicated, the Anabaptists had the same faith in Jesus Christ. They confessed that Jesus is the Lord and Saviour. In the third article, on the breaking of bread, they admitted that Jesus is “the head of the congregation” (Yoder, 1977:11). About Jesus Christ, Pilgram Marpeck (d.1556), who was one of the first Anabaptists, confessed that

... faith in Christ can do and produce what pleases God; disease and

death are undone; life and health are at hand. The salvation of all men is accomplished, ignorance is excused, and, to children and all who have true simplicity [of Spirit], the kingdom of God is given (Marpeck, 1978:126).

Therefore, the heart of Christianity, according to the Anabaptists, is Jesus Christ. Article Six of the Schleitheim Confession of Faith (1527) touches on discipleship—following Jesus Christ:

Thus we should also do as He did and follow after Him, and we shall not walk in darkness. For He Himself says: “Whoever would come after me, let him deny himself and take up his cross and follow me” (Yoder, 1977:15)

Even though the Anabaptists were persecuted after they had launched their movement, because of their understanding of the Bible, they were followers of Jesus Christ and shared the same knowledge about salvation by faith in Jesus Christ as the first reformers had declared. Palmer Becker summarizes Anabaptism as follows: “Jesus Christ is the centre of our faith, Community is the centre of our life, and Reconciliation is the centre of our work” (Becker, 2017: loc. 193). John Roth (2005:21), in his summary of Anabaptist beliefs, comments that “a focus on common beliefs does establish a framework for ongoing conversation and shared points of reference as we seek broader unity within the Christian church.”

In summary, the first reformers in the sixteenth century insisted that the Bible is the authority for the Christian life and for the church. They tried to follow its teaching.

4.2 The Anabaptist concept of discipleship

Since the initiation of the Anabaptist movement, there has been little interest in

developing a systematic theology. Instead, they focused on certain theological methods. The development of early Anabaptist theological concerns was the gracious personal encounter with God in Christ through the mediation of the Holy Spirit and the Bible, realized through baptism and covenant community in which the human conscience was restrained. It was a practical movement rather than a theory, manifested in a transformed life according to the way of the cross of Christ, starting with baptism, continuing a disciplined communion, and ending with a successful testimony (Yarnell, 2013: loc. 620). For Anabaptists, it is more important to walk in the footsteps of Jesus and as a disciple than to establish theological categories such as soteriology and sanctification (Friedmann, 1973:78). Anabaptists understand that “Christ’s atonement on the cross and the justification, sanctification, and perfection of the disciple is seen as one inseparable process” (Klassen, 1981:101). This means that when Anabaptists talk about discipleship, it covers the believer’s justification and sanctification. Discipleship involves both positional and progressive sanctification. For Anabaptists, salvation, as it indicates the believer’s life on the earth, is the long journey of faith characterized by several crucial points (Roth, 2005:61).

Mennonites [one of biggest branches of Anabaptism] understand salvation is a life journey of faith: a spiritual relationship with God, a commitment to full participation in the community of faith, and a willingness to follow Jesus’ teachings in daily life. Baptism symbolizes all of these things. Like a marriage vow, it is a dangerous—albeit joyful—public statement of commitment made in full awareness of the responsibilities and consequences implied in that vow (Roth, 2005:61).

When Jesus called Peter and his other companions, they became followers of Jesus (Mark 1:16–20). Their lives were changed, transformed by the calling of Jesus. And then they started the journey with Jesus. Even though they still lived

in the same country, using the same languages and lifestyle, their perspective and direction were changed (Roth, 2005:87). The Anabaptist understanding of being born again is “beginning to live in a new way in this life, and it causes one’s thoughts, attitudes, and actions to be transformed, and enables one to make a new start” (Becker, 2017: loc. 354). Thus, discipleship in the Anabaptist view can be understood as positional and progressive sanctification. These two aspects are outlined below.

4.2.1 Discipleship as positional sanctification

In order to appreciate the Anabaptist perspective on discipleship as positional sanctification, an understanding of the believer’s baptism is a quintessential point, because when they are baptized, their status is shifted from the world to God. When Conrad Grebel (1498–1526) was baptized in 1525, he wrote a letter to Thomas Muntzer (1489–1525):

The scripture describes baptism for us thus: it signifies that, by faith and the blood of Christ, sins have been washed away for him who is baptized, that it changes his mind and beliefs before and after; that it signifies that a man is dead and ought to be dead to sin and walks in the newness of life and Spirit; and that he shall certainly be saved if, according to this meaning, by inner baptism he lives the faith (Grebel, 1981:196).

This indicates that baptism changes the status of believers. Once they are baptized by faith, they become disciples. A believer cannot become a disciple through their work or progress but it is done when they are baptized by faith, according to the Anabaptist viewpoint. Therefore, baptism is not only a ritual of the church but also a confession that the person has already decided to follow

Jesus.

He has also decided and already inwardly given his intention that from this time on, he will change and improve his life, and that he confesses this openly in the reception of the water (Hubmaier, 1981c:199).

Through this baptism believers surrender their life according to the order of Christ (Hubmaier, 1981c:199). Once a believer is baptized by faith, he is a disciple of Jesus, and he should live his life according to the order of Christ, because “Christ has made him free from sin and he can no longer be the slave of sin” (Denck, 1981:103). When a believer is baptized by faith, he is a member of the church and a member of the one body in Christ. Klassen says,

Baptism was the rite by which one entered the church. Most Anabaptists regarded Christian life as communal life; all Christians were members of one body (Klassen, 1981:194).

Finally, baptism is to be the start of a new life in which one is prepared to follow Christ in death as well (Roth, 2005:69).

4.2.2 Discipleship as progressive sanctification

When Anabaptists talk about discipleship, it centers on the noun “disciple” and the verb “follow after” or “learn” (Yoder, 1994:113). It affirms that Christianity includes beliefs, spiritual experience, and forgiveness (Becker, 2017: loc. 312).

This assumes that discipleship is sanctification in its progressive mode.

Anabaptist authors write about discipleship as suffering with or in Christ.

If a man is to come to the knowledge of the living Son of God, he must await the work of God through the cross of Christ, which we must carry and follow in the footsteps of Christ (Hutter, 1981:106).

This shows that the life of a disciple is not confined to the event of baptism but

is an ongoing process in Christ, sharing Christ's suffering.

The concept of discipleship and sanctification in the sixteenth century

Hans Denck (1495–1527) wrote that “faith is obedience to God and confidence in his promise through Jesus Christ” (Denck, 1981:55). When believers do the work of obedience, this is also given by God (Denck, 1981:54). That is, the believers' effort or work is effective only when it is done in Christ. “Outside of Christ, he confesses that he and his works are vain, of no account and an accursed sinner” (Hubmaier, 1981b:51). Regarding this union with Christ, Leonhard Schiemer (1500–1528) wrote,

The second grace is called righteousness. It is a great work of God to create man out of nothing, but it is an equally great work to justify a sinful man. But that can in no way happen outside of the conception, birth, death, and resurrection in us of Christ who is our righteousness (Schiemer, 1981:64).

Union with Christ implies suffering with him. The early Anabaptists wrote about the suffering caused by the persecution of believers, but they did not forget its origin and the consequences of faith in Jesus Christ, because believers participate in the cross of Christ through suffering and persecution. Pilgram Marpeck (d. 1556) wrote:

Thus the cross of Christ is a holy, innocent cross if one suffers innocently as a witness of God in the truth and for the truth to the praise of God. To this holy cross of Christ, our highest shelter and shield, we have surrendered with holy patience to overcome all our enemies in the victory of Christ (Marpeck, 1981:115).

For Anabaptists, a believer's suffering of persecution is not ultimately harmful but positive, and it is to be united in Jesus Christ and to follow his footsteps because the way of Jesus is different from a natural way, and there must be conflict with the earthly way, as Jesus said (Mark 8:34). Menno Simons (1496-

1561) wrote,

By this counsel, we are all taught that we must hear Christ, believe in Christ, follow his footsteps, repent, be born from above, become as little children, not in understanding, but in malice... deny ourselves, take up his cross and follow him (Simons, 1981:118).

In summary, Anabaptists in the sixteenth century focused on both salvation by faith in Jesus Christ and its progress through obedience.

Contemporary understanding of discipleship and sanctification

Anabaptists have constantly focused on the concept of discipleship since the movement was launched in the sixteenth century. One influential work was Harold Bender's book *The Anabaptist Vision*. In this book, he talked about three fundamental concepts of Anabaptism: "Christianity as discipleship, church as a brotherhood, and an ethic of love and nonresistance" (Bender, 1944: loc. 196). Bender saw discipleship as transformation of the entire way of life of an individual believer and a church following the example of Jesus:

The focus of the Christian life was to be not so much the inward experience of the grace of God but the outward application of that grace to all human conduct and the consequent Christianization of all human relationships (Bender, 1944: loc. 196).

In this way Anabaptists understand sanctification as following Christ (Friedmann, 1973:90). Friedmann writes: "The full commitment to discipleship and the correlated idea of being cleansed through suffering is indeed an element in Anabaptist thought" (Friedmann, 1973:91). When Anabaptists refer to discipleship, its character is "likely to associate with themes of service and love" (Roth, 2005:87). Anabaptists say that "disciples are joyfully obedient to Jesus Christ because of what he did and continues to do for them" (Becker, 2017: loc. 317). Anabaptist discipleship affirms that faith and obedience come

together. “Faith requires obedience, and obedience requires faith” (Becker, 2017: loc. 322). Furthermore, Anabaptist discipleship leads to a more radical approach to the believer’s life. Discipleship comes with suffering and persecution if believers are in and with Christ. When Hans Schlaffer (d. 1528) wrote his “Brief Instruction” in 1527, he said this about followers of Christ:

They [Christians] arm themselves for suffering, do not entangle themselves in the ways of the world, have no fellowship with works of darkness but rather with the works of light, are not ashamed of their master Christ and his words, and follow him in the same (Schlaffer, 1981:108).

Therefore, discipleship is “the result of being transformed through an active relationship with Christ and an exciting way to view and live the Christian faith” (Becker, 2017: loc. 368).

In summary, for Anabaptists, discipleship covers both positional and progressive sanctification; the first speaks of one’s status and the second describes the life of believers.

4.3 The role of the Christian fellowship as a redeemed and transformative community

Another core value of Anabaptism is that “community is the centre of our life” (Becker, 2017: loc. 680). It is “a new concept of the church as a brotherhood” (Bender, 1944: loc. 198).

Voluntary church membership based upon true conversion and involving a commitment to holy living and discipleship was the essential heart of this concept (Bender, 1944: loc. 269).

When believers are baptized, they are baptized into the one body of Christ, which is “the congregation of God, whose head is Christ” (Yoder, 1977:11). Stuart Murray defines the church as “communities of discipleship and mission,

mutual accountability, baptism for believers, sharing bread and wine, and sustaining hope” (Murray, 2015:109). Even in the initial stages of Anabaptism, the church was viewed as communities of discipleship, or “saints.” As Hubmaier wrote,

I also believe and confess the existence of the holy, universal Christian church. That is a community of saints, a brotherhood of many pious and believing men, who with one accord acknowledge one God, one Lord, one faith and one baptism (Hubmaier, 1981c:123).

For Anabaptists, therefore, the church is “community of people who have chosen to follow the way of Jesus” (Wenger, 1991:18).

4.3.1 The church as redeemed community

As Wenger mentioned, Anabaptists have recognized the church as a community or brotherhood of believers. With this concept, Anabaptists believe the church consists of the redeemed communities that are united with Christ. The members of the church share the love of Christ with each other. Regarding discipleship, Peter Riedemann (1506-1556), who was the founder of the Anabaptist Hutterite colony, had a more radical position.

All believers have fellowship in holy things, that is, in God. He has given them all things in his Son, Christ Jesus... no members of Christ's body should possess any gift for themselves or for their own sake. Instead, all should be consecrated for the whole body, for all the members (Riedemann, 1999: loc. 2694).

In his view, once believers are baptized, they must be joined into the fellowship of God, and they should share their goods with brothers and sisters in the association. For Ulrich Stadler, an early Anabaptist Hutterite (died 1540), his community was made up of persons redeemed by faith in Jesus Christ and

entered by baptism.

There is one communion of all the faithful in Christ and one community of the holy children called of God. They have one Father in heaven, one Lord Christ; all are baptized and sealed in their hearts with one Spirit (Stadler, 1981:128).

Anabaptists agree that a person who is baptized by faith becomes a member of the church, which is the community of God, and joins the Lord's Supper, which is communion with Jesus. In earlier times, Anabaptists did not distinguish between the local church and the universal church; they understood that there is one church in the world. The believers join this community of faith in Jesus Christ by the Holy Spirit because it is not a human organization or a religious meeting place.

Thus, it is evident that the church is gathered through the Holy Spirit; the church has its being and continues to exist through the Spirit. There are no churches apart from those which the Holy Spirit gathers and builds (Riedemann, 1999: loc. 1408).

According to Riedemann (1506-1556), therefore, if the community includes non-believers such as sinners, adulterers, people who are covetous or selfish, and all kinds of evil characters not following Jesus Christ, it is not a church or congregation of believers (Riedemann, 1999: loc. 1408). For him, the church of God affirms the truth, which is Jesus Christ. The church can become a holy being or holy place because it is built by the work of Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit, according to Anabaptists.

The church of God is a church of holy beings, namely, of the angels in heaven and of the believing reborn men on earth, who have been renewed in the image of God. These are all united in Jesus Christ (Philips, 1981:136).

On this point, Anabaptists agree that the church of God is the redeemed community which is built on the truth of Jesus Christ and is led by the Spirit. A

person who is baptized in the truth by the Spirit and “responds to the good news by turning from sin toward faith in Jesus” (Wenger, 1991:17) can participate in this redeemed community and love others. Bender emphasises the communal nature of discipleship:

The church was created by the central principle of newness of life and applied Christianity. The church membership based upon true conversion and involving a commitment of holy living and discipleship was the absolutely essential heart of this concept (Bender, 1944: loc. 262).

On the basis of this voluntary membership, the church can be a body of committed and practicing Christians pledged to the highest standard of New Testament living which is separate from the worldly way of life (Bender, 1944: loc. 278). Hence, Anabaptists view redemption as requiring a separation from the world and a commitment to live a life in Christ’s way.

4.3.2 The church as transforming community

With this understanding, believers who are joined in this redeemed community should walk in the truth, so that it becomes a transforming community.

Riedemann (1506-1556) says, “No one may come to the church, much less become a member, unless that person lives and walks in the truth, that is, in God, and has the truth in oneself” (Riedemann, 1999: loc. 1436). Christian faith is centered on God through Jesus Christ, and such a faith leads to a life of obedience to the will of God as revealed in the Bible and as exemplified in the life and teachings of Jesus. In this section I will briefly mention the need for transformation and some Anabaptist practices that promote it.

Walking in newness of life and the practice of discipleship

For Anabaptists salvation is not merely being saved from condemnation. It is a “walking in newness of life or the transformation into a new creature in whom Christ is increasingly being formed” (Bender, cited by Friedmann, 1973:83). This transforming community does not follow the way of rationalism but follows the way of Jesus. It walks in the footsteps of Jesus. When believers are joined into the community, they are not morally righteous even though they have become disciples of Jesus. They are still weak and can easily abandon the faith which they have. The redeemed community does not say that the church is perfect and pure, although it is the gathering place for the disciples of Jesus. It is still depraved and unfit in God’s sight. This is evident from the Anabaptist perspective on sin and the nature of humanity. Menno Simons (1496-1561) says,

Human reason is so depraved in Adam, that it possesses but little light which can lead to godliness; yea, it has become so unfit, haughty, ignorant and blind that it would even attempt presumptuously to alter, bend, break, gainsay, judge and find fault with the word of the Lord God (Simons, 1956: loc. 7194).

Simons saw that the reason humanity is depraved is that the enchanting spirit of antichrist tempts people to reject the doctrines of Christ, the sacraments, and true worship (Simons, 1956: loc. 7200). Humans are corrupted by Satan, which is the old master and arch-enemy of God, according to him (Simons, 1956: loc. 7200). With this understanding, Anabaptists insist that believers need practices that encourage, support, and maintain faith in Jesus Christ, and the church needs to provide and share these methods.

Communion

The first practice is communion. Anabaptists observe fellowship in the Lord's Supper, which is the "central practice of the faithful church" (Roth, 2005:132).

Mennonites generally speak of communion in more symbolic language. As with baptism, the point here is not to reduce communion to the status of being merely a symbol; communion points to the profound reality of Christ's living presence in ourselves and the gathered body of believers (Roth, 2005:133).

Through communion, Anabaptists affirm one faith, one baptism, and one Lord of the church. Anabaptists declare the unity of the church in Jesus Christ, and affirm through the communion that the church is the believers' community in Jesus Christ. It is "a reminder of the self-giving love of Jesus and an occasion for members to recall their baptismal vows to follow Christ in daily discipleship" (Roth, 2005:133). Participation in the communion enables believers to realize the love of Jesus and the benefits of his work. While the Catholic Church understands the Eucharist as a sacrament that confers the divine presence, Anabaptists insist that it is a memorial and more symbolic, indicating a profound reality of Christ's presence in the believer's life and the gathered body of believers (Roth, 2005:133). In fact, Anabaptists were influenced by Zwingli when they had the Bible study with him at the beginning of Anabaptism. Communion also reminds believers that they are unified in Christ and formed together as his body (Roth, 2005:134).

Discipline and the ban

With this mind, Anabaptist churches have a unique practice to encourage the believers' discipline and accountability. A particular concept of the Anabaptists is a ban or excommunication from the church. This is a practice of brotherly love that is meant to help others in the church.

To them, the ban was nothing but the practice of a form of brotherly love to help the one who went astray to find his way back into the holy community. Discipline assumed a redemptive quality besides its primary cathartic function (Friedemann, 1973:122).

They believe that having a church membership implies a “readiness to share fully in the care and nurture of souls” (Roth, 2005:137). This is necessary because humanity is weak and fallible, as indicated above. According to Anabaptists, it is impossible to keep “the pious life without the proper use of excommunication or ban” (Simons, 1956: loc.7219). Therefore, the Schleithem Confession (1527), which is the first confession of Brotherly Union, says:

We have been united as follows concerning the ban. The ban shall be employed with all those who have given themselves over to the Lord, to walk after Him in His commandments; those who have been baptized into the one body of Christ (Yoder, 1977:10).

Because the believers and the church are not perfect and right by themselves before God, they believed they needed the practice of church discipline to deal with the problem of sin in the church. Nowadays, Anabaptists understand that the practice of discipline, as an element of discipleship, is each member’s accountability to the community. The reason for this responsibility is that their membership implies mutual commitment, and this can be difficult.

Anabaptists reveal an assumption that the community is continuously prepared to engage in the hard work of discernment, ready to distinguish between essentials and peripherals in the details of everyday faith and practice (Roth, 2005:139).

Believers are united with Christ through the church, which is his body. With this in mind, believers have mutual accountability. They listen to each other with love. They have a genuine openness to Jesus Christ and other believers. With this attitude, discipline is not for punishment but for restoration and transformation.

As early Anabaptists pondered the life, teaching, death, and resurrection of Jesus Christ, they came to understand that forgiveness and salvation come through honest repentance and a new openness to Jesus Christ (Becker, 2017: loc. 745).

This openness to Jesus Christ and honest repentance enables believers to be transformed by the Holy Spirit. This is because the sense of love and the hope of restoration are the roots of a right relationship with God and other members of the believer's community (Roth, 2005:138). This practice of discipline expresses a desire to fulfill Christ's prayer for unity (John 17:21), that the church may be one so that the world may believe (Roth, 2005:140).

Mission

The church as a transforming community is a missional community. In the initial Anabaptist communities, missions started close to home, with children, neighbours, and friends (Roth, 2005:141). This is because they could not have free access to pulpits or public preaching at the beginning. However, this gave various opportunities for mission. Even though they agreed that preaching, sharing and teaching the gospel is important for the invitation to salvation, Anabaptists/Mennonites believed that their approach to mission should be based on the lived testimony of an upright, compassionate way of life (Roth, 2005:142). So, sharing the gospel was done with those who were in close relationships. The motivation for this sharing was the conviction that through the gospel the identity or nature of the believers might be changed from a life under sin to a new and transformed life empowered by the Spirit (Becker, 2017: loc. 751). The life of discipleship is a missional life, aiming to share the love of God

with others. Anabaptists strongly believe that transformation “happens via confession, forgiveness, and new relationship” (Becker, 2017: loc. 756). A good relationship with God leads believers to a transformed life which brings fruit (Becker, 2017: loc. 761). Once they are united with Christ through their confession in the church, they enter the transformed life with the Holy Spirit. Thus, the essential expression of mission for Anabaptists is not only preaching, teaching and sharing the gospel but also the witness of a consistent moral life and the practices of the gathered community (Roth, 2005:142).

4.4 Conclusion

The first Anabaptists did not establish a theological system because of persecutions from other Protestant churches. However, they focused on living as disciples, following the footsteps of Jesus Christ, and the Bible was the source of their theology. Even though Anabaptists do not have a comprehensive theological statement similar to those of other denominations such as Reformed or Methodist, their concept of discipleship contains an understanding of sanctification as having positioned and progressive aspects, and they understand the church as the redeemed and transformative community.

The next chapter will identify connections between Anabaptist views on discipleship and the previously discussed perspectives on sanctification. Moreover, it will attempt to formulate a doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles.

CHAPTER 5. The Relationship between the Reformed doctrine of sanctification and the Anabaptist concept of discipleship

This paper has discussed sanctification and Anabaptist concepts of discipleship in the context of the redeemed and transformative Christian community. This chapter will work toward the formulation of a doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles.

5.1 The relationship between discipleship and sanctification in the Bible

As discussed in Chapter 3, this paper has seen that sanctification and discipleship can be understood in the same context when viewed biblically.

5.1.1 Biblical concepts of sanctification

The most important thing to understand about sanctification is the primary source, the teachings of the Bible. In the Bible, the word “sanctification” appears mainly in the New Testament, but in the Old Testament, as this paper confirmed in Chapter 3, the word group that includes “holy” and “holiness” can be used in the same context as sanctification in the New Testament.

“Holy” and “holiness” in the Old Testament as sanctification

The concept of sanctification in the Old Testament appears as holiness, and this concept reveals several things. The first is holiness as an attribute of God himself (see 3.1.1). The word “holy” in the Old Testament refers to God himself.

Because God is holy, he is set apart from everything in this world, and because God is holy, what God does is unique. This is an important word to show God's otherness and distinction. Therefore, in the Old Testament, when humans encounter God, they bow the head to his holiness and realize their own unholiness. An example is Isaiah, who prayed to God in the temple, and then God appeared to Isaiah; when the angels praised the holiness of God, Isaiah came to know himself through the holiness of God (Isaiah 6). The Old Testament shows that God's holiness is linked to God's wholeness, sovereignty and awesomeness (see 3.1.1). Holiness, therefore, is a unique attribute of God that shows that God and humanity are distinct, that God is not affected by anything in this world, and he only is the ruler of the world, the Lord of all things. So, in the Old Testament, only the holy could face God. The sacrifices of the Old Testament clearly show that sinful humans cannot draw near to God. Sacrifice has the meaning of restoration for sins in the Old Testament, but it also shows that the holy God and sinful human beings cannot have a direct relationship with each other and must keep a distance.

Second, because of God's inherent attribute of holiness, the Old Testament shows that everything that has a relationship with God is holy. When God came to Moses, the first thing God said to Moses was, "Take off your sandals because this land is holy" (Exod. 3). The holy objects used, the holy land, the holy mountain, and the holy sanctuary are not in themselves holy and clean, but they are holy because the holy God is with them. This means that all things that have a relationship with God, and the place where God is present, are sanctified. This concept applies equally to humans. When God calls his people,

he commands them to be holy (Leviticus 11:44), and calls his people holy people. This does not mean that they are already sanctified as God is, but that they enter the stage of sanctification. So, as we have already seen in Chapter 3, moral holiness is a relationship with God and a manifestation of God's holiness in our lives.

Third, the meaning of holiness in the Old Testament is living according to God's holiness, that is, obedience to God's laws and covenants. When God delivered his people Israel from Egypt, he showed that he saved them as a fulfillment of the covenant made with Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob. After that, God did not leave Israel in the wilderness, but taught them his laws, which they were to obey when they lived in the covenant land in the future. This shows that God's law was now their covenant, and God's covenant was fulfilled among them as they lived in obedience to God's law. The covenant and the law thus revealed the position and identity of the people of Israel, and as God showed himself through holiness, it is a proof of the people of Israel himself to the whole world. Because they had been transformed by God's holiness, Israel could now demonstrate holiness in their lives through obedience and the practice of living according to the law. The Old Testament shows that thorough obedience and sacrifice do not come from Israel but can begin and come from a holy God.

Finally, the Old Testament concept of holiness shows that it is God's message to the whole community as well as the individual. In Deuteronomy 26:18-19, God says that if they obey God's law, then the entire people of Israel are his precious possession according to his covenant, and he will set them in praise and in fame and in honour high above all the other nations he had made. He

also said that he would make them holy as God's people. The people of Israel did not choose God first, but the holy and separate God approached them first and made the covenant with them. Holiness, therefore, was the responsibility of the Israelite community as a whole, that God had bestowed upon his people, to manifest God's holiness and justice toward all the nations. This represented the perpetual relationship of God with Israel.

In summary, the holiness of the Old Testament is the first attribute of God that is revealed, and it means that all things related to God, including humans, are sanctified by that relationship and by his presence . The holiness of the Old Testament also refers to the process by which a person who has been sanctified goes forward by obeying God's covenants and laws. Holiness is a responsibility not only for individuals but also for the whole community, and it also means a perfect and eternal relationship with God.

Sanctification in the New Testament

In the Old Testament, God directly reveals his attributes through holiness, while in the New Testament this concept flows continuously, and the concept of sanctification in the New Testament indirectly expresses God's attributes as participation in the attributes of the Holy One.

First, the sanctification is in Jesus Christ, showing the position and status of the believer. The first meaning of sanctification in the New Testament is "set apart to or for God," which means that the believer's position is not in this world, but in Jesus, and that they are not living according to the laws of this world, but by the laws of Jesus Christ. The sanctification then implies the progressive life of the

believer in Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit. When Peter writes his letter, he expresses “the sanctifying work of the Holy Spirit” (1 Peter 1:2). In this expression, Peter tells believers that the Holy Spirit is the cause of their sanctification and the subject of their sanctification. Therefore, in the New Testament, the subject of sanctification is the Holy Spirit, and the beginning of sanctification takes place in those who follow Jesus’ calling and dwell in him.

Second, God’s call to believers in the New Testament, just as in the Old Testament, is to “be holy,” and in accordance with this, God sanctifies believers. Sanctification is the state of believers determined by God.

Third, New Testament sanctification is not only a change in the position of believers, but also a change in the progress of their lives. Paul says in 1 Thessalonians 3:13 that Jesus makes their hearts blameless before God the Father in holiness (sanctification). Romans 8:1-2 says that the Holy Spirit leads believers in Christ Jesus to be free from the law of sin and death through the fruit of the Holy Spirit; God’s call is to holiness and a life of sanctification. Thus, as in the Old Testament, sanctification in the New Testament also refers to believers’ lives of obedience to God’s call, which is not a life centered on the believer, but a work of the Holy Spirit, a life lived in and with his help. Hebrews 9:11-14 also shows that Jesus Christ is the source of sanctification. It is said that Jesus suffered to sanctify believers with his blood, showing that Jesus is the center of sanctification.

Finally, just as holiness in the Old Testament was a responsibility not only for individuals but for the whole community, so also sanctification in the New Testament has meaning for the community. Paul tells the church in Corinth that

the whole community is washed and sanctified (1 Cor 6:11). John 17 shows that when Jesus prays, he prays for all of his disciples, and their lives will be separate from the world. This shows that the believer's life is not only an individual life, but a life with community, and the community is sanctified. Paul indirectly shows that sanctification applies to the whole community by using the expression "to all believers" rather than addressing one believer at the outset of his epistle to the Philippians. Paul uses this expression frequently in his epistles. The core of communal sanctification can be found in the body of Jesus Christ mentioned by Paul. The church is not simply a gathering of people, but a gathering of believers centered on Jesus Christ, and therefore a place where sanctification takes place, and a community moving toward the calling of Jesus together. In the same sense, Peter also quotes from the Old Testament and uses the expression "holy nation" (Exod. 19:6, 1 Pet. 2:9-10), showing that the church is not just a group but a gathering of those who have been sanctified and who will be sanctified.

In summary, sanctification in the New Testament, as in the Old Testament, reveals God first, and clearly shows that the Holy Spirit is the sanctifier. It also shows that Jesus Christ is the center and source of sanctification. This means that the position and status of believers is in Jesus Christ; they do not achieve sanctification on their own, but through the help of the Holy Spirit. Finally, sanctification is applied to the community as well as to the individual.

In conclusion, the concepts of holiness and sanctification in the Bible are, first, manifestations of the attributes of God and God himself, and all things related to God or Jesus. Second, the center of holiness and sanctification is God and

Jesus Christ, and the source is also God and Jesus Christ. In particular, the New Testament shows that the Holy Spirit is the one who leads the process of sanctification. Finally, holiness and sanctification, both in the Old and New Testaments, show the path of sanctification not only for the individual but also for the whole community as they respond to God's call.

5.1.2 Biblical concepts of discipleship

In section 3.4, cases of discipleship in the Old and New Testaments were identified. In the Old Testament, life as a disciple could be indirectly inferred through the relationship between God and God's people, and in the New Testament it is exemplified in the relationship between Jesus and his disciples. Life as a disciple implies the necessity for holiness, or sanctification. This thesis has already confirmed in Chapter 3 that holiness and sanctification do not come from different etymologies, but come from one etymology. If holiness and sanctification are the central themes in the lives of believers, a practical way to achieve them is through discipleship. This is because the basic meaning of discipleship involves obedience to God.

Discipleship in the Old Testament

As discussed in Chapter 3, the Old Testament does not speak directly about discipleship. However, the relationship between God and his people indirectly reveals what discipleship is.

First, the God of the Old Testament is the King of his people and their leader. The people whom he has called must follow him as their Lord and King. The

Old Testament shows the contrast between God and the people of Israel. God has a constant relationship with the people, but Israel fails to follow his will and keep the law. The reason God is the Lord and leader of this world is that he is the One who created it and governs it with his providence. Thus, the Old Testament shows that even if his called and created people fail to follow him fully, God does not give up on them as their leader but holds them to the end.

Second, the Old Testament shows that God's called people are his servants. In the Old Testament, God continues to call people to make and renew his covenant, and to make them live by his covenant and laws. The important point here is that people did not first seek God or long to meet him, but God reached out to them first. This shows that God is at the center of the call, the covenant and the law, and it means that those who follow the covenant can also follow the law when they are in God. Thus, Exodus shows the call of God and the people of Israel responding to it. God calls Moses through the burning bush. Moses is tending his sheep, not looking for God, but God approaches him and calls him. After that, he tells Moses what to do and sends him to Egypt to fulfill the covenant he made with Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob. And he gives the people of Israel a powerful ability, so that they can obey God's call. During their wilderness journey, he continues to be with them. Although the Old Testament does not directly speak about discipleship, it does show, importantly, that the leader, God, sustains and leads his followers, his servant Israel.

Finally, although the God of the Old Testament calls one person to lead the work, the whole community follows God. Through the Ten Commandments, God allows Israel to live as the kingdom of God. Through this, the entire nation

of Israel obeys God's laws and lives a life of witnessing to all the neighboring nations where God leads them. Therefore, in the Old Testament, the purpose of God's calling is not only for individual salvation but also for the whole community, and this demonstrates God's will to save all nations in the future. Israel, obedient to this call and following his path, will show what life is like for God's people on this earth.

In summary, Old Testament discipleship is the relationship between a leader (God as King of his people) and his called people. In this relationship, God gives covenants and laws to his people, and Israel as a people is called to live their lives according to these laws.

Discipleship in the New Testament

Unlike the Old Testament, the New Testament speaks directly about discipleship, but the overall meaning is not fundamentally different from the Old Testament. First, like the Old Testament, discipleship begins with the call of Jesus. The Gospels, although there are some differences, show that the disciples did not seek Jesus first, but Jesus went to those in their daily lives and called them, and they responded to that call. Through this, we see that discipleship begins with Jesus. In Chapter 3, this thesis looked at the Gospel accounts of how Jesus called and made disciples. The important point here is that, like sanctification, the center of discipleship is Jesus Christ. Matthew shows through his Gospel that Jesus is the beginning of discipleship and that the purpose of fulfilling the Great Commission spoken of in Chapter 28 is Jesus. That is why Matthew records his Gospel from the birth of Jesus. Also, it is Jesus Christ whom the disciples proclaim and follow. The Gospels portray Jesus as

the Messiah who came, the Son of God, the One who forgives sins. Therefore, discipleship in the New Testament is understanding Jesus Christ, believing and accepting Him as the Messiah, and following him.

An important concept in the New Testament discipleship is the kingdom of God. The proclamation of the kingdom of God is the most important thing in Jesus' work, and through this, Jesus speaks and shows the position and the state of his followers. The concept of the kingdom of God is a Jewish concept, which, as the Old Testament states, means that those who are called become a holy people in relationship with God. They are not of this earth but of the kingdom of God. For those who belong to the kingdom of God, discipleship is a change of position, and it means to live with the awareness that we belong to God, not to this earth, in our daily lives. For that, Jesus is saying that disciples are those who deny themselves and carry their cross every day. Thus, as those who belong to the kingdom of God, discipleship involves a new heart and attitude of life. This is like the law that God gave to his people in the Old Testament, and it is not the fulfillment of a moral concept, but the attitude of those who have entered into a new existence.

Lastly, discipleship means not only individual change, but also the community of disciples changing and moving forward together. Jesus uses the parable of the vine and the branches to say that the disciples are branches attached to Jesus, and when they remain attached to Jesus, they will bear true fruit (John 15). Therefore, when Jesus commands his disciples in Matthew 28, the command is not given to individuals, but to the disciples as a whole, and when they fulfill this command together, the kingdom of God will be revealed to all nations.

In summary, in the New Testament, the center of discipleship is Jesus, and discipleship begins with the call of Jesus. Just as God made the people of Israel his people in the Old Testament, the New Testament shows that Jesus' disciples become the people of God's kingdom through the proclamation of the kingdom of God. Discipleship is not a response to an individual call, but rather a community moving forward in response to the call and command of Jesus. Discipleship means living with a new heart and attitude as a member of the kingdom of God.

5.1.3 Conclusion

In dealing with sanctification and discipleship in the Bible, it is clear that sanctification and discipleship, although they differ in some of the details, are closely related.

First, the beginning of both sanctification and discipleship is God. The Old Testament shows the relationship between God as the leader and the servant who follows the leader, and the New Testament shows the beginning of sanctification and the beginning of discipleship through the relationship between Jesus as teacher and Lord and the disciples who follow his call.

Moreover, through the call of God and Jesus, this chapter so far has demonstrated the change of position of those who respond to that call to a new life of obedience. Sanctification and discipleship can be understood in the same context when a believer lives according to the call and response of God. And just as sanctification cannot be achieved by individual effort, neither can discipleship. This is because discipleship begins as a response to Jesus'

calling.

Finally, it has been demonstrated that sanctification and discipleship are not individual moral efforts, but they require the community to work together. Being a people of the kingdom of God in the Old Testament and becoming a member of the kingdom of God as disciples of Jesus in the New Testament can be understood as analogous.

In achieving sanctification, discipleship is the necessary practical approach. Both sanctification and discipleship involve a response to God's call—in other words, obedience. However, true obedience is possible only in Jesus Christ. Therefore, it can be said that sanctification and discipleship are the most important work that can be accomplished through the Holy Spirit for those who believe in Jesus and live by applying his teachings in daily life as disciples.

5.2 The relationship between the Reformed doctrine of sanctification and the Anabaptist concept of discipleship

Historically, it was the Anabaptists who started to see discipleship as central to Christianity, but the Reformed church movements at the time of the Reformation had the concept of discipleship to some extent through the doctrine of sanctification. This is because both sanctification and discipleship speak of the believer's life in Jesus Christ.

5.2.1 Luther's justification by faith and the Anabaptists' discipleship

As mentioned in Chapter 2, the Reformation began with Martin Luther's understanding of justification. Luther said that Christians cannot be justified

through their thoughts and ideas and actions, but only through faith in Jesus Christ (see 2.1). Therefore, it is said that faith and the Word of God bring salvation, and through Jesus Christ all can be justified because he is the end and fulfilment of the law. Luther understood that justification by faith refers to the relationship of the believer with Jesus, like the relationship between the bride and groom, and that the believer is freed from all sins through Jesus Christ. So, it can be seen that Luther's concept of justification does not focus on the journey of believers, but rather on the change of their position or the change of status through justification. For Luther, justification is the beginning of sanctification, and justification is being associated with or connected to a new reality. Christ's victory over sin and death is given to the believer through the actual presence of Christ, a prerequisite for justification (see 2.1). So Luther's understanding of sanctification is a union with Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit through justification by faith in Jesus. Just as Luther's understanding of justification involves the change and sanctification of believers' status, so the Anabaptist concept of discipleship includes both of Luther's meanings in this one word. As Klaassen puts it, Anabaptists speak of the importance of a confession of faith in Jesus Christ and the accompanying obedience (2.5). Like Luther, Anabaptists understood that believers could become children of God because Christ became the atoning sacrifice. Hoffman understood that nobody can be made good by any deed except through innocent death, a clean, spotless body that does not come from a cursed seed (2.4). Hubmaier also understood the salvation of Christians as Jesus making peace between himself and poor sinners, and through his obedience gaining an inheritance for them (2.4). Also, as Klaassen understood (4.2), Anabaptists understood that the

atonement on the cross, justification, sanctification, and discipleship are inseparable processes. Thus it can be seen that the Anabaptists also agree with Luther's confession that believers are justified by faith and become united with Jesus.

5.2.2 Calvin's concept of union in Christ and the Anabaptists' concept of discipleship

Calvin's understanding of the believer's life and sanctification is shown through the expression of union with Jesus, as already examined in Chapter 2. For Calvin, like Luther, the Word of God is central to his sanctification and Christian life. Calvin says (see 2.2) that the Scripture tells us two things: the former is that God's righteous love can be planted in our hearts, and the latter is that God's Law will prevent believers from going astray while they pursue righteousness. For Calvin, justification, sanctification, and Christian life come from Jesus Christ and are given when believers are united to Christ. Moreover, the subject of sanctification is the Holy Spirit, and with his help believers can enter the process of sanctification because the Holy Spirit inspires them with new thoughts and hearts (2.4). Thus, for Calvin, union with Christ is the most important expression of salvation and understanding the life of believers, just as justification covers sanctification for Luther. Thus, Calvin's sanctification is Christological, and is in line with the Anabaptist understanding of discipleship. As Bender noted (4.2.2), discipleship is the transformation of an individual's entire life and of the church, following the example of Jesus Christ. The important thing here is to follow the example of Jesus Christ. Anabaptists

thoroughly understand discipleship centred on Jesus Christ. Without Jesus Christ, there would be no discipleship. Becker (4.2.2) emphasizes the continuity of Jesus' work, saying that discipleship is joyfully obedient to Jesus because of what he has done and what he continues to do in the lives of believers. Thus, like Calvin's concept of union with Christ, the Anabaptist view of discipleship is also Christ-centered, and says that just as sanctification cannot take place outside of Christ, neither can discipleship.

5.2.3 The Puritan concept of sanctification and the Anabaptist concept of discipleship

The Puritans' understanding of sanctification stems from Calvin's view of union with Christ, which focuses on the progress of the believer's life. First, the Puritans understood that just as justification is accomplished by God's grace, so sanctification begins and is accomplished by God's grace (see 2.3). Owen understood that sanctification is the immediate working of the Spirit of God in the lives of believers, cleansing them from tainted and defiled sins, renewing them in the image of God, enabling them to live according to the principles of grace, and of the death and life of Jesus Christ (2.3). John Flavel also said that Christ is the author of sanctification and salvation, and that sanctification is the work of God and the work of the Holy Spirit through Jesus Christ (2.3). The greatest contribution of the Puritans, based on Calvin's concept of union with Christ, was that sanctification is a progressive work. Owen said that holiness grows "by strengthening and increasing the graces we have received and exercised" (2.3). Thus, Puritans believed that grace and growth in grace go

together and cannot be separated. Puritans understood that if believers receive grace, they should live a life of growth in response to that grace, just as a seed grows and bears fruit. This clearly means that sanctification is in the process, showing that life is growing with the help of the Holy Spirit. Just as the Puritans understood sanctification as a process, the Anabaptists also understood discipleship as a process of life, not a one-time event. Becker (4.2) says that faith requires obedience, and obedience requires faith, and that the faith and obedience of believers go together. This shows that discipleship continues to respond to the grace of Jesus Christ and his salvation, as sanctification was to the Puritans. Discipleship implies that a disciple can suffer and be persecuted for the name of Jesus Christ, just as Jesus was. Discipleship is the result of an active relationship with Christ and an exciting way of living the Christian faith (4.2). Thus, Anabaptist discipleship, as the Puritans said, is a response to the call of Jesus Christ, which leads to a process of transformation.

5.2.4 Wesleyan sanctification and Anabaptist discipleship

As we have already seen in Chapter 2, the starting point for Wesley's understanding of sanctification is that it comes after justification. Wesley's understanding of sanctification is faith working in love. In his book *A Plain Account of Christian Perfection*, he quotes Romans 13:9 and 10, saying without a doubt that all laws are perfected by love. What God requires of people now is that faith be worked upon or acted upon by love (2.4). Wesley believed that Christianity should show its reality through faith working by God's love in everyday life. He understood that faith is living a new life in the love of Jesus

Christ, and when we live that life, we grow fully as a child grows. So, as did the Puritans and Anabaptists, Wesley understood and spoke of the progressive work of sanctification. What is often misunderstood about Wesley's concept of sanctification is that he used the words "Christian perfection" with the nuance that sanctification could be accomplished perfectly on earth. However, Wesley did not envisage a complete sanctification on earth, but "renewal of the heart in the whole image of God" and becoming like Christ (2.4). Thus, Wesley's view of sanctification is also linked to Calvin's conception of union with Jesus Christ, which is linked to the Puritans' understanding of continuing to grow with the help of the Holy Spirit. Anabaptist discipleship is also aligned with Wesley's understanding in this area. Discipleship has already been initiated by the call of Jesus, and it means living as a disciple of Jesus with the help of the Holy Spirit. The discipleship of the Anabaptists means a life of being renewed in Jesus every day through faith and obedience and becoming like him according to his attributes.

In summary, Luther, Calvin, the Puritans, and Wesley may differ in their degree, but they agree that the beginning of sanctification is Jesus Christ, and when believers abide in Him they progress through the process of sanctification with the help of the Holy Spirit. Anabaptist discipleship also begins with Jesus Christ, and when disciples abide in Him, they become more like Jesus Christ according to the faith and obedience that the Holy Spirit gives them in Jesus.

5.3 Sanctification as discipleship in the community of faith

So far, this thesis has looked at the approaches and understandings of various

theologians about sanctification, and their connections with the Anabaptists' view of discipleship. In sanctification and discipleship, along with individual responses to Jesus, it is the role of the community of believers that must be addressed. This is because the church is the body of Jesus Christ, and believers are members of the body of Jesus Christ.

5.3.1 Biblical evidence for the application to the church and life of believers

As already mentioned in Chapter 3, both the Old and New Testaments indicate that God's call focuses on the community as a whole rather than on the individual, or even if he calls the individual, God's call is directed toward the community. Chapter 3 highlighted God's message and his law to all of Israel, as seen in Leviticus 20 and 26, which require that the whole of Israel should become holy like God, and that when they obey his laws, God's blessings will come upon them, and they will become the kingdom of God to show his greatness and might to other nations (3.1.5). So, when Israel obeys God's law, their community is protected by God's law and they can protect each other. That is why God's law has the form of social law. Moreover, when all Israel lives according to God's law, Israel will remember and experience God, and the community will reveal God's glory to all the earth. This speaks simultaneously of the responsibility for personal holiness and the responsibility of the community. When an individual responds irresponsibly to holiness, the community suffers from it, and the community loses even its holiness. Achan's sin (Joshua 7) clearly demonstrates this. Therefore, the necessity for holiness, according to the Old Testament, applies to the holiness of the individual and the holiness of the

community. The meaning of communal sanctification in the New Testament can be seen in various expressions, but the meaning can be summarized in the term “saints,” which means a group of believers. As seen in section 3.2.3, Paul, through the expression “saints,” tells the churches that believers are in Jesus Christ. Frangipane (3.2.3) states that “personal maturity, which is holiness, will always be found in dynamic fellowship with the community of faith”. Peter also uses the Old Testament to describe those who believe as a holy nation and God’s own people. Acts 10 tells us that when Cornelius came to believe in Jesus Christ, his entire family was saved. By expressing that salvation is not just for one person, but for the whole family, Luke implicitly shows that salvation involves the individual and the whole community. In addition, when Paul says that salvation came to the Gentiles, he is referring to the whole group, not just particular Gentiles. Therefore, it is saying that both Israel and the Gentiles will be saved through Jesus Christ. In summary, the messages about holiness and sanctification in both the Old and New Testaments are directed not only to the individual but to the community as a whole and show that they are being built and grown together in Jesus Christ.

5.3.2 Sanctification through the church and the life of believers

As briefly mentioned in Chapter 2, theologians have addressed, to varying degrees, the importance of the church, or community of believers, when dealing with sanctification. This is because the church is the center of the lives of believers as the body of Jesus Christ. For Luther, sanctification is inseparable from the church. Believers are not sanctified by themselves, but through the church. Luther (see 2.7) says that God has a unique congregation in the world,

the mother who begets all Christians through the Word of God that he reveals. They understand, accept, cling, and persevere. Calvin, like Luther, emphasizes that the center of sanctification is the church. Through the concept of maternal care, Calvin says that believers grow in the church and achieve the fulfillment of their faith. Believers who are called by God are united with other believers through fellowship with Christ (2.6). The Puritans emphasize the community of faith through communion. This fellowship is only possible through Jesus Christ, says Owen (2.6). The Puritans emphasized private worship and worship within the family as well as the extended family of the church (2.6). Wesley says that sanctification can only be achieved through a community of faith, not through individuals. Wesley understands that the gospel is social and therefore holiness is social holiness. Wesley views sanctification as connected with the community—it is a sanctification in which the social dimension is fundamental (2.6). Although there are differences in expression, all the theologians mentioned so far understand that the church, that is, the community of faith, is the center of sanctification of believers, and that sanctification cannot be achieved as an individual. In summary, in sanctification, the church nurtures, teaches, and guides believers in the Word as the body of Jesus Christ. This body is the community in fellowship with Jesus Christ, and through union with the community, believers can become like Jesus Christ together.

5.3.3 Anabaptist practice for application to the church and the life of believers

Anabaptists may have some differences, but there is no doubt that community is central to the lives of believers. This is because discipleship does not refer

just to individual discipleship, but to community discipleship. For the Anabaptists, the church is, as Wenger puts it (4.3), “a community of those who have chosen the way of Jesus.” On the basis of this understanding, wherever the Anabaptists were, they tried to establish a community first, and the place where the community was established served as a kind of church. The Hutterite community is the most prominent example. Within this community of faith, believers enter the process of transformation together as a redeemed community. For the Anabaptists, baptism is an announcement to the church and the world that they belong to the community of salvation, and it means a determination to live as a disciple of Christ with the same faith and mind as a member of that community. For this reason, it is important for the Anabaptists to confess the faith of those who are being baptized, and it is done voluntarily in the presence of Jesus Christ and the church, not by compulsion by anyone. This confession and baptism by faith is the first step for believers to walk as disciples in the footsteps of Jesus Christ together with the church, and through the Lord’s Supper they can be reminded that they are members of the body of the Lord every day. For Anabaptists, the word “voluntary” has an important meaning. This is because baptism is accomplished through a voluntary decision and confession of faith, and the Lord’s Supper is also a participation by voluntary decision and confession, not coercion or obligation. However, in order to fulfill their responsibilities as the body of Christ, the Anabaptist church nurtures and disciplines believers to keep them from going the other way. For this process, the Anabaptist church disciplined believers through the ban and excommunication from the beginning, because, as Calvin and Luther recognized, all people are liable to sin and must be built together. It should be

noted here that the ban and excommunication are not eternal, for the purpose is to restore them in the love of Christ. All those who profess their faith and are baptized are members of the church, sharing and building each other's needs in love, just as the first disciples did in the book of Acts. Through this, believers recognize each other as brothers and sisters in Christ, and realize what life is like as a disciple. Finally, a disciples' life is a life that follows the life of Jesus, so this life must be oriented toward peace. This non-violence is sometimes seen as passive, in keeping the peace that Jesus has given us. However, this would be impossible without clear discipleship. Deciding to follow Jesus' path is the same as deciding to follow the path Jesus took to the cross. For this reason, many early Anabaptists were persecuted and killed. However, they were not afraid of death or persecution because Jesus and his disciples had already shown in the Bible what the life of a disciple was, so they could follow that way.

In summary, the Bible is clear about the community of believers, for God calls the whole community to do his work. Although there are some differences between Anabaptists and others, they all agree that the church or community of believers is important in sanctification, and because each person is weak, they work together to form the body of Christ through community cooperation.

5.3.4 How all of this could work out in the current Anabaptist church setting in North America

In the twenty-first century, the greatest enemy of the church is individualism. At some point, the church has emphasized individual salvation, but has neglected to speak of the salvation of the community as a whole. Of course, the Bible also

speaks of personal salvation. However, when individual salvation is with the community of believers, it builds up the body of Christ, the church. Faith is not acquired by coercion, but, as the Anabaptists emphasized, comes through the voluntary heart of believers. So, to have faith is not a personal ability or strength, but a voluntary heart given by the Holy Spirit. Moreover, some churches make the mistake of trying to make believers through so many programs and events. A person can see so many church programs just by browsing the internet. Because the church is a community that is built up together in one faith and one Lord, sometimes too many programs make believers tired and exhausted. Thus, the three categories that Anabaptists emphasize can be a guide for churches to re-examine their identities and show which path to follow and what to do.

First, Jesus Christ is the center of our faith. The believer's faith is not a means to receive blessings, not a way to become successful, but a means to follow Jesus Christ. Therefore, as did the early Anabaptists, churches must start with a heart for Jesus and faith in him.

Second, the community is the center of the believer's life. Believers cannot lead a life of faith through personal efforts. The Christian life has its limits. Jesus called his disciples and made them walk by faith together. As there are many parts of the body, believers need one another, and by forgiving one another, they experience God's forgiveness for them. Through the community, believers check and encourage each other's faith and life, and build one another up together. This is why believers need community.

Finally, reconciliation is a Christ-given work that the community must

accomplish. Jesus did not let the gospel apply only to the church. The essence of the gospel is that Jesus Christ, the Son of God, came to this earth to proclaim forgiveness and made sinful humans God's people. Thus, through Jesus Christ, believers have been reconciled to God, so that members of the community are reconciled together through this reconciliation with God. In summary, these three principles—Jesus is the center of faith, community is the center of believers' lives, and reconciliation is the center of believers' calling—can be used to re-examine the identity of the church and believers. It can be a way to show them where they should go.

5.4 Towards a doctrine of sanctification in Anabaptist perspective

This thesis has examined whether Anabaptist discipleship can be connected with sanctification. Anabaptists speak of sanctification as a change of position and progress of believers that can be achieved through the call of Jesus Christ and through the church. The thesis has also examined the important role of community in making disciples, and described the parallels between sanctification and discipleship. Although Anabaptists tend not to use the word sanctification, the word discipleship, which they do use, sufficiently contains the concept of sanctification, and the understanding that believers live their lives with the help of the Holy Spirit is very similar to sanctification. In addition to the emphasis on the Holy Spirit, the Bible is an important guide in both sanctification and discipleship of believers. Therefore, it is not very different from the theology that emphasizes *sola Scriptura*. Just as sanctification emphasizes faith in Jesus, discipleship is also a life centered on Jesus and a

life that actively follows in Jesus' footsteps. So both sanctification and discipleship are centered on Jesus Christ. Just as sanctification applies to all believers, discipleship also emphasizes communality in the formation of mature disciples. However, if there is a difference between sanctification and discipleship, it is that sanctification is a doctrine of the whole of salvation, but for the Anabaptists, discipleship encompasses the entire life of the believer. Anabaptists do not understand the salvation of believers in terms of the order of salvation, such as "the effective calling, Regeneration, Justification, Sanctification, and Glorification" (Grudem, 2000:657-852) but rather understand baptism, the Lord's Supper, and worship all at once through the great category of discipleship. Of course, Reformed theology also understands the whole of salvation in terms of the order of salvation, but the Anabaptists did not make a special distinction. This is also the reason why the Anabaptists have not been particularly aware of discipleship as sanctification so far. Anabaptist theology is not a creed-establishing theology, but a practical theology of discipleship that explains the life course of believers. For this reason, it is clear that Anabaptist discipleship refers to the sanctification of believers, that is, following Jesus and becoming like his character.

5.5 Conclusion

Anabaptist discipleship can be understood alongside sanctification because the Bible tells believers to follow Jesus and become more holy. Like discipleship, sanctification speaks of the lives of believers. Anabaptist discipleship is thus the realisation of a theology of sanctification. It is not merely one step in the journey

of salvation, it is the whole of a believer's life, the journey of disciples who are determined to follow Jesus Christ.

CHAPTER 6. Conclusion

6.1 Summary of the research

This thesis discusses the relationship between sanctification and Anabaptist discipleship and describes the role of community. It has covered the historical, biblical, and theological views of sanctification through Chapters 2 and 3. The historical accounts have dealt with the perspectives of significant theologians: Luther's view of justification and its relationship with sanctification, Calvin's view of union with Christ, the Puritan view of the Christian life, Wesley's view of Christian perfection, and their understanding of the church. Although there may be some differences among these theologians, all understood that sanctification begins with God and proceeds in the lives of believers with God's help. Thus, Chapter 2 described sanctification as an ongoing process that responds to God's manifestation of his attributes and grace. In Chapter 3, the concept of sanctification in the Old and New Testaments was analyzed through keywords and context. In addition, it studied holiness, the keywords of the Old Testament, its example sentences, and its relationship to sanctification in the New Testament. Moreover, when approached theologically, it looked at the concepts of positioned and progressive sanctification and noted how they apply to the lives of believers. Chapter 3 also examined the biblical concept of discipleship in the Old Testament and the Gospels. Then, in Chapter 4, this paper looked at the Anabaptists' perspective on discipleship and how it was applied to the lives of believers. Chapter 5 looked at how the concept of sanctification relates to the Anabaptist concept of discipleship. Specifically, it examined whether the idea of discipleship can be combined with the doctrine of sanctification. Finally, it

explored how the combination of sanctification and discipleship can be applied to the lives of believers and the practices of the church.

6.2 Research objectives

The specific objectives of this thesis have been realised. (1) Traditional doctrinal expressions of sanctification have been examined. (2) The scriptural foundations of the doctrine of sanctification—both its positioned and progressive elements—have been investigated. (3) Anabaptist perspectives on Christian discipleship and the role of the Christian community were highlighted, and (4) an understanding of discipleship that takes full account of the Christian community's role in sanctification was developed, with a brief formulation of a doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles (see 6.5 below).

The main topic of this thesis was whether Anabaptist discipleship can be understood as sanctification, and what might be the influence of the role of the church on sanctification and discipleship. Just as sanctification is the work of God, especially the Holy Spirit, and Jesus Christ is the center, we also confirmed that the Anabaptists also see Jesus Christ as the center of discipleship with the help of the Holy Spirit. Regarding sanctification, this paper confirmed that the church advances together in holiness, the calling of God, through the unity of believers, and the Anabaptists also recognize that the church is a community centered on Jesus Christ and moving in the footsteps of Jesus Christ in one faith. Anabaptists are oriented toward a life of discipleship that imitates Jesus through baptism, the Lord's Supper, sharing of common property, and a life of non-violence. In other words, Anabaptist discipleship is

not theoretical sanctification, but practical sanctification in the lives of believers. Sanctification is not separate from salvation. Anabaptist discipleship can be understood as a realisation of the theology of sanctification that encompasses the entire journey of salvation.

6.3 Significance of the research

The significance of this thesis is that it attempts to understand the connection between Anabaptist discipleship and sanctification, and to find commonalities and connections between them. In addition, it is an attempt to explain communal sanctification, a concept that has been overlooked as an aspect of sanctification. It is the role of the community in sanctification that must be considered and studied together in the lives of believers.

6.4 Conclusion

This dissertation began with the question of whether the theological perspective of the Anabaptists and their concept of discipleship can be understood within a theological framework. This is because, since the beginning of the Anabaptist movement, they have not established a doctrinal statement. Anabaptists do not follow established theological categories because the discipleship they share itself encompasses all theological categories, as this paper concludes.

Therefore, it can be said that Anabaptist discipleship is a community-centered process, an expression of the theology of sanctification based on Jesus Christ, and it means that believers must follow in the footsteps of Jesus Christ, imitating his character, demonstrating the faith and love that Jesus showed, and living a life that is in accordance with his commands.

6.5 An Anabaptist doctrine of sanctification

A doctrine of sanctification that is compatible with Anabaptist principles can be expressed as below:

- a. Sanctification can be understood as both positional, which speaks of a change of status before God, and progressive, which speaks of a process of strengthening and increasing the spiritual life of believers.
- b. Just as historically the center of sanctification for Anabaptists was Jesus Christ and the work of the Holy Spirit, so also Anabaptists view discipleship as a process that is Christ-centered and dependent on the work of the Holy Spirit.
- c. Just as the church plays an important role in the sanctification of believers, so also Christian disciples are established and built up together with one another through the community of believers.

6.6 Areas for further research

This thesis has examined the doctrine of sanctification and the Anabaptist concept of discipleship, and has shown that the two are compatible. An area that could be further studied is the practical application of these concepts in the church, in order to suggest a range of specific ways in which a Christian community could foster the sanctification and discipleship of its members.

Reference list

- Allen, M. and Swain, S.R. 2017. *Sanctification*. New studies in dogmatics. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan.
- Banks, R.J. 1980. *Paul's idea of community: the early house churches in their historical setting*. Exeter: Paternoster Press.
- Barth, K. 1956. *Church dogmatics*. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark.
- Becker, P. 2017. *Anabaptist essentials: ten signs of a unique Christian faith*. Scottdale: Herald Press [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Beeke, J.R. and Jones, M. 2012. *A Puritan theology: doctrine for life* [Kindle ed.]. Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Bender, H. S. 1944. *The anabaptist vision*. Herald Press [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Boice, J.M. 1971. *Philippians: an expositional commentary*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan.
- Bonhoeffer, D. 1995. *The cost of discipleship*. New York: Touchstone ed.
- Bromiley, G.W. 1953. *Zwingli and Bullinger*. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press.
- Brown, C., Coenen, L., Beyreuther, E., & Bietenhard, H. 1986. *The new international dictionary of New Testament theology*. Revised edition, vol. 2, G-Pre. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan.
- Bruce, F.F. 2017. *1 and 2 Thessalonians*. Volume 45. Zondervan. [Kindle ed.]. Available: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Brunk, G.R. 2015. *Galatians*. Believers Church Bible Commentary. Herald Press. [Kindle ed.]. Available: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Calvin, J. 2007. *Institutes of the Christian religion*, revised ed. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson. [Ebook ed.] Available at: <http://www.monergism.com>
- Chung, P.S. 2009. *The Spirit of God transforming life: the reformation and theology of the Holy Spirit*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Cosby, B.H. 2014. *John Flavel: Puritan life and thought in Stuart England*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.
- Davids, P.H. Yarbrough, R.W., & Moo, D.J. (2016). *1 and 2 Peter, Jude, 1, 2, and 3 John*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Academic.

- Denck, H. 1981. Recantation. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press. pp. 54-55.
- Catholic Dictionary. 2020. Saints. Retrieved May 18, 2020, from <https://www.catholicculture.org/culture/library/dictionary/index.cfm?id=36247>
- Dieter, M.E., Hoekema, A.A., Horton, S.M., McQuilkin, J.R. and Walvoord, J.F. 1996. *Five views on sanctification*. Grand Rapids, MI.: Zondervan.
- Dunn, J.D.G. 1988. *Romans 1-8*. Word biblical commentary, vol. 38a. Word Books. [Kindle ed.] Available: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- . 1996. *The epistles to the Colossians and to Philemon: a commentary on the Greek text*. The new international Greek testament commentary. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans.
- Dyck, C.J. 1993. *An introduction to Mennonite history: a popular history of the Anabaptists and the Mennonites*. 3rd revised edition. Scottdale: Herald Press.
- Elliott, J.H. 2000. *1 Peter: a new translation with introduction and commentary*. Anchor Bible, ed. William Foxwell Albright and David Noel Freedman, vol. 37B. New York: Doubleday.
- Ellis, P.F. 1984. *The genius of John: a composition-critical commentary on the fourth gospel*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press.
- Evans, T., & Holman, C.S.B.B. 2019. *The Tony Evans Bible commentary: advancing God's kingdom agenda*. Holman Bible [Kindle ed.]. Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Ferguson, S.B. 2017. *The reformed view of sanctification*. <https://www.uniontheology.org/resources/life/the-reformed-view-of-sanctification> Date of access: 23 Apr. 2019.
- . 2018. Luther's advice for the Christian life. *Tabletalk*, October 2018. <https://tabletalkmagazine.com/posts/2018/10/luthers-advice-for-the-christian-life/> Date of access: 22 Apr. 2019.
- Finger, T. 2004. *A contemporary Anabaptist theology: biblical, historical constructive*. [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Flavel, J. 2016. *An Exposition of the Assembly's Shorter Catechism*. Bible Presbyterian Church WSC Project [online] Available at: http://www.shortercatechism.com/resources/flavel/wsc_fl_035.html Date of access: 18 Apr. 2019.
- . 1853. *The Method of Grace in the Holy Spirits Applying to the Souls of Men the Eternal Redemption Contrived by the Father and Accomplished*

by the Son. Religions tracts Society. [Ebook ed.] Available at:
<http://books.google.ca>

Frangipane, F. 2011. *Holiness, truth, and the presence of God*. Lake Mary: Charisma House.

Friedmann, R. 1973. *The theology of Anabaptism: an interpretation*. Studies in Anabaptist and Mennonite History, no. 15. Scottdale: Herald Press.

Galicinski, L. 2007. John Calvin's Doctrine of Sanctification.
<http://www.depositsoffaiht.com/papers/Calvin%20on%20Sanctification.pdf>
 Date of access: 12 Mar. 2018.

Geiger, E., Kelley, M., Nation, P. 2012. *Transformational discipleship: how people really grow*. B&H Publishing Group [Ebook ed.] Available at:
<http://www.christianbook.com>

Gentry, P.J. and Wellum, S.J. 2012. *Kingdom through covenant: A biblical-theological understanding of the covenant*. Wheaton, IL: Crossway.

George, T. 2013. *Theology of the reformers*. Revised ed. Nashville: B & H Publishing Group [Ebook ed.] Available at:
<http://www.barnsandnoble.com>

González J.L. 1975. *A history of Christian thought*. Nashville: Abingdon Press [eBook ed.] Available at: <http://www.barnsandnoble.com>

Gorman, M., ed. 2015. *Becoming the gospel: Paul, participation, and mission*. The gospel and our culture series. Eerdmans [Kindle ed.] Available at:
<http://www.amazon.ca>

Graves, D. 2021. *Zwingli's sixty-seven articles*.
<https://christianhistoryinstitute.org/study/module/zwinglis-sixty-seven-articles>
 Date of Access: 26 Mar. 2021.

Grebel, C. 1981. Letter to Muntzer. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 196.

Grenz, S.J. 2000. *Theology for the community of God*. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>

Grudem, W. 1994. *Systematic theology: an introduction to biblical doctrine*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan.

Gushee, D.P., Stassen, G.H., 2016. *Kingdom Ethics, 2nd ed.: Following Jesus in Contemporary Context*, 2 edition. ed. Eerdmans [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>

Guthrie, D. 1983. *The letter to the Hebrews: an introduction and commentary*. The Tyndale New Testament commentaries. Inter-Varsity Press [Freeding ed.] Available at: <http://www.freading.com>

- Hartley, J.E. 1992. *Leviticus*. Word biblical commentary. Dallas, TX: Word Books [Freeding ed.] Available at: <http://www.freading.com>
- Hess, R. et al. 2017. *Leviticus*. The Expositor's Bible Commentary. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Academic.
- Hill, Todd E. 2014. *Justification and sanctification in the Southern Baptist Church in West Virginia: implications in worship and practice of faith*. Lynchburg: Liberty Baptist Theological Seminary. (Thesis – DMin).
- Hillmer, M.R. 1996. They believed in him: discipleship in the Johannine tradition. In: Longenecker, R.N. ed. *Patterns of discipleship in the New Testament*, vol. 1. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans, pp.77-97.
- Hoffman, M. 1981. Truthful witness. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 31.
- Holladay, W. L., & Köhler, L. 1988. *A concise Hebrew and Aramaic lexicon of the Old Testament: based upon the lexical work of Ludwig Koehler and Walter Baumgartner*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans.
- Horton, M.S. 2011 *The Christian faith: a systematic theology for pilgrims on the way*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan. [Ebook ed] Available at: <https://www.barnesandnoble.com/w/christian-faith-michael-s-horton/1100268917?ean=9780310286042>
- Howard, J.M. 2006. *Paul, the community, and progressive sanctification: an exploration into community-based transformation within Pauline theology*. New York: Peter Lang.
- Hubmaier, B. 1981a. The twelve articles. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 28.
- . 1981b. Justification. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 51.
- . 1981c. The sum of a Christian life. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, pp. 51, 199.
- Hull, B. 2006. *The complete book of discipleship: on being and making followers of Christ*. Navigators reference library. Colorado Springs, CO: NavPress. [Ebook ed.] Available at <http://www.christianbook.com>
- Hurtado, L.W. 1996. Following Jesus in the Gospel of John. In: Longenecker, R.N. ed., *Patterns of discipleship in the New Testament*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans, pp. 9-29.
- Hutter, J. 1981. Plots and excuses. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 73.

- Kapic, K.M., ed. 2014. *Sanctification: explorations in theology and practice*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press.
- Kautz, J. 1981. The seven articles. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p.57.
- Klaassen, W. 1981. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press.
- Kruse, C.G. 2017. *John: an introduction and commentary*. Tyndale New Testament commentaries, second series, volume 4. InterVarsity Press, USA [Freeding ed.] Available at: <http://www.freading.com>
- Lasor, W.S., Hubbard, D.A., & Bush, F.W. 1982. *Old Testament survey: the message, form, and background of the Old Testament*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans.
- Lints, R. 2014. Living by faith alone: reformed responses to Antinomianism. In: Kapic, K.M., ed., *Sanctification: explorations in theology and practice*. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press.
- Longenecker, R.N. 1996. Taking up the cross daily: discipleship in Luke-Acts. In: Longenecker, R.N. ed., *Patterns of discipleship in the New Testament* (Vol. 1). Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans, pp.50-76.
- Luther, M. 1986. *Luther's small catechism*. <http://catchism.cph.org/en/creed.html> Date of access: 12 Mar. 2018.
- Luther, M., Thornton, J. F. and Varenne, S.B. 2002. *Faith and freedom: an invitation to the writings of Martin Luther*. 1st ed. Vintage spiritual classics. New York: Vintage.
- Lyon, E. s.a. Was the "image of God" destroyed by sin? <https://apologeticspress.org/apcontent.aspx?article=564> Date of access: 25 Jun. 2021.
- MacCulloch, D. 2004. *The reformation*. New York: Viking. [Ebook ed.] Available at: <http://www.barnsandnoble.com>
- Marpeck, P., Klassen, W., & Klaassen, W. 1978. *The writings of Pilgram Marpeck*. Classics of the radical reformation, 2. Scottdale: Herald Press.
- Marshall, P. 2009 *The reformation: a very short introduction*. Oxford University Press.
- Mery, Drew. 2013. *The sanctification of the believer: positional, progressive & perfect*. <https://reformedbaptistdaily.files.wordpress.com/2012/09/the-sanctification-of-the-believer-positional-progressive-perfect.pdf> Date of access: 27 Feb. 2018.
- Migliore, D.L. 2014. *Faith seeking understanding: an introduction to Christian theology*. 3rd ed. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans.

- Murray, S. 2015. *The naked Anabaptist: the bare essentials of a radical faith*. Scottdale: Herald Press.
- O'Donovan, O. 2014. Sanctification and ethics. In: Kopic, K.M., ed., *Sanctification: explorations in theology and practice*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press., pp.150-166.
- Owen, J. 1954. *The Holy Spirit, his gifts and power: exposition of the Spirit's name, nature, personality, dispensation, operations and effects*. Grand Rapids, MI: Kregel Publications.
- . 2003. *On communion with God*. Christian classics for the modern world. [Epub ed.] Available at: <http://www.monergism.com>
- Packer, J.I. 1993. *Concise theology: a guide to historic Christian beliefs*. Wheaton, IL: Tyndale House [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Pardosi, M. 2015. The concept of sanctification in the book of Leviticus: a study of Leviticus 11 and 20. *Sociology Study* 5, 775-784.
- Peterson, D. 1995. *Possessed by God: a New Testament theology of sanctification and holiness*. New studies in biblical theology. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans. [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Philips, D. 1981. Sending the preachers. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, pp. 136-137.
- Plett, H. 1996. *Seeking to be faithful: the story of the evangelical Mennonite conference*. Steinbach: Evangelical Mennonite Conference.
- Porter, S.E. 1994. *Idioms of the Greek New Testament*. 2nd ed. Sheffield: Bloomsbury T&T Clark.
- Rausch, T.P. 2000. *Catholics and evangelicals: do they share a common future?* Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press.
- Riedemann, P., 2019. *Peter Riedemann's Hutterite Confession of Faith*, Annotated edition. ed. Scottdale: Herald Press. [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Rochester, K.M. 2020. *God the leader: a journey through the Old Testament*. Wipf & Stock. [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Roth, John D. 2005. *Beliefs: Mennonite faith and practice*. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press.
- Russie, A. 2013. *The essential works of John Wesley: selected sermons, essays, and other writings*. Uhrichsville: Barbour.

- Ryle, J.C. 2017. *Holiness*. Benediction Books. Available at: <http://www.monergism.com>
- Sanders, F. 2013. *Wesley on the Christian life: the heart renewed in love*. Wheaton: Crossway.
- Scaer, D. P. 1985. Sanctification in Lutheran Theology. *Concordia Theological Quarterly*, 49(2-3):181-195.
- Schiemer, L. 1981. Letter to the church at Ratenberg. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 64.
- Schlaffer, H. 1981. Brief instruction. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 79.
- Simons, M. 1956. *The complete writings of Menno Simons c. 1496-1561*. Scottdale: Herald Press. [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- . 1981. The new birth. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 118.
- Smith, K.G., 2016. *Writing and research: a guide for theological students*. Cumbria: Langham Global Library.
- Snider, A.V. 2010. Sanctification and justification: a unity of distinctions. *The Master's Seminary Journal* 21(2):1–20.
- Snyder, Howard A. 1978. Wesley's concept of the church. *The Asbury Seminary* 33(1):34-59.
- Stadler, U. 1981. Cherished Instruction. In: Klaassen, W., ed. *Anabaptism in outline*. Scottdale: Herald Press, p. 128.
- StudyLight.org. 2020. Greek Lexicon. <https://www.studylight.org/lexicons/greek/37.html> Date of access: 9 Jun. 2020.
- Thiessen, A. 2009. *Hope for tough times: studies in the letters of Peter: for classes and small groups*. Steinbach Bible College.
- Thiselton, A.C. 1980. *The two horizons: New Testament hermeneutics and philosophical description*. 1st American ed. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans.
- Tidball, D. 2014. Holiness: restoring God's image. In: Kopic, K.M., ed. *Sanctification: explorations in theology and practice*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press.
- Toews, J.E. 2004. *Romans*. Believers Church Bible Commentary. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press. [Kindle ed.]. Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>

- Toon, P. 1983. *Justification and sanctification*. Wheaton: Crossway Books.
- Towns, E. 1969. *Martin Luther on Sanctification*. Paper 14. http://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/towns_articles/14
- Vainio, O.-P. 2008. *Justification and participation in Christ: the development of the Lutheran doctrine of justification from Luther to the Formula of Concord (1580)*. Studies in medieval and reformation traditions, v. 130. Leiden: Brill.
- Vine, W.E. 1952. *Vine's expository dictionary of New Testament words: complete and unabridged*, EAC – LIV. Uhrichsville, OH: Barbour.
- Wallace, D.B. 2000. *The basics of New Testament syntax: an intermediate Greek grammar*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan.
- Wenger, J.C. 1991. *What Mennonites believe*. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press.
- Wenham, G.J. 1979. *The book of Leviticus*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Wesley, J., & Wesley, C. 1739. *Hymns and sacred poems*. London: William Strahan.
- Wesley, J. 1999. *The sermons of John Wesley*. Sermon 5, Justification by faith. Edited by Weldon Shuman. <http://wesley.nnu.edu/john-wesley/the-sermons-of-john-wesley-1872-edition/sermon-5-justification-by-faith> Date of Access: 16 Nov. 2018.
- . 2019a. *Sermons of John Wesley*. Sermon 6. Available at: <http://www.godrules.net/library/wsermons/wsermons6.htm> Date of access 18 Apr. 2019.
- . 2019b. *A plain account of Christian perfection*. [online] Available at: <http://www.ccel.org/ccel/wesley/perfection.html> Date of access 18 Apr. 2019.
- . 2011. The Wesley Center Online: Sermon 5 - Justification by faith. <http://wesley.nnu.edu/john-wesley/the-sermons-of-john-wesley-1872-edition/sermon-5-justification-by-faith> Date of access 23 Apr. 2019.
- Whitlock, M. 2014. Balthasar Hubmaier's doctrine of justification by faith. *Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary Journal*, 56(2):145-162.
- Wright, C.J.H. 2013. *The mission of God: unlocking the Bible's grand narrative*. Westmont: InterVarsity Press. [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>
- Yarnell, M. 2013. *The Anabaptists and contemporary Baptists: Restoring New Testament Christianity*. Essays in honor of Paige Patterson. Broadman & Holman Publishing Group. [Kindle ed.] Available at:

<http://www.amazon.ca>

Yoder, J.H. 1977. *The Schleithem Confession*. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press.

———. 1994. *The politics of Jesus: vicit agnus noster* (2nd ed.). Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

Yoder, P.B. 2017. *Leviticus*. Believers Church Bible Commentary. Scottdale: Herald Press [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>

Zerbe, G.M. 2016. *Philippians*. Believers Church Bible Commentary. Scottdale: Herald Press [Kindle ed.] Available at: <http://www.amazon.ca>