

Yet no dream was ever abandoned. Two decades passed in giving support from exile to sustain and develop the liberation struggle. Thirty years later in May 1994, standing on the terrace of the Union Buildings, Pretoria this was a moment of vindication. Although the end of a single journey, it represented the beginning of another, opening stage of history. Yet not the end of a journey, merely the beginning of another for the faith and dedication for those who sacrificed.

In recording our history and preserving our heritage the lessons of the past and the voice of history can help us to understand that past accurately and honestly. For over the passage of time, it happens that memory changes, diminishes, or is forgotten. Bernstein's account enables both the recovery and preservation of memory and stands as a testament to the importance of memory, in recognising the lessons of the past.

*A turbulent South Africa: Post-apartheid social protest*

**(Translated by A Brown. Albany, State University of New York Press, 2018, 266 pp. ISBN: 9-78143846977-5)**

**J Tournadre**

Retha Langa

*University of the Witwatersrand*

rethag@gmail.com

As I write this, South Africa is in the midst of a series of protests in the run-up to the country's elections on 8 May. In what has been described as the most contested elections of the country's 25-year-old democracy with 48 parties appearing on the ballot paper, protests have been a regular feature of the news cycle as residents attempt to grab the attention of politicians frantically campaigning for votes. By May, 140 service delivery protests had taken place nationwide, according to Municipal IQ, a data service monitoring municipalities.<sup>1</sup>

Jérôme Tournadre, explores such protests in *A turbulent South Africa: Post-apartheid social protest*. As he correctly points out in his introduction, there

---

<sup>1</sup> N Gous, "Service delivery protests on the rise, with petrol bombs being used and journalists targeted", *Sowetanlive*, 11 June 2019 (available at <https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/south-africa/2019-06-11-service-delivery-protests-are-on-the-rise-this-year-warn-experts2/>, as accessed on 12 June 2019).

is no shortage of scholarship on post-apartheid protest.<sup>2</sup> What distinguishes his study from many other works, which Tournadre views as taking “monographic approaches”, or which often tend “to interpret the revolts and resistance of the poorest strata of society... in the light of concepts forged by great “radical” thinkers, on in terms of some grand narrative” (p. xiii), he attempts to provide an overview of protest in post-apartheid South Africa within its historical context. He seeks to help the reader “understand the dynamics of protest movements” and “what is actually happening *in the field*” by considering the “ordinary social relations and apparently innocuous moments that make up daily life in the townships” (p. xiii).

Tournadre’s research is based on data gathered between 2009 and 2015 – essentially the first six years of Jacob Zuma’s presidency, which started in May 2009. He primarily focuses on organisations that have sought to oversee and direct protest, in particular the Unemployed People’s Movement in Grahamstown, Abahlali baseMjondolo in Cape Town and the Soweto Electricity Crisis Committee (SECC). To a lesser extent, he also considers Abahlali baseMjondolo in Durban and the Anti-Privatisation Forum in Johannesburg. Interestingly, he does not include the *Rhodes Must Fall* and *Fees Must Fall* movements. This decision was perhaps influenced by the timing of their activities as his data collection ended in 2015 – the year both movements were born. However, it would have enriched his study to compare and contrast the character, strategies and tactics of the student movements with the organisations that formed part of his research. Two other important events that one would expect to receive attention in such a study, but are only briefly referred to, are the Marikana massacre of August 2012 and the formation of the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) – currently the third largest political party in the national assembly.

Tournadre conducted approximately 60 semi-structured interviews during the time he spent with “militants, at their headquarters, while travelling to neighborhoods or on the occasion of demonstrations”. This “immersion”, writes Tournadre, “made it possible... to witness militancy on a day-to-day basis... the tasks, moments, and interactions, seemingly trivial, nonconfrontational, and disconnected from protest action in the strict sense of the term, that work to maintain things over the life of the organization...” (p. xxiv). Further interviews were done with individuals that have regular contact with

---

2 R Ballard, A Habib, and I Valodia (eds) *Voices of protest: Social movements in post-apartheid South Africa* (Scottsville, University of KwaZulu-Natal Press, 2006); J Brown, *South Africa’s insurgent citizens: On dissent and the possibility of politics* (London, Zed Books, 2015).

activists, including trade unionists and representatives from non-governmental organisations.

He introduces the idea of an “intermediate political space” (p. 201) – a fluid space without clear borders that does not belong to that of social protest nor institutional politics, but is also not completely detached from these worlds. It is rather an “in-between” (p. 202) space that has come to the fore since 2005/6 when activists began to lose faith in the capacity of their tactics to achieve a tangible impact and the marginalisation of the left in the ANC-led alliance. An example of a group operating in this space is the Operation Khanyisa Movement (OKM), formed before the 2006 local government elections, who participated in electoral politics while retaining some tactics more closely associated with those of a social movement.

Tournadre describes South Africa as “turbulent” (p. 224) in the title of his book, which he contrasts with the idea of the rainbow nation and the ideology of reconciliation, driven and epitomised by former president Nelson Mandela, and the description of South Africa as the “the rape capital of the world”. It is a country not yet settled where “the lines of demarcation between the worlds of protest and politics are not always drawn with a firm hand. They fluctuate in accordance with frequent and numerous interactions” (p. 223).

He also discusses competing claims to the heritage of the struggle against apartheid – the past, and who has the right to claim ownership of its interpretation and deployment, continues to occupy a prominent space in current political battles. Activists, he argues, frame their protests as a continuation of the struggle, essentially “an extension of *yesterday’s* fight” (p. 170). The idea that the struggle is not yet over<sup>3</sup> is a tactic also regularly used by members of the ruling party, including former ANC president Jacob Zuma, who demonstrates this through his deployment of struggle songs. Tournadre refers to such performance modes, including the *toyitoyi*, which he describes as being part of “attempts to forge an ancestry for the current social struggles” (p. 170). Here I would argue that he is being too dismissive of the potency found in these performances, the way they reactivate and mobilise collective memories of the struggle, and the rich meanings they generate and convey.<sup>4</sup>

---

3 C Kros, “Twenty years of heritage studies – the showbiz of history?”, *Social Dynamics*, 43(3), 2017, pp. 358-373.

4 L Gunner, “Jacob Zuma, the social body and the unruly power of song”, *African Affairs*, 108(430), 2009, pp. 27-48; L Gunner, “Song, identity and the state: Julius Malema’s Dubul’ ibhunu song as catalyst”, *Journal of African Cultural Studies*, 27(3), 2015, pp. 326-341; R Suttner, “The Jacob Zuma rape trial: power and African National Congress (ANC) masculinities”, *Nordic Journal of Feminist and Gender Research*, 17(3), 2009, pp. 222-236.

Scattered in between his analysis, Tournadre includes 11 sub-sections, mostly anecdotes, separated from the rest of the text by their placement in grey boxes. One features the 57-year-old Levy who works as a reconstructor for the SECC. Another tells the story of a Abahlali baseMjondolo mass meeting held in Khayelitsha, featuring speeches, singing and dancing. At times these short narratives feel out of place between his dense writing, but they do bring the reader slightly closer to the on-the-ground tactics of these organisations.

Finally, Tournadre ambitiously aims to provide the reader with an overview of post-apartheid protest while also giving us a sense of “what is actually happening *in the field*”, the “ordinary social relations and apparently innocuous moments that make up daily life in the townships” (p. xiii). He succeeds in the former but leaves the reader rather disappointed regarding the latter as one experiences a degree of distance between the author and the activists and organisations he studied.

*South Africa versus Rommel. The untold story of the Desert War in World War II*

(Review in Afrikaans)

**(Delta Books, Johannesburg en Kaapstad, 2018. ISBN 978-1-92824-807-1)**

**D Brock Katz**

Wessel Visser  
*University of Stellenbosch*  
wpv@sun.ac.za

Alhoewel daar alreeds ’n hele korpus van literatuur oor Suid-Afrika se deelname aan die Tweede Wêreldoorlog en spesifiek die Unieverdedigingsmag se aandeel aan die veldtogte in Oos-en Noord-Afrika bestaan, is hierdie publikasie deur David Katz nie maar slegs ’n gewone toevoeging tot daardie militêre historiografie nie.

Katz benader die onderwerp vanuit die oogpunt van ’n militêre akademikus deur voor die aanvang van die inhoudelike hoofstukke eers behoorlike bronkritiek toe te pas op die bestaande gepubliseerde literatuur oor Suid-Afrika se betrokkenheid in Oos-Afrika en by die sogenaamde woestynoorlog in Noord-Afrika. Die skrywer het ’n indrukwekkende lys van boeke, amptelike en semi-amptelik gepubliseerde staatsgeskiedenis, biografieë, tesisse, internetbronne en akademiese tydskrifartikels geraadpleeg. Daarbenewens het hy uitgebreide