


Exploring the impact of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship in the South African mining sector

EM Pitzer

 **orcid.org/0000-0002-6206-2878**

Dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree *Magister Commercii* in *Labour Relations Management* at the Potchefstroom Campus of the North-West University

Supervisor: Prof HM Linde

Examination February 2018

22820515



FOR THE READER'S ATTENTION

The reader is reminded of the following guidelines that were followed in this dissertation:

- The prescribed format of the American Psychological Association's (APA) publication manual (6th edition) was followed in this dissertation for both the editorial and referencing styles. This is also one of the requirements stipulated in the programme Labour relations at the Potchefstroom Campus of the North-West University.
- The study is submitted in the form of two (2) research articles, one being a literature review and the second one being a qualitative study. Both articles' editorial style follows the principles as set out by the *South African Journal for Human Resources Management*. The tables within article two also followed the framework and guidelines prescribed by the APA referencing guideline.
- Although the study is titled "Exploring employees' experiences of the impact of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area", the first article explores the definition of a power struggle and if a power struggle exists between trade unions, while the second article explores the power struggle as experienced by employees in the platinum mining industry as well as what the causes and consequences of power struggles are and whether or not it has a direct influence on the employment relationship.
- The participants signed an anonymity clause thus; all their personal details were removed from the participant's accounts to protect their anonymity.
- All chapters in this dissertation will have their own reference list.

DEDICATION

I would like to dedicate this research study to my grandmother, ouma Bets Bruwer, who passed on shortly before submitting this study. She was a very special lady and always encouraged me to belief in myself and to strive for success. Thank you for always pushing me to work hard and do more than what is expected of me. You truly were an amazing person and a role model that I will always look up to. I know that she is looking down on me and that she is proud that I finally completed this study.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to acknowledge all individuals who supported me throughout the completion of this dissertation, but I want to take this opportunity to give a special thanks to:

- My God Almighty. I truly believe that God was with me throughout my research study. He gave me strength, new opportunities and the ability to complete this research especially in times when I wanted to give up.
- My supervisor, Professor Herman M. Linde. Thank you for your insight, support and understanding throughout this study.
- I want to give a special thank you to Ms. Liani Stassen at Lonmin for helping me and arranging the time and place for interviews with the participants.
- To all my participants. Thank you for answering all of my research questions with an open mind and for the willingness to participate. I know it was not always easy nor in the best circumstances, but I want to thank you from the bottom of my heart. Without you this study would not have been possible.
- I want to thank all the staff members of Solidarity for giving me direction and support.
- To my parents, thank you for believing in me and for pushing me to do more and to be more. Thank you for understanding that I needed so much time to complete my research study.
- Salomé, thank you for the professional manner in which you translated and edited this dissertation. Your guidance and support meant a lot to me throughout.
- To my grandfather and grandmother, oupa Louis and ouma Bets, thank you for believing in me and encouraging me to continue each time I wanted to give up.
- To my family and friends. Thank you for words of encouragement and support when I felt like giving up. Thank you for believing that I could accomplish this.

DECLARATION BY RESEARCHER

I, Elizabeth Mari Pitzer, hereby declare that ‘Investigating the impact of the power struggle between trade unions and the influence thereof on the employment relationship’ is my own work and that the observations, views and opinions expressed in this study are those of the author and the relevant literature references as shown in the list of references.

I further declare that the content of this research will not be submitted for any other qualification at any other tertiary institution.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading 'E. Pitzer', is positioned above a horizontal line.

ELIZABETH MARI PITZER

FEBRUARY 2018

DECLARATION BY LANGUAGE EDITOR

2018-03-09

This confirms that the language editing of the dissertation:

Exploring the impact of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship in the South African mining sector

by Elizabeth Mari Pitzer (22820515)

at the Potchefstroom Campus of the North-West University

was done by Salome Coertze (Freelance Language Practitioner).

Qualifications:

BMus Performing Art (UP)

PG HED (Unisa)

BMus Hons (UP)

BA Languages (RAU)

BA Hons in Applied Language Studies (UP)

PG Diploma in Translation (Unisa)

MA General Linguistics (SU)

TOEFL Certificate (NWU)

Member of:

SATI & Prolingua



SALOME COERTZE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOR THE READER’S ATTENTION	I
DEDICATION	II
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	III
DECLARATION BY RESEARCHER.....	IV
DECLARATION BY LANGUAGE EDITOR.....	V
SUMMARY.....	11
CHAPTER 1	15
INTRODUCTION.....	15
1.1 Introduction	16
1.2 Problem Statement.....	17
1.3 Research Questions.....	19
1.4 Expected Contribution of the Study	20
1.5 Research Objectives	20
1.5.1 General objective.....	20
1.5.2 Specific objectives	20
1.6 Research Design	21
1.6.1 Research approach	21
1.6.2 Research strategy	22
1.6.3 Research Method	23

1.6.3.1	Literature Review.....	23
1.6.3.2	Research setting.....	24
1.6.3.3	Entrée and establishing researcher roles.....	24
1.6.3.4	Research Participants and Sampling Methods.....	25
1.6.3.5	Data Collection Method	26
1.6.3.6	Interview Schedule	26
1.6.3.7	Recording of Data.....	27
1.6.3.8	Data Analysis.....	28
1.6.3.9	Strategies employed to ensure Quality Data.....	29
1.6.3.10	Reporting Style.....	30
1.7	Ethical Considerations.....	31
	REFERENCES.....	32
	CHAPTER 2.....	37
	RESEARCH ARTICLE 1	37
1.1	Introduction	40
1.2	Contribution to the labour relations field.....	42
1.3	Literature Review	42
1.3.1	Definition of the term power struggle	42
1.3.2	Trade unions and the need for power	45
1.3.3	A brief overview of the history of the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM).....	47
1.3.4	A brief overview of the history of the Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union (AMCU)	48
1.3.5	Practical implications to the power struggle	48

1.3.6	Power shifts and changing social identities and the impact on the workplace ...	50
1.3.7	Collective bargaining in the mining industry	51
1.3.8	South Africa's changing labour relations environment.....	53
1.3.9	The future of mining in South Africa	55
1.4	Summary and Conclusion.....	56
	REFERENCES.....	59
	CHAPTER 3.....	72
	RESEARCH ARTICLE 2.....	72
1.1	Introduction	75
1.2	Literature review	77
1.2.1	The type of employment relationship that exists in a trade union-dominated environment.....	79
1.3	Research Design	82
1.3.1	Research Purpose and Objectives.....	82
1.3.2	Research approach	83
1.3.3	Research strategy	83
1.3.4	Participants.....	84
1.4	Research Method.....	85
1.4.1	Research setting.....	85
1.4.2	Entrée and research role	85
1.4.3	Sampling	86
1.4.4	Data-collection method	86
1.4.5	Recording of data	87

1.4.6	Data analysis	87
1.4.7	Discussion of findings	88
1.5	Findings	88
1.6	Discussion	99
1.7	Conclusion	104
1.8	Recommendations.....	106
	REFERENCES.....	108
	CHAPTER 4: CONCLUSION, LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	113
1.1	Conclusion	114
1.2	Limitations	118
1.3	Scope for Future Research	119
	REFERENCES.....	121

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1:	Characteristics of participants (N=12).....	82
Table 2:	Employees' perceptions about trade union power struggles	86
Table 3:	Causes of trade union power struggles	89
Table 4:	Consequences of trade union power struggles	92
Table 5:	The influence of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship.....	94

SUMMARY

Title: Exploring the impact of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship in the South African mining industry

Key words: Trade unions, power struggle, employment relationship, South African mining industry

This study focused on gathering information through literature as well as on the experiences of employees at a mine in Marikana on the effect of power struggles between trade unions and the influence thereof on the employment relationship. The majority of the research focused on the two key unions in the mining industry namely, The National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) and The Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union (AMCU). The impact of power struggles has an influence on trust members has in their unions. The general objective of the study was to explore what the impact of the power struggle between trade unions is on the employment relationship. The study consisted of the following two articles:

Article 1: The employment relationship and the power struggle between trade unions: A literature review

Article 2: Exploring employees' perspectives about trade union power struggles and the influence thereof on the employment relationship.

A qualitative research approach was used in this study in order to achieve the objectives (Hopper, 2011). The participants were able to describe their perceptions and experiences around the phenomenon of a power struggle as they perceived them through the research design and approach used for this study. The selection criteria for participants in this study were employees of the Lonmin mine in Marikana. A voluntary sample of 12 ($N=12$) participants for article two were drawn from employees willing to take part in the study. Semi-structured, one-to-one interviews were conducted with each

participant in the study. Data analysis was done by making use of content analysis designed by Creswell (2009).

A literature review was conducted for article 1. The main findings collected from literature was that industrial action and wage negotiations enhance the severity of the conflict between trade unions. The reason being that if one trade union fails to deliver on the demands of employees, it sets the scene for another union to come in and deliver. Labour legislation should provide the balance when it comes to power.

For article 2, four categories of findings were created, which were the majoritarian approach to trade unionism and failure of the Labour Relations Act. Themes were found for each category respectively with subthemes identified for each theme. The results for article 2 indicated that employees are aware of a power struggle that exists between two key trade unions at the specific mine. The results correlate with findings of other studies done about the causes and consequences of trade union power struggles. Overall employees perceive trade union power struggles as creating a hostile environment that leads to violence.

Limitations of the articles and recommendations for future research and practice were discussed in the final chapter of this study.

OPSOMMING

Titel: 'n Ondersoek na die impak van 'n magstryd tussen vakbonde op die werkgewer-werknemer-verhouding in die Suid-Afrikaanse mynbedryf

Sleuteltermes: magstryd, vakbonde, werkgewer-werknemer-verhouding, Suid-Afrikaanse mynbedryf

Hierdie studie het op die inwin van inligting uit die literatuur asook op die ervaring van werknemers by 'n myn in Marikana gefokus om te bepaal wat die effek van 'n magstryd tussen vakbonde en die invloed daarvan op die verhouding tussen die werkgewer en die werknemer. Die grootste gedeelte van die navorsing het op die twee sleutelvakbonde in die mynbedryf gekonsentreer, naamlik NUM (National Union of Mineworkers) en AMCU (Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union). Die impak van 'n magstryd beïnvloed die vertroue wat lede in hulle vakbond het. Die algemene doel van die studie was om die impak van sodanige magstryd tussen vakbonde op die werkgewer-werknemer se verhouding te bestudeer. Hierdie studie bestaan uit die volgende twee artikels:

Artikel 1: Die diensverhouding en die magstryd tussen vakbonde: 'n Literatuurstudie

Artikel 2: Werknemers se perspektief op die magstryd tussen vakbonde en die invloed daarvan op die diensverhouding tussen werkgewer en werknemer

'n Kwalitatiewe navorsingsbenadering is in hierdie studie gebruik om die doelwitte te bereik (Hopper, 2011). Die deelnemers kon hulle sienings en ervarings aangaande die fenomeen van 'n magstryd beskryf soos hulle dit deur die navorsingsontwerp en benadering tot hierdie studie ervaar het. Die deelnemers aan hierdie studie was werknemers van die Lonmin-myn in Marikana. 'n Vrywillige groep van 12 (N=12) respondente vir Artikel 2 is uit 'n groep wat bereid was om aan die studie deel te neem, geselekteer. Semi-gestruktureerde, een-tot-een onderhoude is met die

deelnemers gevoer. Die data-ontleding is deur middel van 'n inhoudsontleding gedoen wat deur Creswell (2009) ontwerp is. 'n Literatuurstudie is vir artikel 1 onderneem.

Vir artikel 2 is vier kategorieë vir die bevindings geskep, naamlik die meerderheidsbenadering tot vakbondwese en tekortkominge in die Wet op Arbeidsverhoudinge. Temas met subtemas in elke kategorie het na vore gekom. Die resultate van artikel 2 dui aan dat werknemers bewus is van 'n magstryd tussen die twee sleutelvakbonde by die spesifieke myn. Die resultate korreleer met bevindings van ander studies aangaande die oorsake en gevolge van magstryde tussen vakbonde. In die algemeen ervaar werknemers dat magstryde tussen vakbonde 'n vyandige omgewing skep wat tot geweld lei.

Beperkings ten opsigte van die artikels en aanbevelings vir verdere navorsing word in die finale hoofstuk bespreek.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Introduction

The relationship between an employer and an employee is based on a contract of employment. Basson, Christianson, Dekker, Garbers, Le Roux, Mischke, and Strydom (2009) state that “employees should unite and stand together against the economic power of the employer.” Basson et al. (2009) explained that this led to the rise of the trade union movement in South Africa. Employees started grouping themselves together in order to restore equality in the power relationship of the employment relationship (Basson et al., 2009). Trade union recognition can be regarded as a counter-balance to the employer’s power (Venter & Levy, 2012). This shows us that the employment relationship needs a clear and definite collective dimension in order to balance the power between the employer and the employees (Basson et al., 2009; Rust, 2001).

Trade unions have a long and distinguished history, but it is not only limited to South Africa (Basson et al., 2009; Ewing, 2005). Trade unions were originally born in times of political unrest (Basson et al., 2009; Ewing, 2005). Rheeder (2014) argues that the purpose of setting up a trade union or belonging to a trade union is that collective power is fundamental. Another important point that Basson et al. (2009) makes is that the power-relationship between an employer and an employee is an extremely complex relationship that ultimately results in a relationship of economic dependence. It is important to remember that today’s workforce is better skilled and has more experience, which places them in a better position to negotiate for their demands (Basson et al., 2009). This does not mean that employees can negotiate by themselves with the employer. They need trade unions in order to bring workplace issues under the attention of the employer (Rheeder, 2014).

Problem Statement

“The Marikana incident of 2012 could have been prevented by more responsible trade unionism” (Dhliwayo, 2012). Questions that were raised by the Marikana incident included “To what extent have trade unions contributed to the Marikana incident?” (Dhliwayo, 2012). And also, “Are trade unions becoming more powerful or weaker in managing labour unrest and disputes?” (Dhliwayo, 2012). “What is the future of the mining sector in South Africa?” (Dhliwayo, 2012). In today’s workplace trade unions don’t only protect the workers’ rights and improving the economic status of their members, but they also play a bigger role in national development (Dhliwayo, 2012). Dhliwayo (2012) is of the opinion that disputes should be dealt with more efficiently and effectively to avoid conflict and industrial action. Trade unions must also ensure that employees’ demands are reasonable and justifiable while ascertaining that their rights are not infringed in any way (Dhliwayo, 2012). Dhliwayo (2012) makes an important statement, “trade unions should acknowledge that there is an inherent conflict of interest between labour and capital that can never be completely eroded; workers want higher wages and owners higher profits”. “It is the role of trade unions to facilitate a balanced consensus for parties involved” (Dhliwayo, 2012).

A power struggle refers to people in a relationship fighting about who is in control, with both trying to dominate the relationship in one way or another (Venter & Levy, 2012). Secondly, it also refers to a situation where one group is trying to become the most powerful group (Crossman, 2016). Thirdly, it can be an unpleasant or even violent competition for power (Department of Labour, 2012). Lastly, it can also refer to a situation where two or more people or organisations compete for more influence (Lachman, 2013).

Trade unions have been under examination over the past few years, mainly because of the violent nature of their strike actions (Terblanche, 2012; Speckman, 2014;

Sosibo, 2012). According to Venter (2014) there has been a lot of violent competition between the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) and its rival, the Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union (Amcu). The latter is currently still evident (Du Plessis, 2017; Quintal, 2015). Venter (2014) further states that NUM lost its organising privileges at Lonmin Platinum Mine to Amcu in 2012 firstly because of perceptions between the workers that NUM operated too closely to management. Venter argues that a second reason for NUM losing their organisational rights at Lonmin was that its representation figures dropped from 66% to 49% (Venter, 2014).

Honeymon (2013) is of the opinion that wealth distribution is a big problem in South Africa because of an unfair distribution process. An example is that people with capital are always striving for a better return on their investment, while employees rarely feel they receive a 'fair share' of that wealth contribution (Nel, Kirsten, Swanepoel, Erasmus & Poisat, 2012). The Gini coefficient is used to measure income inequality. It depends on the variable that is used to measure inequality, the time period and the data set. South Africa's Gini Coefficient usually ranges from 0.660 to 0.669 (Bhorat, 2015).

This is the main reason why workers often perceive power imbalances in their work contexts, specifically regarding the owners' returns on their investment. As a result, workers often want more equitable remuneration, including pay, benefits and improved working conditions (Nel et al., 2012). The latter often brings forth a relative amount of conflict in the employer-employee relationship (Nel et al., 2012). Perceptions of fairness are integral to this relationship, as are the dynamics related to power and control. Employees often feel that too much control stems from the power of who controls the scarce resources (Nel et al., 2012).

As no previous studies exist on this particular topic in the South African mining industry, this study explores the impact of the power struggle between trade unions in the mining industry in South Africa, as well as the influence of such a power struggle on employment relationships in the mining industry. This study presented an opportunity for future qualitative research to

explore and investigate if the outcomes of this study can be adapted to industries other than the mining industry in South Africa.

Summarily, this study aimed to investigate what the experiences of employees in the mining industry at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area is, their perceptions on the power struggle between the trade unions, and the struggle's influence on the employment relationship.

Research Questions

Secondary Research Questions for Article One (1)

- How is power struggles between trade unions conceptualised in literature?
- What are the consequences of trade union power struggles in the South African mining industry?
- What role does the Labour Relations Act (66 of 1995) play in regulating the relationship between trade unions?
- What recommendations can be made for future research?

Secondary Research Questions for Article Two (2)

- How is the employment relationship in a trade union dominated work environment conceptualised in literature?
- What perceptions do employees have about power struggles between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area?
- What are the causes and consequences of power struggles between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area?
- Does the power struggle between trade unions influence the employment relationship?
- What recommendations can be made for future research?

Expected Contribution of the Study

Contributions to the literature

The aim of this study was to examine the existence of a power struggle between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area and the influence thereof on the employment relationship. Secondly, it aimed to produce new knowledge on the causes and consequences that a power struggle can have on the employment relationship. Lastly, the study aimed to give a better understanding as to why trade unions are constantly seeking power.

Contributions to the Individual

This study aimed to provide findings surrounding the employment relationship in a union-dominated environment. It also gives background to people reading the study about the incidents that occurred at Marikana in 2012 and the influence thereof on labour relations.

Contributions to Organisations

This study aimed to provide findings which may assist organisations to build better relationships with unions by making use of the relevant legislation. The study also aimed to set aside all the negative aspects which are attributed to the unions in the mining industry and by finding ways in which organisations and labour can improve communication and to limit negative labour unrests.

Research Objectives

1.1.1 General objective

The general objective of this study was to explore what the primary factors within the mining industry are which lead to the power struggle between trade unions, as well as the impact thereof on the employment relationship.

1.1.2 Specific objectives

The specific objectives for article 1 (The employment relationship and the power struggle between trade unions: A literature review) are the following:

- To examine how power struggles between trade unions are conceptualised in

literature.

- To explore whether a power struggle exists between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area.
- To explore what the consequences are of power struggles between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area.
- To explore the role of the Labour Relations Act (66 of 1995) in regulating the relationships between trade unions.
- To provide recommendations for future research.

The specific objectives for article 2 (Investigating the experiences of employees working in the mining industry on the impact of a power struggle between trade unions and the influence thereof on the employment relationship) are the following:

- To explore how the employment relationship that exists in a trade union dominated environment is conceptualised in literature.
- To explore what the perceptions of employees are about a power struggle between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area.
- To explore what the causes and consequences are of a power struggle between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area.
- To explore whether the power struggle between trade unions influences the employment relationship.
- To provide recommendations for future research.

Research Design

1.1.3 Research approach

The specific research approach which was followed, includes a review of literature, along with an empirical study in order to form a *qualitative* research approach,

which provided an in-depth overview of the subject of study. In this situation, there was aimed to gain insight into the power struggle that exists between trade unions in the mining industry. It also aimed to investigate the different factors which contribute to the degree of the power struggle and what the total impact of the struggle is on healthy labour relations.

A qualitative approach with a systematic review was used in this study. Qualitative research is conducted to obtain a deeper understanding of the subject (Golafshani, 2003). Golafshani (2003) further defines qualitative research as a naturalistic approach which seeks to understand certain phenomena in context-specific settings, such as real-world settings. This deeper understanding is facilitated by collecting multiple forms of data and then analysing it from different angles (Leedy & Ormrod, 2013). According to Nieuwenhuis & Smit (2014) qualitative research aims to understand the processes and contexts of behavioural patterns and mostly try to answer the ‘why’ question around the topic being investigated.

Qualitative research is a form of research in which the researcher or a designated co-researcher collects and interprets data, making the researcher as much part of the research process as the participants and the data they provided. Qualitative research utilises an open and flexible design (Corbin & Strauss, 2014).

Semi-structured, one-to-one interviews were used to obtain information from the participants about their experiences and perceptions on the power struggle’s effect on the employment relationship. The interview process was unbiased and all personal judgement and opinions of the researcher were removed, therefore the process ensured that the data collected through the interviews are the views and opinions of the participants.

1.1.4 Research strategy

Data for article 1 was gathered through a systematic review of literature. Various data bases were used to gather scientific and authentic information from reliable sources. Literature from the period 1995 to 2017 was reviewed in order to identify a trend. More specifically, with reference to the mining industry, data from the 2012- incident at Marikana was studied to gather

information for article one. The research provided insight into the power struggle that exists between trade unions, as well as the influence thereof on the employment relationship and labour relations.

Data for article 2 was gathered through semi-structured, one-on-one interviews with participants. The interviews were recorded with a digital voice recorder, after which the interviews were transcribed. A thematic analysis designed by Creswell (2009) was used to extract themes and subthemes and was used in conjunction with a systematic review of literature on trade union power struggles and its influence on the employment relationship.

A qualitative research approach was chosen, because the researcher wanted to:

- explore the inner experiences of the participants;
- explore how meanings are formed and transformed;
- explore areas that have not yet been thoroughly researched; and
- to take a holistic and comprehensive approach to the study of the research topic.

1.1.5 Research Method

1.1.5.1 Literature Review

A literature review is one of the most important steps in the early stages of a research project. A literature study was conducted to determine if the research study could be supported by literature and to determine the causes of the problem.

The primary focus of the literature review was to identify the factors which influence the power struggle between trade unions in the mining industry in South Africa. Limited research exists about the factors that contribute to the power struggle between trade unions, thus this provided an opportunity for the researcher to investigate the topic.

A literature review consists of theoretical studies that provide the basis to definitions for important terms, to describe certain aspects, and to summarise and evaluate previous research findings. These definitions cover topics such as the definition of the term “power struggle”, the relationship between the two key trade unions in the mining industry, the effects of the power struggle on the employment relationship, and any other related findings.

Different literature resources were used, including textbooks, journals and online news articles, the internet, relevant legislation, newspaper articles, and dissertations. The databases, which were used to conduct the literature study, include SA ePublications, Google Scholar, journals from the HRM and IR fields, other academic journals, Sage publications, different textbooks and published materials. Important government gazetted documents were used to draw a clearer picture, as well as publications of among others, the Department of Mineral Resources, the Labour Relations Act, and the Marikana Commission of Inquiry’s report.

1.1.5.2 Research setting

The research interviews were held on the premises of the Lonmin Mine in Marikana. The data for the research was collected from the participants who were employees of the mine at the time of the research. The research participants were chosen randomly from a list of people that were willing to participate in the study.

After the participants had been chosen, a short presentation about the research project was presented to the participants to provide them with more information on the study, as well as answer questions the participants might have had. This session helped to give the participants more clarity. It was important that the participants fully understood the purpose of the study and why their inputs were important.

1.1.5.3 Entrée and establishing researcher roles

Permission for access was sought by sending a letter of admission to the Human Resources Manager of the Lonmin mine in Marikana. After permission were given by the mine,

a presentation about the study was presented to the participants who wished to take part voluntarily. During the presentation, time was allocated for questions of clarity. When access had been granted for the researcher to enter the premises and conduct the study, a written agreement was signed.

The results remain anonymous and unbiased. There had been no unfair discrimination or influence in terms of their state of well-being or position at the time of the research. The target population was ready and willing when the researcher conducted the study to obtain information and no obstacles influenced the validity or reliability of the results. The participants had the knowledge to know what was expected of them, and should they wish to withdraw from the study at any time, they were free to do so; their participation had been voluntarily. Appointments were arranged with all the participants to schedule meetings and conduct interviews.

1.1.5.4 Research Participants and Sampling Methods

It is important that the population of a qualitative study comprise all the elements (individuals, objects or substances) or aggregation of cases meeting the inclusion criteria of the study, which interests the researcher and is rich in data (Burns & Grove, 2005; Cresswell, 2009; Polit & Beck, 2008). This study used quota sampling as a method, as well as convenience voluntary sampling for selecting the participants (De Vos, Strydom, Fouché, & Delport, 2014). An important aspect was to select participants who were able to provide the most valuable information that could contribute to the study.

For the purpose of this study, a convenience voluntary sample of employees within the Lonmin Mine in Marikana ($N=12$) was used. The sample size was considered sufficient enough to analyse, interpret and reach a conclusion from the data gathered from the interviews (Guest, Bunce, & Johnson, 2005). The sample population consisted of a variety in terms of gender, marital status, age and race (African, White, Coloured and Indian). It was important for the respondents to have had a good command of the English language in order to understand and

answer the questions asked by the researcher successfully and to the best of their ability. The researcher approached individuals between the ages of 18 and 65 because it was representative of the workforce. The sample group needed to be representative of the larger population of South Africa in order for it to be able to conform it to a standardised measure.

1.1.5.5 Data Collection Method

Semi-structured, one-on-one interviews were conducted to collect data for the study. According to De Vos et al. (2014) semi-structured interviews are used to obtain a detailed account of participants' beliefs, perceptions or experience regarding a specific topic. A set of pre-determined interview questions was used (see interview schedule), which allowed for clarifying and probing the participant if an answer had been unclear (De Vos et. al., 2014). The researcher chose this type of method to gain in-depth answers from the participants and to sometimes (if necessary) let the interviewee lead the interview (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000). Probing was very important to understand the phenomenon and create new knowledge from the participants' perspectives. Field notes were taken together with recorded observations, thoughts and experiences (Stake, 2010).

Questions in this study were open-ended. Open-ended questions allow the researcher to carefully listen to what participants say and how they react when certain questions are asked (Creswell, 2009).

1.1.5.6 Interview Schedule

In order for the researcher to answer the research questions and reach the specific objectives of the study, the following open-ended questions were asked to each participant during the semi-structured interview:

1. What does the term “power struggle” mean to you?
2. In the context of trade unionism, what does it mean to have power?

3. In your opinion, what are the causes of a power struggle between trade unions?
4. In your opinion, what are the consequences of a power struggle between trade unions?
5. What do you perceive to be the effect that a power struggle has on the employment relationship?
6. Is there anything that you would like to add, any comments, that you think will contribute to the study?

1.1.5.7 Recording of Data

The participants were requested to provide informed consent for the interview session to be recorded on a digital voice recording device. The participants signed and dated the agreement and it has been filed for safekeeping in a secure space. Participants were requested to speak loud and clear in order to ensure audible recordings.

Confidentiality is ensured as the names of participants were not recorded; a number was assigned to each participant (001 – 012) which was used to refer to the participants in the study. The researcher ensured that an extra set of fully charged batteries were readily available and also kept an additional digital voice recording device in case of failure of the preliminary device.

Recorded interviews and field notes were transcribed, verbatim, on a Microsoft Excel spreadsheet and the data files are securely stored by means of an encrypted password. All recorded data was compared to the spreadsheet to ascertain whether any data has been overlooked. Voice recordings and transcribed data are stored on an external storage device which will be stored securely, as well as on Google drive, which is password protected. There has been a co-coder to ensure that the data extracted were unbiased and that the data correctly reflected the answers and experiences of the participant. This also ensured that the researcher's viewpoints and opinions did not interfere with the data extracting process.

The categories of data consist of:

- observation notes;
- interview notes;
- voice recordings;
- voice recorder typed notes; and
- additional findings.

The above ensured that the data was accurate, reliable and valid (De Vos et al., 2014). It also ensured that the data was accurately recorded, safely stored and effectively managed without compromising the quality of the data (De Vos et al., 2014).

1.1.5.8 Data Analysis

Patton (2002) (as cited by De Vos et al., 2014), points out that qualitative researchers have an obligation to monitor and report the analytic procedures they use in their work (p.434). This means that they must observe their own processes and analyse and report on the analytical process.

The analysis of qualitative research involves aiming to uncover and/ or understanding the bigger picture (Alston, 2003). Both qualitative and quantitative analysis involves labelling and coding all of the data in order for that similarities and differences to be recognised (De Vos et al., 2014). The qualitative researcher has no system for pre-coding, therefore a method of identifying and labelling or coding data needs to be developed that is adapted for each research. This is called content analysis (De Vos et al., 2014). Content analysis is a procedure for the categorisation of verbal or behavioural data, for purposes of classification, summarisation and tabulations (De Vos et al, 2014). The content can be analysed on two levels:

1. Basic level or the manifest level: a descriptive account of the data, i.e. this is what was said, but no comments or theories as to why or how (De Vos et al., 2014).
2. Higher level or latent level of analysis: a more interpretive analysis that is concerned with the response as well as what may have been inferred or implied (De Vos et al., 2014).

Content analysis involves coding and classifying data, also referred to as categorising and indexing, and the aim of context analysis is to make sense of the data collected and to highlight the important messages, feature or findings (De Vos et al., 2014).

The qualitative data analysis was done through interviews and observations conducted and managed by the researcher. The reliability was estimated through a content analysis of the transcribed data retrieved from the interviews.

1.1.5.9 Strategies employed to ensure Quality Data

It is very important for a research study to be credible, reliable, valid and trustworthy (Corbin & Strauss, 2014) and all these aspects are discussed in order to get a better view as to why they are important for any research study. The criteria for credibility, validity and trustworthiness may include using standardised measurements (Corbin & Strauss, 2014). In this study, the researcher was interested in questioning and understanding the meaning of the phenomena and interpreting the results. The validity and reliability of qualitative data is harder to determine than those of quantitative data. Therefore, the scientific process of data collection in qualitative studies needs to be thorough and trustworthy (De Vos et. al., 2014).

There are four constructs to ensure that data retrieved is reliable and valid (De Vos et al., 2014):

Credibility: This is the alternative to internal validity, in which the goal is to demonstrate that the inquiry was conducted in such a manner as to ensure that the subject has been accurately identified and described. The researcher asks if there is a match between research participants'

views and researchers' reconstruction and representation of them. The strength of the qualitative study that aims to explore a problem or describe a setting, a process, a social group or a pattern of interaction will be its validity. Within the parameters of that setting, population and theoretical framework, the research will be valid. The parameters therefore need to be adequately stated by the researcher by placing boundaries around the study (De Vos et al., 2014).

Transferability: The research needs to be able to be transferred from a specific situation or case to another. For example, can this research be used in other industries other than the mining industry. Lincoln and Guba (1999) (as cited by De Vos et al., 2014) propose transferability as the alternative to external validity or generalisability, in which the burden of demonstrating the applicability of one set of findings to another context rests more with the investigator who would make the transfer than with the original investigator. To counter challenges, the researcher can refer back to the original theoretical framework to show how data collection and analysis will be guided by concepts and models (De Vos et al., 2014: 420).

Dependability: The research process has to be logical, well documented and audited. This is the alternative to reliability, in which the researcher attempts to account for changing conditions in the phenomenon chosen for study as well as changes in the design created by increasingly refined understanding of the setting (De Vos et al., 2014: 420).

Conformability: This construct captures the traditional concept of objectivity. Lincoln and Guba (1999) (as cited in De Vos et al., 2014) stress the need to ask whether the findings of the study could be confirmed by another. By doing so, they remove evaluation from some inherent characteristic of the researcher (objectivity) and place it squarely on the data themselves. The question is whether the researcher provides evidence that corroborates the findings and interpretations by means of auditing (De Vos et al., 2014: 421).

1.1.5.10 Reporting Style

The research is reported in a qualitative writing style. The researcher's report is clear and self-evidently reflect the guiding standard of the study (Struwig & Stead, 2010). It is important

for the report to be educative and reflect empowerment (Struwig & Stead, 2010). The inclusion of detailed descriptions and remote experiences whereby readers can draw influences relating to their own situation adds to the quality of the report. Results are presented and interpreted in a narrative and include a detailed discussion of the various themes, subthemes and quotations of the participants (Struwig & Stead, 2010). According to Leedy & Ormrod (2013), “qualitative research is flexible and therefore continuously progressed during the research process.”

Ethical Considerations

The definition of ethics, as defined by Kreitner and Kinicki (2010) is the “study of moral issues and choices”. According to De Vos et. al. (2014) “research should be used on mutual trust, acceptance, cooperation, promises and well accepted conventions and expectations between all parties involved in the research project”. The research team must act in an ethical manner towards other individuals, but it is especially important to establish and practice ethics while conducting research. Any unethical behaviour could influence the reliability and validity of the study. The ethical guidelines should become a part of the researcher and they should evaluate their own behaviour and conduct what is acceptable through the eyes of other researchers (De Vos et al, 2014). The researcher deems these statements as her own and it was very important that these guidelines be upheld and followed.

REFERENCES

- Alston, M., & Bowles, W. (2003). *Research for caring professionals: an introduction to methods*. London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Bashir, M., Afzal, M. T., & Azeem, M. (2008). Reliability and validity of qualitative and operational research paradigm. *Research gate*. doi: 10.18187/pjsor.v4i1.59
- Basson, A. C., Christianson, M. A., Dekker, A., Garbers, C., le Roux, P. A. K., Mischke, C., and Strydom, E. M. L. (2009). *Essential labour law*. Centurion: Labour Law Publications
- Bhorat, H. (2015, September 30). Is South Africa the most unequal society in the world? *Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-09-30-is-south-africa-the-most-unequal-society-in-the-world>
- Burns, N., & Grove, S. K. (2005). *The practice of nursing: Research, conduct, critique and utilization*. London: Elsevier Saunders.
- Corbin, J., and Strauss, A. (2014). Basics of qualitative research Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory (4th Ed.). [Google Books]. Retrieved from <https://books.google.co.za/books?hl=en&lr=&id=MaKWBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=qualitative+research+definition&ots=QrDaBQf2M4&sig=7GebD6vbuXhZ777hw0p8BhBiAoE#v=onepage&q&f=false>
- Cresswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory into practice*, 39(3), 124-131.
- Cresswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Crossman, A. (2014, November 25). Class conflict and struggle. *Thoughtco*. Retrieved from <https://www.thoughtco.com/class-conflict-3026134>
- Crossman, A. (2016, April 15). Power. *Thoughtco*. Retrieved from <https://www.thoughtco.com/power-p2-3026460>

- Davies, D., & Dodd, J. (2002). Qualitative research and the question of rigor. *Qualitative health research*, 12(2), 279-289.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y.S. (2000). *Strategies of inquiry*. In Denzin, N. K. & Lincoln, Y. S. (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE, 367 – 378.
- Department of Labour. (2012). Annual Industrial Action Report. Retrieved from <http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/documents/annual-reports/industrial-action-annual-report/2012/industrialreport2012.pdf>
- De Vos, A. S., Strydom, H., Fouchè, C. B., & Delport, C. S. L. (2014). *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human services professions*. (4th Ed.) Hatfield, Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.
- Du Plessis, G. (2017c, October 1). Vakbondwedywering is ondemokraties. *Netwerk24*. Retrieved from <https://www.netwerk24.com/Sake/Ekonomie/gideon-du-plessis-wedywering-is-ondemokraties-20171001>
- Ewing, K. D. (2005). The function of Trade Unions. *Industrial Law Journal*, 34 (1): 1 – 22. doi:10.1093/ilj/34.1.1
- Honeyman, C. (2013). Labor-management conflict. Retrieved from <http://www.beyondintractability.org/coreknowledge/labor-management>
- Hopper, J. (2011). *Why do qualitative research?* Method Logical. Retrieved from <https://methodlogical.wordpress.com/2011/02/16/why-do-qualitative-research/>
- Golafshani, N. (2003). Understanding reliability and validity in qualitative research. *The qualitative report*, 8, 597 – 607. Retrieved from <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR8-4/golafshani.pdf>
- Guest, G., Bunce, A., & Johnson, L. (2005). How many interviews are enough? An experiment with data saturation and variability. *Sage Publications* 18(59). doi: 10.1177/1525822X05279903

- Kreitner, R., & Kinicki, A. (2010). *Organisational behaviour* (9th Ed.). (Pp.47-50) New York, NY: McGraw Hill.
- Lachman, S. (2013). The roots of power struggle in relationships. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/me-we/201306/the-roots-power-struggle-in-relationships>
- Leedy, P. D., & Ormrod, J. E. (2013). *Practical research: Planning and design* (10th Ed.). New Jersey, NJ: Pearson.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. (1999). Establishing trustworthiness. In Bryman, A. & Burgess, R. G. (Eds). *Qualitative research Vol III*. London: SAGE.
- Motshegwa, L. (2015). Splits in AMCU Union ahead of S. Africa platinum Strike. CNBCAFRICA.com. Retrieved from <http://www.cnbafrica.com/news/mining/2014/01/21/splits-in-amcu-union-ahead-of-south-africa-platinum-strike/>
- Nel, P. S., Kirsten, M., Swanepoel, B. J., Erasmus, B.J., and Poisat, P. (2012). *South African Employment Relations: Theory and practice*. Pretoria, Hatfield: Van Schaik Publishers.
- Nieuwenhuis, J., & Smit, B. (2014). Qualitative research. In C. Wagner, B. B. Kawulich, & M. Garner (eds.), *Doing social research: A global context* (pp. 124-139). Berkshire: McGraw-Hill.
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (3rd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Polit, D. F., & Beck, C. T. (2008). *Nursing research: Generating and assessing evidence for nursing practice*. Philadelphia: Wolters/; ippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Quintal, G. (2015). NUM bleeds members, blames AMCU. *Nesw24*. Retrieved from <http://www.fin24.com/Economy/Labour/News/NUM-bleeds-members-blames-Amcu-20150603>

- Rheeder, J. (2014). Trade Unions – How to deal with power play and position bargaining. *Johanette Rheeder Incorporated*. Retrieved from <http://www.jrattorneys.co.za/south-african-labour-law-articles/collective-rights-and-strikes/trade-unions-how-to-deal-with-power-play-and-position-bargaining.html>
- Rust, B. (2001). So, you think being a trade union is plain sailing? *South African Journal of Labour Relations*, 25 (1 & 2). Retrieved from <http://reference.sabinet.co.za/nwulib.nwu.ac.za/document/EJC59543>
- Somavia, J. (2012). Focus on the role of decent work in promoting inclusive, sustainable and equitable economic growth. *Keynote address of Director-General of the ILO, 17th World Congress of the ICFTU, Durban, South Africa, 4 April*.
- Sosibo, K. (2012, August 23). Marikana: AMCU and the leadership dilemma. *Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved from <http://www.mg.co.za/article/2012-08-23-marikana-amcu-and-the-leadership-dilemma>
- Speckman, A. (2014, September 14). Crisis relevance for unions. *Sunday Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.timeslive.co.za/business-times/2014/09/14/crisis-of-relevance-for-unions>
- Stake, R. E. (2010). *Qualitative research: Studying how things work*. New York, NY: The Guilford Press.
- Struwig, F. W., & Stead, G.B. (2010). *Planning, designing and reporting research*. South Africa, SA: Pearson Education.
- Terblanche, S. (2012, August 29). Marikana Conflict: The dangerous aftermath. *Leadership online*. Retrieved from www.leadershiponline.co.za/articles/marikana-conflict-1659.html
- The Citizen (2015, June 2). NUM lost nearly 20 000 members in a year. Retrieved from <http://citizen.co.za/204390/num-lost-nearly-20-000-members-year/>
- Venter, J. (2014) Conflict in the trade union environment in South Africa: Implications for the ANC and the 2014 election. Political Studies: NWU Potchefstroom Campus

Venter, R. & Levy, A. (2012). *Labour Relations in South Africa*. South Africa, Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Wildcat strikes. (n.d.). In Business Dictionary.com. Retrieved from <http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/wildcat-strike.html>

Winter, G. (2000). A comparative discussion of the notion of validity in qualitative and quantitative research. *The qualitative report*, 4(3&4). Retrieved from <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR4-3/winter.html>

CHAPTER 2

RESEARCH ARTICLE 1

THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP AND THE POWER STRUGGLE BETWEEN TRADE UNIONS: A LITERATURE REVIEW

ABSTRACT

Orientation: A literature review investigating the power struggle between two trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area and the influence it has on employee relations, was explored.

Research purpose: The main purpose of this article was to report on a review of the literature about the topic of a power struggle between trade unions and the influence it has on the employment relationship.

Motivation for the study: It was important to gain a better understanding and more knowledge of the term power struggle when using it to explain the relationship between trade unions as well as the impact it can have on the employment relationship. Limited research exists on the topic and some of the research was old and outdated.

Research approach, design and method: The research method included utilising various databases that assisted with examining if a power struggle exists as well as to what extent it influences employee relations. A range of relevant literature of the period 1995 to 2018 was reviewed. The literature that was reviewed provided insight into the background of a power struggle as well as the impact it has on labour and employee relations.

Main findings: From the literature that was reviewed it was evident that the power struggle between trade unions influences the employment relationship as well as labour relations policies and practices. When two majority unions in one industry are in conflict with one another and neither of them wants to give up their power, it will have an influence on the employment relationship. The unions will do the extreme to show that they have more power than the other

union, as we have seen previously in the Marikana incident of 2012 and again in the platinum strike of 2014.

Practical/managerial implications: This article aimed to address a gap that exists when looking at the role power struggles between trade unions play in the employment relationship. By looking at literature on the topic, and examining ways on how to address this struggle, negative labour relations can be limited to a minimum.

Contribution/value-add: This article addressed the gap in limited research that exists on the topic of power struggles between trade unions and its influence on the employment relationship. Through literature, the definition of power struggles, the need for trade unions to have power and the influence on labour relations was examined. This in effect has an influence on the employment relationship because labour relations are at the root of the employment relationship.

Key words: power struggle, trade unions, employment relationship, employee relations, labour relations.

Introduction

Over the past few years, numerous studies have been conducted into the effect of trade union conflict on different aspects of the employment relationship as well as on labour relations (Blanchflower, 1996). Most of these studies were conducted in countries such as the United States and England (Blanchflower, 1996). A lot of the research that was previously done is outdated and dates as far back as the 1960's. Thus, opening the gap for new research to be done on the topic of conflict between trade unions and employers (Blanchflower, 1996)).

From previous studies it was found that union commitment is a predecessor and primary predictor for union participation (Bolton, Bafraim, Witten, Mohamed, Zvobgo, Khan, 2007). Bolton et al. (2007) in their study about union commitment found that “during industrial action union members are more aware of their union status, thus leading them to grow closer to their union in order to show more commitment” (p.78). The difference in commitment within the union can also be attributed to factors such as “the different need to obtain recognition within the union, greater feelings of isolation, and greater identification with the political ideology of the trade union” (Bolton et al., 2007, p.78).

After the incident of 2012, the winner-takes-all approach relating to trade union recognition was established because of power and financial reasons (Du Plessis, 2017c). Literature suggests that conflict still remains in the mining industry today (Terblanche, 2012). The August 2012 strike at the Lonmin mine in Marikana lead to a wave of wildcat strikes across the mining sector but also escalated to other sectors in South Africa (Cavvadas, 2012). These wildcat strikes was caused by a turf war between the Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union (herein after referred to as AMCU) and the National Union of Mineworkers (herein after referred to as the NUM) (Mining Review Africa, 2014).

These strikes cost platinum and gold producers over R16-billion in 2012 (Mining Review Africa, 2014). The Department of Labour presents the results of strike activities annually for the period January to December. In 2012, the Department's strike database indicated a dramatic

increase in the number of strikes in 2012 compared to previous years (Department of Labour, 2012). According to the Annual Industrial Action Report of 2012, the country's total working days lost in 2012 were estimated at 3 309 884 where 241 391 workers participated across all economic sectors. Of the total number of workers involved in the labour unrest, 57.5% of the workers were from the mining sector (Department of Labour, 2012). The country lost R6.7 billion in wages during the labour unrest in 2012 compared to R1.1 billion in wages in 2011 (Department of Labour, 2012).

During the period from August 2012 to October 2012 South Africa experienced violent, bloody and deadly industrial actions in the mining, transport and agricultural industries (Department of Labour, 2012). The number of strikes recorded in 2012 were 99, and from the 99 strikes, 45 strikes were unprotected. This means that 44% of strikes recorded in 2012 were unprotected (Department of Labour, 2012). Another interesting fact that the Department of Labour reported on was that most of the workers who were involved in the labour unrests were from the NUM (Department of Labour, 2012). NUM strikes were supported by miners at Modikwa Platinum, Westdawn Investments, Anglo Gold Ashanti, and employees at Benicon Opencast Mining, Samancor Eastern Chrome and Eskom (Department of Labour, 2012).

In this article, a definition for the term power struggle between trade unions will be given and the existence of a power struggle between unions will be investigated. Thereafter, the background to the two key unions in the mining industry will be given. Following the background to the two unions, a literature review will be conducted about the events that unfolded during the Marikana incident of 2012. The impact of these events on labour and employee relations will follow. In the conclusion of this article the main points from the research findings will be summarised.

Contribution to the labour relations field

It is evident from the discussion above that the term power struggle between trade unions need to be examined and understood more thoroughly. By understanding the effects that power struggles can have on the employment relationship, more meaningful and joint decision making practices can be implemented to ensure that better relationships in the workplace are formed. In order to avoid another Marikana incident, a framework for a sustainable mining industry in 2013 were signed by role players in the mining sector (Du Plessis, 2017c). In this framework there was agreed that the majority principle should come to an end (Du Plessis, 2017c). The parties to the framework agreement also agreed to continuously improve processes and procedures and to implement new measures to bring about lasting change (Du Plessis, 2017c). Joint participation by all parties is needed to sustain and improve the sector by building relationships amongst stakeholders that is based on trust and respect and avoiding any actions that can affect this relationship (Du Plessis, 2017c).

Literature Review

1.1.6 Definition of the term power struggle

Venter and Levy defines power as having the ability or means to influence someone, or to bring a shift in a previously held position (2012). Weber (as cited in Crossman 2016) defines power as “the ability to control others, events, or resources; to accomplish what you want to achieve despite obstacles, resistance, or opposition.” Crossman (2016) continues “power is something that is held, coveted, seized, taken away, lost, or stolen, and it is used in relationships involving conflict between those with power and those without it.” Marx’s argument was that “power rests in a social class’s position they hold” (Crossman, 2016). Marx also found that “power lies in domination and subordination of social classes and not in the relationship between individuals” (Crossman, 2016).

According to Venter and Levy (2012), a balance of power is important because that is central to the employment relationship. Each party has the means to exercise sufficient influences to swing the balance in their favour (Venter and Levy 2012). Employers can exercise their power by threatening to withhold work, and by controlling and manipulating financial resources. (Venter & Levy, 2012). On the other hand, the employees can collectively threaten to withhold labour (Venter & Levy, 2012).

Lachmann (2013) explains that in relationships, “those who feel powerless tend to act in a demanding, overwhelming, power-driven way to compensate for their perceived powerlessness.” According to Lachmann, this results in individual’s behaviour being more aggressive or excessively intense because they underestimate their ability to influence others (2013). A power struggle is a situation where two or more people, or organisations, are in constant competition with each other for influence (Collins English Dictionary, n.d.). It can also be defined as “a situation in which two or more people or groups compete for control in a particular industry and in certain instances it can lead to violence” (Cavvadas, 2012).

According to Crossman (2016), Marx has influenced the concept of power in all the social sciences, thus attention will be given to the Marxist theory. Marx made important contributions to studies about human societies. One of the contributions was the view that societies are essentially changeable systems (Encyclopedia.com, n.d.). Marx further stated that these changes are largely produced by internal conflicts and contradictions (Crossman, 2016). The assumption was made that if these changes are observed in a large number of cases, it is possible to predict the causes and consequences of these behaviours (Encyclopedia.com, n.d.). Marx was also famous for the conflict theory. Conflict theory states that tensions and conflicts arise when resources, status, and power are unevenly distributed between groups in society and that these conflicts become the engine for social change (Crossman, 2018). In this context, power can be seen in the

control of material resources and accumulated wealth, control of politics and the institutions that make up society (Crossman, 2018).

Marx and Engels wrote in the *Communist Manifesto* that social development takes place through the class struggle. Marx defined class conflict and struggle to occur because of the economic organisation (Crossman, 2014). Marx focused on the causes and consequences of class conflict between the bourgeoisie (the owners of the means of production and the capitalists) and the proletariat (the working class and the poor). Focusing on the economic, social, and political implication of the rise of capitalism in Europe, Marx theorised that this system, premised on the existence of a powerful minority class (the bourgeoisie) and an oppressed majority class (the proletariat), created the class conflict because the interests of the two were at odds, and the resources were unjustly distributed among them (Crossman, 2018). The class struggle is inevitable in capital societies because the interests of workers and capitalist differ greatly (Crossman, 2014). Capitalists accumulate wealth by exploiting workers while workers maintain or advance their own well-being by resisting capitalist exploitation (Crossman, 2014). Crossman (2014) says that “this can be seen when trade unions place the demands of workers on the negotiation table.” Crossman (2014) continues “thus the end result being conflict and struggle, and this is reflected in all aspects of social life, for example unionising efforts, strikes and political campaigns.” Woods (2013) wrote that Marx predicted that “capitalism would eventually lead to accumulation of wealth on the one hand, and on the other an equal accumulation of poverty, misery and unbearable labour on the other.”

Within this system an unequal social order was maintained through ideological coercion which created consensus, and acceptance of the values, expectations, and conditions as determined by the bourgeoisie. Marx theorised that the work of producing consensus was done in the “superstructure” of society, which is composed of social institutions, political structures, and culture (Crossman, 2018). Marx reasoned that as the socio-economic conditions worsened for the proletariat, they would develop a class consciousness that revealed their exploitation at the hands

of the wealthy capitalist class of bourgeoisie, and they would revolt, demanding changes to smooth conflict. This was also seen during the Marikana strike in 2012 whereby workers demanded a minimum wage of R12500 per month. Workers felt that they were exploited by the mining companies and were not remunerated accordingly (Crossman, 2018).

In conclusion, power is having control. For a dominant party, like a trade union in a specific industry, they want to acquire as much power as they can and by doing so, they become more successful. Power is being able to dominate a group, being a leader to that group and controlling that group. In my opinion, power is all about control. The party who has the most control, has power. That is when a power struggle exists. Other parties also want control in order to dominate a specific group, but the party in control does not want to give up that control. In trade unions, you have power when you are the majority union, meaning you represent the majority of the employees in a specific workplace.

1.1.7 Trade unions and the need for power

In the Labour Relations Act (No. 66 of 1995), herein after referred to as the LRA, Section 213, defines a trade union as “an association of employees with the principal purpose, to regulate the relationship between employers and employees, including employers’ organisations.”

Trade unions need power to negotiate on behalf of their members and this is known as collective bargaining power (Nel, Kirsten, Swanepoel, Erasmus & Poisat, 2012). If you have bargaining power, but you are not able to convince your opponent of its strength, you won’t be successful in getting your demands (Venter & Levy, 2012).

The most important aspect for trade unions to have is collective bargaining power (Nel et al., 2012). This is a fundamental part of any trade union, without collective bargaining power, a trade union cannot exist (Rheeder, 2014). Unions bring demands from the employees to the employer and over the past few years there has been many

cases of protest marches and strikes that turn into violent outburst if these demands are not met (Rheeder, 2014; Cavvadas, 2012). Rheeder (2014) argues that this could be the cause of a lack of common understanding and failed relationships between employers and employees in South Africa. Rheeder (2014) continues “this includes collective bargaining, dispute resolution, representation in disputes and effectively working together to achieve labour peace in the workplace and increase employee participation in workplace matters.” Collective bargaining will be examined in more detail later in this study.

Employees organise themselves under trade unions in order to maximise their collective power, this term is referred to as “power play” against the employer (Rheeder, 2014). This helps to promote participation by employees in the regulation of workplace matters. In order for a union to achieve their purpose, they need to seek recognition from the employer and this will empower them to exercise their organisational rights if a certain level of representation is achieved (Venter & Levy, 2012).

The LRA, Section 11, defines a representative trade union as “a registered trade union, or two or more registered trade unions acting jointly, that are sufficiently representative of the employees employed by an employer in a workplace.”

The more members a union has, the more powerful it is and the more effective it becomes in the power play with the employer or employers in an industry (Rheeder, 2014). If a union’s membership decreases below the threshold of representivity, the employer has the right to cancel the collective agreement, in terms of the LRA (Rheeder, 2014). This was the case at Lonmin Platinum where the employer (the mine) gave notice to NUM that they are going to cancel the agreement (Du Plessis, 2017b).

It is very important for trade unions to have good relationships with employers (Du Plessis, 2017a). If there is a healthy relationship between trade unions and employers, the parties can negotiate to extend the recognition agreement based on the relationship status (Du Plessis, 2017a). In order for trade unions to achieve the purpose of the Labour Relations Act, it must seek

labour peace and engage in a joint and meaningful consensus seeking process (Labour Relations Act). Union-management cooperation will help improve organisational performance and sustainability, which will benefit all the role players in the employment relationship (Petrick, n.d.).

GilesFiles (2016) explains that there is no ‘duty to bargain’ or to ‘recognise’ a trade union in South Africa. Disputes of interest such as wages, terms and conditions of employment and trade union recognition are resolved through a ‘power play’ relationship and not necessarily by arbitration (GilesFiles, 2016). Collective agreements between the registered trade unions, representing the majority of employees in the workplace, and the employer serves as a form of security for both parties (GilesFiles, 2016). The Department of Labour defines a collective agreement as “a written agreement concerning terms and conditions of employment, or any other matter of mutual interest, concluded by one or more registered trade unions on the one hand and, and on the other hand, one or more employers; one or more registered employers’ organisations; or one or more employers and one or more employers’ organisations (Department of Labour, 2008).

1.1.8 A brief overview of the history of the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM)

The National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) was founded in 1982 (National Union of Mineworkers, n.d.). According to the NUM, “their strength is to ensure that their members are protected from health and safety hazards and where there is negligence, the company must adequately investigate and take the necessary measures to ensure safety in the workplace” (The National Union of Mineworkers, n.d.). In August 1987, NUM led by Cyril Ramaphosa, organised South Africa’s longest and biggest strike (Webb, 2007). Webb (2007) stated that at that time, NUM was the second largest trade union in South Africa. More than 300 000 black mine workers that went on strike over wages and working conditions (Webb, 2007). This strike was violent, 11 people died, 500 were injured and over 400 workers were arrested (Webb, 2007).

NUM was until the Marikana incident of August 2012, the majority union at Lonmin (Botiveau, 2014).

1.1.9 A brief overview of the history of the Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union (AMCU)

The Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union was established in 1998 in Mpumalanga, South Africa (South African History, 2014). It was formed by a previous member of the National Union of Mineworkers. AMCU held a minority position for 12 years before breaking through into platinum (Botiveau, 2014). AMCU is an ‘apolitical and non-communist’ party which is very different from what the NUM stands for (South African History, 2014). AMCU is seen by many as a militant union (Botiveau, 2014). The Marikana incident made AMCU more popular among the mineworkers and they now represent over 70% of the mineworkers at Lonmin Platinum (Mahlakoana, 2017a). When these numbers are compared to NUM’s membership numbers, NUM only represents about 20% of the mineworkers at Lonmin Platinum mine (Mahlakoana, 2017a). AMCU has majority membership at both Amplats and Impala Platinum (Mahlakoana, 2017a).

Infighting within NUM has led to the union losing support and membership to AMCU, especially in the platinum sector (Dhliwayo, 2012). Dhliwayo (2012) explains the following; “NUM has lost credibility with workers as the union is regarded as a means of acquiring powerful government positions and board directorship in the mining companies.” An example of this is Cyril Ramaphosa (Dhliwayo, 2012). Ramaphosa, who was the first General Secretary of NUM, sits on the board of directors of Lonmin because his company, Shanduka, is Lonmin’s Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) partner (Dhliwayo, 2012).

1.1.10 Practical implications to the power struggle

The rivalry between NUM and AMCU first started in 2012 and continued ever since (Terblanche, 2012). Paton (2013) states that any rivalry between two key unions influences the pace and success of labour relations. The year 2012 will be remembered for the highest number

of unprotected strike actions, high wage demands and the infamous Marikana incident (Paton, 2013). According to Botiveau (2014) “the strike was driven by both top-down and bottom-up dynamics” (p. 129). Botiveau (2014) uses the example that “a partly autonomous workers’ committee was created by the strikers that operated outside of AMCU control, and the strike rapidly spread to other Lonmin operations where the new union had limited presence” (p.129). Botiveau (2014) continues “from the top down, the union officially avoided claiming paternity for a movement that was both illegal and marked by episodes of violence. At the same time former NUM leaders who had joined AMCU encouraged workers to voice their demands, supported the workers’ movement and also partly led it” (p. 130). Botiveau (2014) is of the opinion that AMCU’s strategy was to take advantage of the strike in order for them to gain ground in its struggle against NUM’s dominance in the mining sector (p.130).

The problems started when migrant Rock Drill Operators, herein after referred to as RDO’s, at Impala Platinum (Implats), demanded a wage increase (Hartford, 2012). They elected a strike committee and had two demands (Hartford, 2012). The first is net pay of R9000, which is equivalent to the miners’ net pay after the eighteen percent adjustment (Hartford, 2012). The second demand was that there would be no negotiations with NUM. Management of Impala adjusted their salaries to bring an end to the strike (Hartford, 2012). After this incident over 10 000 employees resigned from the NUM and joined the new union, AMCU (Hartford, 2012).

The same trends from the Implats strike were observed at Lonmin Platinum in the same year (Hartford, 2012). Hartford (2012) commented that the Lonmin strike was unprocedural and it also occurred during a period where a collective agreement was in place. If a strike is unprocedural it means that there was no procedures followed to initiate the strike and it was not protected by law (Labour Relations Act 66 of 1995). The strike was mainly characterised by a general dissatisfaction with the NUM leadership (Terblanche, 2012). The underlying trends were hostility towards NUM, disrespect for the collective agreement, unprocedural industrial action

and the R12 500 wage demand (Hartford, 2012). The strike was driven without union advice and without union endorsement or support (Hartford, 2012).

In 2013, one year after the 2012 strike, AMCU succeeded in its objective and is now the majority union in Lonmin, representing 60 percent of the employees (Botiveau, 2014). AMCU now also has a monopoly in the collective bargaining process (Botiveau, 2014).

1.1.11 Power shifts and changing social identities and the impact on the workplace

Individuals distinguish themselves within the group they belong to according to social categories (Booyesen, 2013). According to Booyesen (2013) there have been many societal shifts and changes in societies where group boundaries and experiences are often altered, this causes individuals to change their perceptions about their group membership. This is known as a state of social identity. Social identity is defined by Andeeva (in Ivanova, 2005: 72) “as a state of unconsciousness in which most of the social categories by which individuals define themselves and their place in society, seem to have lost their boundaries and their value”.

Social identity groups are defined as groups in which an individual’s self-concept is derived from membership to the group along with the psychological value and emotional significance attached to that membership (Booyesen, 2013; McLeod, 2008). Bornman (In Booyesen, 2013: 2) points out that a positive or negative self-concept is often defined by the status of the group to which the individual belong in relation to that of other relevant groups in society. McLeod (2008) explains that in order for individuals to increase their self-image, they enhance the status of the group they belong. The second way in which individuals enhance their self-image is by discriminating and holding prejudice views against the out group (the group they don’t belong to). The conclusion here is that individuals divide themselves into two groups, “them” and “us” based on the process of social categorisation. Social categorisation is when individuals categorise people into social groups (McLeod, 2008). This is known as in-group (us) and out-group (them). The social identity theory states that the in-group will discriminate against the out-group to enhance their self-image (McLeod, 2008). This could possibly be why members

from different unions tend to act in a violent manner towards other individuals who are not part of their group (Terblanche, 2012).

In the case of Lonmin in 2012, trade union leaders failed to provide direction and leadership to workers, thus leaving them to run amok (Dhliwayo, 2012). The unions should not have supported the illegal strike, but rather have followed the legislative process to express their grievances. Dhliwayo (2012) states that this was irresponsible from union leadership and they should accept some of the blame.

1.1.12 Collective bargaining in the mining industry

Research showed that collective bargaining structures have failed in mediating wage disputes (Arendse, 2015). The question that arises from the previous statement is “is South Africa’s collective bargaining structure still valid? (Arendse, 2015)”. Collective bargaining means that collective agreements reached between parties are binding at an industry level (Cilliers, 2012).

Some individuals believe that labour unrest in South Africa is caused by collective bargaining (Cilliers, 2012). The reason being that it gives undue power to the dominant trade union (Cilliers, 2012). If membership is 50% + 1 of all employees in an industry, the majority trade union can bargain on behalf of all workers. This means that the union has majority representation (Cilliers, 2012). Collective agreements have been applied by mining companies since 2012 to employees who are not affiliated with unions to ensure that there is standardisation regarding wages and benefits in the workplace (Arendse, 2015).

The question that was raised is whether collective bargaining is a good or a bad thing. The evidence pointed out that it is a bad thing for South Africa in two ways; bad for employment and bad for employer-worker relations (Cilliers, 2012). Berkeley economist, Magruder, arrived at the conclusion that collective bargaining in South Africa comes at a prohibitive cost for small firms, and thus contributes to lower employment. South Africa has a smaller proportion of small firms relative to other countries (Magruder, 2012). The reason why this is troublesome is that

small firms are a large source of employment in a country (Magruder, 2012). Small firms has a lower capacity and thus cannot afford collective agreements, which are commonly reached between the largest firms and unions in an industry (Magruder, 2012). Magruder (2012) suggests that more flexibility for firm-specific labour negotiations would allow for more entrants of smaller firms in an industry.

The Marikana Commission of Inquiry found that the process of collective bargaining had a significant impact on the events at Marikana (2015). Section 23 in the LRA makes provisions for an arrangement between the lawfully organised union and the employer as well as the legal effect of such an agreement. This regulates the party's interaction and also provides for the possibility to resort to lawful strike or lockout measures (The Labour Relations Act 66 of 1995). Literature suggests that the events that occurred at Implats could have triggered the events that occurred at Lonmin (Hartford, 2012; Mckay, 2012).

According to Maree (2009):

Collective bargaining trends in South Africa have often moved in the opposite direction to global trends over the past thirty years. When collective bargaining decentralised in many countries it became more centralised in South Africa; when trade union density declined in other countries, it increased in South Africa. One reason for this can be the emergence of a less repressive regime in South Africa that enabled the demands of trade unions to be met (p.1).

In conclusion, it seems that collective bargaining works in other countries (Cilliers, 2012). It is seen as one of the reasons for wage equality and stability in north European countries like Germany and Sweden. The largest source of inequality in South Africa is not wages, but employment (Cilliers, 2012).

1.1.13 South Africa's changing labour relations environment

Labour unrest remains a concerning factor across South Africa's mining industry (Botiveau, 2014). The unrest is caused by factors such as job security, wage negotiations and trade union conflict (Gernetzky, 2015). This means that South Africa's labour relations environment is at a defining moment (The skillsportal, 2013). Unprotected strike action that escalated into an uncontrolled, violent and unlawful practice has increased over the past few years (The skillsportal, 2013).

In June 2016, the need to improve labour relations was highlighted by S & P Global Ratings (S & P Global, 2017). S & P Global Ratings is the world's leading provider of independent credit ratings.

South Africa's labour relations landscape needs to change to an environment of normality, stability and order (Jacobs, 2013). Jacobs (2013) says that "in order for this to happen, employers need to re-establish constructive relationships with employees, not only union leaders, and manage both legislative challenges as well as economic demands. To achieve this, it is imperative that sound employee relations strategies be developed rather than short-term re-active tactics." Jacobs (2013) further argues that change needs to happen on three levels; at a union, employee and employer level.

Trade unions also face some challenges. These challenges include; diminishing membership numbers, a disconnection with their members and unhealthy competition with each other (Jacobs, 2013). A study conducted by the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) revealed that South Africa's trust in trade unions has dropped from 49 percent in 2011 to 29 percent in 2012 (Gordon, 2013). Jacobs (2013) argues that unions need to re-establish contact with their members, take responsibility for their own actions and for those of their members because the current state of labour relations is detrimental to both employers and employees.

The Labour Relations Act 66 of 1995 was designed for circumstances in that period, this means that for that period majoritarianism was applicable, but it is now outdated (The

skillsportal, 2013). Thus, it necessitates change. The following question is raised by Van Eck and Kreuser (2012), could labour law, which specifically regulates the relationship between employers and employees, not have saved the lives of the 46 people who were killed at the Lonmin mine during the Marikana strike in 2012? The Minister of Labour responded to employees' loss in confidence in the Labour Relations Act by indicating that there needs to be a re-establishment of the bargaining system in the platinum mines (Department of Labour, 2012). The industrial action at the Marikana Platinum mine has forced the South African government to strengthen social dialogue and collective bargaining processes (Department of Labour, 2012).

The Labour Relations Act 66 of 1995 was amended to make provision for minority unions who do not have recognition because of a threshold that the employer and the majority union set, to fight the threshold through an arbitration process (Labour Relations Act; Du Plessis, 2017c). A trade union who has a significant interest in a specific workplace, and who can prove the significant interest may apply for limited organisation rights (Coetzee & Kelly, 2013).

The LRA protects workers against dismissal if they participated in protected strike action (Labour Relations Act). AMCU should have gone to the CCMA. The CCMA would have issued a certificate stating that the matter could not be resolved, and then AMCU could have given Lonmin 48 hour notice that they are going to strike. This would then have been a protected strike. The LRA would have given protection against dismissal as well as immunity against delict and contractual damage claims (Labour Relations Act). History tells us that this did not happen and Lonmin acted within their rights to dismiss the striking RDO's as well as put in a claim against the workers and the union for all the damages caused (van Eck & Kreuser, 2012). The LRA introduced a national minimum wage policy and proposed amendments to the Basic Conditions of Employment Act No. 75 of 1997 and the Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995. Experts say that these changes will have a significant impact on the collective bargaining systems in South Africa (Mahlakoana, 2017b). The amendments will be on the minimum wage and the Code of Good practice on Collective Bargaining, Industrial Action and Picketing. It is

said that these changes are aimed at managing the violence that accompanies strikes. South Africa does not have a system in place for dealing with the massive growth of low-paid workers. The new amendments which will become law in May 2018, sets the national minimum wage at R20 an hour for major sectors, this excludes farm workers who will receive a minimum of R18 per hour and domestic workers who will receive a minimum of R15 per hour (Mahlakoana, 2017b).

1.1.14 The future of mining in South Africa

Mining in South Africa is facing a crisis of legitimacy as support from local communities and the broader society is weakening” (Baxter, 2016). Mining is very important for the country, as it helps to develop and grow a country (Baxter, 2016).

The potential risks for mining include market demand, replacement technology, policy and regulatory uncertainty, labour instability and South Africa seen as an unreliable supplier to the global market (Baxter, 2016). The mining industry has been hit hard with global commodity prices falling drastically (Baxter, 2016). The Domestic cost pressures has risen too quickly for mining inputs and electricity prices have tripled in 7 years (Baxter, 2016). Wages went up by 10% per annum over the past 5 years (Baxter, 2016). Productivity has been declining for the past ten years. This can be ascribed to a declining grade, aging mines, production disruptions which includes; inappropriate Section54 closures, industrial action, community disruptions, illegal mining and an inability to increase productive shifts (Baxter, 2016). The overall mining industry operated against an aggregate net loss of R37 billion in 2015 (Baxter, 2016).

Employment in the mining industry has also become a growing concern (Du Plessis, 2017c). 59 407 jobs were lost in mining between January 2012 and December 2015. Another 29 000 mining jobs can be lost due to section 189 retrenchment processes. The multiplier effect of job losses in the mining sector equates to 180 000 jobs being lost in other sectors related to mining (Baxter, 2016). More and more mining companies are announcing that they will be retrenching workers in the near future (ENCA, 2017).

Du Plessis says that good leadership is the only thing that can save the mining industry (Du Plessis, 2018). On the negative side, the leadership problem lies at mining level where the outdated autocratic management style is still valid and leads to conflict with unions (Du Plessis, 2018). Mine houses will have to address their middle-level leadership problem urgently because that is the level at which labour relations are practiced (Du Plessis, 2018). Participatory leadership can't be exercised at executive level if it is not embraced on all other levels as well (Du Plessis, 2018). A subsequent initiative is a policy of visual leadership employed by Anglo American (Du Plessis, 2018). This entails that their executive leadership corps, along with senior officials and trade union leaders, regularly visits their mines to listen to miners' challenges and especially to their proposals on mine safety. Thus, the "them and us" feeling is eliminated (Du Plessis, 2018).

Summary and Conclusion

The aim of this article was to gain more insight into the effect of trade union power struggles on labour relations and the employment relationship. This was done by looking at events and situations that causes the power struggle. The main findings were that industrial action and wage negotiations enhance the severity of the conflict between trade unions. The reason being that if one trade union fails to deliver on the demands of employees, it sets the scene for another union to come in and deliver.

The relationship between the employer and an employee as individual or collective cannot be overlooked in this research for several reasons. The first reason is that political interests might have an influence on the employer-trade union relationship as both are driving their own agenda. Secondly, reckless use and abuse of power is prominent if complete power lands in the hands of the trade union. Thirdly, internal conflict could occur if too much power is given to trade unions (Tshukudu, 2015). Lastly, although power can never be balanced, it is important that there is equitable power between employers and trade unions. The balancing act in

respect of the employment relationship is Labour legislation that can guide both parties on the various aspects of the relationship.

The South African labour landscape has undergone massive changes in the past few years and this left the trade union movement almost unrecognisable from previous years (Bezuidenhout, 2017). The Congress of South African Trade unions, which is still the largest trade union federation in South Africa, has been bleeding members for a while and has been shaken to the core by the exit of the National Union of Metal Workers of South Africa. This exit has led to the formation of a new federation, The South African Federation of Trade Unions. Another interesting thing to note is that the membership base of trade unions has changed dramatically. It has shifted from one dominated by unskilled and semi-skilled workers to one that shows bias towards skilled and professional workers. According to Bezuidenhout (2017), was this captured in a series of surveys undertaken between 1994 and 2014, before the National Union of Metal Workers' exit. The data shows that less than 1% of members within the trade union movement classified themselves as professional in the early years of democracy. The picture had changed radically by 2008 with 20% of the respondents classifying themselves as professional. It would therefore seem that South Africa's trade union movement had become the home for middle class civil servants, rather than a working class federation. Marx's theory of conflict can be seen in this as well. It was previously stated that Marx focused on the causes and consequences of class conflict between the bourgeoisie (the owners of the means of production and the capitalists) and the proletariat (the working class and the poor). Marx theorised that this system, premised on the existence of a powerful minority class (the bourgeoisie) and an oppressed majority class (the proletariat), created the class conflict because the interests of the two were at odds, and the resources were unjustly distributed among them (Crossman, 2018).

The amended Labour Relations Act became effective on 1 January 2015. The amended LRA now makes it easier for unions to obtain rights within the organisation. This means that unions who are sufficiently represented but who do not have majority representation, can now be

given majority rights by Commissioners given that there are no other union in the workplace who already has majority rights.

Another change in the LRA relates to strikes. The reasons for which employees can strike has been limited. An employee cannot strike about any labour dispute which can be adjudicated nor, can they strike about the content of any sectoral determination within the first 12 months of it being published. The Labour Court has a lot more power in terms of dealing with misconduct during strikes. For example, the Labour Court can suspend a strike, they can vary or change picketing agreements to make them more effective and suspend a lockout where an employer is in breach of the agreement. Protection against civil liability is also suspended where picketing agreements are breached.

Unions with influence and power has a negative effect on labour relations and more specifically on the employment relationship (Tshukudu, 2015). They put pressure on employers, discourage investors, collective bargaining becomes a lengthy process and more regular and long industrial action (Tshukudu, 2015). If there is no trust between the parties, there is no basis to engage on with each other in a civil and respectable manner.

This study adds to the limited body of knowledge that exists on the impact of power struggles between trade unions and the influence thereof on the employment relationship within South Africa's mining sector. The results of this study indicate that there is a struggle for power amongst unions. This power struggle has deadly consequences as it literally results in violence that escalates to murder. It further has an influence on the labour relations environment, on the employment relationship and on the country. Knowing how to encourage better trade union participation is of great importance to trade union leaders. Dealing with workplace issues in a more respectable manner, by both union representatives as well as human resource managers, will also contribute to better relationship building. Future research should seek to assess the generalisability of these findings to other industries within the South African context.

Jacobs (2013) explains that:

The first step in creating an Employee Relations strategy is to ensure a fair workplace climate with the right corporate culture. Companies must ensure an equitable workplace, which includes having policies, practices and procedures in place that are legally correct and suited to the company's culture. This can include disciplinary codes and employment equity practices and must be consistently applied to create the right climate and culture in the workplace. Furthermore, appointed leaders must guide the way and create a climate beneficial to peace and harmony in the workplace.

Another important factor is communication. The company needs to take up the primary role of communicator (Jacobs, 2013). Jacobs (2013) says that open and honest communication from management directly to employees will ensure that the correct information is portrayed to all staff members. For this to be successful, structures need to be established throughout the organisation (Jacobs, 2013).

In summary, the focus should be on better communication channels which are open and transparent. A corporate climate and culture need to be established and the employees need to give their buy-in for management to initiate and implement this together with the support of trade unions. The better the relationship is between trade unions and management, the more productive and motivated workforce the employer will gain.

REFERENCES

- Anglo Gold Ashanti. (2013). Material issue 2: Managing and meeting internal and external expectations. Retrieved from <http://www.aga-reports.com/13/os/performance/managing-expectations/for-employees>
- Arendse, N. (2015, October 9). Is there still a place for collective bargaining in SA's mining sector? *Moneyweb*. Retrieved from <http://www.moneyweb.co.za/news/industry/is-there-still-a-place-for-collective-bargaining-in-sas-mining-sector/>
- Baxter, R. (2016, June 14). The future of the South African Mining Industry. Chamber of Mines of South Africa. *Presented by Roger Baxter, Chief Executive of the Chambers of Mines*. Retrieved from <http://www.chamberofmines.org.za/industry-news/publications/presentations/send/7-2015/242-the-future-of-the-south-african-mining-industry>
- Bendila, D. (2016, June 7). NUM concerned over threats of a wipe-out at Northam Platinum. *Eye Witness News*. Retrieved from <http://ewn.co.za/2016/06/07/NUM-believes-there-are-attempts-to-wipe-it-out-at-Northam-Platinum>
- Bhorat, H., Naidoo, K., & Yu, D. (2014). *Trade unions in an emerging economy: The case of South Africa (201402)*. Development Policy Research Unit. Retrieved from http://www.dpru.uct.ac.za/sites/default/files/image_tool/images/36/DPRU%20WP201402.pdf
- Blanchflower, D. G. (1996). The role and influence of trade unions in the OECD. *Dartmouth College, National Bureau of Economic Research and Centre for Economic Performance, LSE*. doi: 10.1.1.589.6691 Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.589.6691&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Blanchflower, D. G., & Bryson, A. (2009). *Trade union decline and the economics of the workplace*. Retrieved from http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item6860698/?site_locale=en_GB

- Bohlmann, H. R., Dixon, P. B., Rimmer, M. T., & Van Heerden, J. H. (2014). The impact of the 2014 Platinum mining strike in South Africa: An economy-wide analysis. *Economic Research Southern Africa*, 478. Retrieved from www.econrsa.org/system/files/publications/working_papers/working_paper_478.pdf
- Bolton, D., Bagraim, J. J., Witten, L., Mohamed, Y., Zvobgo, V., & Khan, M. (2007). Explaining union participation: The effects of union commitment and demographic factor. *South African Journal of Industrial Psychology*, 33(1), 74-79. Retrieved from <http://www.sajip.co.za/index.php/sajip/article/viewFile/254/251>
- Booyesen, L. (2013). Societal power shifts and changing social identities in South Africa: Workplace implications. *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, 10(1). Retrieved from <http://sajems.org/index.php/sajems/article/view/533/201>
- Botiveau, R. (2014). Briefing: The politics of Marikana and South Africa's changing labour relations. *Oxford University Press*, 113(450), 128 -137. doi: 10.1093/afraf/adt073.
- Bryson, A. (2005a). 'Working with Dinosaurs? Union Effectiveness in Britain'
- Bryson, A., Forth, J., & Kirby, S. (2005b) 'High-performance practices, trade union representation and workplace performance in Britain', *Scottish Journal of Political Economy*, 53, 3: 451-491
- Bryson, A., & Forth, J. (2010). Union organisation and the quality of employment relations. *National Institute of Economic and Social Research*. Retrieved from www.cardiff.ac.uk/cglr/events-activities/2010/bryson-forth.pdf
- Cavvadas, D. (2012, December 27). Marikana – the causes and wider implications and lessons for the mining industry in Africa. *Fasken Martineau in Lexology online. Global Mining Q4 Newsletter Feature Article*. Retrieved from <https://s3.amazonaws.com/documents.lexology.com/8b71ee31-c603-4d26-b0d9-f8c886d23bce.pdf>

- Cilliers, J. (2012). The Marikana massacre – watershed in South African politics. *SCRIBD*. Retrieved from <https://www.scribd.com/document/112176100/Marikana-Massacre-Watershed-in-South-African-Politics-August-26-2012-Cilliers>
- Claassen, A. (n.d.). Employee and Employer rights. *The South African Labour Guide*. Retrieved from <http://www.labourguide.co.za/most-recent/1144-employee-a-employer-rights>
- Coetzee, F. & Kelly, S. (2013, May 9). Giving unions greater access to organisational rights. *HR Pulse*. Retrieved from <http://www.hrpulse.co.za/legal/legal-opinion/229622-giving-unions-greater-access-to-organisational-rights>
- Creamer, M. (2012, October 19). One Marikana after the other unless underlying causes tackled, says labour doyen. *Mining Weekly*. Retrieved from http://www.miningweekly.com/article/one-marikana-after-the-other-unless-underlying-causes-tackled-says-labour-doyen-2012-10-19/rep_id:3650
- Crossman, A. (2014, November 25). Class conflict and struggle. *Thoughtco*. Retrieved from <https://www.thoughtco.com/class-conflict-3026134>
- Crossman, A. (2016, April 15). Power. *Thoughtco*. Retrieved from <https://www.thoughtco.com/power-p2-3026460>
- Crossman, A. (2018, June 1). Understanding conflict theory. *Thoughtco*. Retrieved from <https://www.thoughtco.com/conflict-theory-3026622>
- Crowley, K. & Mokhema, T. (2016, November 11). Platinum producers ink wage deals with AMCU. *BusinessReport*. Retrieved from <http://www.iol.co.za/business-report/companies/platinum-producers-ink-wage-deals-with-amcu-2085551>
- Davies, N. (2015, May 22). The savage truth behind the Marikana massacre. *Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-05-21-the-savage-truth-behind-the-marikana-massacre>

- De Lange, J. (2012). The rise and rise of AMCU. *Miningmx*. Retrieved from http://www.miningmx.com/special_reports/mining-yearbook/mining-yearbook-2012/A-season-of-discontent.htm
- Department of Labour. (2008). Basic guide to collective agreements. Retrieved from <http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/legislation/acts/basic-guides/basic-guide-to-collective-agreements>
- Department of Labour. (2012). Annual Industrial Action Report. Retrieved from <http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/documents/annual-reports/industrial-action-annual-report/2012/industrialreport2012.pdf>
- Dick, W. (2016). Platinum wage negotiations. *Mineweb: Your investment Resource*. Retrieved from www.mineweb.com/news/political-economy-analysis/platinum-wage-negotiations/
- Donnelly, L. (2014, February 4). SA's economy depends on mining labour relations, says Manuel. *The Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved from <http://mg.co.za/article/2014-02-04-sas-economy-depends-on-mining-labour-relations-says-manuel>
- Du Plessis, G. (2017a, June 18). Arbeidsvrede moontlik sonder om te veg. *Netwerk24*. Retrieved from <https://www.netwerk24.com/Sake/Ekonomie/gideon-du-plessis-arbeidsvrede-is-moontlik-20170618>.
- Du Plessis, G. (2017b, August 10). Solidariteit: Ons vertrou Lonmin-hoof nie meer. *Netwerk24*. Retrieved from <https://www.netwerk24.com/Sake/Mynbou/solidariteit-ons-vertrou-lonmin-hoof-nie-meer-20170810>
- Du Plessis, G. (2017c, October 1). Vakbondwedywering is ondemokraties. *Netwerk24*. Retrieved from <https://www.netwerk24.com/Sake/Ekonomie/gideon-du-plessis-wedywering-is-ondemokraties-20171001>
- Du Plessis, G. (2018, January 14). Gideon du Plessis: Goeie leierskap kan mynbou red. *Netwerk24*. Retrieved from <https://www.netwerk24.com/Sake/Mynbou/gideon-du-plessis-goeie-leierskap-kan-mynbou-red-20180114>

- ENCA. (2017, August 10). AMCU vows to fight job losses in mining industry. Retrieved from <https://www.enca.com/south-africa/amcu-vows-to-fight-job-losses-in-mining-industry>
- Gernetzky, K. (2015, April 30). Amplats plan to retrench 474 workers reignites anger. *BusinessDay Live*. Retrieved from <http://www.bdlive.co.za/business/mining/2015/04/30/amplats-plan-to-retrench-474-workers-reignites-nums-anger>
- GilesFiles. (2016). Trade union recognition: Rights and agency. Retrieved from <http://www.gilesfiles.co.za/philosophy-politics-economics/organisationl-rights-and-trade-union-recognition/>
- Gordon, S. (2013). The state of the union? Attitudes to South African trade unions. *Human Sciences Research Council*. Retrieved from <http://www.hsrc.ac.za/en/review/hsrc-review-march-2013/the-state-of-the-union>
- Hartford, G. (2012, October 10). The mining industry strike wave: what are the causes and what are the solutions. *Ground Up*. Retrieved from <http://www.groundup.org.za/article/mining-industry-strike-wave-what-are-causes-and-what-are-solutions/>
- Hill, N. & Maroun, W. (2015). Assessing the potential impact of the Marikana incident on South Africa mining companies: An event method study. *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, 18 (4), 586-607. doi: 10.17159/2222
- Retrieved from <https://dx.doi.org/10.17159/2222-3436/2015/V18N4A10>
- Hlongwane, S. (2013 April 9). The NUM/AMCU Cold War moves to bargaining councils. *Daily Maverick*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2013-04-09-the-numamcu-cold-war-moves-to-bargaining-councils/#.WBjDC196M8>
- International Labour Organisation. (2006). Employment relationship. *Paper presented at the International Labour Conference, Geneva: ILO*. Retrieved from

- http://www.ilo.org/ifpdial/areas-of-work/labour-law/WCMS_CON_TXT_IFPDIAL_EMPREL_EN/lang--en/index.htm
- Ivanova, N.L. (2005). Social identity under various socio-cultural conditions. *Russian Education and Society*, 47(11): 71-87.
- Jacobs, C. (2013, May 28). The future of labour relations in South Africa. *OIM Group*. Retrieved from <https://www.oimgroup.com/news/coverage/the-future-of-labour-relations-in-south-africa/>
- Kalenga, A. (2016, June 16). Northam Platinum welcomes arrests following deadly violence. *Eye Witness News*. Retrieved from <http://ewn.co.za/2016/06/16/Northam-Platinum-welcomes-arrest-of-six-suspects-after-violence>
- Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995 as amended.
- Lachman, S. (2013). The roots of power struggle in relationships. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/me-we/201306/the-roots-power-struggle-in-relationships>
- Langenhoven, H. (2017, June). Facts and Figures 2016. *Chamber of Mines*. Retrieved from <http://www.chamberofmines.org.za/industry-news/publications/facts-and-figures>
- Leon, P. (2013, October 21). The mining industry after Marikana. *Politics Web*. Retrieved from <http://www.politicsweb.co.za/news-and-analysis/the-mining-industry-after-marikana>
- Longhurst, L. (2015). Marikana: the case for political culpability. *News24*. Retrieved from <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/MARIKANAthe-case-for-political-culpability-20150821>
- Lonmin issues notice to terminate organisational rights to three unions. (2017, August 7). *The Citizen*. Retrieved from <https://citizen.co.za/news/south-africa/1602482/lonmin-issues-notice-to-terminate-organisational-rights-to-three-unions/>

- Lonmin. (2013). These are the sticking points with AMCU – Lonmin. *PoliticsWeb*. Retrieved from <http://www.politicsweb.co.za/documents/these-are-the-sticking-points-with-amcu--lonmin>
- Magruder, J. R. (2012). High unemployment yet few small firms: The role of centralised bargaining in South Africa. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 4(3), 66-138. Retrieved from <https://www.aeaweb.org/articles/pdf/doi/10.1257/app.4.3.138>
- Mahlakoana, T. (2017a, May 24). Marikana mineworkers feel shafted by AMCU. *BusinessDay*. Retrieved from <https://www.businesslive.co.za/bd/national/labour/2017-05-24-marikana-mineworkers-feel-shafted-by-amcu/>
- Mahlakoana, T. (2017b, November 9). Amendments to labour laws up for discussion. *BusinessDay*. Retrieved from <https://www.businesslive.co.za/bd/national/labour/2017-11-09-amendments-to-labour-laws-up-for-discussion/>
- Maldonado, M. (2014, February 25). How stress affects mental health. *Psych Central*. Retrieved from <http://psychcentral.com/blog/archives/2014/02/25/how-stress-affects-mental-health/>
- Manyathela, C. (2016a, June 7). AMCU snubs Northam Platinum meeting. *Eye Witness News*. Retrieved from <http://ewn.co.za/2016/06/07/Amcu-snubs-Northam-Platinum-meeting-to-resolve-violence>
- Manyathela, C. (2016b, June 11). Minister's intervention at Northam Platinum welcomed. *Eye Witness News*. Retrieved from <http://ewn.co.za/2016/06/11/Mosebenzi-Zwanesi-intervention-at-Northam-Platinum-welcomed>
- Maree, J. (2009). *Trends in collective bargaining: Why South Africa differs from global trends*. Paper presented at the 15th IIRA (International Industrial Relations Association) World Congress in Sydney, Australia. Retrieved from http://www.ilera-directory.org/15thworldcongress/files/papers/Track_4/Wed_P4_MAREE.pdf
- Marrian, N. (2014, July 3). NUM & ANC: The price of loyalty. *Financial Mail*. Retrieved from <http://www.financialmail.co.za/coverstory/2014/07/03/num-anc-the-price-of-loyalty>

- Marxist Sociology (n.d.). Encyclopedia.com. retrieved from
<http://www.encyclopedia.com/social-sciences-and-law/political-science-and-government/political-science-terms-and-concepts-41>
- Mathews, C. (2015, July 9). AMCU membership audit good news for NUM. *BusinessDay Live*. Retrieved from <http://www.bdlive.co.za/national/labour/2015/07/09/amcu-membership-audit-good-news-for-num>
- McKay, D. (2012, August 22). SA platinum faces “toxic mix” as it plots union talks. *Miningmx*. Retrieved from <http://www.miningmx.com/news/platinum/17005-sa-platinum-faces-toxic-mix-as-it-plots-union-talks/>
- McKay, D. (2016, April 4). Mathunjwa in full cry as AMCU confirms Sibanye strike. *Mininingmx*. Retrieved from <http://www.miningmx.com/news/gold/27010-mathunjwa-in-full-voice-as-amcu-calls-sibanye-strike/>
- McLeod, S. (2008). Social Identity Theory. *Simply Psychology*. Retrieved from <https://www.simplypsychology.org/social-identity-theory.html>
- Mining Review Africa. (2014, July 18). Effects of the mining strikes on the South African Economy. *Mining review*. Retrieved from <https://www.miningreview.com/news/effects-of-the-mining-strikes-on-the-south-african-economy/>
- Motau, K. (2017, August 6). NUM: Current retrenchments in mining industry will fuel illegal mining. *Eye Witness News*. Retrieved from <http://ewn.co.za/2017/08/06/num-current-retrenchments-in-mining-industry-will-fuel-illegal-mining>
- Mulder, C. (2017, October). Mynbouhandves ondermyn Suid-Afrika. *Solidariteit Tydskrif*, 5, 26-27.
- National Union of Mineworkers. (n.d.). NUM History. Retrieved from <http://num.org.za/About-Us/History>
- Nel, P. S., Kirsten, M., Swanepoel, B. J., Erasmus, B.J., & Poisat, P. (2012). *South African Employment Relations: Theory and practice*. Pretoria, Hatfield: Van Schaik Publishers.

- News24 Correspondent (2015). Malema, Maimane turn Marikana into political rally. *News24*. Retrieved from <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Malema/Maimane-turn-Marikana-into-political-rally-20150816>
- Nicolaides, G. (2013, November 6). NUM shop steward dies after being shot. *Eye Witness News*. Retrieved from <http://ewn.co.za/2013/11/06/NUM-shop-steward-shot-dies-in-hospital>
- Ori, J. (2012). *The hierarchy of needs for employees*. Retrieved from smallbusiness.chron.com/hierarchy-needs-employees-20121.html
- Paton, C. (2013, September 19). Strikes take bite out of GDP and Wages. *BusinessDay*.
- Petrick, J. (n.d.). How to improve working relationships with the employee union. *Chron*. Retrieved from <http://work.chron.com/improve-working-relationships-employee-union-23038.html>
- Peyper, L. (2015, September 22). AMCU, NUM relations better since 2013. *Miningmx*. Retrieved from <http://www.miningmx.com/news/markets/13950-amcu-num-relations-better-since-2013-pact/>
- Power. *BusinessDictionary.com*. Retrieved from [BusinessDictionary.com](http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/power.html). <http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/power.html>
- Power struggle. *Cambridge Dictionary*. Retrieved from <http://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/power-struggle>
- Power struggle. *Collins English Dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/power-struggle>
- Rheeder, J. (2014). Trade Unions – How to deal with power play and position bargaining. *Johanette Rheeder Incorporated*. Retrieved from <http://www.jrattorneys.co.za/south-african-labour-law-articles/collective-rights-and-strikes/trade-unions-how-to-deal-with-power-play-and-position-bargaining.html>

Sjogren, K. (2013). The boss, not the workload, causes workplace depression. *ScienceNordic*.

Retrieved from <http://sciencenordic.com/boss-not-workload-causes-workplace-depression>

Slabbert, J. A., Parker, A. J., & Farrell, D.V. (2013). *Employment relations management – Back to basics: A South African perspective*. [Lexis Nexis]. Retrieved from

<http://www.polity.org.za/article/employment-relations-management-back-to-basics-a-south-african-perspective-2015-10-06>

South Africa. Department of Labour. (2008). *Basic Guide to Collective Agreements*. Pretoria: Admin.

South Africa. Department of Mineral Resources. (2017). *Minister Mosebenzi Zwane: Release of the 2017 Mining Charter*. Retrieved from [http://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-](http://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-mosebenzi-zwane-occasion-release-mining-charter-15-jun-2017-0000)

[mosebenzi-zwane-occasion-release-mining-charter-15-jun-2017-0000](http://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-mosebenzi-zwane-occasion-release-mining-charter-15-jun-2017-0000)

South Africa. Marikana Commission of Inquiry. (2015). Retrieved from

<https://www.sahrc.org.za/home/21/files/marikana-report-1.pdf>

South African History. (2014). The Association of mineworkers and construction union.

Retrieved from <http://www.sahistory.org.za/article/association-mineworkers-and-construction-union-amcu>

Standard & Poor Global. (2017). *Standard & Poor's Global Ratings*. Retrieved from

<https://www.spglobal.com/what-we-do/our-capabilities/our-divisions/ratings>

Steyn, L. (2013, August 14). AMCU declared official majority union at Lonmin. *Mail &*

Guardian. Retrieved from <https://mg.co.za/article/2013-08-14-amcu-declared-official-majority-union-at-lonmin>

Terblanche, S. (2012, August 29). Marikana Conflict: The dangerous aftermath. *Leadership*

online. Retrieved from www.leadershiponline.co.za/articles/marikana-conflict-1659.html

The Skillsportal. (2013). The future of labour relations in SA. Retrieved from

<https://www.skillsportal.co.za/content/future-labour-relations-sa>

- Tshukudu, T. T. (2015). *Increasing public sector trade union power and its implication on labour and employee relations*. (Doctoral thesis). University of Botswana.
- Turton, A. (2014, January 9). The drivers of the South African mine conflict [Web log post]. Retrieved from <http://www.thebrokeronline.eu/Blogs/Power-dynamics-and-natural-resources/The-drivers-of-the-South-African-mine-conflict>
- Van Aswegen, S. (2015). *Introduction to Human Resource Management: Fresh perspectives*. South Africa, Cape Town: Pearson Education.
- Van Buuren, M. (2012, June 26). Employee relations as a strategic priority. *HR Pulse: The knowledge hub for HR professionals*. Retrieved from <http://www.hrpulse.co.za/employee-management/management/227665-employee-relations-as-a-strategic-priority>
- Van Eck, B. P. S. & Kreuser, M. A. (2012). *Kommentaar op die Marikana slagting en die rol van "Arbeidsreg"*. (Master's thesis). Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/2263/59337>
- Venter, R. & Levy, A. (2012). *Labour Relations in South Africa*. South Africa, Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Webb, M. (2007, August 8). SA miners mark two decades since crippling 1987 strike. *Mining Weekly*. Retrieved from <http://www.miningweekly.com/article/sa-miners-mark-two-decades-since-crippling-1987-strike-2007-08-08>
- Whittles, G. (2013, October 18). NUM chairperson killed in Marikana. *Eyewitness News*. Retrieved from <http://ewn.co.za/2013/10/18/NUM-Chairperson-killed-in-Marikana>
- Whittles, G (2015, August 5). SA's mining industry in serious trouble. *Eyewitness News*. Retrieved from ewn.co.za/2015/08/05/SAs-mining-industry-is-in-trouble
- Woods, A. (2013). *The ideas of Karl Marx*. In Defence of Marxism. Retrieved from <https://www.marxist.com/karl-marx-130-years.htm>
- Writer, S. (2017, February 21). Collective agreement validly extended to AMCU, Constitutional Court finds. *BusinessDay Live*. Retrieved from

<https://www.businesslive.co.za/bd/national/labour/2017-02-21-collective-agreement-validly-extended-to-amcu-constitutional-court-finds/>

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH ARTICLE 2

EXPLORING EMPLOYEES' PERSPECTIVES ON TRADE UNION POWER STRUGGLES AND THE INFLUENCE THEREOF ON THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP

ABSTRACT

Orientation: The effect that power struggles between trade unions has on the employment relationship should not be underestimated. It can have detrimental effects if trade unions continue to drive their own agendas. Management fears for what could happen if they don't give the trade union exactly what they want. Thus, looking at the causes and consequences we can determine a way forward.

Research purpose: The purpose of the study was to explore what effect power struggles between trade unions has on the employment relationship as perceived by employees. The study was conducted at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area.

Motivation for the study: To gain more knowledge and a better understanding of the experiences of employees about trade union power struggles. Employees' perspectives were sought to determine from their perspective what the impact of power struggles are on employees. The study was conducted to address a gap in literature around the influence of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship.

Research design, approach and method: A qualitative research design with both a descriptive and theoretical approach was used in this study. A phenomenological approach was used to obtain information based on the experiences employees have about power struggles between trade unions. According to Husserl (1970) as cited in Lester (1999), phenomenological research seeks to describe the situation rather than explain it (p.1). A voluntary sample of 12 ($N=12$) participants formed part of this study. The participants were employees of a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. The data was collected through semi-structured, one-on-one interviews. Data analysis was manually performed by means of the content analysis process. De Vos, Strydom, Fouché & Delport (2014), defines content analysis as "a procedure for the categorisation of verbal and behavioural data for classification, summarisation and tabulation of data." The aim was to make sense of the data that was collected and to highlight the important findings.

Main findings: The results of this study indicate that employees are aware of a power struggle that exists between two key trade unions at the specific mine. The results correlate with findings

of other studies done about the causes and consequences of trade union power struggles (Finlayson, 2016; Bhorat, 2014; McGuire, 2014). Overall employees perceive trade union power struggles as creating a hostile environment that leads to violence. The dominant theme from the findings were violence. The violence includes violent acts and attitudes towards non-unionised employees.

Practical/managerial implications: This study tried to provide information around the limitations and gaps that exist on current research about the effect of power struggles between trade unions on the employment relationship as perceived by employees.

Contribution/value-add: The results of this study add value to the research conducted on the Marikana incident of 2012. A lot of research has been done on the topic of Marikana, including what the implications were, but none of these studies looked at the event from the employees' perspective. This research article aims to explain what the employees' perceptions are about power struggles between trade unions and the influence thereof on the employment relationship.

Keywords: power struggles, trade unions, the employment relationship

Introduction

The purpose of this article is to explore how the employment relationship that exists in a trade union dominated environment is conceptualised in literature. Secondly, to explore what the perceptions of employees are about a power struggle between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. Thereafter, to explore what the causes and consequences are of a power struggle between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. After which, an investigation will be conducted to explore whether the power struggle between trade unions influences the employment relationship. Lastly, to provide recommendations for future research.

Employees can easily be exploited if proper measures in regulating the working conditions and the outputs of the employees are not applied consistently (Visser, 2012). Employees join trade unions because they feel the union can help them and assist them to gain more benefits from employment (Hammer & Avgar, 2005). According to Hammer & Avgar (2005: 1), “a pro-union vote towards trade unions is primarily determined by job satisfaction and a belief that the union will be able to improve the work life of employees by ensuring higher wages and benefits, job security, and protection against arbitrary and unjust treatment”. The neoclassical economic model of joining unions, illustrates that workers choose a union environment over non-union environments because the former will have higher effectiveness, which has been born out of wages, benefits, and pensions (Hirsch and Macpherson, 1998; Hirsch and Schumacher, 2000). Furthermore, this illustrates that “a union environment entails social benefits in the form of a system of due process and participation in decisions about employment and working conditions” (Hammer & Avgar, 2005). Trade unions fill the role of negotiating wages and terms and conditions of employment, they also regulate the relationship between the employer and employees, and lastly, they have the authority to take action and make collective decisions in order for better negotiation and collective bargaining processes to take place (Aspinwall & Greenwood, 2013).

Recognised trade unions can raise new demands when it is required and lodge grievances on behalf of the employee (Amexwrite, 2016). A recognised trade union is a trade union who is sufficiently represented amongst employees (Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995) and is an organisation who tries to settle conflict between the employer and employees (Amexwrite, 2016). Trade unions must seek to support and encourage management for the functions performed by employees and act as a contributor to the company (Fossum, 2014). Fossum (2014) also states that this can be achieved by motivating and encouraging the employees to perform better.

On 16 August 2012, thirty-four striking mineworkers were killed outside of a mine in the Rustenburg area and this event today is well known as the Marikana Massacre (Alexander, Lekgowa, Mmope, Sinwell & Xezwi, 2012). This event has been described by Alexander et al., (2012: 1) and other sources as “a watershed moment” (Bizos as cited in Tolsi, 2012); “a turning point” (Pityana, 2012); “a tipping point” (Gumede, 2012); and as Alexander et al., (2012) puts it “a seismic event”. Events like the Marikana Massacre, causes turning points in history (Alexander et al., 2012). It can also be viewed as transformation in a sense that nothing will be the same after such an event (Sewell, 2005: 5). Sewell (2005: 218) explains that “to understand and explain an event, the structural change it brings needs to be determined together with how the structural change was caused”. Sewell sees structures as being national, ethnical or even local (2005). Thus, the scale of the event can be measured on the impact the event has. The questions that should be asked are: How many people were affected and to what degree they were affected (Sewell, 2005). Although these events are tragic, they open new opportunities and lessons can be learned from these events (Alexander et al., 2012). Kahn (2013) states that if there is non-delivery on socio-economic issues, they can manifest themselves as labour disputes. Kahn (2013) continues and makes a powerful statement by saying that the Labour Law was not designed to deal with such tragic events. In chapter 2 of this study, it was noted that the Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995, needs to be amended because it did not cater for issues highlighted

by the Marikana incident of 2012, such as collective bargaining. It was also noted that the Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995 and the Basic Condition of Employment Act No. 75 of 1997 will be amended in May 2018 to include national minimum wages and amend the laws around picketing. The following factors were evident from what happened at Marikana: unions were in disarray, unions were divided, the unions were seen as weak, there was poor management on the part of union leadership and employer leadership, adversarial collective bargaining, and there were two sides to collective bargaining, namely majoritarianism and sufficiently representative unions (Thompson, 2013). Conflict is an inherent part of human interaction. In order to constructively solve conflict, it needs to be analysed from different angles (Thompson, 2013). Some of the conflict aggravators of Marikana were: unresolved conflict, mistrust, poor communication, perceptions and misrepresented facts, politics and political opportunists, and poor policing (Thompson, 2013).

In this study, there will be a focus on the effect of trade union power struggles and its influence on the employment relationship as perceived by employees. The research was prompted by the Marikana incident of 2012. The two key unions were the National Union of Mineworkers, herein after referred to as NUM, and the Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union, herein after referred to as AMCU. During the 2012 strike, employees complained about NUM, and accused the trade union as being corrupt and operating too close to management (Alexander et al., 2012). The mine and mine management attempted to free themselves from responsibility for the violence and blamed it on clashes between NUM and AMCU, and they claimed the cause was the competition between these two unions (Alexander et al., 2012).

Literature review

Kester (2007) published the results of a longitudinal research project on the role of trade unions in the democratisation of workplace labour relations in Africa. The assumption of the

research was that democracy can only survive if it is participatory. Secondly, Kester found that participatory democracy is a necessary condition for sustainable development and that trade unions are ideally placed to contribute to the democratisation of the economy (Kester, 2007).

The main goal of trade unions is to defend and improve the living standards of their members and give their members more control over their working lives and conditions (Fiorito, 2016). In order to measure union effectiveness, you need to look at their outcomes, resources and processes by which they achieve outcomes. The resources include members' activism, staff employed and financial resources, as well as their members' collective power inside and outside the organisation (Fiorito, 2016). Additional resources can be provided through alliances with other unions, the community, and religious and other groups (Fiorito, 2016). Some trade unions are affiliated to political organisations and this also makes them stronger. The processes include collective bargaining and political action (Fiorito, 2016). When looking at it this way, power is a means to an end, and according to Fiorito (2016: 3), power itself does not specify the chosen outcomes nor does it guarantee effectiveness in gaining the desired outcomes. Fiorito (2016: 3) believes that this is because the application and exercise of power must be specific to the situation as well as the circumstance of the goal being sought and its temporal and spatial context. Lévesque and Murray (2013: 779) point out that "the important rider to this logic is that acquisition and generation of power is often an implicit goal for unions given that it is the critical *modus operandi*". When a union attains its goals, it is an indicator of their effectiveness and the effectiveness can only be achieved through a power play (Rheeder, 2014).

Fiorito (2016: 3) points out that a union without power is an ineffective union because the application and exercise of power is a critical variable in explaining whether union effectiveness is attained. Levers of power are important to the context or situation it is exercised in order to attain certain goals. For example, if it is economic goals which you are trying to achieve, you should use economic levers such as industrial action or strikes. The same goes for politics. If you have certain political goals, you should use political levers, such as political affiliation. The

National Union of Mineworkers is part of the tripartite relationship between the African National Congress (ANC), the South African Communist Party (SACP) and the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). An example of this is Gwede Mantashe. He was the General Secretary of NUM before becoming the Minister of Mineral Resources in February 2018.

Sturmthal (as cited in Fiorito, 2016) noted that “unions may resort to political means for economic ends when the state or the economic situation blocks union exercise of economic leverage. Unions reflect the power imbalance between capital and labour. The power imbalance is best understood in terms of what flows from capital owning and controlling the means of production, distribution and exchange (Fiorito, 2016). Unions aim to rectify this imbalance.

Alexander et al. (2012: 3), in their study on the Marikana Massacre, argued that rivalry between the two unions did not cause the employees to strike. Seoka (2012) argued that the events of 16 August 2012 could have been avoided if Lonmin’s management listened to the workers’ concerns. As noted in chapter 2, the 2012 wildcat strikes spread beyond the mining industry (Alexander et al., 2012). There were unprotected stoppages in the car industry and the farming industry, all demanding higher wages (Alexander et al., 2012). The wildcat strikes experienced in 2012, and which was also referred to in chapter 2 of this research study, indicated these strikes were violent, bloody and deadly in the mining, transport and agricultural industries (Department of Labour, 2012). As referred to in chapter 1, in order to bring stability to the mining industry, a framework policy was signed in 2013 by all role players in the mining sector (Du Plessis, 2017).

1.1.15 The type of employment relationship that exists in a trade union-dominated environment

Throughout history, the drive for obtaining status and power has been thought of as a fundamental motivator for human behaviour (Keller, 2009). Industrial relations are used to define the employment relationships. It came into existence through the industrial revolution as

an important tool to understand the complex relations between employers and employees (Nikoloski, Dimitrova, Koleva & Kacarski, 2014). Employees associate industrial relations with better wages, safety at the workplace, job security, and training in the workplace (Nikoloski et al., 2014). On the other hand, employers associate industrial relations with productivity, conflict resolution and employment laws (Nikoloski et al., 2014). The term “employee relations” is now used instead of industrial relations and refers to the relationships that exist in both unionised and non-unionised workplaces (Nikoloski et al., 2014). The concept “employee relations” is a study of relations between employees as well as between employer and employees in such a way as to try and resolve conflicts and to help improve the productivity of the company by increasing the motivation and morale of the employees. Sisson (2008: 4) argues that the fall in union membership around the world made people realise that the relationship between employers and employees are more important than focusing on industrial relations. Employees are the fundamental part of the organisation in all operations, thus making the study of relationships between employers and employees more important than the laws and institutions that govern relations in the workplace (Sisson, 2008).

It is important to get the buy in from employees regarding company goals and making sure that the employees have full comprehension of the aims and policies, management put in place (Nikoloski et al., 2014). The employment relationship is the relationship between employees and their employer, thus it also includes those employees not affiliated to any union. According to Leat (2011), industrial and employment relations cover:

- tripartite social dialogue;
- negotiation, consultation and exchange of information between the different role players;
- collective bargaining;
- dispute prevention and resolution; and
- other instruments of social dialogue, including corporate social responsibility and

international framework agreements.

Industrial relations have been dominating the workplace because of the need to resolve conflicts, mainly between employees and management, whereas employment relations are dealing with developing a working environment where conflict is dealt with in an effective manner and in short period of time (Gennard & Graham, 2010).

The major differences between industrial relations and employment relations are as follows: Firstly, industrial relations has a focus on employees as part of a collective body, while employment relations puts a strong emphasis on employees regarded as individual (Anderson, 2014). Secondly, employment relations are based on cooperation between management and employees, both motivated to add value to the organisation (Anderson, 2014).

Nikoloski et al., (2014: 3) sets the following preconditions for sound industrial and employment relations:

- Strong, independent workers' and employers' organisations with the technical capacity and access to relevant information to participate in social dialogue.
- Political will and commitment to engage in social dialogue on the part of all the parties.
- Respect for the fundamental rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining.
- An enabling legal and institutional framework.

It is important for Human Resource Managers to understand industrial labour relations and industrial relations challenges in order for them to follow a strategic managerial approach that is integrated with management's vision (Casale, 2011).

Most studies agree in linking partnership with organisational change initiatives (Oxenbridge & Brown, 2002). Partnership arrangements between management and trade unions are necessary to facilitate the employment relationship. For example, if change needs to be implemented in the organisation, unions can facilitate this process (Oxenbridge & Brown, 2002). Studies have showed that a partnership does not necessarily lead to increased union membership or enhanced union influence, or better wages or conditions of employment (Oxenbridge &

Brown, 2002). Publications produced by the Trade Union Congress (TUC) and Involvement and Participation Association (IPA) highlight some of the benefits. These benefits include increased production levels and profitability, lower turnover and absenteeism, and more secure and fulfilling jobs (Oxenbridge & Brown, 2002).

In conclusion, the employment relationship has many dimensions. There is an economic exchange between buyers and sellers of labour, thus employers and employees (Casale, 2011). The employment relationship is a legal relationship because the parties enter into the relationship with a contract of employment (Casale, 2011). There is a power and authority relationship with the employee agreeing to an element of subordination to the authority of the employer, with the employer having the power (Casale, 2011). The relationship between the employer and the employee is dominated by inherent conflict because of mutual interests. The role of trade unions in this relationship is to resolve the conflict and bring the demands of the employees to the employer's attention.

Research Design

1.1.16 Research Purpose and Objectives

The general objective of the research study was to determine what the primary factors within the mining industry are that lead to power struggles between trade unions as well as what the impact thereof is on the employment relationship. The objectives of this study were:

- To conceptualise in literature the type of employment relationship that exists in a trade union dominated environment.
- To investigate the perceptions of employees about a power struggle between trade unions.
- To determine the causes and consequences of a power struggle between trade unions.
- To investigate if the power struggle between trade unions influences the employment relationship.
- To provide recommendations for future research.

1.1.17 Research approach

A qualitative research design was used with an exploratory approach to explore the impact of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship. Denzin and Lincoln (2003), states that researchers use qualitative research to observe and describe events as they occur within a specific research setting. The main purpose of this type of research is to capture the participant's experiences of events (Denzin & Lincoln, 2003).

The study used a qualitative research design with a social constructivism approach. Hay (2016: 520) defines social constructivism as “a profound normative mode of political inquiry which seeks to discern, interrogate and elucidate the contingency of social, political and economic change”. With this approach, the aim was to study what effect a power struggle between trade unions has on the employment relationship. The causes and consequences of a power struggle between trade unions were investigated, as well as the perceived effect thereof on the employment relationship. According to Creswell (2009), individuals develop subjective meanings of their experiences and apply these meanings to situations that occur in their environment. Constructivist researchers address the process of interaction among individuals, and thus this forms the basis of the research study. The thoughts and experiences of the participants were explored to understand the power struggle between trade unions better from the perspective of employees facing the dynamics thereof on a daily basis.

In this study, a qualitative research design was used with semi-structured, one-on-one interviews with participants. Strauss and Corbin (as cited in Golafshani, 2003: 600) define qualitative research as any kind of research that produces findings that is not derived from statistical procedures or other measures.

1.1.18 Research strategy

The qualitative approach is an explorative approach. Patton (as cited in Golafshani, 2003: 600), states that “qualitative research uses a naturalistic approach that seeks to understand

phenomena in context-specific settings, such as real world settings where the researcher does not attempt to manipulate the phenomena of interest”. The research was focused on employees of Lonmin’s Marikana mine where the mass wildcat strikes in 2012 occurred. The study also focused on relevant literature that exists on the topic of the Marikana incident of 2012 to give background to the participant’s experiences and perspectives. Thus, the explorative approach is the best strategy to follow in order to study the phenomena of the effects of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship in South Africa’s mining industry.

1.1.19 Participants

The population of this study comprises 12 participants from the Lonmin Mine in Marikana. Both purposive and theoretical sampling was used in this study. Purposive sampling was used to select the participants because they are characterised by a specific feature necessary for the study. This sampling approach was used as a deliberate choice of participants because of the qualities they present. Thereafter a theoretical sampling method was used to select the 12 participants who formed part of this study. It is a non-random technique because there is no need for underlying theories nor a fixed number of participants (Dolores & Tongo, 2007).

The sample consisted of 12 employees ($N=12$) from Lonmin’s Mine in Marikana.

Table 1: Characteristics of participants (N=12)

Item	Category	Frequency	Percentage
Gender	Male	9	75
	Female	3	25
Race	African	7	58
	White	5	42
Home language	Afrikaans	5	42
	English	0	0
	Tswana	4	33
	Xhosa	3	25
	Other	0	0

Province originated	North West	7	58
	Eastern Cape	3	25
	Other	2	17

Table 1 shows that the majority of the participants (75%) were male and the other participants (25%) were female. In this group, 58% were black and 42% were white interviewees. Most of the participants were from the North-West Province (58%), others were from the Eastern Cape (25%), and 17% were from other provinces. English is the second language of all the participants with 42% of the participants Afrikaans-speaking, 33% Tswana-speaking and 25% Xhosa-speaking. All employees were comfortable with the interviews being conducted in English as it is their second language and it is a prerequisite to their employment at the mine.

Research Method

The research method consisted of both a literature study and an empirical study.

1.1.20 Research setting

The interviews were conducted at Lonmin's Marikana mine in the offices of the different employees that volunteered to participate in the study. It was more convenient for the participants because it meant little to none interruptions in their daily tasks and responsibilities. The participants were forthcoming after the objectives of the study were explained and their rights stated. They also signed an anonymity document stating that their names would not be mentioned in the study. A copy of the document was given to each participant.

1.1.21 Entrée and research role

Access to the participants were gained through the Human Resources Department of the Lonmin Mine. An email was sent to a few employees explaining the objectives of this study. The criteria for selection was that the participants needed to be an employee of the mine. They could

respond to the email by stating that they are willing to participate in the study. From there the researcher went to the Lonmin Mine to conduct the interviews over a two-day period.

According to Walliman (2006: 148), “researchers are ethically obliged to ensure that they are competent, honest and adequately skilled to undertake the investigation”. Thus, it is important for the researcher to have emotional intelligence when conducting the interview with the participant (Walliman, 2006). The latter assists the researcher to determine when a participant is feeling uncomfortable with a question asked or whether the participant does not understand the question, which the researcher can then rephrase (Walliman, 2006). During the interviews, the researcher did not allow her own opinions and beliefs to influence the answers of the participants. Fair and transparent answers were encouraged from each participant.

1.1.22 Sampling

Purposive sampling was used in this study, thereafter theoretical sampling was used. This allowed for the richest data to be collected and it also pointed out the criteria that were used to select the sample. Coyne and Strauss (as cited in Robinson, 2014: 9) defines theoretical sampling as “sampling that differs from purposive sampling strategies, as it takes place during data collection and analysis, following provisional sampling and analysis of some data”.

The researcher could then define categories, identify the context to which they are relevant, specify the conditions and discover the consequences on the employment relationship.

1.1.23 Data-collection method

Semi-structured one-to-one interviews were conducted and were digitally recorded. This aided in gaining more detailed information about the participant’s beliefs and perceptions about the power struggle between trade unions and the influence thereof on the employment relationship. The researcher had the opportunity to ask questions for clarity as well as probe the participant to provide follow-up answers to questions that were raised by the researcher during the interview (De Vos, Strydom, Fouché & Delport, 2014). The interviews were conducted in an

informal manner to put the participant at ease. The interview was guided by predetermined questions with the possibility to ask follow-up questions.

1.1.24 Recording of data

The interview was recorded with a digital voice recorder. The participants provided written consent for the interview to be recorded after the reasons for recording the interview were explained to each participant before the interview commenced. The document that was signed by the researcher and the participant, explained all the details of the study as well as that the anonymity of the participant would be protected. It was also made clear by the researcher that the participant could withdraw at any time during the study without any repercussions to the participant.

The interviews were coded with the names “Interview 001” to “Interview 012”. Part of the role of the researcher was to ensure that the recorder was functioning optimally, thus the researcher made sure that there were extra batteries and the recorder was tested before each interview to ensure it works properly.

The researcher promised confidentiality to all the participants, thus extra care and measures were taken to protect the identities of the participants. All data collected and transcribed were securely stored. Back-up files were stored on an external hard drive which was stored in a safe place which only the researcher could access and electronic copies were kept on a Google drive.

1.1.25 Data analysis

The data that was collected during the semi-structured one-on-one interviews were transcribed. A thematic analysis was used to identify the themes and sub-themes of the study. Analysing the data involved collecting the raw information, sifting through the information, identifying significant patterns and constructing a framework for communicating the information

that the data revealed (Creswell, 2009). Creswell (2009) identified six steps to be used during the data analysis process. These six steps include:

Step 1: Organise and prepare the data for analysis. This involves transcribing the interviews, optically scanning material, typing of field notes or sorting and organising the data into different themes (Creswell, 2009).

Step 2: Read through the data. This is done to obtain a sense of the information collected and to reflect on the meaning of the data (Creswell, 2009).

Step 3: Start with the coding process. This is a process of organising the material into segments of text before bringing meaning to information. This involves dividing the data into categories and labelling them with a term that gives meaning to the data (Creswell, 2009).

Step 4: Use the coding process to generate a description of the setting or people as categories or themes for analysis (Creswell, 2009).

Step 5: Decide how the description and themes will be presented in the qualitative narrative. This allows for the flow of information and to deliver the findings (Creswell, 2009).

Step 6: Interpret that data and make sense of it. This is the final step in the analysis process. (Creswell, 2009).

1.1.26 Discussion of findings

As part of the discussion of the impact of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship, this article focuses on the causes and consequences of trade union power struggles and the influence thereof on the employment relationship as perceived by the employees.

Findings

The findings of this article are catalogued into various categories, themes and sub-themes, along with the responses of the participants to support the findings. Each of the themes and sub-themes will be explained in the different tables.

The findings clearly indicated four categories of themes, namely:

1. Employees' perceptions about trade unions power struggles.
2. Causes of trade unions power struggles.
3. Consequences of trade union power struggles.
4. The influence of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship.

The findings of the study were organised into themes and sub-themes. These themes and sub-themes are provided in various tables below.

Table 2: Employees' perceptions about trade union power struggles

Theme	Sub-Theme	Response
Intimidation from unionised employees towards non-unionised employees	Aggressive attitudes towards non-unionised employees	<i>“Obvious and aggressive intimidation of employees who are not associated to specific trade unions... and in many instances, this leads to violence inside and outside the workplace.”</i>
	Violent acts and attitudes	<i>“Management took AMCU as this violent and rough union that can't, negotiate, they always revolt into strikes or violence.”</i>
Power struggles lead to strikes	Financial implications on both the employer and the employee	<i>“The power struggle leads to financial implications for both employers and employees, lengthy strikes and a poor financial position for the employer and for us as employees.”</i>

The findings reflected in Table 2 were obtained by posing the question “What are your perceptions about trade union power struggles?” The participants' responses indicated that power struggles exist between trade unions. This was a blatant broad question to get a broad answer.

The themes that emerged from this question were intimidation of non-unionised workers and violent and destructive strikes.

Theme 1: Intimidation from unionised employees towards non-unionised employees

Participants have a clear experience of intimidation, threatening or attacking employers or employees, lack of safety and some experienced a change in the employment relationship.

Greater elaboration on this variance of intimidation can be found below.

Sub-Theme: Aggressive attitudes towards non-unionised employees

Some of the participants experienced harm, vandalism and intimidation during which they were physically hurt and personal belongings were damaged. Most of the participants experienced violence, intimidation, loss in trust towards the union, threats, abuse and effects on family and friends. One of the participants responded that “obvious and aggressive intimidation of employees who are not associated to specific trade unions... and in many instances, this leads to violence inside and outside the workplace.” Participants mentioned that the power struggle went beyond the workplace and spilled over to the community.

Sub-Theme: Violent acts and attitudes

The participants confirmed that power struggles cause violence and intimidation towards employees not belonging to the majority union. Majority unions have power over smaller unions. People are scared to make their membership status public because they fear for their lives. Another aspect is strikes. They also mentioned that their biggest form of power is to threaten to withhold their labour. “Yeah. I think the relationship was obviously affected. Even after AMCU took over, it was recognised and everything the relationship still was in a bad state whereby management took AMCU as this violent and rough union that can’t negotiate, they always revolt into strikes or, or violence and all that.”

Theme 2: Power struggles lead to strikes

Unions express their power through industrial action, the means to withhold labour to get the employer to give in to their demands. Unfortunately, industrial action has negative implications, thus the sub-theme of financial implication was identified.

Sub-Theme: Financial implications on both the employer and employees

Participants also mentioned financial loss. The financial loss can be on the part of both the employer and the employee. "... employees also feel the financial burden of strikes because of the 'no work, no pay' principle.". Many participants mentioned the financial burdens and implications that strikes bring, while others answered that "in order to get your demands, you have to strike.". Furthermore, participants stated that they have a lot of debt that needs to be repaid. Another participant said that "in the bigger world the power struggle leads to financial implications for employers, strikes that lasts for months at a time wiped out all of Lonmin's reserves and left the company in a bad financial position".

Table 3: Causes of trade union power struggles

Theme	Sub-Theme	Response
Power of a majority trade union	The majority union has control	<i>"...it's power, as in people are quite hungry for power and they want to control..."</i>
		<i>"Without power behind you as labour, you may not be able to pursue the company or management and achieve nothing."</i>
Power means more money for the majority trade union	Membership levies from employees belonging to trade unions	<i>"... unions are being paid by their members in order to gain membership, so more members, more money in the pocket."</i>

	Agency fees that must be paid by non-unionised employees	<i>"... they want the volume, they want the people, they want the income."</i>
Migrant labour from other provinces	Cultural differences between groups at the specific mine in the Rustenburg area	<i>"In the mining industry you are dealing with different tribes, which will have an influence on the union."</i>
	People from different backgrounds has different skills	<i>"... most of the RDO's are from the Eastern Cape ... they have a certain skill,..."</i>

Table 3 describes the answer to the question "What do you think are the causes of the power struggle between trade unions?" The participants answered that power and money are the major causes of trade union power struggles. Some of them also said that migrant labour could also be a cause for the power struggle. Inter-union rivalry, especially in the mining industry between NUM and AMCU, has been increasing as both unions are fighting to become the dominant union in the mining industry (Jones, 2013).

Theme 3: Power of a majority trade union

Trade unions have collective power in organisations if they are the majority union in the workplace. The participants mentioned that power is the main cause of inter-union rivalry because everyone wants to lead and be in control of the industry. The sub-theme identified was control.

Sub-Theme: The majority union has control

The participants were clear that power equals control. Trade unions want to be in control of industries and they will do anything to remain on top. The participants answered: "It's power as in people are quite hungry for power and they want to control so the more they empower they feel like they, they will control everything and they just want to be on top." Another participant mentioned that "trade union officials use their position in the trade union to promote their political aspirations and the trade union's power helps with support for this aspirations" and "trade unions with power will be taken seriously by management and the media". Without power, unions cannot

have control and the participants were aware of this. Majority unions are the ones with power and the ones who can control the industry. They also mentioned that money is a major cause of trade union power struggles.

Theme 4: Power means more money for the majority trade union

Throughout the interviews, the participants mentioned that without money, the trade union does not have power. Money is one of the main reasons why trade union power struggles exist. Financial prosperity equals the amount of power trade unions have. The more members a union has, the bigger its income is. The sub-theme identified was membership levies and agency fees.

Sub-Theme: Membership levies from employees belonging to trade unions

Participants mentioned that money is important for power. “Trade unions with power experience financial prosperity, a lot of extra benefits for their members and public and media coverage”. When the question “What are the causes of trade union power struggles?” were asked, the majority of the participants said that it is money. Trade unions’ biggest form of income is membership levies. The more members the union has, the higher their income is.

Sub-Theme: Agency fees that must be paid by non-unionised employees

Participants mentioned that money is one of the major causes of trade union power struggles. Majority unions within the mining industry can set agency fees for non-union members to get “free-riders” to pay for the services trade unions offer to their members. Some employees do not want to be associated to any trade union, thus the levy gets deducted from their salaries. This also leads to employees paying for the services of two trade unions because a lot of them do not want to make their membership status public and they have debit orders with other trade unions like Solidarity or UASA.

Theme 5: Migrant labour from other provinces

Rustenburg is a Tswana-dominated environment. The Rock Drill Operators (RDOs) are mostly from the Eastern Cape which are Xhosa-speaking people. The cultural differences and skills were identified as sub-themes.

Sub-Theme: Cultural differences between groups at the specific mine in the Rustenburg area

The participants mentioned that a lot of fighting that occurs between the unions can be ascribed to cultural differences. “NUM is a Xhosa-dominated union which most of them were from the Eastern Cape. And within NUM you had tribal issues where you get internal conflicts...” and “... AMCU was formed and there is a group of Xhosa-speaking people who are dominating in AMCU...”. Another participant stated “... Rustenburg is Tswana-dominated and NUM is dominated by Xhosa-speaking people and the mining was in the area of the Tswana-speaking people.” Cultural conflicts can also be the reason of in-fighting within unions.

Sub-Theme: People from different backgrounds has different skills

The RDOs poses a specific skill. Originally, they were from the Eastern Cape and are very good at their job, but they are migrant labour. The conflict can escalate, according to one of the participants: “If a Chief of Babong decides that the children of Rustenburg must be considered for employment, they will limit the number of people taken from the Eastern Cape. Then you lose that skill.”. They do not have the same skills as the RDOs from the Eastern Cape, and the mine management is more focused on productivity. The time invested in training the Rustenburg people will take longer, thus they will hire RDOs from the Eastern Cape.

Participants also noted that many of the mineworkers are not literate. Their educational levels are very low, which brings forth the “herd mentality”: “Many mineworkers will follow the herd although they do not know where they are going.”.

Table 4: Consequences of trade union power struggles

Theme	Sub-Theme	Response
-------	-----------	----------

There is a break in communication between the employer and employees	Communication hurdles occur	<i>“It makes it extremely difficult to speak and engage with employees because you’ve got different unions working against each other.”</i>
Employees act violently towards the employer	Fatalities because of intervention from external forces	<i>“...people were killed because of the fight between the trade unions. So that’s where it is going to end up, murder.”</i>

Table 4 reflects the answers to the question: “What are the consequences of the power struggle between trade unions?” The participants answered that power struggles between trade unions can lead to fatalities and referred to the Marikana incident. Power struggles also cause a break in communication from management to employees. They explained that the trust relationship between management and employees is broken down and needs to be fixed because it leads to a hostile work environment. Over the past five years, there has been an increase in the length of strikes and violence associated with industrial action (Jones, 2013).

Theme 6: There is a break in communication between the employer and employees

In any relationship, the most important tool is to be able to communicate effectively. If there is not effective communication, a lot of problems will occur. The sub-theme identified is communication hurdles and will be discussed below.

Sub-Theme: Communication hurdles occur

Participants experienced that after a big event like Marikana, communication hurdles were created: “The open policy I remember last time I mentioned people can call you anytime that they want but the open communication between management and the employees is one of the things that can prevent something similar to what happened in previous years, because we didn’t, people didn’t have any liberty to talking to managers so communication is quite key to the foundation of everything to say if I’m not happy about this I’m gonna tell you I’m not happy

about this, ...”. They also felt that management communicates less with them during situations where unions are fighting.

Theme 7: Employees act violently towards the employer

Throughout the interviews with the participants, violence seemed to be a prominent factor in trade union power struggles. No matter which way one looks at it, there will always be violence when it comes to union rivalry. The saying, “survival of the fittest” plays a big role in power struggles, as the most dominant role player will win in the end. The sub-theme, derived from the violence, when looking at the case study of Marikana, could be identified as fatalities.

Sub-Theme: Fatalities because of intervention from external forces

In most cases, major strike action turns ugly with a lot of people dying and some being injured, owing to violence during strikes: “They kill each other, it causes disruption in the workplace.” All the participants referred to the Marikana incident of 2012, where the police killed 34 striking mine workers. As was mentioned in chapter 2 of this study, 46 people were killed at the Lonmin Mine in Marikana during industrial action. Participants also answered where the conflict will end up: “It’s like what happened in Marikana. That’s the main thing, that’s where it ends up. Because there is fighting, an internal fighting between them and they keep hurting each other and then it goes all wider like the Marikana, before Marikana even happened there was security guys, police guys that were killed because of the fight between the trade unions. So that’s where it is going to end, it’s going to end on murder.”

Table 5: The influence of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship”

Theme	Sub-Theme	Response
The work environment becomes less favourable	A hostile work environment	<i>“... where there was previously a relationship, now there is nothing...everyone works against each other.”</i>

	The trust relationship is broken down	<i>“Unions need to bring their member’s voice to management, if there is no trust, how will they be able to do that?”</i>
The Labour Relations Act and trade unionism	Section 4 of the Labour Relations Act - Freedom of association	<i>“Employers are forced by legislation to give advantage to majority unions which gives the perception to employees belonging to minority unions that the employer thinks their demands and needs are less important.”</i>
	The Majoritarianism approach to trade unionism	<i>“Employees resent employers for not offering them as part of a minority, more protection and stand up for what is right”</i>

Table 5 explains the influence of trade union power struggles on the employment relationship. The hostile environment was mentioned in the previous table, but more employees answered that when there is no relationship between the employer and the trade union, the employees experience the work environment as hostile. Employees do not want to be affiliated to any union. This directly impacts their right to freedom of association as this right is regarded as to belong to a trade union. Secondly, the employees feel that the employer only wants one union in the workplace and that labour law protects the employer in this regard. The employer only has to grant recognition to a majority union: “I think the relationship was obviously affected.” One of the participants mentioned that: “Even after AMCU took over, it was recognised and everything the relationship still was in a bad state.”

Theme 8: The work environment becomes less favourable

The participants indicated that trade union power struggles have an influence on their work environment. The work environment also includes the relationship between the employee

and employer in a trade union-dominated environment. The sub-themes extracted from work environment included hostility and trust.

Sub-Theme: A hostile work environment

Participants said that the relationship with their employer suffers "... where there was previously a relationship, now there is nothing...everyone works against each other." They said that there is no trust between the parties and this creates a hostile work environment. The participants noted that big events like the Marikana incident had an influence on their employment relationship; there is no trust between employees and management. Everyone is waiting for a situation to become so hostile that it ends up in another Marikana incident.

Sub-Theme: The trust relationship is broken down

Participants mentioned that trust and communication are interlinked: "Unions need to bring their member's voice to management, if there is no trust, how will they be able to do that?" Some of the participants' answers included: "Power struggles between trade unions puts strain on trade unions loyalty."; "I think the conflict it was the members. The members were not happy with the services that NUM was giving them. So it's whereby they striked, they went to strike at the Koppie then after it is whereby AMCU step in and we saw that AMCU they will be in this company and they will help us." The participants also argued that NUM lost their members' trust and this was also a contributing factor to the Marikana incident of 2012.

Theme 9: The Labour Relations Act 66 of 1995 and trade unionism

During the interviews, the theme of the Labour Relations Act was identified and furthermore the sub-themes of freedom of association and the majoritarianism approach was identified. Each sub-theme will be discussed below.

Sub-Theme: Section 4 of the Labour Relations Act - Freedom of association

Participants seemed to be aggrieved by the fact that management makes it clear that they only want one union with which they can negotiate: "The causes of power struggles between trade unions can be encouraged by labour legislation as it promotes the majority approach to

trade unionism.” Employees belonging to minority unions, like Solidarity and UASA, feel that their right to freedom of association was infringed. They cannot belong to their trade union of choice because the employer only recognises the majority union. These minority unions receive notice in terms of their collective agreements being suspended if they drop below a certain percentage. This results in minority unions losing their limited rights.

Sub-Theme: The majoritarianism approach

The participants felt that the employer only wants one union with which it can negotiate and engage with. The responses were: “The LRA shoots you in the foot at the end of the day in the sense that, once one of the unions reached majority status (50% +1), it takes certain rights from the smaller unions. The smaller unions will not survive this.” They feel that this has a direct influence on the employment relationship, because all the power lies with the majority union and management will do anything to keep them happy - “management will do anything just to keep the majority union happy”. Other participants answered that “employers are forced through legislation to give preference to majority unions”. The more members a union has, the more power lies with that union: “It’s membership. If you have membership, you have that power to negotiate, you have that power of representing and to grow as a union. So, membership is key”. Participants stated that power is the cause of the conflict between trade unions: “Power is everything in trade unionism, power is linked to majority status of one trade union, or two or more trade unions acting jointly.”

Discussion

The general objective of this study was to explore the perceptions employees have about power struggles that exist between trade unions, and to also explore from their perspective whether it has an influence on the employment relationship. From the research done and the data gathered, the most prominent theme which stood out was violence. Trade unions use violence to control the employer and thus increase their power. The latter is discussed in greater detail later

on. Another important factor that stood out from the research was the majority approach to trade unionism. The employees experience that the employer seeks to deal with only one union in an industry. The Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995 supports employers' right to recognise a majority union in an industry. Unfortunately, this is not realistic as there are a few smaller unions also representing the interests of their members. Employees choose a certain trade union because they associate with that specific union; they believe in the cause and they support the union's ideology.

The first specific objective of this study was to conceptualise through literature, the type of employment relationship that exists in a trade union-dominated environment. Literature suggests that this can either have positive or negative implications. The positives include that if there is greater cooperation between management and trade unions, employees' productivity and morale increase, which will benefit both the organisation and the employees. On the negative side, if there is a militant and hostile trade union in a specific workplace, there will be less cooperation between management and that trade union. Masiloane (2010: 31) explains that "violence and intimidation of non-striking employees are a prominent feature of any strike action in South Africa". This erodes the employee's freedom to choose whether or not to strike and it also effects the safety and security of the employee not participating in the strike (Masiloane, 2010). Murwirapachena and Sibanda (2014: 554) state that "strikes have been common in all sectors, leaving some economic commentators calling South Africa a striking nation. They have become a blunt weapon frequently wielded in an atmosphere of hostility and intimidation with negative socio-economic consequences". The causes of strikes are multifaceted, and the effects are detrimentally catastrophic. Strikes are a threat to peace in the workplace. Murwirapachena and Sibanda (2014: 556) explain one of the effects of strike action as:

"loss in production, strike action causes a decline in production levels because for strikes to be successful there needs to be a slowdown or shut-down in production. The employees who are willing to work are always under threat from the striking workers as

they are accused of undermining the unity and weakening the cause of the striking workers. Management and employee representatives waste a lot of time in long and strenuous negotiations”.

On the employer’s side:

“lost contracts, because of prolonged strikes result in firms losing business contracts. Losing suppliers and customers is associated with losing trust and once it is lost, it is very difficult to regain the trust. Because of the loss in production and lost contracts, most firms struggle to recover financially, and they are forced to shut down operations” (Murwirapachena & Sibanda, 2014: 557).

Jordaan (2016) states that:

“apart from the direct losses in terms of production, lower dividends for shareholders, and less income for employees, the economy is also negatively impacted. Other direct impacts include higher debts of employees, as they cannot repay their debt if they do not earn an income. Employees could also be blacklisted as a result of them not being able to service their commitments, and a lower standard of living” (Jordaan, 2016).

Participants experienced a financial set-back during the 2014 strike that lasted five months (Bohlmann, Dixon, Rimmer & Van Heerden, 2015).

The second specific objective of this study, investigating the perceptions of employees about a power struggle between trade unions, it could be established that employees are aware of a power struggle occurring in their work environment. The participants explained situations like intimidation and strikes. Over the past few years there has been many violent and unprotected strike actions that occurred in the mining industry (Cavvadas, 2012). The blame can be put on employers for making the problem worse when they give in to employees’ demands after industrial action becomes violent (Jones, 2013).

The third specific objective, determining the causes and consequences of a power struggle between trade unions, the findings revealed that the major causes of power struggles are

money and power. To have power, is to have control over resources, and to have the ability to influence others' behaviour (Keller, 2009). It was interesting that another cause the participants described was migrant labour and housing. Research about the Marikana topic highlighted that labour recruitment and housing need to be changed (Alexander et al., 2012). In 2010, only 18% of Lonmin's workforce were employed from local communities, 83% were immigrants, mostly from within South Africa (Chinguno, 2013). It was mentioned in chapter 2 of this study that the Marikana incident of 2012 established the winner-takes-all approach relating to trade union recognition because of power and financial resources (Du Plessis, 2017).

In the early 1990s, the companies and NUM negotiated a living-out allowance, reducing dependence on hostel accommodation and increasing the number of workers residing in informal settlements (Alexander et al., 2012). During the 2012 strike, the allowance paid by Lonmin for housing was R1 830 per month (Alexander et al., 2012). This is a substantial contribution to workers' income, but only 10% of employees lived in accommodation provided by the company (Chinguno, 2013). This new arrangement meant more freedom for employees, some of them started having second families (Chinguno, 2013). The negative side to this is that miners now live with poor service delivery and in low quality accommodation (Chinguno, 2013).

The consequences of power struggles include violence that escalates into fatalities, and a break-down in communication. Almost all the participants mentioned during the interview that power struggles will lead to events like the Marikana Massacre. The Marikana incident has been linked to historical events like the massacres at Sharpeville (1960) and Soweto (1976) and to the 1973 strike in Durban (Alexander, 2012). Violence is tied to a very long history in South Africa and is still evident today (Chinguno, 2015). Violence during strikes emerges when there is tension between collective and individual interest and violence is a means of forging or destroying worker unity (Chinguno, 2015).

This exposes employees and their families to a lifetime of poverty as some will not be able to work for their families in the future because of injuries, retrenchments or even death. This

results into a burden on the government and society in financially supporting the injured workers, retrenched people and the bereaved families, especially through payments to the disabled, unemployment benefits and social grants, respectively (Murwirapachena & Sibanda, 2014, p.558).

The fourth specific objective, investigating if the power struggle between trade unions influences the employment relationship, the participants clearly indicated that power struggles has a definite impact on their employment relationship. They mentioned factors such as their right to freedom of association being in jeopardy. Management only wants one union in the workplace. Unfortunately, labour legislation is on the employer's side in this regard. One trade union who represents the majority of employees in a specific workplace, can negotiate a recognition agreement and set a threshold of representivity. There are legal issues about the collective bargaining processes. One issue is the extension of collective bargaining agreements reached in bargaining councils to non-members. Bargaining councils are accused of representing the interests of larger unions and businesses at the expense of smaller companies which are placed under an unnecessary burden when subject to minimum wage agreements (Jones, 2013). When the Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995 was drafted, COSATU (Congress of South African Trade Unions) was keen on collective bargaining to become ingrained as it provides a degree of stability and a predictable cycle for wage negotiations (Jones, 2013). As referred to in chapter 2 of this study, collective bargaining in South Africa comes at a prohibitive cost for small firms, and as a result, contributes to lower employment rates (Magruder, 2012). This results in less small entrepreneurs starting their own businesses because the risk of trade unions and collective bargaining is too high (Magruder, 2012). Statutory minimum wages also contribute to less small entrepreneurs because they cannot afford to pay the employees these minimum wages.

Previous studies indicated that there is a lack of confidence in labour unions in South Africa (Gordon, 2015). The Marikana incident indicated the impact and demonstrates how

employees continue to be a powerful and creative social force in South Africa (Alexander, 2013). This specific incident had an enormous effect on public opinion of trade unions and this had a direct impact on the decline of trade union membership (Gordon, 2015).

This gave a clear indication that employees are aware of the power struggle that exists between trade unions. It also indicated that the power struggle between trade unions influences the employment relationship.

Conclusion

Since 2005, South Africa has experienced more strike days per capita than in any other country (Alexander, 2012: 63). The Department of Labour reported that in 2012, more than half of the strikes were unprotected and a higher use of violence and damage to property were reported (Paton, 2013). This shows that the class struggle, as explained by Marx, is still relevant today. The socio-political context for South Africa's labour relations shows high level of conflict and strike violence. Industrial action has been linked to violence (Jones, 2013). There are also a lot of problems with the collective bargaining processes (Jones, 2013). Secondly, South Africa has a very high unemployment rate, which leads to poverty. Militant trade unions like AMCU, see the need to fairly distribute resources like decent work, housing, health and education. South Africa is the most unequal country in the world where the gaps between the rich and the poor is quite big (Thompson, 2013).

This article looked at the perceptions employees have about trade union power struggles. The literature review was supported by data gathered through a literature study on previous research done in the field. It also looked at international and national trends of workplaces dominated by trade unions and its effect on the employment relationship. The one aspect that is clear, is that trade union power struggles has a definite impact on the employment relationship. The question that arose from this finding is: How can trade union power struggles be contained

so that the impact on the employment relationship can be kept to a minimum? The participants described the hostile environment which power struggles between trade unions cause.

The learnings from Marikana were the regulations of collective bargaining in terms of representivity. Secondly, excluding unions does not reduce inter-union rivalry, it rather aggravates it. Thirdly, there is a need for better union leadership and management leadership. Lastly, there is a need for collaborative problem solving (Thompson, 2013). The participants pointed out the need to develop and maintain trust and incorporating more space for participative decision-making by all stakeholders. Good relationships are not enough; participation in the process must have tangible benefits. Managers and union/employee representatives need to be up-skilled in problem-solving and early conflict management techniques. Model workplaces of high collaboration need to be developed together with value-based decision-making. Opportunities need to be created to get parties together to find common ground to achieve the goals of the Labour Relations Act No. 66 of 1995. From the findings, it is clear that only relying on legislation, rules, collective agreements and policies is not going to solve anything. Participation by all role players need to be incorporated into management strategies and developing a proactive approach to conflict resolution instead of a reactive approach. Effective, credible workplace communication forums need to be developed to equip the parties with the necessary knowledge and skills to participate meaningfully in such forums.

The Marikana incident had a clear effect impact on industrial relations in South Africa. This escalated from the mining sector to other sectors in South Africa. The hostility of the Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union towards government and other entities, increased the union's popularity among workers in the platinum sector, but more specifically at this specific mine in Rustenburg. This caused a weakening in the more established mining unions. The increase in support for AMCU, also caused NUMSA (National Union of Metalworkers of South Africa) to see a gap into the mining industry and they are now trying very hard to get into the gold and coal sectors. The Marikana incident further include divides between

pro- and anti-government unions. Alexander (2013) provides the example of a divide between the workerists and populists in the COSATU (Congress of South African Trade Unions) Federation. This divide resulted in the federation's largest affiliates, like NUMSA, who withdrew their support from the ruling party in the 2014 national and provincial elections (Gordon, 2015). NUMSA has joined the new federation, SAFTU (South African Federation of Trade Unions).

It is clear from the findings in article 2 that trade union power struggles are serious. It can have detrimental effects, it causes violence and even fatalities. Both employees and employers suffer a financial burden because of strikes that are caused by a power play by the majority union. Hyman (2004: 31), states:

Real solidarity cannot be imposed by administrative fiat, or even by majority vote. Its achievement is possible to the extent that unions rediscover the conviction, and persuade both their own members and members of civil society more generally, that they have a mission as a 'sword of justice'.

Thompson (2011) ends with the following powerful quote:

Great and productive workplaces are those with strong working relationships founded on high levels of trust, respect and information sharing, geared towards the achievement of organisational goals and employee rewards."

Recommendations

As with any other research study, there were several limitations, which constricted this research, but it provided opportunities for improvement in future research.

One limitation of the study is that the number of participants that were interviewed were all members of trade unions, thus they answered the questions from their union's point of view. Future research should look at constructing the interviews and using a sampling method to

include a broader diversity of employees and not only employees who are members of trade unions.

Another limitation was that employees' perceptions from only one mine in the Rustenburg area were gained and were not compared to employees at other mines in the Rustenburg area. This could possibly indicate whether more employees in the platinum mining sector have the same experiences and perceptions about trade union power struggles and its influence on the employment relationship.

The following recommendations can be carried out in future research. First, a pilot study should have been conducted to hammer out some of the issues with the research questions. This would have aided in eliminating unnecessary questions that cost a lot of time to transcribe. Secondly, because this study was qualitative, a second confirmatory quantitative study should have been carried out to get a broader answer and to be able to reach a bigger target participant group. This would have aided in confirming the participants' answers and getting a clearer picture about employees' perceptions about trade union power struggles.

Future studies may also explore the themes that became evident in this study in more detail. Some research questions could be drawn up specifically for exploring the themes, for example, the hostile environment created by power struggles and ways to enhance the environment and greater participation.

REFERENCES

- Alexander, P. (2012). "Barricades, Ballots and Experimentation: Making Sense of the 2011 Local Government Elections with a Social Movement Lens." In *Contesting Transformation: Popular Resistance in Twenty-first-century South Africa*, edited by M. C. Dawson and L. Sinwell, 63–100. London: Pluto Press.
- Alexander, P., Lekgowa, T., Mmope, B., Sinwell, L., and Xezwi, B. (2012). *Marikana – A View from the Mountain and a Case to Answer*. Johannesburg: Jacana Media.
- Alexander, P. (2013). Marikana, turning point in South African history. *Review of African Political Economy*, 40(138), 605-619.
- Amexwrite. (2016, July 12). What do trade unions do in the employment relationship. [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://www.amexwrite.com/blog/item/3-what-do-trade-unions-do-in-the-employment-relationship>
- Anderson, C. (2014). *Makers: The new industrial revolution*. Crown Business: New York, NY.
- Aspinwall, M. & Greenwood, J. (Eds.). (2013). *Collective action in the European Union: Interests and the new politics of associability*. Retrieved from https://books.google.co.za/books/about/Collective_Action_in_the_European_Union.html?id=IUbaAAAAQBAJ&redir_esc=y
- Bhorat, H., Naidoo, K., & Yu, D. (2014). *Trade unions in an emerging economy: The case of South Africa (201402)*. Development Policy Research Unit. Retrieved from http://www.dpru.uct.ac.za/sites/default/files/image_tool/images/36/DPRU%20WP201402.pdf
- Bohlmann, H. R., Dixon, P. B., Rimmer, M. T., & Van Heerden, J. H. (2015). The impact of the 2014 Platinum Mining Strike in South Africa: An Economy-Wide Analysis. *Economic Modelling* 51, 403-411.
- Casale, G. (2011). *The employment relationship: A comparative overview*. The International Labour Organisation, USA.
- Cavvadas, D. (2012, December 27). Marikana – the causes and wider implications and lessons for the mining industry in Africa. *Fasken Martineau in Lexology online. Global Mining Q4 Newsletter Feature Article*. Retrieved from

<https://s3.amazonaws.com/documents.lexology.com/8b71ee31-c603-4d26-b0d9-f8c886d23bce.pdf>

- Chinguno, C. (2013). Marikana and the post-apartheid workplace order. *Johannesburg: Sociology, Work and Development Institute*. University of the Witwatersrand.
- Chinguno, C. (2015). Strike violence in post-apartheid South Africa. *TRIVIAL, capital et société*, 48(1&2). Retrieved from www.tcs.com/PDFs/48-12/6%20-%20Chinguno.pdf
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: choosing among five approaches*. London: SAGE, p. 150-155.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y.S. (2000). *Strategies of inquiry*. In Denzin, N. K. & Lincoln, Y. S. (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE, 367 – 378.
- Department of Labour. (2012). Annual Industrial Action Report. Retrieved from <http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/documents/annual-reports/industrial-action-annual-report/2012/industrialreport2012.pdf>
- Dolores, M. A., & Tongo, C. (2007). Purposive sampling as a tool for informant selection. *A Journal of Plants, People and Applied Research*, 5, 147-158. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/10125/2277>
- Du Plessis, G. (2017, October 1). Vakbondwedywering is ondemokraties. *Netwerk24*. Retrieved from <https://www.netwerk24.com/Sake/Ekonomie/gideon-du-plessis-wedywering-is-ondemokraties-20171001>
- Finlayson, C. (2016). The struggle to empower trade union members: insights from Zambia. *Taylor & Francis Online*. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09614524.2016.1224816>
- Fiorito, J. (2016). Union effectiveness: In search of the Holy Grail. *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, 37(1), 189-211.
doi: 10.1177/0143831X14537358
- Fossum, J. (2014). *Labor relations: Development, Structure, Process*. Retrieved from https://www.amazon.com/Labor-Relations-Development-Structure-Process/dp/0077862473/ref=mt_hardcover?_encoding=UTF8&me=
- Gennard, J., Judge, G., Bennet, T., & Saundry, R. (2015). *Managing employment relations* (6th ed.). London: Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development.

- Golafshani, N. (2003). Understanding reliability and validity in qualitative research. *The qualitative report*, 8(4), 600. Retrieved from <http://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol18.iss4/6>
- Gordon, S. L. (2015). Individual trust and distrust in South African trade unions: A quantitative analysis, 2011 – 2013. *South African Association of Political Studies*, 42(3), 325-343. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/02589346.2015.1104464>
- Gumede, W. (2012, August 29). South Africa: Marikana is a turning point. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2012/aug/29/marikana-turning-point-south-africa>
- Hammer, T. H. & Avgar, A. (2005). The impact of unions on job satisfaction, organisational commitment and turnover. *Journal of Labour Research*, 26 (2), 1 – 26. Retrieved from <https://link-springer-com.nwulib.nwu.ac.za/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs12122-005-1024-2.pdf>
- Hay, C. (2016). Good in a crisis: the ontological institutionalism of social constructivism. *New Political Economy*, 21(6), 520. doi: 10.1080/13563467.2016.1158800
- Hirsch, B. T. & Macpherson, D. A. (1993). *Union membership and earnings data book: Compilations from the current population survey*. Washington DC: Bureau of National Affairs.
- Hirsch, B. T. & Schumacher, E. J. (2000). *Private sector union density and the wage premium: Past, present and future*. Paper presented for the symposium, “The future of Private Sector Unionism,” edited by Bruce Kaufman, for publication in the *Journal of Labour Research*.
- Hyman, R. (2004). An emerging agenda for trade unions. *Labour and Globalisation: Results and Prospects*. 19-31.
- Jones, G. (2013, February 27). What’s wrong with South Africa’s industrial relations.
- Jordaan, J. C. (2016). An estimation of the impact of the 2012 platinum-sector strike on the South African Economy. *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, 19(2), 303-320.
- Keller, K. M. (2009). *Power conflicts: Struggles for intragroup control and dominance* (Doctoral thesis). University of Maryland, College Park.

- Kester, G. (2007). *Trade unions and workplace democracy in Africa*. New York, NY: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.
- Leat, M. (2011). *Employee Relations*. Edinburgh Business School, Heriot-Watt University, 23.
- Lester, S. (1999). An introduction to phenomenological research. *Stan Lester Developments*. Retrieved from <https://www.rgs.org/NR/rdonlyres/F50603E0-41AF-4B15-9C84-BA7E4DE8CB4F/0/Seaweedphenomenologyresearch.pdf>
- Lévesque, C. & Murray, G. (2013). Renewing union narrative resources: How union capabilities make a difference. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 51(4), 777-796.
- Magruder, J. R. (2012). High unemployment yet few small firms: The role of centralised bargaining in South Africa. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 4(3), 66-138. Retrieved from <https://www.aeaweb.org/articles/pdf/doi/10.1257/app.4.3.138>
- Masiloane, D. T. (2010). Guaranteeing the safety of non-striking employees during strikes: The fallacy of policing. *Acta Criminologica*, 23(2), 31-41.
- McGuire, D. (2014). *Analysing union power, opportunity and strategic capability: Global and local union struggles against the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)*. University of Kassel, Germany. Retrieved from <https://mulpress.mcmaster.ca/globallabour/article/view/1147/1203>
- Murwirapachena, G., & Sibanda, K. (2014). Exploring the incidents of strikes in Post-Apartheid South Africa. *The International Business and Economics Research Journal*, 13(3), 553.
- Nikoloski, K., Dimitrova, J., Koleva, B., & Kacarski, E. M. (2014). From industrial relations to employment relations with focus on employee relations. *International Journal of Sciences: Basic and Applied Research (IJSBAR)*, 1-8. Retrieved from <http://eprints.ugd.edu.mk/11569/1/3096-7295-2-PB.pdf>
- Oxenbridge, S., & Brown, W. (2002). The two faces of partnership: An assessment of partnership and co-operative employer/trade union relationships. *Employee Relations*, 24(3), 262-276. doi: 10.1108/01425450210428435
- Paton, C. (2013, September 19). Strikes take bite out of GDP and Wages. *BusinessDay*.

- Pityana, S. (2012, October 3). Marikana a turning point. *Sowetanlive*. Retrieved from <https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/opinion/columnists/2012-10-03-marikana-a-turning-point/>
- Rheeder, J. (2014). Trade Unions – How to deal with power play and position bargaining. *Johanette Rheeder Incorporated*. Retrieved from <http://www.jrattorneys.co.za/south-african-labour-law-articles/collective-rights-and-strikes/trade-unions-how-to-deal-with-power-play-and-position-bargaining.html>
- Robinson, O. C. (2014). Sampling in interview-based qualitative research: A theoretical and practical guide. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 11(1), 25-41.
- Seoka, J. (2012, September 5). Charges against miners raise questions. *Business Day*.
- Sewell, W. H. (2005). Logics of history: Social theory and social transformation. *Chicago: University of Chicago Press*.
- Sisson, K. (2008) Putting the record straight: Industrial relations and the employment relationship. *Warwick papers in industrial relations, University of Warwick*, 4.
- Thompson, B. (2013, July 25). Learnings from Marikana for SA's labour relations system. *South African Society for Labour Law*. Retrieved from https://documentslide.org/the-philosophy-of-money.html?utm_source=learning-s-from-marikana-for-sa-s-labour-relations-system-25-july-2013-bill-thomson
- Thompson, C. (2011, December 8). Building High Performance Workplaces. *CCMA Indaba*. Retrieved from https://nanopdf.com/download/managing-conflict-in-the-workplace_pdf
- Tolsi, N. (2012, September 14). From Rivonia to Marikana. *Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://mg.co.za/article/2012-09-14-00-from-rivonia-to-marikana>
- Visser, J. (2012). The rise and fall of industrial unionism. *Sage Publications*, 18(2), 129 -141. doi: 10.1177/1024258912439160
- Walliman, N. (2006). *Social research methods*. London: SAGE, p. 148. In de Vos, A. S., Strydom, H., Fouché, C. B., & Delport, C. S. L. (2011). *Research at grass roots*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers, p. 123.

CHAPTER 4: CONCLUSION, LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

Conclusion

The final chapter briefly discusses the conclusions of the objectives of the two articles in this study. In addition, limitations to the study and subsequent recommendations to correct the limitations as well as possible avenues for future research will be outlined.

Article 1: The employment relationship and the power struggle between trade unions: A literature review

The general purpose of this study was to explore what the impact of trade union power struggles are on the employment relationship. Throughout the study it was found that inter-union rivalry influences the employment relationship in a number of ways. It creates a hostile work environment, violent strike actions and intimidation. The research also shows that the employment relationship needs a clear and definite collective dimension in order to balance the power between the employer and the employees (Basson, Christianson, Dekker, Garbers, le Roux, Mischke, and Strydom, 2009; Rust, 2001)

The first objective of the study was to explore how power struggles between trade unions are conceptualised in literature. Firstly, the employment relationship is a valid employment agreement between the employer and the employee and it consists of certain rights and obligations (Venter & Levy, 2012). Power can be defined as “the ability to control others, events, or resources; to accomplish what you want to achieve despite obstacles, resistance, or opposition.” Crossman (2016) continues “power is something that is held, coveted, seized, taken away, lost, or stolen, and it is used in relationships involving conflict between those with power and those without it.” In the employment relationship the employer has power over financial resources and employees have power as a collective. That is why they join trade unions, to help them gain more power in the employment relationship. There are a lot of international studies that exist which explores the effects of trade union conflict on different aspects of the employment relationship. The Marikana incident of 2012 triggered the winner-takes-all approach relating to trade union recognition because of power and financial resources.

The second objective of the study was to explore whether a power struggle exists between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. A lot of literature exist about the existence

of a power struggle between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. The most famous case is the rivalry between NUM and AMCU. The trigger was the Marikana massacre of 2012. The rivalry between NUM and AMCU is still evident today. AMCU is the dominant union in the platinum sector and they are trying to get into the gold and coal industries as well. NUM is doing everything in their ability to remain relevant in the mining industry. South Africa experienced violent, bloody and deadly industrial actions in the mining, transport and agricultural industries during the period August to October 2012. This period is known as strike season because of the salary or wage negotiations happening in this time. Literature clearly indicates that trade union power struggles exist in the mining industry of South Africa.

The third objective of the study was to explore what the consequences are of trade union power struggles at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. The first consequence of trade union power struggles are, power shifts and changing social identities. This is one of the reasons why some trade union members act violently to employees who are not affiliated to the union. Union leaders did not provide enough direction and leadership to their members and this caused the violent outrage of the members. The power struggle indicated that better collective bargaining processes is needed. This resulted in an amended to the Labour Relations Act 66 of 1995. Mining is very important for South Africa's growth and development. Unfortunately because of the number of strikes that occur in this industry, it makes it a risk for investors, potential and current. Du Plessis (2018) states that good leadership is the only thing that can save the mining industry. It is a time for leaders in management to stand up as well as for trade union leaders to stand up and lead their members.

The fourth objective of the study was to explore what the role of the Labour Relations Act 66 of 1995 is in regulation the employment relationship. The LRA plays a big role in the employment relationship. It regulates the conduct of trade unions, the conduct of employees and the conduct of employers. It is a manual that can be used by parties in order to enforce the law and ensure fairness. The LRA could have played a bigger role during the Marikana incident of 2012, but everything about the industrial action that took place, were done illegally. Firstly, the strike was an unprotected strike. The strike occurred during a period of an existing collective agreement. The Rock Drill Operators were unhappy with the services they received from the NUM officials, and instead of following the procedures prescribed by legislation, they took the law into their own hands. Interactive forums needs to be established inside the workplace where employees and trade unions can have open discussions with management. Better information sharing processes will also aid in resolving disputes faster.

The fifth objective of the study was to provide recommendations for future research. Future research should look into a broader scope of the power struggle. Examining the role that politics and government play in trade union power struggles would be an interesting concept to examine.

Article 2: Exploring employees' perspectives about trade union power struggles and the influence thereof on the employment relationship.

The first objective of this study was to explore how the type of employment relationship that exists in a trade union-dominated environment is conceptualised in literature. It was found that trade unions can have an impact on the work environment in both positive and negative ways. It can be positive if there is a relationship between the trade union and the employer and also if there is good communication channels that exist in this relationship. It can be negative when trade unions drive their own agendas. Also, trade unions who are militant and hostile towards the employer and this has a direct influence on the way the employer deals with employees.

The second objective was to explore what the perceptions of employees are about power struggles between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. From the data that was collected, it could be established that employees are aware of the power struggle that exists between the two key unions in their work environment. They also stated that this causes a hostile and violent working environment. The employees also experienced situations of intimidation from the majority union. They had feelings of “them and us”. They answered “if you are not with the majority union, then you will be victimised”, this created feelings of anxiety and fear. The participants explained that the power struggle is realised through the amount of strike actions that occurred since 2012. They mentioned that “this is a way for the majority union to show the employer that they have the power and they control the employer.”

The third objective was to explore the causes and consequences of a power struggle between trade unions at a specific mine in the Rustenburg area. The causes of power struggles from the employees' perspective is money, power, control and migrant labour. The more members a union has, the more its membership percentage is with the employer. Trade unions in most instances, has power if they are the majority union in terms of representation. The second aspect of membership numbers, is of course the income the union gets in terms of membership levies. The more members, the higher the income of the trade union. Power and control are words that can be used interchangeably in the context of power struggles. If you have power, you can control.

That is ultimately what unions want, to be in control. This has a negative influence, because trade unions can't tell the employer how to run their business. The employers are the risk takers, they invest a lot, if not all, their money in the business and they want to see it grow and develop. Employers know that employees are an important component for their business to be successful. In my opinion, if trade unions and employers can work together and share the same vision, there will be less violent industrial actions and more productivity amongst the employees. It was an interesting notion that the participants mentioned that migrant labour could also be a cause of power struggles. Although in my opinion, I believe that it is more of a contributing factor, than a cause. The reason why I say this is in all parts of society, you will always get different people, coming from different backgrounds, that is why we are known as the rainbow nation. There are some differences in the way certain cultures approach certain situations, but is that not something that can contribute to us being more successful. This makes it unique. Instead of only wanting to do things one way, look at different ways in dealing with problems.

The consequences, as we have seen in the event of 2012 at Marikana, is violence which leads to fatalities. Violent strikes emerge when there is tension between collective and individual interest. Violence is also seen by many as a last result, and by others as the only resort to get what you demand. The long term effects of such violent actions is a lifetime of poverty, retrenchments or even death.

The fourth objective of the study was to explore whether the power struggles between trade unions influences the employment relationship. The participants indicated that power struggles between trade unions have a clear and definite impact on their employment relationship. The factors they mentioned were their right to freedom of association is in jeopardy. The minority unions that exist in the mining industry are receiving notice from the employer because of their membership numbers. The employer only wants to deal with one trade union, the labour law supports them in this regard. This is why relationships are so important. In this regard it is not only having good relationships with the employer, but also with other trade unions.

The fifth objective was to provide recommendations for future research. One of the things that need to be incorporated during industrial action events, is better communication channels. Open communication between management and trade unions need to be established. Another recommendation. This will help in better relationship building as communication is the most important part of any relationship.

The loss of identity and of internalised boundaries are not only felt by the groups that are losing power but also in the groups that have gained the most power. The moment the trade union members realise that the group that gained the power, is not delivering on their promises, they will start losing their power. This results in even more conflict and struggles because opportunists see the gap and they will come in to fill that gap. The NUM lost their recognition in the platinum industry, but they remain relevant in the gold and coal industries. AMCU is trying to get a foot in the door in the coal and gold industries and this causes tension between the two rival unions.

When all of the above mentioned experiences are taken into consideration, it is clear that trade union power struggles influences the employment relationship. As the literature has shown and was referred to in the previous chapters, trade union membership around the world has decreased over the past few years. One of the factors that attributed to this is the militant manner in which some of the unions act towards management. This creates a hostile work environment and employees suffer the greatest.

Limitations

All research has limitations and some limitations were identified in this study. The first limitation that was identified was the framework of research. Qualitative studies extracts information from a relatively small sample size. The participants provided personalised answers as to how they perceive and experience power struggles between trade unions. In order to test the participants' answers, a bigger sample size could have provided correlations between answers. The second limitation of the study related to the fact that the interviews were conducted at only one mine in the Rustenburg area and as a result the findings cannot be generalised to the mining industry of South Africa. Another limitation was that not all the interviews could be conducted in the participant's first language. This resulted in communication hurdles.

The participants were uncomfortable due to the interviews being recorded for the purposes of transcribing it a later stage. However, after the second question, the participants started to relax and felt more comfortable answering the questions. The presence of a recording device made participants hesitant and might have limited their responses to the questions asked. Some of the questions lead to the participants referring to the Marikana incident of 2012 and this created a traumatic reliving of the event. This made the participants feel uncomfortable and some of them refused to elaborate on the things that they experienced.

Despite the purpose and process of the research study explained to the participants, some participants were hesitant to open up to the researcher and communicate openly about their experiences. Some of them were very uncomfortable and hesitant and thought the researcher was there to do research for management. The researcher did however try to maintain an open and safe environment where participants could express their perceptions comfortably.

As mentioned above, the study was limited by the sample size of the willing participants. The study was further limited by the time frame in which the participants were interviewed. Also, the time period since the study was started and the interviews conducted, new research were published on the topic, thus making this research study only a contributor to current research and no new information was gathered.

Research has largely yet to examine how these individual motives and behaviours designed to garner power may translate to processes at the interpersonal and group level, and in particular, the extent to which they may result in conflicts or power struggles.

Scope for Future Research

Despite the various limitations listed above, there are some recommendations that can be made for future research and practice.

Several recommendations can be made that may improve the accuracy of findings within future studies. The population size needs to be enlarged to include a wider representation for future research. A sample size that include human resource managers may also add value to the study and application in the workplace.

Limited research exists on power struggle between trade unions and the influence it has on the employment relationship. This research study is unique in the sense that it looks directly at power struggles' influence on the employment relationship. Foreign studies cannot always be applied to the African context, thus future studies could examine other contexts such as the different industries in order to determine whether the findings of this study can be applied to those contexts or industries and to see if the findings are truly transferrable). Looking at the mining industry as a whole and to include the different sectors could also provide with more accurate results.

The employment relationship is the centre of relationships between management and employees. Trade unions are role players in this relationship. Trade union power struggles could

also be investigated and tested against other variables such as employment law. For example looking at Freedom of association and the majoritarianism approach in more detail.

In addressing the above mentioned limitations, a quantitative research design could be recommended for future research. This will ensure a bigger sample size which will give a more detailed answer to the question whether power struggles influences the employment relationship. The survey can be administered at more mining companies. The results could then be generalised to the mining industry of South Africa. This research study could be used as a pseudo pilot study for a larger and more complex investigation on the entire industry. Future studies should utilise a larger sample size from a wider variety of organisations in the mining industry as this will help to enhance the accuracy of the findings. Future studies should attempt to include a more equal balance between the characteristics of the participants and should explore whether demographic and biographic differences can have any significant impact on the employees' perceptions about trade union power struggles.

In conclusion, even though there were a few limitations to the research, very valuable insights and information were captured. The findings add insight that could be used as guidelines for future research regarding power struggles between trade unions and its influence on the employment relationship.

REFERENCES

- Basson, A. C., Christianson, M. A., Dekker, A., Garbers, C., le Roux, P. A. K., Mischke, C., and Strydom, E. M. L. (2009). *Essential labour law*. Centurion: Labour Law Publications
- Crossman, A. (2016, April 15). Power. *Thoughtco*. Retrieved from <https://www.thoughtco.com/power-p2-3026460>
- Du Plessis, G. (2018, January 14). Gideon du Plessis: Goeie leierskap kan mynbou red. *Netwerk24*. Retrieved from <https://www.netwerk24.com/Sake/Mynbou/gideon-du-plessis-goeie-leierskap-kan-mynbou-red-20180114>
- Rust, B. (2001). So, you think being a trade union is plain sailing? *South African Journal of Labour Relations*, 25 (1 & 2). Retrieved from <http://reference.sabinet.co.za/nwulib.nwu.ac.za/document/EJC59543>
- Venter, R. & Levy, A. (2012). *Labour Relations in South Africa*. South Africa, Cape Town: Oxford University Press.