

THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INDIGENT POLICY IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE: CHALLENGES AND OPTIONS

MASHAPHA MASINDI CECILIA

BA HONS (NWU)

Mini-dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree

MASTER OF DEVELOPMENT AND MANAGEMENT

Vaal Triangle Campus of the North-West University

Supervisor: Dr. Lukamba-Muhiya Tshombe

May 2015

DECLARATION

I, Masindi Cecilia Mashapha, declare that the mini-dissertation entitled “The implementation of the indigent policy in the City of Tshwane: challenges and options”, is my own work. All sources quoted are indicated and acknowledged through complete reference. I did not previously submit this dissertation for a degree at any institution of higher learning.

MASINDI CECILA MASHAPHA

MAY 2015

SIGNATURE

DATE

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The study would not have been complete without the invaluable help and support from the persons and the institution mentioned below:

- I would like to thank Jehovah for giving me the strength, courage, perseverance, determination and wisdom to pursue my studies.
- Dr M.T. Lukamba from the North-West University: Vaal Campus, who was my study leader (Supervisor). The guidance, patience and direction encouraged my academic improvement.
- The Department of Humanities at the North-West University for granting me a post-graduate bursary for two years, and for allowing me to study this degree, despite the three years taken for completion.
- The National Department of Social Development for funding two years of the degree and for allowing me to take leave when I needed to attend study-related activities.
- The City of Tshwane Municipality, City Manager's Office, Health and Social Development Unit, Research Innovation Unit, and Finance Section that was supportive during the entire process.
- The participants in the study, as the study would not have been possible without them. They welcomed me and gave me their valuable time.
- My family for being loving and supportive – gratitude goes to my parents, Mapula Grace and Daniel Mashapha, for taking care of my son, Koketso, while I was studying.
- My friends and relatives who encouraged me to stay focused even when I felt like giving up.

ABSTRACT

There is a dire need to improve the implementation of the indigent policy in municipalities to assist the most disadvantaged group in the community, the poor. The study focussed on the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane: challenges and options.

The challenges would render the indigent policy inefficient and would require more improvement to avoid wasteful expenditure. The indigent policy is implemented through the identification process, which is the criterion the municipality uses in order to register the indigents on the municipal database. The municipality is offering a social package as part of the free basic services. The funding of the programme, which is critical for sustainability, and the exit programme that seeks to transform the poor into economically independent residents who will afford basic municipal services.

The study found that the more the indigent register increases in the number of beneficiaries, the higher the municipal rates become, resulting in increased municipal costs for those who do not qualify to be on the indigent register. The implementation of this policy is critical yet complicated. It calls for integration, alignment, and coordinated utilisation of human capital, financial, infrastructural and technical resources involving other relevant stakeholders.

Strategic interventions must be in place as a way of reducing levels of indigence in Tshwane. The cycle of poverty needs to be broken. The researcher believes that ongoing implementation of poverty alleviation programmes, partnership with tertiary institutions for linking deserving children from poor households, continuous monitoring of the indigent register, assurance that the registration process correspond with the exit process, continuous monitoring, and periodic evaluation of the programme should be executed with efficiency and effectiveness.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xi
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM STATEMENT	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY	1
1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT	3
1.4 CENTRAL THEORETICAL STATEMENT	5
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS	5
1.6 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES	6
1.7 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY	6
1.8 LIMITATION OF THE STUDY	6
1.9 METHODOLOGY	7
1.9.1 Literature review	8
1.9.2 Empirical study	9
1.10 RESEARCH ETHICS	9
1.11 CHAPTER OUTLINE	10
CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL OVERVIEW OF CHALLENGES ASSOCIATED WITH THE INDIGENT POLICY GLOBALLY AND LOCALLY	11
2.1 INTRODUCTION	11
2.2 NATURE OF INDIGENCE GLOBALLY	11

2.3	INDIGENT POLICIES OF INTERNATIONAL COUNTRIES.....	12
2.4	APPROACHES TO POVERTY REDUCTION	13
2.4.1	Breaking intergenerational transmission of poverty	13
2.5	INDIGENT POLICIES OF WESTERN COUNTRIES.....	14
2.5.1	Indigent programmes of the United States of America.....	14
2.5.2	Indigent policy of California.....	15
2.5.3	Bill 112 of Canada	15
2.5.4	Indigent policy of Scotland, Glasgow.....	15
2.5.5	Indigent Policy of Britain, Wessex	16
2.6	POVERTY IN AFRICAN COUNTRIES	16
2.7	SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT: AN OVERVIEW	17
2.8	THE IMPERATIVE OF INDIGENT PROGRAMMES.....	19
2.8.1	Moral imperatives	21
2.8.2	Pragmatic imperatives.....	21
2.8.3	Financial imperatives	21
2.8.4	Governance imperatives.....	21
2.9	HEALTH PROBLEMS AND POVERTY.....	22
2.10	INDIGENT POLICIES OF METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITIES	22
2.10.1	Indigent policy of City of Cape Town	23
2.10.2	Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality: Indigent support.....	24
2.10.3	Indigent support policy of Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality.....	25
2.10.4	Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality Indigent policy draft	26
2.11	LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK	27

2.11.1	The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996)	28
2.11.2	The National Indigent Policy Framework.....	28
2.11.3	The National Indigent Policy Guidelines.....	29
2.11.4	Municipal Finance Management Act.....	29
2.11.5	Public Finance Management Act	30
2.11.6	Municipal Systems Act.....	30
2.11.7	Reconstruction and Development Programme	30
2.11.8	The National Development Plan	31
2.12	CHAPTER SUMMARY.....	32
	CHAPTER 3 THE INDIGENT POLICY OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE.....	33
3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	33
3.2	URBAN POVERTY	33
3.3	INDIGENT POLICY OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE.....	34
3.4	THE OBJECTIVES OF THE INDIGENT POLICY	35
3.4.1	Assisting the poor.....	35
3.4.1.1	The advantages of assisting poor individuals and households.....	35
3.4.2	Improve access to the service.....	35
3.5	DOCUMENTS FOR REGISTRATION	36
3.6	REGISTRATION PROCESS	37
3.7	THE SOCIAL PACKAGE.....	38
3.8	FUNDING FOR THE INDIGENT PROGRAMME	39
3.8.1	Equitable share	39
3.9	EXITING THE INDIGENT PROGRAMME.....	40
3.9.1	Training.....	41

3.9.1.1	Life skills training	43
3.9.1.2	General purpose entrepreneur training.....	43
3.9.1.3	Small, micro and medium enterprises (SMMEs).....	44
3.9.1.4	Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP).....	45
3.9.1.5	Community Work Programme (CWP)	46
3.10	MONITORING	46
3.11	CHAPTER SUMMARY	47
CHAPTER 4 RESEARCH DESIGN AND RESEARCH RESULTS.....		48
4.1	INTRODUCTION.....	48
4.2	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	48
4.2.1	Qualitative methodology	49
4.2.1.1	Attributes of qualitative research	50
4.3	ENSURING QUALITY OF THE STUDY	51
4.3.1	Trustworthiness	51
4.3.1.1	Validity	51
4.3.1.2	Reliability.....	52
4.3.2	Consistency	52
4.3.3	Neutrality	52
4.4	TECHNIQUES IN DATA COLLECTION	53
4.4.1	Data collection instrument	53
4.4.2	Focus group discussion	53
4.4.3	Interviews.....	54
4.4.4	Target Population	56

4.4.5	Sampling	57
4.5	DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION	57
4.5.1	Data analysis	57
4.5.2	Data interpretation.....	59
4.6	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS.....	59
4.6.1	Approval.....	60
4.6.2	Informed consent.....	60
4.6.3	Confidentiality	60
4.6.4	Harm to participants.....	60
4.7	PROCEDURE FOLLOWED DURING DATA COLLECTION	61
4.8	FINDINGS OF THE STUDY.....	62
4.8.1	Narrative of the findings	64
4.9	CHAPTER SUMMARY	70
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS		72
5.1	INTRODUCTION.....	72
5.2	SUMMARY OF THE CHAPTERS.....	72
5.3	ACHIEVEMENT OF THE RESEARCH OBJECTIVES	73
5.4	CENTRAL THEORETICAL STATEMENT	73
5.5	SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS.....	74
5.6	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	75
5.7	CONCLUSION.....	77
BIBLIOGRAPHY		78
ANNEXURE A INTERVIEW SCOPE		88
ANNEXURE B FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION		91

ANNEXURE C INFORMED CONSENT FORM FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPANTS..... 93

ANNEXURE D INFORMED CONSENT FORM FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPANTS..... 94

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1:	Poverty measures by province in 2011	18
Table 2.2:	Overview on indigent framework in metropolitan municipalities.....	23
Table 4.1:	Biographical profiling of participants.....	61
Table 4.2:	Thematic presentation of Research findings.....	63

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ANC	African National Congress
CDS	Centre for Development Support
CPRV	Centre for the Prevention and Resolution of Violence
CoT	City of Tshwane
CWP	Community Work's Programme
DFID	Department for International Development
DPLG	Department of provincial Local Government
ES	Equitable share
EU	European Union
EPWP	Extended Public Works Programme
FGD	Focus group discussions
FBS	Free basic services
GCC	Glasgow City Council
HSRC	Human Science Research Council
IEC	Independent Electoral Commission
IES	Indigent Exit Strategy
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MFMA	Municipal Finance Management Act
MIIU	Municipal Infrastructure Investment Unit
MSA	Municipal Systems Act
NDP	National Development Plan
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NWU	North-West University
PFMA	Public Finance Management Act
QLFS	Quarterly Labour Force Survey
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SMME's	Small- Medium- Micro-Enterprises
SSANCS	Statistics South Africa's National Community Survey
UN	United Nations
WRDM	West Rand District Municipality

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM STATEMENT

1.1 INTRODUCTION

All municipalities in South Africa have created special policies aimed at assisting struggling households in paying their rates and service charges. The indigent policy is designed to give rate rebates to homeowners who meet predetermined criteria. Like other municipalities in South Africa, the City of Tshwane has developed an indigent policy. The policy was reviewed in 2010 and is currently being implemented.

This study seeks to identify the challenges and options encountered by the City of Tshwane in its implementation of the indigent policy. This chapter comprises the orientation and problem statement of the study, an outline of the central theoretical statement, research questions and objectives, significance and limitations of the study, methodology, ethical considerations and the chapter outline. These are discussed below:

1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

Statistics South Africa Millennium Development Goal's (MDG) country report (2010:5) reveals that in order to address the scourge of poverty, countries should eradicate extreme poverty and hunger. The South African government's first priority would have to be speeding up growth and transformation of the economy in responding to the MDG. Such a transformation process should ensure that decent employment and sustainable livelihoods are urgently created. The MDG goals were developed and signed in 2000 with the aim of achieving its objectives by 2015. Little progress has been made as far as economic development is concerned hence poverty is still a serious challenge. Majority of South Africans still depend on social grants and gaining full time employment appears to be impossible for many. Social assistance grants are aimed at ensuring that households meet their basic subsistence needs. Poverty and massive unemployment necessitates this form of redistribution and it is generally believed that the reliance on social grants will continue, if not increase, if the current situation continues. Social grants play a vital role in ameliorating poverty and improving access to food and education (Altman et al, 2009). The South African government has made a commitment to build the economy through social infrastructure development investment. The 2008 economic crisis brought a setback and the investment aims at reversing it. The government hopes to create more employment through such projects.

According to Section 152(2) of the Constitution (1996) of South Africa, “local government has a mandate to strive within its financial and administrative policy to provide democratic and accountable government where the people are. The local government is also mandated to promote social and economic development; to encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations in all matters of governance in their areas”. The investment that the national government intends making is implemented at the ward level with relevant municipalities entrusted with the responsibility of accountability. This means that municipalities are expected to ensure that service delivery happens in their areas of authority and that it does so in a sustainable manner as obligated by the constitution of the country. One of the key expectations in this regard is the provision of services to all citizens, including those who cannot afford them.

The former Minister of Finance, Mr Pravin Gordan, indicated in the budget speech of 2013 that government was continuing to make progress in extending access to housing, electricity water and sanitation and in providing refuse removal services to all communities (Department of Finance, 2013). Similarly, on the 5th October 2013, the Executive Mayor of the City of Tshwane, Councillor Kgosientsho Ramokgopa, the member of the mayoral committee for Human Settlements, Councillor Joshua Ngonyama, and deputy minister of Trade and Industry Elizabeth Thabethe, handed over title deeds to 2296 inhabitants of low cost houses in Hammanskraal and Stink Water. It can be deduced that the handing over of the title deeds depicts the commitment of the City of Tshwane in providing habitable human settlements. This process of formalising informal settlements in Tshwane is named “Re aga Tshwane” and it translates into “we are building Tshwane”.

The Framework for Municipal Indigent Policy (2005:12) indicates that there are households and citizens who are unable to access or pay for basic services. The City of Tshwane Indigent Policy Review (2010:2) adds by stating that “the basic municipal services mean an acceptable and reasonable quality of life that, if not provided would endanger public health or safety or the environment”.

The deduction in this regard is that the City of Tshwane aims at ensuring that all critical basic needs for survival are met through its policy and programmatic intervention as it is protective and concerned about the well-being of its residents. However, Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2003:7) argue that indigent policies often adopt a limited scope. In their view, indigent policy, focuses on chronically poor households within a limited set of administrative and debt management

procedures. The indigent policy is supposed to be broadening the scope to include a more comprehensive set of basic needs and rights protection.

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

According to Quarterly Labour Force Survey (2012: xiv), “there were approximately 3.9 million persons unemployed in South Africa in the last quarter of 2008. The level of unemployment climbed rapidly, reaching a peak of 4.4 million in the wake of the financial and economic crisis. The number of unemployed persons rose to 4.5 million in Q1:2012”. These increasing figures attest to the realities of unemployment and poverty in South Africa. The situation cannot remain like this as people would starve and die.

In 2002, unemployment was the highest in the City of Tshwane with 321 478 people. The number decreased in 2008 to 218-671. The number increased again in 2010 peaking at 272 450 and representing 21.8% increase (City of Tshwane Integrated Development Plan 2012). According to Stats SA (2008:10), income figures reveal that in a 10-year period, the number of people without income has almost doubled. These groupings of the unemployed, who are poverty-stricken people, are referred to as the indigents. The question remains: will South Africa again fight unemployment and poverty?

People from all over the world migrate to Gauteng. Some are from African countries and others coming from Europe, Asia and America, while others are from different provinces of South Africa. People migrate for considerable economic incentives. They leave home provinces because they are unable to find employment in their own provinces and countries. In this regard, migration is mainly driven by economic enrichment. The Human Science Research Council (HSRC) (2005:2) suggests that the large number of migrant workers contributes to the higher levels of visible poverty in Gauteng. Migrants account for 1.3 million or 46% of the national total. This, in large measure, accounts for the rapid increase in overall population evident in percentage terms in the province.

The population increased by about 20% between 2001 and 2008 and by about 57% between 1996 and 2008. However, Stats SA (2007:59) argues that the overall population of South Africa grew by only 8% between 2001 and 2007.

There is a strong correlation between migration and poverty. Historically, migration has been a source of opportunities for people to improve their lives and those of their families. Countries continue to motivate individuals to escape poverty through migration. This is due to the large

differences in incomes among different places. After arriving in an area that is regarded as having economic opportunities, people often realise that the area cannot provide opportunities for all of them.

Poverty pockets are created because of unemployed people. Usually, the area where people living in poverty are residing is densely populated, often without proper access to basic services. According to HSRC (2005:2), “such poverty pockets are areas of the province which are the most difficult to assist in terms of poverty reduction”. It is not easy for municipality management and planning structures to deal with service delivery in the area that is over populated. Usually, overpopulated areas are invaded areas such as shacks and lack of sanitation. If the municipality does not plan the area for residential purposes, it becomes difficult to even conduct the profiling of the area, hence no inclusion in planning and implementation of services. The government implement policies on areas where the household information, is known. This is highlighted in the African National Congress slogan that says “a better life for all” irrespective of the inability to pay for services.

According to the Framework for Municipal Indigent Policy (2005:3), the Gauteng province is leading in providing a decent life for the poor and destitute. Community Survey (2007) adds that the main factor that contributes to the increased poverty in the City of Tshwane’s population is migration. As indicated earlier that Gauteng province, in general, receives a major inflow of people re-locating from elsewhere. Statistics South Africa mid-year population report (2010:3) estimates that “Gauteng had a population of 12 728 400 people”. The number translates to 22.4% of the population of South Africa. The remaining eight provinces of South Africa constitute 77.6% of the total population.

Framework for Municipal Indigent Policy (2005:3) states that the “indigent policy is a vital response to lack of access to basic services by the poor”. It further states that this lack of access is primarily due to chronic poverty experienced by most community members from previously disadvantaged backgrounds. The overall objective of the indigent policy is to eradicate substantially those elements of poverty over which local government has control. It is in this regard that the municipality should use its professional and non-professional staff, experts, budgeting, civil society, business sector and all resources at its disposal to fight poverty and have interim measures to assist the most impoverished in its area.

“As part of the broader social agenda and anti-poverty strategy of the South African government, the local government has an obligation to provide free basic social services” (City of Tshwane

Indigent Policy Review, 2010:2). The deduction in this regard is that South African government did not only promise a better life for all, but is also committed to a successful implementation of projects and programmes aimed at changing lives. There should never be a day any person is deprived any basic social service, irrespective of their economic or social status. One of the Batho Pele principles clearly stipulates access to services. According to HSRC (2010:4), the free basic services listed in this regard are: water supply, sanitation, energy, refuse removal and assistance with the housing process. These services are what the Indigent Policy Framework refers to as the essential household services package.

The study covered the following area, which is located within the jurisdiction of the City of Tshwane Municipality: Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12, which, according to demarcation, is called Ward 97. The residential area is mainly comprises Reconstruction and Development Plan (RDP) houses. Many house owners have constructed shacks in their yards as a way of increasing their monthly income. Majority of the owners are unemployed. That is why they qualify for RDP houses. It was crucial for this study to focus on the challenges and options available in the implementation of the City of Tshwane's indigent policy. The study was meant to assist in creating a sound understanding of the challenges and options available in the implementation of the City of Tshwane's indigent policy.

1.4 CENTRAL THEORETICAL STATEMENT

The central theoretical statement in this study is that the residents of Ward 97 experience of challenges when accessing indigent services of the City of Tshwane and it is critical to involve both the municipality and residents in offering options that will improve the provision of services to the indigents residing at Ward 97.

1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

- How is the indigent policy implemented in Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12, of the City of Tshwane?
- What is the regulatory and statutory framework supporting the provision of services to the indigent people within the City of Tshwane?
- What are the challenges related to the implementation of the indigent policy in Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 of the City of Tshwane?
- What are available options to enhance appropriate implementation of the indigent policy in this area?

1.6 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

- To describe how the indigent policy is implemented in Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 of the City of Tshwane.
- To explain the regulatory and statutory framework supporting service delivery to indigent people.
- To explain the challenges related to the implementation of the indigent people in Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 of the City of Tshwane.
- To provide the options available to enhance appropriate implementation of indigent policy in this area.

1.7 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

According to Madue (2007:29), “scientist who have something important to say, publish their findings vigorously in the open international journal and serial journal literature”. Learning and development happens when scholars research and learn from others on how to improve certain programmatic perspectives. The institution’s research and innovation unit also has the responsibility to implement the research agenda and advice the municipality through evidence-based research. Interest in the study derived from realisation that as long as unemployment increases, the municipality’s burden for care and support will also increase.

There is the body of knowledge that every research seeks to contribute to. This study strives to do the same. Firstly, the study will describe how the indigent policy is implemented in Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 of the City of Tshwane. Secondly, it will explain the regulatory and statutory framework supporting service delivery to indigent people. Thirdly, it will explain the challenges related to the implementation of the indigent policy in Ward 97 of the City of Tshwane. Lastly, it will provide the options available to enhance the appropriate implementation of the indigent policy in this area. This research project is critical and aligns well with the quest of rendering free basic services to the indigents of City of Tshwane. The researcher will share the findings and the recommendations with the City of Tshwane research unit and the colleagues with the same interest in the research topic.

1.8 LIMITATION OF THE STUDY

The study is located in the City of Tshwane with a special focus on Mamelodi Mandela, extension 12. The research will be limited to the areas of the implementation of the indigent

policy. Generalisations of the findings to other areas will not be possible. The focus on the indigent policy limits the generalisation of the findings.

1.9 METHODOLOGY

The research methodology is the critical part of the research process. The proposed study would be conducted in an exploratory manner. According to Robson (2002:59), “an exploratory study is a valuable means of finding out what is happening, to seek new insights, to ask questions, and assess phenomena in a new light”. The exploratory methodology will assist the researcher to gain more insight into the subject matter and be clarified immediately when there is misunderstanding. Brynard and Hanekom (2006:36), explain that the research methodology focuses on the decision that the researcher has to make in order to conduct the research project. This study will be conducted through qualitative research method.

Fossey, Harvey, McDermott and Davidson (2002:717) explain qualitative research as the methodology that describes and explains the person’s life experience, behaviour, interactions, stories and social context without using statistical procedures or quantification. In contrast quantitative research is concerned with numbers. Creswell (1994) is of the opinion that qualitative research study is utilizing the enquiry process of understanding a social or human problem based on building a complete picture without words or reporting detailed views of informants which are conducted in natural settings. The methodology chosen here is the most suitable as it is interested in detail from the key informants. As such the research questions probes how and what, in order to get to answers.

It also focuses on study of human action from the insider’s perspective. In qualitative research, the respondent’s freedom and natural development of action and representation are captured. Through this methodology, the respondents are free to give their opinions. Rubin and Babbie (1997:26) state that qualitative research has the following characteristics:

- Meanings and interpretations are negotiated through human data sources
- The researcher is the primary data collector; the researcher does field work
- The research occurs in a natural setting where human behaviour and events occur, and the settings are not controlled.
- The researcher has to be as unobtrusive as possible, and see the world through the eyes of the participants

To this end, the proposed study will be conducted at Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 and at the City of Tshwane municipal buildings. The focus is on residents experiences and on the manner in which they make sense of their lives. The municipal officials will also explain the options and challenges experienced during the implementation of the indigent policy.

The qualitative method will be used through interviews and focus group discussions to obtain a deeper understanding of challenges and options available in the implementation of City of Tshwane's indigent policy. Generally, the qualitative method will produce descriptive data.

1.9.1 Literature review

A literature survey will be conducted to describe and analyse the policy framework for the implementation of the indigent policy. Qualitative methods will be used to obtain a deeper understanding of the challenges and options faced in the implementation of the City of Tshwane's indigent policy.

Rowland (2000:16) states that "in explaining social phenomena, we must always consider what people think and believe and consider their ideas". Rowland is of the opinion that the literature review can serve many functions, some of which are:

- To indicate what researchers in the field already know about the topic
- To indicate what those in the field do not yet know about the topic/gaps
- To indicate major questions in the topic area
- provide background information for the non-specialist reader seeking to gain an overview of the field
- To ensure that new research avoids the errors of some earlier research
- To demonstrate the grasp of the topic.

There will be two aims with the literature review in this study, namely to locate it in the context of what has already been done by other researchers on this topic. The second reason for the literature review would be to present a synopsis of the policy framework for the study. In this study, the researcher will consult different sources of material such as books, guidelines, journals and scientific reports.

1.9.2 Empirical study

The City of Tshwane has 7 regions and 105 wards. Only residents of Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 and officials in the finance and social development units were studied. The researcher interviewed four officials, the Director for indigent programme, the Social Worker and two officials working at finance section. Interviewing politicians: MMC for Health and Social Development and the ward councillor of Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 proved impossible. 30 household owners participated in the focus group discussions.

The finance unit allocate a budget for the implementation of the indigent policy from the Department of Treasury to the Health and Social Development unit of the municipality. The unit is the custodian of the indigent programme. The reason for Health and Social Development to be the custodian could be that as poverty is more of a social and structural challenge and affects the health of the people.

1.10 RESEARCH ETHICS

According to Rubin and Barbie (1997:60), ethics is associated with morality, which can further be attributed to what is wrong and right. It is also about conforming to the standard code of conduct of a given profession or group. It is important to highlight the ethical considerations in this regard of the research. An essential aspect is the issue of confidentiality of the results and findings of the study and the protection of the participant's identities. This could include obtaining permission to be interviewed (Creswell *et al.*, 2010:42). Participants must be legally and psychologically competent to give consent. They will be informed about their liberty to withdraw from the study at any given time.

According to De Vos *et al.* (1998:28), "confidentiality is seen as a continuation of privacy which refers to agreement between persons that limit access to private information". The letter granting permission to conduct the interviews was issued from the City of Tshwane research and innovation division. The authorising document also stressed the issue of confidentiality from the researcher's side. The study will be conducted with competence, commitment and skill that ensure that the participants would not be harmed.

1.11 CHAPTER OUTLINE

Chapter 1: Introduction, orientation and problem statement

The section will introduce the background to the topic of the study, different subsections to be covered. The chapter will also highlight the problem statement, target population, objectives and the methodology to be used throughout the study.

Chapter 2: Theoretical overview of challenges associated with Indigent Policy globally and locally

The section will focus on literature review on indigence, poverty, International and national approaches to poverty reduction. The section will also highlight the relationship between poverty and health while also providing comparison among Indigent policies of Metropolitan municipalities in South Africa. Lastly, the section will discuss the legislative and regulatory framework informing the implementation of Indigent Policy.

Chapter 3: The indigent policy of the City of Tshwane

The section will focus on the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane from an entry level until the exit point. The objectives of this policy are also discussed in this section.

Chapter 4: Empirical research design and research results

This chapter will focus on the research methodology, the techniques used in data collection. The section will also outline the how the data was analysed and interpreted and lastly it will discuss the findings of the study.

Chapter 5: Conclusion and recommendations

The chapter will highlight the conclusion of the study and recommendations will be made based on the empirical study and analysis.

CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL OVERVIEW OF CHALLENGES ASSOCIATED WITH THE INDIGENT POLICY GLOBALLY AND LOCALLY

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The literature review for this study will bring about the theoretical perspective and previous research work regarding the indigent policy. This chapter will focus on indigent policy implementations in comparison with interventions other countries offer to their indigents. The comparison will assist in drawing challenges and options as per the intervention. The chapter will further present the overview of the government of South Africa and the imperative of the indigent programme at the municipalities. For the purpose of this study, the chapter will discuss the metropolitan municipalities implementing the indigent policy and finally the legislative framework informing the development and implementation of indigent policies at municipalities.

There is less research on indigent policies of international countries as the researcher tried not to miss any research paper that would contribute meaningfully to the knowledge of the subject studied. Few developing countries have even partially developed social security systems, and still fewer are able to articulate what the social welfare system is. The problem of how to target the chronically poor is complex. The question remains, will the measures aimed at poverty eradication ever end in our lifetime?

2.2 NATURE OF INDIGENCE GLOBALLY

Internationally indigence is understood and defined in different ways. Castex (2007:29) defines indigence as “a legal term often used in reference to people whose estates lack the resources to pay independently”. He further adds that it is a multi-faceted concept. It also encompasses the low level of health, education, poor access to clean water, sanitation, inadequate physical security, lack of voice, and an insufficient opportunity for a better life, which are the major challenges faced by most international countries. Yazbeck (2009:157) states that the chronically poor people are often excluded from services. The definition shows that people who are unable to pay independently will settle for anything given, despite the quality of the service or product. If an indigent person visit the clinic and there is no treatment for the condition, the person might end up not getting better because of the lack of resources to buy self-medication at the pharmacy.

Statistics portal (2014) adds by explaining poverty as deprivation in well-being, and comprising many dimensions. It further includes the inability to acquire the basic goods and low-income services necessary for survival with dignity. Statistics portal (2014) is not inclusive because it does not list the indicators of poverty. The researcher can deduce that the methods used to measure poverty, are based on incomes or consumption levels. The mentioned level means that if the person cannot meet minimum level necessary to meet basic needs, a person is considered poor. This minimum level is usually called the poverty line. Various societies differ according to what is necessary to satisfy basic needs. Therefore, poverty lines vary, and each country uses lines, which are appropriate to its societal norms, values and level of development.

With the quest to meet the Millennium Development Goal (MDG) of eliminating poverty, the government interventions have grown enormously. Sheng, Rodriquez, Young, Ludena and Mukherjec (2007) examined the best place to start good governance. They agreed that good governance could play an important role in attempting to implement MDGs in the elimination of global poverty. It can thus be concluded that the government should strive for good governance as it influences positively on the lives of the vulnerable group in the society.

2.3 INDIGENT POLICIES OF INTERNATIONAL COUNTRIES

International countries are engaged in employing different strategies and policies of improving and subsidising the poor people residing within their localities. Material subsidy to the poor calls for continuous planning and further effective, efficient and economic implementation. Urbanisation increased in most countries. Meta (2000) indicates that along with the process of urbanisation, poverty is also increasingly being urbanised. Aiding the poor people in urban areas has become a prioritized area by government globally.

The basic municipal services include water supply, sewerage, drainage, flood protection, solid waste collection, disposal, local roads, public transport, street lighting and traffic management. In most cases, the poor face challenges with limited or no access. Shika indicates that even if municipality are regarded as engines of growth, they are under severe strain in meeting the growing demands and aspirations of the people (Mzini, 2011:6).

No method is perfect, but it is important to minimise these errors of exclusion and inclusion as much as possible (Morestin, Grant & Ridde, 2009). The criteria used to identify indigents are not always effective. Effectiveness in this context is the capability to identify beneficiaries as those that are poor. It is highly possible to commit two types of errors in the identification phase. The

municipality might exclude poor individuals who are the intended beneficiaries of the programme, and include persons who are not poor among the beneficiaries.

2.4 APPROACHES TO POVERTY REDUCTION

United Nation Development Plan (2013b:1) defines poverty as “the denial of basic choices and opportunities to lead a long, healthy, creative and free life to enjoy a decent standard of living; the deprivation side of human development; and to participate in the life of the community including political freedom and cultural choices”. The UNDP’s definition is not inclusive as it treats the poor as victims and dependant on those who are in power. The problem of defining and measuring poverty has been the subject of considerable research and debate over the last two decades. Wolff (2009:93-94) argues that two issues must be decided when measuring and defining poverty. The first is the identification of the poor, and the second is the aggregation of the individuals who fall in the poverty population, into an overall index of poverty.

It is evident that marked affluence coexists with dire poverty. Schwella *et al.* (1996:254), confirm, “the state of affairs exists not only within the same country or even the same city but across continents”.

2.4.1 Breaking intergenerational transmission of poverty

According to Bird *et al.* (2013), equilibrium of poverty points to the presence of chronic poverty, while some poverty is generational. It can be deduced that poverty is only generational if it moves from one generation to the next. This has negative implications for the previous generation as it means they did not fight successfully against the scourge. A group of Ugandan women were cited as stating that where specific and targeted programmes are required, the support given should include policies and strategies that prioritise livelihoods, ensure chronically poor people can take up opportunities, take empowerment opportunities seriously and recognise obligation to provide resources

Intergenerational transmission of poverty is from poor parents and grandparents to poor children. It is assumed that all working age generations will strive to invest in their children and support their parents because of altruism and strategic self-interest. Bird (2007: x) adds that intergenerational transmission of poverty accompanies the replication of socio- economic class. From this, it can be deduced that unlike wealth, poverty might cause parents to have too little left over for investment in the human capital of the younger generation.

2.5 INDIGENT POLICIES OF WESTERN COUNTRIES

Most of previous research on indigent policy dwells on public indigent defence system, health care and financial relief.

2.5.1 Indigent programmes of the United States of America

The indigent defence policy was launched in the United States of America by the landmark Supreme Court in 1963. The formulation of the policy came as a result of most indigents' inability to access free legal representation. They were deprived access to the justice system. Failing to provide the indigents with access to defence deprives the poor access to justice, hence the formulation thereof. The policy guarantees every person accused of a crime the right to an attorney for his or her defence, regardless of the ability to pay. The defence policy for indigents stipulates that all citizens have equal rights, regardless of race or national origin. Yet all too often, the lack of resources, including human violates the rights of indigents by leaving low-income people, without adequate representation. Mann (2010) argues that there is no single perfect indigent defence system. Each country applies its own unique combination of answers to the administration, funding and service delivery model by which they provide representation.

According to Census Bureau report (2011), 46.2 million persons or roughly one in seven Americans was poor in 2010. The numbers were up sharply from the previous year's 43.6 million. Although the recession increased the numbers of the poor, high levels of poverty predate the recession. It is clear that even the USA, which is perceived by most people as a well off country, is also hit by the challenge of poverty.

In order to understand poverty in the USA, one needs to focus on the living conditions of individuals, rather than generalise. For most Americans, the word "poverty" suggests near destitution. It also depicts the inability to provide for reasonable shelter for one's family or to provide nutritious food and clothing. However, only a small number of the 46 million persons classified as poor by the Census Bureau fit that description. "While real material hardship certainly does occur, it is limited in scope and severity" (Rector and Sheffield, 2011).

In America, there are also strong relations between the reasons for unemployment and the overall jobless rate. Wolff (2009:222-223) states that, in periods of low unemployment, such as 2000, the proportion of the unemployed who were job losers was relatively low, while in a period of high unemployment such as 1982 and 1992, layoffs increased and this was the primary cause of unemployment. Moreover, during economic downturns, the number of workers who voluntarily

quit a job without having another job in line was much smaller since the probability of finding a new job is lower when the overall unemployment rate is high (Wolff, 2009 225).

2.5.2 Indigent policy of California

According to Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2003:25), the indigent policy requires all countries to provide support to indigent persons who are legal residents and have no other means of support. This means all eligible adults that meet the programme requirements should receive monthly cash or in kind aid. There is no time limit to receiving aid. However, persons convicted of drug use and those distributing substances are excluded.

2.5.3 Bill 112 of Canada

Bill 112 is an Act to combat poverty and social exclusion. It was introduced because of lobbying efforts by anti-poverty groups and concerted efforts from civil society and the social sector. Unlike other countries, it provides income support strategies, access to education, employment, health, social services and housing for persons living in poverty. As such, the person might lose interest if he/she is unable to participate fully in the community and greater society.

Rector and Sheffield (2011) explain that poverty is characterised by living with insufficient and often poor quality food, sleeping in poor quality housing, in homeless shelters or on city streets and parks. On a daily basis, it is to have to make difficult and painful decisions involving trade-offs, such as whether to pay rent, the electric bill, go to the dentist, buy a new bus pass or forego inviting friends for dinner. To live in poverty is also to be at greater risk of poor health, family or neighbourhood violence and a shorter lifespan. Poverty is the condition of a human being who is deprived of the resources, means, choices and power necessary to acquire and maintain economic self-sufficiency. Poverty increases human suffering and infringes the rights of human beings.

2.5.4 Indigent policy of Scotland, Glasgow

Glasgow is the city that hosted the 2014 Commonwealth Games. It is the fourth largest city in the United Kingdom and the largest city in Scotland. Inhabitants of the city are referred to as Glaswegians. Glasgow grew from a small rural settlement on the river Clyde to become one of the largest seaports in Britain. According to Income poverty statistics report (2012), poverty rate has increased for all groups. The report further highlights the fact that the largest increase was in the rate of child poverty. It explains that 820,000 children were living in poverty in 2012. The number was 110,000 more than the previous year while child poverty increased to 19% in 2012,

up from 15% the previous year. What is happening to child protection services in Glasgow if children experience poverty?

Glasgow City Council has a blocked council tax, water charge and waste-water sewerage based on property values. Although the West of Scotland Water Authority sets water and sewerage separately, they are included in the council's rates bill. According to Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2003), people who are exempted from the rates are:

- “students
- people living together under the age of 18
- people who are severely mentally impaired
- school or college leavers under the age of 20
- people who are part of the armed forces
- people who form part of the sheltered housing scheme”.

2.5.5 Indigent Policy of Britain, Wessex

According to the Oxford English dictionary (2013), “Wessex is the kingdom of the West Saxons that was established in Hampshire in the early 6th century and gradually extended by conquest to include much of southern England”. Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2003:25) state that Wessex operates a fixed social tariff designed to help vulnerable groups pay for metered water. Vulnerable groups are designated as having three or more dependent children. Those who are under 16 years are not regarded as adults since they cannot legally give consent for anything.

Other vulnerable groups include people living under one roof with people of one or more of the following medical conditions: desquamation (flaky skin loss), weeping skin disease, incontinence, abdominal stoma or renal failure requiring home dialysis. The intervention Wessex offers depicts their understanding of poverty and its effect on human life. However, skin conditions could be mistaken for poverty-related conditions and as such cover all patients with a blanket of poverty.

2.6 POVERTY IN AFRICAN COUNTRIES

African countries have faced extreme hunger, diseases and poverty. There are extreme unequal power relations that predispose the vulnerable to a life full of lacking. Human development is compromised while food insecurity increases. Furthermore, sub-Saharan Africa is the only

region in the world where overall livelihoods and food security continue to deteriorate. United Nations Development Programm (UNDP) (, 2013b) adds that nearly half the population (340 million people) are living on less than a dollar a day. Notwithstanding Africa's challenges, the twenty-first century has seen significant changes in the understanding of poverty and hunger, and in priority setting to tackle these challenges. The hunger and famine that occurred in Ethiopia around 1984 shocked everyone in the continent and that pushed countries to come up with strategies to curb poverty in their countries.

It is asserted that there is an oblivious disparity in access to formal water supply facilities. The needy tend to have less access and a poorer quality of water. Inadequate municipal supply is usually substituted by informal sector supply. In Addis Ababa, which is the capital city of Ethiopia, the water price is far below cost. This has resulted in the local government's inability to operate and maintain existing systems and cover additional neighbourhoods (Wegellin & Borgman, 1995:21). Economic transformation is not a priority for African continent alone. The recent economic meltdown that plunged the world into recession, the widening gap between the rich and the poor and the rising scourge of youth unemployment clearly shows that transformation is needed everywhere, not just in Africa.

2.7 SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT: AN OVERVIEW

In 2011, the poverty lines were found in Limpopo province, where 63.8 % of all residents were poor, followed by Eastern Cape (60.8%) and Kwa-Zulu Natal with 56.6%. The poor were in minority in Western Cape (24.7%) and Gauteng Province (22.9%). The table below shows poverty measures by province.

Table 2.1: Poverty measures by province in 2011

Province	Headcount	Poverty gap(p1)	Severity(p2)	Poverty share
Limpopo	63.8	30.0	17.3	16.1
Eastern Cape	60.8	27.2	15.3	18.3
Kwa-Zulu Natal	56.6	25.5	14.4	26.3
North West	50.5	22.6	2.6	8.1
Mpumalanga	52.1	21.7	11.5	7.7
Northern Cape	46.8	19.1	9.9	1.8
Free State	41.2	17.5	9.3	4.9
Gauteng	22.9	8.1	4.1	11.0
Western Cape	24.7	8.5	3.9	5.7

Adapted from Statistics South Africa. Poverty trends in South Africa (2014:31).

What table 2.1 also shows is that, despite Gauteng having the lowest headcount of individuals living below the poverty line, it had the fourth highest number of poor people (11,0%) in 2011. As one would expect, the Northern Cape with a poverty headcount of 46,8% in 2011 – was home to only 1,8% of the country's poor because of the small number of people that live in the province

The government of South Africa has three spheres; national, provincial and local levels. Since the boundary reform at the time of the municipal elections of 18 May 2011, there are eight metropolitan municipalities, 44 district municipalities and 226 local municipalities in South Africa. According to Mzini (2011), the local government sphere is divided into metros, district and local, which are categorised by the constitution of South Africa as A, B and C. Category A represents largely urbanised regions that encompass multiple cities and constitute metropolis (metros) such as the City of Johannesburg and EThekweni metropolitan area. Category C is referred to by the constitution as municipalities that have municipal executives and legislative authority. Areas that include more than one municipality are called district municipalities, for example, West Rand District Municipality (WRDM). Category B municipalities are called local municipalities. Categories A and B are the heart of service delivery.

The IEC (2011) reports that local and metropolitan municipality areas have been demarcated through wards. There is no area in South Africa that does not fall under a specific ward. There used to be places called district areas, but they have been phased out. The researcher can conclude that although the local sphere is at the coalface of service delivery, the mandate comes

from the national and provincial spheres through legislative framework. The synergy among the three spheres should be maintained at all costs. Integration and alignment of services should be what all government officials strive to achieve.

2.8 THE IMPERATIVE OF INDIGENT PROGRAMMES

Most commonly, indigent policies point out that indigence is described in terms of a particular household income level, administratively identifying households falling below a certain income level. Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2003:7) offer a different perspective that indigence highlights issues of debt management policies and their application to households.

It is believed that people with no or low income will not be able to pay their municipal bills on time and that would require them to arrange with the debt management section of the municipality on how they will settle their accounts.

According to Municipal Infrastructure Investment Unit guide (2006:37), poverty is endemic and unemployment rates are noticeably high. The ANC (1994:14) concurs with the MIIU guide when it states that poverty goes beyond the mere lack of income; it includes lacking the know-how of managing the little one might come across. Previously disadvantaged communities still have the highest percentage of outstanding debt. Therefore, financial support is necessary through indigent and other social grants. It can be concluded that previously disadvantaged people who were not used to having money lack capacity in terms of managing money.

In 1996, South Africa became a signatory to the Habitat Agenda. The country committed itself to improvement of living and working conditions on a sustainable and equitable basis. That would allow everyone to have facilities and amenities, adequate shelter that is healthy, safe, secure, accessible, affordable and will enjoy freedom from discrimination in service delivery and that includes basic services.

The Human Science Research Council (2004:3) argues that government, in an attempt to remedy the deficiency of income poverty measures, has shifted towards indicators development. The indicators measure the difference and eventually, the impact social assistance is making. The experience of poverty and powerlessness is perpetuated by the isolation and exclusion poor people find themselves in. Unemployment can be seen as both the cause and result of poverty and indigence. It is a cause since joblessness causes people not to have income and unable to pay for proper housing, food, medical care and education. It is a result because lack of proper housing and sanitation will lead to poor health.

The continuing challenges of poverty have marked the urban landscape for at least half a century (Huchzemeyer & Karam 2006:01). The contributing factors towards poverty have been war and large-scale displacement. Informal development has overtaken formal development, resulting in the majority of sub-Saharan African urban population residing in informal settlements (Lasserve, 2006).

The HSRC (2004:1) highlights that “the experience of poverty is multi-dimensional. The inability to access income remains one of the most obvious expressions of poverty. Poverty definitions typically refer to the absence of access to natural resources, capital, such as land, or to the importance of social and intellectual capital and even the climate of democracy and security necessary to enhance the capabilities of the poor and excluded”. There is a dimension of poverty that recognises that the poorest in the nation do not have access to state assistance as expected. They could be too poor to even care about what is happening around them.

There are estimated poverty rates for each municipality (HSRC, 2004). The Western Cape has the most of municipalities with the lowest poverty rates. These include areas such as Stellenbosch (23%) and Saldanha Bay (25%). The city with the lowest poverty rate is Cape Town (30%). Pretoria and Johannesburg have somewhat higher rates of 35 % and 38 % respectively, while Durban has a rate of 44 %. The poorest municipality is Ntabankulu in the Eastern Cape, where 85 % of its residents live below the poverty line (www.nelsonmandela.org).

According to De Beer (2008:11), the experience of economic exclusion by indigent households is often linked to exclusion from access to basic services. Given the primary role municipalities have in providing such services, through rapidly increasing access to services, they can have a major impact on reducing the exclusion of indigents. There is the other contrary aspect that efforts at poverty alleviation may bring some relief, but soon the poor will regress to their initial state. “A society in which large sections depend on social welfare cannot sustain its development” (Mbeki, 2004). According to Stats SA household survey (2013), the number of people receiving social grants increased from 12.7 % to 30.2 % in 2013. The percentage translates into one third of South Africans, a number that is unreasonably high and unsustainable.

Rakodi and Loyd (2002:37) argue that the quality of life of poor people is influenced by what local governments do. As a result, the relationship between the poor and local government is critical to their well-being because municipalities provide a conducive environment for economic growth. As a legal imperative, many municipalities have developed indigent policies, which are aimed at ensuring that households with little or no income at all can be identified and should be

able to access basic municipal services. In most areas, all users get a certain amount of free water and electricity. The subsidised amount could be enough for their most basic needs. Those who consume a lot must pay for the extra water and electricity used. This translates to the fact that the poor who use very little, pay nothing or very little.

2.8.1 Moral imperatives

According to Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2003:12), the pillar of a progressive democracy is the provision of basic human rights for all people. All human beings are equal before the law and are entitled to basic government services. Norms and standards clearly stipulate the action and conduct of municipal services as far as service delivery is concerned. Morally, municipal officials are expected to treat people the way they would love to be treated. The key principle is that of providing free basic services to every citizen, regardless of their ability to pay.

2.8.2 Pragmatic imperatives

The creation of metropolitan municipalities around South Africa presents an opportunity to address poverty because it creates a new environment with economic opportunities for policies that can be implemented across the city. The municipality will have to deal with the issue of indigence as sensibly and realistically as possible and with a lot of practicality.

2.8.3 Financial imperatives

It is more efficient to support the provision of services to the poor than it is to pay for the consequences of failing to do so (Van Ryneveld *et al.*, 2003:12). Service delivery protests have been getting violent lately whereby communities act in an inconsiderate way. For example, in their quest for a clinic, a community destroys a library or a municipal building. Bob Marley (1975) says in his song that “a hungry man is an angry man”. The government programmes should also be complemented by education that will groom responsible citizens. Risk assessment plan should always be implemented to mitigate the danger of angry communities. Vandalising government infrastructure has negative impact on taxpayer’s money and delays government priority programme.

2.8.4 Governance imperatives

A government is trusted with the lives of citizens. In every way, it should be people-centred and acknowledge that people’s economic status will never be the same. The interventions designed should be based on the need analysis model.

2.9 HEALTH PROBLEMS AND POVERTY

Lack of proper basic services has a major impact on the health of individuals and this might add the burden of cost to government in treating sicknesses. At the moment, the budget of the Department of Health for unsanitary housing, social exclusion and inadequate nutrition is determined by strong links between health and income. There are strong links between health and income as they determine the opportunity for families and individuals to thrive.

The effects of poverty are serious. Children who grow up in poverty suffer more persistent, frequent and severe health problems than do children who grow up under better financial circumstances. The signs and symptoms of poverty in infants include a low birth weight, which is associated with many preventable mental and physical disabilities. Not only are these infants more likely to be irritable or sickly, they are also more likely to die before their first birthday. Children raised in poverty tend to miss school more often because of illness. These children also have a much higher rate of accidents than other children. They are twice as likely to have impaired vision and hearing, iron deficiency anaemia and higher than normal levels of lead in the blood, which can impair brain function.

For the development of the land and many other enterprises including health and standards of the population, water is essential. The Department of Water Affairs instituted a programme on water supply and sanitation, which aims to ensure that all South Africans have access to adequate potable water. The amount is given as 20-25 litres per day, no more than 200 metres from the household with an adequate safe sanitation facility per site over the next nine years (Department of Water Affairs, 2007:76).

2.10 INDIGENT POLICIES OF METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITIES

According to the national framework for Indigent policy (2005:2), municipalities provide a full range of services that will influence the lives of indigents. For example, the provision of support to newly-established businesses such as assisting with drawing of business plans and linking the new business with potential funders. These enable business people to function effectively, while creating and enhancing employment economic growth, which benefit indigents in the long term.

Table 2.2: Overview on indigent framework in metropolitan municipalities

Municipality	Monthly Social Package	Duration	Exit programme
Buffalo	Free electricity Free Water Free sanitation No property rates Free refuse removal Free grave	12 months	None
Cape Town	Free 50kw of electricity + R30 Subsidy Free 6kl of Water No property rates	12 months	None
Erkurrhuleni	Free 100kw of electricity Free 9kl of Water Free 9kl of sewerage No property rates Free refuse removal	18 months	None
Mangaung	Free 50kw of electricity Free 10kl of Water Free 10kl of sewerage No property rates Free refuse removal Free grave	None	There is a programme

Source: created by the researcher

Generally, these municipalities subsidise their indigents with a stipulated amount of water and electricity. They provide services required for basic survival. They consider the value of the property hence they do not charge property rates. It is only Buffalo municipality that is silent about the quantity it provides, but just like all the other municipalities implementing the indigent programme, they indicate that the municipal council will review and approve the policy when it is due.

2.10.1 Indigent policy of City of Cape Town

The City of Cape Town is a large urban area with high population density. Due to the variety of services rendered and production made in the city, tourists, skilled and unskilled labour flock to the city. There is an intense movement of people, goods, services and extensive development,

multiple business districts and industrial areas. The city has strong interdependent social and economic linkages among its constituencies. Those include the Cape Metropolitan Council, Blaauwberg, Central Business District, Helderberg, Oorstenberg, South Peninsula and Tygerberg. The aim of the City of Cape Town indigent policy is to ensure that even the poorest of the poor have their rights upheld and basic needs met, while protecting resource use for the next generations.

According to the Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2013:9), “the Indigent Policy provides a safety net to the poorest section of the population”. It structures the city taxes, tariffs and grants to ensure that the provision of affordable services is financially viable. The indigent policy builds the institutional structure that guarantees social, financial and environmental security for a specific period. The city’s indigent policy is not just in the interests of the poor, it is in the interest of everyone. Every aspect of council business that influences the lives of poor people is addressed by the scope of the indigent policy.

2.10.2 Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality: Indigent support

Buffalo municipality is located in the Eastern Cape Province of South Africa. According to the Local Government handbook (2013), “Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality’s population is 755 200 with unemployment rate of 35.10 percent”. The scope of this indigent policy extends to all indigent households within Buffalo City Municipality, rather than individuals. Whether registered as indigent with Buffalo City Municipality or not, efforts are made to ensure that all who qualify as indigents are recognised and receive all services, grants and rebates they are entitled to. The definition of an indigent household in Buffalo City is as determined from time to time by the council. However, it is realised that the implementation of the indigent policy should be in conjunction with other policies of the municipality. This will also serve as an important component of the funding to be used to subsidise the provision of free basic services to the indigents.

The objective of the policy is an attempt to close the gap between those who are indigents and other citizens of the Buffalo City Municipality through targeted assistance with free allocations of electricity, water and other services, together with broader-based access to housing, community services, employment initiatives and basic health care. The long-term objective is to move those who are indigents away from the need for free basic services and other support measures into a more positive developmental role as rate-paying citizens of the community. The municipality does not have enough budget for dependant households. If indigents gain economic

growth through employment (self or others), they are removed from the indigent register and further pay municipal services, rates and taxes.

2.10.3 Indigent support policy of Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality

According to the Ekurhuleni Municipality Indigent Support Policy (2013:3), the indigent support policy, like in all municipalities, is a legal imperative. It is a tool designed to ensure that some aspects of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, in terms of service delivery and access to such basic services, are realised. Due to the incidence of poverty, the indigent policy remains a critical tool. The indigent support policy responds to the Bill of Rights in its attempt to discharge the government's mandate (Ekurhuleni Municipality Indigent Support policy, 2013:2).

The objective of the indigent support policy is to ensure the provision of basic services to the community in a sustainable manner, within the financial and administrative capacity of the Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality. It is also to ensure that the establishment of procedures and guidelines for the effective of subsidisation of basic service charges to approved indigent households are within budgetary and intergovernmental grant guidelines.

The Ekurhuleni Municipality Indigent Support Policy (2013) outlines the following as the guiding principles for the formulation of an indigent support policy:

- The indigent support policy must be formulated in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) and other related legislation. The policy developers acknowledge that it should be developed in line with other policies and aligned with already existing ones so that it complements them.
- The Municipality offers indigent support to registered households only and the support offered as cost effective, fair, equitable and as justifiable as possible. The subsidising of minimum service levels should not result in the creation of a massive bureaucratic administration.
- The duration for assistance is 36 months and only the council of the municipality may review and amend the qualification criteria for indigent support based on the informed developments.
- The joint gross income of all the household members will be considered before approval is granted.
- The municipality will punish anyone found to have provided false information in the application process.

- The Municipality conducts household profiling and assessments in order to verify new applications and existing approved indigents against any relevant external data source.

The council also determines the other social tariffs based on the availability of funds for assistance to the indigents. The services include sports grounds, pools, fire protection, transport, market, museums, mayor's relief fund, cemeteries and crematoria, hiring of halls, and damage to property as a result of natural disaster. Any other services as determined by council might include emergency and ambulance services.

Unlike with the City of Tshwane, Ekurhuleni re-evaluates the subsidy after 36 months from the date on which relief was authorised in order to assess the need for the continuation of relief in terms of this policy. The Health and Social Development Department must complete the re-verification prior to the expiry of the 36 months approved status period. In the event where the socio-economic status of the household is improved beyond the indigent threshold, the applicant has a responsibility to apply for cancellation of the indigent status as prescribed. After 36 months' period, as contained in the policy, the debtor may apply to be de-registered. The application for de-registration will be administrated by the Health and Social Development unit of the municipality who will advise finance accordingly, where after the affected units will be requested to restore the full services at the property (Municipality Indigent Support Policy, 2013:12-13).

2.10.4 Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality Indigent policy draft

The municipal council is obliged to prioritise the basic needs of the community. At the same time promotion of the social and economic development of the community would occur. The draft indigent policy was developed to ensure that all residents and communities in the municipality have access to at least the minimum level of basic municipal services as required by Section 152(1) (b) and 153(b) of the Constitution (1996). The researcher can conclude that all indigent policies are a constitutional mandate.

In 2001, the Centre for Development Support (CDS) conducted research on the practice of non-payment of municipal services in order to build capacity of local government political office bearers and career officials. The purpose of this research was not only to investigate the economic consequences of non-payment, but also to explore payment practices. Possible solutions to non-payment were also sought. Questionnaires were distributed to households in thirty-two sampled local authorities in South Africa and in-depth interviews were held with financial managers at the different municipalities (<http://www.cds.org>).

The non-payment for municipal services has negative socio-economic impact. A national baseline survey was conducted among 1599 households. Concurrently, in-depth interviews were held with finance managers. The core finding was that in most cases poverty is the main cause of non-payment. Government has acknowledged this fact and, as a mitigating step, has introduced an unconditional equitable share grant that is allocated to local government. However, as reflected during workshop consultation with government and civil society, many municipalities struggle with the formulation and implementation of an indigent policy that operationalises the equitable share grant (www.sabinet.co.za).

Four case study sites were selected and a multi-pronged qualitative approach was employed. With regard to the formulation of the policy, findings indicate that the unconditional nature of the equitable share grant, a need for socio-economic research and the qualifying criteria for allocation, unemployment, consultation and communication all impede this process. Stumbling blocks in respect of implementation of policy are the processes of identifying the poor and verifying applications. Furthermore, issues of concern are monitoring the process and also arrears in account payments. The output of the study is a strategy outlining guidelines for the design and implementation of the policy and suggestions on how best to meet the service delivery needs of the poor.

Monitoring is also necessary for ensuring that the manner in which indigent policies are managed by municipalities such that they meets the objective of the grant and do not endanger fiscal sustainability. This is crucial if the indigent policy is to be used as a tool with which poverty-related problems of non-payment of services can effectively be addressed. More work is required to develop the necessary structures and systems for effectively managing indigent policies at the municipal sphere of government.

2.11 LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

Government prioritises poverty alleviation and the rendering of basic services to inhabitants of towns and cities who cannot afford to pay for essential services. This is clearly reflected in several policy documents such as the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and the new enabling legislation for municipalities. The need to cater for the poor is continually expressed at national, regional and local conferences.

It is critical to have an understanding of the statutory framework informing the implementation of indigent policy. Although there are a variety of policies which have a bearing on assistance of indigents, the highlight will be on the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), the Framework for Municipal Indigent Policy (2005), the National Indigent Policy Guidelines, Public Finance Management Act (1 of 1999), Municipal Finance Management Act (56 of 2003), Budget Policy, Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000), Reconstruction and Development Programme and National Development Plan.

2.11.1 The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996)

Government obligations are set out in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996). It gives specific attention to basic human rights, which are contained in the Bill of Rights. Act 108 clearly stipulates that everyone has the right to have access to health care services, sufficient food and water and social security, including, if they are unable to support themselves and their dependants, appropriate social assistance. The state must take reasonable legislative and other measures within its available resources, to achieve the realisation of these goals. Service delivery should be implemented in a sustainable manner; among these is the obligation to cater for indigents. The constitution further commits to improve the quality of life of all citizens.

In terms of the Constitution (1996), South African municipalities are entitled to an equitable share of revenue raised nationally. This equitable share enables municipal officials to provide basic services and perform their functions. Although the Constitution does not define basic services, for most municipalities this includes potable water supply, road access to dwellings, sewage and refuse removal and storm water drainage. To manage the equitable share properly, every municipality must adopt an indigent support policy.

Fundamental values such as equality and human dignity compel municipal policies to be aligned to them. These values are also enshrined in the constitution. Chapter 1 Section 3 states that all citizens are equally entitled to the rights, privileges and benefits of citizenship. The Bill of Rights in the constitution clearly articulates all the rights that every human being is entitled to despite their nationality, colour race and sex.

2.11.2 The National Indigent Policy Framework

A National Indigent Policy Framework was announced in September 2005 and implementation guidelines shortly thereafter were developed. The policy framework (2005) states: “the overall objective is to substantially eradicate those elements of poverty over which local government has

control by the year 2012". Given the definition of the indigent stated in this policy, it implies that all should have access to basic water supply, sanitation, energy and refuse services. All municipalities should undertake major initiatives to facilitate the access of the indigent to land for housing, in cooperation with provincial government.

2.11.3 The National Indigent Policy Guidelines

The guidelines followed immediately after the policy framework. The purpose for development of the guidelines was to operationalise the framework and indicate the procedure followed during the implementation. It clearly indicates what to do and how to identify the indigents until the exiting from indigent register. According to the National Indigent Policy guidelines (2005:7), indigents should be involved in the planning phase and implementation of the Indigent policy at the municipal level, particularly the free basic services. The national and provincial departments cannot be left out, as they are stakeholders supporting the municipalities.

The guidelines should not replace the individual municipality indigent policies, but assist as a point of reference when indigent policies are developed. National Indigent Policy Guidelines guideline (2005:9) explains that the guidelines are not a template that a municipality can generally implement, but provide options for development of their own. The guidelines acknowledge the uniqueness of each municipality and expect them to come up with plans that are most suitable.

2.11.4 Municipal Finance Management Act

This Act finds its relevance at the municipal government, which is the third sphere of government. It could be Metro/City, District or local municipality. Section 16 of the Municipal Finance Management Act (56 of 2003) requires that municipalities approve an annual budget before the start of the financial year. A municipality must adopt, maintain and implement a budget policy. Watt *et al.* (2002:2) state citizens delegate power and public finance to government and hold it to account for those resources under its control.

As the indigent policy is implemented in municipality, everything pertaining to the budget should be in line with this Act. The municipality should always account for its actions; hence, the Municipal Manager is regarded as the accounting officer. The Chief Financial Officer handbook (2013) agrees that, in terms of the Municipal Finance Management Act (MFMA), the Municipal Manager is the accounting officer. The CFO certifies the correctness of municipal reports that includes, but not limited to, assisting the Executive Mayor in preparing the budget,

informing the public about approved budget and developing the Service Delivery and budget Improvement plan (SDBIP).

2.11.5 Public Finance Management Act

The primary objective of the Finance Management Amendment Act, (No. 29 of 1999) is to provide a legislative framework, which seeks to provide for the regulation and management of government finances at both national and provincial government levels. At the municipality level, financial management is regulated through the Municipal Finance Management Act No. 56 of 2003 (MFMA). The North West University Public Finance Study Guide, (2011:2) notes that although the Act “has a specific bearing on national and provincial government, it does contain a provision that relates directly to municipal finance”.

In addition, the Act seeks to ensure that all government revenue, expenditure, assets and liabilities are managed effectively and that there is accountability for government’s finances. The Act also outlines the primary responsibilities of persons entrusted with financial management in government and what measures should be taken in instances where these persons do not observe the Act.

2.11.6 Municipal Systems Act

In terms of Section 74 of the Municipal Systems Act, No. 32 of 2000 (Municipality Act), municipal councils are required to adopt and implement a tariff policy. Section 74(i) and 74(ii) stipulate that each municipality is required to take into account the subsidisation of poor households. In pursuit of this objective of subsidising poor households, municipalities must implement indigent support. The structures of the municipality should give provision, which strives to empower local government to fulfil its constitutional mandate. The structure will facilitate systems and processes that will build a robust local government system, which can provide democratic and accountable government for local communities.

2.11.7 Reconstruction and Development Programme

The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) came into effect because of the first democratically elected government in South Africa following the 1994 general elections. According to ANC (1994:16), the RDP serves as an integrated, coherent socio-economic policy framework that aims to mobilise the people of South Africa as well as the resources of the country. It further ensures that the legacy of the apartheid regime in the country is completely eradicated.

The RDP also had as its objective to develop South African human resources, meet people basic needs, build the economy and democratise the state and society. The nation embarked on the process of building a democratic, non-racial and non-sexist future. The country was defined by colonialism, apartheid, racism, inequality, socio economic challenges and this process provided a tool that would bridge the gap these challenges brought.

In essence, the RDP provided specific attention on the provision of electricity and water services for the poor, particularly those who were previously disadvantaged. Through the RDP, the government committed to electrification that resulted in several specific policy documents and programmes such as Electricity Basic Services and Support Services and Support Tariff (Free basic Services) policy available from the Department of Mineral and Energy.

Notwithstanding the government's efforts of providing basic services, South African economy is still in its initial stages of growth, with the unemployment levels still relatively high in the country, the RDP remains relevant as a point of reference with regard to South Africa's vision and aspirations. South Africa aims at building a country that is able to provide services to its people, especially at all levels of government, including the local municipality level.

2.11.8 The National Development Plan

According to Paton (2012), former Minister in the Presidency, Trevor Manuel, released the final version of the National Development Plan in Parliament. He indicated, "the plan states that movement towards an inclusive and dynamic economy requires the country urgently to launch the virtuous cycle that will allow it to move to a new growth trajectory". The National Development Plan (2012) is a strategic document, which the South African government put together outlining the government's vision for the country as far as 2030 is concerned and how the government intends to provide basic services to its people.

Of particular essence about the NDP is that, it clearly provides a roadmap to be followed by different stakeholders (government, business, civil society and development partners) in working together to build the nation and contribute to the realisation of this collectively -defined desired destination (vision). In addition, through the NDP, it is envisaged that all sectors of South African society will rally fully behind the 2030 vision and towards the attainment of the commonly defined goal of eliminating poverty and reducing inequality by 2030. In conclusion, the NDP will ensure that South Africa's economy is strengthened such that poverty would be eliminated and equality improved (National Development Plan Vision for 2030, 2011).

2.12 CHAPTER SUMMARY

In summary, this chapter provided an overview of the South African government machinery as well as how it functions. The concepts of indigence and poverty were clearly articulated as critical concepts underlined in this study. In addition, the legislative frameworks that guide the formulation and implementation of the Indigent Policy were articulated in detail. Various Indigent Policies of metropolitan municipalities were also dealt with in detail. In the next chapter, the focus is on the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane.

CHAPTER 3

THE INDIGENT POLICY OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter dealt with global and national perspectives on indigent policy. In this chapter, an outline of how the City of Tshwane (CoT) implements its indigent programme is discussed in detail. Since Ward 97 of the CoT is in Mamelodi Township, urban poverty and the objectives of indigent support of the CoT are discussed. The chapter further discusses documents required and the criteria for registration. The social package and how the indigent programme is funded are discussed. In conclusion, the chapter elaborates on how to exit the programme and measures the municipality has put in place to make indigents economically active.

3.2 URBAN POVERTY

Unemployment, poverty and inequality should not be addressed separately in South Africa. Unemployment is a major challenge in South Africa. Job creation is a serious challenge for the government and unemployment poses a social risk. According to Mufamadi (2002:11), the government faces stubborn unemployment and municipalities are in crisis with cumulative debt. The developmental state has to ensure that all citizens, especially the poor and other vulnerable groups, have access to basic services. In order to address the challenge, Stevens *et al.* (2006) indicate that “the only route to alleviate urban poverty is to adopt integrated urban development where a project or a programme undertakes several activities in a coordinated way, thus increasing the linkage between local authorities and poor communities”. The war on poverty would not be won with silos approach. Rather focused and concerted efforts considering all aspects will make the intervention a success.

Lane (2006:34) adds that urban policy should be developed in the battle against urban poverty, however states that a policy alone will not solve the problem but at least if adequately designed and implemented it can contribute partially to a solution to the plight of the poor. A country with past imbalances and lack of opportunity for all such as South Africa will not only have to rely on policy but use every resource at its disposal to fight poverty.

3.3 INDIGENT POLICY OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE

According to Erasmus (2004:17-19), the City of Tshwane commissioned Integrated Community Development (ICD) to research on feasibility of the indigent programme. ICD recommended that CoT come up with a programme addressing the needs of the most disadvantaged in its area.

According to Pillay (2003), the City of Tshwane officially recommended and approved the integration of the indigent programme and basic services package as part of its poverty alleviation programme. The review, approval and application of the CoT's indigent policy are part of reasonable measures, within which resources are taken by the municipality in pursuance of the constitutional obligations of rendering services to the needy.

The above argument means policy should focus on addressing the needs of the poor in totality rather than focusing on their basic needs. If people are not able to care for their most basic needs for survival, what more with safety and security needs if Maslow's hierarchy of needs was the way to go by? The poor should not only be given food, electricity water but also be empowered so that they do not remain dependant on the government forever.

De Beer (2008:13) views the state of the indigent programme in the CoT as follows: "the Tshwane Municipality is in the process of developing programmes that will support economically unproductive indigent family members". The aim is to reduce the number of indigent families through provision of free basic services, skills development, the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) and other poverty reduction strategies in partnership with non-governmental organisations (NGOs), business sector and training institutions.

The municipality has approved the appointment of more social workers who will be responsible for the registration, assessment, evaluation and exit of the indigents from the indigent programme. The appointment of Social Workers and implementation of other poverty alleviation programmes in the City of Tshwane is the commitment by the municipality to assist the needy. Community workers such as the Community Development practitioners, Community Development Workers, EPWP volunteers and pastors and traditional leaders have a role to identify the indigent households and report to municipality, while the Social Workers assess and recommend the intervention.

De Beer (2008:14), further cites that the municipality will link emergency services to the indigent support programme by rendering emergency medical and ambulance standby services to vulnerable and poverty stricken areas. The researcher can deduce that the municipality aims at

going beyond basic care but also assist with medical needs. This is good for those because the poor do not have medical aids which will enable them choice as far as medical services is concerned.

3.4 THE OBJECTIVES OF THE INDIGENT POLICY

According to Framework for Municipal Indigent Policy (2005:13), indigence is defined as the inability to afford the essential package in the absence of support from a second person. The definition of indigence in a given place does not remain the same. It does not differ because people's circumstances change, but because the costs of services also change. Indeed, recent increase in electricity, water, rates and taxes means that more and more people around South Africa, and elsewhere, will be defined soon as indigents. The City of Tshwane Indigent policy wants to achieve the following:

3.4.1 Assisting the poor

The 1994 democratically elected ANC government has the interest of the poor at heart. This is attested by slogans such as "A better life for all". The poor constitute majority in South Africa. Neglecting them would be defying the mission of government of the day. Many government programmes and projects have been put in place in order to address the challenges of poverty.

3.4.1.1 The advantages of assisting poor individuals and households

According to Latakomo (2011), the municipality will develop an intimate knowledge of poor residents through the indigent registration programme and can use this knowledge to advance their interests. It encompasses an area, which happens to include a large number of well-resourced private enterprises, tertiary institutions, non-profit organisations and development partners. The researcher can deduce that the knowledge derived from implementing this programme will assist the CoT to design interventions that are evidence-based. Future programming will be informed by the present status quo.

3.4.2 Improve access to the service

Van Ryneveld *et al.* (2003) reveals that the indigent programme is part of the city's indigent policy, that is implemented in line with national government's call to alleviate poverty. It is in this regard that the Health and Social Development unit of the City of Tshwane is ensuring that service points in all city regions are ready to register indigent households during weekdays. The indigents must always be able to physically, or through different communication channels,

access municipal services. When they encounter challenges or want to register, they should know where to find officials who will assist them.

The Department of Public Service and Administration came up with the framework for Service delivery, which is called Batho Pele. “Batho Pele” is a Sotho word for people first. The approach is people driven and centred. Pretorius and Schurink (2007:19) indicate, “the initiative strives towards moving public servants to pursue excellence in service delivery”. One of the eight principles of Batho Pele is access”. According to this principle, everyone should have equal access to services they are entitled to, despite their economic, social or religious status. The Department of Public Service and Administration has the framework on its website <http://www.dpsa.gov.za/batho-pele/index.asp>. Batho Pele is a service delivery framework for making decisions about delivering public services to the many South Africans who do not have access to them. It further aims at rectifying inequalities in the distribution of existing services. The constitution of the country places the responsibility on government to ensure that such services are expanded progressively to all municipalities, despite limited resources. The government’s standpoint is to move progressively towards universal access to basic services.

According to the National Indigent Policy Framework (2005:15), for the municipality to have desired outputs and impact, the indigent service must be properly functional. The CoT requires qualified personnel, who will exclusively be dedicated to the programme, and to allocate a budget to implement the programme. The CoT is coordinating road shows that raise awareness of the indigent programme. They intend fast-tracking the registration of indigent households. Mostly, they are held during weekends to cater to households that are unavailable during the week.

3.5 DOCUMENTS FOR REGISTRATION

In the City of Tshwane website (<http://www.tshwane.gov.za>), it is indicated that on the 29 September 2011, the council approved the revised indigent policy. The policy provides guidance on the identification, registration process and exit strategy of poor households that are unable to pay for municipal services. The municipality also conducted public participation so that the communities can claim ownership of the policy document. It can be deduced that the local government implements service delivery with the principles of public participation and consultation that depict pillars of good governance.

According to City of Tshwane Indigent Policy Review (2010:5), indigents should submit certified copies of the following documents when applying: proof of income or, if unemployed, a sworn affidavit indicating low income or unemployment; identity document of spouse and dependants, the latest municipal account as the system is linked to the municipal account. Birth certificates of children and proof of their school attendance such as a school report or a letter from the school are also required. When applying for the indigent programme, proofs of marital status (such as marriage certificate, divorce certificate, proof of customary union/living together or a death certificate, as applicable) are required.

After submission of the required documents and assessment and verification by the committee, the household can be registered on the Indigent data base. The indigent register represents a powerful information tool and, with minor adjustments, it could be more powerful. One possible use is to connect members of indigent households with possible job opportunities and or training opportunities. The Human Science Research Council Indigent Exit Strategy (2010:5) argues that the overall potential for this should not be exaggerated. The challenge is that there are very few permanent employment positions available and a lack of sustainable employment opportunities.

3.6 REGISTRATION PROCESS

The City of Tshwane Indigent Policy Review (2010:5) indicates that for the household to be registered as indigent, it needs to meet all the following criteria: the applicant must be a South African citizen with an identity document. The Minister of Finance annually announces an increase in the amount of social grants during the budget speech, including old age grant.

This would require the municipal council to also review the policy timeously to be relevant. The gross monthly income of all members of the household should not exceed the joint amount of two state old-age grants and foster care grant. The former Minister of Finance, Pravin Gordhan, indicated in the 2014 budget speech that the old age grant was R1370 per month when a person is above 75 years and R1350 when below 75 years. The speech of the minister clarified the amount meant by the municipality when it uses income as a measure for qualification criteria. If the indigent's household income exceeds the amount as determined by the policy, the household does not qualify.

The applicant, as well as any other members of the household, should not own fixed property other than the one in which they reside. The applicant applying on behalf of a household must be eighteen years or older, except if the child is appointed as executor by a court of law. The person

applying should be the registered owner, the municipal tenant. A child from a child-headed household who is eighteen years and older may apply and have the household registered as indigent. The municipality shall be entitled to withdraw any approval for indigent support if the indigent fails to comply or contravenes the provision of the municipal policy or any other laws, regulations or bylaws, or provides the municipality with false and incorrect information. If the indigent fails to pay the excess consumption of subsidised service support without submitting written valid reasons to the municipality, the services can be withdrawn. The municipality will debit those benefiting wrongfully from the service.

3.7 THE SOCIAL PACKAGE

According to the City of Tshwane Indigent Policy Review (2012:8), the indigents in its jurisdiction will get 100 percent rebate on refuse removal and free basic services. The registered indigents will receive a pre-determined quantity of electricity, water and sanitation free of charge on a monthly basis.

The CoT is taking extra measures in an attempt to make services more affordable to indigent households. The additional measures will be implemented on availability of resources. The infrastructure together with water and sanitation unit of the CoT will assist indigent households to change from conventional meters to prepaid meters by providing the meter for free (100kw h per month). The City of Tshwane renders prepaid electricity services indicated on the website (<http://prepairedelectricity.co.za>). The website indicates that it costs R2100 to install the prepaid meter for paying residents, while indigents get the meters for free. Installation of a prepaid meter takes two to eight weeks. Metered water services and sanitation will be reduced to 12 kl per month flow rate for poor households to address affordability of their current monthly accounts. For purposes of refuse removal, registered indigent households will be provided with a free dustbin. According to City of Tshwane Indigent Policy Review (2012:8), debt collection or credit control measures will not be instituted against the indigent household as long as consumption over and above the free use is paid in full.

An indigent application by the household will nullify the credit control and debt collection actions, but current monthly accounts must be paid every month. The Social Development Department, which is part of the committee that monitors the programme, will recommend that the arrears of registered indigents be written off. Applications must be processed and finalised within six months from the date of application. Benefits to households will be linked to social,

economic and educational services. Child-headed households will be assisted to manage the consumption of services as they may exceed the limited amount of free basic services.

The City of Tshwane Indigent Policy Review (2012:18) further indicates that the rental arrears of a tenant with a valid lease agreement and registered on the indigent register of the CoT, will be written off. The monthly rent should then be calculated at 25 percent of the family income or the full cost recovery rental of the specific housing scheme, depending on which one is lower. The minimum rental that will be considered is 25 percent of the government pension.

According to CoT Indigent Policy Review (2012:5), the assistance provided by the CoT for indigent burials/cremations are as follows: transfer of the body from where a person died (within the borders of Tshwane) to the premise of the contractor for storage. The question that arises is what happens if the indigent dies outside the municipal jurisdiction? The medical referee, including the official registration of death, provides all relevant services. Also provided are the transfer of the body from the contractor's premises to the deceased's home and to the cemetery, supplying the grave, coffin lowering device, gazebo and ten chairs and a hearse, and ensuring that the funeral takes place during the week.

The Department of Human Settlements will assist all registered indigents, child-headed and pensioner-headed households that have challenges with change of ownership.

3.8 FUNDING FOR THE INDIGENT PROGRAMME

Section 214(1) (a) (c) of the Constitution (1996) explains that an "Act of parliament must provide for the equitable division of revenue raised nationally among the national, provincial and local sphere of government". The constitution further provides for any other allocations to provinces, local government or municipalities from the national government and a share of that revenue and any conditions on which those allocations may be made.

3.8.1 Equitable share

"The equitable share formula takes into account the cost of providing free basic services, however, according to its own parameters, including its own threshold for defining indigence. The municipality receives equitable share received in terms of the Division of Revenue Act" (CoT Indigent policy, 2010). The equitable share from the national treasury is the main contribution of the national budget in the financing of household amenities for municipalities. According to Malehase (2013:6), in the 2013 budget, the equitable share provided a subsidy for

every household with a monthly income of less than R2300 or about 59 percent of all households.

According to Malehase (2013), “the equitable share will enable municipalities to provide basic services to poor households. The basic services component funds (R277.78) is the provision of free basic services for poor households”. This component provides an allocation for every poor household in a municipality to cover the cost of providing a package of free basic water (R87.90), sanitation (R73.25), energy (R56.24) and refuse removal (R60.39). All municipalities are allocated the same amount per poor household. Only poor households are included in the calculation of this component, as it is perceived that non-poor consumers should be able to pay for their own basic services. The structure of the proposed Local Government Equitable Shares formula (LGES) would make it possible to annually update the cost estimates for each of the basic services funded (Malehase, 2013).

The municipality needs to be financially viable and this simply means that it has to have the necessary finances to sustain the programme.

The municipality can also partner with development agencies and donor funders operating within the City of Tshwane so that the budget is not sourced from only the Equitable share. The municipality must make allocation on its annual operating budget to subsidise the tariffs of the registered indigents. The arrears of services for the beneficiaries of the indigent programme may be written off against bad debt. The municipality must make provision in its annual operating budget to assist applying households to change ownership and the attainment of letters of authority. The Human Settlement and Legal Services units of the municipality will administer the issues pertaining to housing.

3.9 EXITING THE INDIGENT PROGRAMME

There are circumstances that can cause indigent households to be terminated from the indigent register. When the account holder dies, it is the responsibility of the family members to make the municipality aware of the death. The other reason that warrants termination from the register is when the property registered is sold within 24 months. It is a possibility that the buyer’s status might be different from the previous owner. The benefits will be terminated if it is discovered that, after approval, the person applying on behalf of the household has supplied false information. The municipality will debit the household that unduly benefits from the indigent programme (CoT, 2012:9).

Pillay (2010) indicates that the municipality could not assist indigents to exit the indigent programme and be able to pay for municipal services. In the process of exiting majority were accumulating debt. Looking at the HSRC expertise, the CoT commissioned it to come up with the Indigent Exit strategy (IES). The IES was developed as a means of considering the nature of poverty in Tshwane. The objectives were to examine the CoT indigent policy relative to that of other metropolitan municipalities, to review the current poverty reduction interventions and take into account what could be the role of the CoT relative to other spheres of government. The HSRC Indigent Exit Strategy (2010:1) elaborates by stating that the main pillars of sustainable assistance to the poor are training, employment referral services, strategic small, micro and medium enterprises, investments, individual commitments, airtime subsidies, communications and SMEs coaching, intensifying the role of social workers and rethinking procurement for household services.

3.9.1 Training

The scope for intervention recognises that although there is a global trend towards local government playing a greater role in poverty reduction, much of this relates to the provision of subsidised services and improvement of the residential and business environment. Even though the CoT and other role players, such as businesses and government departments, are responsible for poverty reduction programmes initiatives, which will address joblessness and lack of appropriate skills in Tshwane, a lot still needs to be done.

Adults and their families should participate in continuing education in order to promote a culture of development and lifelong learning. A community survey was conducted in 2008 and the findings were that 0,3 percent of adults aged 20 in Tshwane were receiving some form of non-academic training or capacity building. Presumably, more benefited from training. The reality is that the benefits from training of adults are pitifully meagre. There are many advantages of training: it is inexpensive to provide, it stimulates people's interest and ambitions, it provides for positive social engagement and offers a possible growth area for SMMEs. There are limitations as well: receiving training is no guarantee of employment or successful business. Despite the limitations, the municipality aims at ensuring that training happens on a massive scale and there is a placement programme linked to Local Economic Development (LED) which plays an important role in this regard, by ensuring that trainees are placed in other levels of the economic ladder (HSRC, 2010:5).

Human capital capacity building remains critical in the implementation of the indigent programme. Van Dyk (2012) states that: “the workforce will need key skills such as the ability to determine the deeper meaning or significance of what is being expressed”. The acquired skills will improve social intelligence, the ability to connect to others, to sense and stimulate reactions and desired interactions, novel and adaptive thinking, cross-cultural competencies and computational thinking or the ability to translate vast amounts of data into abstract concepts, in order to succeed. There is dire need for skilled employees to be media literate and trans-disciplinary with the ability to understand concepts across multiple disciplines. These will equip them with a design mind-set and the ability to represent and develop tasks and work processes for desired outcomes. The training perspective is not only meant for indigents, but also for municipal officials so that they can also improve how they render the services using the latest information technology.

The training will assist them to improve services utilising latest information technology and social media developments. As the digital community advances, officials are expected to be one step ahead so that their programming can be as effective and efficient as possible.

In reporting the developments in the municipality, the City of Tshwane timeously updates its website. The CoT launched a programme for youth skills development, job creation and entrepreneurship in 2013. It is a public-private partnership, with different role players to ensure that all young people have access to economic opportunities, which will enable them to grow, develop and prosper as participative, responsible and productive citizens. During the launch, the Executive Mayor of Tshwane, Cllr Kgosientsho Ramokgopa said: "I wish to reiterate that all of us have a role to play in youth development, with each and every one of us having different roles and a range of capacities to support and complement one another's efforts". He further indicated that he would like, in particular, to appeal to members of the business community and public sector to continue to support and complement Tshwane's efforts in fighting youth unemployment, poverty and inequality at all levels of society (City of Tshwane Tshepo10000 entrepreneurship programme, 2013). It can be deduced that private -public partnership remains critical in all key populations of the society. In this instance, the municipality is faced with unemployed, unskilled and inexperienced youth, while the business community has resources and services that would allow the youth to gain skills, knowledge and experience required to penetrate the job market.

According to the HSRC Indigent Exit Strategy (2010:6), the Social Development unit of the municipality will assist with the evaluation and assessment of households to check if criteria are

met. This is in order to determine family members who are fit to work, both physically and mentally. Emphasis must be placed on the skills and abilities of each of these members. Profiling of household members should be done and those with similar interest and qualifications grouped so that when potential employers require new staff, the municipality knows where to source them from. Specific programmes should be designed for those with no qualifications. Their training will be responding to what the economy requires the most. The kind of courses may include, but not be limited to the following: shoe making, gardening, painting, catering, bakery and poultry.

3.9.1.1 Life skills training

Life skills that are required to cope with life demands are defined by United Nations Children Fund UNICEF (2012) as “psychosocial abilities for adaptive and positive behaviour that enable individuals to deal effectively with the demands and challenges of everyday life”. The rationale behind life skills training is to make the trained indigents employable. Others would be able to start an enterprise, however these are not the only objectives of the training component.

According to HSRC Indigent Exit Strategy (2010:6), the training should place emphasis on the management of household finances and financial literacy. The purpose of life skills training is to help people to develop the ability to manage their finances more effectively. This is not to suggest that poverty is simply a function of poor money management. However, there is strong evidence to the effect that those poor people who do manage their money effectively feel poverty much less acutely than others. There is also evidence to suggest that this type of training is effective, yet in very short supply. The life skills training will be mandatory for all households entered in the register.

The CoT will collaborate with the private sector and tertiary institutions, through memorandum of understanding and service level agreement, for assistance in sponsoring specialised training courses and in organising them. This corresponds to the recent trend in corporate social investment towards skills development. In fact, in the process of developing the business implementation plan, all possible sources will be explored. Resources could be financial and in kind assistance, whether from other spheres of government, the private sector, donor partners or tertiary institutions.

3.9.1.2 General purpose entrepreneur training

This involves imparting basic skills such as bookkeeping, basic market research and a deepening of financial literacy. It can be deduced that management of finances remains critical in life hence

all these interventions have the element of financial management. The efficacy of this training is well known, yet it is in extreme short supply. It is also reasonably inexpensive to provide. CoT needed to establish partnerships with accredited institutions of higher learning, including further education and training colleges, so that students trained through these institutions can have better qualifications, which will increase their chances of employability and/or starting a business.

The HSRC Indigent Exit strategy (2010:6) adds that specialised provision of vocational training will depend on what is already available, what is the need, and what private sector partners and institution of higher learning are able to provide. However, the shape of the vocational training component will also be conditioned by an informal survey conducted among businesses in Tshwane. CoT should enter into a memorandum of understanding with these role players to ensure that members of indigent households get first preference to training and job placement.

3.9.1.3 Small, micro and medium enterprises (SMMEs)

Nenzhelele (2012) raises a contentious issue in the discipline debates that, “the diverse nature of the economy combined with good infrastructure implies scope for increasing the SMME sector”. The CoT Metropolitan Municipality has prioritised the strategic national goals of job creation and sustainable growth. However, these goals cannot be realised without the creation of growth-oriented SMMEs.

According to HSRC Indigent Exit Strategy (2010:28), there are two main initiatives to support SMMEs in specific situations. At present, the municipality has two main components for achieving the provision of support. The first is township-based Internet cafes. Internet cafes are proven business models in most environments, but lack of capital and business skills means that there are too few of them. Candidates can be sourced from the indigent register, whereby unemployed youth who have some degree of training with computers could be used. The municipality also supports the few existing Internet cafes. The support is in the form of training, technical support, new hardware or a combination.

The second component of SMMEs is the one specialising in training. It cannot be assumed that sufficient capacity exists. The training-of-the-trainer approach could be used to upscale the creation of entrepreneurs. While accredited service providers will provide life skills training courses, the other role of this service provider will be to identify candidates from their initial intakes. These candidates, therefore, will be people from similar circumstances to those whom they will be expected to train in future.

They would have experienced training in their own right and will then receive further support to become both trainers and entrepreneurs, including through business skills courses provided to them by other parties

3.9.1.4 Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP).

The CoT, has made big strides in rolling out a massive job creation project as part of the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP). Without compromising the quality of the product, the EPWP emphasises the use of an appropriate mix of labour and machines, with a preference for labour, which is technically and economically feasible.

The EPWP programme is coordinated by the office of the City Manager of the City of Tshwane. The unit has developed a policy to guide the EPWP rollout. For the EPWP to be effective, the programme needs to be incorporated in all activities of the municipality. The City of Tshwane EPWP draft policy (2012) explains that the policy ensures that plans for the programme become a reality with sound facilitation process. The policy seeks to ensure that relevant departments in Gauteng province support the recruitment and implementation processes. It can be deduced that the municipality collaborates with departments in the social sector to avoid silos approach and strives towards an integrated development of the unit.

The EPWP remains a key initiative in empowering communities, while rolling out much-needed infrastructure. In the 2011/12 financial year, 38 000 job opportunities were envisaged, and for the political term of office ending in 2016 the target is 375 000 job opportunities. The job opportunities will be created through the implementation of projects in the infrastructure, environment, culture and social sectors. Most participants in the EPWP have reaped benefits from being part of this venture. They do not have to travel long distances to work because the projects are carried out in their residential areas; in fact, they seldom incur transport costs.

There is need to have a minimum wage specified for the EPWP volunteers. According to the HSRC midterm review (2007), the total amount of wages had remained more or less constant while the number of workers increased over time. It has been noted that the average wage per work opportunity has declined. In some cases, projects pay stipends only to a few workers, but also record other workers who do not receive either training or benefits as EPWP beneficiaries.

According to Richards *et al.* (2007), there are also challenges of late payments of wages on the EPWP. Due to late payment, some workers opted for lower-paying jobs. All employees will agree that regular and consistent payment allows for better planning and utilisation of money.

3.9.1.5 Community Work Programme (CWP)

The documents containing CWP information are loaded on the cooperative governance and traditional affairs website (<http://www.cogta.gov.za>). The Community Work Programme is an innovation from government to provide a job safety net for unemployed people of working age. The CWP is also a great opportunity for unemployed people who are actively looking for employment opportunities. The programme enables job seekers to have that much-needed extra cash required for searching for full-time employment. Programme participants do pure community work. It is a government programme aimed at tackling poverty and unemployment. The programme provides an employment safety net by giving participants a minimum number of regular days of work, typically two days a week or eight days per month, thus providing a predictable income stream.

The Minister of Labour, Ms Mildred Oliphant, came up with the ministerial determination that clearly stipulates conditions of employment of CWP volunteers. According to Department of labour (2012:6), the ministerial determination contains “the terms and conditions for workers of elementary occupation on EPWP”. The terms and conditions, however, do not apply to staff members on supervision and managers. The purpose of the CWP programmes is to complement government grants, but it does not replace it; it is an on-going programme. WP sites are in marginalised economic areas, both rural and urban, where unemployment is high. Unemployed men and women who qualify to apply for work are eligible to participate in the programme. The worker may not be paid less than the minimum wage rate of R60.00 per day or task. The will be adjusted annually in line with inflation. At present, the rate is R75.00 per task or day. The amount is very little, especially that CWP volunteers do not render their services from Monday to Friday. Some work twice per week, but for people who were not used to getting any single cent it is better than nothing.

3.10 MONITORING

As part of commitment to the indigent programme, the municipality appointed an advisory committee. The advisory committee consists of one representative from the Directorate Financial Services, an area social worker from the Directorate Social Development unit and one representative from the Gauteng Provincial Department of Social Development. The committee was established to evaluate the assessed forms, monitor whether circumstances have improved in a particular family and ensure that the council is not abused.

3.11 CHAPTER SUMMARY

Poor people do not live in a static state of poverty. Annually people transition out of poverty by gaining permanent employment and investing in new business opportunity. At the same time, others regress due to ill health, retrenchments and dismissal. All forms of systems should be employed so that the community does not fall deeper into poverty. This chapter dealt mainly with the implementation of the indigent policy of the CoT. Exiting from the programme was also explained. In the next chapter, the empirical research and findings are discussed.

CHAPTER 4

RESEARCH DESIGN AND RESEARCH RESULTS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter discussed the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane. Chapter 4 discusses the research methodology, which is qualitative in nature, the data collection, analysis and the findings thereof. The interviews questions were responded to and those of the focus group discussions were not responded to because the programme is not implemented in Ward 97. A clear analysis of available data was done. Research ethics were clarified.

4.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research study needs to follow a certain methodology for it to have the desired outcomes. According to Bless and Higson-Smith (1995:102), research methodology is regarded as investigative method, which has immediate practical applications to solve some real-life problems and to increase scientific understanding on the research that has been undertaken. The research methodology describes the approach followed throughout the project.

According to Burns and Grove (2003:488), “methodology includes the design, setting, sample, methodological limitation and the data collection and analysis techniques in a study”. Undoubtedly, methodology is used as a significant tool in the research process and no research can succeed without the right one. Holloway (2005:293) adds by explaining it as “a framework of theories and principles on which methods and procedures are based on”. Methodology leads to desired results as the appropriate design guides the implementation process.

The aim of this research was to understand and describe options and challenges experienced when implementing the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane. The only way to achieve this was by finding relevant people who had first-hand information about the challenges and options available for the implementation of the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane. Relevant and appropriate data collection and analysis had to be applied. The present study was exploratory in nature. In other words, the researcher aimed to explore the experiences participants (municipal officials and residents of Ward 97) had gone through. Based on these experiences of the participants, the researcher can provide some descriptions and attempt to attach meaning to these explanations.

Parahoo (1997) asserts that a good understanding of research design enhances the quality of any research project and also lays a good foundation for the research project. The research design is regarded as a blueprint for research and it deals, at best, with four problems: which questions to study, which data are relevant, which data to collect and how to analyse the results. The design selected should be the most appropriate.

4.2.1 Qualitative methodology

While De Vos *et al.* (2002:360) defines the qualitative methodology as the way of discovering a participant's world during the interaction between the researcher and research participants, Burns and Grove (2003:356) regard qualitative methodology as inductive, holistic, emic, subjective and process-oriented methods used to understand, interpret, describe and develop a theory on a phenomenon on a setting. Meaning is given and life experiences are described through the subjective approach. Furthermore, qualitative research can be defined as, "the process of analysing and interpreting text and interviews in order to discover the meaningful patterns descriptive of a particular phenomenon" (Auerbach & Silverstein, 2003:3).

Creswell (1994:1) defines a qualitative research study as "an enquiry process of understanding a social or human problem based on building a complete picture without words or reporting detailed views of informants which are conducted in natural settings". Creswell's (1994) definition is not inclusive of other indicators such as numbers or statistical quantification. Fossey *et al.* (2002:717) add that qualitative research describes and explains the person's life experience, behaviour, interactions, stories and social context without using statistical procedures or quantification. It can, thus, be concluded that the quality of the study is of utmost importance and the researcher should be able to deduce things such as the emotions and readiness of the informants. The environment should also be conducive to avoid compromising the responses.

This study on the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane was conducted through a qualitative research method. In qualitative research, the variables are not controlled. The qualitative method focuses on study of human action from the insider's perspective. In qualitative research methodology, the respondent's freedom and natural development of action and representation are captured. This methodology allows the respondents the freedom to express their opinions.

Rubin and Babbie (1997:26) state that qualitative research methodology has the following characteristics: first, meanings and interpretations are negotiated through human data sources. The researcher does not use any data information system to generate information and meaning, but if the research was quantitative, the system would be used to generate the percentages and

numbers. Secondly, the researcher is the primary data collector and conducts field work. The researcher was not assisted by anyone when collecting data. An audio recorder was used during the questioning and focus group discussion. The research occurs in natural settings where human behaviour and events occurs and the setting is not controlled. The researcher interviewed the municipal official in their offices and the community members at Mamelodi extension 12(Ward 97) in order to observe the reality that the participants operate.

In qualitative research, the focus is on residents' perceptions and experiences and on the manner in which they make sense of their lives. The most important people are the research participants and the researcher should see things from their point of view. The researcher's experience is not key here, but that of the participants should be considered. The researcher has to be as non-intrusive as possible and see the world through the eyes of the participants.

4.2.1.1 Attributes of qualitative research

Mamabolo (2009:4) states that in qualitative research, the researcher is required to be a good listener, non-judgmental, friendly, honest and flexible. The author further asserts that the qualitative researcher adopts a person-centred and holistic perspective. The holistic approach improves the researcher's understanding of the people's opinions about their lives and that of others.

According to Boswel and Cannon (2009), "qualitative data collection methods are flexible and unstructured, capturing verbatim reports or observable characteristics and yielding data that usually do not take numerical form". Qualitative methods allow the researcher to probe more in order to get more information. It offers the opportunity to observe even the non-verbal language of participants.

Miles and Huberman (1994:4), state that the main reasons for conducting qualitative research are description and central theoretical statement generation. Description is necessary when the phenomenon under study has limited knowledge known about it. Little is known about the challenges and options encountered during the implementation of the City of Tshwane indigent programme in Mamelodi Extension12 (Ward 97). The study brought the central theoretical statement, which are residents of Ward 97 experience challenges when accessing indigent services of the City of Tshwane and it is critical to involve both the municipality and residents in offering options that will improve the provision of services to the indigent within the City of Tshwane.

4.3 ENSURING QUALITY OF THE STUDY

Aspects contributing positively towards ensuring the quality of the study are discussed in the following sections:

4.3.1 Trustworthiness

Lincoln and Guba (1985:289) establish the concept of trustworthiness in qualitative research. They suggest that trustworthiness should include four criteria: credibility, transferability, dependability and conformability. Credibility is the confidence with which the true picture is presented so that others can believe it. Transferability refers to the degree to which findings can be transferred to other situations. Dependability shows that the findings can be repeated, while conformability suggests that the findings represent the data gathered and not personal opinion. Mamabolo (2009:5) adds that qualitative research is trustworthy when it accurately represents the experiences of the study participants. Trustworthiness establishes validity and reliability of qualitative research.

4.3.1.1 Validity

According to Joubert and Ehrlich (2007:117), a valid instrument will measure what is supposed to be measured. According to Brynard and Hanekom (2006:48), “there are five validity criteria that can be used to test the validity of a design or an instrument”. Makgatho (2013) concurs by discussing the following validity criteria:

- **Content validity:** usually refers to the correctness and appropriateness of the questions included in a test or questionnaire. It is advisable to test the correctness, relevance and lucidity of the questions in a preliminary investigation. Duplication of questions can, thus, be avoided. The results of a preliminary investigation will also help determine whether or not the questions included are relevant to the research problem. The researcher was advised on several occasions to change the questions in order to avoid ambiguity and duplication.
- **Criterion-related validity:** involves testing whether or not an instrument (A) selected for data collection measures what it is expected to measure and whether or not it can be compared to another instrument (B), which is known to be valid. If the data collected through both instruments closely match, then instrument (A) is also valid. The stipulation is that the two sets of data should be collected from the same group of subjects.
- **Construct validity:** refers to the degree to which a measurement technique uncovers the information, which it was designed to uncover. For example, questions for a questionnaire

should be designed specifically to obtain the desired information. The researcher designed the questions asked in the interviews and focus group discussions were meant to ask research questions in detail and eventually meet the research objectives.

- **Face validity:** is concerned with the way an instrument appears to the participants. For example, do they view it as so simple, useless and boring that they experience it as an insult to their intellect or does it appear so difficult that the participants give up even before starting? Therefore, face validity is based on the subjective judgment of the researcher and the respondents. Municipal officials took the research seriously and believed new knowledge will help improve their indigent programme, while community members perceived the focus group discussion as a facilitation tool.
- **External validity:** refers to the applicability to similar problems of the conclusions drawn from the research, provided that the sample is representative and that the study is a simulation of the real world and real-life situations (Makgatho, 2013:60).

4.3.1.2 Reliability

According to Maree (2007:122), reliability refers to the repeatability in consistency of an instrument to measure the same thing. When different people with a reliable tool measure the same thing, they should get the same or similar results. Reliability of an instrument can be improved with standardised guidelines and training on the use of the instrument. A study is regarded as reliable if other researchers get the same results when they use the same assessment criteria.

4.3.2 Consistency

Krefting (1991:216) explains consistency as demonstrating whether findings would be consistent if the enquiry were replicated with the same object in similar contexts. The participants should be the ones discussing, not the facilitator.

4.3.3 Neutrality

Krefting (1991:216) defines neutrality as “the freedom from bias in the procedures and results of research”. It refers to the degree in which the findings are functioning solely of the informants and conditions of the research and not of other biases, motivations and perspectives. According to Babbie and Mouton (2001:278), sometimes the emphasis of neutrality is shifted to the researcher rather than looking at the neutrality of data. The authors suggest that conformability

should be the criterion of neutrality. This is only possible once the truth-value and applicability are achieved.

4.4 TECHNIQUES IN DATA COLLECTION

According to Burns and Grove (2003:372), data collection is the precise, systematic gathering of information relevant to the research sub-problems using the tools such as interviews, participant observation, focus group discussion, narratives and case histories.

4.4.1 Data collection instrument

According to Bless and Higson-Smith (1995:99), primary data is the first hand information acquired and gained by the researcher through interviews. The researcher collected data for the purpose of the research by having interviews with municipal officials implementing the indigent policy. The interview enabled the researcher to establish a trustworthy working relationship and gain insight into the subject matter.

The researcher worked alone during the data collection process. There was no research assistant involved as the researcher could not find a sponsor for payment. The researcher played an active role in ensuring the success of the data collection process. The interviews were recorded and the researcher extracted the data from the material after the interviews were over. De Vos *et al.* (2002:340), emphasise that the researcher analyse the data recorded and translate the interviewee's responses into meaningful descriptions.

4.4.2 Focus group discussion

According to Brits (2012:44), many definitions exist for focus group discussion. Some researchers even use the name focus group interview. "The main difference between the focus group discussion and the focus group interviews is that the objective is to get answers to specific questions while in focus group discussion the interaction between the group and group dynamics are as important as the information gathered" (Boddy,2005:251). The comparison asserts that interviews are specific and limiting in terms of feedback, while discussion encourages engagement. Discussion is more of a dialogue and enhances group work, while relying on the facilitator's ability to give direction. The researcher used focus group discussion to engage the residents of Ward 97 and collection of data.

Focus group discussion is a qualitative methodology in which a small number of people are brought together to discuss specific topics under the guidance of a facilitator. The structure of the

focus group may appear informal, but in fact, it uses a script with open-ended questions. A facilitator leads the discussions and probes or asks additional questions as warranted by the situation (Imas & Rist, 2009:335-336). According to Moutton (2007:292), the main advantage of focus group discussion is the opportunity to observe a large amount of interaction on a topic in a limited period of time based on the researcher's ability to assemble and direct the focus group.

The dialogue among participants during the focus group discussion elicits more information as it allows different views and engagement. It is better than individual interviews as the facilitator explores the participants' reasons and feelings. The conversation is often nonlinear and participants may bring up information or different perspectives at any time.

In this study, convenience sampling was used. It is the method that relies on availability. This is the group that was the closest and readily available to participate in the study. the focus group discussion consisted of 30 people. The criteria that were used in selection was the following:

- The participants had to be the residents of the low cost houses of Mamelodi Mandela Extension 12 of the City of Tshwane;
- They had to be home owners with title deeds;
- They had to be eligible for registration with City of Tshwane Indigent programme (Income of less than two old age grants) and they should be willing to participate in the study

Three sessions that comprised 10 people were held. The group composed of men, women and youth owning low cost houses. The facilitator provided comfortable safe surroundings and began with a clear explanation of what the purpose was, why participants' views were important, how they were selected and what the rules of the process were.

4.4.3 Interviews

The interview method was used as a second method of obtaining data. It only applied to municipal officials. Mamabolo (2009) explains that interviews refer to structured or unstructured verbal communication between the researcher and the participants. Non-verbal communication should also be observed during the interviews. Interviews are one of the dominant methods of qualitative research. Normally, they are limited to meeting a participant once. While most are carried out face-to-face, qualitative interviews can also be carried out by telephone or via the Internet.

In-depth interviews were used because they enabled the researcher to probe for more information. In Mamabolo's (2009:59) words, there is a relationship between the philosophical tradition and the method, which distinguishes this interview from other forms. The distinction is clearly in the relationship between the researcher and the participants, as this moves from observational in quantitative research to dialogue in qualitative research, and then to reflective in phenomenological research. Such reflectivity appears to acknowledge that the researcher is an important component in the research process. Holloway (2005:293) concurs with Mamabolo that a semi-structured interview has a more specific research agenda and is more focused. This type of interviewing technique allows respondents to describe the situation in their own words and in their own time. Through interviews, the researcher was able to spend more time with respondents/informants, trying to understand their experiences, feelings and how indigent policy affects them. Everything about the research was explained to the respondents to get their consent. The respondents/informants were asked if they could be recorded during the interviews, to which they responded positively. It was explained further to them why the interviews were to be recorded.

Just like focus group discussion, interviews have advantages. According to De Vos et al. (2002:302), an interview has the following advantages:

- “It is a technique that can be used to facilitate cooperation and elicit information through interpersonal interaction
- It offers the interviewer the opportunity to explore the greater depth of meaning
- The responses are quicker as compared to filling in questionnaires or observing the participants;
- It is not affected by the ability to read and write from the participant's side and they can participate freely despite their literacy level”.

The other advantages of interviews are that they can explore complex issues in depth and are forgiving of mistakes. Unclear questions can also be clarified during the interviews and changed for subsequent interviews. Furthermore, interviews can provide evaluators with an intuitive sense of the situation and they can be structured or semi-structured or a combination of both, but most are generally semi-structured.

According to Kvale (1996:3-5), qualitative interviews are the interaction between an interviewer and a respondent in which the interviewer has general plan of inquiry, but not a specific set of

questions that must be asked in particular words and in a particular order. The meeting involves asking the participant to take part in the study and arranging the meeting for the interview (Fox & Bayat, 2007:78). According to Cassel and Symon (2004:12), qualitative research interviews vary in methodological features. This includes factors such as length, style of questioning and participant numbers.

The disadvantages of interviews include the following: they can be expensive, labour intensive and time consuming; they may not indicate why different people have different viewpoints; as a result of selective hearing by the interviewer, may miss information that does not conform to pre-existing beliefs; they require cultural sensitivity and particularly with respect to gender issues (Morra *et al.*, 2009).

The researcher did the following before conducting the interview:

- thanked the informants for willingness to participate in the study;
- Emphasised the issue of confidentiality;
- Asked follow up questions to clarify the responses;
- Asked for permission to record the interview.

The officials interviewed in this study were the finance manager and the director of the indigent programme. Efforts were made to interview members of the mayoral committee: Health and Social Development, the councillor of Ward 98, as well as the community development worker, but they did not bear fruits. The only officials who participated in the assessment of the implementation of the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane challenges and options were the finance manager and the director of the programme.

4.4.4 Target Population

According to Chisnall (2005:71), a target population is a collection of those objects or elements with certain characteristics sought by the researcher and about which deductions have to be made. Burns and Grove (2003:43) add that the population includes all elements that meet certain criteria for inclusion in a study. It is critical that the target population be defined accurately because if that is not done, it might lead to misleading conclusion about the researched subject. In this study, the target population consisted of municipal officials implementing the indigent programme and the residents of Mandela Extension 12.

4.4.5 Sampling

A sample is defined as the subset of population selected to participate in a study. It is also explained as the selected groups of elements, individuals, groups or organisations. The sample is chosen from the study population that is referred to commonly as the target population (Burns & Grove, 2003:233). Thirty community members were sampled from Mandela Extension 12, which is Ward 97 and municipal officials were chosen because of their involvement in the implementation of the indigent policy. The participants met the criteria because of the indigent status and their involvement in the implementation of the programme. The participants were briefed about the purpose and consent to participate was granted.

4.5 DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

According to Lewis *et al.* (2009), qualitative data is extremely diverse in nature and that makes it very difficult to follow a standardised approach of analysis. Qualitative data cannot be analysed in a uniform way as it involves interpretation. As such there is no single approach all researchers should use during analysis.

4.5.1 Data analysis

According to Terreblanche *et al.* (2006:189), data are the raw materials of any research. Raw data cannot generate meaning without analysis and interpretation. Data analysis is a mechanism for reducing and organising data to produce findings that require interpretation by the researcher (Burns & Grove, 2003:479). According to Creswell (2003:191), six steps that are involved when analysing qualitative data are

- Organise data by transcribing;
- Read through the data to get the bigger picture;
- Start coding the data in text according to macro topics and then rewrite it to fit in different themes;
- Make sure that the themes address the research questions;
- Describe participant settings, categories and themes;
- Determine how themes and categories will be represented and interpret and make meaning of data.

The qualitative data was analysed according to the eight steps of the Tesch framework as discussed in Creswell (1994:154-155) as follows:

- Organise data by transcribing – writing word for word. Internalise it, and record the session.
- Select one interview that was maybe interesting, short or the best. Write the thought in the margin.
- When the first task for other informants is completed, make a list of all topics. Put similar topics in one session.
- Find a fitting abbreviation for each identified topic
- Start coding the data in the text according to macro topics and then rewrite it to fit in the different themes and categories.
- Make a final decision on the abbreviation for each theme or category and transform the codes into alphabet letters.
- Categorise the data or material belonging together or put the themes into one place and conduct a preliminary analysis.
- The researcher records the existing data and reports.

According to De Vos *et al.* (2002:339), data analysis is a challenging and creative process characterised by the intimate relationship of the researcher with the participants and the data generated. Data analysis is a method that researchers use to consider and arrange interview transcripts, field notes and other material that they gain to help with the findings. Researchers work with that information, organise information and break them into manageable units and coding (Bogdan & Biklem 2007:15). According to Burns and Grove (2003:382), analysis goes beyond description because data is transformed and extended. It requires identification of essential features and descriptions of interrelations among them.

As qualitative data is extremely diverse in nature, it is very difficult to follow a standardised approach of analysis (Lewis *et al.*, 2009). According to Leedy and Ormrod (2010), the standard task during analysis is to identify underlying and common themes in the participants' description of the phenomena. The first task in the analysis process was to transcribe the information obtained in the interviews and focus group discussion. That also included the researcher's recording. Irrelevant data were separated from relevant data. Only data related to the study were used.

Data were summarised and key points formulated from what the participants had said. Longer statements were compressed into shorter ones, which contained the essence of what was said. The key points became the main themes that were explored further in the study. After summarising the data, they were categorised. The key points were grouped into different categories that reflect different perceptions, meanings and experiences of the indigent policy.

Codes were used to reflect themes or objectives/questions. Creswel *et al.* (2010) provide that after the composite descriptions are developed of how participants experience the phenomenon, meanings are interpreted. This is in order to draw conclusions and answer the research questions successfully. The results will be a broad description of people involved in the implementation of the indigent policy and the beneficiaries.

4.5.2 Data interpretation

According to Burns and Grove (2003:389), interpretation focuses on the usefulness of the findings for clinical practice or moving towards theorising. Priest *et al.* (2002:30) further indicate that there are three approaches to the interpretation of qualitative data. They are grounded theory, qualitative content analysis and narrative analysis. In grounded theory one needs evidence from the natural context, where the enquiry took place, in order to generate a theory. Hsie and Shannon (2005) add that content analysis is defined as a research method or the subjective interpretation of the content of text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes or patterns. According to Fritz (2008:6), narrative analysis is a type of case-centred research that focused on close readings of stories told by participants. It also seeks to understand human experience or social phenomena through the form and content of stories analysed as textual units.

4.6 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Rubin and Babbie (1997:60) indicate that ethics is associated with morality that is, what is wrong and right and conforming to the standard of the code of conduct of a given group or profession. Ethical measures are important in research and they include ethical conduct towards participant information. Burns and Grove (2003:65) assert that the researcher should establish trust with the participants. In the process of building trust, the researcher acknowledges their uniqueness and respects them as being autonomous enabling them to make sound decisions. It also includes honesty when reporting findings. The ethical issues in this study include approval, informed consent, confidentiality, prevention of harm to participants.

4.6.1 Approval

The research proposal was submitted to the North-West University Ethics Committee for approval before the study could be conducted. The study was approved on the 24 June 2014 under approval number: FH-BE-2014-0002. The researcher's request to conduct the study was sent to the City Manager of the Municipality. An authorisation letter to conduct research was sent to the researcher through the Research and Innovation Unit of the City of Tshwane.

4.6.2 Informed consent

Informed consent prepares the researcher and clearly outlines the implications of participation. It is an indicator that the participants understand what they are getting themselves into. The participants should be legally and psychologically ready to give consent. It means that all information on the study and goals are made explicit before the participants can be involved.

The researcher handed the consent forms to the focus group discussion participants and the municipal officials. Time was spent in clarifying the form to the participants. Among other things, the consent forms stipulated the liberty to withdraw participation (see consent forms as Annexures 1 and 2).

4.6.3 Confidentiality

Confidentiality refers to handling of information in a very private way. It refers to agreements among persons that limit others' access to that private information.

No names are given in the report, even in the presentation to the municipality. The respondents were informed about those who will have access to the data and to what extent (refer to the consent forms Annexures A and B).

4.6.4 Harm to participants

Research should never expose participants to any harm. Ethics would not allow any circumstance that would endanger human life. The researcher should always guard against possible harm. In this study, the participants were informed thoroughly in advance about the potential impact of the study. They were told that the City of Tshwane will be informed about the findings and recommendations of the study but the informants would be protected by keeping them anonymous.

4.7 PROCEDURE FOLLOWED DURING DATA COLLECTION

The dates for the interviews and focus group discussion were selected based on the availability of municipality officials and household owners. The interviews took place in the municipality offices and the process was recorded for reference and evidence. The focus group was conducted at the vacant stand in Mamelodi Extension 12 without the ward councillor as she seemed reluctant to assist in the study. After the process was explained, the key informants were asked to sign the consent forms to participate in in-depth interviews and focus group discussions.

The biographic information of Mamelodi residents was given through the graph, and data were reported through four themes, sub themes and categories. The biographic profile was compiled mainly from the participant's responses to the following questions:

- What is your name and surname?
- What is your marital status
- How old are you?
- How many other people stay in your house?
- How many people stay in your yard?

For adhering to the norms of anonymity of participants, the numbers were used. The data on the biographic profiling is presented in Table 4.1:

Table 4.1: Biographical profiling of participants

Respondents	Age	Gender	Highest Educational level	Marital status	Household members	Years in the programme	Language
1	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Single	3 and 5 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
2	71-80	F	No Grade 12	Married	2 and 7 tenants	N/A	Isizulu
3	31-40	F	Grade 12	Single	6 and 7 tenants	N/A	Isindebele
4	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Single	5 and 5 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
5	51-60	F	No Grade 12	Separated	3 and 3 tenants	N/A	Setswana
6	41-50	M	No Grade 12	Widow	4 and 6 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
7	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Single	3 and 7 tenants	N/A	Isindebele
8	61-70	F	No Grade 12	Married	3 and 4 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
9	71-80	M	No Grade 12	Married	3 and 5 tenants	N/A	Sepedi

Respondents	Age	Gender	Highest Educational level	Marital status	Household members	Years in the programme	Language
10	61-70	F	No Grade 12	Single	6 and 5 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
11	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Divorced	7 and 6 tenants	N/A	Isindebele
12	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Single	5	N/A	Sepedi
13	31-40	F	Grade 12	Single	5 and 7 tenants	N/A	Isizulu
14	31-40	M	Grade 12	Married	5and tenants	N/A	Isindebele
15	51-60	F	Grade 12	Married	3 and tenants	N/A	Sepedi
16	51-60	F	No Grade 12	Separated	5 and 5 tenants	N/A	Xhosa
17	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Married	3 and 7 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
18	51-60	M	Grade 12	Married	7 and 5 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
19	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Married	6 and 7 tenants	N/A	Xitsonga
20	41-50	F	FET Certificate	Married	5	N/A	Tshivenda
21	41-50	F	Matric	Single	3 and 5 tenants	N/A	Isizulu
22	41-50	M	No Grade 12	Widowed	5 and 6 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
23	51-60	F	No Grade 12	Widowed	7 and 5 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
24	51-60	F	No Grade 12	Single	3 and 7 tenants	N/A	Sepedi
25	61-70	F	No Grade 12	Married	6 and 7 tenants	N/A	Xitsonga
26	41-50	F	No Grade 12	Divorced	4	N/A	Xhosa
26	71-80	M	No Grade 12	Married	6 and 8 tenants	N/A	Xhosa
27	51-60	F	No Grade 12	Widowed	6 and 6 tenants	N/A	Tsonga
28	41-50	M	Grade 12	Single	6 and 7 tenants	N/A	Tshivenda
29	61-70	F	No Grade 12	Single	3 and 3 tenants	N/A	Isindebele
30	51-60	F	No Grade 12	Widowed	4 and 5 tenants	N/A	Sepedi

Source :Latakgomo (2011:41)

Table 4.1 indicates that the participants' ages ranged from 31 to 90 years. The number of females who attended the focus group discussion was 24, while men were six. Their educational background varied from never to one with tertiary education. Most participants' living arrangements varied and tenants contribute financially to the households as they pay for rental accommodation.

4.8 FINDINGS OF THE STUDY

The findings in this study were based on the following questions outlined in Chapter 1:

- How is the indigent policy implemented in Ward 98 of the City of Tshwane?
- What are the challenges related to the implementation of the indigent people in Ward 98 of the City of Tshwane?
- What is the regulatory and statutory framework supporting the provision of services to the indigent people within the City of Tshwane?
- What options are available to ensure appropriate implementation of the indigent policy in this area?

The participants answered the set of questions (refer to Annexure A) which was meant for municipal officials. The process of data analysis by the researcher resulted in themes, subthemes and categories:

- Theme 1: Description of how the indigent programme is implemented at Mamelodi, Mandela Extension 12/Ward 97
- Theme 2: Challenges experienced during the implementation of the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane
- Theme 3: Regulatory and legislative framework informing the implementation of the indigent programme
- Theme 4: Options available for the improvement of the indigent programme (Latakomo, 2011:42).

Table 4.2: Thematic presentation of Research findings

Theme 1: Description of how indigent programme is implemented at Mamelodi, Mandela Extension 12/Ward 97	
Theme 2: Challenges experienced during the implementation of the Indigent policy of the City of Tshwane	
Sub theme 2.1: Challenges encountered during the implementation of the indigent policy	Category 2.1.1 Gaps in the indigent policy of the CoT
	Category 2.1.2: Registration process
	Category 2.1.3: Beneficiaries on arrears
	Category 2.1.4: Fraudulent activities
	Category 2.1.5: Exiting beneficiaries from the programme

Subtheme 2.2: Evidence to indicate that the municipality does have sufficient personnel for implementation of the indigent policy	
Theme 3: Regulatory and legislative framework informing the implementation of the indigent programme	
Subtheme 3.1: Regulatory and legislative framework informing the City of Tshwane officials on implementation of the indigent policy	
Subtheme 3.2: Implications of not adhering to legislative and regulatory framework of the indigent policy	Category 3.2.1: Implications of lying
	Category 3.2.2: Confidentiality not strictly adhered to
Theme 4 :Options available for the improvement of the indigent programme	
Subtheme 4.1 Measures in place for sustainability and affordability of the indigent programme	
Subtheme 4.2 The way the indigent programme is monitored.	
Subtheme 4.3 Awareness of the programme	

Source: (Latakomo, 2011:43)

Table 4.2 presents the themes, subthemes and categories of the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane: challenges and options.

4.8.1 Narrative of the findings

The themes, subthemes and categories below are presented as a narrative with direct quotes from the transcripts of the Interviews and literature control.

THEME 1: EXPERIENCES OF THE INDIGENT PROGRAMME BY THE INDIGENTS IN MAMELODI MANDELA EXTENSION 12/WARD 97

The list of those that are receiving the indigent subsidy at Mandela Extension 12 was requested from officials, but the request was never attended to. It appeared that the indigent Management Information System could not generate a report with the list of beneficiaries.

During the three focus group discussions held with 10 people each, it was found that not all of them were benefitting from the indigent programme of the City of Tshwane. During the preparation phase, the participants were requested to bring their electricity and water bills. The bill had water and sanitation, which they are paying for fully. Even with prepaid electricity, they

are not getting any subsidy. Not all of them are paying property rates as they are all staying in RDP houses. Some participants made it very clear that they know nothing about the programme, while others know about it. This included households that are older-person headed.

“We used to have the bonus on our lights until somewhere around 2007; it used to make our lives easier”.

“No one said anything to us; the subsidy was just cut from us”.

“We end up building rooms for accommodation for income purposes as we are unemployed”

“We gave up our privacy a long time ago as we are sharing our personal spaces with strangers”

“The only time we see politicians is during election campaigns. We hoping to see them when local Government elections approaches”

According to Keepile (2010), the municipalities have a tendency of starting programmes for the poor communities, but are unable to sustain them, and leaving the community despondent. This is supported by service delivery protest actions that we see every day on television.

Although theme 1 was linked with objective, that is description of how indigent policy is implemented in Ward 97 of the City of Tshwane, it was not responded to. The residents could not experience what does not exist in their ward.

THEME 2: CHALLENGES EXPERIENCED DURING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INDIGENT POLICY IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE.

The discussion that follows demonstrates the challenges encountered during the implementation of the indigent programme:

The answers to the following questions led to the theme, sub-themes and categories:

- Kindly elaborate on challenges encountered during the implementation of the indigent policy?
- Is there evidence to indicate that the municipality does have sufficient personnel for implementation of the indigent policy?

The theme was divided into the following sub-themes after careful examination of questions:

Sub-theme 2.1: Challenges encountered during the implementation of the indigent policy

The sub-theme has been divided into the following categories:

- Gaps in the indigent policy of the CoT
- Registration process
- Beneficiaries on arrears
- Fraudulent activities
- Exiting the beneficiaries from the programme

Challenges encountered by the implementers will affect the impact of the indigent programme. As a result, the municipality might not consistently satisfy the needs of its indigents. The following responses from participants and summaries of interviews disclose the categories.

Category 2.1.1: Gaps in the indigent policy of the City of Tshwane

“The policy still has gaps; it is silent about the value of the property of the beneficiary and their indigent status.

When foreigners die and have to be buried here, it is a serious challenge as the policy requires South African bar coded identity document.

Category 2.1.2: Registration process

“As the registration process is not done at homes, indigents find it difficult to have to go to police stations for affidavits, bank for statements and municipal offices. All this trips require transport money and not all have”.

“The indigent programme involves identification process, referral (including self), verification and registration and the names be sent to finance which will also work with electrical and water and sanitation department. It sometimes takes a longer time as it is not a priority to other units.

“The more the indigent register increases, the more the finance department s burden of financing the project increases. This might translate to taking from the affording residents to subsidising those who cannot afford”.

Category 2.1.3: Beneficiaries on arrears

“The municipality is not as yet having detectors that would limit the beneficiaries to exceed the subsidised amounts of services. “

“Majority are still not using prepaid”.

“The billing system results in them having arrears on their municipal accounts”.

Category 2.1.4: Fraudulent activities

“After some allegations that people were benefitting illegally, the Special Investigation Unit was commissioned to conduct the investigations and it was found out that even some professionals households are benefitting from the indigent programme.

This proves a gap in the implementation tools and lack of monitoring from the municipality.

Category 2.1.5: Exiting beneficiaries from the programme

“As the beneficiaries participate in the programme for 24 months only, it becomes a serious problem if you terminate them especially if there has not been change in their economic status

“Some don’t even report to the municipality, if they gain employment”

Subtheme 2.2: Evidence to indicate that the municipality does have sufficient personnel for implementation of the indigent policy

“The municipality does not have enough staff to implement the Indigent programme”.

“The EPWP volunteers who identify the indigents through their door to door visits have been stopped since 2013 September due to lack of finances”.

THEME 3: REGULATORY AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK INFORMING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INDIGENT PROGRAMME

The answers to the following questions led to the theme, sub-themes and categories:

Which legislative and regulatory framework informs the implementation of the indigent programme?

What are the legal implications of the implementation of the indigent policy?

From the responses by key informants, this theme was divided into the following two sub themes:

Regulatory and legislative framework informing the City of Tshwane officials on implementation of the indigent policy

Implications of not adhering to legislative and regulatory framework by beneficiaries of the indigent policy

Subtheme 3.1: Regulatory and legislative framework informing the City of Tshwane officials on implementation of the indigent policy

The following responses confirm that the indigent policy is a legislative mandate of the local government:

“To start with it’s a constitutional obligation that clearly stipulates that everyone has the right to access to basic services and as the municipality should cater for the needs of the poor of the poorest”.

“The DPLG developed national framework for Indigent management which was followed by national guidelines”.

“The 2012 reviewed Indigent Policy that came as a result of merging of former Kungwini and Metsweding Municipality into the City of Tshwane”.

These responses show that the officials implement the indigent programme as a government mandate. The municipality understands their obligation as servants of the state with the quest to assist the neediest in the community.

Subtheme 3.2: Implications of not adhering to legislative and regulatory framework of the indigent policy

“The cases of lying about indigent status are increasing”

Category 3.2.1: Implications of lying

The following responses by participants display their understanding of lying under oath:

“Even the Indigent Policy clearly stipulates that penalties will be laid against someone who been benefiting unduly from the programme. The whole subsidy will be claimed from the person”

“It is a criminal offence to lie on the affidavit that you meet the criteria for indigent’s management”

“Only social workers verify the indigent status by doing household assessments”

The responses indicate that the process of implementation will be legal and the beneficiaries will be warned against manipulating the system.

Category 3.2.2: Confidentiality not strictly adhered to

“In trying to address issues of confidentiality, evidence for daily work submitted to Supervisors of volunteers. The records are not allowed to be at homes of volunteers. The information is captured in the Indigent Management Information System”.

THEME 4: OPTIONS AVAILABLE FOR THE IMPROVEMENT OF THE INDIGENT PROGRAMME

Responses to the following questions gave rise to the theme, its sub-themes and categories:

- Which measures are in place to ensure that the municipality’s implementation of its indigent policy is affordability and sustainable?
- Is the application and verification process measurable/If yes, how?
- What measures are in place to ensure the successful implementation of the policy?
- How do you monitor the indigent register?
- Has the municipality organised a campaign regarding the indigent policy?

The officials saw the need to enhance the indigent programme management. The theme was divided into the following sub-themes:

- The measures in place for sustainability and affordability
- The way the programme is monitored.

Subtheme 4.1: Measures in place for sustainability and affordability of the indigent programme

“The municipality receives equitable share from the National Department which funds the programme”.

“The municipality is not getting any donor funding yet has many programmes that are linking indigents with opportunities”.

Subtheme 4.2: The way the indigent programme is monitored.

“The programme has a review committee which is an interdepartmental official from Health and Social Development, electricity, housing, finance, water and sanitation and provincial Department of Social Development”

“The committee meet monthly for reviewing of applications”

“The social workers assess and verify the indigent household and make some recommendations”.

“The finance unit check information on the billing system against the forms submitted by Health social Development unit”.

“Monthly, the DD compares what has been submitted with what has been registered”

“The indigents are also requested to provide bank statements or even pay slips “.

“There are the Indigent Management Information systems which administer the indigent register.

Subtheme 4.3: Awareness on the programme

“The Executive mayor’s directive was that when there are municipal or ward meetings, issues of Indigents be incorporated.

“He advocated for mainstreaming of the Indigent programme”.

“The Health and Social Development hold road shows and bring along relevant stakeholders to address the social needs of the communities”.

4.9 CHAPTER SUMMARY

In this chapter, the research methodology was discussed and qualitative methodology was discussed in detail. Elements that would ensure that the quality of the study were discussed, and instrumentation in data collection outlined. The technique sampling, data analysis and data interpretation were also discussed in detail. Lastly, the concept of ethical consideration was

explained. The next chapter, which is the final one, outlines the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the study.

CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter focused on the empirical research, which involved the researcher doing fieldwork on the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane: Options and Challenges. In this chapter, a summary of the preceding chapters is provided. The achievement of research objectives and the central theoretical statements will be discussed. The chapter will be completed by recommendations that will make the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane to be effective, efficient and economical in its implementation.

5.2 SUMMARY OF THE CHAPTERS

Chapter 1: In this chapter, the background, orientation, problem statement and central theoretical statement was discussed and research questions, research objectives, significant of the study and limitations of the study outlined.

Chapter 2: The chapter discussed the theoretical overview of challenges associated with the implementation of the indigent policy. The nature of indigence globally and poverty in African countries were discussed. The South African government, an overview of the imperative of indigent programme, health problems and indigent policies of South African metropolitan municipalities were discussed in detail. The chapter ended with the legislative and regulatory framework informing the implementation of the indigent policy.

Chapter 3: The chapter discussed the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane in detail. The concept of urban poverty was outlined. The objectives of the indigent policy, documents required for registration and the criteria for registration were discussed. The social packages for indigents as well as the sources of funding for the programme were outlined. How beneficiaries exit the indigent programme and how the monitoring of the programme takes place were clarified.

Chapter 4: This chapter is about the methodology used and findings of the study. The researcher used the qualitative method and the data collection methods were clarified. The interviews were conducted with municipal officials, while the focus group discussions were planned for the residents of Mandela Extension 12. The data collection, analysis and interpretation were also discussed in this chapter. Ethical consideration and findings of the study were reported on fully.

5.3 ACHIEVEMENT OF THE RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

There was a need to respond to the description of how indigent policy is implemented in Ward 98 of the City of Tshwane. The research objective was realised in Chapter 3, where the concept of urban poverty was explained. The objectives of the indigent policy, documents required for registration and the criteria for registration were discussed. The social package for indigents was also outlined. Chapter 4 with its findings also assisted in achieving the first objective as the experiences of the Ward 97 residents.

Objective two was to explain the challenges related to the implementation of the indigent policy in Ward 98 of the City of Tshwane. The objective was achieved through Chapter 4, where it was also made clear that findings on Ward 97 were a challenge. The revelation that the ward is not subsidised through the programme, while unemployment and poverty are rife, pose the greatest challenge.

Objective three was to explain the regulatory and statutory framework supporting service delivery to indigent people. It was achieved in Chapter 2, where a detailed discussion of the regulatory and legislative framework informing the implementation of the indigent programme was clearly articulated. This ranged from frameworks, guidelines, strategic plans, policies and Acts.

Objective four was to provide options available to ensure appropriate implementation of the indigent policy in the City of Tshwane. This chapter provides recommendations for improvement and enhancement of the implementation of the programme.

5.4 CENTRAL THEORETICAL STATEMENT

The central theoretical statement in this study is stated in Chapter 1 in that the residents of Ward 97 experience challenges when accessing indigent services of the City of Tshwane, and it is critical to involve both the municipality and residents in offering options that will improve the provision of services to the indigent within the municipality. Both the literature and the empirical evidence were used to support the statement that there are challenges in accessing the indigent programme of the City of Tshwane by the residents of Ward 97. The municipality and the residents need to use a different approach to resolve the lack of access in the programme.

5.5 SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS

The residents of Ward 97 do not access the indigent programme of the City of Tshwane and do not know about the application process. This could be attributed to several factors, which include, but are not limited to, lack of information sharing on the part of the City of Tshwane in empowering the residents of this programme and inaccessibility of information about the programme by its intended beneficiaries.

There are not sufficient personnel to implement the programme. The Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) volunteers stopped working in September of 2013 which, in turn, contributes to the lack of knowledge about the programme by the beneficiaries, hence the findings. It also contributes to the deprivation of access to services to the deserving resident of the CoT.

There are people benefitting unduly from the programme such as those who are on the list fraudulently because they do not meet the selection criteria. This exposes the inability of the City of Tshwane to monitor the effective implementation of the policy by ensuring that due processes and procedures are followed when registering the beneficiaries into the programme. The more the indigent register increases with the number of beneficiaries, the more expensive the services get for residents who can afford, as they are expected to pay more for their rates and services to fund the programme indirectly.

The funding mechanism for the programme remains a key concern in that it is solely dependent on government funding (equitable share). There are no other funders (donors or other forms of grants) to fund the programme, which make it difficult for the programme to reach all its intended beneficiaries. Cognisance is taken of the total income of the household members, especially spouses or partners. If the household owner is married, their partners' financial status needs to be considered before approval is granted. These factors prevent abuse of the system and the channelling of resources to households with a prescribed income.

According to the officials, it is difficult to deregister the indigents from the programme who have not gained employment during the 24 months which they were getting subsidy. The critical issue that still remains is taking care of their basic needs, which they cannot afford. The Exit Indigent Strategy of the City of Tshwane, which was developed by the Human Science Research Council (HSRC) in 2010, had elements for improving the programme. Currently, the strategy is not operationalised. As such, the interventions are not evidence-based.

The following gaps in the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane were identified:

- There is no clarification in the policy regarding indigent foreigners who die within the City of Tshwane and whose families can not afford to take them back to their original countries, and those whose relatives resort to burying them within the City of Tshwane.
- The assets of the household owner and the value of the property owned by the applicant in relations to being registered as indigents.

Finally, there are eligible older persons in ward 97 who are not receiving the indigent subsidy.

5.6 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1 The Marketing and Communications Department, Health and Social Development of the City of Tshwane should market the indigent programme extensively in the communities it aims to serve in order to ensure that the beneficiaries are well informed and aware of the programme and the implications of the policy. The existing road shows that the municipality embarks on should target the poverty-stricken areas around City of Tshwane. Different channels of communication, ranging from visual, print, and audio can be employed to make the citizens aware of these subsidies aimed at the most vulnerable people in the community.
- 2 Dedicated staff should be appointed to implement the indigent programme. The units of finance, electricity, water and sanitation should also have dedicated staff.
- 3 Different stakeholders should be involved in the review of indigent applications. As public participation is one of the principles that the current government is encouraging.
- 4 The community needs to be represented when critical decisions regarding their lives are taken. People with disabilities should be considered and that would be responding to the slogan which says “nothing about us, without us”.
- 5 The ward councillor of Mamelodi Extension 12 should discuss matters of indigents in community meetings as mandated by the executive mayor. Meeting resolutions and a clear programme of actions (interventions) should be documented by the councillor and submitted to the executive mayor, who, in turn, should ensure implementation thereof through continued oversight and strategic intervention mechanisms.
- 6 The indigent Management Information System should be enhanced to ensure that it is easy for the list of indigents to be retrieved by the public and other members of the community (such as academics) for different purposes.

- 7 Punitive actions should be instigated against those who were investigated and found to have engaged in fraudulent activities such as lying under oath. The media, to create public awareness, should cover these issues.
- 8 The municipality should source more funding and only rely only on the equitable share from treasury. Development partners with interest in assisting the poor should be engaged in the programme.
- 9 This policy / programme should be reviewed in such a way that it does not cater for the needy at the expense of those not qualifying for a subsidy.
- 10 The policy should address the issue of foreign nationals buried in South Africa. It should emulate the United States of America that stipulates that all citizens have equal rights regardless of race or national origin.
- 11 The total income of members and assets of the household applying should be taken into cognisance before approval of the registration. The CoT could have a blocked council tax, water charge and wastewater sewerage based on property values as implemented in Glasgow.
- 12 There should be regular risk assessment processes in place, to enable the municipality develop risk assessment plans that would prevent abuse of the system. The City of Tshwane should further coordinate the implementation of the risk plans to companies from which it outsources electricity services and water.
- 13 It is critical to monitor and evaluate the programme as it provides the only consolidated source of information showcasing project progress and implementers to learn from each other's experiences, building on expertise and knowledge. It often generates written reports that contribute to transparency and accountability. Monitoring and evaluation further reveals mistakes, provides a basis for questioning and testing assumptions. Above all, it provides a more robust basis for raising funds and influencing policy. Most of the challenges found would be avoided if the monitoring tools were in place and the municipality sets a budget aside to evaluate its programme through impact assessment studies.
- 14 There should be provision of information, education and communication material to beneficiaries, which clearly articulates the programme and its packages. These should include highlighting that the programme is only for a period of 24 months. It also has limitations as far as the consumption of electricity and water is concerned to avoid unnecessary arrears. Indigent benefits are only due to those who need them the most.

- 15 The recommendations of the indigent Exit Strategy from the Human Science Research Council should be implemented, especially in relations to training, operation of small and medium enterprises and future development.
- 16 If it is a standard that all pensioners, especially those that are not receiving pension money from their previous employers, be subsidised through the indigent programme, the standard should apply to all older-person headed households within the City of Tshwane.
- 17 That the indigent programme of the City of Tshwane be implemented be like that of Canada and provide income support strategies, access to education, employment, health, social services and housing for persons living in poverty.

5.7 CONCLUSION

This chapter concludes the final phase of the study. It can be concluded that the research objectives have been achieved because implementation of the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane: challenges and options were investigated. Challenges in getting community members and municipal officials for interviews were experienced, but eventually it was a success. Recommendations have been made and the municipality could use them for further programme intervention and enhancement.

The researcher will compile a letter to the city manager directed to Research and Innovation, Health and Social Development Unit, informing them about the completion of the study. Upon request, a presentation will be made to the City of Tshwane on the findings and recommendations as part of the agreement that was entered into between researcher and the City of Tshwane prior to the granting of the approval to conduct the study. Through the study, the importance of academic and professional development has been stressed. The community perspective is very different from the official perspective as far as the indigent programme is concerned.

Lastly, the indigent programme is a critical intervention aimed at mitigating challenges of unemployment and poverty. The City of Tshwane can only achieve this if it puts measures in place to alleviate poverty and involve communities as active participants in solutions to their problems. All efforts, starting with strategic intervention to operations, should be concentrated on rendering effective and efficient services.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

African National Congress. (ANC). 1994. The reconstruction and development programme: a policy framework. Johannesburg: Umanyano Publications.

Altman, M, Hart, T. and Jacobs, P. 2009. Food security in South Africa. Human Sciences Research Council: Pretoria.

Auerbach, C.T. & Silverstein, L.B. 2003. An introduction of coding and analysis of qualitative data. USA: New York University Press, pp. 1-7.

Babbie, E. & Mouton, J. 2001. The practice of social research. 9th ed. Belmont: Wadsworth Thomas Learning.

Bless, C. & Higson-Smith, C. 1995. Fundamentals of Social Research methods. Lansdowne: Juta.

Bird, K. 2007. The intergenerational transmission of poverty. An overview. Chronic Poverty Research Centre. Odi Working paper, (286).

Bird, K., Hulme, D., Moore, K. & Sherperd, A. 2013. Chronic poverty and rural areas. Chronic poverty research centre.CPRC Working paper (13). University of Birmingham.

Boddy, C. 2005. A rose by another name may smell as sweet but group discussion is not another name for focus group, nor should it be. *Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal*, 8(3).

Bogdan, R.C. & Biklen, S.K. 2007. Qualitative research for education: an introduction to theories and methods. 5th ed. Boston: Pearson Education.

Boswell, C. & Cannon, S. 2009. Introduction to nursing research: incorporating evidence-based practice 2nd ed. UK: Jones & Bartlett Learning.

Brits, H. 2012. Dissertation. An evaluation of the assessment tool used for extensive mini dissertation in Master's degree in family medicine at the school of medicine, University of Free State (UFS).

Brynard, P.A. & Hanekom, S.X. 2006. Introduction to research in management related fields. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

- Burns, N. & Grove, S.K. 2003. Understanding nursing research. 3rd ed. Philadelphia: University Press.
- Cassel, C.& Symon, G. 2004. Essential guide to qualitative methods in organisational research. London: Sage.
- Castex, G.M. 2007. Social workers final act of service. Pretoria: Juta.
- Centre for Development Support. 2002. Indigency policy support report: draft copy. Bloemfontein: University of the Free State.
- Census Bureau report. 2011. Income, poverty and health insurance coverage. <http://www.census.gov>. Date of access 15.03.2014
- Chief Financial Officer handbook for municipality. 2013. National Treasury 1st edition.
- Chisnall, P. M. 2005. Marketing research. Seventh edition. Spain: McGraw-Hill.
- City of Tshwane. 2006. Credit control by laws. <http://www.tshwane.gov.za>. Date of Access: 07 Aug. 2014.
- City of Tshwane. 2012. Draft Expanded public works programme policy. Economic Development Unit. Pretoria.
- City of Tshwane. 2010. Indigent Policy. Pretoria.
- City of Tshwane. 2012. Indigent Policy Review . Pretoria.
- City of Tshwane. 2012. Integrated Development Plan. <http://www.cot.gov.za> Date of access: 11 Jan. 2014.
- City of Tshwane. 2013. Tshepho 10 000 entrepreneurship programme. www.tshwane.gov.za. Date of access: 16.March 2014.
- Creswell, J.W. 1994. Research design, qualitative and quantitative approaches. London: Sage.
- Creswell, J.W. 2003. Research design, qualitative and quantitative approaches .London: Sage.
- Creswell, J.W., Ebersson, L., Ellof, I., Ferreira, R., Ivankoma, N.V., Jansen, J.D., Niewenshuis, J., Pietresson, J., Plano Clark, V.L. & Van der Westhuizen, C. 2010. First steps in research. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

De Beer, J.K. 2008. City of Tshwane: Business plan 2008/2009. Health and Social Development. Pretoria: City of Tshwane.

Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs:2010.Community work's programme commission 3 Technical implementation forum on outcome 9. "A responsive, accountable, effective and efficient local government system. <http://www.cogta.gov.za> . Date of access: 07 Dec. 2014.

Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs. 2014. www.cogta.gov.za Date of access 12 July 2015.

Department of Finance. 2013. www.treasury.gov.za Date of access 12.04.2014.

Department for International Development. 2010. Improving public services: in the politics of poverty. London: Elites citizens and states. www.dfid.org Date of access 15 Apr. 2014.

Department of Labour (SA). 2012. Ministerial Determination. Basic Conditions of employment Act for Extended Public Work's programme. Government Gazette no 35310 Vol 563.

De Vos, A. S., Strydom, H., Fouche, CB.,& Delpoort, C.S.L. 2002. Research at grassroots for Social Services and Human Services profession .2nd Pretoria: Van Schaik

Erasmus, J.C. 2004. Indicators of poverty in City of Tshwane. Empowerment and economic research unit. Pretoria: CoT.

Erkurhuleni indigent support policy.2013. www.erkurhuleni.gov.za Date of access: 15 June 2014.

Erlandson, D.A., Harris, E.L., Skipper, B.L. & Allen, S.D. 1993. Doing naturalistic inquiry: a guide to methods. Newbury Park: Sage.

Fossey, E., Harvey, C., McDermott, F. & Davidson, L. 2002. Understanding an evaluative competitive research. <http://www.stes-apes.med.ulg.ac.be/Doc> Date of access: 26 Apr. 2014.

Fox, W. & Bayat, B. 2007. A guide to managing research. Cape Town: Juta.

Fritz, K. 2008. Case Study & Narrative Analysis. Qualitative data analysis. ocw.jhsph.edu Date of access: 12.09.2014.

Holloway, I. 2005. Basic concepts for qualitative research. Oxford: Blackwell Science.

Hsie, H. & Shanon, S.E. 2005. Qualitative health research <http://qhr.sagepub.com>. Date of Access: 10 Dec. 2014.

Huchzemeyer, M. & Karam, A. (eds.) Informal Settlements. A perpetual challenge. Cape Town : Juta.

Human Science Research Council. 2004. Fact sheet: Poverty in South Africa. South African regional poverty Network. Pretoria: Juta.

Human Science Research Council. 2005. Poverty pockets in Gauteng. How migration impacts poverty. Pretoria.

Human Science Research Council. 2007. Midterm review of the Expanded Public Works programme. Pretoria.

Human Science Research Council. 2010. Indigent Exit Strategy. Study commissioned by City of Tshwane. Pretoria

Imas, L.M. & Rist, R. 2009. The road to results: Designing and conducting effective development evaluations. Washington: World Bank.

Income poverty statistics. 2012. <http://www.gov.scot/Topics/Statistics/Browse/Social-Welfare/IncomePoverty>. Date of access 13.10.2014.

Independent Electoral Commission (IEC) Candidate lists: 2011 Municipal Election candidates. www.elections.org.za. Date of access: 20 June 2014.

Joubert, G. & Ehrlich, R. 2007. Epidemiology. A research manual for South Africa. 2nd ed. Pretoria: Oxford University Press.

Keepile, K. 2010. ANC urges calm after Gauteng service delivery protests.<http://www.mailandgurdianonline.com>. Date of access 12.12.2014.

Krefting, L. 1991. Rigor in qualitative research. The assessment of trustworthiness. *American Journal of Occupational Therapy*.

Kvale, S. 1996. Interviews: an introduction to qualitative research interviewing. London: Sage.

Landman, K. 2004. Gated communities in South Africa: A review of the relevant policies and their implications www.csir.co.za Date of access: 27.07.2014.

Lane,V.M. 2006. Trends in poverty and welfare alleviation issues. New York: Nova Science Publishers, inc.

Lasserve, A.D. 2006.Treating people and communities as assets. informal settlements and the millennium development goals: global policy debates on property ownership and security of tenure.<http://www.globalurban.org>. Date of access 09.12.2014.

Latakomo, C.N. 2011. Dissertation. The experience and views of individual older persons in Atteridgeville on the Indigent Policy programme of Local Government. University of South Africa (Unisa).

Leedy, P.D. & Ormrod, J.E. 2010. Practical research: planning & design. New Jersey: Pearson Education International.

Lewis .P. Sanders, M. & Thornhill, A. 2009. Research method for business students. United Kingdom : Pearson Education International.

Lincoln, Y.S. & Guba, E.G. 1985. Naturalistic enquiry. Newbury Park: Sage.

Local government handbook. 2013. Cooperative Government and Traditional Affairs. www.cogta.gov.za Date of access 15.07.2014.

Loots, J.L. 2004. Equity and the local government share in South Africa. Pretoria.

Madue, S.M. 2007. Thesis. Measurement of research output of public higher education in Institution in South Africa: Hurdle or handle? University of Pretoria (UP).

Makgatho, K.E. 2013. Dissertation. Effectiveness of internal control mechanism in monitoring the Gauteng Department of Education. University of North West (NWU).

Malehase, C. 2013. Free basic services. Presentation to portfolio committee on energy. Pretoria.

Mamabolo, L.R.C. 2009. Dissertation : Experiences of registered nurses at one community health centre providing termination of pregnancy .University of South Africa(Unisa).

Mann, P.E. 2010. Ethical obligations of indigent defense. Attorneys to their clients. scholarship.law.missouri.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3884. Date of access 13 Nov. 2014.

Maree, K. 2007. First steps in research. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

- Mbeki, T. 2004. State of the Nation Address. www.gov.za Date of access: 13 Mar. 2014.
- Meta, D. 2000. Urbanisation of poverty. Vol 6 Habitat debate, 2000 – www.unhabitat.org Date of access 05 Dec. 2014.
- Miles, M.B. 1979. Qualitative data as an attractive nuisance: problem of analysis. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 24, 590-601.
- Miles, M.B. & Hubberman, A.M. 1994. Qualitative data analysis. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage. In Morestin. F., Grant, P. & Ridde, V. 2009. Criteria for identifying the poor as beneficiaries of programmes in developing countries. University of Montreal.
- Morra, I., Linda, G. & Rist, G. 2009. The road to results, designing and conducting effective development evaluations. United Kingdom: World Bank.
- Morestin, F., Grant, P. & Ridde, V. 2009. Criteria and processes for identifying the poor as beneficiaries of programmes in developing countries. <http://www.help-ev.de>. Date of access 11.10.2014.
- Mouton, J. 2002. Understanding social research. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.
- Mouton, E. 2007. The practice of social research. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Mufamadi, S.F. 2002. What's trust got to do with it: Non-payment of services. Pretoria: HSRC.
- Municipal Infrastructure Investment Unit. 2006. A guide to enhancing municipal revenue.
- Mzini, L.B. 2011. Improving the quality of public services: the relation between accountability and customer satisfaction in the Sedibeng district municipality. University of North West.
- National Development Plan. 2012. Key issues - www.gov.za Date of access: 27 Jul. 2014.
- National Development Plan Vision for 2030. 2011. South African government. www.gov.za Date of access : 06.June 2014.
- Nenzhelele, T.E. 2012. Dissertation. A study of the awareness and practice of competitive intelligence in SME's in the City of Tshwane metropolitan municipality. Pretoria: Unisa.

North West University. 2011. Public Finance Management Study guide .University of North West.

OED (Oxford English Dictionary). 2013 <http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definitions/english>.
Date of access: 12 September 2014.

Parahoo, K. 1997. Nursing research: principles, processes and issues. London: McMillan.

Pattel, Y .2009. Extent of poverty, inability to pay services. Local government capacity building.
<http://www.inca.co.za> Date of access: 17 October 2012.

Paton, C. 2013. In Depth. National Development Plan. Business Day live.
<http://www.bdlive.co.za/indepth/ndp>. Date of access: 04 December 2013.

Pillay, D. 2003 Integration of basic social package and policy. Pretoria: City of Tshwane.

Pretorius, D. & Schurink, W. 2007. Enhancing service delivery in local government: the case of a district municipality. South African journal of Human Resource Management. University of Johannesburg, 5(3),19-29.

Priest, H., Roberts, P. & Wood, L. 2002. An overview of three different approaches to interpretation of qualitative data. Part 1: Theoretical issues. Nurse researcher. Keele University.

Principles of state policy. www.arusovo.com Date of access: 20 May 2014.

Polit D.F. & Hungler, B.P. 2004. Essentials of nursing research methods, appraisals and utilisation. Philadelphia: JB Lippincott.

Quarterly labour force survey: quarter 2(April to June), 2012 Press statement
(<http://www.Statssa.gov.za>) Date of access: 13 Oct. 2012.

Rakodi, S.C. & Loyd, J.T. 2002. Urban livelihoods: a person centred approach to reducing poverty. London: Earthscan Publication.

Rector, R. & Sheffield, R. 2011. Understanding poverty in the United States. Washington: Pearson.

Richards, R., Zenobia, I., Ian, M., Alvino, W., Zaid, K., Mark, S., George, K. & Yuri.R. 2007. An assessment of the socio economic impact of the working for water programme on the households of beneficiaries. Johannesburg: Case.

- Robson, C. 2002. Real world research. London: Oxford.
- Rowland, R. 2000. The creative guide to research - How to find what you need - online or offline. USA. Franklin Lakes, NJ: Career Press.
- Rubin, A. & Babbie, E. 1997. Research methods for social workers. London: Collier McMillan.
- Schwella, E., Burger, J., Fox, W. & Muller, J.J. 1991. Public resource management. Cape Town: Juta.
- Sheng, Y.K., Rodriguez, J.C., Young, L.E. 2007. Access to basic services for the poor. The importance of good governance . www.gsdr.org. Date of access: 29 Jan. 2014.
- South Africa. 1996. Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (108 of 1996). Pretoria: Government Printers.
- South Africa. 2000. Local Government: Municipal System Act (32 of 2000). Pretoria: Government Printers.
- South Africa. 2000. Municipal Systems Act (32 of 2000). Pretoria: Government Printers.
- South Africa. 1999. Public Finance Management (1 of 1999). Pretoria: Government Printers.
- South Africa. Unemployment rate. <http://www.tradingeconomics.com>) Date of access: 14 Aug. 2012.
- Statistical Portal. 2014. poverty statistics and facts <http://www.statistica.com?topics/781/poverty>. Date of access 12.05.2015
- Statistics South Africa. 2007. Community survey, (revised version). Statistical release P0301.
- Statistics South Africa. 2008. Income and expenditure survey. <http://www.statssa.gov.za>. Date of access 19 June 2014.
- Statistics South Africa. 2010. Mid-year population report. <http://www.statssa.gov.za>. Date of access 12.09.2014.
- Statistics South Africa. 2010. Millennium Development Goals. <http://www.statssa.gov.za>. Date of access 12.09.2014.

Statistics South Africa. 2012. Quarterly labour force survey, (revised version). Statistical release P0211.

Statistics South Africa. 2013. General household survey (revised version). Statistical release P0318.

Statistics South Africa. 2014. Poverty trends in South Africa. An examination of absolute poverty between 2006 and 2011. Report No. 03-10-06.

Stevens, L., Coupe, S. & Mitlin, D. 2006. Confronting the crisis in urban poverty. Making integrated approaches work. London: International Technology Limited.

Terreblanche, M., Durrheim, K. & Painter, D. 2006. Research in practice: applied methods for social sciences. 2nd ed. Cape Town: University of Cape Town press.

Tredoux, C. & Durrheim, K. 2000. Numbers, hypotheses & conclusions. A course in statistics for the social sciences. Cape Town: UCT Press.

United Nations Children's Fund. 2012. Global evaluation of life skills education.<http://www.unicef.org>. Date of access:18.07.2014.

United Nations Development Programme. 2013a. Human Development report. Human progress in diverse world. The rise of the south. <http://www.undp.org>. Date of Access: 29 June. 2014.

United Nations Development Programme. 2013b. Poverty reduction and the Millennium Development goals. United Nations Development Programme. <http://www.undp.org>. Date of Access: 29 Jul. 2014.

Van Dyk. D 2012.Skillssummit.Nationaltoolinginitiativeprogramme.www.skillssummit.co.za. Date of access 12.08.2014.

Van Ryneveld, P., Parnell, S. & Muller, D. 2003. Indigent Policy of the City of Cape Town. www.capetown.gov.za Date of access: 14 Jan. 2014.

Watt, P., Richards, S. & Skelcher, C. 2002. Review of public administration in Northern Ireland briefing paper. Birmingham: The University of Birmingham.

Wegelin, E.A. & Borgman, M.K. 1995. Municipal intervention in urban poverty alleviation. 7(2).Pretoria: Haum Educational publishers.

Wolff, R. 2009. *Economic crisis hit the world*. London: Sage.

Yazbeck, A. 2009. *A menu for pro poor policies in attacking inequality in the health sector: a synthesis of and tools*. Washington DC: World Bank p. 15.

ANNEXURE A
INTERVIEW SCOPE

ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION OF INDIGENT POLICY IN THE CITY OF
TSHWANE: CHALLENGES AND OPTIONS

All information herewith provided will be treated confidentially.

INSTRUCTIONS

Please answer all questions as honestly, frankly and objectively as possible.
Answer according to your personal opinion and experience.

1. Which strategies and guidelines are in place for the implementation of Indigent Policy at the Municipality?

2. Is there evidence to indicate that the municipality does have sufficient personnel for implementation of the Indigent Policy?

3. What methodology is the Municipality using to identify Indigents?

4. Which measures are in place to ensure that Municipality's implementation of its Indigent Policy is affordability and sustainable?

5. What are the legal implications of the application process?

6. Is the application and verification process measurable/ If yes how?

7. How many Indigents were approved during the financial year 2013/2014?

8. How do you monitor the Indigent register?

9. Kindly elaborate on challenges encountered during the implementation of the Indigent policy

10. Has the Municipality organised a campaign regarding the Indigent policy?

11. What measures are in place to ensure the successful implementation of the policy?

ANNEXURE B

FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION

INTRODUCTION

We are conducting a study titled: *The implementation of the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane: Options and Challenges*. We would like to know more about the subsidy extended to the residents of the City of Tshwane in a form of a subsidy aimed at helping them their municipal accounts. In conducting this study, we started with municipal officials and now we want to hear your side of the story. Your names will not be used for the final draft of this study so feel free to give your opinions. You will remain anonymous.

BIOGRAPHIC DETAILS

- What is your name and surname?
- What is your marital status?
- How old are you?
- How many other people stay in your yard?
- How many people stay in your yard?

FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION QUESTIONS

- 1 Are you beneficiaries of the Municipality's Indigent programme? If yes, what procedures did you follow to get access to the Indigent policy? If no, what are the reasons for that?
- 2 Describe the ease of access to the service.
- 3 What challenges do you experience in terms of the procedure required to qualify for assistance?
- 4 How do you think can these problems be solved? (Suggest possible solutions)
- 5 Describe any instances whereby beneficiaries have been denied access to services.
- 6 Has the municipality organised a campaign regarding the indigent policy?
- 7 What can each one of us do to make the implementation of the policy better?
- 8 Do you think that the indigent subsidies are the best ways for the municipality to help the needy residents?

- 9 What are the uncomfortable things about this Indigence Programme?
- 10 What are you doing as non-recipient of the subsidy to be registered?
- 11 What are you doing as recipients to ensure that you get out of this Programme?

Questions 9 and 11 have been adapted from Latakomo C (2011).

ANNEXURE C

INFORMED CONSENT FORM FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPANTS

Title of the Study: The implementation of the Indigent Policy in the city of Tshwane: challenges and options

Researcher: Masindi C. Mashapha (Student Number: 23123885) Mobile 0768271458
masindim@dsd.gov.za

Institution: North West University (Vaal Campus)

Dear Participant

Thank you for willingness to participate in this research study. The purpose of this study is to examine the implementation of the Indigent Policy in the City of Tshwane: challenges and options. The study focuses specifically on the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane, its challenges and options.

Your participation will be in the form of an interview that will take 30-60 minutes. If necessary, follow up interviews will also be conducted to seek further clarity or additional information. The discussion will be recorded, but no one will be identified by the name. The information recorded is confidential and no one will have access to the records.

To the best of my knowledge, there are no risks or benefits of participating in this study. Participation is completely voluntary. If you decide not to participate or withdraw from participating there will be no negative consequences.

All the information you supply during the research will be held in confidence and your name will not appear on any report or publication of the research.

Participant consent Declaration

Iagree to participate in this research study. The purpose and nature of the study has been explained to me in writing. I am participating voluntarily. I give permission for the interview with Ms Mashapha to be recorded. I fully understand that I can withdraw from the study without repercussions at any time whether before it starts or while it is in progress. I understand that anonymity will be ensured in the report or publication of the research. I understand that disguised extracts from these may be quoted in the mini dissertation.

(Please tick in box below)

I agree to quotation /publication of extracts from my interview

I do not agree to quotation /publication of extracts from my interview

Participant's signature: _____

Date _____

ANNEXURE D

INFORMED CONSENT FORM FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPANTS

Title of the Study: the implementation of the Indigent Policy in the city of Tshwane: challenges and options

Researcher: Masindi C. Mashapha (Student Number: 23123885) Mobile 0768271458
masindim@dsd.gov.za

Institution: North West University (Vaal Campus)

Dear Participant

Thank you for your willingness to participate in this research study.. The purpose of this study is to examine the implementation of the Indigent Policy in the City of Tshwane: challenges and options. The study focuses specifically on the Indigent Policy of the City of Tshwane, its challenges and options. Your participation will be in the form of the Focus Group Discussion with 6-9 other persons with more or less same experiences. The process will begin with the researcher ensuring that you are comfortable. The questions about your knowledge and experience of the Indigent Policy will be asked.

The discussion will be recorded, but no one will be identified by the name. The information recorded is confidential and no one will have access to the records.

To the best of my knowledge, there are no risks or benefits of participating in this study. Participation is completely voluntary. If you decide not to participate or withdraw from participating there will be no negative consequences.

All the information you supply during the research will be held in confidence and your name will not appear on any report or publication of the research.

If you have any further questions you may contact me by telephone at + 2776 827 1458 or email: masindim@dsd.gov.za.

Participant consent Declaration

Iagree to participate in this research study. The purpose and nature of the study has been explained to me in writing .I am participating voluntarily. I give permission for the focus group with Masindi to be recorded. I fully understand that I can withdraw from the study without repercussions at any time whether before it starts or while it's the process.

I understand that anonymity will be ensured in the report or publication of the research. I understand that disguised extracts from these may be quoted in the mini dissertation.

Participant's signature: _____

Date: _____